

**INTERNATIONAL NEWS COVERAGE OF HUMAN
TRAFFICKING ARRESTS AND PROSECUTIONS:
A CONTENT ANALYSIS**

by

Erin Denton

Bachelor of Arts (History), University of British Columbia 2007

THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

In the
School of Criminology

© Erin Denton 2009

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY

Summer 2009

All rights reserved. However, in accordance with the *Copyright Act of Canada*, this work may be reproduced, without authorization, under the conditions for *Fair Dealing*. Therefore, limited reproduction of the work for the purposes of private study, research, criticism, review and news reporting is likely to be in accordance with the law, particularly if cited appropriately.

APPROVAL

Name: Erin Denton
Degree: Master of Arts
Title of Thesis: International News Coverage of Human Trafficking Arrests and Prosecutions: A Content Analysis

Examining Committee:

Chair: Neil Boyd
Professor & Graduate Program Director

Dr. Eric Beauregard
Senior Supervisor
Assistant Professor – School of Criminology

Dr. Ted Palys
Supervisor
Professor – School of Criminology

Dr. Martin Bouchard
Supervisor
Assistant Professor – School of Criminology

Dr. Tom Mieczkowski
External Examiner
Professor & Chair – Criminology Department
University of South Florida

Date Defended/Approved: June 15, 2009



SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
LIBRARY

Declaration of Partial Copyright Licence

The author, whose copyright is declared on the title page of this work, has granted to Simon Fraser University the right to lend this thesis, project or extended essay to users of the Simon Fraser University Library, and to make partial or single copies only for such users or in response to a request from the library of any other university, or other educational institution, on its own behalf or for one of its users.

The author has further granted permission to Simon Fraser University to keep or make a digital copy for use in its circulating collection (currently available to the public at the "Institutional Repository" link of the SFU Library website <www.lib.sfu.ca> at: <<http://ir.lib.sfu.ca/handle/1892/112>>) and, without changing the content, to translate the thesis/project or extended essays, if technically possible, to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation of the digital work.

The author has further agreed that permission for multiple copying of this work for scholarly purposes may be granted by either the author or the Dean of Graduate Studies.

It is understood that copying or publication of this work for financial gain shall not be allowed without the author's written permission.

Permission for public performance, or limited permission for private scholarly use, of any multimedia materials forming part of this work, may have been granted by the author. This information may be found on the separately catalogued multimedia material and in the signed Partial Copyright Licence.

While licensing SFU to permit the above uses, the author retains copyright in the thesis, project or extended essays, including the right to change the work for subsequent purposes, including editing and publishing the work in whole or in part, and licensing other parties, as the author may desire.

The original Partial Copyright Licence attesting to these terms, and signed by this author, may be found in the original bound copy of this work, retained in the Simon Fraser University Archive.

Simon Fraser University Library
Burnaby, BC, Canada

ABSTRACT

Trafficking in human beings is a growing phenomenon with an expanding body of literature. However, a gap is evident in this body of literature: original research focusing on specific incidents of human trafficking. At this time, the human trafficking literature is permeated with discussions of the sex trade, sexual exploitation, organized crime, global socioeconomic problems and human rights. While these issues are all pertinent to the human trafficking debate, the literature requires maturation. This growth should occur with research that seeks to understand the trafficking event through analysis of occurrences of human trafficking: such is the aim of this study. This content analytic study examines 191 unique incidents of human trafficking, as reported in electronic international print media, in order to analyze specific attributes relating to the trafficker, the trafficked individual and the trafficking event.

Keywords: human trafficking; human smuggling; trafficking in persons; transnational crime; illegal immigration

Subject Terms: human trafficking; human trafficking--law and legislation; human trafficking--case studies; human trafficking government policy; human trafficking prevention; human smuggling

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Trafficking in human beings is a growing phenomenon with an expanding body of literature. However, a gap is evident in this body of literature: original research focusing on specific incidents of human trafficking. At this time, the human trafficking literature is permeated with discussions of the sex trade, sexual exploitation, organized crime, global socioeconomic problems and human rights. While these issues are all pertinent to the human trafficking debate, the literature requires maturation. This growth should occur with research that seeks to understand the trafficking event through analysis of occurrences of human trafficking: such is the aim of this study

This content analytic study examines 191 unique incidents of human trafficking as reported in international electronic print media sources. The purpose of this study is to analyze media coverage of human trafficking arrests and prosecutions for specific attributes relating to the trafficker, the trafficked individual and the trafficking event. This study will also create a supplementary constituent of human trafficking research previously unrealized: the female human trafficking offender.

The results of this study indicate that women are involved as human traffickers far more than previously identified, and that law enforcement and the media frequently categorize incidents of human smuggling as human trafficking. This occurs more frequently when women are involved as the migrants of the

event. The results of this study also indicate that definitional issues relating to human trafficking are precluding the effectiveness of human trafficking legislation. Countries with anti-trafficking legislation are failing to detect and arrest cases of human trafficking because immigration departments and vice units are currently the governmental and police branches responsible for combating trafficking at the street and border level. The implications for the aforementioned results are discussed in this paper.

DEDICATION

To those who continue to inspire me to challenge my beliefs and the beliefs of others.

To Elie Wiesel, Primo Levi, and Rudolph Vrba, three survivors who endeavoured to remind the world that amidst what appears to be never-ending peril there can be hope.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thank you to the many professors and teachers who I am forever indebted to for my educational, professional and personal development. Specifically, thank you to Janice Manson, Poul von Bulow, Johnnie Terry, Robert Brain, Lyn Rae, Eric Beauregard, and Ted Palys.

Thank you to my parents and friends for continuing to challenge, inspire and support me to pursue the goals I have set for myself. To Christine, thank you for keeping me grounded during this entire process; your steadfast support has been remarkable and will never be forgotten.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Approval.....	ii
Abstract.....	iii
Executive Summary.....	iv
Dedication.....	vi
Acknowledgements.....	vii
Table of Contents.....	viii
List of Figures.....	x
List of Tables.....	xi
LITERATURE REVIEW.....	1
Definitional Consensus.....	4
Data Collection and Accurate Statistical Representations.....	7
Global Consensus Regarding the Decriminalization of Prostitution.....	11
Socioeconomic Issues and Equal Rights for Women and Children in Supply Countries.....	14
Homeland Security Versus Human Security Approach.....	16
The Involvement of Criminal Organizations in Human Trafficking.....	18
Future Trends in Human Trafficking Literature.....	20
METHOD.....	24
Data collection.....	25
Transference of data into NVivo for coding.....	31
Attribute coding by case.....	33
RESULTS.....	44
Characteristics of the human trafficking act.....	44
Characteristic and motives of the trafficker in reported cases of human trafficking and human smuggling.....	49
Characteristics and motives of the trafficked individuals in reported cases of human trafficking and human smuggling.....	51
DISCUSSION.....	55
The effect of the media on the general public’s perception of human trafficking.....	58
Definitional issues affecting arrests and prosecutions of human trafficking.....	61
Overrepresentation of sexual exploitation in the literature.....	63

The female human trafficking offender.....	66
Ineffective human trafficking legislation and misuse of law enforcement to detect and combat trafficking offences.....	68
Defining a subjective concept in the legal world.....	71
Socioeconomic factors and human rights abuses in countries of origins of trafficked individuals.....	74
Complexities of utilizing a human security versus homeland security approach to human trafficking.....	77
CONCLUSION.....	81
Limitations of the current study and directions for future research.....	83
Appendix.....	87
Reference List.....	91

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Example of coded article.....	87
--	-----------

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: GNA results from 1990-2008 for all search taglines.....	28
Table 2: Search engine results for human trafficking arrest.....	29
Table 3: Search engine results for sex trafficking arrest.....	29
Table 4: Search engine results for human smuggling arrest.....	30
Table 5: Search engine results for human trafficking prosecution.....	30
Table 6: Sex trafficking prosecution results imported into database.....	31
Table 7: Sex trafficking prosecution results imported into database.....	31
Table 8: Level of trafficker cooperation with other individuals (N of missing cases = 22, or 11% of all cases coded).....	45
Table 9: Gender and Age of trafficked person (N of Missing Cases = 24, or 12.57%).....	46
Table 10: Gender of trafficker (N of missing cases = 61, or 31.9%).....	47
Table 11: Offender(s) community position and employment (N of missing cases = 66 or 34.6%).....	47
Table 12: Region of arrest of trafficker(s) (N of missing cases = 36 or 18.8%).....	48
Table 13: Age of trafficker (N of missing cases = 45 or 23.6%).....	49
Table 14: Region of origination of trafficker(s) (N of missing cases = 25 or 13.1%).....	50
Table 15: Role of trafficker(s) (N of missing cases = 29 or 15.2%).....	51
Table 16: Region of origination of trafficked person (N of missing cases = 25 or 13.1%).....	52
Table 17: Initiation of transport (N of missing cases = 56 or 29.3%).....	53
Table 18: Arrest of trafficked individual (N of missing cases = 101 or 53.9%).....	54
Table 19: Attributes and attribute values for coding.....	90

Table 20: Percentages of valid cases of incidents of human trafficking.....90

LITERATURE REVIEW

The phenomenon of human trafficking¹ has created a contentious debate regarding the global sex industry and the proliferation of the recruitment and procurement of individuals for profit. Identifiable in current trends of human trafficking research and literature is the failure to decisively comprehend and analyze the human trafficking act as a whole, and, more specifically, to understand the human trafficking actors, from trafficked individual to trafficker. The tendency of human trafficking literature to extend the polarization of men and women and to create a male/female dichotomy is problematic because such hypotheses of human trafficking fail to identify significant aspects of the trafficking event. Subsequent to the creation of male/female polarities in human trafficking literature is a lack of research specifically focusing on the human trafficking act as an event in and of itself.

Since the late nineteenth century, a belief has existed in the global community that human trafficking, specifically of women and children, has

¹ Human trafficking, as defined by the United Nations (UNODC, 2006), is segregated into two components: 1) trafficking in persons; and 2) smuggling of migrants. Trafficking of persons is defined by the United Nations (2006) as: "the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payment benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation includes, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs" (p. 07). Smuggling of migrants is defined by the United Nations (2006) as: the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a country which the person is not a national or a permanent resident (p. 06).

continued as an underground slave trade (Chuang, 1998; Doezema, 2002; Friman & Reich, 2007; Williams, 1999). How far underground the slave trade has gone is dependent upon how persistent the local government, including military, police and immigration forces, is in regards to combating human trafficking. In 1904, the first modern response to the new slave trade, the *International Agreement for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic*, was created (Friman & Reich, 2007). Followed by the 1910 *Convention for the Suppression of White Slave Traffic*, both the international agreement and the convention were a response to the perceived rise in human trafficking of innocent, white women and children (Doezema, 2002; Friman & Reich, 2007).

Led by “moral entrepreneurs” (Andreas & Nadelmann, 2006) of the early 1900s like Josephine Butler², groups such as the American Purity Alliance and the National Vigilance Association of London “sparked a ‘moral crusade’ to prohibit white slavery, either broadly or narrowly defined” (Friman & Reich, 2007, p. 5). The crusade suggested that white women and children were highly susceptible to organized trafficking networks and that responses from governments to criminalize both trafficking and prostitution were needed. However, during the era of the moral crusaders, 99% of trafficked women and children were non-white individuals from colonial areas (Friman & Reich, 2007).

The crusade appears to have been directed at the criminalizing of

² Josephine Butler, part of the rising feminist movement of the late nineteenth century, brought the White Slave Trade, or *Traite des Blanches* (an adaptation of the French term *Traite des Noirs*, which described the Negro slave trade), to the attention of the American public (Derks, 2000). Butler felt white women and children were susceptible to involuntary prostitution and pushed for the criminalization of prostitution in order to alleviate potential harms associated with prostitution (Friman & Reich, 2007).

prostitution as an immoral act, rather than an attempt to prevent human trafficking. Doezema (1999) posits that while ostensibly the goal of the early anti-white slavery movement was protection of women, ultimately the movement was an attempt to control *loose women* (p. 23).

Attempts to prevent human trafficking through the criminalization of prostitution are important to the human trafficking literature that has developed because the core of the current literature focuses heavily on sexual exploitation and the sex trade. Rather than separating the forced prostitution and sexual exploitation literature from human trafficking, much of the literature muddles the two together. Although forced prostitution and sexual slavery can be the end result for women and children who are trafficked, the assumption that every trafficked individual is a victim of sexual slavery makes prostitution the problem instead of the actual trafficking event. Ultimately, an individual can be a prostitute without being trafficked; therefore, too strong a focus on the combination of trafficking and prostitution can be problematic because sexual exploitation is only a small component of the bigger picture. Paradoxically, the criminalization of activities involved with the sex trade has done little to suppress human trafficking. Whether or not human traffickers supply the global sex industry with trafficked individuals is not certain. Further research is required in order to determine the full extent of the trafficking act and such research should explore the extent to which individuals are trafficked and exploited.

In the century that has followed the first international attempts at preventing human trafficking, no single or combined effort has resulted in a

resolution to the problem of human trafficking. Some of the issues addressed by the current study that continue to undermine attempts to prevent, punish, and reduce the harm associated with all individuals affected by human trafficking include the following:

- A lack of global consensus for one single definition of human trafficking
- Inability to gather data and compile accurate statistical representations of trafficking
- A lack of global consensus regarding the decriminalization of prostitution
- Issues regarding socioeconomic problems and equal rights for women and children in countries that dominate the supply of women and children for the global sex trade
- A lack of consensus for a homeland security versus human security approach to human trafficking (a rule of law approach to human trafficking, as enacted by countries like the United States, versus a human security issue where trafficking is viewed as a crime against an individual and not the state).
- A lack of consensus regarding the levels to which criminal organizations participate in human trafficking

Definitional Consensus

Although there is a level of agreement regarding definitional issues of trafficking, not all countries have ratified the United Nations *Trafficking in Persons Protocol* (ASIL, 2007; UNODC, 2006) and as such, one common definition cannot be claimed. Furthermore, because the United Nations *Trafficking in Persons Protocol* requires each nation to criminalize trafficking (UNODC, 2006), definitions can be drastically altered at the national level, which

is ultimately where the punishment aspect of trafficking occurs.

Disagreements about definitions appear even in relation to component aspects such as sex trafficking. It should thus come as no surprise that pitted against one another in the definitional debate of sex trafficking are those who contend that all acts of prostitution are exploitative and involuntary (Jeffreys, 1997, 1999), and those, like Doezema (2000), who argue that individuals can freely choose to participate in the global sex industry and are only subjected to trafficking when forced to work in sexual servitude (Busza, 2004, Doezema, 2000, 2002, 2003; Friman & Reich, 2007, Murray, 1998, Wijers, 1998). Adding to the debate are those like Kelly (2003) who argue that force should not be the contested issue because the concept of “force” can be difficult to prove and prosecute (Gulcur & Ilkkaracan, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999). Determining exploitation in a trafficking case also can be extremely arduous because, in certain circumstances, investigators may struggle to draw a distinction between victim and illegal immigrant.

Joining the debate over definitions of trafficking are nongovernmental organizations that each employ varying definitions suited to the purpose of their approach to trafficking (Chuang, 1998). Reshaping human trafficking definitions in order to facilitate a cause is especially problematic because areas of human trafficking unrelated to the cause shift to the background. Although it is unlikely that a neutral definition of human trafficking can exist, definitions that focus on one component of human trafficking are troublesome. In extreme cases ulterior motives, often regarding the plight of women and their involvement in prostitution,

exist under the guise of a cause pertaining to assisting victims of human trafficking. In such cases the reshaping of definitions pertaining to human trafficking can result in misunderstandings regarding the propensity and categories of human trafficking. It is likely that cases of human smuggling are labelled human trafficking and this denies the trafficked individual's agency in making a decision to illegally migrate.

Notwithstanding these disagreements, is the important point that the current, relatively accepted definition of trafficking describes a wide range of activities (Bruckert & Parent, 2002; O'Connell, Davidson & Donelan in Laczko & Gramegna, 2003). The trafficking of humans is not one single activity. There are individuals who recruit, transport, and sell, as well as others facilitating each activity as it unfolds. As such, any single definition will fall short because the sheer magnitude of the trafficking act cannot be captured with one single definition. While a common definition of what does, and does not, constitute a trafficking offence would be useful for actively combating the trafficking of humans, unless an international legal court is created to deal with human trafficking offences, it is highly unlikely that an international consensus will be reached.

Definitional issues regarding human trafficking abound and will receive no further attention for the purpose of this paper because, as shown over the course of a century, debating definitions does little to uncover the intricacies of human trafficking. However, definitional debates are habitually present in the quandary of active worldwide governmental participation seeking to prevent human

trafficking and to punish those involved.

Data Collection and Accurate Statistical Representations

Much of the literature regarding human trafficking focuses on issues of data collection and statistical representation of trafficking, with varying methods of empirical data collection discussed and posited (Andrees, 2005; AIC, 2002; Di Nicola & Cauduro, 2007; IOM, 2000; Kelly, 2005; Laczko, 2002; Laczko & Gramegna, 2003; Tyldum & Brunovskis, 2005; UNODC, 1999, 2006). Issues regarding the abilities of governments to collect and record the number of human trafficking offences, combined with the unwillingness or inability of nation-states to gather statistics, create a dearth of reliable empirical data regarding human trafficking (Bruckert & Parent, 2002; Kelly, 2002, 2005; Laczko, 2002; Laczko & Gramegna, 2003; Okolski, 2000; Tyldum & Brunovskis, 2005, UNODC, 1999, 2006). This is especially true for nations without human trafficking legislation. Kelly (2005) suggests that:

A considerable proportion of trafficking research is funded/commissioned/conducted by international organizations as one element of counter-trafficking programmes. Establishing an evidence base for interventions is to be commended, but most such commissions have short time lines and require policy relevant findings and conclusions. Pure research studies and detailed research evaluations continue to be extremely rare, and a limited number of established social scientists are involved in exploring the contours of human trafficking. These patterns contribute to several methodological weaknesses in the field. (p. 236)

Kelly further examines problems with the representation of data collection in the literature and finds too few individuals willing to disclose fully their methods of research.

Kelly (2005) outlines additional issues with data collection in regards to the seemingly limited research training displayed by many social scientists who look at human trafficking. Whether or not individuals are receiving limited training, or are merely attempting to work with the limited resources they have, is debatable. Some individuals are taking positive steps towards human trafficking data collection with qualitative techniques in order to build informative databases (Allvazi del Frate, 2003; Andrees, 2005; Blanchet, 2002; Bruckert & Parent, 2002; Busza, 2004; Dottridge, 2002; Human Rights Watch, 1995, 2001, 2002, 2003; Petros, 2005; Vocks & Nijboer, 2000). While Andrees (2005) considers the use of media and secondary sources a cause for concern, others (e.g., Dottridge, 2002), see the use of media as a means to gain access to a field of study that is notoriously difficult to infiltrate.

Vandenberg (2007) worries that the rise in media coverage regarding human trafficking could create a situation where increased policing is induced in order to combat the trafficking activities. This type of aggressive policing can, in turn, create more havoc for trafficked individuals, rather than limiting the activities of traffickers (Vandenberg, 2007).

The nature of the media's coverage of human trafficking could also negatively affect attempts at understanding the human trafficking act. Whether trafficking cases involving sexual exploitation are prototypical trafficking acts remains undetermined. Additionally, an increased focus on the voice of victims is driving the movement to search for innovative means to circumvent the lack of reliable governmental statistics regards human trafficking (Allvazi del Frate,

2003; Bruckert & Parent, 2004; Human Rights Watch, 2003; Surtees, 2007; Vocks & Nijboer, 2000); however, as Kelly (2002) discusses, victims may not be aware of where they were, went and currently are, which may further confuse, rather than assist, the research.

Human trafficking is an underreported crime (Laczko & Gramegna, 2003). Although it receives widespread international attention in the media, it remains a low priority among authorities in many countries (Kelly & Regan, 1999; Laczko & Gramegna, 2003). Vandenberg (2007) deduces that United Nations anti-trafficking efforts are failing because the individuals stationed by the United Nations—in countries deemed in need of international assistance—are creating multi-million dollar industries that promote the demand for licit, as well as illicit, goods and services. In countries where this may be the case, human trafficking remains underreported and a low priority for local officials (Laczko & Gramegna, 2007). Human trafficking also remains underreported in countries, like Thailand, where foreign military, like the United States during the Viet Nam War, create the demand for the sex trade while on rest and relaxation tours (Phongpaichit, 1999; Williams, 1999). Since the onset of the Viet Nam War, Thailand has remained a pivot country in the global sex trade, especially in South East Asia (Williams, 1999). The accuracy and possible extent to which the American military facilitated the demand for the supply of women into the sex trade may be debatable, but the notion cannot be considered merely coincidental. However, the existence of a coincidence does not immediately suggest that every woman involved in prostitution in Thailand was trafficked and forced into participation.

The perceptions posited by Phongpaichit, Williams, and Vandenberg further typify the problems inherent to the accuracy of data collection and empirical evidence regarding human trafficking.

Human trafficking is a lucrative market that is very difficult to infiltrate, which makes data collection all the more difficult. As Williams (1999) identifies, “corruption is the lubricant which allows criminal organizations to operate with maximum effectiveness and minimum interference” (p. 4). Corrupt governments that are participating in the facilitation of human trafficking are highly unlikely to report accurate statistics (Human Rights Watch, 2002; Matilac & Florendo, 2002; Stone, 1999; Williams, 1999; Vandenberg, 2007). The muddling of legitimate versus illegitimate migration patterns further facilitates the problems with gathering data on human trafficking (Bruckert & Parent, 2004; Lackzo & Gramegna, 2003; Salt & Stein, 1997).

Laczko & Gramegna’s (2003) critique that, “reliable trafficking data can be compiled only when the appropriate capacity to produce it exists” (p. 186) and their calls for innovative approaches to gathering of data have since been answered. Beginning in 2002, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime created the Global Programme Against Trafficking in Human Beings (GPAT), and establish a single database on flows of human trafficking (UNODC, 2006). The publication in 2006 from the UNODC, based on the single database, is perceived to have provided stronger insights into human trafficking and assisted in alleviating some of the concern regarding the reliability and validity of estimates of trafficking. However, it is important that research regarding human trafficking

continues to challenge and test the validity of the results of any trafficking database that is created. Tyldum & Brunovskis (2005) echo concerns previously outlined by Kelly (2002) and Dottridge (2002) regarding the inability of legislation and prohibitions to deal with human trafficking if the data presented is inaccurate, or not wholly representative of the issue. The continued data compilation by the UNODC into one single database seeks to rectify such issues (UNODC, 2006).

If the human trafficking literature continues to equate trafficking with prostitution, the positive changes in data collection methodologies could become superfluous because the data collected may only refer to human trafficking events involving prostitution. This is problematic because illegal immigrants who were smuggled into the country may be involved in prostitution and may skew the data as a false positive for human trafficking.

Global Consensus Regarding the Decriminalization of Prostitution

My intention for this section of the paper is not to present a complete and comprehensive representation of all arguments for and against the decriminalizing of prostitution, but rather to highlight some of the issues inherent to the uniting of the human trafficking and prostitution literatures.

Currently, there is little debate that the global sex trade drives the trafficking of persons for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Whether this consensus is accurate remains to be determined because the numbers of individuals willingly involved in prostitution has not been assessed in the human trafficking literature. However, the extent to which the criminalizing and

immoralizing of prostitution has further fuelled the underground flesh trade is highly contested. Debate regarding the force/choice dichotomy also permeates the literature (Derks, 2000; Gulcur, 2002).

There are two sides to the debate: (1) those who argue that force is not the issue regarding prostitution and trafficking because all acts of prostitution are exploitative and involuntary (e.g., Gulcur & Ilkkaracan, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Kelly, 2003); and (2) those who contend that individuals can freely participate in the global sex industry and are only subjected to trafficking when forced to work in sexual servitude (e.g., Busza, 2004; Murray, 1998; Wijers, 1998). Doezema (1998, 2000, 2001, 2003) fluctuates between the two arguments because she suggests that the forced/voluntary dichotomy of sex workers has become a way to deny sex workers their human rights. Doezema (1998, 1999) contends that the portion of the international community that seeks to abolish prostitution refuses to grant human rights to sex workers who choose prostitution as an occupation because sex workers who *choose* prostitution have chosen an immoral lifestyle. By further perpetuating the forced/voluntary aspect of prostitution, the human trafficking literature continues to create the opposing images of an innocent victim and a woman who got what she deserved (Doezema, 2003). If the human trafficking literature continues to focus only on the global sex trade, other categories of human trafficking, such as human smuggling and incidents involving men, may be overlooked.

The primary argument in the literature supporting the notion that all forms of prostitution, whether coerced or not, are sexually exploitative is that female

sexuality as a commodity is a result of patriarchal structures in society (Bertone, 1999; Jeffreys, 1999; Savona et al., 1996). Jeffreys (1999) contends that women cannot choose prostitution as 'work' because prostitution is an act that requires only a woman's body to be present. The woman is not working: rather, she is facilitating the sexual desire of a man by disassociating and offering her body (Jeffreys, 1999). Kelly (2003) suggests that the argument of whether women can choose or are always forced to prostitute themselves, or whether or not prostitution can be considered 'work', is the wrong approach. Instead, she recommends that the focus should be on the perceived possibility of a woman from a poor country with little or no income travelling between or across continents. The importance of this distinction is that women, in these cases, are more likely to be forced to repay, through debt-bondage, the individual(s) who funded the trip. Such arrangements can be circular and the woman may find herself unable to ever repay what the debt-bonder claims she owes (Murray, 1998). Discussions pertaining to whether or not a woman chooses to prostitute in order to repay those who funded her migration are rare. The notion that a woman may agree to prostitute, without force or coercion, in order to acquire financial stability, is taboo and discussions involving such inferences are often avoided in human trafficking literature. Bruckert & Parent (2004) address this taboo and the results of their study indicate that many women are aware that they are smuggled for the purpose of prostitution. They also contend that women become involved in prostitution in the destination country because employment in the sex trade permits financial stability.

Human trafficking legislation crafted for anti-prostitution purposes is likely to fail because the legislation is incapable of dealing with the root causes of trafficking. Literature regarding the prevalence of trafficked individuals in countries where prostitution is either decriminalized or legalized may help to address whether or not the criminalization of prostitution promotes the demand for migrant sex workers. Literature regarding the socioeconomic and human rights conditions of countries where traffickers and trafficked individuals originate may assist in addressing the motivations of those who involve themselves in human trafficking and smuggling.

Socioeconomic Issues and Equal Rights for Women and Children in Supply Countries

Prevalent in the human trafficking literature is the notion that women and children who are trafficked are from lower socioeconomic backgrounds and from countries where women and children are not afforded the same rights as males (Bertone, 1999; Bruckert & Parent, 2002, 2004; Chapkis, 2003; GAATW, 2000; Hysi, 2007; Jana, 2002; Long, 2007; McDonald, 2000; Stone, 1999). Vocks & Nijboer (2000) and Blanchet (2002) suggest that women who are not coerced into sexual servitude are victims of strain and anomie, and are fighting against the dichotomy of expectations and few opportunities to succeed legally in society. Shannon (1999) contends that, “poverty is a great supporter of sexual exploitation” (p. 123) and suggests that individuals who are desperate to provide for their families will sell their bodies in order to meet the demand of both the market and their families. At the root of Shannon’s statement is the notion that

poverty induces behaviour in individuals that otherwise might not occur if financial stability was conceivable outside of unfavourable actions.

The notion that Shannon suggests is puzzling, because while her argument defends the actions of individuals who sell themselves for profit, Shannon provides no discussion of individuals facing the same socioeconomic issues who sell others. If there is a distinction between those who sell themselves and those who sell others, then the human trafficking literature should address the difference. It is also important to note that most literature regarding human trafficking seems to assume all traffickers are men (Malarek, 2006). There appears to be a profound gap in the literature that deals with women as traffickers, brothel owners and madams. If, as Shannon (1999) insists, desperation leads women to sell their bodies, what leads women to sell other women for sexual exploitation? Claims by Bertone (1999) and Jeffreys (1999) that a patriarchal society is the root of sexual exploitation do not consider that female offenders are involved in all stages of human trafficking. There is also a profound lack of human trafficking literature that discusses trafficked males. At times, the human trafficking literature appears to suggest a trafficked male is a smuggled migrant and a trafficked female is a victim. The suggestion that a male is often smuggled may not be inaccurate. The inaccuracy resides with the assumption that all females are trafficked rather than smuggled.

Legislation dealing with trafficking can be inefficient because the focus is usually on prostitution rather than what Beare (1999) and others (Berman, 2003; Bertone, 1999; Friman & Reich, 2007; Hysi, 2007; Lindstrom, 2007; Mertus &

Bertone, 2007; Wijers, 2002) perceive the issue to be: socioeconomic problems and human rights injustices. What the human trafficking literature fails to address is the possibility that individuals agree to illegal migration with the assistance of smugglers in order to escape the problem inherent in their countries of origin. Bruckert & Parent (2004) interviewed an RCMP sergeant who stated that immigrants are willing to work longer hours for less pay in developed nations because the working conditions and living conditions are significantly worse in their home countries. Bruckert & Parent categorize these individuals as *willing victims* (p. 38).

Legislation and international protocols that define trafficking as a national security, migration, or sex issue do not properly identify the main causes of human trafficking: poverty, inequality, and corruption (Beare, 1999; Shannon, 1999; Williams, 1999). As Friman & Reich (2007) suggest, human trafficking legislation should address the problem as a human security issue rather than a homeland security issue. If this were to occur, a better understanding could develop in order to define and identify the differences between human trafficking and human smuggling. Trafficked individuals differ from smuggled individuals with regards to choice. Smuggled individuals choose to illegally migrate and are aware of the end result of their migration in the destination country. Trafficked individuals may willingly travel either legally or illegally, but they are not aware that they have been trafficked for the purpose of exploitation.

Homeland Security Versus Human Security Approach

Recent publications regarding human trafficking can be distinguished in

whether they advocate a human security approach that defines the issue as a crime against a person, a homeland security approach that defines the issue as a crime against the state (e.g., Friman & Reich, 2007), or a market-based perspective (e.g., Williams, 1999). The latter suggests that individuals are moved as commodities and should be studied as commodities. The human security approach does not deny the body as a commodity, but conceptualizes human trafficking primarily as a crime against the individual who has been trafficked.

Arguing for a “human security” perspective, Friman & Reich (2007) contend that a separation between illegal immigration and human trafficking for exploitation should occur. They suggest a stronger more definitive separation must be made regarding individuals who migrate illegally to another country in order to find labour in the licit, or illicit, work force, and those who are trafficked against their knowledge specifically for the purpose of exploitation. They argue that the trafficking of individuals for exploitation, not the illegal migration for licit or illicit work, is the human security issue. However, differentiating those who migrate illegally for work from those who migrate and are subsequently exploited could lead to additional anti-sex legislation (Chapkis, 2003). Legal framework, like anti-sex legislation, can lead to police and government discrimination against trafficked individuals because the trafficked individual will have committed a crime in the destination country (Chapkis, 2003; Doezema, 1998, 2000, 2002; Murray, 1998; Wijers, 2002). Bruckert & Parent (2004) assert:

When the problem is defined as a moral, criminal, migration or public order problem, there is a tendency to opt for solutions that

involve control or punishment. When the problem is defined as a labour or human rights issue, positive measures can be taken in response (p. 7).

Notwithstanding the aforementioned, Williams (1999) argues that it is also important that the logistical component of trafficking be studied from a market-based commodity approach. A strong understanding of how individuals are physically trafficked would allow for enforcement and detection to occur. The involvement of criminal organizations should be addressed and assessed in order to provide apt and capable enforcement and detection methodologies. The focus should specifically address the stages of the trafficking act where criminal enterprises are traditionally involved. Research regarding the organizational levels, coupled with the logistical component of human trafficking, can increase the success of combating trafficking.

The Involvement of Criminal Organizations in Human Trafficking

The involvement of criminal organizations in the global sex trade is not lost in the human trafficking literature (AIC 2000, 2001, 2002a, 2002b; Bruisma & Meershoek, 1999; GAATW, 2000; GSN, 1999; Human Rights Watch, 2001, 2002; Kelly, 2002; Salt, 2000; Schloenhardt, 1999; Shannon, 1999; Stoecker, 2000; Stone, 1999; Taibly, 2001; Taylor & Jamieson, 1999; Zhang & Chin, 2002). As in other areas of human trafficking literature, the definition of 'organized crime' is debated (Salt, 2000); however, the idea implicit within human trafficking discourse is that highly structured criminal organizations reap large monetary rewards from the trafficking of humans for the purpose of sexual exploitation (Human Rights Watch, 1995; Shannon, 1999; Williams, 1999).

The level of organization at the beginning stages of the trafficking process is unclear. The Trafficking Database compiled by the UNODC suggests the type of criminal organization involved in human trafficking differs from the commonly perceived notion of a hierarchical structure (UNODC, 2006). Rather than a top-down criminal organization, human trafficking tends to fluctuate between core group organizations, where roles are defined but no individual is more important than the next, and standard hierarchical groups (UNODC, 2006). The distinction between the two types of criminal organizations is important: hierarchical organizations are more likely engaged on an ongoing basis in a lucrative market for significant profit, while core group organizations are strictly opportunistic (UNODC, 2006).

Like the drug market, there is a difference between those who provide “product” and those who sell the product to an end-user. The demand of the market supports the notion of purchasing individuals for forced prostitution, but the demand does not provide a complete description of the causes for an individual to sell a human for profit. Also like drug trafficking, there are certain individuals who sell a commodity in order to survive, while other individuals involve themselves in the market in order to enjoy a substantial profit (Shannon, 1999; Williams, 1999; Zhang & Chin, 2002). Human trafficking literature deals extensively with the latter, and minimally with the former. While there are some instances of criminal organizations involved from beginning to end (Shannon, 1999; Stone, 1999; Williams, 1999), criminal organizations are not always involved at the beginning stages. A study by Zhang & Chin (2002) of Chinese

human smugglers indicates that smuggling organizations are less structured and less organizational than typical organized crime syndicates. While Chinese smugglers display a showed commitment to making money, little else hold them together. Zhang & Chin also contend that while smuggling organizations display clear divisions of labour, there is a limited structural hierarchy. Research should be undertaken that seeks to analyze, and separate, the specific actors at each stage of the trafficking act.

Future Trends in Human Trafficking Literature

Persistent difficulties with infiltrating communities of individuals involved with human trafficking create challenges for the academic community. Human trafficking discourse is still in its infancy, and continued efforts, like those of Laczko & Gramegna (2003) and UNODC (2006) to build stronger tools for data collection should help alleviate some of the difficulties. The importance of nongovernmental organizations in the collection and preservation of human trafficking data also should be acknowledged. Caution should be used when relying on governmental reports because of the corruption and complicity of some, and the masking of political ideologies and agendas of others. The use of media sources provides yet another vantage point into human trafficking activity and should continue, providing stringent statistical and data analysis occurs, in tandem, in an effort to corroborate media accounts of trafficking. Due to the lucrative nature of human trafficking, media sources are often the sole provider of insight *within* the community (Bienstock, 2006).

Trafficked individuals can provide another source of insight into certain

aspects of the trafficking event, although the limitations of such accounts also should be considered. The unmitigated trauma inflicted on trafficked individuals could lead to an inability to reflect accurately on the trafficking event. The need for post-traumatic treatment should be attended to for trafficked individuals before they are requested to provide insight. One must also consider the possibility that not all individuals claiming to have been trafficked were, in fact, victims of trafficking. Some individuals enlist the aid of human smugglers in order to arrive in a destination country and willingly engage in sex work (Bruckert & Parent, 2004). Current legislation in the United States involving the granting of residency visas to victims of human trafficking could motivate the actions of individuals claiming trafficked status.

Another step in contributing to human trafficking literature is the separation, or careful inclusion, of prostitution and human trafficking literature. Prostitution is often the end result of human trafficking, with individuals facing further moves between brothels; however, discussions of prostitution and human trafficking has not, as of yet, aided in substantially reducing the number of trafficked individuals yearly. An emphasis on the relationship between prostitution and human trafficking can lead to a heavy focus on the end result of trafficking, rather than its beginning stages. It is as important to understand the individuals who recruit, smuggle and sell individuals, as it is to understand what trafficked individuals may ultimately face as an end result. It is just as important to accept the reality that some individuals acquire the assistance of smugglers and become prostitutes by choice. An individual who does not have legal status

in a country will find it difficult integrating into the legal market. For women, prostitution may become the likely business venture in the illegal market without force, fraud or coercion. Human trafficking literature does not currently reflect this.

It is also important to create profiles of each actor involved at all stages of the criminal act. Because criminal profiling relies on the action, or the event, in order to better understand the individual perpetrator, the secrecy of human trafficking should not affect the profiling result. Cultivating a better understanding of each actor at each stage of the trafficking event will allow proper legislation to be adopted in order to prevent and punish those who engage in trafficking, not just sexual exploitation. There also needs to be a better understanding of the difference between human trafficking and human smuggling and the rates at which each are occurring. If acts of human smuggling are characterized by law enforcement as human trafficking, crime rates regarding the two could be skewed.

The lack of knowledge of human trafficking is directly reflected in the lack of research specifically analyzing characteristic traits of the human trafficker, the trafficked individual and the trafficking act. Traits such as who initiated transport, whether any force, coercion or deception was detected, where the trafficker was arrested, what role the arrested trafficker played in the trafficking act, and the gender of the trafficked individual are some of attributes of the trafficking act that are not reflected, or not adequately researched, in the human trafficking literature. Research specifically aimed at analyzing trafficking incidents resulting

in arrests and prosecutions will provide insight and will allow greater analysis of the aforementioned characteristic traits. This type of research will also allow for analysis of legislation and law enforcement practices directly relating to human trafficking and human smuggling.

The current study addresses the lack of depth of understanding of the human trafficking act. Human trafficking is often misunderstood and this will continue unless research is undertaken that seeks to identify and analyze the rationales and methodologies of those engaged in acts of human trafficking; however, data collection and analysis must first occur with the specific aim of breaking down the trafficking act so that each component, from trafficker, to trafficked individual, to the actual trafficking act, may be better understood: such is the aim of this study.

METHOD

This study utilizes content analysis, which allows the researcher to begin with a research idea, create a sampling methodology, define recording units (words, phrases, or ideas to be coded), and then construct categories for analysis (Pedhazur & Schemlkin, 1991 as cited in Boots & Heide, 2006). A content analysis is particularly useful because while allowing for a systematic overview of the content of the data (Robson, 2002 as cited in Boots & Heide, 2006), This method also allows the researcher to collect and code information and explore both manifest and latent information within the data. Furthermore, this method is “excellent for comparative and historical studies or for discerning trends in existing phenomena” (Hagan, 2003 as cited in Boots & Heide, 2006).

This study’s use of content analysis is limited by both the amount of information available via the electronic Internet database search engine and the fact that the articles collected were not intended for the frame of analysis of this study. The researcher attempted to limit the shortcomings of the content analysis for this study by assessing only specific attributes defined within each newspaper article that was collected; that is, the attribute values created for coding purposes did not rely on interpretation by the researcher; rather, the researcher coded only the information made directly available in the article and did not interpret information. Despite these, and other undefined possible shortcomings, the researcher based the study of human trafficking on electronic

news media because opportunities to access data regarding specific acts of human trafficking are limited. With such difficulties in mind, the researcher crafted a study that would allow specific cases of human trafficking to be analyzed and coded for varying attributes of the trafficker, the trafficked individual and the trafficking act.

Data collection

In order to analyze specific cases of traffickers, trafficked individuals and trafficking acts, I began by compiling English language electronic newspaper articles reporting cases of human trafficking arrests and prosecutions via the Google News Archives (GNA) on-line search engine. Over several weeks in September and October of 2008, the GNA search engine was utilized as a data collection tool. GNA was used because it offered a perspective regarding the number of articles per year over several decades. Within the annual timeline, GNA provided a monthly register of newspaper articles relating to the specific searched topic. In essence, GNA presented a yearly tally of articles pertaining to a searched topic and within each specific year also provided a monthly tally of articles. Furthermore, GNA provided results from English-language newspapers across the globe and allowed me to amass a collection of data with an international perspective. This factored greatly into the decision to employ GNA as a search engine because this factor allowed for a compilation of newspaper articles that varied greatly from options presented by other on-line search engines.

I began with the following search criteria: 1) human trafficking arrest [-drug –narcotic -cocaine]³; 2) sex trafficking arrest [-drug –narcotic –cocaine]; 3) human smuggling arrest [-drug –narcotic –cocaine]; 4) human trafficking prosecution [-drug –narcotic –cocaine]; 5) sex trafficking prosecution [-drug –narcotic –cocaine]; and 6) human smuggling prosecution [-drug –narcotic –cocaine]. Utilization of the aforementioned search criteria was based on the decision to amass articles pertaining to the United Nations Convention against Organized Crime and the supporting Protocols regarding the prevention and suppression of human trafficking and human smuggling.⁴ Although human smuggling is not categorized as a human trafficking offence⁵, my decision to include migrant smuggling in the search engine and coding process was based on the desire to assess the overlap between human trafficking and human smuggling. As well, my decision occurred because one particular focus of this study was to amass data that could expose issues pertaining to the definitional criteria of human trafficking; many of the issues pertaining to categorization of victims is based on intangible and subjective criteria.

³ “Human trafficking arrest –drug –narcotic –cocaine” is the actual search engine tagline for Google News Archive.

⁴ As mentioned in previous chapters, this study uses the United Nations definition of human trafficking and the smuggling of migrants. The definitions are as follows: “trafficking in persons”: the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payment benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation; “smuggling of migrants”: the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a country or which the person is not a national or a permanent resident. (UNODC, 2006, p. 06-07)

⁵ Migrant smuggling, although part of the United Nations Convention and two supporting Protocols regarding trafficking, should not be considered a human trafficking offense if the individuals involved consented, without force, fraud or coercive measures, to receive assistance in illegally migrating to another country (UNODC, 2006). The relationship between the illegal migrant and the smuggler ends on arrival in the destination country and does not involve any exploitation of the smuggled individual. However, if the illegal migrant is exploited upon arrival in the destination country, they are considered a victim of human trafficking.

During initial searches, articles pertaining solely to narcotics and drug raids, frequently concerning cocaine, were persistent in the results. In order to suppress the likelihood of articles relating only to drug trafficking, without connection to the trafficking of human beings, the search criteria were focused to eliminate articles specifically pertaining to drugs, narcotics and/or cocaine. Such focusing was completed using the advanced search engine capabilities of Google News. By eliminating as many articles pertaining solely to drug trafficking as possible, a smaller number of false-positives occurred in the search engine results.⁶ After compiling and comparing the results generated by the search engine from 1990 to 2008⁷ (See Table 1), the last complete year of results, 2007, was chosen as the focus year for the study because it yielded, on average, the largest number of articles per search engine terms (e.g. human trafficking arrest).

Based on the number of results produced by the search engine in 2007 and the time constraints of the study, a decision was made to focus all searches on the first six months (January 1st to June 30th) of 2007. This decision was a matter of expediency. During the initial stages of data collection, I had hoped the study would span the entire 2007 calendar year; as such, the data were compiled

⁶ Although attempts were made to eliminate the number of articles unrelated to human trafficking and human smuggling from the search engine results, articles dealing with the trafficking and smuggling of the following were tabulated in the timeline results provided by Google News: arms and weapons, weapons technology, diamonds, uranium, timber, wedding gowns, political propaganda, pharmaceuticals, human skeletons, other narcotics (hashish, ecstasy, marijuana, heroin, etc.), art, alcohol, stolen property, oil, child pornography and cultural artefacts. It is important to note that false-positive articles of this nature often appeared in each portions of the timeline relating to the 1990s. As well, these articles, although tabulated in the original search engine timeline, were not collected or utilized for any portion of this study.

⁷ Newspaper articles regarding human trafficking were rare prior to 1990, as evidenced in the beginnings of the study when the search for an appropriate search engine occurred.

chronologically beginning with January 2007. Time constraints made it impossible to collect and assess all articles from 2007; instead, I stopped after six months.

YEAR	HT Arrest	ST Arrest	HS Arrest	HT Prosec.	ST Prosec.	HS Prosec.
2008	1,020	453	774	309	165	151
2007	1,690	608	1,360	450	221	190
2006	1,340	679	1,440	381	223	254
2005	1,220	546	1,240	357	157	190
2004	1,140	476	1,240	319	162	178
2003	1,160	405	1,280	257	150	189
2002	545	223	841	159	62	120
2001	401	123	688	116	55	100
2000	238	92	525	115	75	73
1999	122	70	333	50	26	46
1998	118	54	287	19	8	42
1997	50	46	196	16	13	19
1996	52	30	200	7	9	12
1995	72	39	136	23	10	17
1994	43	29	175	13	8	36
1993	55	11	246	23	5	40
1992	22	12	108	5	2	18
1991	28	12	111	9	2	15
1990	14	6	107	0	2	11
	9,330	3,914	11,287	2,628	1,355	1,701

Table 1: GNA results from 1990-2008 for all search taglines⁸

The advanced search for human trafficking arrest [-drug –narcotic – cocaine] yielded 9,330 articles from 1990 to 2008,⁹ of which 876 occurred during the January to June interval in the year 2007; of the 876 articles, 458 were collected (See Table 2). The primary reasons for the discrepancy between articles retrieved by the search engine (876) and articles actually collected (458) were: 1) some articles were physically archived and unavailable to me for on-line reading; 2) some articles were available for viewing by purchase, which I was unable to do; and 3) some articles did not address human trafficking and were

⁸ HT, ST, and HS are abbreviations for human trafficking, sex trafficking, and human smuggling, respectively. Prosecution is abbreviated as “prosec”.

⁹ This number can vary depending on additional articles added or removed from archived news articles from various on-line newspapers; however, such fluctuations are generally minimal.

aforementioned cases of false-positives.¹⁰

HUMAN TRAFFICKING ARREST [w/o -drug -narcotic -cocaine]		MONTH	ACTUAL	NVIVO
2007	1,690	JANUARY	59	10
		FEBRUARY	30	5
		MARCH	99	16
		APRIL	87	47
		MAY	83	56
		JUNE	100	43
			458	177

Table 2: Search engine results for human trafficking arrest

The advanced search for sex trafficking arrest [-drug -narcotic -cocaine] yielded 3,914 articles¹¹, of which 282 appeared during the January to June interval in the year 2007; of the 282 articles, 181 were collected (See Table 3).

SEX TRAFFICKING ARREST [w/o -drug -narcotic -cocaine]		MONTH	ACTUAL	NVIVO
2007	608	JANUARY	29	18
		FEBRUARY	22	5
		MARCH	38	8
		APRIL	31	9
		MAY	26	10
		JUNE	35	9
			181	59

Table 3: Search engine results for sex trafficking arrest

The advanced search for human smuggling arrest [-drug -narcotic -cocaine] yielded 11,287 results¹², of which 746 occurred in the January to June interval in the year 2007; of the 746 articles, 302 were collected (See Table 4).

HUMAN SMUGGLING ARREST [w/o -drug -narcotic -cocaine]	
---	--

¹⁰ The primary reasons for the discrepancies were the same for all search engine results regardless of the topic search (i.e. human trafficking arrest, human smuggling prosecution, sex trafficking arrest, etc.). One disadvantage of the GNA search engine is that no matter how many results are yielded per month, the maximum of articles that can be viewed is 100. Google employs algorithms that take a number of factors into account when selecting the best articles to display in a monthly cluster. GNA is set up to detect duplicate content and promote the original source of a news story. As such, GNA will indicate the number of articles picked up by the search tagline but will only display the most relevant and original articles indicated with the algorithms. This explains why random searches conducted by the researcher resulted in the frequent appearance of same 100 articles.

¹¹ See Footnote 4.

¹² See Footnote 4.

		MONTH	ACTUAL	NVIVO
2007	1,360	JANUARY	23	4
		FEBRUARY	41	16
		MARCH	57	18
		APRIL	67	34
		MAY	61	35
		JUNE	53	25
			302	132

Table 4: Search engine results for human smuggling arrest

The advanced search for human trafficking prosecution yielded 2,628 results¹³, of which 218 occurred during the January to June interval in the year 2007; of the 218 articles, 135 were collected (See Table 5).

HUMAN TRAFFICKING PROSECUTION [w/o -drug -narcotic -cocaine]				
		MONTH	ACTUAL	NVIVO
2007	449	JANUARY	19	2
		FEBRUARY	12	2
		MARCH	33	4
		APRIL	17	4
		MAY	25	4
		JUNE	29	5
			135	21

Table 5: Search engine results for human trafficking prosecution

The advanced search for sex trafficking prosecution yielded 1,355 results¹⁴, of which 100 occurred during the January to June interval in the year 2007; of the 100 articles, 73 were collected (See Table 6).

SEX TRAFFICKING PROSECUTION [w/o -drug -narcotic -cocaine]				
		MONTH	ACTUAL	NVIVO
2007	221	JANUARY	14	1
		FEBRUARY	5	2
		MARCH	24	4
		APRIL	0	0
		MAY	13	2
		JUNE	17	1
			73	10

¹³ See Footnote 4.

¹⁴ See Footnote 4.

Table 6: Sex trafficking prosecution results imported into database

The advanced search for human smuggling prosecution yielded 1,701 results¹⁵, of which 98 occurred during the January to June interval in the year 2007; of the 98 articles, 61 were collected (See Table 7).

HUMAN SMUGGLING PROSECUTION [w/o -drug -narcotic -cocaine]		MONTH	ACTUAL	NVIVO
2007	190	JANUARY	7	1
		FEBRUARY	2	0
		MARCH	16	2
		APRIL	11	1
		MAY	18	3
		JUNE	7	1
			61	8

Table 7: Sex trafficking prosecution results imported into database

All 1,210 articles collected from the aforementioned advanced search guidelines were modified into PDF formatting for transferring into the NVivo program database for coding.

Transference of data into NVivo for coding

The second stage of the data collection and coding process involved the loading of PDF versions of all articles collected into the coding database. Folders were compartmentalized to import each newspaper article by month and search tagline (i.e. human trafficking arrest [-drug -narcotic -cocaine]) and articles were bulk loaded into the database by the catalogued grouping of month and tagline. After the bulk loading¹⁶ by catalogued month and tagline, each article was assessed for relevance to the study topic of arrests and prosecutions for human

¹⁵ See Footnote 4.

¹⁶ During the bulk loading, a variety of articles failed to load into the NVivo database for causes that remain unknown. It is likely that a formatting error occurred, resulting in the failure to load; however, such failures occurred within each month and tagline, so no month or tagline suffered specifically in relation to others. That is, the failure to load appeared to be distributed randomly across loadings.

trafficking, human smuggling and sex trafficking. If the article addressed a specific case of arrest or prosecution pertaining to human trafficking, human smuggling or sex trafficking, the article was created within NVivo as a case, which allowed for attribute coding (to be discussed in the next section). All articles not specifically associated to an incident of a trafficking act resulting in an arrest or prosecution were disregarded at this point and deleted from the database.¹⁷ Any articles from different sources but dealing with the same trafficking incident were created as a set within NVivo; however, only one article from each set was coded for attribute values; sets, a total of thirty in this study, included two or more articles.

After the deletion of articles without a direct connection between a trafficking act and an arrest or prosecution, 407 articles remained (human trafficking arrest=177, sex trafficking arrest=59, human smuggling arrest=132, human trafficking prosecution=21, sex trafficking prosecution=10, human smuggling prosecution=8) (See Table 2 to 7). Of the 407, 53 articles were duplicates, a consequence of appearing in search engine results for more than one of the search criteria topics (human trafficking, human smuggling or sex trafficking). These duplicates were not deleted because the NVivo database does not allow for duplicate cases. As such, duplicate articles did not result in duplicate cases and the absolute value of cases for attribute coding, after

¹⁷ For example, the *New York Times* produced several editorials generically discussing the issue of human trafficking without specifically addressing a case that could be analyzed. Another example of a category of article for deletion would be the January 19, 2007 *Daily Mail* article from the United Kingdom that announced a law enacted to allow the prosecution of British citizens who commit human trafficking acts in other countries. Although these articles are related to human trafficking and were retrieved via the search engine criteria, they do not specifically mention a trafficking case and were deleted because they did not meet the criteria for inclusion in this study.

factoring in the number of articles assigned to sets of cases (163), was 191.¹⁸

Attribute coding by case

This study implemented attribute coding for each case in order to cultivate a greater understanding of the individuals involved at all stages of the trafficking act. The literature review in the previous chapter suggests that information regarding human trafficking is limited because research is lacking regarding specific traits of the trafficker, trafficked individual and the trafficking event. The coding instrument constructed for this study in order to obtain information from news accounts of human trafficking focused on the following characteristics of both the trafficker and trafficked individual: age, gender, initiation of transport, trafficker cooperation with others, method of transport, offender employment, previous arrests and convictions of trafficker, regions of arrest and origination, role of trafficker, and type of geographical move. The aforementioned characteristics were divided into fifteen attribute variables for coding purposes (See Appendix, Table 19).

- *Age of trafficker* was divided into the following valuations:
 - Unassigned, which was utilized if the article did not identify the age of trafficker or traffickers;
 - 18-25;
 - 26-35;
 - 36 and older;

¹⁸ Of the 354 articles transferred into the NVivo database, 140 (39%) articles were captured by the “human smuggling arrest” and “human smuggling prosecution” search tag lines. Of these 140 articles, 30 (21%) were captured in the other search taglines. Of the 110 (79%) articles captured only in the “human smuggling” related taglines, 65 (59%) articles were directly related to incidents characterized in the article and by law enforcement as human trafficking.

- Under 18; and
- Varies, which was utilized if there were multiple traffickers whose ages were either identified or unidentified, or whose ages varied over the aforementioned age categorizations.
- *Gender of trafficked person* was divided into valuations by age as follows:
 - Unassigned, which was used if the article offered no indication of gender or age or number of individuals trafficked;
 - Children—variety of ages under 18, which was used in cases where only children of multiple ages were identified as trafficked;
 - Female—adult 18-25;
 - Female—adult 26-35;
 - Female—adult 36 and older;
 - Female—child 10-14;
 - Female—child 15-17;
 - Female—child under 10;
 - Female—unknown age;
 - Females—variety of ages, which was used in cases where multiple victims were trafficked and either all, or some, of their ages were identified¹⁹;
 - Male—adult 18-25;
 - Male—26-35;
 - Male—36 and older;
 - Male—child 10-14;
 - Male—child 15-17;
 - Male—child under 10;

¹⁹ In cases where “Female—variety of ages” was coded as the attribute value, female children could have been trafficked along with female adults. This was also a possibility for the gender valuation of “Males—variety of ages,” which could include male children trafficked with male adults.

- Male—unknown;
- Males—variety of ages and;
- Males and Females—variety of ages, which was used when groups of two or more males and females were trafficked, with or without children, whether or not their ages were identified in an article.

I attempted to assess both the gender and age of the trafficked individuals in a comprehensive and concrete manner. The purpose of this coding method was to provide a stronger breakdown of the varying gender and ages of trafficked individuals than the frequently used concept of “men, women and children”. As mentioned previously, in order to assess those cases of multiple trafficked individuals, attribute values such as “Children—Variety of ages” and “Males and Females—Variety of ages” were created. Formation of attribute values that allowed for multiple ages and genders, grouped by commonalities, allowed for a more thorough analysis than leaving cases of multiples as “Unassigned”; however, it must be noted that designating a case under a particular attribute value does not indicate that only one individual was trafficked. Rather, if two females, both between the ages of 18 and 25, were trafficked, the attribute value was coded as “Female—Adult 18 to 25”; this category was rarely invoked.

- *Gender of trafficker* was divided into three valuations: male, female, and male & female. Although singular terms were used (e.g. - male), more than one male could be involved. This is true for the female and male & female valuations. The researcher noted that cases that involved female traffickers tended to specifically identify that a female offender was involved; however, cases where the article did not clearly identify gender, which the researcher assessed either through specific use of the term “male” or “female” or specific use of pronouns “he, she, him, her,” were left unassigned. In cases where the name of the offender was clearly male or female, the researcher coded the gender

of the individual accordingly.²⁰

- *Initiation of transport* was coded because of the implications for this study, as well as human trafficking research as a whole. As discussed previously, definitions of human trafficking and human smuggling do not necessarily rely on whether or not the trafficked or smuggled individual initiated transport, but once an individual is exploited, or if their transport occurred under fraudulent, coercive, or otherwise deceitful methods, the individual is a victim of a trafficking offence. Because of the definitional constraints of human trafficking and smuggling, the researcher opted to code with the following valuations: Unassigned, which was used if there was no indication that a trafficked individual had been coerced, deceived, forced, exploited²¹ or if there was no indication or certain clarity that a trafficked individual had agreed to be transported; Trafficked person, which was used if the trafficked individual agreed to transport and was not coerced, deceived or forced into the decision and was not exploited upon arrival at the destination country²²; Trafficker—force, which was used in all cases involving only children²³ and in cases where a trafficked individual was physically, mentally or emotionally forced into the trafficking act or the

²⁰ For example, names that included Mohammed, or any deviation of the spelling, were considered males. In addition, the name “Kaur” is commonly a middle name for females in Indian culture; any occurrences of this name were coded as female.

²¹ The concept of exploitation will be addressed in the Discussion chapter of this study because exploitation is subjective based on a variety of factors, including the geographic region, culture and social status of an individual, whether trafficker or trafficked individual.

²² The concept of exploitation is complex and for this study I only coded for exploitation in cases where it was implicitly clear in the article whether or not exploitation occurred. However, I did not assume that a case of exploitation did not occur if an article failed to mention exploitation; in these types of delicate cases, the researcher used the context of the article to assess exploitation, but did so without interpretation; for example, if a trafficked individual was involved in prostitution, the researcher did not assume that involvement in the sex industry implied sexual exploitation unless the article specifically addressed the force, coercion, luring or deceit of the trafficker in order to involve the trafficked person in prostitution. Any cases of ambiguity regarding force, deceit, exploitation and coercion were coded as “Unassigned” in order to legitimate the study as much as possible.

²³ All cases involving only children, without parental accompaniment, were coded as forced trafficking because I employed the United Nations definition of human trafficking and human smuggling for this study and the United Nations specifically identifies that children under the age of eighteen are unable to legally consent to the act of trafficking (UNODC, 2006).

ensuing exploitation; Trafficker—non-force, fraud or coercion, which was used in cases where a trafficked person was duped, lured, coerced or deceived into either the illegal migration or exploitation after arrival at the destination country.

- *Level of trafficker cooperation with others* was divided into the following valuations in order to assess the level of organization of the trafficking offence: Unassigned, which was used if the level of cooperation with others was unclear; Trafficker acted as an individual; Trafficker acted with family members; Trafficked acted with one other individual; Trafficker involved in organized crime, which was used only when the article identified an individual's ties to a specific organized crime ring²⁴; Trafficker involved in smuggling/trafficking organization, which was used when the article specifically identified the trafficker's involvement in a smuggling or trafficking ring, but not an organized crime ring.
- *Method of transportation of trafficked individual* was divided into the following: Unassigned, which was used if the article offered no indication of method of transportation of the trafficked individual; Air—plane, etc.; Automobile—truck, car, trailer, train, etc.; Sea vessel—boat, shipping container, etc.; On foot.
- *Offender employment/ community position* was assessed using the following valuations: Unassigned; Civilian, which includes landed immigrants; Government—aid worker; Government—military; Government—police; Government—politician; Illegal immigrant. In cases where a trafficker was arrested in a country different from their country of residence but there was no indication that the trafficker had illegally migrated to the country of arrest and was merely present in the

²⁴ The level of organization of human trafficking is currently under debate in academic circles, with the debate focusing on whether human traffickers are engaging in organized crime or whether human traffickers are engaging in a crime that is organized. For the purpose of this study, the researcher coded for organized crime only if it was evident in the article that the individual involved was involved in a specific organized crime ring. As well, if it was evident that the trafficker was only involved in the smuggling or trafficking of humans, the researcher coded the trafficker as being involved in a smuggling/trafficking ring. This dichotomy will be addressed further in the Discussion chapter.

country for the trafficking act, the offender employment was coded as unassigned.

- *Previous arrest(s) of trafficker* was an attribute value created in order to assess the recidivism rates of trafficking; however, the results of this attribute were missing 98% of the time. The lack of previous arrests reported in this study does not suggest that repeat offending rarely occurs for trafficking offenders. Rather, this could suggest that previous arrest information is not made known to the media, that previous arrests did not occur because of the relative novelty of trafficking legislation, or that previous arrests did not occur.
- *Previous conviction(s) of trafficker* was created with similar intentions regarding recidivism and repeat offending and yielded the same insignificance as the previous arrest category.
- *Region of arrest of trafficker* was divided into the following valuations regarding geographic region of arrest: Unassigned, which was used in cases where a trafficked individual was identified but the trafficker eluded arrest; Africa; Asia—not including Russia; Australia; Canada; Central America; Eastern Europe; Mexico; Middle East; Russia; South America; Southeast Asia; United States; Western Europe.
- *Region of origination of trafficker* was divided into the same valuations as region of arrest of trafficker, but included one additional valuation: Various, which was used when multiple traffickers were involved in one trafficking act but did not all originate from the same region or country. If the article did not provide the region of origination of the trafficker, the “Unassigned” attribute value was used. However, if multiple traffickers were arrested but the region of origination was provided for only a select few, the select few were coded based on the information provided (e.g. – three individuals arrested and two identified as Mexican nationals and the other unknown, Mexico was the assigned attribute value). In any cases of uncertainty, as with all attribute values for all attribute categories, the case was designated as “Unassigned.”

- *Region of origination of trafficked individual* was divided and systematically coded using the same methods employed for the region of origination of trafficker. The “Various” category was used in cases where multiple trafficked persons from multiple regions or countries were identified in one single trafficking act.
- *Role of trafficker* was divided into the following attribute valuations: Unassigned, which was used if the article did not disclose the trafficker’s role; End user—domestic work, which was used if the trafficked person was involved in positions of domestic servitude (e.g. – housekeeper, maid, nanny, au pair); End user—labourer, which was used if the trafficked person was involved in occupations of labour outside of the home (e.g. – construction, gardener, drug runner, day labourer with variety of tasks); End user—prostitution, which was used in the trafficked individual was involved in prostitution services ranging from massage parlours, brothels, or any other form of prostitution; End user—unknown, which was used when it was clear that the trafficked individual was functioning for an end user, but the trafficked individual’s specific function was not disclosed; Middleman—transportation, which was used in all cases where the trafficker was involved in the physical transportation of the individual or was involved in the acquiring of travel documentation and additional items required for travel; Procurer, which was used when the trafficker purchased an individual from another individual for the purpose of re-sale for profit; Recruiter, which was used in cases where the trafficker recruited individuals, usually in order to exploit the trafficked individual for profit; Various—multi-dimensional role, which was used for all cases where the trafficker engaged in any of the above attribute values relating to the role of the trafficker and all cases where multiple traffickers were involved at multiple stages for one trafficking case.
- *Arrest of trafficked individual* was divided into the following valuations in order to determine how trafficked individuals were treated after the

trafficking act: Unassigned, which was used in cases where the arrest of the trafficked individual was not disclosed; No; Yes-immigration related, which was used when trafficked individuals were arrested for immigration violations; Yes—prostitution related, which was used when trafficked individuals were arrested for their prostitution related activities; Yes—for other offences, which was used when the trafficker was arrested for either undisclosed reasons or the trafficker was arrested for other offences relating to the trafficking act (e.g. – Asian and Southeast Asian trafficked individuals were often arrested for Immoral Trafficking if engaged in activities deemed immoral by the arresting government).

- *Type of geographical move* was divided into the following valuations in order to assess the modes of geographical transport frequented by human traffickers and smugglers: Unassigned, which was used when a lack of information was available in order to assess the type of move; Cross-border—country to country, which was used when a direct border cross occurred (e.g. – border-sharing countries) and was used when a direct-flight via air was utilized for movement of the trafficked individual²⁵; Cross-border—several countries, which was used when evidence suggested that several border crossing occurred from origination to destination country; International—continent to continent, which was used when trafficked individuals were moved from one continent to another regardless of the geographical proximity of the movement between continents (e.g. – if an individual moved from Russia to Britain, this was assessed as an international move because two continents were involved); Regional—no border cross, which was used for all cases where the trafficking act, for which the trafficker was arrested, occurred within a single country and no border crossing

²⁵ Direct flights likely created a situation where only one border crossing occurred and traffickers and trafficked individuals were not required to clear immigration at multiple border crossings, if applicable.

occurred.²⁶

The purpose of this specific selection of attributes was to create a set of variables that could address facets of the trafficking offence that are currently underrepresented in the literature. The lack of empirical studies that assess concrete cases of human trafficking is troubling and this deficiency implies a possible lack of understanding of the trafficker, the trafficked individual and the trafficking act. The aim of this study is to develop a greater comprehension of facets of the trafficking act, including the trafficker and trafficked individual, in order to better evaluate the occurrence of human trafficking. With this particular purpose in mind, I created attributes that could be compared to results from previous studies. The specific attributes utilized in the study will offer insights into the trafficking offence that might not have been previously realized because previous studies have failed to focus on specific cases of human trafficking. The selection of attributes was not arbitrary; prior to the selection of the aforementioned variables for coding, samples of the cases in the database were assessed prior to coding in order to define attributes readily available within the articles themselves. In addition, if an attribute that had not originally been created for coding was present in several articles, the attribute was created after the fact and each article was re-coded for any variables added throughout the coding process.

Each article was read through once (see Appendix, Figure 1 for example

²⁶ If an individual had previously been trafficked into a country but was currently situated with a different trafficker who was moving them throughout a region without crossing a border, either legally or illegally, the “Regional” attribute value was assigned. This decision was based on the arrest of the trafficker for the particular portion of the trafficking act discussed in the article.

of an article that met the coding criteria for the study) and assigned attribute values based on the information contained within. If the information for an attribute was not present, was unclear, or was not evident, the attribute value was coded as “unassigned”. If conflicting information appeared in articles involved in a set of cases, the attribute value with conflict was left “unassigned”. After assessing all 354 articles and assigning attributes to the 191 unique cases, each article was reviewed and re-assessed twice in order to ensure that the attribute values assigned were representative of the information within the article. Any occurrences of uncertainty resulted in the removal of the attribute value and the reapplication of the “unassigned” value. For cases where a trafficked individual was involved in prostitution, I only assigned the attribute values of either “Trafficker – Force” or “Trafficker – Non-Force, Fraud or Coercion” if it was evident in the article that either of these had occurred; I made no assumptions that because an individual was involved in prostitution, he or she must have been forced, deceived or coerced.

Reliability of the coding scheme was tested through independent coding of 20 articles from the original sample size of 191. In order to create a blank slate for coding, I copied the original NVivo project and deleted all 191 coded articles. After deleting the 191 articles, I uploaded 20 articles that I had coded during the original coding stage. By first deleting the 191 articles and re-uploading 20, my attribute variables remained within the project but the 20 articles were no longer assigned any attribute values. Coding occurred in the same manner employed during the initial coding stage and each article was assessed. I selected

corresponding attribute values based on the information within the article. In total, 300 attribute values²⁷ were assigned to the 20 articles. Of the 300 attribute values, I assigned 1% (n=3) of the attribute values inconsistently during reliability coding.²⁸

This discussion of “cases” of human trafficking implies and refers to an *incident* of human trafficking, not a case where one individual was trafficked; an incident of human trafficking does not refer to multiple acts committed by one human trafficker, although multiple individuals, both trafficked and traffickers, could be involved in one single trafficking incident. Further coding practices are discussed in the next chapter within each section in order to address specific methods employed for assigning attribute values corresponding to each attribute.

²⁷ Fifteen attribute variables were employed in this study and reliability coding occurred with 20 articles.

²⁸ The three inconsistent attribute value coding occurred in regards to the trafficked person’s country of origin. During the initial coding stage I selected the attribute value “Various” and during reliability coding I selected the attribute value “Unassigned”. Upon re-reading the article, it was evident that for the cases where inconsistent coding occurred, multiple individuals had been trafficked and the country of origin was only provided for a few of the trafficked individuals.

RESULTS

Initial findings are presented in three areas of investigation in the 191 cases of human trafficking acts available for this study. These three areas consist of characteristics of the human trafficking act, offender characteristics and possible motives, and trafficked individual characteristics and possible motives. Descriptive statistics provided in this study are based on the total number of cases that met the criteria for coding²⁹. The 191 unique incidents captured by this study were all coded on some level. For example, if an article provided the age of the trafficker but did not provide the country of origination of the trafficked individual, coding would occur for the age attribute but not the country of origination—this attribute value would remain “unassigned”. I made this coding decision because my sample size would have been significantly smaller (less than 20) had I only coded articles that contained information regarding all attributes. The percentages of applicable cases versus those that could not be analyzed because of failure to meet coding criteria are provided in the Appendix (Table 20).

Characteristics of the human trafficking act

This study analyzes 191 unique incidents of human trafficking. The level of organization of the trafficking incident could not be determined for 11% (n=22) of

²⁹ Articles met the criteria for coding if they specifically addressed an incident of human trafficking resulting in an arrest and/or prosecution.

the cases. Of those that could be determined (n=169), 24% (n=40) were trafficking incidents where only one trafficker was involved while 78% (n=129) involved two or more individuals. Fifty-seven percent (n=96) of the incidents where organizational levels could be determined involved traffickers identified as participatory agents in smuggling and/or trafficking organizations (See Table 8). However, it was unclear, and could not be determined from the data, whether this means that trafficking is simply a crime that requires collaboration and hence is organized, or whether it is a crime perpetrated by organized crime.

LEVEL OF TRAFFICKER COOPERATION WITH OTHERS		
	N	%
Trafficker Acted as Individual	40	23.7
Trafficker Acted with Family Members	15	8.9
Trafficker Acted with One Other Individual	16	9.5
Trafficker Acted in Organized Crime Ring	2	1.2
Trafficker Involved in Smuggling/Trafficking Ring	96	56.8
Totals	169	100.0

Table 8: Level of trafficker cooperation with other individuals (N of missing cases = 22, or 11% of all cases coded)

The method of transport of trafficked individuals, which was assessed for the purpose of determining the most frequent method of transportation and the implications for a method's popularity, yielded 134 (70%) cases where the method of transport could not be determined. Of the 56 (30%) incidents coded for method of transport, 28 (50%) incidents occurred with the most common mode of transport—the automobile.

Trafficked person data. The gender and age of trafficked individuals was assessed within one particular attribute variable and the corresponding attribute values for coding simplicity. The gender and age of trafficked individuals could

not be determined for 13% (n=24) of the cases. Of the 167 that could, 42% (n=70) involved only females while 9% (n=15) involved only males. However, 44% (n=73) of incidents involved both males and females trafficked together. Children were involved in 13% (n=21) of cases, but are included in the aforementioned results if their gender was specified in the article. Five percent (n=9) of cases involved children of both genders and a variety of ages. Males were determined to be trafficked individuals in at least 53% (n=98) of incidents of human trafficking coded for this study (See Table 9).

GENDER AND AGE OF TRAFFICKED PERSON		
	N	%
Children (Variety of Ages Under 18)	9	5.4
Female (Adult 18-25)	3	1.8
Female (Adult 26-35)	1	0.6
Female (Adult 36+)	1	0.6
Female (Child 10-14)	4	2.4
Female (Child 15-17)	4	2.4
Female (Child Under 10)	2	1.2
Female (Unknown)	11	6.6
Females (Variety of Ages)	44	26.3
Male (Adult 18-25)	1	0.6
Male (Adult 26-35)	0	0.0
Male (Adult 36+)	0	0.0
Male (Child 10-14)	1	0.6
Male (Child 15-17)	0	0.0
Male (Child Under 10)	1	0.6
Male (Unknown)	1	0.6
Males (Variety of Ages)	11	6.6
Males and Females (Variety of Ages)	73	43.7
Totals	167	100.0

**Table 9: Gender and Age of trafficked person
(N of Missing Cases = 24, or 12.57%)**

Offender data. In 32% (n=61) of incidents the gender of the trafficker could not be determined. Of the 68% (n=130) of cases where this could be determined, 63% (n=82) of the incidents involved males (one or more) while 9% (n=12) involved females (one or more). The remaining 28% (n=36) of incidents

involved males and females (See Table 10).

GENDER OF TRAFFICKER		
	N	%
Male	82	63.1
Female	12	9.2
Male & Female	36	27.9
Totals	130	100.0

**Table 10: Gender of trafficker
(N of missing cases = 61, or 31.9%)**

Of the incidents involving only female traffickers (n=12), 83% (n=10) were cases where the female involved in the trafficking act in order to exploit the trafficked individual. Of those 10 incidents of exploitation, 90% (n=9) were sexually exploitative. Incidents (n=36) involving men and women were exploitative 58% (n=21) of the time, and in cases where the traffickers were only male (n=82), the men involved were usually middleman involved in the transportation of trafficked individuals.

OFFENDER EMPLOYMENT/ COMMUNITY POSITION		
	N	%
Civilian	101	80.8
Government (Aid Worker)	0	0.0
Government (Military)	2	1.6
Government (Police)	9	7.2
Government (Politician)	5	4.0
Illegal Immigrant	8	6.4
Totals	125	100.0

**Table 11: Offender(s) community position and employment
(N of missing cases = 66 or 34.6%)**

The trafficker's position in the community of residence was undetermined in 35% (n=66) of the incidents. Of the 125 incidents where community position could be determined, 81% (n=101) involved civilians while 13% (n=16) involved

government employees. Six percent (n=8) of Incidents involved illegal immigrants.

The region of arrest of the trafficker could not be determined for 19% (n=36) of incidents. The inability to determine region of arrest was usually a result of trafficker eluding arrest. I chose to code these cases only if the trafficked individual had been arrested or if law enforcement had identified the traffickers but had failed to make an arrest. Of the 81% (n=155) of cases where this could be determined, the largest majority of arrests occurred in the United States (39% - n=60 cases), Southeast Asia and Asia—not including Russia (25% - n=39 cases), Europe—both Eastern and Western (16% - n=25 cases), and the Middle East (9% - n=14 cases).

REGION OF ARREST (TRAFFICKER)		
	N	%
Africa	5	3.2
Asia (Not Including Russia)	28	18.1
Australia	1	0.6
Canada	3	1.9
Central America	5	3.2
Eastern Europe	11	7.1
Mexico	0	0.0
Middle East	14	9.0
Russia	2	1.3
South America	1	0.6
Southeast Asia	11	7.1
United States	60	38.7
Western Europe	14	9.0
Totals	155	100.0

**Table 12: Region of arrest of trafficker(s)
(N of missing cases = 36 or 18.8%)**

Of the 60 incidents of arrests that occurred in the United States, 42% (n=25) were determined to be human smuggling offences because the police concluded that the trafficked individual was not exploited. These cases usually

resulted in the trafficked individual's deportation to their legal country of residence. Of the remaining 58% (n=35) of arrests in the United States, 57% (n=20) were for cases of exploitation, usually related to prostitution activities. The exploitation of trafficked individuals is key to understanding the trafficking offence because the status of victim is usually granted only to individuals who are exploited in some manner; however, the concept of exploitation, as assessed by this study, is subjective and tends to favour individuals who are sexually exploited, rather than the previously discussed modes of exploitation. This concept will be addressed in detail in later chapters of this study.

Characteristic and motives of the trafficker in reported cases of human trafficking and human smuggling

AGE OF TRAFFICKER		
	N	%
18-25	7	4.8
26-35	10	6.8
36+	14	9.6
Under 18	0	0.0
Varies (2+)	115	78.8
Totals	146	100.0

**Table 13: Age of trafficker
(N of missing cases = 45 or 23.6%)**

Age. The age of the trafficker, or of at least one of the traffickers involved in a trafficking act, could be assessed in 146 (76%) of the 191 cases analyzed by this study; however, of these 146 assessed cases, 115 (78%) of the cases involved two or more individuals. Of the 31 cases where the age of the trafficker was discerned, 23% (n=7) incidents involved a trafficker between the ages of 18 and 25, 32% (n=10) involved a trafficker between the ages of 26 and 35 while 45% (n=14) involved a trafficker over the age of 36. No incidents involved

traffickers under the age of eighteen.

Region of origination. Of the 191 cases in this study, the region of origination of the trafficker could be determined in 166 cases. The 25 (13%) incidents where the origination region was not determined was due to the absence of information and/or failure to apprehend the trafficker; however, in cases where police arrested one individual but failed to apprehend another, the nationality of the trafficker who eluded arrest was coded if reported in the article.

REGION OF ORIGINATION (TRAFFICKER)		
	N	%
Africa	6	3.6
Asia (Not Including Russia)	31	18.7
Australia	2	1.2
Canada	3	1.8
Central America	6	3.6
Eastern Europe	12	7.2
Mexico	7	4.2
Middle East	20	12.0
Russia	0	0.0
South America	1	0.6
Southeast Asia	10	6.0
United States	49	29.5
Western Europe	10	6.0
Various	9	5.4
Totals	166	100.0

Table 14: Region of origination of trafficker(s)
(N of missing cases = 25 or 13.1%)

Of the 166 incidents where region of origination was determined, traffickers originated in the largest percentages from the United States (29% - n=49), Southeast Asia and Asia—not including Russia (25% - n=41), Europe—Eastern and Western (13% - n=22), and the Middle East (12% - n=20).

Traffickers cooperating together but originating from different regions of the world represented 5% (n=9) of the 166 incidents.

Role of the trafficker. The role of the trafficker was not determined for 15% (n=29) of incidents. Of those where the role was determined, the trafficker or trafficker(s) acted as the middleman in 39% (n=64) of incidents while 29% (n=47) involved traffickers with multi-dimensional roles. Twenty-seven percent (n=44) of incidents involved traffickers acting as end-users.

ROLE OF TRAFFICKER(S)		
	N	%
End User (Domestic Work)	6	3.7
End User (Labourer)	6	3.7
End User (Prostitution)	31	19.1
End User (Unknown)	1	0.6
Middleman (Transportation)	64	39.5
Procurer	1	0.6
Recruiter	6	3.7
Various (Multi-Dimensional Role)	47	29.0
Totals	162	100.0

Table 15: Role of trafficker(s)
(N of missing cases = 29 or 15.2%)

Of these 44 incidents, 70% (n=31) of the incidents involved end-users who were exploiting trafficked individuals for prostitution-related activities. Fourteen percent (n=6) were incidents of exploitation for domestic work while 14% (n=6) were incidents of exploitation for labour related activities. The 31 incidents of end-user prostitution exploitation represented 19% of all 166 assessed incidents of trafficking.

Characteristics and motives of the trafficked individuals in reported cases of human trafficking and human smuggling

Region of origination of trafficked person. The region of origination of trafficked persons was not determined for 13% (n=25) of incidents. When this was determined, 21% (n=35) of incidents involved individuals from North America

(including the United States, Canada and Mexico) while 31% (n=51) of incidents involved individuals from Southeast Asia and Asia—not including Russia.

REGION OF ORIGINATION (TRAFFICKED PERSON)		
	N	%
Africa	15	9.0
Asia (Not Including Russia)	40	24.1
Australia	0	0.0
Canada	1	0.6
Central America	13	7.8
Eastern Europe	9	5.4
Mexico	21	12.7
Middle East	14	8.4
Russia	5	3.0
South America	3	1.8
Southeast Asia	11	6.6
United States	13	7.8
Western Europe	0	0.0
Various	21	12.7
Totals	166	100.0

**Table 16: Region of origination of trafficked person
(N of missing cases = 25 or 13.1%)**

Trafficking incidents with more than one trafficked individual from varying regions of origination accounted for 13% (n=21) of the trafficking cases. Africa (9% - n=15), Central America (8% - n=13) and the Middle East (8% - n=14) represented the next largest regions of origination of trafficked persons for incidents where this attribute was determined. The regions of origination representing the lowest percentage of trafficked individuals were Russia (3% - n=5), Eastern Europe (5% - n=9) and South America (2% - n=3).

Initiation of transport. The role of the trafficker, as examined by this study, appears to correlate positively to the initiation of transport of the trafficking act; that is, in cases where the trafficker was arrested as a middleman the trafficked individual usually initiated the trafficking act in order to obtain residency in another country, either legally or illegally.

INITIATION OF TRANSPORT		
	N	%
Trafficked Person	74	54.8
Trafficker (Force)	29	21.5
Trafficker (Non-Force, Fraud or Coercion)	32	23.7
Totals	135	100.0

**Table 17: Initiation of transport
(N of missing cases = 56 or 29.3%)**

Initiation of transport was not determined for 29% (n=56) of incidents. When this was determined, 55% (n=74) of incidents involved trafficked individuals who initiated the trafficking event without force, fraud or coercion by the trafficker. These 74 incidents were determined by law enforcement to have been non-exploitative acts. Twenty-two percent (n=29) of incidents involved force while 24% (n=32) involved fraud or coercion, absent of force. Included in the 22% of incidents involving force are the 13% (n=21) of trafficking incidents involving children, who were trafficked without adults supervision and were subsequently coded as “forced” into the trafficking act.

Arrest of the trafficked individual. Although the arrest of trafficked individuals was not determined in 53% (n=101) of incidents, when this could be determined, 50% (n=45) of incidents did not result in arrest. Of the 50% (n=45) of incidents that did result in arrest, 2% (n=2) were prostitution-related while 38% (n=34) were immigration-related. The remaining 10% (n=9) of incidents resulting in arrest were related to other offences. Incidents where arrest occurred based on immorality, as defined by the arresting government, were often related to prostitution. Incidents such as these were included in the “Yes-Other Offences” category. Included in the 50% of cases where arrest did not occur were the 13%

(n=21) of cases involving children.

TRAFFICKED INDIVIDUAL ARREST		
	N	%
No	45	50.0
Yes (Other Offences)	9	10.0
Yes (Immigration Related)	34	37.8
Yes (Prostitution Related)	2	2.2
Totals	90	100.0

**Table 18: Arrest of trafficked individual
(N of missing cases = 101 or 53.9%)**

DISCUSSION

This study analyzes 191 separate cases of human trafficking and human smuggling and offers insight into the act of human trafficking, including the patterns and methodologies of specific parties involved. Some cases involved in the study, particularly dealing with the trafficking of individuals for sexual exploitation, reflect current trends in human trafficking literature. While this study addresses some of the gaps in the literature, it also generates many additional questions regarding human trafficking.

First, the arrest and prosecution patterns discovered in the current study suggest that the current definitional issues of trafficking are capable of preventing the effectiveness of human trafficking legislation. This concept is especially evident in cases of arrest and prosecution where human trafficking legislation was used for a crime that involved immigrant smuggling without exploitation. The results of this study also indicate definitional issues relating to legislation when considering that cases of illegal immigration involving female migrants resulted, more often than not, in charges of human trafficking.

Second, the lack of participation on a global scale to limit trafficking is also evident in the results of the study. Specifically, only countries that employ anti-trafficking legislation are captured by the researcher's results. While this may limit the universality of the results, this study is able to evaluate the effectiveness of trafficking legislation in countries where such legislation exists because the

results of this study capture arrests and prosecutions as they occur in countries with anti-trafficking legislation. The majority of countries without trafficking legislation are originating countries³⁰ and current detection and prevention methods result in most arrests occurring in the destination country (UNODC, 2006).

Third, like the debates surrounding definitions of human trafficking, issues surrounding the amalgamation of human trafficking and prostitution is strongly evident in the results of this study; expressly, the problematic issue of exploitation and proof of such claims. Law enforcement frequently perceived cases involving brothels and massage parlours as cases of human trafficking rather than illegal immigration. However, law enforcement was rarely able to prove these beliefs, often because the illegal immigrants denied that they were exploited. In other instances, illegal immigrants employed as day-labourers claimed that they had been exploited and law enforcement was unable to prove such claims. In one case that was read for this study, but not coded, illegal immigrants employed at a tree nursery only made claims of exploitation after their demands for higher pay were rejected (“US suit says”, 2007).

Fourth, the results of this study regarding country of origin of trafficker and trafficked individual suggest that debates regarding global socioeconomic problems and the likelihood of these economic problems fuelling the sex trade may be slightly unfocused, but economic problems are likely still affecting the human trafficking trade in some medium. Results pertaining to initiation of

³⁰ Countries where trafficked individuals originate.

transport indicate that individuals are willing to put themselves in danger in order to escape their country of origin for the chance to obtain economic stability in the destination country. Some cases analyzed by this study suggest that females willingly prostitute themselves in the country of destination in order to gain financial security. Research conducted by Bruckert & Parent (2004) further supports this notion. The results of this study also indicate that both males and females are willingly employed in destination countries with less than average pay because the economic stability they gain from these wages outweigh the hardships of their country of origin.

Fifth, the homeland security versus human security issue regarding trafficking legislation is extremely evident in the results regarding initiation of transport and the patterns of arrest in destination countries; this theme is particularly problematic in regards to the United Nations and United States published reports that highlight countries involved in human trafficking. United States human trafficking arrest patterns, as analyzed by this study, indicate that human smuggling offences are often documented as human trafficking offences. The results of this study also raise questions regarding the failures of certain bodies of law enforcement that are utilized in the fight against human trafficking. Specifically, the results raise questions regarding whether or not border patrol agents are effective in garnering arrests for human trafficking rather than human smuggling, and problems surrounding the use of vice units to detect sexual exploitation among prostitutes.

Also evident in this study is the importance of the media in regards to

human trafficking awareness, legislation and policies. The media's capability to shape the general public's understanding of human trafficking is of considerable importance because too strong a focus by the media on the sexual exploitative side of trafficking can lead to ineffective policies and legislation seeking to end the phenomenon. This study attempted to eliminate the bias of the media through a collection and coding methodology that focused specifically on cases of human trafficking arrests and/or prosecutions. This study began with thousands of articles that dealt with human smuggling, human trafficking and sex trafficking. An original sample size in the thousands that diminishes to 191 separate incidents of human trafficking arrests/prosecutions suggests further research and analysis is required in order to better understand rates of human trafficking. My suggestion for the types of human trafficking research that should occur is detailed in the final section of this paper.

The effect of the media on the general public's perception of human trafficking

Although online media sources depict only a small portion of human trafficking events, the importance of the media is found in its ability to shape public perception and policy. As described by Boots & Heide (2006), "the public draws conclusions from cases about which they become familiar [and] legislators, similar to their constituents, often formulate policy on what they know about a phenomenon, particularly when it is one that inflames passion (p. 435)." Boots & Heide's concept is evident in human trafficking media coverage, and while the accuracy of what the media reports cannot be guaranteed for all

cases, the notion that the media tends to focus on the most heinous and sensational crimes is important to this study (Boots & Heide, 2006; Ericson, 1995; Jewkes, 2004).

This study's indication of the tendency of the media to focus on sexual servitude and forced prostitution means that cases involving flagrant sexual exploitation are over-reported by the news media. While some of these cases may have been lost in the initial data collection stages, cases involving such blatant exploitation were often covered in numerous news sources and were frequently captured in the results of this study.³¹ Although one might argue that countries without anti-trafficking legislation would not be represented in these cases of sexual exploitation, the act of forced sexual servitude is considered in the human trafficking literature to occur in the destination country. As such, the arrest and prosecution for the sexual exploitation would occur in the destination country.

As claimed in much of human trafficking literature, the developed world acts as the demand side of the global sex trade. If true, the destination country for sexual exploitation is more likely to be a developed country. The majority of developed countries in the world have ratified the United Nations convention against human trafficking and have adopted legislation to prevent trafficking and sexual exploitation (UNODC, 2006). These concepts are important for human

³¹ I did not systematically analyze the number of times an article appeared in various newspapers because the nature of the Google News Archive (GNA) search engine algorithms prevented me from doing so. GNA algorithms are specifically created to minimize the number of newspaper articles reporting on the same news story. The goal of this study was to capture as many unique incidents of human trafficking as possible during the January 2007 to June 2007 time period.

trafficking research, and this study in particular, because they suggest that cases involving sexual exploitation would be covered by the news media if the idea holds true that the demand side of the global sex industry is fuelled by developed nations.³²

The results of this study, particularly relating to the number of individuals trafficked for sexual exploitation, may explain why, in the initial stages of the data collection, many articles were eliminated from consideration because they failed to address a concrete case of human trafficking. Many such articles told stories of young women forced into sexual servitude, but frequently failed to mention any specific details regarding a trafficking offence and rarely used real names and locations. While it is certainly possible that these editorial-style reports were based on actual cases of trafficking, little explanation can be provided for why some articles were specifically related to a trafficking offence and others merely adopted what could be perceived as a scare-tactic approach to addressing sex slavery.

This tactical method of evoking fear from the general public is also evident with the growing popularity of television news media coverage, like MSNBC's "Sex Slaves in the Suburbs" (2008), which seeks to address issues pertaining to human trafficking. One particular article assessed by this study suggested individuals practice diligence in assessing the possibility that their neighbours may be victims of human trafficking (VerPlanck, 2007).

³² In the case of sexual exploitation of children, the notion that the demand side controls the industry may still hold true; however, the difference in the case of children is that the demand side will travel to countries, such as Thailand, in order to engage in sexual acts with minors.

Although cases of human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation do exist, the results of this study show trends in human trafficking that suggest that a significant number of trafficking arrests and prosecutions are not related to sexual exploitation; in fact, the results of this study demonstrate that a significant proportion of trafficking incidents involved trafficked males (53% - n=89). Although 7% (n=6) of the trafficked males were exploited, the remaining 93% (n=83) were willingly smuggled without force or coercion and no exploitation occurred in the destination country.³³ This is not to say that no men are trafficked for exploitative purposes, but rather that trafficked males are rarely given the victim-status attention that their female and child counterparts receive in the media. Media portrayals of human trafficking as a dichotomy between a powerful male and a vulnerable female describe only a small proportion of human trafficking.

Definitional issues affecting arrests and prosecutions of human trafficking

Significant portions of the human trafficking literature position males as the exploiters and females as the victims in human trafficking. The current study indicates problems with this polarity. My data suggest that females were involved in exploitation, either with or without the cooperation of males in 51% (n=31) of the 61 exploitation incidents. Also, female offenders were frequently involved in the sexual exploitation of trafficked women and children, which is inconsistent with the notion that men exploit and women are exploited (Bertone,

³³ Because many of the trafficked individuals were discovered en route to their final destination, it cannot be determined whether the trafficked males were trafficked for exploitation or willingly smuggled.

1999; Jeffreys, 1997; Shannon, 1999).

If sexual exploitation were a male versus female phenomenon, the current study would reflect this dichotomy; however, the results do not aptly characterize the sexual exploitation of trafficked individuals as a male-dominated and male-only perpetrated crime. While it is likely that a portion of the 29% (n=47) of cases involving individuals with multi-dimensional trafficking roles (both males and females) were involved in sexual exploitation, even if *all* were perpetrating sexual exploitation, 44%(n=71) of the cases analyzed by this study still would be non-exploitative. This is further illustrated by the finding that 55% (n=74) of cases evaluated by this study involved non-exploited individuals who were willingly trafficked without force, fraud or coercion.

The literature asserts that human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation is a significant problem. Debates in the literature regarding the force/choice dichotomy of prostitution (Busza, 2004; Derks, 2000; Gulcur & Ilkkaracan, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Kelly, 2003; Murray, 1998, Wijers, 1998) and the domination of patriarchal structures as the primary reason for sexual exploitation and human trafficking (Murray, 1998; Shannon, 1999) create a situation where all acts of human migration within the sex trade are deemed exploitative acts of human trafficking. The results of this study suggest otherwise. Some explanations for this discrepancy are as follows:

- Human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation is overrepresented in the literature and does not accurately portray the reality of the phenomenon;
- The nucleus of sexual exploitation literature focuses on a male/female

dichotomy and fails to represent or analyze the female offender involved in human trafficking;

- Legislation seeking to halt human trafficking does not target the offenders who are engaging in exploitation;
- As a consequence of the legislation, appropriate law enforcement is not utilized in order to identify and apprehend the offenders perpetrating sexually exploitative trafficking offences
- Failure of law-enforcement to actively track and identify cases of exploitation; in many instances, as is the case in the United States, immigration officials are the individuals often responsible for tracking human trafficking cases
- Defining the subjective concept of exploitation with objective laws may lead to an over-encompassing definition that fails to identify specific components of human trafficking acts

Overrepresentation of sexual exploitation in the literature

The focus on the male/female dichotomy in the literature might have led to over-representations of sexual exploitation and forced human trafficking into a debate regarding prostitution and the subjugation of women by men for male sexual satisfaction. While forced prostitution is a significant issue, especially when involving minors, the human trafficking literature may be misleading in its attempts to understand the trafficking act. Human trafficking may not even be the issue: the results of this study suggest that human smuggling is receiving attention as human trafficking and may be inflating arrest rate statistics. Human smuggling is, as reported in this study, frequently categorized as human trafficking.

Many in the human trafficking literature (Bertone, 1999; Busza, 2004;

Derks, 2000; Doezema, 1998, 2000, 2002, 2003; Gulcur, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Kelly, 2003; Murray, 1998; Savona et al., 1996; Wijers 1998) focus on the force/choice dichotomy of individuals involved in prostitution, with a portion regressing (Bertone, 1999; Jeffreys, 1999; Savona et al., 1996) to discussions of the prevalence of human trafficking as a result of patriarchal domination of society. Bertone (1999) contends that the international political economy of sex is maintained by men from industrialized and developed nations, and that “the patriarchal world system hungers for and sustains the international subculture of docile women from underdeveloped nations” (p. 4). While the sentiment that Bertone posits is not a fabrication of the culture and politics of human trafficking, the construction of Bertone’s statement continues the polarization and stereotypical view of men versus women in human trafficking. More specifically, the grammatical structure of Bertone’s statement immediately suggests that the female acts as a “docile” individual in a patriarchal society (p. 4) and thereby further perpetuates the antagonism between men and women.

The notion that the demand side of the trade fuels human trafficking is neither surprising nor revolutionary. However, Bertone and others (Busza, 2004; Derks, 2000; Doezema, 1998, 2000, 2002, 2003; Gulcur, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Savona et al., 1996; Shannon, 1999; Wijers 1998) fail to recognize the importance of the female human trafficking offender and, more importantly, continue to place blame on the consumer for actions for which he may not be directly related. Although there is a possibility that education of the sex consumer regarding the possibility of a prostitute being a victim of human

trafficking may yield positive results in the reduction of male consumers in the sex trade, it is unlikely that the demand for sex will cease. The bigger issue is that by demonizing the client as part of the problem a situation is created where men are unlikely to report cases of exploitation because of the repercussions of reporting their involvement with a prostitute. It is important that feminist discourse of the global sex trade do not overwhelm the literature on human trafficking because its male/female dichotomy blinds us to other issues, such as the female offender, pertinent to human trafficking.

Further complicating this issue is the possibility that those involved in the human trafficking debate are unwilling to question the authenticity of a trafficking individual's claim. If a young woman is forced or coerced, or voluntarily agrees to prostitution in order to repay her debt to her trafficker (debt-bondage) and then claims exploitation, it is more likely that she will be treated as a victim of human trafficking. However, a double standard is evident in this study: a young man who is forced or coerced, or voluntarily agrees to drug trafficking in order to repay his debt to his trafficker, is less likely to receive either victim status or sympathy like that garnered for his female counterpart. Situations like this suggest that the issue with human trafficking is not exploitation but rather prostitution and rape. This is further exemplified in the Toronto Peel Region (Canada) case where a young woman was gang raped at an acquaintance's home, and the young men involved in the rape were charged with human trafficking offences. Law enforcement added a charge of human trafficking to the original rape charges because they perceived that the young man had brought the young woman to the

party in order to rape her. This double standard is also evident in the failure of those who claim that sexual exploitation is shaped by the male/female dichotomy (Busza, 2004; Derks, 2000; Doezema, 1998, 2000, 2002, 2003; Gulcur, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Savona et al., 1996; Shannon, 1999; Wijers 1998) to address the frequency of women perpetrating forced prostitution and other acts of sexual exploitation.

The female human trafficking offender

The female offender involved in human trafficking is the least researched and analyzed individual in the human trafficking process. I would suggest she is one of the most theoretically important elements of human trafficking given the literature that attributes human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation to a male/female dichotomy purported to have been created by the patriarchal domination of society (Bertone, 1999; Derks, 2000; Gulcur, 2002; Gulcur & Ilkcaracan, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Savona et al., 1996). It is not unreasonable to conclude that a significant portion of human trafficking involves males, but it would be erroneous to suggest that men represent the entirety of the problem. The current study reveals that females are involved in human trafficking offences with and without their male counterparts. Indeed, female offenders are more likely to be involved in the sexual exploitative side of human trafficking and this is even more likely when they act alone, with other females, or as the head of a trafficking organization. Failure to recognize the female exploiter leaves the literature incomplete and based on questionable premises such as the male/female dichotomy and the domination of patriarchal ideals in

the sex industry.

As characterized by Malarek (2006), female victims of forced prostitution have indicated that the female trafficker is often more violent and more brutal than her male counterpart; however, it is possible that this perceived heightened violence and brutality by female traffickers is directly correlated to the belief that females are the more nurturing and caring gender. That is, the behaviour of female traffickers may be on par with their male counterparts and is only perceived to be more violent because the behaviour is out of character for the female gender. The failure of female offenders to remain in character based on gender standards is an interesting component of human trafficking, and general criminological, research.

Fagan (1994) contends that female participation in deviant economies occurs as a result of the restructuring of social conditions in particular markets, as well as the expansion of illegal markets, which has increased roles for women. Mieczkowski (1994) echoes the role complexities of women involved in illicit activities, specifically roles of women involved in drug trafficking. Although Mieczkowski contends that female participation in the drug economy often occurs as a result of relationships with males already involved in drug trafficking, Fagan posits that female involvement may result in the perceived profitability of an illicit market. Fagan also hints at problems in research relating to female gender-role deviation and the perception that females are the more nurturing of the two genders. Focusing on gender deviance may create, as can be seen in human trafficking literature, conclusions that do not aptly define all characteristics of the

deviant act. The human trafficking literature that strongly focuses on the inequality of women fails to address the growing number of women involved in illicit markets as a direct result of increased equality between men and women. As Fagan suggests, the growth of equality between men and women has resulted in female access to previously male-dominated economies, including illicit ones.

Females have shifted from passive to active roles in economies previously controlled by men. This notion is evident in female trafficking offenders who operate in sexually exploitative aspects of the trafficking act without a male counterpart. Fagan's research on the involvement of women in drug trafficking suggests that women transition from roles of prostitution to active participation in the drug market because of profitability. The profitability of human trafficking provides female offenders an income option that protects them from the exploitation and health risks involved with prostitution. As such, female human traffickers are more likely to sell individuals into prostitution because of self-preservation resulting from the profitability of human trafficking rather than the perceived success of a patriarchal society.

Ineffective human trafficking legislation and misuse of law enforcement to detect and combat trafficking offences

The current study speaks to issues surrounding human trafficking legislation and the misuse of law enforcement in the prevention, detection and apprehension of individuals involved in the trafficking act. The majority of arrests in cases evaluated by this study occurred in the United States (39%, n=60).

Forty-two per cent of those (n=24) were determined by police to be human smuggling cases. Most of these involved individuals from Mexico and Central America who were travelling illegally to the United States in order to obtain employment.

The geographical proximity of Mexico and Central America to the United States meant that the majority of the arrests were made in Florida and the southwestern states (Arizona, California, Nevada and Texas), with additional arrest made at sea by the Coast Guard. Immigration officials made the vast majority of these arrests. This is an important factor in the human trafficking debate, because it is possible that immigration officials are more focused on apprehending illegal immigrants than detecting individuals trafficked against their will. Although the United States has created an immigration unit (ICE – Immigration and Custom's Enforcement) to deal with trafficking-related offences ("Increase in arrests strains", 2007), John P. Torres, the director of ICE indicated in a *Washington Post* interview on January 10, 2008 that the majority of arrests (26,500 a day in 2007) occurring in the United States deal with illegal immigrants from Mexico and Central America. It is this factor that suggests that individuals trafficked for exploitation may go undetected because American immigration officials and border patrol agents have a higher interest in border security and illegal immigrants. Human traffickers who recruit and transport individuals for exploitative purposes often do not have to hide their cargo. This is a result of the nature of the trafficking event: usually, individuals are fraudulently recruited with false employment offers. A trafficked individual will think that he or she is

travelling to the destination country for employment as a server, dancer, domestic worker, labourer, and so on, and only upon arrival realize the exploitation they will face. If they have not obtained illegal travel documentation, smuggled individuals often willingly place themselves in dangerous situations in order to avoid detection when illegally crossing the border.

During initial stages of the data collection procedure, I read several articles relating to the misuse of trafficking legislation in Arizona. These particular articles focused on a county sheriff who was charging illegal immigrants with human trafficking offences if they committed crimes in the United States. However, the committed acts did not pertain to trafficking offences and the trafficking legislation was invoked as a way to avoid simple deportation of an illegal immigrant. The sheriff admitted that his county would utilize trafficking legislation in this way, so as to avoid a lack of prosecution of illegal immigrants (“Arpaio gets tough”, 2007).³⁴ Smugglers who are apprehended by immigration officials are often charged under human trafficking legislation, not legislation specific to human smuggling. Such a policy is only effective in combating middlemen who provide transportation for illegal immigrants.

The area of law enforcement with the closest proximity to sexually exploitive trafficking offences is vice units dealing with prostitution prostitution-related activities. Vice units specifically engaging in the arrest and detention of prostitutes may fail to apprehend the individuals responsible for the trafficking offence and may induce fear in the trafficked individual they are to protect. If law

³⁴ These cases were not coded because they did not pertain to an actual event of human trafficking or smuggling resulting in an arrest or prosecution.

enforcement is to effectively combat human trafficking offences relating to sexual exploitation, task forces should be created that seek to track and identify sexually exploited prostitutes, without creating a fear of arrest. Vice units that continue to arrest prostitutes and then probe their status regarding human trafficking create unnecessary barriers that force situations where prostitutes may not feel comfortable revealing their status as a trafficked individual. Assessing and evaluating a claim of trafficking is possibly even more difficult, especially considering the likelihood that law enforcement is involved in human trafficking offences in various regions of the world (UNODC, 2006). Corruption of law enforcement may pose serious implications for the number of individuals trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation; it is plausible that human trafficking offences are underreported in regions where law enforcement is known to actively engage in corruption and, more specifically, prostitution.

Law enforcement cannot actively engage in combating a problem that may not exist in the numbers suggested by the media, government and human trafficking literature. Further accentuating the issue is the possibility that some willingly trafficked individuals may be unaware that they are being exploited, as defined by the country where they have been trafficked. A trafficked individual's lack of awareness may be a possible ramification of the economic and social realities of their legal country of residence.

Defining a subjective concept in the legal world

The subjectivity of exploitation is emphasized when law enforcement is required to determine the difference between a willing prostitute and a trafficked

prostitute. Although some determinations by law enforcement may occur quite easily, based on the condition in which a prostitute is found (e.g. if the individual is found in a house where he or she has been chained), other claims of exploitation may be less clear. An individual working as a prostitute may claim to be exploited in order to obtain victim rather than perpetrator status. Some individuals falsely claim exploitation in order to avoid prosecution, and possible deportation, for a crime in which they willingly participated. If a trafficked individual willingly and knowingly participated in illegal activities in order to secure residency in another country, at what point is it reasonable for law enforcement to question whether this individual is actively and freely engaging in prostitution? Although debates abound (Busza, 2004; Derks, 2000; Doezema, 1998, 2000, 2002, 2003; Gulcur, 2002; Jeffreys, 1997, 1999; Kelly, 2003; Murray, 1998; Savona et al., 1996; Wijers 1998) regarding whether or not individuals can choose such a profession, it would be a misrepresentation of the sex industry to suggest that every individual is involved against their will. Kelly's (2003) suggestion that the focus of female participation in prostitution rely not on force but on the perceived ability of an individual from a lower-socioeconomic to travel across continents lends credence to the need for questioning motivations of those involved in prostitution.

Although cases of debt-bondage exist, where women are forced to engage in prostitution in order to repay their traffickers, it is possible that cases also exist where a female agrees to actively participate in prostitution in order to

sustain a living in the country of destination.³⁵Fagan's (1994) research on female participation in drug trafficking suggests that women from lower socioeconomic communities become involved in illicit economies because income from illegal activities is often higher than that of legal activities. Considering Fagan's notion that "legal income from irregular hourly jobs (waitressing, delivery work, clerical work) offer low wages that only marginally meet the demands of women with family responsibility and who aspire to the material aspects of conventional lifestyles" (p. 16), women may immigrate to developed countries and involve themselves in prostitution after failing to acquire a steady income from the legal economy.

Bourgois (1989) contends that minorities experience racial humiliation and harassment in legal work, which adds to the incentive for participation in illegal economies. This suggests that individuals who immigrate, legally or illegally, from a foreign country may suffer when we consider the level of discrimination that exists against minorities in developed countries. If Bourgois is correct, it is tenable that immigrants may participate in illicit economies in order to secure a reasonable income. Ruminating the legitimacy of Fagan and Bourgois' claims, questioning the validity of a trafficking claim may appear insensitive but is not unfounded.

³⁵ One article analyzed for this study involved an Indonesian woman who contacted an Australian man to receive assistance in migrating to Australia (Wray, 2007). She informed law enforcement that she suggested that she could prostitute herself in order to repay the man. Issues over the amount of money earned versus what the woman received (\$11,000AUS vs. \$3300AUS) resulted in charges of human trafficking. The Indonesian woman and Australian man exchanged seven emails where the details of the transaction were identified and agreed upon. The woman also claimed that she did not receive the days off that she felt had been outlined in the agreement.

Further confounding exploitation cases is the notion that individuals may not realize or believe they are being exploited. For example, some articles reported that individuals agreed to be transported to another country in order to gain employment with wages comparable to those of their country of residence.³⁶ Based on the wages received for their current employment, it is unlikely that the trafficked individual would be considered a victim of exploitation in their country of origin. As such, the trafficked individual may not identify him or herself as exploited. Additional complexities arise when considering newly landed immigrants who employ individuals based on wages comparable to those of their country of origin. Intricacies regarding exploitation, like those aforementioned, require further attention in order to effectively legislate against acts of human trafficking.

Socioeconomic factors and human rights abuses in countries of origins of trafficked individuals

The results of this study partially support the suggestions in the human trafficking literature (Blanchet, 2002; Bruckert & Parent, 2002; Shannon, 1994; UNODC, 2006; Vocks & Nijboer, 2000) that women and children are trafficked, more often than not, from lower socioeconomic backgrounds, and from countries where women and children are not afforded the same rights as their male counterparts. The results of this study also suggest that socioeconomic factors are likely to motivate both traffickers and trafficked individuals to engage in

³⁶ Although the wages are comparable to their home country, some individuals agree to relocate to another country because they cannot obtain employment in their homeland. Also, some agree to relocate because they want their children to be raised in a country with more opportunities (like those offered by a developed nation).

human trafficking or smuggling. It is likely that men and women are equally affected by socioeconomic factors, and are willingly migrating to countries with greater employment prospects.

Of the 8% (n=13) of US cases where individuals were trafficked regionally, the majority were related to sexual exploitation. As such, it is plausible to conclude that developed countries are capable of fuelling their own regional sex trade and that women and children are exploited regardless of the rights granted to them by their governing body. If, as Shannon (1999) contends, poverty is a supporter of sexual exploitation and women are willing to sell themselves in order to provide for their families, then it is conceivable that some individuals willingly migrate in order to participate in the sex industry of the destination country. Human trafficking research must adequately deal with the notion that adults are actively pursuing roles in sex industries across the world.

While it is likely that socioeconomic factors influence decisions as to whether or not to pursue participation in the sex industry (Blanchet, 2002; Fagan, 1994; Mieczkowski, 1994, Shannon, 1994 Vocks & Nijboer, 2000), socioeconomic factors also influence whether or not individuals, both male and female, act as traffickers. Vocks & Nijboer (2000) suggest that women who are not coerced into sexual servitude are victims of strain and anomie, and are fighting against the dichotomy of expectations and few opportunities to succeed legally in society. Vocks & Nijboer's argument can be taken one step further and be applied to the female trafficker: women who sexually exploit other women are doing so, much like their male counterpart, in order to garner success in society.

Further research must be conducted in order to understand this dichotomy. As well, research and legislation must address the numbers of individuals, both male and female, who are initiating transport in order to secure employment in foreign lands.

Southeast Asia and Asia (not including Russia) represented a significant portion of traffickers and trafficked individuals (25% - n=42 and 31% - n=51, respectively) and trafficking arrests (25% - n=39). The United States closely mirrored the statistics of Southeast Asia and Asia (not including Russia) with 39% (n=60) of the arrests, 29% (n=48) of originating traffickers, and 8% (n=13) of originating trafficked individuals. However, the United States State Department released a report in 2008 that indicates a majority of Southeast Asian and Asian countries failed to adopt the TVPA (Trafficking Victims Protocols Act), which was created by the United States. The results of this study suggest that Southeast Asia and Asia are relatively on par with American attempts at thwarting human trafficking.

Although Southeast Asia and Asia have a significantly higher population than the United States, and, as such, may experience many more acts of human trafficking that go undetected, the cases analyzed by this study noted that when arrests did occur in Southeast Asia and Asia, multiple numbers of trafficked individuals were rescued, whereas few American cases of sexual exploitation resulted in the rescue of multiple victims. One possible explanation for this number differential could be a result of the propensity of Asian human traffickers to house larger numbers of individuals in one area. One case in particular

highlighted China's rescue of hundreds of trafficked individuals, originally from various regions of China, who were exploited in mines throughout the northeastern provinces of China ("Leaders order action", 2007). The number of trafficked individuals involved in the Chinese case is important because it highlights China's ability to detect large cases of human trafficking. Arrests in Southeast Asia and Asia were more frequently associated with exploitation than arrests that occurred in the United States.

Friman & Reich (2007) suggest a need for separation between illegal immigration and human trafficking for exploitation. Human trafficking definitional dilemmas are creating problems in legislative aspects of trafficking; this is especially the case when a nation adopts legislation that can be manipulated, or misappropriated, as was the case with the country sheriff in Arizona, so as to prevent the migration of undesirable individuals, or individuals from undesirable origination countries. The amalgamation of illegal immigration and human trafficking, and the use by some developed nations of immigration departments to combat trafficking may be creating situations where manifestations of human trafficking remain undetected. Further research is required in order to analyze the efficiency of government departments undertaking the task of reducing and eliminating acts of human trafficking.

Complexities of utilizing a human security versus homeland security approach to human trafficking

Ratification of legislation is no guarantee of improvement in combating human trafficking, as was shown by the fact that the cases analyzed by this study

rarely involved arrests in the countries appearing in the Tier 1 section of the TVPA.³⁷ Tier 1 countries are defined by the US State Department as those who have adopted the TVPA and are making significant achievements in ending human trafficking. Tier 1 countries are, in the majority, developed countries that align themselves with the policies of the United States. If Tier 1 countries were making significant steps the expected results of this study would show higher arrest and prosecution rates because of their mere appearance on the list.

The notion of expected arrest results is significant because of the perception that the developed world acts as the demand side of the sex industry. It is more likely that the exploitation of trafficked individuals would occur in the nations where the sexual activities are occurring: the developed world. Although this study did involve cases of human trafficking for sexual exploitation that occurred in Spain, Austria, Macedonia, the Netherlands, and the United Kingdom (all Tier 1 countries), arrests did not occur in the majority of the countries on the Tier 1 list for trafficking offences relating to exploitation; the problematic Tier 1 arrest rate is significant because the majority of Tier 1 countries are considered developed. As such, it is reasonable to suggest that the identification of countries with a high propensity for trafficking should not occur as a result of whether or not a country has ratified human trafficking legislation. Such identification methods may be unsuccessful in recognizing countries that are failing to actively suppress incidents of human trafficking.

³⁷ Tier 1 countries are as follows: Australia, Austria, Belgium, Canada, Columbia, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, France, Georgia, Spain, Germany, Hong Kong, Hungary, Italy, Rep. of Korea, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Macedonia, Madagascar, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Poland, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland, and the United Kingdom.

The results of this study support the notion that the United States appears to approach human trafficking as a homeland security issue. Of the 60 (39%) arrests/prosecutions that occurred in the US, 42% (n=25) were cases of illegal immigration, with the majority of individuals travelling from Mexico. These arrests were often defined as incidents of human trafficking and were prosecuted as such. The “trafficked” individuals in these cases were deported and the smugglers were charged with human trafficking. If these incidents were all acts of human trafficking, which can only be defined as such when the act is exploitative, then the “trafficked” individuals should not have faced immediate deportation (as suggested by the US TVPA).

The US’ homeland security approach to human trafficking is further exemplified when considering that countries not allied with the United States are frequently touted as strong participants in human trafficking, who are doing little to end the plight of trafficked individuals. Further indicative of the US’ security approach to human trafficking occurred with Malaysia’s adoption of democratic policies, coinciding with their ratification of the TVPA, and their subsequent removal from the TVPA watch list, by the United States; this is especially important considering Malaysia’s continued role in the child sex trade and the perceived corruption of law enforcement and government. A homeland security approach to human trafficking is problematic (Friman & Reich, 2007) because the approach suggests that a crime has occurred against the state, rather than the individual.

Although the results of this study indicate that the United States is taking

steps to prosecute individuals who are engaging in human trafficking for exploitation, this study reveals that the majority of arrests and prosecutions in the United States are related to immigration offences. The heavy focus on the United States in this section of the paper is a result of the tendency of the United States to claim that they lead by example in combating human trafficking. If human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation is occurring at the rates suggested by the United Nations and the United States, then steps must be taken in order to address human trafficking as a crime against the person. Notwithstanding the aforementioned, it is also important for human trafficking legislation to narrow its focus in order to differentiate between individuals who willingly migrate illegally in order to obtain employment, in either licit or illicit economies, and those who are forced, coerced or deceived into what they perceive to be legal migration.

CONCLUSION

This study provides descriptive data on 191 incidents of human trafficking found by examining Google News search engine during the fall of 2008.

Although all cases of human trafficking between January and June of 2007 were not captured, this study indicates numerous areas of human trafficking that require extensive hypothesizing and further research. The most salient point suggests that current trends in human trafficking research fail to comprehensively examine the female offender in the trafficking act. Further gaps in the area of human trafficking research determined by this study include the following:

1. The arrest and prosecution patterns suggest that current definitional issues of trafficking are capable of precluding the effectiveness of human trafficking legislation. Human trafficking definitions suggest that trafficking does not occur unless some type of exploitation occurs. This study found that several incidents of human smuggling were identified as human trafficking by both the media and law enforcement. Because the literature, media, and governments equate human trafficking with prostitution, cases of illegal immigration with women can be incorrectly defined as cases of human trafficking. This occurs because assumptions are made that migrant women are victims of trafficking and will be forced into prostitution. The results of this study suggest that women choose illegal migration and are not subjected to exploitation in relation to the migration event. The complexities of the human trafficking event create difficulties for prevention and punishment practices. If the events involved in human trafficking were defined as separate circumstances (recruitment, transport, and end user) it may be possible to better equip law enforcement with the

necessary tools for detection and prevention. The results of this study suggest that combining the factions of human trafficking into one definition and one law proves problematic. Further research comparing human trafficking incidents resulting in arrest with legislation of that particular arresting country may help to address this issue.

2. Countries with anti-trafficking legislation may be failing to detect and arrest cases of human trafficking because immigration departments and vice units are currently the governmental and police branches responsible for combating trafficking at the street and border level. Such units have proven themselves apt at detecting illegal immigration and prostitution, respectively, but have not proven themselves capable of detecting and apprehending individuals involved in human trafficking offences.
3. The fusion of prostitution and human trafficking literature in refining understandings of the human trafficking act is problematic. Levels of sexual exploitation in human trafficking are either less than previously perceived or remain undetected as a direct consequence of the failure of human trafficking legislation and law enforcement.
4. Debates regarding global socioeconomic problems and the likelihood of such economic problems fuelling the sex trade may be unfocused, but economic problems are likely still affecting the human trafficking trade in some medium. The human trafficking literature that focuses on the socioeconomic factors that lead women to prostitution does not effectively address females involved as human traffickers. It is more likely that the economy influences individuals, both male and female, to sell others for profit and self-preservation. It is less likely that the economy forces individuals into the global sex industry as a direct or indirect result of a global patriarchal society.
5. Many of the developed nations arresting individuals for human trafficking related offences are actually apprehending individuals alleged to be involved in smuggling illegal immigrants, not individuals trafficked for exploitative means. This anomaly could be the result of a disproportioned

focus on human trafficking rather than human smuggling. Because law enforcement and media identify cases of human smuggling as human trafficking, arrest rates may be disproportionate to the actual occurrences of human trafficking. Human trafficking may not be occurring at the rates currently highlighted in the literature. The rates of human trafficking may remain ambiguous if a homeland security approach to human trafficking continues.

Limitations of the current study and directions for future research

The nature of this study, and human trafficking research in general, poses several limitations. Perhaps the most significant limitation is the source of the data: newspaper articles. Although attempts were made during research to inhibit as many limitations as possible, this study has five noticeable limitations.

First, this study relied on English language electronic newspapers and this resulted in a limited search arena for articles reporting human trafficking arrests and prosecutions; however, this limitation did not prevent the researcher from collecting data from a wide variety of countries and regions of the world, including countries that do not employ English as a primary language. Further research focusing on a wide variety of newspaper articles in varying languages might enhance the understanding of human trafficking.

Second, the validity of the information contained within the newspaper articles regarding each individual trafficking event was not corroborated in all cases; however, validity checks were conducted at random for several cases for validation and such verification procedures resulted in validation of all cases submitted for substantiate analysis. It is extremely unlikely that Google News

search engine encompassed all human trafficking arrests and prosecutions from January to June 2007. It is highly plausible that many more incidents regarding human trafficking existed in this time period. It is also expected that many cases of human trafficking arrests and prosecutions went unreported by news media. In addition, governments that limit the reporting ability of the press might not be represented in this study.

Third, the decision to collect only articles available to the public, free of cost, and the lack of ability to import all cases collected into the NVivo database could result in the lack of analysis of cases of human trafficking. However, because the number of articles available at cost, as well as those that failed to upload, were equal over each monthly time period and search topic tagline, the loss of articles was equally represented throughout the study and should not have significantly disrupted the results. It is unlikely that all cases available at cost, or those that failed to upload, were related to sexual exploitation. This is a considerable postulation because the results of this study indicate previous numerical representations of human trafficking for sexual exploitation might be skewed.

Fourth, the lack of human trafficking legislation in specific regions of the world could be conceived as a significant limitation. Certain nations, as indicated by the United Nations as highly likely to engage in human trafficking offences (UNODC, 2006), do not currently have legislation sanctioning against the trafficking of human beings. As such, it may be that these nations would be less likely to produce newspaper articles pertaining to human trafficking arrests and

prosecutions. The political climate in each country reporting on human trafficking could influence the types of cases reported in the news media. A country, like the United States, which has a current political climate debating issues pertaining to illegal immigrants, may be more likely to report human trafficking crimes relating to illegal immigration; however, the current political climate of the United States also has a strong focus on suppressing the trafficking of human beings, specifically relating to sex trafficking, so it is likely that cases involving sex trafficking would be revealed by the news media. Sexual slavery receives heightened attention from North American news media, so it is highly likely that any cases regarding sex trafficking would be emphasized and would be captured, if not overemphasized, by the results of this study.

Lastly, it is probable that the international news media are not made aware of all cases of arrest and prosecution regarding human trafficking, and, as such, many cases remain unreported. In regards to unreported human trafficking crimes, it is expected that many cases of human trafficking remain unreported to the government, police or media; this is true of all crime. The aim of this study is to perform a content analysis of the specific articles collected in order to obtain additional insight into the human trafficking act. The human trafficking incidents, as collected for this study, may not be representative of all human trafficking incidents, but do represent a portion of incidents that do occur.

The results of this study clearly indicate a need for future collection and analysis of human trafficking data to determine if the limited media accounts of this study are representative of the overall phenomenon of, and responses to,

human trafficking. The results of this study also indicate a need for a better understanding of all actors involved in human trafficking; more specifically, the results suggest that the involvement of the female offender in the human trafficking act is extremely important in characterizing motivations for the proliferation of trafficking of human beings for profit.

APPENDIX

Printed from

THE TIMES OF INDIA The Times of India -Breaking news, views, reviews, cricket from across India



'Two more MPs involved in human trafficking'

21 Apr 2007, 1806 hrs IST, IANS

NEW DELHI: The arrest of Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) MP Babubhai Katara on the charge of running a human trafficking racket has opened a can of worms as one of his aides on Saturday named two more MPs in the scam.

Sunder Lal Yadav, a travel agent who was arrested on Saturday morning along with Rajendra Kumar Gampa and their female accomplice Kiran, told in the court of Additional Chief Metropolitan Magistrate Kamini Lau that Mohammed Tahir Khan and Ramswaroop Koli were also involved in the racket.

Khan is Bahujan Samaj Party MP from Sultanpur, Uttar Pradesh, while Koli of the BJP represents Bayana, Rajasthan.

The court sent Yadav to three-day police custody while Gampa was sent to five-day police custody. Kiran was remanded to judicial custody till May 4.

While Gampa, a part-time office assistant of Katara, was held on charges of forging documents and passports, Yadav was charged with arranging the visas, police said.

Katara, MP from Dahod in Gujarat, was arrested at the airport here Wednesday just before he was to board a Toronto flight with Paramjeet Kaur and 15-year-old Amarjit Singh. The two were travelling on the passports of the MP's wife and son.

Police alleged that Katara had helped other women immigrate illegally in the past.

Kiran was allegedly involved in giving "training" to such women. "She taught women how to carry themselves while travelling with MPs," a police official said.

He said police teams were sent to several states including Gujarat, Andhra Pradesh and Punjab to probe various aspects of the case and more arrests were likely.

Paramjeet Kaur, wife of a US-based expatriate, was Thursday sent to police custody for five days while Amarjit was sent to juvenile remand home.

[About Us](#) | [Advertise with Us](#) | [Careers @ TIL](#) | [Terms of Use](#) | [Privacy Policy](#) | [Feedback](#) | [Sitemap](#)
Copyright © 2008 Bennett Coleman & Co. Ltd. All rights reserved. For reprint rights: [Times Syndication Service](#)
This site is best viewed with Internet Explorer 6.0 or higher; Firefox 2.0 or higher at a minimum screen resolution of 1024x768

Figure 1: Example of coded article

ATTRIBUTE	ATTRIBUTE VALUE
AGE OF TRAFFICKER	Unassigned 18-25 26-35 36+ Under 18 Varies (2+)
GENDER (TRAFFICKED PERSON)	Unassigned Children (Variety of Ages Under 18) Female (Adult 18-25) Female (Adult 26-35) Female (Adult 36+) Female (Child 10-14) Female (Child 15-17) Female (Child Under 10) Female (Unknown) Females (Variety of Ages) Male (Adult 18-25) Male (Adult 26-35) Male (Adult 36+) Male (Child 10-14) Male (Child 15-17) Male (Child Under 10) Male (Unknown) Males (Variety of Ages) Males and Females (Variety of Ages)
GENDER OF TRAFFICKER	Unassigned Male Female Male & Female
INITIATION OF TRANSPORT	Unassigned Trafficked Person Trafficker (Force) Trafficker (Non-Force, Fraud or Coercion)
LEVEL OF TRAFFICKER COOPERATION WITH OTHERS	Unassigned Trafficker Acted as Individual Trafficker Acted with Family Members Trafficker Acted with One Other Individual Trafficker Acted in Organized Crime Ring Trafficker Involved in Smuggling/Trafficking Ring
METHOD OF TRANSPORT OF TRAFFICKED PERSON	Unassigned Air (Plane, Etc.) Automobile (Truck, Car, Train, Etc.) Sea Vessel (Boat, Shipping Container, Etc.) On Foot
OFFENDER EMPLOYMENT/ COMMUNITY POSITION	Unassigned Civilian Government (Aid Worker) Government (Military) Government (Police) Government (Politician)

PREVIOUS ARREST OF TRAFFICKER	Illegal Immigrant Yes (Human Trafficking Offense) Yes (Other Offense) No
PREVIOUS CONVICTION OF TRAFFICKER	Yes (Human Trafficking Offense) Yes (Other Offense) No
REGION OF ARREST (TRAFFICKER)	Unassigned Africa Asia (Not Including Russia) Australia Canada Central America Eastern Europe Mexico Middle East Russia South America Southeast Asia United States Western Europe
REGION OF ORIGINATION (TRAFFICKER)	Unassigned Africa Asia (Not Including Russia) Australia Canada Central America Eastern Europe Mexico Middle East Russia South America Southeast Asia United States Western Europe Various
REGION OF ORIGINATION (TRAFFICKED PERSON)	Unassigned Africa Asia (Not Including Russia) Australia Canada Central America Eastern Europe Mexico Middle East Russia South America Southeast Asia United States Western Europe Various
ROLE OF TRAFFICKER(S)	Unassigned End User (Domestic Work)

	End User (Labourer) End User (Prostitution) End User (Unknown) Middleman (Transportation) Procurer Recruiter Various (Multi-Dimensional Role)
TRAFFICKED INDIVIDUAL ARREST	Unassigned No Yes (Other Offences) Yes (Immigration Related) Yes (Prostitution Related)
TYPE OF GEOGRAPHIC MOVE	Unassigned Not Applicable Cross-Border (Country to Country) Cross-Border (Several Countries) International (Continent to Continent) Regional (No Border Cross)

Table 19: Attributes and attribute values for coding

FIFTEEN VARIABLES CODED IN 191 INCIDENTS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING			
Attribute Variable	Valid Cases	% Valid	% Missing
Age of trafficker	146	76.44	23.56
Gender of trafficked person	167	87.43	12.57
Gender of trafficker	130	68.06	31.94
Initiation of transport	135	70.68	29.32
Level of trafficker cooperation with others	169	88.48	11.52
Method of transport of trafficked person	56	29.32	70.68
Offender employment/ community position	125	65.45	34.55
Previous arrest of trafficker?	4	2.09	97.91
Previous conviction of trafficker?	4	2.09	97.91
Region of arrest of trafficker	155	81.15	18.85
Region of origination of trafficker	166	86.91	13.09
Region of origination of trafficked person	166	86.91	13.09
Role of trafficker	162	84.82	15.18
Trafficked individual arrested?	90	47.12	52.88
Type of geographic move	148	77.49	22.51

Table 20: Percentages of valid cases of incidents of human trafficking

REFERENCE LIST

- Alvazzi del Frate, A. (2003). The voice of victims of crime: estimating the true level of conventional crime. *Forum on Crime and Society*, 3(1&2), 127-140.
- American Society of International Law (ASIL). (2001). International Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children. *The American Journal of International Law*, 95(2), 407-410.
- Andrees, B. & van der Linder, M. (2005). Designing Trafficking Research from a Labour Market Perspective: The ILO experience. *International Migration (IOM)*, 43, 55-73.
- Andreas, P. & Nadelmann, E. (2006). *Policing the Globe: Criminalization and Crime Control in International Relations*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press).
- Arpaio gets tough on illegal immigration. (2007, April 24). *Daily Press*. Retrieved from Google News Archive search engine.
- Barry, Kathleen. (1995). *The Prostitution of Sexuality: The Global Exploitation of Women*. New York: New York University Press.
- Beare, M. E. (1999). Illegal Immigration: Personal tragedies, social problems, or national security threats? *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex: The New Slave Trade*, Phil Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass Publishers, 11-41.
- Berman, J. (2003). (Un)Popular Strangers and Crises (Un)Bounded: Discourse of sex-trafficking, the European political community and the panicked state of the modern state. *European Journal of Internal Relations*, 9(1), 37-86.
- Bertone, A. (1999). Sexual Trafficking in Women: International Political Economy and the Politics of Sex. *Gender Issues*, Winter 2000, 4-22.
- Biemann, U. (2002). A Topography of the Global Sex Trade. *Feminist Review*, 70, 75-88.
- Bienstock, R. (Director). (2006). *Frontline: Sex Slaves Documentary* [Motion Picture].
- Blanchet, T. (2002). Beyond Boundaries: A critical look at women labour migration and the trafficking within. *USAID*, Dhaka, April 2002.
- Bruckert, C. & Parent, C. (2002). Trafficking in Human Beings and Organized Crime: A Literature Review. Ottawa: Research and Evaluation Branch, Community, Contract and Aboriginal Policing Services Directorate, Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP).

- Bruckert, C. & Parent, C. (2004). Organized Crime and Human Trafficking in Canada: Tracing Perceptions and Discourses. Ottawa: Research and Evaluation Branch, Community, Contract and Aboriginal Policing Services Directorate, Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP).
- Bruinsma, G. & Meershoek, G. (1999). Organized Crime and Trafficking in Women from Eastern Europe in the Netherlands. *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex: The New Slave Trade*. Phil Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass Publishers, 105-118.
- Boots, D. & Heide, K. (2006). Parricides in the media: A content analysis of available reports. *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology*, 50(4), 418-445.
- Busza, J. (2004). Sex Work and Migration: The Dangers of Oversimplification: A case study of Vietnamese Women in Cambodia. *Health and Human Rights*, 7(2), 231-249.
- Chapkis, W. (2003). Trafficking, Migration, and the Law: Protecting Innocents, Punishing Immigrants. *Gender and Society*, 17(6), 923-937.
- Chew, L. (1999). Global Trafficking in Women: Some issues and strategies. *Women's Studies Quarterly* (1&2), 11-17.
- Chuang, J. (1998). Redirecting the Debate over Trafficking in Women: Definitions, paradigms and contexts. *Harvard Human Rights Journal* (11). 65-107.
- Cunneen, M. (2005). Anti-Slavery International. *Journal of Global Ethics*, 1(1), 85-92.
- David, F. (2000). Human Smuggling and Trafficking: An Overview of the Response at the Federal Level. *Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC)*, 24.
- Derks, A. (2000). From White Slaves to Trafficking Survivors: Notes on the Trafficking Debate. *Conference on Migration and Development*. May 4-6, 2000.
- Di Nicola, A. & Cauduro, A. (2007). Review of Official Statistics on Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual Exploitation and their Validity in the 25 EU Member States from Official Statistics to Estimates of the Phenomenon. 73-94.
- Doezema, J. (1998). Forced to Choose: Beyond the Voluntary v. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy. *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance and Redefinition*, Kamala Kempadoo and Jo Doezema (eds.). New York: Routledge, 34-50.
- Doezema, J. (1999). Loose Women or Lost Women? The Re-Emergence of the Myth of White Slavery in Contemporary Discourses in Trafficking in Women. *Gender Issues*, Winter 2000, 23-50.
- Doezema, J. (2002). Who Gets to Choose? Coercion, Consent, and the UN

- Trafficking Protocol. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 20-27.
- Doezema, J. (2003). The ideology of trafficking. Presented at: Work Conference 'Human Trafficking,' Center for Ethics and Value Inquiry (CEVI), Ghent University, November 15, 2002.
- Dottridge, M. (2002). Trafficking in Children in West and Central Africa. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 38-42.
- Ericson, R. (1995). *Crime and the Media*. Richard Ericson (ed.). Dartmouth Publishing Group.
- Fagan, J. (1994). Women and drug revisited: Female participation in the cocaine economy. *Journal of Drug Issues*, Winter/Spring, 24(1/2), 179-225.
- Friman, H. R. & Reich, S. (2007). Human Trafficking and the Balkans. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 1-19.
- Friman, H. R. & Reich, S. (2007). Human Trafficking and Human Security. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 136-154.
- Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women. (2000). *Human Rights and Trafficking in Persons: A Handbook*. GAATW.
- Goodey, J. (2003). Migration, Crime and Victimhood: Responses to sex trafficking in the EU. *Punishment & Society*, 5, 415-431.
- Goodey, J. (2004). Sex Trafficking in Women from Central and Eastern European Countries: Promoting a 'victim-centered' and 'women-centered' approach to criminal justice intervention. *Feminist Review*, 76, 26-45.
- Gulcur, L. & Ilkcaracan, P. (2002). The "Natasha" Experience: Migrant sex workers from the former Soviet Union and Eastern Europe in Turkey. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 25(4), 411-421.
- Human Rights Watch. (1995). *Rape for Profit: Trafficking of Nepali's Girls and Women to India's Brothels*. <http://www.hrm.org>
- Human Rights Watch. Memorandum of Concern: Trafficking of Migrant Women for Forced Prostitution into Greece. (2001a). <http://www.hrm.org>
- Human Rights Watch. (2001b). *NGO Background Paper on the Refugee and Migration Interface*, presented to the UNHCR Global Consultations on Internations Protection. Geneva: 29 June 2001. <http://www.hrm.org>
- Human Rights Watch. (2002). *Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 14(9). <http://www.hrm.org>
- Human Rights Watch. (2003). *Togo*, 15(8). <http://www.hrm.org>
- Human Rights Watch. (2004). *Help Wanted: Abuses against female migrant domestic workers in Indonesia and Malaysia*, 16(9). <http://www.hrm.org>
- Human Rights Watch. (2005). *Maid to Order: Ending Abuses Against Migrant*

- Domestic Workers in Singapore*, 17(10). <http://www.hrm.org>
- ICMPD (International Center for Migration Policy Development). (1999). *The Relationship between Organized Crime and Trafficking in Aliens*. Budapest: The Budapest Group.
- ICMPD (International Center for Migration Policy Development). (2007). *Listening to Victims Experiences of identification, return and assistance in South-Eastern Europe*. Rebecca Surtees (ed.). Vienna: ICMPD.
- IOM. (1995). *Trafficking and Prostitution: The Growing Exploitation of Women from Central and Eastern Europe*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- IOM. (2000). *Counteracting Human Trafficking: Protecting the Victims of Trafficking*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- IOM. (2001a). *Deceived Migrants from Tajikistan: a Study of trafficking in women and children*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- IOM. (2001b). *Trafficking in Women and Children from the Republic of Armenia: a Study*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- IOM. (2005a). *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey*. Frank Laczko & Elzabietta Gozdziaik (eds.). Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- IOM. (2005b). *Legal Review on Trafficking in Persons in the Carribean*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- IOM. (2006). *Trafficking in Human Beings and the 2006 World Cup in Germany*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- Increase in arrests strains immigration agency. (2007, February 5). *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from Google News Archive search engine.
- Jana, S. (2002). A tale of two cities: shifting the paradigm of anti-trafficking programs. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 69-79.
- Jasinski, F. (2006). National Co-ordination of the Fight against Trafficking in Human Beings: Recommendations for Poland as a 'New' EU Member State. *EUI Working Papers*. Italy: European University Institute.
- Jeffreys, S. (1999). Globalizing Sexual Exploitation: Sex tourism and the traffic in women. *Leisure Studies*, 18, 179-196.
- Jewkes, Y. (2004). *Media and crime*. London: SAGE.
- Jordan, A. (2002a). The Annotated Guide to the Complete UN Trafficking Protocol. *International Human Rights Law Group*.
- Jordan, A. (2002b). Human rights or wrongs? The struggle for a rights-based response to trafficking in human beings. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 28-37.
- Kangaspunta, K. (2003). Mapping the inhuman trade; Preliminary findings of the database on trafficking in human beings. *Forum on crime and Society*, 3(1&2), 81-103.

- Kangaspunta, K. (2006). *Trafficking in persons: Global Patterns*. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC).
- Kangaspunta, K. (2006). *Trafficking in persons: Global Patterns (Appendices)*. United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC).
- Kelly, L. & Regan, L. (2000). *Stopping traffic: Exploring the extent of, and response to, trafficking in women for sexual exploitation in the UK*. London: Research, Development and Statistics Directorate of the Home Office.
- Kelly, L. (2002). *Journeys of Jeopardy: A commentary on current research on trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation*. London: International Organization for Migration (IOM).
- Kelly, L. (2003). The Wrong Debate: Reflections on why force is not the key issue with respect to trafficking in women for sexual exploitation. *Feminist Review*, 73, 139-144.
- Kelly, L. (2005). "You Can Find Anything You Want": A critical reflection of research on trafficking in persons within and into Europe. *International Migration (IOM)*, 43, 235-265.
- Konevska, G. (2007). Policy Responses to Human Trafficking in the Balkans. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 119-135.
- Laczko, F. & Thompson, D (eds.). (2000). *Migrant Trafficking and Human Smuggling in Europe: a Review of Evidence with Case Studies from Hungary, Poland and Ukraine*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- Laczko, F. & Gramegna, M. (2003). Developing better indicators of human trafficking. *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 10(1) , 179-194.
- Laczko, F. (2002). Human trafficking: the need for better data. *Migration Information Source, Data Insights*. Washington, DC: Migration Policy Institute.
- Leaders order action on kiln slaves. (2007, June 16). *The Standard – China's Business Newspaper*. Retrieved from Google News Archive search engine.
- Lindstrom, N. (2007). Transnational Responses to Human Trafficking: The Politics of Anti-Trafficking in the Balkans. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 61-80.
- Long, L. D. (2007). Trafficking Exchanges and Economic Responses: Reflections from Bosnia and Herzegovina and Serbia. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 20-39.
- Makkai, T. (2003). Trafficking in Humans Beings, Especially Women and Children. *Australia Institute of Criminology (AIC)*, Vienna, May 15, 2003.

- Malarek, V. (2006, February 7). Sex Slaves: Interview Victor Malarek. (PBS, Interviewer)
- Matilac & Florendo. (2002). *Child Trafficking in Southeast Asia*. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- McDonald, L. et al. (2000). Migrant Sex Workers from Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union: The Canadian Case. *Centre For Applied Social Research*. University of Toronto.
- Murray, A. (1998). "Debt-bondage and trafficking: don't believe the hype," *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance and Redefinition*, Kamala Kempadoo and Jo Deozema (eds.). New York: Routledge.
- Mertus, J. & Bertone, A. (2007). Combating Trafficking: Internations Efforts and Their Ramifications. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 40-60.
- Mieczkowski, T. (1994). The experience of women who sell crack: Some descriptive data from the Detroit Crack Ethnography Program. *Journal of Drug Issues*, Winter/Spring, 24(1/2), 227-248.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. & Donelan, B. (2003). *Review of the Evidence and Debates on the 'Demand Side of Trafficking.'* Stockholm: Save the Children.
- Okolski, M. (2000). Illegality of International Population Movements in Poland. *International Migration* (IOM), Special Issue, 57-89.
- Pearson, E. (2002). Half-hearted protection: what does victim protection really mean for victims of trafficking in Europe. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 56-59.
- Petros, M. (2005). The Cost of Human Smuggling and Trafficking. Geneva: IOM. <http://www.iom.int>
- Phongpaichit, P. (1999). Trafficking in People in Thailand. *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex Trade: The New Slave Trade*. Phil Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass Publishers, 74-104.
- Ruggiero, V. (1997). Trafficking in Human Beings: Slavery in contemporary Europe. *Internation Journal of Sociology and Law*, 25, 231-244.
- Salt, J. (2000). Trafficking and human smuggling: a European perspective. *International Migration*, 38(3), 31-54.
- Salt, J. & Stein, J. (1997). Migration as a Business: The case of trafficking. *International Migration*, 35(4), 467-494.
- Savona, E. et al. (1996). Dynamics of Migration and Crime in Europe: New Patterns of an Old Nexus. *Research Group of Transnational Crime*, University of Trento, School of Law.
- Schloenhardt, A. (1999). Organized crime and the business of migrant trafficking:

- An economic approach. *Crime, Law & Social Change*, 32, 203-233.
- Shannon, S. (1999). Prostitution and the Mafia: The Involvement of Organized Crime in the Global Sex Trade. *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex Trade: The New Slave Trade*. Phil Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass Publishers, 119-144.
- Shelley, L. (2003). The Trade in People in and from the Soviet Union. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 40, 231-249.
- Skeldon, R. (2000). Trafficking: A perspective from Asia. *International Migration (IOM)*, Special Issue, 7-30.
- Stoecker, S. (2000). The Rise in Human Trafficking and the Role of Organized Crime. *Democracy*, 8, 129-131.
- Stone, A. (1999). How the Sex Trade Becomes a Slave Trade: The trafficking of women to Israel. *Middle East Report*, Summer 1999, 35-38.
- Taibly, R. (2001). Organized Crime and People Smuggling/Trafficking to Australia. *Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC)*, 208, 1-6.
- Taibly, R. (2002). A Cross-Analysis Report into Smuggling and Trafficking between the Phillipines and Australia – Executive Summary. *Australian Institute of Criminology (AIC)*, 1-8.
- Taylor, I. & Jamieson, R. (2000). Sex Trafficking and the Mainstream of Market Culture. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 32(3), 257-278.
- Thobani, S. (2001). Benevolent State, Law-Breaking Smugglers, and Deportable and Expendable Women: An Analysis of the Canadian State's Strategy to Address Trafficking in Women. *Refuge*, 19(4), 24-33.
- Turnbull, P. (1999). The Fusion of Immigration and Crime in the European Union: Problems of co-operation and the fight against the trafficking in women. *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex Trade: The New Slave Trade*. Phil Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass Publishers, 189-213.
- Tyldum, G. & Brunovskis, A. (2004). *Crossing Borders: An Empirical Study of Transnational Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings*. Norway: Interface Media. 17-34.
- Tyldum, G. & Brunovskis, A. (2005). Describing the Unobserved: Methodological challenges in empirical studies on human trafficking. *International Migration (IOM)*, 43,
- Tzvetkova, M. (2002). NGO responses to trafficking in women. *Gender & Development*, 10(1), 60-68.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and Global Programme Against Trafficking in Human Beings. (2006). *Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons*. New York: United Nations.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute. (2003). *Coalition*

against Trafficking in Human Beings in the Philippines: Research and Activities. New York: United Nations.

US suit says nursery paid illegal wages. (2007, April 9). *The New York Times*. Retrieved from Google News Archive search engine.

Vandenberg, M. E. (2007). Peacekeeping and Rule Breaking: United Nations Anti-Trafficking Policy in Bosnia and Herzegovina. *Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans*. H. Richard Friman & Simon Reich (eds.). Pittsburg: University of Pittsburg Press, 81-95.

Van Impe, K. (2000). People for Sale: The need for a multidisciplinary approach to human trafficking. *International Migration*, 38(3), 113-130.

VerPlanck, S. (2007, April 23). Serving 'every victim, every time'. *San Francisco Chronicle*, pp. B5. Retrieved from Google News Archive search engine.

Vock, J. & Nijboer, J. (2000). The Promised Land: a Study of trafficking in women from Central and Eastern Europe to the Netherlands. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 8, 379-388.

Wijers, M. (2002). *Only rights can stop wrongs: a critical assessment of anti-trafficking strategies*. EU/IOM: Brussels, Belgium, September 18-20, 2002.

Wijers, M. (2007). Women, Labor, and Migration: The Position of Trafficking Women and Strategies for Support. *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance and Redefinition*, Kamala Kempadoo and Jo Deozema (eds.). New York: Routledge, 69-78.

Williams, P. (1999). Trafficking in Women and Children: A Market Perspective. *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex: The New Slave Trade*. Phil Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass Publishers, 145-170.

Wray, M. (2007, May 9). 'Deception' lured sex worker. *Courier Mail*. Retrieved from Google News Archive search engine.

Zhang, S. & Chin, K. (2002). Enter the dragon: Inside Chinese human smuggling organizations. *Criminology*, 40(4), 737-768.