CONTINUUMS OF WORTH: A NEWSPAPER DECONSTRUCTION OF MISSING CANADIAN WOMEN

by

Emma Gayler
Bachelor of Arts, Brock University, 2005

THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

In the
Department of Sociology and Anthropology

© Emma Gayler 2008
SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
Fall 2008

APPROVAL

Name: **Emma Gayler**

Degree: **Master of Arts**

Title of Thesis: **Continuums of Worth: A Newspaper Deconstruction of Missing Women**

Examining Committee:

        Chair: **Dr. Hannah Wittman**
Assistant Professor of Sociology

_____

Dr. Wendy Chan
Senior Supervisor
Associate Professor of Sociology

_____

Dr. Dorothy Chunn
Supervisor
Professor of Sociology

_____

Dr. Margaret Jackson
External Examiner
Professor, School of Criminology, Simon Fraser University

Date Defended/Approved: _December 15, 2008_

ABSTRACT

This thesis analyses how the print media represents the problem of missing women in Canada. Using an open and reflective feminist discourse analysis, I examine 240 newspaper articles from 11 major Canadian newspapers from April, 2006 to April, 2007. Guided by a feminist intersectional framework, my research posits that missing women are placed along continuums of worth according to how they perform 'appropriate' femininity. Four key identity factors emerged as central to women's constructed identity: motherhood, association to criminal/deviant behaviour, class position and racial identity. The findings of this project reinforce the use of moralising discourses throughout news coverage of missing women and serve to affirm, or refute, a woman's worth as a victim.

Keywords: gender, media, moral regulation, victimisation, 'appropriate' femininity

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge my Senior Supervisor, Dr. Wendy Chan, for her constant guidance and support through this research process. Her insight and grounded attitude helped make this both a challenging and rewarding experience. To my second Supervisor, Dr. Dorothy Chunn, and also Dr. Margaret Jackson, thank you for your thought-provoking questions and insightful comments; you both encouraged me to push the boundaries of my analysis, allowing for a deeper understanding of my research.

I would also like to thank my peers in the graduate program for their constant support throughout this process. Thank you especially to Aazadeh, Heather, Eagan, Francoise, Kirsten and Hilal for your kind words, friendship and editing expertise. This experience would not have been the same without all of you.

To all my parents and family- thank you so much for your support, encouragement and phone calls. You helped me to believe in myself and my abilities, and always knew the right words, at the right time, to sustain me on this journey.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 1:
INTRODUCTION

Missing Women in Canada

On January 22, 2007, the media ban concerning the arrest and forthcoming trial of Robert

Pickton, an individual who faces the most murder charges in Canadian history, was lifted,

and the details of what is believed to have happened to six women began to emerge.

Almost one year later, Robert Pickton was found guilty for the second-degree murders of

Sereena Abotsway, Mona Lee Wilson, Andrea Joesbury, Brenda Ann Wolfe, Marnie Lee

Frey and Georgina Faith Papin. Currently, Robert Pickton is charged with the murders of

twenty additional women from a neighbourhood of Vancouver referred to as the

Downtown Eastside. The majority of the women that Robert Pickton is accused of

killing were involved in the sex trade and used illicit drugs. This trial has alerted

members of the Canadian public to the disappearances and deaths of women from

Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, while also calling attention to the shared experiences

of violence faced by marginalised women across Canada. Through the attention that this

trial has received, many advocacy groups from different areas of the country have been

given the platform to speak of their missing and murdered women, including groups from

Northern British Columbia, Edmonton, Calgary, and the Niagara Region.

The media coverage of this trial was extensive and many Canadian newspapers

published daily articles informing readers as to the trial's progress. The beginning of the

trial also saw reporters from many different countries in attendance. This is in stark

contrast to the media attention that the initial disappearances of these women received, which often focused on the families' pleas for police action as opposed to searching for the missing women themselves. Many of the missing women were not officially listed as missing for years after their last sighting. Friends and family members came forward to raise complaints that the police did not take the disappearances of many women seriously and were hesitant to officially recognise the women as missing. Furthermore, *Vancouver Sun* reporters Lindsay Kines, Kim Bolan and Lori Culbert are credited with 'breaking' the silence on the case within the news media when they published an 11 part series on the missing women in 2001- two decades after women began disappearing from the area (see www.missingpeople.net; Jiwani & Young, 2006). The disconnect between the lack of coverage for the disappearances of dozens of women and the coverage for his trial speaks to why this case is controversial, for while Robert Pickton is potentially Canada's most prolific serial killer, this case concerns victims from a marginalised population of missing women whose initial disappearances went largely unnoticed.

On the other hand, the disappearances of some women result in instant media attention, and there is no need for family members and friends to petition for these women to be publicly recognised as missing. For example, the disappearance of Jennifer Teague, an 18 year-old resident of Ottawa who went missing while walking home from her part-time job, immediately raised concern (McCooey, 2008). Similarly, the disappearance of Liana White, a 29 year-old from Edmonton, received much media attention. Liana White has also been compared to American missing woman Laci Peterson, as both were pregnant when they disappeared and both their husbands have been found guilty of their murders (Harding, 2006). The disappearances of both these

missing (and murdered) Canadian women resulted in immediate search parties and front-page articles in newspapers across the country. In this way, members of the public were instantly confronted with the news that these women were missing and pictures of the women were prominently displayed on television news stations and on the front pages of newspapers across the country. This raises the questions: are the disappearances of certain women more 'newsworthy' than others? What does this tell us, as members of the public, about missing women's worth as victims?

Canadian women continue to go missing every year. Some victims receive immediate media attention, while others do not. Despite the concerns raised regarding the missing women of the Downtown Eastside, women from marginalised populations across the country continue to go missing and are murdered. While this case has given advocacy groups the platforms to draw attention to these cases, and has alerted members of the public to these causes, it is time to critically analyse the ways in which women, both marginalised and not, are represented in news coverage of their disappearances.

Purpose and Direction of Research

For many members of the Canadian public, their only connection to missing women is through newspaper articles, including reports on their disappearances, police statements regarding their cases and trial coverage of those accused of their deaths. The above examples provide the basis for the following media analysis, which focuses on the construction of missing women's identities within Canadian newspapers and aims to deconstruct the ways in which newspapers report on missing women from across the country. This analysis considers both what information is included and what is absent from articles on women's disappearances.

My primary research question is: How are women who go missing represented in Canadian daily newspapers? Further, in light of the trial of Robert Pickton and the recent attention to the violence faced by marginalised women across Canada, I am concerned with the ways in which the identities of all missing women are constructed, and what differences might exist. Therefore, this research project deconstructs articles from 11 major daily newspapers across Canada from April 2006 to April 2007.

The theoretical perspective that guides this research is feminist intersectionality, an approach which posits that one's position and identity is uniquely affected by each aspect of one's identity (Crenshaw, 1991; Cossins, 2003). In this context, it is essential to consider all aspects of identity to truly understand or gain insight into social experiences. For the purposes of this research project, I focus on motherhood, criminal/deviant behaviour, class position and racial identity as four key aspects of missing women's identity in order to offer an in-depth analysis of this issue.

My Position as a Feminist Researcher

The topic of missing and murdered women in Canada is of particular importance for me as a woman and a feminist researcher. I come from St. Catharines, Ontario; the city from which Paul Bernardo and Karla Homolka abducted and murdered 15 year-old Kristen French in 1992. At the time, I was a child in grade school; however, I remember vividly the ways in which her disappearance changed my life. The discovery of her body seemingly shattered the confidence felt by members of the city. For example, almost immediately I was advised to always walk with a 'buddy,' something which had not been a concern in my younger years.

In my early twenties, I became aware of the disappearances of more than 60 women from Vancouver, and felt there was a disconnect between the immediate reaction to the disappearance of Kristen French and the seeming lack of response to the disappearances of more than sixty women. I began to ask those around me if they were familiar with the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, and was both shocked and saddened by the responses I received, which ranged from a lack of knowledge to dismissal because of who these women were (read: their association to the sex trade and illicit drug use). These responses provided the basis of my undergraduate thesis, which focused on the narratives found within newspaper coverage of the missing women from Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, prior to the arrest of a suspect. Ultimately, this led me to consider how all women who go missing are represented within news coverage of their disappearances.

I believe that the ways newspapers represent missing women is related to how we, as members of the public, respond to women who go missing and, particularly, their value and worth as missing persons. Further, I believe these articles have the potential to influence public views on the victimisation of women more generally. It is important that we, as readers, are aware of the representation of women who go missing. If there are stereotypes and generalisations present, not only must these be highlighted but the impact of this representation must be questioned because it can have very real effects on those who rely on the news media for information. Newspapers hold the power to raise awareness regarding important, and often sensitive, issues and events. They also have the ability to reach a wide range of people, especially given the increased use of the internet and online news updates. Therefore, it is imperative to consider the ways in which

5

newspapers represent and/or construct individuals and particularly when those individuals do not have the ability to speak for themselves.

Chapter Outlines

Chapter Two provides an overview of literature concerning the criminal victimisation of women in Canada. This chapter focuses on two groups of Canadian women who experience disproportionately high levels of violent victimisation: Aboriginal women and sex trade workers. Chapter Two concludes with an analysis of media portrayals of women's victimisation.

Chapter Three highlights the theoretical perspective, conceptual framework and methodology which guide this study. As mentioned above, the theoretical perspective utilised is feminist intersectional theory. The conceptual framework section of this chapter aims to deconstruct the ways in which gender and racial identity affect the ways women in Canada experience victimisation. Key topics of discussion include the moral regulation of women, women's fear of crime and processes of racialisation in relation to constructed continuums of worth for female victims of violence. Feminist discourse analysis is the research method of this study.

Chapter Four offers a quantitative overview of research findings, including the number of items included in this study, as well as the length and type of articles. It also provides a summary of the claims-makers found within news coverage of missing women. This chapter concludes with a discussion of the three key categories found within the sample, which are factual articles, call-for-action articles and human interest stories. Significant themes found in each category of articles are summarised.

Chapter Five provides a qualitative analysis of central themes found in this study regarding the construction of missing women's identities, which are motherhood, criminal and deviant behaviour, class position and racial identity. Identity as a mother and association to criminal and deviant behaviour are considered essential to the construction of a missing woman's identity within news coverage of her disappearance. A woman's class position is never directly identified within articles of her disappearance, though in many it is alluded to. Similarly, racial identity is noticeably absent from news coverage, despite being highlighted by racialised women as a factor which must be acknowledged in a Canadian context.

Chapter Six summarises key themes and offers future considerations for further research.

CHAPTER 2:
WOMEN AND VICTIMISATION IN CANADA: A LITERATURE REVIEW

In the past three decades, feminist scholars have demonstrated the importance of a gendered perspective of crime by focusing on the different experiences of victimisation of women and men (Stanko, 1995). This has resulted in the rise of women centred research and an increased body of knowledge concerning women's experiences of victimisation. Elizabeth Stanko (1995:219) maintains that feminist theorists have changed the way we think about crime and have situated women's victimisation along a continuum of violence in contemporary society. A gendered perspective of crime, therefore, aids in understanding the ways in which women experience violence in their lives as well as the ways that some violence is normalised (Stanko, 1995). However, while there is a significant amount of research concerning women's relationship to experiences of violence, there is a lack of resources specifically regarding women who are missing or who have disappeared. Marla Patterson (2005) emphasises that, in general, the research on missing adults is limited. Instead, much of the current research focuses on specific or well-known disappearances (Patterson, 2005:5). Patterson (2005:5) highlights how this may be because it is harder to declare an adult as missing, since adults (as opposed to children) have the legal right to move from one place to another. Some advocates of missing women have argued that this style of reasoning has been used to dismiss the pleas of family members and friends regarding their missing relatives, especially women (Amnesty International, 2004).

Given the paucity of information on adult missing women, attempts to understand the topic of missing women can be achieved by first examining the literature on the criminal victimisation of women in Canada with a specific focus on the victimisation experiences of Aboriginal women and sex trade workers. These latter two populations of women experience disproportionately high levels of violent victimisation and comprise a disproportionate number of missing women in Canada today. Second, since my research project focuses on media portrayals of missing women, I will also examine scholarly discussions on media representations of violence against women and women's victimisation.

Criminal Victimisation of Women in Canada

The General Social Survey and the Violence Against Women Survey

The two main sources of data on violence against women in Canada are the General Social Survey (GSS) and Violence Against Women Survey (VAWS). The most recent GSS was conducted in 2004 and, following revisions of the 1999 GSS, included questions about domestic violence. The GSS is a self-report survey and questions focus on three primary areas: experiences of criminal victimisation, the impacts and effects of victimisation and the use of formal and informal services after victimisation (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005). The GSS focuses on three types of violent crimes, which are sexual assault, robbery and assault (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005:3). Some theorists have argued that the GSS questions lack proper context and this may result in misleading conclusions; still, the GSS does give some perspective to the levels of violence experienced by Canadian women (Larkin & McKenna, 2002).

The 2004 GSS found that women and men experience similar levels of violent victimisation. Overall, women report an average of 102 violent incidents per 1,000 respondents, compared to 111 incidents for men (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005:6). However, when episodes of violence are broken down into categories, definite trends emerge differentiating rates of violence between women and men. Women are five times more likely to report sexually assault than are men (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005). These figures are more telling when rates of spousal violence are considered. Overall, seven percent of women in marriages or common-law relationships experienced some form of violence at the hands of their partner in the last five years (Statistics Canada, 2006). The GSS reveals that women suffer more severe forms of abuse and face more serious impacts as a result of abuse (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005; Jiwani, 2002a:67). For example, women are more likely to report being choked, beaten, threatened with a knife or a gun, or having a knife or gun used against them and women are more than twice as likely to experience injury as a result of spousal abuse (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005:7).

Women are also more likely to experience repeat victimisation and to fear for their lives. Results from the GSS indicate that twice as many women than men have experienced more than ten episodes of violence, and women are more than three times more likely to fear for their lives than are men (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005). Feminist research demonstrates that this fear is reasonably justified; for example, in 1996 one third of 84 women murdered were killed by current or former spouses (Sev'er, 2002:78). Tanis Day and Katherine McKenna (2002:330) estimate that about 80 women die every year in Canada because of domestic violence, a figure that is nine times higher than the probability of being murdered by a stranger. The results of the 1999 GSS led the

National Clearinghouse on Family Violence (2002:1) to conclude, "physical and emotional abuse is a common experience for women in Canada." The results of the 2004 GSS continue to support this conclusion.

The 1993 Violence Against Women (VAW) survey was the first national survey to provide information on women's rates of abuse (NCFV, 2002). The VAW asked women ages 18 and older about their experiences of physical and sexual victimisation since the age of 16, as well as questions concerning women's fear of violence (Johnson & Sacco, 1995; Johnson, 2002). The main difference separating this survey from others is in its design. The survey was designed by feminist researchers and special attention was paid to informing and training those administering the survey to ensure they were sensitive to women's experiences of violence, and that questions were sensitive as well as accurate (Johnson & Sacco, 1995:283). While the VAW survey is older than the most recent GSS, its findings are important because it focuses on women. Advocates for women's safety also argue that the VAW survey asks more detailed questions, and that these questions result in the reporting of more incidents of violence than previous surveys, thus more accurately reflecting the experiences of women (Larkin & McKenna, 2002).

The VAWS found that 51% of women had experienced at least one incident of abuse since the age of 16 (Johnson, 2002:41). Almost one half of women interviewed (45%) reported having been victimised by a man known to them, while 23% of all women had been victimised by a stranger (Johnson & Sacco, 1995:293). The VAW found that four in ten women had been victims of sexual assault and one in four women had experienced violent sexual attacks. Further, one third of women had been physically

assaulted or threatened (Johnson & Sacco, 1995:294). The findings of the VAW survey are consistent with results from the 2004 GSS; experiences of violence and victimisation are a common phenomenon among Canadian women.

The VAW results also correspond with the 2004 GSS in terms of violence experienced by women in marriages and common-law partnerships. The VAW found that 29% of married women had experienced an assault by their husband or common-law partner (Johnson, 2002:41). The most common forms of violence women faced from partners included pushing, shoving, grabbing; threats of hitting, slapping, throwing something, kicking, biting, and hitting with fists (Johnson & Sacco, 1995:296). This survey also found that women are vulnerable to increased violent victimisation when leaving a relationship (Johnson & Sacco, 1995).

The VAW concludes that approximately 572, 000 women in Canada have experienced at least one incident of sexual assault in the year preceding the survey, and 201, 000 women experienced violence by a spouse (Johnson, 2002:42). Women's greatest risk of victimisation outside of marriage involves sexual violence and the majority of women who have been physically or sexually assaulted have experienced more than one episode of violence (Johnson & Sacco, 1995). The survey also measured women's experiences of sexual harassment and an overwhelming 87% of Canadian women reported experiencing an incident of this kind. These results, in conjunction with responses from the GSS, indicate that women's experiences of violent victimisation are widespread across Canada. Further, when we look more specifically at the types of violence that Canadian women experience, it is clear that women are vulnerable to

violence in both public and private spaces, and suffer violence at the hands of strangers, acquaintances and family members.

Aboriginal Women and Experiences of Violence in Canada

While the GSS and VAW surveys have been instrumental in confirming that violence is a common experience for many Canadian women, they do little to demonstrate how different women are differently affected by violence. Further research reveals that not all Canadian women experience violence in the same ways; racialised women experience both higher rates of violence and more serious violent victimisation. In particular, Aboriginal women in Canada experience disproportionately high levels of violent victimisation.

Results from Canadian national surveys show that Aboriginal peoples across the country experience higher rates of victimisation than their non-Aboriginal counterparts. The 2004 GSS found that Aboriginal peoples experienced 319 violent episodes per 1, 000 respondents versus 101 per 1, 000 found in non-Aboriginal respondents (Gannon & Mihorean, 2005:8). These results remain consistent with those of the 1999 GSS, which found that Aboriginal peoples experienced 206 episodes of victimisation per 1, 000 versus 81 per 1, 000 (Chartrand & MacKay, 2006:20). Aboriginal peoples are also more likely to suffer sexual abuse. Larry Chartrand and Celeste MacKay (2006) contend that Aboriginal peoples are five times more likely to experience a sexual offence than the general population. Chartrand and MacKay (2006:22) argue that "while victimization of Aboriginal people is much higher than non-Aboriginal people, statistics show that it is Aboriginal women and children who are largely bearing the burden of victimization." They hold that Aboriginal women are more vulnerable to domestic abuse and face higher

13

rates of domestic violence than non-Aboriginal women, though they acknowledge that some statistics are based on smaller scale studies across Canada (Chartrand & MacKay, 2006:23). Patricia Monture-Angus (1999:84) argues that experiences of violence and abuse are so common among Aboriginal women that those who have not suffered violence are exceptional. She holds that most women do not suffer one incident of abuse, but more often experience a combination of incest, child sexual abuse, rape and battering, representing overt physical, psychological and emotional violence (Monture-Angus, 1999:84). Monture-Angus (1999:85) concludes, "violence describes most of our lives." Such findings lead Chartrand and MacKay (2006:23) to deduce that domestic violence is the most pervasive form of violence facing Aboriginal women today; however, other advocates and activists question this conclusion as perhaps premature (Monture-Angus, 1995; Comack, 2006).

The majority of Aboriginal peoples, including women, live off reserve lands (Amnesty International, 2004). However, research shows that Aboriginal peoples experience disproportionately high rates of violent victimisation in urban centres across Canada (Amnesty International, 2004; Chartrand & MacKay, 2006). In Canada, Aboriginal peoples comprise between 3% and 10% of the population, depending on how data is gathered (Culhane & Taylor, 2000; Chartrand & MacKay, 2006:17). However, despite being a small minority of the overall population, Aboriginal peoples experience disproportionate rates of victimisation. In Vancouver, B.C. Aboriginal men and women comprise 8% of victims of violent crime but only 2% of the population of the city (Chartrand & MacKay, 2006:21). This leads Chartrand and MacKay (2006:21) to conclude that their disproportionate representation among victims of violent crime is

alarming. Further, it is clear that Aboriginal women face violence from both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal perpetrators. One study found almost equal rates of victimisation experienced by urban Aboriginal women committed by Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal offenders (45% and 41%, respectively) (Chartrand & MacKay, 2006:21). While studies show that levels of violence are high in many reserve communities, it is clear that urban centres across Canada do not offer adequately safe spaces (Chartrand & MacKay, 2006).

Aboriginal women experience higher overall levels of victimisation than Aboriginal men and there is a growing body of research demonstrating links between Aboriginal women, economic marginalisation and sexual exploitation (Amnesty International, 2004; Farley et al, 2005). For Aboriginal women, their relationship to experiences of violent victimisation is exacerbated by economic factors. A disproportionate number of Aboriginal women suffer from economic marginalisation in Canadian cities and are often members of poorer neighbourhoods (Culhane & Taylor, 2000). This can result in Aboriginal women having fewer choices when facing violence (Culhane & Taylor, 2000; Amnesty International, 2004). In many Canadian cities, Aboriginal women are disproportionately represented among women in the sex trade and this can leave them particularly vulnerable to violence because they experience first hand the intersection between sexism and racism, which will be discussed in further detail below (Lowman, 2001; Amnesty International, 2004).

Aboriginal women represent a group of women experiencing high rates of violence and victimisation, but more importantly, they are also disproportionately represented among missing women in Canada. Amnesty International's report entitled "Stolen Sisters" focuses on the violent victimisation of Aboriginal women. The heart of

15

this report centres on the number of missing and murdered Aboriginal women in Canada. Amnesty International (2004:23) documents that Aboriginal women aged 25 to 44 are five times more likely to die from violent victimisation than other women. The report lists five examples in which violence directed at Aboriginal women is shown to be patterned and, perhaps, serial. Included in these examples are the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, as well as women who went missing along a highway stretch in British Columbia that has been dubbed 'the Highway of Tears' (Amnesty International, 2004:23-24).

The 'Stolen Sisters' report examines the discrimination and racism experienced by Aboriginal women, and their treatment by law enforcement officials and agents of the state. The report concludes that Aboriginal women are not sufficiently protected by the Canadian state and that this is in violation of their basic human rights (Amnesty International, 2004). The report ends by providing nine case studies of Aboriginal women in Canada, who are thought to represent the many common themes found by Amnesty International researchers while exploring cases of missing and murdered Aboriginal women in Canada. Helen Betty Osborne, Shirley Lonethunder, Pamela Jean George, Janet Henry, Sarah de Vries, Cynthia Louise Sanderson, Maxine Wapass, Felicia Velvet Solomon and Moira Louise Erb all went missing or were found murdered between 1971 and 2003. Amnesty International (2004) maintains racial identity to be a determining factor in the way the police and general public perceived and responded to each woman's disappearance or murder.

It is believed that these accounts are part of a larger pattern of violent victimisation and are enough to demonstrate a potential epidemic of violence affecting

Aboriginal women. The Native Women's Association of Canada estimates that up to five hundred Aboriginal women have gone missing or been murdered in the last 20 years (Boyer, 2006:18). Clearly, Aboriginal women in Canada represent a population of women who experience disproportionately high levels of violent victimisation and are part of a growing body of women who are missing today.

Women in the Sex Trade and Experiences of Violence

Information concerning the victimisation of sex trade workers provides a different context and perspective of the violence experienced by women in Canada. As stated in the introduction, sex trade workers also represent a group of Canadian women who experience disproportionately high levels of violence and are represented among populations of missing women across the country. This category of women is not mutually exclusive from the discussion on Aboriginal women, as many sex trade workers identify as Aboriginal.

In their study of sex workers in Vancouver, British Columbia, Melissa Farley, Jacqueline Lynne and Ann Cotton (2005) found that an overwhelming majority of the women had experienced some form of serious violent victimisation while working as sex trade workers and the authors conclude that many women involved in prostitution suffer from post-traumatic stress disorder (Farley et al., 2005). Their interviews with 100 women found that, while working in the street sex trade, 90% of the women had been physically assaulted, 89% had been physically threatened, 67% had been threatened with a weapon, 76% had been raped by a customer and 67% of those raped had been raped more than five times (Farley et al., 2005:250). The authors further discovered that sex trade workers frequently experience verbal and emotional abuse while working. Farley et

al. (2005:250-251) also found that 75% of women had suffered physical injuries due to violence experienced while working, including injuries from stabbings, beatings, concussions, broken bones, cuts and black eyes. Moreover, 50% of these women had experienced head injuries after violent assaults involving baseball bats, crowbars, or having their heads hit against walls or car dashboards (Farley et al., 2005:251).

Violent victimisation, and particularly attempted murder, is extremely high for women involved in the street sex trade. Phil Hubbard and Teela Sanders (2003:86) quote a British study in which it was calculated that "women who work in prostitution are 12 times more likely to be killed than women of a similar age." While this number is certainly alarming, it is lower than estimates from Canadian studies. One such study found the death rate of sex trade workers to be 40 times higher than the rate for the general population (Farley et al., 2005:244). A separate study of sex trade workers in Vancouver found that approximately one third had survived an attack on their lives (Amnesty International, 2004:27). Such studies have led John Lowman (2000:1008) to conclude that sex work is one of the most dangerous jobs in Canada and that sex trade workers are among the most vulnerable to violent victimisation. This assertion is confirmed by sex trade workers themselves. Violent victimisation is so common for sex workers it is normalised; as one woman concludes "what rape is to others, is normal to us" (as cited in Farley et al., 2005:254).

Identity is intimately linked to the understanding of the victimisation of sex trade workers. Racial identity is central to this dialogue because a disproportionate number of female sex trade workers in Canada identify as Aboriginal (Lowman, 2001; Farley et al., 2005). Lowman (2001:3) found this to be true especially in the Western provinces of

18

Canada in relation to street sex workers. Indeed, studies in British Columbia frequently demonstrate Aboriginal women to be over-represented in the sex trade (Farley et al., 2005). Additionally, Lowman (2001:4) argues that Aboriginal women involved in the sex trade "experience higher rates of criminal victimisation while working the street than their non-native counterparts." Maya Seshia (2005:43) cites a study conducted by John Lowman which found that Aboriginal women and youth comprised 27% of sex workers who were violently victimised, a percentage which Seshia purposes is likely higher than their proportion in the general population of sex workers. Based on the work of Farley et al. (2005), Lowman (2001; 2002) and Seshia (2005), it is evident there is some connection between racial identity and victimisation for women involved in the sex trade.

The violent victimisation of sex trade workers is a topic that has been receiving some attention in the past few years because of the disappearances and murders of women involved in the sex trade across Canada. There have been at least twenty women and transgendered persons who have gone missing from Winnipeg in the last 20 years, and all were involved in the sex trade (Seshia, 2005:43). Similarly, the RCMP in Edmonton recently confirmed beliefs that there is a serial killer or killers targeting sexually exploited women, murdering them and dumping their bodies in nearby fields (Seshia, 2005:44). Since 1997, nearly a dozen women's bodies have been found in fields around Edmonton (Seshia, 2005:44). Another area worth mention is Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. This is the area from which more than 60 women involved in the sex trade have gone missing in the last three decades. The missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside are a population currently receiving academic attention, especially as the accused, Robert Pickton, was recently found guilty for the murder of six

of these women. This case represents Canada's largest serial killer investigation and, if convicted of 26 charges, Pickton will become Canada's most prolific serial killer.

There are a number of reasons why the above cases are receiving so much attention beyond the disturbing and alarming number of women that have disappeared. One reason is due to criticisms raised by family members of the women who are missing and advocates' fight for the safety of all women, especially those most marginalised, that the police do not take the disappearances women involved in the sex trade seriously (Amnesty International, 2004). It is believed by some that these women were 'allowed' to go missing because of their racial identity, the spaces in which they lived and worked and their association with drugs and the sex trade (Lowman, 2001; Pitman, 2002; Culhane, 2003). For example, a disproportionate number of the missing women of the Downtown Eastside identified as Aboriginal (Amnesty International, 2004). One study highlights that 70% of sex trade workers in this area of Vancouver are Aboriginal women under the age of twenty-six (Culhane, 2003:597). This provides context for why this area is referred to by some Aboriginal peoples as an 'urban reserve,' as women in this area suffer from extreme poverty and are particularly vulnerable to violent victimisation and sexual exploitation (Farley et al., 2005:257). For too many women, the intersection of racism, sexism and poverty has resulted in their physical disappearance and violent murder. However, these women also disappeared metaphorically when they began living in the Downtown Eastside and, even after their physical disappearances, family members, friends, community members and activists fought to have them recognised as missing women.

The development and implementation of policies concerning prostitution have also been problematised in the literature linking prostitution and victimisation. For example, the number of sex trade workers murdered in British Columbia increased after the introduction of the communication law, which deems it illegal to discuss publicly the exchange of money for sex (Lowman, 2004). Nick Larsen (1996) notes that the policing of the communication law in Vancouver resulted in the relocation of sex trade workers to different areas of the city. Consequently, sex trade workers have been displaced to specific neighbourhoods, such as the Downtown Eastside. Lowman (2000:1003) has termed the discourse of this period as "the discourse of disposal" because he argues that the implicit aim of such policies is to "get rid of" sex trade workers. This indicates that as prostitution moves to areas of the city that are less visible, such as poorly lit alleys or under-policed areas, it results in increased levels of victimisation because these areas generally have less traffic and supervision for safety purposes. It is clear that for some women, this has direct links to their metaphorical and physical disappearances.

Razack (2002:143) concludes that spaces of prostitution are areas in which violence can occur with impunity, as demonstrated by the treatment by state officials when violence against sex trade workers occurs, as well as reactions by members of the general public. In the case of Pamela Jean George, whose disappearance was also included in the "Stolen Sisters" report, her Aboriginal identity and association with the sex trade over-determined the way to which her violent murder was responded. Razack (2002:143) concludes that "bodies from respectable spaces may also violate with impunity, particularly if the violence takes places within the racialised space of prostitution." Unfortunately, it does not appear that the murder of Pamela George and the

reaction her death produced is atypical. As is the case with Aboriginal women, it is clear that women involved in and associated with the sex trade are particularly vulnerable to violent victimisation and are among an increasing number of missing women in Canada.

Violence against women in Canada is both frequent and serious. The majority of studies that have been published are concerned with women's experiences of violence within the private sphere, as domestic violence has been central to feminist campaigns to acknowledge the ways in which women's experiences of violence are different than those of men. Women's experiences of victimisation in the public sphere are increasingly becoming the focus of research, such as experiences of sexual harassment as well as violent victimisation. Studies specifically focused on the victimisation of Aboriginal women and sex trade workers highlight the ways in which different women experience violent victimisation differently in both the private and public spheres. These two groups of women have also received attention because they are among populations of women who have gone missing in recent years. While there is a lack of information or studies looking at women who go missing in Canada, there have been a small number of studies concentrating on the disappearances of Aboriginal women and sex trade workers. However, these studies rarely include a discussion of media representation of missing women and it is necessary to address this area.

Violence Against Women in the Media

Frankie Bailey (2006:44) holds that women's images in the media are socially constructed. It is important to deconstruct these images and the role they have in the perception and treatment of victimised women. In this context, the language used to describe an event affects the ways in which others understand that event, and this extends

to the victimisation of women (Bailey, 2006:44). The themes I will highlight and discuss in this section include the ways violence against women is presented as an individual problem divorced from social forces and institutions and how racialised women are presented as the 'Other' and are both hypervisible and invisible.

Women's Victimisation in the Media

Critical theorists have long held that news content is a politicised and hierarchical process and this is apparent in the news coverage of violence against women (Wykes, 2001:22; Jiwani & Young, 2006). Jiwani and Young (2006:900) argue that cases of women's victimisation are most often presented in a one-dimensional way. One example of this is the representation of domestic violence in news media. In her analysis of intimate violent crime in British media, Maggie Wykes (2001) concludes that women, more often than men, are the focus of press coverage concerning fatal intimate violence, regardless of their assigned identities as victims or offenders. Women's sexuality is often central to news coverage and is viewed negatively, whereas men's sexuality is (if present) written in a positive way (Wykes, 2001:160). A woman's appearance and habits are also included in news articles and often as a way to identify that woman. For example, Wykes (2001:158) notes one woman is referred to as "Blonde Pam," and argues that this not only indicates that her hair colour is important but this label associates her with a specific female sexual stereotype. Men, on the other hand, are not referred to in such terms. A further way that women are represented differently than men is by the use of their names (Wykes, 2001:158). Women as both victims and offenders are frequently introduced by their first names whereas men are commonly referred to by their surnames and sometimes by their first and surname, though rarely by their first name alone. Wykes

23

(2001:158) holds that this serves to deny women the respect of using their full name and is both patronising and infantilising. Overall, Wykes (2001) concludes that women are more likely to be discussed and associated with negative terms regardless of their identities as victims or offenders involved in intimate killing.

Nancy Berns' (2004) study on the way domestic violence is framed within the media overlaps with Wyke's discussion, though it is the way her analysis diverges that I will focus on. Berns (2004) argues that the ways in which women are portrayed as victims has changed over the last few years towards a way that is seen as more empowering. However, she maintains that this is misleading, as an empowered victim is one who 'takes charge' of her situation and this is dependent on notions of victim responsibility (Berns, 2004:58). While it appears that this perspective is empowering victims, in fact it is creating and solidifying a framework in which blame is assigned to those who do not 'take charge.' Women are, therefore, responsible for identifying 'warning signs' of abuse, negotiating relationships with men so that they do not experience abuse and 'solving' abusive relationships. Berns (2004:152) concludes that this creates a hierarchy of victims as pardoned, partially or fully responsible for, or deserving of abuse.

The perpetuation of the belief that violence is a victim's issue ignores the role of social institutions and social structures in fostering domestic violence (Berns, 2004:145). Berns (2004:159) argues that the media continue to present intimate partner violence as a personal issue, and often focus on individual stories in which women are encouraged to leave the relationship and seek counselling, or stories in which inspirational women have successfully ended an abusive relationship. The central message here is that women who

overcome their problems are triumphant and inspirational; however, Berns (2004:159) highlights how it is 'easier' to have a 'happy ending' than to address necessary structural and cultural changes that need to take place to ensure the safety of women. Of course, the appeal of the personal story is that it is inspiring and has the potential to gain public sympathy and support. Further, it is more complete in that it can be presented with a beginning, a middle and an ending, which gives it added appeal for media sources as well as advocates against violence in their interaction with media (Berns, 2004:158-159). On the other hand, this focus serves to perpetuate the belief that responding to abuse is the responsibility of the victim. Berns (2004:161) holds that it would be more productive (and realistic) to include stories that focus on abusers, the roots of violence and the roles of social institutions and structures as these are sorely lacking. Thus, even a gendered perspective of women's victimisation can be a contentious issue that warrants careful consideration.

Women of Colour and Experiences of Violence within the Media

What is not addressed in the above studies are the ways in which different women are portrayed differently within the media. Jiwani and Young (2006:901) contend that the representation of violence against women of colour is markedly different and this difference is especially apparent in how crimes against women of colour are less likely to be featured in the news in comparison to white women. Frances Henry and Carol Tator (2000:52) argue that "one of the most significant measures of racism in the media is the absence or underrepresentation of people of colour in all areas of the print and electronic media." This can be seen in the results of one study which concluded that crimes against black women were rarely front page news and news coverage was more likely to be

found on the back pages, or omitted completely (Wortley, 2002 as cited in Jiwani &
Young, 2006).

Unfortunately, when news stories concerning the violent victimisation of women
of colour are included in media sources, their representation is frequently based on racist
stereotypes which ultimately serve to 'Other' them. Jiwani and Young (2006:901)
discuss the ways in which black women have been characterised as welfare cheats and
matriarchs, playing into dominant stereotypes which minimise the violence they
experience. For example, some women of colour are stereotyped as hypersexual, such as
Aboriginal women and black women being associated with promiscuity (Razack, 2002;
Wilcox, 2005; Joseph, 2006). Violence against women of colour is also presented as part
of their 'culture' or cultural traditions, which again serves to minimise the violence they
experience (Jiwani & Young, 2006:901). Aboriginal peoples, for example, are often
associated with poverty, alcoholism, unreliability and untrustworthiness (Henry & Tator,
2000). This results in their credibility being undermined within Canadian media.

Henry and Tator (2000:66) argue that within the media, people of colour are
categorised in ways that ignores the diversity found within communities. Further, by
consistently being misrepresented within Canadian media, there is a polarisation and an
'us' versus 'them' dynamic is created (Henry & Tator, 2000:66; Jiwani, 2002b). The 'us'
versus 'them' dichotomy is further strengthened and solidified by the ways in which
certain crimes receive more press coverage than others. As discussed above, crimes
against women of colour are less likely to be front page news than crimes against white
women (Jiwani & Young, 2006:901). Janice Joseph (2006:305) argues that media reports
silence the victimisation of black women while at the same time sensationalising crimes

committed by black men against white women. Thus, when perpetrators are persons of colour and victims are white, there is not only increased coverage of the events but these stories are placed at a higher priority, such as the front page of a newspaper. Akua Benjamin (2002:182) holds that this perpetuates the idea of white innocence and black criminality, which serves to further 'Other' the black body. Benjamin (2002) argues that by silencing the voices of black victims and providing one-sided stories of their victimisation, media accounts offer little positive information and reinforce existing stereotypes. This ultimately affects the ways in which news readers interpret stories involving the violent victimisation of women of colour versus white women.

The voices of Aboriginal women in Canada within the media overlaps with many of the themes above; however, there are some interesting differences. Historically based stereotypes linking Aboriginal women with notions of prostitution and promiscuity have served to minimise the violence experienced by Aboriginal women (Razack, 2002). Jiwani and Young (2006:899) hold that Aboriginal peoples have been associated with violence and criminality even when they are victims of crimes, as shown through the publishing of police photos in news articles of the missing women of the Downtown Eastside. Aboriginal peoples have also been portrayed as child-like and, therefore, in need of protection and action by others (Jiwani & Young, 2006:898). Aboriginal women are further silenced within news discourses. Jiwani and Young (2006:899) highlight how "representations of Aboriginal women in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside oscillate between invisibility and hypervisibility: invisible as victims of violence and hypervisible as deviant bodies." It is clear, therefore, that Aboriginal women are differently represented within Canadian news media than white women. Moreover, representation

27

of women of colour within the news media plays a key role in the racialisation of crime in Canada.

Missing Women in the Media

As stated in the introduction to this chapter, there is little research concerning adults who go missing and the majority of what has been published focuses on specific high profile cases (Patterson, 2005). This pattern is mirrored when discussing media constructions of women who go missing, with a clear focus in Canada on media coverage of the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. There are two key themes present within media representation of missing women. The first is a critique of the overall absence of media coverage, and the second concerns the construction of the women as missing persons.

In recent years criticisms have been raised regarding how certain populations of women who go missing, namely Aboriginal women and sex trade workers, have been absent from media sources (Amnesty International, 2004; Jiwani & Young, 2006). Amnesty International (2004) holds that Aboriginal women are less likely to have their disappearances reported in newspapers. Further, because the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside were involved in the sex trade and a disproportionate number identified as Aboriginal, their disappearances were largely ignored and vastly underreported (Amnesty International, 2004:23). In reference to three Aboriginal women murdered in Saskatchewan, one journalist concludes:

> I don't get the sense the general public cares much about missing or murdered aboriginal women. It's all part of the indifference to the lives of aboriginal people. They don't seem to matter as much as white people.
> (As quoted in Amnesty International, 2004:24)

28

Scholarly attention to the representation of the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside is likely owing, at least in part, to the above criticisms. To date, there have been two key studies in this area. The first was conducted by Barbara Pitman (2002) and focuses on a 1999 episode of *America's Most Wanted* which featured the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. Pitman (2002:177) argues that *America's Most Wanted* openly sensationalised this population of missing women. One of the most interesting critiques highlighted in this study concerns a re-enacted segment featuring one of the missing women. The story centres on the disappearance of Sarah deVries, a young women who identifies as Mexican and Aboriginal. While Pitman (2002:177) does not critique the choice of this missing women over others from the Downtown Eastside, a critique which might be valid considering Sarah deVries' upper-middle class background, she is critical of the young blonde white actress chosen to represent her. Pitman (2002:177) questions why the show "would cater to a male fantasy of white female sexual availability." Perhaps, as Pitman (2002) alludes, it is to make the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside more knowable to viewers, by conveying that the women who have gone missing are 'just like them,' and that we should all be concerned about these missing women. It would seem that 'just like them' in this context means 'white.' Therefore, racial identity, and perhaps class background, is a central theme which is apparent within coverage of these missing women.

Yasmin Jiwani and Mary Lynn Young (2006) have also studied media coverage of the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. By deconstructing newspaper articles, Jiwani and Young (2006:897-898) found that while some coverage was 'sympathetic' of the women, there was a tendency toward focusing on their

association with criminality and culpability as victims. The authors offer a rich understanding of media coverage, largely concentrated on the ways the focus of articles was to make these women 'knowable,' while also serving to solidify their identities as the 'Other.' For example, there is a focus on the women's identities as mothers, daughters and sisters, highlighting that these women could have been anyone's mother, daughter, or sister. However, the missing women are simultaneously identified as 'runaways' or 'troubled,' as if the women all followed a pattern in how they came to live in the Downtown Eastside and became involved in prostitution. Jiwani and Young (2006:912) conclude that these themes serve to uphold existing binaries of 'good' or 'respectable' women versus 'bad' or culpable women. These themes will be discussed in more detail in the next chapter.

Media representations of women who go missing are important areas for study, especially as there are only a small number of studies in this area. Fortunately, there is a growing body of research concerning media representation of victimised women and the ways in which their identities are constructed. These studies are critical to feminist research because they highlight the ways in which women's identities affect their treatment as victims and how these identities contribute to frameworks of acceptability and worth as victims. These themes will also be discussed in further detail in the following chapter.

Summary of Chapter

Canadian women experience significantly high levels of violent victimisation both in the public and private spheres. While women do not experience the same levels of violence as men, their experiences of violent victimisation are unique and, therefore, it is

necessary to conduct research with a gendered lens. Women in Canada do not experience

violence in uniform ways, and Aboriginal women and sex trade workers experience

disproportionately high levels of violent victimisation. Media representations of women

demonstrate that women are sexualised and often women are placed within frameworks

of blame and culpability. This is especially acute for women who are Aboriginal or

involved in the sex trade.

CHAPTER 3:
METHODOLOGY

This chapter is organised into two sections. The first is concerned with the theoretical

perspective and conceptual framework which inform and influence this study.

Specifically, it defines and discusses feminist intersectional analysis as a theoretical

perspective, and notions of 'appropriate' gendered behaviour and processes of

racialisation within the context of moral regulation and social control of women in

Canadian society. The second section examines the methodological framework of this

project, specifically the use of qualitative feminist discourse analysis. It also discusses

data collection, organisation and coding. This chapter concludes with a discussion of the

benefits and limitations of the above approach.

Theoretical Perspective and Conceptual Framework

This study is concerned with the ways in which women's victimisation and women as

victims of crime are conceptualised. My focus includes women's experiences of

victimisation and the ways in which women who go missing are represented within

newspaper articles. My research follows a woman-centred approach and recognises that

experiences of crime and victimisation are gendered, and women's experiences are

unique and affected by multiple social factors. The theoretical perspective that informs

my research is feminist intersectionality, which maintains that women's lived experiences

are affected by identity factors and position women in unique ways (Crenshaw,

1991;1993; Hill Collins, 2000; Cossins, 2003). This theory responds to oversights from

32

previous essentialist feminist arguments and maintains that we must identify and respond to the intersection of identity markers in order to fully understand women's lived experiences and the frameworks of oppression that perpetuate the discrimination of women. These factors inform the conceptual framework of this study, in which notions of what constitutes 'appropriate' gendered behaviour and processes of racialisation affect the ways in which we conceptualise who constitutes an 'appropriate' or 'valuable' victim of crime.

Feminist Intersectionality

It is widely held that there is no singular feminist perspective, and there has been and continues to be significant tension and disagreement among feminist scholars. In particular, second and third wave feminists have countered essentialist arguments found within earlier feminist works and have argued that some feminist studies have served to privilege certain groups of women over others, principally white, middle class, heterosexual women (Crenshaw, 1993; Carrington, 1998; hooks, 2000). bell hooks (2000) maintains that while there is no definitive definition of feminism, feminists must share the desire to counteract women's experiences of exploitation and oppression in both the collective and individual sense in order to end sexist discrimination. Further, hooks (2000:33) maintains that "feminism as a movement to end sexist oppression directs our attention to systems of domination and the interrelatedness of sex, race, and class oppression." Her focus on the interconnection of sex, race and class has fundamentally changed the way many feminists situate themselves within academia, the political sphere and the feminist movement itself.

Black and critical race feminists have furthered many of the arguments raised and popularised by hooks, and these writings have laid the path for feminist intersectionality. Patricia Hill Collins (2000) focuses on the work of different black feminist advocates and calls attention to the ways in which black women can be empowered and affect change. She notes how black feminist thought has responded to the ways in which black women as a group remain oppressed and how unequal power relationships must be examined within social theory (Hill Collins, 2000:9). Similarly, Anne Cossins (2003:78 original italics) observes that "critical race feminists [have] recognised that race carries with it unique cultural meanings that create cultural divisions between *women* in ways that are analogous to the way that sex creates cultural differences between men and women."

These criticisms have resulted in debates as to the best, or most appropriate, approach for responding to women's discrimination and the different ways in which women experience oppression, while still focusing on women's lived experiences. For example, some feminists have argued that we must adopt an additive approach to women's oppression, by focusing on one identity factor or type of disadvantage as a base measurement and 'adding the rest' (Cossins, 2003:78). However, critical race feminists have opposed this method, as Adrien Wing (as cited in Cossins, 2003:89) maintains "our anti-essentialist premise is that identity is not additive. In other words, Black women are not white women plus color, or Black men plus gender." Critical race feminists insist that having race as an 'add-on' ignores the ways in which women of colour's lived experiences of discrimination and oppression are unique. Further, discourses that include race as an 'add-on' fail to acknowledge historical processes of racialisation resulting in an ahistorical account of racialised women's experiences (Cossins, 2003:90). In order to

take action against these oversights, and glaring oversights found within monocausal frameworks, feminist scholars have adopted approaches which seek to understand the interconnectedness of sex, gender, racial identity, ethnic background, class, sexual orientation, among other identity factors.

This theoretical perspective is widely referred to as intersectionality, a term coined by Kimberle Crenshaw. Crenshaw (1991:1243-4) maintains that racism and sexism intersect in the lives of people, but rarely do so in feminist and anti-racist theory and practice. She contends that these discourses focus on white women and black men, respectively. She argues that if intra-group differences are not considered, then the needs of women of colour fail to be addressed and they are further silenced. According to Crenshaw (1993), there are three forms of intersectional analysis: structural intersectionality, political intersectionality and representational intersectionality. Structural intersectionality refers "to the ways in which women of colour are situated within overlapping structures of subordination . . . [and] how the dynamics of each hierarchy exacerbates and compounds the consequences of others" (Crenshaw, 1993:114). In her research, this is applied to women of colour experiencing domestic violence and the ways in which resources to end violence are geared toward white women (Crenshaw, 1991). Political intersectionality refers "to the different ways in which political and discursive practices relating to race and gender inter-relate, often erasing women of colour" (Crenshaw, 1993:115). Crenshaw (1991:1253) holds that women of colour are not represented within popular discourses of feminism or anti-racism and are often erased by political priorities and strategic silences by advocacy groups. The third variant that Crenshaw (1993:116) defines is representational

35

intersectionality, and this refers to "the way that race and gender images, readily available in our culture, converge to create unique and specific narratives deemed appropriate for women of colour." She argues that these images frequently centre on sexuality and often influence how women of colour are expected to act (Crenshaw: 1993:117). In her research, Crenshaw (1993) considers the ways women of colour are portrayed in movies and how these roles serve to reinforce and perpetuate racialised sexual stereotypes, as well as silencing and delegitimising experiences of violence.

Hill Collins (2000) and Cossins (2003) have also made significant contributions to this perspective. Hill Collins (2000:18) discusses a 'matrix of domination' which refers to how "intersecting oppressions are actually organised." Her focus is the structural and hegemonic frameworks of power which persist across forms of oppression and how these frameworks affect the lived experiences of women (Hill Collins, 2000:18). Similarly, Cossins (2003:91) describes this approach as a convergence analysis and considers the ways in which the intersections of identity factors such as sex and race intersect and produce "intersectional identities." Cossins (2003:92) uses the term convergence because it "evokes an image of a unique cultural space that is created by sex and race- in particular a space where black and indigenous women are marooned or isolated by cultural barriers created by these two converging systems of subordination." The concepts of a 'matrix of domination' and convergence analysis are encompassed within the framework of intersectional analysis because they acknowledge that "individuals possess multiple identities (based on race/ethnicity, class, and gender) that simultaneously interact with each other" (Joseph, 2006:299). Janice Joseph (2006:299) summarises how this approach uncovers the ways in which systems of oppression work

simultaneously to affect social life, focuses on disempowerment of marginalised peoples and "examines how the systems of racism, sexism, classism, and ethnic discrimination overlap and interrelate to each other."

This type of approach is necessary and beneficial for a number of reasons. An intersectional approach is inclusive and, therefore, complex. As Cossins (2003:97) notes, it is often easier to discuss characteristics such as gender and race in isolation; however, to do this is to ignore how identity factors are defined in relation to each other and change over time. Academics and advocates are increasingly demonstrating how the intersection of characteristics can affect the likelihood of discrimination and victimisation of certain identifiable groups of women. This is especially important in considering the victimisation of marginalised women, such as sex trade workers. The work of Sherene Razack (1998; 2002) is most relevant here as she analyses the intersections of gender, race and space within the context of prostitution in Canada. Razack (1998) argues that an intersectional approach allows us to understand how white supremacy, patriarchy and capitalism are all involved in the construction of prostitution. Her analysis allows us to see how prostitution both defines gender, race and space as well as the way that gender, race and space define prostitution. In this way, no singular characteristic or identity marker contributes to assumptions about prostitution or sex trade workers more than any other, and all must be included in an analysis of prostitution. The need for an intersectional analysis is also shown in the writings of Patricia Monture-Angus (1995; 1999). Monture-Angus self identifies as a Mohawk woman married to a Cree man, an Aboriginal woman, and an Indian woman. She argues that monocausal analyses do not relate to people's lived experiences because these theories often essentialise women of

colour in ways that do not acknowledge the differences between and among, for example, Aboriginal women and Black women. Monture-Angus (1999:82) shares how she has and continues to experience oppression as a woman, as an Indian, and as an Indian woman, and she has experienced violence as an individual, but also as a member of a group. She writes, "My world is not experienced in a linear and compartmentalised way . . . To artificially separate my gender from my race and culture forces me to deny the way I experience the world" (Monture-Angus, 1995:178). Monture-Angus (1995) demonstrates how considering frameworks of sexism and patriarchy without an analysis of processes of racialisation is meaningless. Monture-Angus' perspective provides crucial insight into experiences of Canadian Indigenous women's experiences of violence and victimisation and reminds us of the need to consider social factors and power relationships in all analyses.

My aim is to understand how identity factors inform and define each other in order to uncover who constitutes a 'valuable' or 'appropriate' victim in relation to women who go missing across Canada. In this way, no singular characteristic or identity marker, such as Aboriginal identity or association to the sex trade, can be understood alone, and all must be included in my analysis because they collectively affect the perception and treatment of women who are victimised. Identity factors do not simply increase vulnerability but contribute to the overall treatment, response and attention given to those victimised. In this context, the theoretical perspective of feminist intersectionality is essential to my research because it allows for an analysis of systems of oppression as well as the unique spaces which are created according to the intersection of

identity factors. It is this relationship that I investigate in regards to the media attention of women who go missing across Canada.

Conceptual Framework

Moral Regulation

In addition to the theoretical perspective of intersectionality, I believe it is critical to discuss notions of 'appropriate' gendered behaviour and processes of racialisation within Canadian society and Canadian print media, in order to understand the ways in which frameworks of oppression impact women's lived experiences of discrimination. I argue these processes are largely influenced by and maintained through the social control and moral regulation of women's behaviours, specifically sexuality, in Canadian society. Social control and the moral regulation of women are fundamentally sustained by perceptions and beliefs regarding women's fear of crime and victimisation, which are both self-imposed and placed upon women. Women experience the effects of social control and moral regulation in their everyday life and these processes influence how women behave and act. Moral regulation is a process that informs the standards to which we react to and judge women's behaviour. Therefore, moral regulation is central to the development and perpetuation of gendered and racialised frameworks.

Joycelyn Pollock (2006:6) defines social control as "the limits and restriction on behaviour and values experienced by each member of society." Pollock (2006:7) maintains that social control manifests itself in both informal and formal forms. Informal social control refers to organisations which influence individuals through processes of socialisation, such as the family and the church, while formal social control includes institutions such as the military, criminal justice system and school system.

Formal institutions differ because methods of control are more standard and sanctioned through the state (Pollock, 2006:7).

The framework of moral regulation shares similarities with social control, and some use these terms interchangeably. Alan Hunt (1999:18), on the other hand, rejects social control because it denies individual's agency and denotes there is a "society" that is its own entity and is capable of action (Hunt, 1999:18). Hunt (1999) prefers the term moral regulation because it acknowledges the fluidity of power and agency. Hunt (1999:1) defines moral regulation as a form of "politics in which some people act to problematise the conduct, values, or culture of others and seek to impose regulation upon them." Hunt (1999:7) argues that "the 'moral' element in moral regulation involves any normative judgement that some conduct is intrinsically bad, wrong or immoral." Moral regulation is intrinsically linked to and informed by 'moral politics' and 'moralising discourses,' which change over time and space and result in 'moral movements' (Hunt, 1999).

Joan Sangster (2006:36) discusses the shift from the use of social control to moral regulation as being linked to the rise of Foucauldian and feminist theorists. According to Sangster (2006:37), Foucauldian theorists offer a slightly more nuanced understanding of morality by questioning how moral discourses have been defined by use of 'expert knowledges' that normalise and pathologise individuals. These processes become central to what is determined 'normal' and 'natural' and, by definition, what is considered 'abnormal,' 'unnatural' and 'undesirable.' These dichotomies define what is moral and immoral behaviour.

Similar to social control, moral regulation originates from a variety of social positions. Hunt (1999) defines these social positions as 'above' (the State), 'the middle' (non-State institutions) and 'below' (members of the public). According to this model, the three levels do not exist and operate in isolation but are often interconnected and interdependent. This perspective coincides with arguments put forth by Mariana Valverde and Lorna Weir (2006), who maintain that moral regulation exists within a complex relationship between state and non-state institutions that work both together and individually to define and enforce moral conduct. Further, Foucauldian theorists highlight the ways in which individuals play a significant and critical role in policing their own conduct, further blurring the lines of state and non-state (Hunt, 1999; Sangster, 2006).

Mariana Valverde (2006) maintains that contemporary moral regulation has its roots in the Victorian era which was central to moral reform. This time period centred on the formation and rise of "the social" and an increased interest in the conduct and behaviour of the public and responding to issues of crime and poverty. The Victorian era also saw the rise of social scientists, resulting in studies of the lower classes, an increased focus on the lives of the poor and the production of materials aimed at 'remoralising' the individual (Valverde, 2006:123). However, sexual morality became the centre of this movement for social purity, and specifically the sexual purity of women. Valverde and Weir (2006) maintain that Victorian bourgeois notions of respectability and purity became the foundation of what was considered 'acceptable,' and Victorian principles shape contemporary notions of 'acceptable' femininity and sexuality. Thus, from the beginning, moral regulation has differently affected women and men, and today women's

bodies, sexual practices and class position are still central to discourses of moral regulation. The moral regulation of women's sexuality can be seen most particularly in relation to discourses of prostitution and women involved in the sex trade, which will be discussed in further detail below.

Moral Regulation and Fear of Crime

As stated previously, women's experiences of violence are believed to exist along a continuum of violence in contemporary society and are linked to women's self-regulation of their behaviour (Stanko, 1995). Research in this area has helped to demonstrate that women and men experience crime differently. While men might experience more violent victimisation than women, for women the experiences and effects of victimisation are different (Stanko, 1990; Mooney, 2000). Elizabeth Stanko (1997) argues that discourses of crime are framed within discourses of risk and this has different meanings for women and men. Women are taught that they are at-risk of victimisation by men and, as such, women are taught to be fearful of men (Stanko, 1997:482). Stanko (1997) maintains that this results in women assuming more fear than men because they are taught to be responsible for their own safety. She further argues that women's self regulation of their behaviour constitutes 'doing gender,' in that women who are successful at 'safekeeping' are seen as effectively performing feminine roles (Stanko, 1997:487). In this context, 'safekeeping' refers to fear of crime discourses and the behaviours which are central to these processes.

Fear of crime is crucial to consider because it has very real effects for individuals, communities and societies. Stanko (1990:176) maintains that "most women have developed an elaborate set of precautionary strategies which they use in every day life" as

42

a way to protect themselves from real and perceived victimisation. One method is varying how they walk. Many women admit that they walk in more aggressive ways when they are alone at night, by keeping their head up high, walking fast and projecting 'an attitude' (Madriz, 1997:122-123). Women acknowledge being hyper aware of their surroundings, who else is on the street and to holding their keys as possible weapons (Stanko, 1990:176). Research shows that women will spend money on cars and private taxis to avoid using public transportation at night, regardless of whether or not it is financially feasible (Stanko, 1990:176). Additionally, women will change their style of dress to conceal their bodies and appear more masculine to deflect attention they might receive if perceived as women (Madriz, 1997). Esther Madriz (1997:41) concludes that women live by "strict rules of conduct" equalling "invisible walls . . . limiting their lives and activities." Women will also share their strategies with other women; thus through sharing 'rules of caution,' women produce discourses of safety which are held as "common sense" (Stanko, 1990:176).

Moral regulation and fear of crime are, therefore, intricately related. Processes of moral regulation influence what is considered appropriate behaviour and it is these very notions of appropriate behaviour that inform discourses of fear of crime. Women's self-regulation of their behaviour serves to strengthen gender norms of 'appropriate' female behaviour, dividing women into categories of 'good' girls and 'bad' girls according to how they respond to tenets dictated by fear of crime discourses. These divides are directly linked to gendered continuums of worthiness for women who experience victimisation (Benedict, 1992; Madriz, 1997).

Scripts of Femininity and Continuums of Worth

What is considered 'appropriate' gendered behaviour is intrinsically linked to the moral regulation of women, and the ways in which women negotiate fear of crime discourses partially demonstrates this relationship. As Stanko (1990:180) claims, "women already know that if they breach notions of respectability . . . they will not- and probably should not expect to- receive the benevolent protection of a man, the police, the criminal justice system, and so forth." Thus, conforming to and performing acceptable scripts of femininity is crucial for women, since any deviation could mean women are culpable for their experiences of victimisation. Deserving and undeserving victims, therefore, are socially constructed according to notions of how they conform to gender roles.

Madriz (1997) details the construction of the appropriate victim as one who conforms to values regarding 'American-ness.' According to this view, good victims are those who are identified as hardworking, responsible, middle to upper-class and family-oriented (Madriz, 1997:76). For women, good victims must also avoid areas or spaces that they are not 'supposed' to be. Further, women are taught to avoid violence because it is not feminine; thus, good women are passive (Stanko, 1995; Madriz, 1997). Finally, good women are virtuous and must convey an image that they are sexually innocent and refrain from dressing provocatively. Pollock (2006:5) describes this divide as the 'madonna/whore' dichotomy, a divide that has been noted by many feminist scholars. She contends that victimised women are stereotyped to fit into one of these two categories, in order for others to make sense of their victimisation. Pollock (2006:5) states:

> If a 'good' woman is raped, then the rapist is viewed as worse than a murderer because he has violated her purity, which is seemingly more important than her

life. By contrast, a 'bad' woman cannot be raped according to this duality, and a bad woman is any woman who does not conform to the stereotype of femininity.

The dichotomy of the Madonna/whore translates to dualities of acceptable/unacceptable and valuable/valueless victims. Madriz (1997:83) adds to this by concluding that women are placed along a continuum of victim-hood, with good, innocent victims representing one end and culpable victims representing the other. The innocent victim represents the ideal; however, the culpable victim is characterised as sexually active or promiscuous, especially if she is not monogamous. In short, she has a 'dubious' reputation. Culpable women also include those who party, drink and do drugs, and engage in other behaviours thought to be 'unfeminine,' women who are poor and on welfare, and those who associate with disreputable people (Madriz, 1997:88-89).

As discussed in the previous chapter, sex trade workers are a uniquely marginalised population of women who experience a disproportionate amount of violent victimisation in Canada. However, they are also uniquely placed along continuums of morality and worth as victims because of their placement within frameworks of femininity and sexuality. This affects both their experiences of victimisation and construction as victims. Research demonstrates that sex trade workers are vulnerable to victimisation because they challenge, or violate, norms of acceptable female behaviour and acceptable female sexuality. Phil Hubbard and Teela Sanders (2003:82) highlight how street prostitution challenges the norm that women should only practice sexuality in the privacy of their homes. In this way, prostitution is seen as polluting and sex workers are morally offensive (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003:82). Hubbard and Sanders (2003:81) describe how many protests against sex workers use the language of moral outrage, such as depicting sex workers as the "embodiment of vulgar and conspicuous sex."

45

Helga Kristen Hallgrimsdottir, Rachel Phillips and Cecilia Benoit (2006:272) found that discourses of prostitution situate sex workers as morally culpable, as 'fallen women' and as 'morally destitute' women. They conclude that "narratives around culpability sustain and reproduce the stigma that workers are fundamentally and deeply morally damaged" (Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2006:272). Further, women are declared to be 'fallen women' because they violate appropriate norms of femininity (Boritch, 1997). While the narrative of sex workers as culpable peaked in the 1980s, newer discourses have similar moral undertones, positioning prostitution as a 'public nuisance' (Brock, 2000; Jeffrey, 2004). Leslie Ann Jeffrey (2004:91) notes that this debate separates sex trade workers from 'good' moral citizens as sex workers threaten to 'take over' neighbourhoods and put moral citizens 'at-risk.' Sex trade workers are not 'good' or 'moral' women, because 'good' (and therefore worthy) women are subject to harassment caused by the presence of sex trade workers. The public push for new laws, therefore, is based upon the protection of 'good' women, which strengthens the belief that sex trade workers are 'bad' women.

Ultimately, the treatment of sex trade workers as culpable or less worthy victims serves to aid in the process of creating and reinforcing a continuum of worthiness. It can be argued that sex trade workers, because of the ways in which they violate norms of acceptable femininity and sexuality, are central to this dichotomy as they serve as a marker to be judged against. Beverly Balos and Mary Louise Fellows (1999:1271) conclude that "the making of the worthy woman happens by imagining what the worthy woman is not." It is clear that 'acceptable' female behaviour is intimately linked to women's sexuality and sexual practices.

46

Processes of Racialisation and Continuums of Worth

A central factor associated with constructions of worthiness involves stereotypes and assumptions regarding race and racial identity. While I have taken some steps to separate this section of the discussion in order to provide clarity, it must be remembered that discourses and lived experiences of racial identity and processes of racialisation cannot be separated from scripts of femininity. Racial identity and racialisation are intimately related to moral regulation of women, as these processes contribute to notions of who is and who is not a worthy victim of crime.

What is most important for the purposes of this argument are the ways in which certain groups of people are racialised and, therefore, belong to racialised populations. Yasmin Jiwani (2005:848) defines racialisation as the process by which individuals are "marked by physical and cultural differences." Miles (as cited in Jiwani, 2005:851) maintains that racialisation is a "process or situation wherein the idea of 'race' is introduced to define and give meaning to some particular populations, its characteristics and actions." Racialisation becomes complete when individuals are held to these assumptions about their identities, characteristics and behaviours as being linked to their racial identity. It is clear that here the concept of race itself is not problematised, but taken for granted. Further, actions linked to race are placed along a continuum of value and moral order.

Jiwani (2005:851) highlights how the relationship between racism and violence is much stronger than believed to be in Canada, and concludes that "gendered socialisation combined with the Othering resulting from racialisation heightens the complex and intersecting forms of violence that girls and young women of colour experience." Along with Jiwani (2005), many feminist scholars maintain that racialised women are

47

constructed as the sexually available 'Other,' which leaves racialised women uniquely vulnerable to violent and sexual victimisation. Sangster (2002) highlights the ways this can be seen historically through the implementation and enforcement of the Female Refugee's Act (FRA), legislation in Ontario which sought to control women's sexuality from 1897 to 1958. She argues that interpretations of the Act were linked to race in two ways: the imprisonment of white women who were involved with men of colour, and the increasing rate of conviction for women of colour, in particular Aboriginal women (Sangster, 2002:47). Sangster (2002:54) holds that "Native women and women of colour were almost always seen to be more prone to promiscuity." Therefore, women of colour were policed differently from white women because they were seen as more promiscuous and, as a result, in need of regulation. Sangster (2002:59-60 original italics) concludes that one general theme persists;

> The very notion of which women were *likely* to be promiscuous, which women needed "protection," which women had a weaker moral constitution, was shaped by the equation of Whiteness with the protection of purity, and Aboriginal and women of colour with potential moral laxity. Indeed, Aboriginal women were subject to extra surveillance and control in part for this reason.

It is clear that these beliefs were based upon racist sexualised stereotypes which had very real effects for women of colour.

These frameworks remain apparent in Canadian society and continue to affect women of colour today. Aboriginal women continue to be associated with promiscuity (Razack, 2002; Comack & Balfour, 2004). In her analysis of the trial for the murderers of Pamela George, Razack (2002:148) argues that Pamela George "never left the racially bounded space of prostitution and degeneracy during the trial, a space that marked her as a body to be violated." Pamela George was an Aboriginal sex trade worker and this

identity affected the way she was held as a victim within the courtroom. Razack (2002:144) concludes that because of her identity as an Aboriginal sex trade worker, Pamela George remained a "hooker" and her murderers' young boys who did "pretty darn stupid things." Razack's (2002) analysis demonstrates that race and sexuality do affect the treatment one receives from the criminal justice system and how the identity of the victim contributes to her perceived worth. Her work coincides with conclusions put forth by Madriz (1997:132), who argues that racialised stereotypes regarding sexuality result in the deligitimisation of women of colour's experiences of sexual victimisation. Indeed, Madriz (1997:132) concludes that these ideologies have "served to condone rape against women of colour." Her work demonstrates that women of colour's lived experiences of violence continue to exist within racialised frameworks that hold women of colour as differently responsible for their victimisation.

Madriz (1997:81) maintains that women of colour are placed along continuums of worth as victims according to how they conform to notions of white middle class femininity. As described previously, a 'worthy' or 'acceptable' victim is one who subscribes to 'appropriate' gendered behaviour. However, Madriz (1997:81) argues that the 'worthy,' or idealised, victim is white and women of colour "are culpable victims because of their race, unless they have some qualities in common with white middle class victims." For example, Hill Collins (as cited in Balos & Fellows, 1999:1271) argues that historically the construction of Black women as prostitutes allowed the creation of white women as virginal. In this case, racialised and sexualised women provide the necessary backdrop for white women to be proclaimed worthy. In Canada, Elizabeth Comack and Gillian Balfour (2004) found that Aboriginal women are assumed to be promiscuous,

49

violent and aggressive, while white women are held to scripts of white middle-class femininity, focusing on the potential of their futures, their beauty and their ties to the community. Further, white women are more likely to be pathologised or medicalised; therefore their violence is more likely to be considered 'an isolated incident' as opposed to an indication of violent or aggressive character as it is for Aboriginal women (Comack & Balfour, 2004). Their research demonstrates how notions of appropriate femininity and racialised ideologies affect the treatment, classification and criminalisation of women of colour by maintaining frameworks of oppression.

Therefore, in addition to scripts of femininity, racial identity and processes of racialisation must be taken into account when considering continuums of worth and women's victimisation. These gendered and racialised scripts have consequences not only for how victims are constructed, but what this means in terms of their 'worth.' Further, and most especially, for women who experience violent victimisation, this notion of worth is not just their worth as victims, but their worth as persons and the value of their lives.

Media's Role in Relation to Gendered and Racialised Frameworks

As outlined in the previous chapter, the print media plays an important role in disseminating information to the public regarding the victimisation of women. The above themes of 'acceptable' gendered behaviour, scripts of femininity and processes of racialisation are displayed in clear ways in news coverage of victimised women. Indeed, newspaper articles both reinforce and perpetuate these frameworks.

The media is important to consider because it informs people's opinions and is an important source of information. Henry and Tator (2006:254) discuss the ways in which

media institutions are "major transmitters of society's cultural standards, myths, values, roles, and images." They argue that the purposes of the media are to inform, socialise, and educate (Henry & Tator, 2006:254). Henry and Tator (2006:254) further hold that the media is integral to how we perceive and conceptualise the world around us and define 'reality' itself. Nancy Berns (2004:13) maintains that people seek out media stories in order to understand social phenomena, and that information found within media stories will often inform what is held as 'common knowledge.' Print news media, therefore, reflects as well as shapes public opinion (Benedict, 1992:3; Ramp, 2000).

William Ramp (2004) holds that while the focus of news stories has changed over time, reflecting the fluidity of moralising discourses and shifting social norms, the role of the media as central to informing these discourses has remained constant. News coverage differs according to which stories are 'popular' and often themes which are not central to criminal investigations or trials become the major focus of news articles (Ramp, 2004:31-32). It is clear that the production of what is considered 'newsworthy' is highly systematised and contextual, and while print media and those who produce it are expected to remain neutral and objective, this is clearly not the case (Wykes, 2001:22; Henry & Tator, 2006:254). Not only are news stories affected by moralising discourses, but time factors, business interests and perceived public interest all play a role in determining the nature of news coverage (Ramp, 2004; Henry & Tator, 2006). Wykes (2001:22) highlights that news is not what happens, but what is considered 'newsworthy.'

Newspapers are an important medium to study because newspaper articles are often the only site in which people come into contact with information and identities that are unknown. Henry and Tator (2006:254) argue that "white people rely almost entirely

51

on the media for their information about minorities and the issues that concern their communities." Similarly, Helga Hallgrimsdottir, Rachel Phillips and Cecilia Benoit (2006:267) contend that for many people, the media is the only site where they are in contact with marginalised peoples and, specifically, sex trade workers. In both cases, the representation of a group of people is more than simply informative; it serves as the basis of such information by creating ties between segregated groups. Newspapers, and by extension those who are interviewed and quoted, are seen to hold positions of authority and knowledge (Ericson et al., 1989). However, news articles in and of themselves represent a moral power or authority, especially through the use of specific language and news discourses.

Liesbet van Zoonen (1994:8) highlights the two main ways in which news articles are part of larger social processes. Drawing from the work of Stuart Hall, van Zoonen (1994:8-9) describes how the production of news involves both coding, the institutional practice and production of news, and decoding, wherein audiences interpret and find meaning in what is written. The news, therefore, is central to the production of meanings and beliefs (van Zoonen, 1994).

One of the key ways in which newspapers shape public opinion concerns the victimisation of women. Madriz (1997:113) argues that newspapers construct a 'truth' through what is reported and this influences public perceptions of what is the 'truth' about crime and victimisation. Further, women often internalise these truths and change their behaviour accordingly. However, newspaper content not only informs women about the ways they should act and dress, it also affects public opinion and the ways that others believe women should behave. When women experience victimisation, therefore,

newspapers hold a form of social power in determining whether victims of sexual assault are seen as worthy or culpable by the ways in which discourses of gender norms are incorporated into their text (Benedict, 1992).

Ultimately, media representation of women and the ways in which stereotypes are used demarcates good versus bad or culpable victims. Paula Wilcox (2005:527) argues that women in the media are presented as one-dimensional; either as innocent or guilty. This serves to ignore the ways in which some women are both victims and offenders, but also the complex reality of women's victimisation and experiences of violence. Further, many women's relationships to 'guilt' or 'innocence' are clouded by social values and beliefs concerning women's behaviour. The relationship between women's sexuality and categories of guilt/innocence and good/culpable victims in the media has been well documented (Wykes, 2001; Wilcox, 2005; Jiwani & Young, 2006).

Helen Benedict's (1992) analysis of the language used in newspaper articles of victimised women finds that media coverage plays a central role in shaping and perpetuating rape myths. Further, these rape myths produce what Benedict (1992) terms the virgin/vamp dichotomy, wherein women are placed into one of two categories: the virgin who is a true innocent victim or the vamp who is culpable and likely provoked the attack. Benedict (1992:24) holds that both labels are detrimental because a woman faces blame if she is categorised as a vamp, while the classification of the virgin upholds the division of virgin and vamp and perpetuates the idea that women can only be virgins or whores. Arguably, Benedict (1992) does not offer a thorough analysis of women's racial identity, experiences of victimisation and the pervasive nature of rape myths; however, she does explicitly highlight the importance of media representation of women's

victimisation as having a central role in the solidification and continuation of these continuums of victimised women's perceived worth.

Summary of Theoretical Perspective and Contextual Framework

Moral regulation, women's victimisation, the influence of newspapers and the discourses found within print media are central to my research. Print media play an active and central role in constructing and maintaining discourses of morality regarding women's victimisation. Women's lived experiences of violence, and the ways in which others interpret and understand those experiences, are informed by fear of crime discourses, conceptions of appropriate female behaviour and processes of racialisation. These discourses, which produce hierarchies of gender and race, determine who becomes a 'legitimate' female victim. Ultimately, women are placed along a continuum of worthiness relative to how they conform or deviate from these scripts. The above research indicates that women are placed along a continuum of worthiness according to identity factors over which they have little to no control.

The conceptual framework and theoretical perspective of this study equally inform my research as the two are interrelated. In order to understand the ways in which the intersections of women's identities produce or affect their lived experiences, it is necessary to examine the social constructions of those identity factors and processes. Further, the methodology of this research centres on the deconstruction of discourses. The discourses of fear of crime, femininity, sexuality and racialisation are central to this study and influence the ways in which women experience their identities in their daily lives. These discourses also affect the ways in which members of the public respond to

women's experiences of crime and victimisation. The second half of this chapter highlights the methodological framework of my project.

Methodological Framework

My study adopts a qualitative feminist discourse analysis to examine newspaper articles about missing women. This section begins with a discussion on quantitative and qualitative methodology and includes a more in-depth discussion of feminist discourse analysis. This section will also highlight my research questions and data sampling. It concludes with an overview of the benefits and limitations of this research project.

Discourse Analysis

My analysis is primarily qualitative with an accompanying quantitative component. A quantitative analysis involves reading newspaper articles and coding for frequency of specific terms and use of specific vocabulary, thus allowing for the analysis of patterns found within news content (Ericson et al., 1991:50). This approach assumes that frequency and repetition found within news articles is an indication of worth and significance (Ericson et al., 1991). However, it is not enough to consider only frequency because this does not allow insight into the meanings, social significance or power structures involved in the use of specific terms or phrases. Therefore, my research primarily focuses on qualitative methods of analysis. A qualitative approach allows for the interpretation and understanding of themes and concepts found within text (Ericson et al., 1991).

John Richardson (2007:21) argues that the field of discourse analysis is very broad and diverse. He further holds that this field contains some of the most contested

concepts and varying definitions for the same terms; one of them being 'discourse.' Thus, to state that one is conducting a 'discourse analysis' can be vague or carry multiple meanings. Richardson (2007:26) concludes that the general characteristics of critical discourse analysis include a concentration on social problems and power relations. Discourse analysis is also interpretive and explanatory because there is a focus on the relations between texts and social conditions, ideology and power relations (Richardson, 2007:27).

Discourse analysis, therefore, involves looking at 'social actors' and 'social actions' within contexts of social power (Sunderland, 2004). Jane Sunderland (2004:32) explains that this involves looking at how actors are referred to, what verbs are used and what types of verbs are used. Further, Sunderland (2004:32) holds that one must also consider what words, phrases, sentences and discourses are 'chained' together- or not. Therefore, the role of discourse analysis is to consider the ways in which people speak and write about social issues (Sunderland, 2004:28-9). As Clare Walsh (2001:63) summarises of her own work; "as a critical discourse analyst, my role is, of course, to go beyond the surface features of what is said to interpret the underlying assumptions."

As a feminist researcher, a gendered approach to discourse analysis is essential for a number of reasons. One of the aims of feminist research is to uncover messages and meanings of gender within dominant discourses and, as a result, discourse analysis is well suited for feminist research (van Zoonen, 1994:66). A feminist discourse analysis, therefore, considers what words are used and how words are used (Reinharz, 1992; van Zoonen, 1994). This allows for the study of the way words are used and how words are used in combination, and how this affects meanings within discourses (van Zoonen,

1994:142). By taking this approach, a critical analysis of what is said, but also what is missing and the significance and implications of these gaps can be examined (Reinharz, 1992:163). Overall, a feminist discourse analysis allows for a focus on how women who go missing are represented within print media, what this may mean regarding their status as missing women, and how this may affect public reactions to missing women. In this context, a feminist discourse analysis is complementary to feminist intersectionality as a theoretical framework because the concern is the intersection of identity factors, both those highlighted and those that are absent.

Research Questions

The main research question that guides my study is: How are women who go missing represented in Canadian daily newspapers? My sub-questions are: Who is a missing woman? Who is not a missing woman? What does this representation tell us about women who go missing? Although these questions seem quite broad, I felt this was necessary in order to remain open and receptive to the material that is in the sample.

Data Sampling/Sources

In order to conduct a newspaper analysis of stories on women who have gone missing across Canada, I chose to look at daily newspapers from across the country. Daily newspapers from major cities were selected because they have higher circulation rates and larger readership bases. Each of the newspapers chosen has a circulation rate of more than 100,000 per day, with the exception of *The Times Colonist*, Victoria and *The StarPhoenix*, Saskatoon (Canadian Newspaper Association, 2007). However, these two newspapers have the largest circulation in their areas, with readership of *The StarPhoenix*

being slightly higher than Regina's *LeaderPost*. Furthermore, exclusion of *The StarPhoenix* and *The Times Colonist* would exclude results from significant geographical areas of Canada which would be underrepresented otherwise. While it is not the only national daily paper in Canada, *The Globe and Mail* was included because it has the highest circulation and largest readership (Canadian Newspaper Association, 2007).

Table 3-1 Newspapers Selected for Study

Region	City	Newspaper
Atlantic	Halifax	*The Chronicle-Herald*
Eastern	Montreal	*The Gazette*
	Ottawa	*The Ottawa Citizen*
	Toronto	*The Toronto Star*
Central	Winnipeg	*The Winnipeg Free Press*
	Saskatoon	*StarPhoenix*
Western	Calgary	*The Calgary Herald*
	Edmonton	*The Edmonton Journal*
	Vancouver	*The Vancouver Sun*
	Victoria	*The Times Colonist*
National	National	*The Globe and Mail*

The newspapers that were chosen, therefore, were selected because of their higher circulation rates, as well as geographical location in urban centres across the country. Because I am an English-speaking researcher, the data sample is comprised of only English-language newspapers.

In Canada, ownership of newspapers is concentrated between a small number of conglomerates. In this study, the majority of the papers in the data sample are owned by CanWest Publishing, with the exception of *The Globe and Mail*, owned by Bell Globe Media; *The Toronto Star*, owned by TorStar Corporation; *The Winnipeg Free Press*, owned by FP Canadian Newspapers Ltd.; and *The Chronicle Herald*, owned by Halifax Herald Ltd (Canadian Newspaper Association, 2007). Because a majority of newspapers

are owned by the same company, there were a number of articles repeated as they appeared in more than one newspaper owned by CanWest Publishing. These articles were removed from the sample to avoid repetition. There was no particular system for the removal of repeat articles, though in general the newspaper which was geographically closest to the event tended to be the one that was included in the sample. This was linked to which newspaper included more complete coverage of the event; for example, at times there were articles which repeated only sections of the same article and in this case the full article was included in the sample. Therefore, my analysis is not concerned with which newspapers contained the most or least articles on women who go missing, as all repeat articles were removed. In this way, my analysis cannot properly compare or contrast the ways different newspapers differently construct particular women, as the sample itself may not be sufficient.

The target sample size for this study was 250 to 300 articles. I used the *Canadian Newsstand* search engine, using the key search terms '*missing and women*' and '*missing and woman.*' All returned articles were printed in newspapers between April 1, 2006 and April 1, 2007, and these dates were chosen in order to ensure articles were recent as well as available online. However, *The Chronicle Herald* is not available online for this time period. For this paper, I searched the newspaper's own website using the same search terms. Article times and dates were returned, and I then searched through microfiche film for a copy of each original article.

Only stories pertaining to women who have gone missing across Canada and a small number of Canadian women who have gone missing outside of the country were included in this study. This was done in order to ensure that the sample concerned

Canadian women who have gone missing. Therefore, a large number of returns were excluded because they contained the word 'missing' and 'woman' but the topic of the article was not about a 'missing woman' per se. Furthermore, because the date range of this sample overlaps with the trial of Robert Pickton, there were a large number of articles focusing on his pending and in progress trial. Only articles focusing on the women themselves were included in the sample, and these articles comprised a small minority of the total sample. After all articles had been filtered to match the criteria for this study, the final sample contained 240 articles and included feature, secondary, brief or "fast track" articles and editorials (See Appendix A). All articles concentrate on a missing woman, or a group of missing women.

Data Analysis

Articles were divided into categories according to type of article and the focus of the article content, which will be discussed in further detail in the next chapter. Each category of articles was read multiple times until themes and commonalities began to emerge from the sample. This formed the basis for developing a coding schedule, which was refined over time through multiple readings of the articles. The re-reading of articles and a coding schedule aided in ensuring coding consistency.

Benefits and Limitations of Study

van Zoonen (1994:143) holds that discourse analysis is interpretive, no matter what steps are taken to promote systematic analysis. Therefore, I acknowledge my own interpretation of the data is subjective and dependent upon my standpoint. Data interpretation is not neutral, and all decisions must be justified (van Zoonen, 1994:44).

Since I read all articles without identifying themes or having a coding process in mind, my biases are likely present as results are based on my interpretations of the data. However, this is part of the feminist research process, which discredits beliefs of objectivity and neutrality in the social sciences.

My study can only discuss the content of what is published and cannot speak to the processes of encoding and decoding (van Zoonen, 1994:8). In order to truly speak to these concepts, it would be necessary to conduct interviews with editors or writers, as well as interview people who read newspapers. However, this would have been very difficult, time consuming and expensive to accomplish in order to speak to newspaper coverage of women who go missing across Canada. Thus, my research findings concentrate on what appears within news articles of women who go missing, and discusses how readers might interpret this content.

A cover-to-cover search would likely have contributed more depth to this study, as key word searches can be limited. For example, it is likely articles were not included in this study because they did not include the key words explicitly within document text. A cover-to-cover search may also have resulted in richer data, such as the inclusion of pictures which are not returned through electronic sources, as well as an analysis of placement within the paper, the size of the article, and the placement of photographs. Ultimately, this approach is too time-consuming for the purposes of this study.

However, despite these limitations, my research can contribute to academic literature in a number of ways. In the area of criminology, this study can contribute towards a growing body of research concerning the victimisation of women in Canada and the ways in which victimised women are constructed according to pre-existing

gendered and racialised frameworks. This research is also valuable for the disciplines of sociology and women's studies, since the gendered nature of my project will expose the treatment of missing women and raise further awareness of this ongoing issue. In contrast to similar studies which focus on specific populations of missing women, this study concentrates on newspaper coverage of all women who have gone missing within the time frame of data collection. Therefore, this analysis can speak to the constructions of missing women more generally, while also making comparisons between different constructed categories of women.

Given the paucity of research on missing women in Canada and recent criticisms about the differential treatment of specific populations of Canadian women, this study not only raises awareness of how different women in Canada are perceived, but the ways in which we, as members of the public, may respond to their victimisation. The results of this study can enhance and challenge our understanding of how our responses to missing women may reinforce their marginalised status. Hopefully, it can also pave the way towards re-examining institutional policies and practices in the investigation of missing women in Canada.

CHAPTER 4:
QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS

This chapter outlines and details the quantitative data found in this research project. It provides an overview of the number of articles contained in this study, article type and length, and discusses claims-makers found within news coverage. It then describes and highlights four categories of articles, which were developed through the coding process, including factual, call-for-action and human interest stories. Each category of articles is briefly defined and the central themes and characteristics are discussed.

Number of Items by Newspaper

In total, 11 daily Canadian newspapers are included in this study and the total number of articles included from these papers is 240. All articles appeared in newspapers between April 1, 2006 to April 1, 2007. Table 4.1 lists the total number of articles.

Table 4-1 Total Articles According to Newspaper

Newspaper	Number of Articles (N=240)
The Globe and Mail	23
Chronicle-Herald	40
Montreal Gazette	7
Ottawa Citizen	17
Toronto Star	13
Winnipeg Free Press	6
StarPhoenix	27
Calgary Herald	24
Edmonton Journal	22
Vancouver Sun	38
Victoria Times Colonist	23

As highlighted in the previous chapter, the majority of newspapers are owned by the same media conglomerate, CanWest Publishing, resulting in repeated articles which were removed from the sample.

Type and Length of Articles

In order to conduct a critical discourse analysis of article content, it is necessary to establish the type of articles included in the sample, as well as their length. Articles were categorised into four types: feature news stories, secondary news stories, brief or "fast-track" articles, and editorial articles. Feature stories are comprised of articles which appear in the first or second page of each newspaper section. Secondary articles include all articles found within subsequent pages of the newspaper sections. Brief articles usually appear within a regular column found throughout newspaper sections, and often do not include their own headlines. Some newspapers categorise these articles as "brief updates" or "fast-track" items, and they are sometimes placed within groupings according to provincial news or national news updates. The editorial category includes regular columnists on the editorial page and letters to the editor. The number of articles by type is represented in Table 4.2.

Table 4-2 Total Articles by Type

Type of Article	Number of Articles
Feature	75
Secondary	133
Brief	30
Editorial	2
Total	**240**

Articles which did not focus on a missing woman or a group of missing women were excluded from this sample. Therefore, there are few editorials or letters to the editor in

this study (less than 1% of sample). This does not mean that women who go missing are not discussed within editorial sections of Canadian newspapers, but that individual missing woman are not the focus of editorial content. Overall, news coverage of women who go missing is most likely to appear as secondary articles, comprising over 55% of the total sample. Feature news coverage makes up 31% of the sample and 12.5% consists of brief/fast-track articles.

The length of articles is also important and articles were divided into three categories: short articles (less than 150 words), average length articles (150-450 words) and longer articles (more than 450 words). Overall, short articles comprise 30% (N=72) of the sample, medium length articles 26% (N=64) and longer articles 43% (N=104). This suggests that coverage of women's disappearances is longer, and potentially descriptive, and is important as 'news,' given that space within the paper is allotted to this topic.

Who Speaks for Missing Women?

As the focus of this research is newspaper representation of women who go missing, it is important to consider who are the claims-makers found within newspaper content, especially since missing women are unable to speak for themselves and, therefore, have no active voice in terms of how they are constructed by the media. The central focus here is to identify voices of authority. Thus, a claims-maker is not just who speaks for a missing woman, but who is central and authoritative in the construction of her story. Article content was categorised according to both central and secondary claims-makers within articles (see Appendix A). Table 4.3 lists key claims-makers found within the study.

65

Table 4-3 Who Speaks for Missing Women

Claims-makers	Number	Percentage
Criminal Justice		
• Judges	8	2%
• Lawyers	8	2%
• Police Officers	119	33.6%
Family Members	84	23.7%
Friends	21	5.9%
Community Organisations	27	7.6%
Academics	1	0.3%
Victims	9	2.5%
Professionals	48	13.5%
Public	20	5.6%
Politicians	10	2.8%
• First Nations Leaders	5	1.4%
Journalists	1	0.3%
Total	**354**	**100%**
Articles with No Claims-makers	53	--

It is evident from overall numbers that members of the criminal justice system, and particularly police officers, dominate newspaper content on women who go missing. This is likely because police officers are quoted extensively within articles regarding updates as to such investigations. The voice of police officers is also included when women are found, such as through the discussion of search efforts for a specific woman or a group of women and input as to current or past criminal investigations regarding disappearances. This indicates that the voices of members of the criminal justice system are held as credible and demonstrates "that the media and the criminal justice system have become increasingly interconnected in the dissemination of knowledge" (Brennan, 2006:55).

The voice of family members is also central to the construction of missing women's identities and news coverage of their disappearances. However, their voices are often presented as less authoritative than police officers and quotes are often incorporated

in addition to quotes from police officers. Family members, therefore, are more often secondary claims-makers who add a personal, but less legitimate, element to a missing woman's story. Jiwani and Young (2006) echo these findings in their study of the news coverage of the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. The authors found that as police investigations achieved success in the search for a suspect, the voices of family members became increasingly secondary and appeared toward the end of articles (Jiwani & Young, 2006:906).

Individuals associated with a profession or community organisation are often quoted because of their specific knowledge regarding a missing woman's behaviour or past. They are frequently quoted in ways similar to family members; however, some professionals add legitimacy to a missing woman's status. For example, this category also included coast guard workers who conducted search parties for a missing woman at sea and, therefore, acted as police officers. Individuals from community organisations often include persons affiliated with non-profit out-reach programs, such as organisations for women involved in street prostitution. These interviews are more likely to be of a secondary nature and presented in a way that is less authoritative than police officers, further demonstrating that the voices of police officers, and other members of the criminal justice system, are constructed as more credible (Brennan, 2006).

Article Categories

As stated in the introduction to this chapter, the articles in this study were separated into three groupings according to the focus of each article. These categories are factual articles, call-for-action articles, and human interest stories. The focus of factual articles is factual information regarding a missing or found woman, including notices that police

and/or family members are looking for a woman who is believed to be missing, notices of women who had been found, as well as criminal investigation updates from police or court officials. This category is subdivided into two categories: one for missing women with only one article regarding her disappearance (termed: single-article cases) and a second category whereby there is more than one article (termed: multiple-articles cases)[1]. Articles were subdivided into these two categories in order to make comparisons between the two groupings. This division follows the argument that the amount of media coverage is related to the importance or value of the news story.

The focus of call-for-action articles is creating or enforcing some sort of structural or social change; for example, articles calling attention to specific groups of women which include pleas to make changes for all women's safety. One example of this includes recommendations for shuttle buses along the Highway of Tears in B.C. to provide transportation for women who might otherwise hitch-hike [OC:F22:A14; GM:Jn22:A1; CH:Jn14:B5; CH:Jn22:B2; WFP:Jl2:B2]. Similar to call-for-action articles, human interest stories focus on honouring missing and murdered women's memories, and include articles on memorials or services for such women [CH:Au18:A9; SP:Jn7:B6; SP:Jl15:A6; VS:J23:A4; VS:S21B2]. Therefore, the central focus is not on finding the woman/women, but honouring their memories. Table 4.4 records articles from all newspapers separated by category.

---

[1] It should be noted that these categories include announcements regarding women who have been located, and I cannot comment on whether or not initial disappearances were reported in newspapers. For example, some 'found' women had been missing for over a decade. They are included in this study because they were missing women, and the coverage of their appearances follows factual articles regarding missing women.

Table 4-4 Total Articles by Newspaper and Category

Newspaper	Human Interest	Call-for-action	Factual: Single-article Cases	Factual: Multiple-article Cases[2]	Total
Globe and Mail	3	2	2	16	23
Chronicle-Herald	2	1	6	31	40
Montreal Gazette	0	0	3	4	7
Ottawa Citizen	1	3	5	8	17
Toronto Star	2	2	3	6	13
Winnipeg Free Press	1	2	3	0	6
StarPhoenix	3	5	7	12	27
Calgary Herald	1	2	4	17	24
Edmonton Journal	1	2	4	15	22
Vancouver Sun	7	3	4	24	38
Victoria Times Colonist	4	1	3	15	23
Total	**25**	**23**	**44**	**148**	**240**

Separating articles in this way allows for a more complete analysis of themes found within articles, because each grouping of articles has a different focus. For example, call-for-action and human interest stories are significantly more likely to appear as secondary articles, consisting of 70% and 72% respectively of articles within the article type. It is significant that call-for-action articles, which seek to educate and mobilise members of the public toward social change, and human interest stories, which aim to make women knowable and honour missing and murdered women's deaths, are less likely to be published as feature articles. Similarly, the word count of article categories is also revealing, as single-article cases are significantly more likely to be less than 150 words. Therefore, not only do these women's disappearances result in less news coverage, but articles on their disappearances are shorter and, arguably, less informative. There are also interesting observations when considering claims-makers, as call-for-action articles and human interest stories are more likely to include quotations from

---

[2] These numbers represent the number of articles in the sample. As such, they do not reflect the number of women reported within the sample, as there is more than one article regarding each case.

family members. Factual articles, on the other hand, are more likely to quote police officers. Further, single-article cases differ considerably from the other categories, with no claims-maker present in nearly half (48%) of the articles. This is significantly higher than multiple-article cases (20%), human interest stories (4%) and call-for-action articles (9%).

Themes Found within Factual Articles

Factual articles total 192 and discuss the disappearances and discoveries of 78 women (44 women within single-article cases and 34 women within multiple-article cases). For single-article cases, it is interesting to consider whether a woman's status is missing or found, because there are no follow-up articles to inform readers of what has happened. Of single-article cases, 21 of 44 women are announced as missing and 14 of 44 women have been found[3]. There are also eight 'other' single-article cases, the majority concerning court updates regarding women who had been missing, such as the arrest of a suspect believed to have murdered a missing woman. One of these articles concerned the arrest of an individual for the murders of two women.

The status of women within multiple-article cases is similar to those women within single-article cases, though included in this category are women who were missing and have been found. Within multiple-article cases, ten of 34 women are termed as missing. In total, 11 of 34 women were found and 12 of 34 women went missing and

[3] Of the 21 missing women, 18 had gone missing within the scope of the sample, meaning that news coverage of their disappearances was immediate. The three remaining women had gone missing before the start date of the study. Of the 14 women who had been found, six were found alive and eight were found dead. All but one of the found women initially went missing after the start date of this study; therefore, there is seemingly no initial news coverage of their disappearances.

were then found[4]. There is also news coverage of a court case involving the murder of one missing woman. Table 4.5 outlines the missing and found status of women within factual articles.

Table 4-5 Missing and Found Status of Women

Women's Status	Single-article Cases[5]	Multiple-article Cases
Missing	21	10
Found	14	11
Missing then Found	N/A	12
Other	9	1
Total	44	34

Criminality and Deviant Behaviour

Women's association with criminal or perceived deviant behaviour is an important factor to consider in relation to women's value or worth as a victim of violence (Madriz, 1997). Of single-article cases, seven of 44 articles mention instances of the missing women's criminal and deviant behaviour. Of these seven, involvement in the sex trade is most frequent (3), use of illicit drugs (2), involvement in a "high risk" lifestyle (2) and hitchhiking (2). These numbers are not especially high and it is difficult to compare and contrast with so few returns. Instances of criminality and deviance are more frequent within multiple-article cases, and these numbers provide more insight into this area. Of multiple-article cases, criminal and/or deviant behaviour is mentioned in relation to 14 of 34 women. In a total of 148 articles, 51 articles make reference to or mention a woman's criminal or deviant behaviour. Involvement or association with the sex trade is

---

[4] Of the ten missing women, nine went missing after the start date of the study and one went missing before the start date. Of the 11 found women, six had gone missing before the start date of data collection. Six of these 11 women were found alive, and five were discovered dead. Of the 12 women who were missing and then found, six were found alive and six were found dead.

[5] While there were only eight articles in the 'Other' sub-category, nine women were included within these articles.

71

mentioned within 29 articles, as are illicit drug use (16), "high risk" lifestyle (9), use of alcohol or alcoholism (9), loan-sharking (4) and identity as a "runaway" (2). Table 4.6 lists the number of articles which mention criminal and/or deviant behaviour.

Table 4-6 Articles Mentioning Women's Criminal and Deviant Behaviour

Criminality and Deviance	Single-article Cases N=7 of 44 N of Women=7 of 44	Multiple-article Cases N=51 of 148 N of Women=14 of 34
Sex trade work	4	29
Drug use/dependency	2	16
"High risk" lifestyle	2	9
Alcohol use/dependency	1	9
Hitchhiking	2	N/A
Runaway	N/A	2
Loan-shark	N/A	4

Additionally, there are a number of significant outliers within this sample. Four articles focus on disassociating two missing women from criminal/deviant behaviour. Both women were believed to be among the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, and news coverage of their found status emphasises that they were not involved in the sex trade or used illicit drugs, though one is identified as having been an alcoholic. These themes will be further examined in the next chapter.

Race/Ethnicity

As research into women's victimisation and lived experiences of violence indicate, racial identity and ethnic background are central to women's identity and their lived experiences of violent victimisation (Madriz, 1997; Amnesty International, 2002). Racial identity and ethnic background are most often included within physical descriptions of missing women. Of single-article cases, 14 of 44 contain a physical description and, of these, three specified the woman's racial identity or ethnic background. Three articles

which did not include a physical description state the woman's racial identity or ethnic background. There is one indirect rather than direct statement of racial identity included in this sample: an article on the disappearance of Eva Lee includes her Chinese name, Ywai har Lee, though she is not identified as Chinese.

There are two ways to consider multiple-article cases: by the number of articles and by the missing women who are the focus of the articles, as there are 148 articles discussing 34 missing women. Of the 148 articles included in this sample, 32 articles include a physical description of the missing woman and eight articles explicitly mention the missing woman's racial identity or ethnic background. Only three other articles identify a woman's racial identity or ethnic background outside of a physical description. However, another way to consider this theme is by focusing on the missing women themselves. Of the 34 women in the sample of multiple-article cases, 16 women had articles which state a physical description and seven articles explicitly identify the woman's racial identity or ethnic background. Articles on two women identify their racial identity or ethnic background without including a physical description. Thus, of 34 women, nine women had their racial identity or ethnic background explicitly mentioned within news coverage of their disappearance or discovery. This theme will also be discussed in further detail in the next chapter.

Themes Found within Call-for-action and Human Interest Stories

As highlighted previously, articles were also separated into two other categories: call-for-action and human interest stories. These categories differ according to the focus of the article. In this context, call-for-action and human interest stories differ from factual articles because the focus is not on locating a missing woman or factual information

regarding the disappearance or discovery of a missing woman. Instead, call-for-action articles focus on creating some sort of public change, or gathering of public resources in order to effect change, and human interest stories involve honouring the memories of missing and murdered women.

There are 23 call-for-action articles. Themes and topics found included the Highway of Tears (N=10), the victimisation of Aboriginal women (N=9), the need for increased public resources for police and the health care system (N=6), the missing and murdered women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside (N=5), and the victimisation of sex trade workers (N=3). There is much overlap within articles, as these themes overlap in women's lived experiences of victimisation. For example, articles focusing on the disappearances of women along British Columbia's Highway of Tears also discuss Aboriginal identity and Aboriginal women's increased likelihood of encountering violent victimisation [WFP:Jl2:B2; SP:Au14:A5]. Similarly, articles calling attention to violence experienced by Aboriginal women may also cite involvement in the sex trade and living in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside as evidence of the increased and unique victimisation they experience [GM:F15:A10; VS:F15:B1; VS:Jn27:B3].

These articles differ from factual articles in a number of ways. In particular, the focus of these articles is to draw attention to the ways in which members of the public respond to cases of women who go missing. The context of the discussion, therefore, is about creating change and enforcing positive solutions to prevent future women from going missing. Issues that appear in factual articles are seen within this sample as well; however, the context is markedly different. Issues such as drug addiction and dependency, poverty, racism and involvement in the sex trade are themes which appear

frequently in these articles, but the focus is to draw attention to the social factors and context in which these issues appear in women's lives. Therefore, the focus is less on an individual woman and her use of drugs, but more generally on how illicit drug use is inextricably tied to involvement in the sex trade, poverty, experiences of racism, or histories of abuse and victimisation. In this way, there is a mapping which takes place linking key themes together for many women who go missing, as opposed to factual articles which individualise issues in women's lives. This is especially apparent in terms of racial identity, as many of the articles within this sample call attention to issues of racial identity and victimisation, and racism in Canadian society.

Human interest stories constitute 25 articles in this study and include reports on memorial walks, services and ceremonies held in honour of the memory of missing women. Article content includes discussion of specific missing women (N=4) and groups of missing women. Most articles discussing groups of missing women can be categorised according to geographic location of the missing women; for example, women missing from the same city or province (N=5). Of these five articles, two are strictly women from the same geographical locations, while the remaining three articles are specifically concerned with women involved in the sex trade from particular urban centres in Canada. The remaining 16 articles focus on women who have gone missing from the Highway of Tears (N=5) and Vancouver's Downtown Eastside (N=11). As discussed in the previous chapter, the data sample for this study overlaps with the beginning of the trial of Robert Pickton, and a number of articles focus on remembering the six women he was on trial for murdering: Sereena Abotsway, Marnie Frey, Andrea Joesbury, Georgina Papin, Mona Lee Wilson and Brenda Wolfe [ChH:J21:1-5;

GM:J20:A12; VS:J12:A4; VS:J13:A4; VTC:J14:D6]. The focus of these articles is not about effecting change. Instead, the tone of interviews and articles is about making the missing women knowable and reminding readers that these women are missing or have been murdered.

Human interest stories also contain overlapping themes with factual articles, as they contain factual information on women who have gone missing. However, human interest stories are more likely to highlight and discuss a group of missing women with some form of commonality. For example, articles focus on women from the same geographical area, such as Edmonton or the Niagara Region, or involvement in similar activities or behaviours, such as the sex trade or "high-risk" lifestyles. While many of these articles concentrate on a number of women who have gone missing who share similar characteristics, frequently the articles do not actually discuss the women themselves. Indeed, a notable minority do not name the missing women, let alone provide informative content about who they are [VS:S21:B2; CH:Au18:A9; VTC:F22:A3; EJ:Jn4:A16]. On the other hand, a number of articles discuss to some length the personal details of women who are considered to live "high-risk" lifestyles, and there is often discussion of how they 'ended up' living that sort of lifestyle, as opposed to factual articles which do not discuss the contextual background of women's experiences [OC:O28:E7; ChH:J21:1-5; VS:J12:A4; VTC:J14:D6]. The voice of family members, close friends and acquaintances is frequently present.

Summary of Chapter

This chapter has outlined the number of articles from each newspaper within the sample, as well as the type, length and focus of articles. Voices and claims-makers within news

coverage are also identified and discussed. Central to this chapter is the identification of the focus of articles within the sample, and key themes found in each focus category. For factual articles, themes include identity as a mother, mention of criminal or deviant behaviours as well as racial identity or ethnic background. Differences and commonalities between factual articles, call-for-action articles and human interest stories are introduced and central issues found are summarised. The following chapter will analyse in more detail the central themes introduced above.

CHAPTER 5:
QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS

"It's the whole issue of missing women having value. The whole issue is when people go missing is there someone who is going to go looking for them?"

[WFP:J23:A6]

This chapter offers a qualitative analysis of the data. An in-depth reading of the newspaper articles was undertaken to highlight the central themes used in the construction of missing women's identities. The main themes emphasised are women's statuses as mothers, their engagement in criminal and/or deviant behaviours, missing women's class position and the focus on their racial identity and ethnic backgrounds. Within these discussions, moralising discourses emerge in the characterisation of missing women, and serve to affirm their worthiness to the public.

Motherhood

A women's identity as a mother is central to the ways she is constructed within news coverage of her disappearance. Overall, the women who are identified as mothers are a minority of women in the sample; however, it is the way in which they are discussed that is significant. This contextual framework provides a more in-depth analysis than quantitative numbers or percentages.

Introductions of Missing Mothers

Many of the women within this sample are repeatedly introduced and referred to by their identity as mothers. For example, the first article to announce the disappearance of Leslie

Ann Conrad begins "A Wolfville mother of four…," and ends by stating: "Ms. Conrad is a mother of three daughters and one son ranging in age from 22 to 10" [ChH:O13:B4]. This statement precedes a brief physical description including the clothes she was last seen wearing. Thus, her identity as a mother of four children is given priority over her appearance, which is significant given that this is a public announcement of her disappearance and a physical description would aid in her identification. Further, the inclusion of her children's ages and repetition regarding how many children she has can make her more knowable to readers, which in turn may encourage others to aid in locating her; however, it is not as likely to help in her actual discovery without a physical description.

Many other women are also introduced as mothers; for example, a news article on the disappearance of Rhonda Wilson introduces her as "a mother of three" [ChH:D7:B2]. The content of the article focuses on how her father has coped with her disappearance over the past four years. This article is critical of the previous coverage of the missing woman, and Rhonda Wilson's father is upset that her disappearance did not result in more press coverage and efforts by police; however, the article itself does not offer any details of Rhonda Wilson beyond her age and what she was wearing. There is no discussion of why she might have disappeared, or a physical description: only that she was a mother of three. In this context, she is introduced as a mother, and her identity as a mother is the only personal information readers receive about Rhonda Wilson. Overall, women who go missing are introduced in a variety of ways, for example by their location or age; however, the introduction of a woman as a mother carries a unique significance, as is shown in the following discussion.

Mothers and 'Out of Character' Behaviour

The identity of a missing woman as a mother is central to discussions of a woman's behaviour or disappearance as 'out of character,' a statement which is repeated throughout many articles on missing women. This statement is especially important because it adds legitimacy to a woman's designation as 'missing.' In a news article detailing the disappearance of Sangeeta Khanna, the focus is her attention to routine related to the care of her son. For example, one police officer is quoted as saying, "obviously it's a suspicious situation because it's not characteristic of this woman to go missing" [EJ:A21:B3]. Later, her sister states: "it's totally unlike her. She's very responsible to her son. There's just no way she would just take off" [EJ:A21:B3]. The foci of the article are Sangeeta Khanna's identity as a 'normal' mother and her close relationship with her son. Her behaviour is explicitly identified as out of character because of her lack of contact with her son.

Likewise, in news coverage of Manjit Panghali, the reader is frequently informed of how she "is completely devoted to her three-year-old daughter" and that "her being away from her daughter for this long- it's just not right. It's not normal" [VS:O23:B2]. A later article describes how Manjit Panghali "would never have abandoned her little daughter" [VS:O24:A1]. The discussions of Manjit Panghali's attention to routine and disappearance as 'out of character' are justified through her dedication to her child. This is similar for the disappearance of Marie Lesas, who readers are told has "missed her regular phone calls with her children" [SP:O5:A7]. A second article states: "Based on their investigation, police believe it's out of character for Marie to stay away from home without contacting her family. She has missed regular phone calls with her children, one-year-old and two-year-old girls" [SP:O19:A7]. For Sangeeta Khanna, Manjit Panghali

80

and Marie Lesas, the fact that they have not spoken with their children for a prolonged period of time is cause for concern and legitimises their missing status.

The close association of motherhood and 'out of character' behaviour is arguably most apparent in the coverage of the discovery of Nancy Clark. Nancy Clark had been missing for over 15 years when it was announced that her DNA had been discovered. One article declares:

> Concerns about Clark's well-being were raised one day after her disappearance because she had failed to return home to look after her two daughters- aged eight years and eight months—which was out of character. "It was the birthday of her child that day, and for a sex street worker, she was a bit of a homebody. That's what was suspicious at the start, because she would have never have done that," said [Sgt.] Bland.
>
> [VS:O11:B1]

This quote is significant for a number of reasons, in regard to what is and what is not stated by the police officer. The fact that Nancy Clark's disappearance raised concern within one day of her last being seen is contrasted against her identity as a sex trade worker, and her role as a mother and commitment to her children are the mitigating factors. Nancy Clark disappeared during a time when many sex trade workers went missing from the same geographical area, the majority of whom did not receive attention from the police (Amnesty International, 2004). However, Nancy Clark's disappearance raised suspicion immediately, despite her identity as a sex trade worker, because she did not return home to care for her children. This point is emphasized by police officers who are frequently quoted as stating that Nancy Clark was "responsible" and a "homebody." The inclusion of police officers as key claims-makers adds legitimacy to her status as missing. Therefore, her identity as a mother supersedes her identity as a sex trade worker and her worth as a victim is directly related to her identity as a mother.

Discourses on 'Good Mothering'

The identity of missing women as mothers and, specifically, the focus on their role as mothers in relation to their missing status, speaks to discourses on good mothering and the construction of these women as 'good' victims. Discourses on good mothering are complex and contextual, but speak to many of the same themes found within moral discourses. Briefly, good mothers are those who are selfless and put their children before themselves (Robson, 2005). Good mothers are also responsible for their children's development and must exist within heterosexual, nuclear families (Robson, 2005). Susan Chase (2001:31) is more explicit, and states that the ideal mother is white, able-bodied, middle/upper middle class, married and heterosexual. The ideal mother and the ideal female victim of crime have clear similarities; however, of most importance here is the way in which social constructions of good mothers relate to social constructions of good victims. In this context, Manjit Panghali is a good mother because she always put her child first and 'would never abandon' her daughter. Similarly, Nancy Clark was never absent from her children for extended periods of time and she was, therefore, a responsible (read: good) mother. Therefore, it can be deduced that each of these women must have come to some sort of harm. This reasoning dictates that the public must accept that these women are in danger, but more so that they are worthy of sympathy and public resources because they have children who depend on them.

Good mothering discourses also centre on beliefs that the relationship between mothers and their children is of utmost importance. Shari Thurer (1994) details the historical basis of mothering myths, and argues that the 20th century saw the rise of scientific tests 'proving' the necessity of bonding between mothers and infants. These studies focused on the harmful effects of 'maternal deprivation' and have influenced

good mothering discourses (Thurer, 1994:275). Within news coverage of women who are missing, there is the underlying statement that these women must be found for the sake of their children, implicitly placing the children at the centre of the news coverage. This approach was taken in the coverage of Manjit Panghali and Marie Lesas.

Alternatively, according to these discourses, to lose one's children is confirmation that a woman is a bad mother and, therefore, a bad woman. In the study sample, the loss of children is given as a justification for a woman's disappearance, and can be seen in the news coverage of Linda Grant and Mary Florence Lands. Linda Grant came forward after having been missing for over two decades, and is first introduced as "the mother of three little girls" [VS:Jn7:A1]. Readers are later informed that "she moved in 1983, when she was 25 years old, to the southern United States – 'the furthest place I could get' – after losing custody of her two young daughters" [VS:Jn7:A1]. Therefore, the loss of her children is cited as the reason for Linda Grant's disappearance (she was then pregnant with her third daughter, who was born shortly after her disappearance and adopted). Further, children also are imagined as the place of redemption and success; her 'new life' is presented as 'happy and successful' because of her marriage and subsequent three daughters [VS:Jn7:A1]. These statements are repeated through later coverage of the discovery of Linda Grant, as one article focuses on the pending reunion between mother and daughters [VS:Jn10:B1]. Linda Grant's identity as a mother is placed as central to her identity as a missing person: the loss of her children signify the end of her life in Vancouver and the birth of her subsequent children are central to her current life's success. Discourses of good mothering are woven throughout news coverage of her discovery.

83

Similarly, the disappearance of Mary Florence Lands is, at least initially, directly linked to the loss of her children. She is first reported to have left Vancouver after losing her children to foster care [VS:Jn23:A3]. However, another article on the discovery of Mary Florence Lands details how:

> The single mother of three toddlers . . . was hospitalised for 18 months and believed she wouldn't be able to care for her children. She arranged for a cousin from Ontario to legally adopt her two sons and her daughter. Unknown to Lands, the cousin changed her mind about the adoption and the children were sent to three different foster homes. Thinking her children had become a part of a loving and stable family, Lands decided to wait until each turned 18 years old before trying to contact them. "I was in full belief in my heart that I had done the right thing and they were taken care of," said Lands.
>
> [SP:Jn24:A1]

It is emphasised that Mary Florence Lands believed she had 'done the right thing' in leaving her children with a responsible family member before leaving the city. This defensive stance places Mary Florence Lands as a 'responsible' mother, one who looks out for her children and takes 'proper' care of them, aiding in the solidification of divides between responsible and irresponsible mothers (Robson, 2005). That this article is printed in response to earlier ones which state that she had lost her children to foster care and subsequently left the city demonstrates a perceived need to respond to the construction of Mary Florence Lands as an irresponsible or 'bad' mother. The overarching message in the news coverage of Linda Grant, and Mary Florence Lands, parallels that above; good mothers do not abandon their children and the loss of children is devastating in women's lives. Further, women can find redemption through connecting with their children and reclaiming their identity as 'good' mothers.

Motherhood is fundamental to the ways in which a woman's disappearance is viewed as serious as well as the ways in which her life is constructed as having

importance and value. Bonnie Jack's identity as a mother is not the primary focus in an article identifying her remains. Instead, the focus is an interview with her friend, who discusses Bonnie Jack's identity as a sex trade worker with a drug dependency. At the end of the article is a quote from a police officer, who states "I can tell you that this lady, as with many of the victims, was a mom. . . It's very sad" [EJ:Ma20:A1]. It is important to note that the declaration that her murder is 'sad' directly follows her identity as a mother. This is the only statement in the article which is given by the police, who are considered voices of authority, as all other information is provided by her friend. Her identity as a mother is important in and of itself but, and perhaps more significantly, it is central to why her murder is considered 'sad.'

Murder of Pregnant Women as 'Most Horrendous'

The above link is most clearly demonstrated within coverage of pregnant women who are missing and found dead. In the announcement of Manjit Panghali's death, a police officer is quoted as stating "Mrs. Panghali and her unborn child have had their lives taken prematurely and very tragically. This type of crime defies comprehension and the value of human life" [VS:O27:A1]. Another officer states; "the case has touched all those involved because the victim was a mother, [and] four months pregnant" [VS:O27:A1]. A second article from *The Globe and Mail* repeats the first quote; thus the value of Manjit Panghali's life is inextricably tied to her pregnancy and the death of her unborn child [GM:O27:A12]. Similarly, in an article declaring a life sentence for Liana White's murderer, the ruling judge states "the fact that Liana was pregnant made the offence worse, as did the fact that she left behind her 'young and vulnerable' daughter" [ChH:D16:A5]. Liana White's murder is perceived as more gruesome and significant

than others because she was pregnant. Further, the fact that she has a young child increases the horrendous nature of her death.

The focus on pregnancy and the tragedy of the death of an unborn child speaks to mothering discourses concentrating on the rights of foetuses or, as seen in news coverage within this sample, 'unborn children' (Thurer, 1994). Good mothering does not begin at the birth of a child; it is the responsibility of women to protect their unborn children from the moment of conception. Women face advice and demands from a multitude of sources upon discovering they are pregnant, including doctors, friends and family members and the media, and good mothering discourses are central to this (Thurer, 1994). In the murders of Manjit Panghali and Liana White, there is an underlying discourse centring on the death of their unborn and 'innocent' babies, resulting in demands for increased public sympathy and outrage at their deaths.

Mothers and Worth

Ultimately, the victimisation of mothers and discourses of good mothering found within news coverage of women's disappearances and discoveries are directly linked to discourses of femininity and worth as victims of crime. A woman's identity as a mother places her in a unique and significant position as a victimised woman, especially if she embodies the ideal mother, as outlined by Chase (2001). Arguably, the identification or role as a mother supersedes other identity factors, as news coverage on missing mothers focuses almost exclusively on their identities as mothers. Women who are good mothers fulfill what is considered appropriate femininity and female sexuality. When a good mother is murdered, her murder is viewed as more horrendous or defying comprehension. This speaks to beliefs that when a good woman is raped, her rapist is considered worse

86

than a murderer (Pollock, 2006:5). Therefore, good mothers are socially constructed as good and worthy victims.

Criminality and Deviance

A second theme found within news coverage of women who go missing is engagement in criminal and deviant behaviour, including the labelling of women as criminal and deviant, involvement in sex trade work, use of illicit drugs, consumption of alcohol and hitchhiking. Discussions of 'out of character' behaviour and search efforts, and how these are differently applied to criminal and deviant women, are highlighted in this section. The context in which a woman's criminality and deviance are discussed is significant because it contributes to the construction of her identity and worth as a missing woman. For some women engaging in criminal and deviant behaviours may result in culpability for victimisation.

Introduction as a Criminal or Deviant Woman

Women, and particularly those identified as drug users and sex trade workers, are frequently introduced and defined by their criminal and deviant behaviours. In an article discussing the recovery of bones from an Ottawa canal, it is stated that the bones might belong to Gina Smith, who is "a crack addict and prostitute" [OC:O30:A1]. It is then stated: "Family and friends fear Ms. Smith's high-risk lifestyle may have ended in foul play" [OC:O30:A1]. No other information is included aside from her age. Thus, her whole identity as a missing woman centres on two deviant and criminal activities. Further, her 'high-risk' lifestyle is associated with her disappearance and perceived death and is presented as a choice of a lifestyle she willingly entered and continued.

87

News coverage of the murder of Theresa Innes begins by announcing that a man has been charged with the death of an unnamed sex trade worker. Theresa Innes is named the following day as the murdered woman and the article begins by stating her association to the sex trade and "the slaying[s] of Alberta sex trade workers" [EJ:Ma11:A1]. Similarly, headlines in two different newspapers announcing the discovery of Bonnie Jack's body read: "Prostitute task force called after body found in field" and "Latest victim was street prostitute" [CH:Ma18:A15; EJ:Ma20:A1]. Her association to the sex trade is exemplified through the text under one of the headlines, which reads "37-year-old woman was too addicted to crack to give up high-risk lifestyle" [EJ:Ma20:A1]. Much like news coverage of Gina Smith, Bonnie Jack's addiction to an illicit drug and her engagement in sex work are directly linked to her identity as a victim and are considered central to her identity as a missing (and murdered) woman. This kind of introduction sets a tone for subsequent news coverage. However, while being introduced as a good mother is positive for a missing woman, association to criminal and deviant behaviours has the opposite effect.

Involvement in the Sex Trade and Illicit Drug Use

While introductions and headlines about missing women are important, the overall context in which criminality and deviance are discussed is most significant and revealing. This is demonstrated through the discussion of Nancy Clark who is viewed as 'responsible' by the police, despite her involvement in the sex trade. What is implied here is that sex trade workers are not responsible, and that when they go missing there is little cause for alarm. Because Nancy Clark was 'a homebody' and a 'responsible' mother, her disappearance was immediately accepted as such. Theresa Innes'

disappearance, on the other hand, was not released to the community because the police

saw little value in making that information public. Readers are informed:

> "The difficulty with a missing person is that sometimes people can go missing
> and they have no desire to be contacted," [Cpl Oakes] said. "So investigators first
> of all have the obligation to conduct an investigation before the circumstances
> give us justifiable reason for putting out the person's name." When Edmonton
> police spokesman Jeff Wuite was asked why the service had not reported the
> woman's disappearance to the public, he said "We have about 7, 000 missing
> person's files a year, that's why." Investigators on individual cases decide
> whether a public release on a missing person is valuable, he said.
> [EJ:Ma11:A1]

Here it is implied that some women want to go missing, and Theresa Innes is one of those

women because her disappearance was not released to the public. This raises the

question of what it is about her disappearance that led the police to conclude she 'wanted'

to go missing. This information is not included in the article; however, discussion of her

association with illicit drug use and involvement in the sex trade is undeniably central to

this reasoning. Discussion of Theresa Innes' lifestyle is not presented in the same way as

that of Nancy Clark, and in this context the latter is an anomaly. This reinforces the

belief that sex trade workers are not responsible women and that if they go missing there

is little cause for concern and, arguably, demonstrates that Lowman's "discourse of

disposal" is potentially still operating (Lowman, 2000:1003). These sentiments are

supported by research focusing on the victimisation of sex trade workers, the lack of

adequate responses by both government representatives and members of the public, and

insinuations that sex trade workers are less worthy victims of crime (Lowman, 2000;

2001; Razack, 2002; Amnesty International, 2004). Some authors argue that myths

surrounding sex work posit violence against sex workers as acceptable, or not really

violence at all (Miller & Schwartz, 1995; Razack, 2002). This silencing of sex trade

workers' experiences of violence places them as invisible, and this is the case with the disappearance and murder of Theresa Innes. Further, these myths are so pervasive that there is the perceived need to distinguish Nancy Clark from this group and explicitly state that she was a responsible woman in spite of her identity as a sex trade worker.

Drug dependency is often discussed in relation to involvement in sex trade work, and this is the case for Theresa Innes, Bonnie Jack, and Rachel Quinney. Within news coverage of women who are missing, drug use and dependency is often presented as a reason or cause for a woman's disappearance or death. Theresa Innes' brother and former husband are quoted as stating that her use of "street drugs had everything to do with her downfall" [CH:Ma19:A10]. Her brother declares "there would have been no Theresa the prostitute if it wasn't for crack cocaine" [EJ:Ma19:A10]. Further, her former husband believes that their marriage fell apart when she began using drugs and entered into the sex trade to support her addiction. He states "My wife disappeared on me years ago. She sort of vanished away" [EJ:Ma19:A10]. Theresa Innes' drug dependency and involvement in the sex trade are, therefore, mutually dependent. Similar themes arise in the news coverage of Bonnie Jack and Rachel Quinney. Bonnie Jack is described by one of her friends as having "a bad crack addiction, and [working] the streets to support her habit" [EJ:Ma20:A1]. Similarly, Rachel Quinney is described as a young woman "who was hoping to get off the street and kick a drug habit, but died before fulfilling her dream" [GM:J3:A1]. For Bonnie Jack and Rachel Quinney, drug use and involvement in the sex trade are also reciprocal.

Moral discourses are apparent in news coverage of women associated with drug use and involvement in the sex trade. For example, within discussion of the murder of

90

Bonnie Jack, her friend states: "I used to tell her to get off the street and find a job, even if it's washing dishes for $5.90. She figured it would never happen to her. She said if you played it smart, you'd be all right" [EJ:Ma20:A1]. This statement, in light of her disappearance and murder, implies that Bonnie Jack is responsible for her death because she knew of the risks involved in sex trade work, but actively ignored those risks. Within factual articles of women who are missing, discussions of the systemic or structural factors which contribute to women being involved in the sex trade are rarely included. For example, these articles do not discuss poverty, racism, lack of access to resources or cuts to public services that affect many women in their daily lives. Instead, women with drug dependencies and sex trade workers are more often described according to notions of 'fallen women' who are, therefore, morally culpable (Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2006). Many of the articles on the above women include moralising discourses, often centring on women's sexuality, which perpetuate the belief that they violate norms of femininity by engaging in the sex trade and using illicit drugs and are, thus, to blame for their victimisation (Boritch, 1997; Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2006).

Illicit drug use is also a theme that appears in articles independent from sex trade work. Laura Gainey, a woman believed to have been swept overboard into the ocean, is described as being a 'former' or 'recovering' drug addict. Further, it is her relationship to drugs and her 'success' in battling and overcoming her addiction that is juxtaposed against the tragedy of her death. Laura Gainey's family was 'struck by tragedy' when her mother died shortly after being diagnosed with cancer during her teen years. Readers are informed:

> Laura, who was 14, plummeted into the ugly, mind bending culture of hash, marijuana, acid and speed. She was only a teenager, but in its own clawing, gnawing way, in her mind these terrible drugs were the only way out.
>
> [MG:D11:A1]

The language used to describe Laura Gainey's drug use demonstrates clear moralising scripts of drug use as 'ugly' and 'terrible.' This statement positions the family as a site of redemption, while drug use is the opposite- a space into which one 'plummets.' This divide is further confirmed by her father, who states: "Laura bottled up some of the emotions. Others, she acted out in *the wrong way*" [MG:D11:A1; emphasis added]. Laura Gainey, therefore, is described as having pulled away from her family during a time of tragedy, and engaging in the 'wrong' behaviours. However, she is then portrayed as having won "the fight of her young life" through her recovery [MG:D11:A1]. In fact, one article states that "her recovery, and the fresh steps in the decade since, makes her loss all the more sad for her father and family" [ChH:D11:A1]. In each newspaper discussing her disappearance, Laura's current successes, including her hardworking nature and positive attitude, are juxtaposed against her teen years of illicit drug use, and her 'success' and 'recovery' are provided as the reasons that her death is tragic. Therefore, because of her 'successful recovery,' Laura Gainey's death is more tragic because "she turned her life around" [ChH:D11:A1]. The use of the phrase 'turning one's life around' is telling in and of itself, and demonstrates that the victimisation or death of women who engage in deviant and criminal behaviours are less worthy of sympathy because they are less tragic. The moralising scripts which appear in news coverage of Laura Gainey's disappearance solidify the opposing ends of this framework.

Alcohol as Deviant

What is perceived and discussed as irresponsible use of alcohol is also highlighted in a number of articles concerning missing women. Sally McManus was found frozen by her car in a ditch along a major highway. At the end of the article discussing the discovery of her body, it states:

> Sgt. Neufeld said Ms. McManus had been drinking the night she disappeared. "She may have had a drink or something but whether she was impaired or not we don't know."
>
> [GM:M22:A9]

The text of the article declares that Sally McManus had been drinking the night she disappeared, and this is confirmed by a police officer who acts as a voice of authority. These statements imply that Sally McManus may have been responsible for losing control of her vehicle and therefore to blame for her death based on the 'common-sense' dangers associated with drinking and driving. However, the quote that is included from a police officer states that "she *may* have had *a* drink," which would not necessarily result in impairment [GM:M22:A9; emphasis added]. These assumptions, therefore, exist without confirmation of her actual activities on the night she disappeared.

Alcohol is also central to the discussion of a 19 year-old woman who disappeared after attempting to swim in a nearby river. In one article, readers are told that the woman and her family were "having a drinking party," while another discusses how they "were drinking on the riverbank" [CH:Jl16:A5; EJ:Jl17:A9]. Moral connotations are apparent in these articles, as the first states that "her husband tried to prevent her from entering the water, but couldn't" [CH:Jl16:A5]. This implies that her impaired judgement from drinking alcohol led her to jump in the river despite her husband's attempts to 'save' her. The second article is more direct, and includes a quote from a bystander who states:

"That's awful. . . . But definitely alcohol and water don't mix" [EJ:Jl17:A9]. This bystander seemingly speaks for the community and the inclusion of this quotation emphasises that people should not drink and go swimming or there will be regrettable consequences. These statements indicate that the missing, and presumed drowned, woman is culpable for her disappearance and potentially her death because she should have 'known better' or listened to the caution of her husband. This speaks to literature on women's self-regulation of their behaviour. As Stanko (1997) maintains, women who perform safekeeping strategies are successfully performing femininity. Alternatively, women who do not ascribe to 'appropriate' femininity are morally culpable for their victimisation. The role of men is often complicated because women are taught to be fearful of men, but also that in order to be safe they need the protection of men (Stanko, 1990; Madriz, 1997:16). In this context, there is the message that because the young woman did not listen to the caution of her husband (as Stanko argues: benevolent protector), she came to harm.

The language used between the two articles is also significant, as the first article in *The Calgary Herald* refers to the unnamed woman as a "pregnant wife" and "a 19-year-old pregnant woman" [CH: Jl16:A5]. On the other hand, in *The Edmonton Journal* the missing woman is identified as a "missing teen," and later as "a pregnant teen" [EJ:Jl17:A9]. The use of the term pregnant teen infantilises this woman, as the terms "teen" and "wife" have different connotations. Thus, while both articles identify her as pregnant, her worth as a missing woman has different meanings implied by the use of language in the two newspapers. Interestingly, her identity as a pregnant woman is not central to the coverage of her disappearance. While the first article does portray this

94

woman in a more positive way, the article is short, with fewer than 150 words. The second article is longer and more informative, yet it is also more judgemental by describing the woman as a 'teen' as opposed to an adult or wife. The term 'pregnant teen' appears in good mothering discourses; however, teen pregnancy is often vilified as teen mothers are thought to violate the nuclear family structure and are responsible for "a host of social ills: poverty, crime, violence, drugs, family breakdown and the disintegration of social values" (Chase, 2001:36). In terms of good mothering discourses, the differences between 'pregnant teen' and 'pregnant wife' are significant.

For both the unnamed missing 19-year-old woman and Sally McManus, consumption of alcohol is negatively associated with their disappearances. Further, the focus of both women's disappearances is tied to the improper or irresponsible consumption of alcohol resulting in their deaths. These women, therefore, are held to scripts of femininity that place them as at least partially culpable for their disappearances.

Hitchhiking as Dangerous

Another theme of criminal and deviant behaviour is apparent in the coverage of Cindy Burk, who went missing while hitchhiking in Northern British Columbia, and the recent arrest of a suspect in her murder. Readers are informed that this has given hope to other families, namely Jack Hoar, whose daughter "is among the 11 cases of missing or murdered women last seen along the notorious stretch of road dubbed the Highway of Tears" [CH:N18:A9]. However, the article states there are few similarities between Nicole Hoar and Cindy Burk, besides being similar in age and "hitchhiking on 'lonely stretches of road' in northern B.C." [CH:N18:A9]. The use of 'notorious' and 'lonely stretches of road' are interesting as these terms are not defined. In this context, readers

95

do not know if these missing women knew that others had gone missing along this highway, or when these women went missing in relation to others. For readers unfamiliar with the time line of these cases, the women who have gone missing from this area may be held as irresponsible for hitchhiking in a 'dangerous' place. Further, hitchhiking is not viewed as an activity which 'responsible' girls partake because it is risky (Weaver et al., 2000). This potentially constructs both Cindy Burk and Nicole Hoar, along with other women believed to have gone missing along this road, as deviant and irresponsible because they have not followed prescribed feminine safekeeping (Stanko, 1997).

Speaking for Themselves: Two Women Respond to Deviant Labels

The damaging effects of being associated with criminal and deviant behaviour are exemplified by the responses of found women Linda Grant and Mary Florence Lands. Both women are quoted as disassociating themselves from sex trade work and drug dependency. An article on Mary Florence Lands begins:

> Florence Lands' portrayal as a Vancouver hooker who abandoned her children couldn't be further from the truth says the woman who thought she had given her children up for adoption. "It's just beyond me that I could be painted so ugly," said Lands.
>
> <div align="right">[SP:Jn24:A1]</div>

Interestingly, none of the articles within this sample refer to her as "a hooker." However, the message here is clear: Mary Florence Lands is seeking to disassociate herself from the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside and the specific criminal and deviant behaviours of sex work and drug use. She later expresses that she was an alcoholic, but reiterates that she was not involved in sex work and did not 'sell her body' to obtain alcohol [SP:Jn24:A1]. In a separate article, Mary Florence Lands' son expresses his anger with his mother being associated with the women missing from the

Downtown Eastside. He is quoted as declaring; "this has all totally tainted her name" [EJ:Jn23:B12].

News coverage of Linda Grant raises similar objections. It is stated that "she insisted that she doesn't fit the profile of the other women on the list—denying she has ever worked in the sex trade or done hard drugs" [VS:Jn7:A1]. For both women, there is an emphasis on 'clearing' their names from association of drug use and sex work in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside, demonstrating that public opinion is influenced by these associations which are negative and damaging to the women's reputations. This speaks to continuums of worth for women who go missing, as both Mary Florence Lands and Linda Grant seek to redeem their reputation by disassociating from the women of the Downtown Eastside. While the majority of women who are missing are unable to speak for themselves, Linda Grant and Mary Florence Lands are given this opportunity. It is significant that their voices are defensive and support contemporary discourses of good mothering and worthy victimisation.

Search Efforts of 'Worthy' versus 'Unworthy' Missing Women

Search efforts for missing women associated with criminal and deviant behaviour have recently come under much scrutiny (Amnesty International, 2004). The difference between public reactions to the disappearance of 'worthy' women as opposed to 'unworthy' women is seen in the news coverage of Jennifer Teague and Gina Smith. While Jennifer Teague's initial disappearance occurred prior to the start date of this study, there is one article included which details the arrest of a suspect for her murder. This article states: "the disappearance of the popular athlete shocked residents of the nation's capital, sparking a massive search and triggering a debate about the

97

responsibility of employers for ensuring their workers make it home safely"

[GM:Jn28:A1]. A further reference to search efforts appears later in the article, and

readers are told of how her disappearance, along with the disappearance of another

Ottawa woman two years earlier, resulted in fear of a serial predator. However, an article

on the discovery of bones possibly belonging to Gina Smith declares:

> Gina's case has caused barely a ripple in a city that has lived through the trauma
> of Jennifer Teague and Ardeth Wood, two vibrant young women who disappeared
> after conducting the most normal activities: walking home from work; cycling on
> a hot summer's day. . . Sandwiched between those two homicides, Gina's
> disappearance occurred without so much as a press release to signify that she was
> gone. This is the story of a woman who lived on the margins of society, a woman
> many people considered disposable.
>
> <div align="right">[OC:O28:A1]</div>

These statements both call attention to the differential treatment received by women 'on

the margins,' while at the same time reinforcing these divides. For example, this article

highlights that Gina Smith's disappearance 'barely caused a ripple,' but at the same time

defines Jennifer Teague and Ardeth Wood's activities as 'normal.' Thus, Jennifer

Teague and Ardeth Wood are identified as different because they are 'vibrant' and

'normal' young women, while Gina Smith is further constructed as deviant and criminal

despite the purpose of this article being to call attention to the differential treatment her

disappearance received.

The discussion of criminal and deviant women differs according to article

category, and call-for-action articles are much more likely to be critical and call for

public response. For example, critiques have been raised in Vancouver, where family

members have argued that "people seem to care more about storm-ravaged trees in

Stanley Park than about murdered women" [EJ:F15:F7]. A mother of a missing and

murdered Toronto woman argues that her daughter is "just another police statistic. . .

She's forgotten. If she was a judge's daughter, the case would have been solved by now" [TS:Jn25:A10]. Family members and advocates for missing and murdered women are frequently interviewed and their message is clear: women associated with crime and deviance, specifically the sex trade and use of illicit drugs, are marginalised. Women are less likely to be considered or labelled as officially missing, to have their disappearances reported within news media and their cases receive differential and inferior treatment from the police. Most importantly, their deaths are more likely to be ignored by the public, resulting in the message that their lives have less value. Clearly, the link between criminal and deviant behaviour touches on class positioning for missing and victimised women. This is exemplified by the statement that college students and a judge's daughter would receive immediate attention, and also shown through coverage of women engaged in street sex trade work.

Criminal and Deviant Women and Worth

The above discussion demonstrates that association to criminal activity and deviant behaviours affects the news coverage of missing women. This theme speaks explicitly to constructions of femininity; women who engage in criminal and deviant behaviour violate scripts of femininity (Stanko, 1997; Madriz, 1997). All behaviours, including alcohol 'abuse,' illicit drug use, hitchhiking and sex work, cross the boundaries of acceptable female behaviour. Specifically, women involved in sex trade work disobey codes of acceptable female sexuality. Sexuality is central to moralising discourses, and the importance of sexual purity is repeatedly shown to be linked to discourses of women's victimisation (Pollock, 2006; Valverde, 2006). In this study, news coverage of women involved in sex work, and often those who also use illicit drugs, contains moral

99

undertones woven throughout. This is often demonstrated through quotes from family members, friends and police officers. Women who engage in criminal and deviant behaviours, therefore, are placed as less worthy victims because they defy constructions of appropriate behaviour. Some women are even held, at least partially, to blame for their disappearances and, for some, their deaths. Unlike mothers, who fulfill gender roles and as a result are constructed as worthy and valuable victims, these women are placed at the opposite end of the worthy victim continuum.

Class Position of Missing Women

The third key theme found within news coverage of missing Canadian women is socio-economic status or class position. This theme differs quite substantially from motherhood and criminality/deviance because a missing woman's class position is never directly identified within news coverage of her disappearance. However, in many articles, class position is alluded to or insinuated. Class position is important to this study because it is pivotal both to the ways in which individuals experience the social world and how individuals are viewed by others. In this context, class position is central to moralising discourses and the ways in which value is attached to women who go missing.

Women in Poverty: Making Women 'Knowable'

For many of the missing women in this study, their class position is insinuated through their association to criminal and/or deviant behaviours. This can be seen within discussions of sex trade work and use of illicit drugs. The two are often linked and, for many women, involvement in the sex trade is cited as a way to afford illicit drugs. Interestingly, for many missing women involved in the sex trade, their position as living

100

in poverty is often juxtaposed against their family's working or middle class position. For example, within discussion of the disappearance of Darlene MacNeill, it is stated: "dependence on crack cocaine gripped . . . and held her captive on the streets and in the alleyways of Parkdale" [TS:Jn25:A11]. Within the content of the article, Darlene MacNeill is presented as having chosen drug dependency and involvement in the sex trade. Her family, at the same time, is seemingly middle class because they can afford to offer her help, such as through plane tickets to leave the province, as well as encouraging rehabilitation programs.

This theme is also clear in an article on the disappearance of Gina Smith. It begins with a discussion of how she shared a one bedroom apartment with her friend, up until the day she disappeared:

> The two spent much of the cold February day in the messy one- bedroom apartment in the house on the corner, across from the fire station. Gina lounged on a mattress that lay on the floor, one of the only pieces of furniture in the place.
> [OC:O28:E7]

The article later states that "she didn't own much, but the few things she did own- her purse, makeup kit and clothes- were still scattered around the apartment" [OC:O28:E7]. It is clear that at the time that Gina Smith disappeared she was living in poverty, as evidenced by the emphasis on her lack of possessions, including furniture. However, her mother is later introduced as living in a "quiet, semi-private retirement community in Victoria, B.C." [OC:O28:E7]. Furthermore, her mother's house is described in middle class sentimental language, with focus on "cherished family photos" which "cascade down the wall" [OC:O28:E7]. Gina Smith's early years are presented as positive, and family members are quoted as declaring their disbelief that she "rebelled" because she "grew up in a family with no abuse" [OC:O28:E7]. The focus here is to make Gina

Smith and her family knowable to readers by reinforcing shared middle class positioning. This speaks to the perceived need to emphasise that Gina Smith is a valuable individual, and that her disappearance and death is significant.

This focus of making marginalised women, especially sex trade workers and illicit drug users, knowable to readers in order to emphasise that they are valuable is most apparent in the coverage of the missing women of Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. In the days leading up to the beginning of Robert Pickton's trial, there are a number of articles published focusing on the missing women and their backgrounds. These articles include claims by family members who want their loved ones to be remembered as more than drug addicted sex trade workers, in response to previous news coverage of the women's disappearances. However, these articles reveal interesting patterns in terms of the women's class position. More than one article makes reference to Vancouver's Downtown Eastside as "an area a former B.C. premier described once as 'a terrible human zoo'" [VTC:J14:D1]. From the beginning, therefore, readers are made aware that these missing women lived in poverty. News coverage of their families, on the other hand, does not directly identify the family's class position; however, for many of the families their class position is suggested.

In the news coverage of Mona Wilson, readers are informed that her early childhood years were marked by neglect and abuse. This is held in contrast to her adoptive family, who took her on family vacations and activities, such as fishing and camping. It is stated: "attending school and other regular childhood routines were sporadic for Wilson in her earliest years, but in the Garley's home she went to class and was taken on family vacations—including one to Disneyland" [VS:J12:A4]. Thus, there

is a focus on Mona Wilson's adopted family as providing a "normal" home environment through family activities. Discussion of Marnie Frey's family is similar to Mona Wilson's adoptive family, and central to news coverage of her background is the stability and strength of her family. In an article discussing three missing and murdered women, the section on Marnie Frey begins:

> It was a parental nightmare. Your teenage daughter meets new friends and starts experimenting with mushrooms and marijuana. She hangs out at the mall with a new crowd that parties with cocaine and heroin. By the time you figure out what is going on, she is pregnant and addicted. That's what happened to Marnie Frey, according to her father and stepmother Rick and Lynn Frey.
> GM:J20:A12

The discussion then moves to Marnie Frey's childhood and the ways in which she cared for animals and how she was a thoughtful girl. The focus of this article is her 'downfall' from a respectable, middle class family through her association with the wrong crowd, which ultimately resulted in her living in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. Overall, news coverage of both Marnie Frey and Mona Wilson's families appeals to middle class notions of 'normal' childhood experiences and family roles. Scholars have documented the ways in which romanticised notions of childhood are shaped according to historical processes involving ideal notions of what childhood should be (Jenks, 1996; Hendrik, 1997). Harry Hendrik (1997:34) argues that contemporary theories of childhood are largely based upon the efforts and ideals of members of the middle classes. Specifically, according to these perspectives, there is the belief that childhood is a time of innocence and that children need to be protected from all harms (Schmuck Murray, 1998). In this context, news coverage of missing women assumes that readers share these definitions of childhood and family by seeking to present this image in the lives of specific missing women. Missing women's class position, in the above examples, is insinuated through

their association to the sex trade and the Downtown Eastside. However, this is contrasted against their family's class positions which appeals to notions of middle class views of childhood based upon middle class values.

Differential Treatment According to Class Position

Another theme apparent within this study in terms of class position of missing women involves articles which call attention to the differential treatment that different women receive when they go missing. Many of the call-for-action articles which explicitly highlight differential treatment, as discussed above in relation to criminal and deviant behaviour, implicitly highlight women's class position. For example, Phil Fontaine, the national chief of the Assembly of First Nations, states that "Canadian society failed to give the disappearance of native women in Vancouver the same attention given to the murder of 14 women at Montreal's Ecole Polytechnique in 1989" [VS:F15:B1]. It is clear that the class position of women in the sex trade, as opposed to women attending university, is central to this claim. This assertion shares the same basis as the argument put forth in another article which questions the perceived disposable nature of sex trade workers. Specifically, it is stated, "honestly, if the Vancouver murdered had been Caucasian college students, there would have been a manhunt to find the killer. If 21 "bad dates" had taken place with local coeds, there would have been an uproar" [WFP:J23:A6]. This article highlights the racial identity of the missing women, but focuses on their class position as sex trade workers as opposed to university students.

These arguments rest on the belief that class position is directly related to a missing women's worth as a victim. Here, advocates on behalf of missing and murdered sex trade workers argue that the disappearances of these women are considered less

important because of their class position. Further, these arguments reflect critiques raised by academics regarding the moral regulation of Canadian women. As discussed in chapter three, historically the moral regulation of women's sexuality has been heavily influenced by class identity, as seen through the policing of lower class women's sexuality (Valverde, 2006; Valverde & Weir, 2006). Within news coverage of missing sex trade workers, worth as a victim is directly related to lower class positioning and conceptions of acceptable female sexuality.

The relationship between the worth of a victim and class position is most evident within the news coverage of the disappearance of Laura Gainey. The identity of her father, Bob Gainey, the General Manager for the Montreal Canadiens, is central to the discussion of her disappearance. Indeed, one article details Bob Gainey's professional life and, in reference to an initial article on Laura Gainey's disappearance appearing on page A6, begins:

> Important stories normally are carried closer to the front page. The woman was not identified, so the story was scanned and the page turned. It didn't involve anyone you know. Yesterday, it involved someone everybody knows when the Canadiens confirmed that Gainey's daughter Laura had been identified as the missing woman. The report left me breathless.
>
> [MG:D11:A1]

It is clear that upon being identified as the daughter of a 'hockey legend,' articles on her disappearance did appear as front page news, as demonstrated by the above article. Laura Gainey's identity as the daughter of someone 'important' is a marker of her worth and importance as a victim. Further, her father's identity and her family's socio-economic or class position, and the implications of that position, are central to news coverage of her disappearance. Although never explicitly stated, her family's position as upper-middle class is evident within these articles. This adds another layer to the dialogue of her drug

use and subsequent 'successful recovery' because Laura Gainey is an upper-middle class woman who 'rose' from the culture of drugs. The statement that one 'plummets' into a life of drug use connotes a fall from an acceptable lifestyle, and one of the characteristics of this is economic and socio-economic standing. Illicit drug use, in this context, is associated with lower class citizens. Class divisions and position, though here implied, are significant. Further, while other articles tend not to provide a 'before and after' scenario outlining a 'fall from grace,' class position of drug users as lower class citizens remains apparent throughout news coverage of missing women, including the examples above.

Class Position in Relation to Other Identity Factors

The class position of a missing woman is not always associated with criminal or deviant behaviours. In the case of Manjit Panghali, 12 of 14 articles on her disappearance mention that she went missing after attending a pre-natal yoga class. Manjit Panghali and her husband were both school teachers who had recently bought a house in Surrey, B.C. for $122, 000 [VS:O26:A6]. One article states: "the lovely new suburban house- with its pumpkin lights already up- is assessed at $452, 000. A tent trailer chained to the side of the house is an indication of summer fun the couple enjoyed" [VS:O26:A6]. Therefore, through mention of activities and hobbies in which Manjit Panghali and her husband participated, as well as their material possessions and careers, the couples' class position is insinuated. It should also be noted that Manjit Panghali's disappearance resulted in the most news coverage within this sample. It is clear that her disappearance was viewed as news worthy, as evidenced by the amount of coverage found in Canadian newspapers. As discussed in the section on identity as a mother, there is a correlation between Manjit

Panghali's identity as a pregnant mother and her worth as a missing woman. However, it also is evident that her class position is an important element in this relationship.

The ways in which class position interacts with other identity factors is also clear in news coverage of Linda Grant. While her class position is never directly stated, it is hinted through discussion of her current life in the United States. Readers are informed that upon moving to the United States, Linda Grant owned a bar [VS:Jn7:A1]. This is juxtaposed against her residency in the Downtown Eastside of Vancouver. It is not explicitly stated that Linda Grant was living in poverty when in the Downtown Eastside; however, the association for Canadian readers is strong. Linda Grant's 'new' identity highlights many of the characteristics of a good mother, including alluding to her socio-economic position as being 'improved.' This example further demonstrates the relationship that exists between different identifying factors, as Linda Grant's identity centres on her role as a mother, her disassociation from a deviant or criminal lifestyle and her 'improved' class position.

The ways in which a missing woman's class position is presented is important and affects the ways in which her disappearance is presented to, and arguably accepted by, members of the public. These links are especially clear in call-for-action articles, as many of these articles seek to respond to the ways in which both members of the public as well as state officials have responded to specific groups of missing women. However, factual articles and human interest stories, which do not explicitly seek to call attention to women's identities and responses to their disappearances, also highlight class position. While in these cases class position is more often implied through statements regarding where a woman lives and the activities or work she engages in, her class position can be

understood. Mention of class position is often subtle; however, a woman's class position is intricately related to her worth as a missing woman.

Racial Identity and Ethnic Background

The fourth key theme from this study involves the racial identity and ethnic background of women who go missing. This theme is significant because discussions of race and ethnicity are noticeably absent from the content of factual articles. However, racial identity and ethnic background are central to the discussion of missing women in call-for-action articles. These articles include demands and pleas from family members, friends and social justice advocates for the public to recognise racialised woman as valuable victims. What is perhaps most interesting and significant is that call-for-action articles appear alongside factual articles on women who are missing; however, there is an obvious disconnect between articles calling for the "fair" and "equal" treatment of racialised women as valuable victims, and the ways in which racialised women continue to be reported within newspapers.

Omission and Inclusion of Racial Identity

If we consider the women within the sub-category of factual articles who have the most follow-up articles (in the belief that the number of articles is a signifier as to the woman's worth as a victim), the two most written about women are Manjit Panghali and Leslie Ann Conrad. Both of these women are between the ages of 30 and 50, are presented as "devoted" mothers and law-abiding citizens, and neither have their racial identity or ethnic background specified. In one article, Manjit Panghali's racial identity is alluded to in regard to her husband's delay in reporting her disappearance to the police. A friend of

the family states, "Anyone in the Sikh or Indo-Canadian community would understand the husband's reluctance to call police" [GM:O26:S4]. A later article states that the death of Manjit Panghali has renewed debates regarding the experiences of violence faced by Indo-Canadian women in the greater Vancouver area [VS:M12:A1]. However, despite the importance of racialised women's experiences of violence, Manjit Panghali's racial identity is never explicitly stated within news coverage of her disappearance or murder. While her racial identity is perhaps implied by her name, readers are left to draw their own conclusions based on assumptions because there is no explicit physical description.

Similarly, of 13 articles discussing the disappearance of Leslie Ann Conrad, of which five contain a physical description including her hair and eye colour, there is no mention of her racial identity. In these instances, readers may assume that Leslie Ann Conrad is white, because whiteness is held by many as the norm in Canada, or because of assumptions based on mention of hair and eye colour; nevertheless, her racial identity is never explicitly stated (Henry & Tator, 2006). However, it must be noted that this study cannot speak to the inclusion of photographs of missing women accompanying news coverage of their disappearances, which is perhaps a notable limitation of this analysis, as the focus is a textual analysis. These examples, which are supported by numerous others in this study, help demonstrate there is a divide between the content of factual articles and concerns raised within call-for-action articles.

There is one instance within factual articles whereby racial identity and ethnic background are both central and directly stated. Irene Pawluk, who died after leaving her vehicle in a snowstorm, is discussed in terms of her commitment to the Dene community and the ways she contributed to the continued teaching of Dene traditions and language

[SP:F16:A9]. Indeed, her knowledge and commitment to the Dene culture are the focus of this article and are spoken of by a family member and former colleague. This discussion comes before the mention of her children, who are referred to in passing within the article. However, this article is an anomaly within factual news coverage of missing women, as no other articles give similar detail about a woman's racial identity or ethnic background.

Within a small number of factual articles, women are introduced according to their racial identity. For example, Mary Florence Lands' racial identity is not mentioned within news coverage of her disappearance; however, one article states: "the Missing Women Task Force officially added the native woman to its poster in October 2004" [VS:Jn23:A3]. In the above article, her racial identity is only mentioned in passing, and is not elaborated on. Discussion of Rachel Quinney states that she was interested in "enrolling in an apprenticeship program for aboriginal people" [GM:J3:A1]. Rachel Quinney is never identified as Aboriginal, and mention of this program is arguably in reference to her 'desire' to "do something besides being a prostitute;" speaking to frameworks of criminality and deviance as discussed previously [GM:J3:A1]. Similarly, an article on the suspected murder of Danielle Larue states: "Danielle Larue, 25, went missing in December 2002. She was a native woman from B.C.'s interior" [VS:M6:B2]. This is the only mention of her racial identity, and as with Rachel Quinney and Mary Florence Lands, it is not elaborated on or contextualised. Instead, each woman's racial identity is stated in an offhand or casual way.

Aboriginal Identity and the Canadian Context

Arguably, the representation of Aboriginal identity is of particular importance in Canada. As outlined by Henry and Tator (2006), there is a complex history of oppression and colonisation of Aboriginal peoples in Canada, and currently there exists tension between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal peoples, as well as between Aboriginal peoples and governmental institutions and law enforcement. These tensions are echoed within academic literature, which documents experiences of racialisation and discrimination faced by Aboriginal peoples (Monture-Angus, 1999; Razack, 2002; Henry & Tator, 2006). Although newspaper content is unlikely to address the structural elements involved in these processes of racialisation, the failure to include racial identity in newspaper content serves to reinforce these frameworks because it maintains the status quo.

A second reason that stating a woman's Aboriginal identity may be important is that it allows a focus on women's shared experiences of violence and the widespread victimisation experienced by Aboriginal women in Canada. Central to call-for-action articles is the context in which Aboriginal women experience violence in their daily lives. In an article entitled "Native women under siege," the author discusses how the women who went missing along the Highway of Tears are "linked by race" [WFP:Jl2:B2]. It concludes:

> What is clear is that the lives of Aboriginal women and girls are so much different from other Canadians that the Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics suggests in a study released in early June that they might as well be living in another country.
> [WFP:Jl2:B2]

This article places the missing women from the Highway of Tears within the context of missing Aboriginal women across Canada. Race is not simply mentioned; it is the focus

of the discussion. A separate article in another newspaper is titled "Code Red alert urged for missing Native women" [SP:S27:A13]. This article details how "Amnesty International Canada is urging police to treat calls about missing aboriginal women as Code Red Cases" due to the increased risk and degree of violence they face [SP:S27:A13]. These articles recognise the increased levels of violence faced by Aboriginal women and highlight the need to respond quickly and effectively when Aboriginal women go missing.

The focus of the above two articles is the contextualisation of violence faced by Aboriginal women in Canada. These articles incorporate statistics from victimisation surveys as well as link stories from across the country to show that violence is not individual. Call-for-action articles in general highlight experiences of racism and the lack of public awareness or concern for victimised Aboriginal women. They show that for racialised women, and especially Aboriginal women, racial identity cannot simply be mentioned in passing. Call-for-action articles draw attention to many of the same themes central to victimisation literature focusing on women of colour's experiences of violence, including the disproportionately high levels of violence experienced by Aboriginal women and systemic issues such as poverty (Amnesty International, 2004; Chartrand & MacKay, 2006).

Looking Critically at the Inclusion of Racial Identity

Call-for-action articles appear alongside factual articles within Canadian newspapers. These articles are printed throughout the timeline of the sample and across different newspapers. They are published at the same time as factual articles; however, there is a clear disconnect between the demands of the former versus the content of the latter. Call-

for-action articles reaffirm many of the appeals raised by academics regarding racial identity and experiences of violence against women in Canada. While it may be argued that not including the racial identity or ethnic background within news coverage of missing women potentially creates equality, it must be remembered that women of colour often experience violence in their daily lives differently than white women. Omitting the racial identity or ethnic background of a missing woman creates two potential problems. First, the public may assume the victim is white, and this ignores her identity and unique experiences as a woman of colour (Crenshaw, 1991;1993; Cossins, 2003). In this context, it perpetuates frameworks that place white victims as the norm (Madriz, 1997). Therefore, there is an incorrect conception of the victim that is presented within physical descriptions of missing women if racial identity is not stated and whiteness is assumed.

The second problem is that this potentially further silences women of colour and renders them invisible within newspaper coverage of their own victimisation. For example, if newspaper reports are correct and there is concern regarding the amount of violence faced by Indo-Canadian women in the Vancouver area, ignoring racial identity and ethnic background will not help to adequately address the issue [VS:M12:A1]. As intersectional theorists contend, the intersections of women's identities must be at the forefront of analysis and discussion, and here both racial identity and ethnic background play a role.

This argument raises the question: what happens when racial identity is allowed to enter the picture? There is the potential that identifying a woman's racial identity or ethnic background could serve to stereotype the missing woman and/or her community. This is a criticism that has been raised by women suffering from spousal abuse: in

113

seeking services against domestic violence, women of colour fear facing racism from the very organisations and institutions that offer help (Bannerji, 2002). This can include women's shelters and the police, as well as members of the public, who may assume that violence is a characteristic of certain minority communities or that such violence is 'acceptable' within minority communities. Naturally, these issues apply to news coverage of women who go missing, as members of the public may hold racist views and news coverage is unlikely to deconstruct racist frameworks. However, a "colour-blind" approach to women who go missing, as outlined above, ignores the lived experiences of women of colour. This approach also unfairly assumes and privileges whiteness because it remains the unquestioned norm (Henry & Tator, 2006). Most importantly, the silencing of any person's racial identity follows an approach which privileges equality as opposed to equity and, ultimately, perpetuates the illusion of equality by not addressing systems of oppression (Henry & Tator, 2006).

Summary of Chapter

This chapter analyses key themes found within Canadian news coverage of women who go missing. Identity factors which are central to the constructions of missing women include identity as a mother and association with criminal activities and deviant behaviours. However, while identity as a mother places women as valuable victims worthy of sympathy and public resources, criminal and deviant behaviour positions women as culpable for their victimisation and diminishes their worth as victims. Class position is never directly identified, but is frequently alluded to through mention of activities in which missing women engage. For women who are missing, class position subtly affects the ways in which their disappearances are presented within newspapers.

Findings also demonstrate that racial identity and ethnic background are noticeably absent from the sample of factual articles; however, racial identity and ethnic background are fundamental in call-for-action articles. There is a clear disconnect between call-for-action articles which demand that commonalities between marginalised women be recognised, in particular racial identity and effects of racism, and the ways in which women's disappearances continue to be reported. Further, and perhaps most importantly, these identity factors work together in subtle and obvious ways to affect the ways women are constructed as valuable victims.

CHAPTER 6:
CONCLUSION

The purpose of this research project is to critically analyse the ways in which the

identities of Canadian women who go missing are constructed within Canadian

newspapers. This research is guided by the feminist intersectional perspective, which

seeks to understand the ways intersections of identity affect the lived experiences of

individuals (Cossins, 2003). A gendered perspective is critical to this project because of

the different ways women and men experience victimisation and violence in Canadian

society (Stanko, 1990; Gannon & Mihorean, 2005). Furthermore, women and men

differently experience processes of moral regulation, which is directly related to the ways

in which value and worth are assigned to experiences of victimisation. This research

project is founded on the argument that there exist continuums of worth in which

victimised women are placed according to how well they conform to standards of

appropriate femininity (Madriz, 1997).

Articles from 11 major daily newspapers from urban centres across Canada are

analysed in order to determine the ways in which women who went missing are

represented within articles on their disappearances and discoveries. The data method

utilised is feminist discourse analysis and an open and reflexive coding method is

employed. Key findings centre upon identity factors which are repeated throughout the

study sample, and themes include identity as a mother, association to criminal and/or

deviant behaviour, class position and racial identity and ethnic background. Each

individual identity factor has important characteristics; however, it is also interesting and critical to consider the intersections of identity factors.

Summary of Findings

Many individuals go missing every year, and the release of information to newspapers regarding missing persons is dependent upon the perceived worth of their story. This is related to the perceived worth of that individual as a missing person. In this way, newspapers will not publish stories on every person who goes missing, just as police will not release information to the public regarding each missing individual. The inclusion of information pertaining to a missing woman is important to analyse because it demonstrates what is considered newsworthy and, therefore, valuable. In this study, a woman's identity as a mother is found to be fundamental to the construction of her identity as a missing woman. Children are central to distinctions of 'out of character' behaviour, a term that carries significant power when determining if a woman's disappearance is viewed as serious. Women who are 'good' mothers are constructed as important victims who are worthy of public sympathy and resources.

On the other hand, association to criminal or deviant behaviour detracts from a missing woman's perceived worth as a victim. This is especially the case for sex trade workers and women using illicit drugs. Unfortunately, the focus on criminality and deviance continues in spite of efforts and concerns raised by advocates responding to the disappearances of women from Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. Women involved in the sex trade who use illicit drugs continue to go missing across Canada, and the construction of their identities has not changed in any significant way (for example, see Jiwani & Young, 2006). For many women, association to criminal and deviant behaviour

117

results in notions of blame and culpability in their disappearances and, in some cases, their deaths. While women who are mothers subscribe to appropriate scripts of femininity, and are thus constructed as worthy victims, women who engage in criminal and deviant behaviour violate norms of femininity are less worthy victims. Further, a woman's identity as a mother only supersedes her categorisation as criminal or deviant if she subscribes to discourses of 'good' mothering.

Class position of women who go missing is not central to news coverage; however, it is insinuated in several key ways. A woman's class position may be alluded to according to the area in which she lives and works, as well as through mention of the activities and hobbies in which she engages. The class position of many women living in poverty and involved in the sex trade are contrasted against their families, who are presented as working or middle class. It is argued that this is conducted to make the women more 'knowable' to readers and appeal to middle class commonalities, as many readers have none of the lived realities of, or association to, marginalised women other than what they read in the newspaper (Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2006). There are also a number of articles that call attention to the ways in which class position is related to the response a woman's disappearance receives. The message of these articles is a critique of the ways that the disappearances of marginalised women are ignored or viewed as less newsworthy than middle or upper class women. Significantly, these critical articles appear alongside articles that specifically highlight a missing woman's middle and upper class position as contributing to her worth as a missing woman. Clearly, there is a divide between the published concerns of advocacy groups and the factual information regarding certain women's disappearances.

One of the most significant disconnects found within this study concerns the critiques raised by concerned individuals and community organisations regarding the news coverage of the disappearances of Aboriginal women from urban and rural areas across Canada. Racial identity and ethnic background are argued to be central to a missing woman's identity and critical in the Canadian context. However, factual articles regarding women's disappearances repeatedly omit women's racial identity and ethnic background. This serves to ignore the context of racialisation in Canada as well as silence the ways in which racial identity affects women's daily lives. It is important to be sensitive to racism and processes of racialisation; however, ignoring how racial identity affects women's lived experiences does not serve to create equality. Instead, it further silences racialised women and privileges whiteness as the norm.

As intersectional theory contends, women's experiences are dependent upon the intersections of identity factors. In this context, it is imperative to consider the intersections of identity factors as presented within news coverage of women's disappearances. This is a difficult task given the size and time constraints of this study; however, some initial observations are clear. One's identity as a 'good' mother supersedes all other identity factors, including association to criminal and deviant behaviour. Indeed, for those women who adhere to constructions of 'good' mothering, identity as a mother is a mitigating factor that offsets the negative associations of criminal and deviant behaviour. For example, women involved in the drug trade who had children are constructed as responsible, and therefore worthy victims, if they are also 'responsible,' or 'good,' mothers. Similarly, characteristics identified as 'good' and 'worthy' identities for victims can also counteract 'negative' qualities. This is seen

within news coverage of missing sex trade workers, where information regarding their families class position as middle class is included in order to make the women 'knowable' to other readers.

It is clear from the above discussion that the disappearances of all women are not considered equally news worthy. In other words, their disappearances do not carry the same weight, and certain women are considered more important and valuable victims than others. This study found the occurrence of specific characteristics aided in the construction of a missing woman as worthy. In the introduction to this research project, I began with a description of the Pickton trial in relation to the news coverage that the disappearances of the women he is accused of murdering received. I stated that this trial created a platform for family members, friends and advocates on behalf of women to call attention to the victimisation of marginalised women across the country. However, as this study has shown, reporting on marginalised women has not significantly improved. The disappearances of many women continue to be silenced by the police and are still, at least initially, omitted from newspapers. Marginalised women continue to be primarily associated with criminal activities and deviant behaviours, which serves to further detract from their perceived worth as victims. Moreover, these articles frequently are published alongside articles calling attention to these problems. This is most obviously demonstrated by the disconnect between factual articles and call-for-action articles, especially regarding the racial identity of women who go missing and concerns raised by women of colour and Aboriginal groups across the country. Clearly, there is not only the desire but the demand for change, which, while recognised, has not manifested itself in any concrete or relevant way.

Future Considerations

Given recent criticisms raised by advocacy groups on behalf of missing women in Canada, there are a number of research considerations which must be highlighted. This is especially important as such criticisms are raised within the study sample itself.

This study focuses on articles from major daily newspapers across Canada, based upon circulation and readership rates. However, it is possible that community papers and newspapers from smaller cities offer more in-depth news coverage of women who go missing within those communities. As such, smaller community newspapers may be more insightful because of what information is included in the construction of a missing woman's identity.

Similarly, newspapers are not the only medium worthy of consideration. While newspapers continue to be a relevant and important source of information in Canada, news websites, magazines and television are also significant news sources. Further, each of these news sources offers a different element for study, such as a focus on accompanying pictures and film for television news, or additional web-links found on news websites.

There are a number of different ways newspaper content can be studied in order to focus on different elements of news content. A more quantitative approach might look at where articles are placed within newspapers, concentrating on placement within sections of a newspaper, as well as placement on the page. In light of criticisms raised by advocacy groups against the victimisation and representation of marginalised women, it might be relevant to interview news reporters and editors, in order to uncover the processes involved and decisions made in the newsrooms themselves. Another relevant

study might involve examining public responses to news coverage of missing women by interviewing members of the public, in order to address the ways in which readers decode information (van Zoonen, 1994).

It is a truism to state that the lives of all women who go missing are equally valuable. However, when a woman disappears, the pursuit of knowledge and justice are too often unequal. As members of the public who rely, at least partially, on newspapers to inform us of what is happening across our country, it is necessary to be critical of newspaper content and the ways in which different women's identities are constructed. Hopefully, my research has demonstrated that we must be critical of what we read and the role of claims-makers who speak for a population of women who often cannot speak for themselves.

APPENDICES:

Appendix A: Coding of Articles

Coding charts are comprised according to themes found within article content after multiple readings of the sample. Determination of certain categories was modified from the coding manual used by Brennan (2006).

Coding Manual

The coding process used in this study was open and flexible. Articles were read multiple times for key themes to emerge. After multiple readings, articles were placed within three category types (termed factual, call for action and human interest stories). These categories were constructed and labelled because it was felt the article types reflected the different focuses of article content. Articles in each category were further read multiple times as key themes developed. Factual articles were organised according to the missing woman who was the focus, and articles were separated into multiple and single coverage. The coding process was then refined and more focused. Key themes were developed, and articles coded according to:

1. Name: is missing or found woman's name mentioned?
2. Physical Description: is a description of the missing woman stated? What does it include?
3. Race/Ethnicity: is this stated within the article? If there is a physical description, does it include race/ethnicity?
4. Class: is a job mentioned? Is class insinuated?
5. Status: is the woman missing, found, alive or dead?
6. Criminal/Deviant behaviour: is illicit behaviour mentioned? If so, what?
7. Motherhood: is the woman identified as a mother? Is she pregnant?
8. Claims-makers: who speaks for missing women?
9. Out of character: is the woman's disappearance described as 'out of character'?
10. If not included above, what is the main focus of the article?
11. Any significant outliers?

Claims-makers

Articles were coded for who speaks within the articles; including who is directly and indirectly quoted. Categories include:

1. Criminal Justice: category subdivided:
   a. Judges
   b. Lawyers
   c. Police officers

2. Family members
3. Friends
4. Victims: the woman herself is interviewed or previous interviews/diary entries are included within article content.
5. Community Organisations: this includes religious organisations, out-reach programs and community action organisations, such as prostitution awareness.
6. Professionals: individuals whose voice is included because of their affiliation to a specific job, such as the coast guard or teachers.
7. Academics: those interviewed with affiliations to universities. Individuals are interviewed because of their specialisation within a specific field of knowledge.
8. Members of the public: Voices of those who are not connected with the missing women, or associated with a specific profession.
9. Politicians: this includes mayors, premiers or other members of parliament. This category was also subdivided to account for First Nations leaders.
10. Journalists: interviews with other journalists, or content from previously published news articles.
11. None: article content that does not include any direct or indirect quotations.

Appendix B: Article In-Text Referencing Guide

News Articles

CH: Calgary Herald
ChH: Chronicle Herald
EJ: Edmonton Journal
GM: Globe and Mail
MG: Montreal Gazette
OC: Ottawa Citizen
SP: Saskatoon Star-Phoenix
TS: Toronto Star
VS: The Vancouver Sun
VTC: Victoria Times-Colonist
WFP: Winnipeg Free Press

Month of Publication

J: January
F: February
M: March
A: April
Ma: May
Jn: June
Jl: July
Au: August
S: September
O: October
N: November
D: December

Articles are referenced according to the newspaper, date of publication and page number.

Appendix C: Data Sources

List of Articles by Newspaper and Date of Publication

The Calgary Herald

1. Zickefoose, S. (May 17, 2006). Police search dump for body; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.
2. Unknown Author. (May 18, 2006). Prostitute task force called after body found in field; [Final Edition]. Pg. A15.
3. Zickefoose, S. (May 18, 2006). Police make 'progress' searching dump for body: Hunt sifts through week's worth of garbage; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.
4. Sadave, M. (May 19, 2006). Slain prostitute 'sweet, giving person:' mother: drugs changed their lives, husband says; [Final Edition]. Pg. A10.
5. Poole, E. (June 7, 2006). Hopes rise for missing climbers; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
6. Poole, E. (June 8, 2006). Clouds stall search for missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B4.
7. Tetley, D. (June 14, 2006). Tips not followed up, PI alleges: RCMP say they're doing all they can; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.
8. Williamson, K. (June 18, 2006). Mountain hazards await unwary: Park officials brace for annual wave of mishaps; [Final Edition]. Pg. B8.
9. Tetley, D. (June 22, 2006). Report calls for hitchhiker bus; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
10. Chapman, S. (June 25, 2006). Searchers find wandering woman: Missing camper 'doing OK' after night alone in wild; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.
11. Unknown Author. (July 16, 2006). Husband can't save pregnant wife; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.
12. Poole, E. (July 19, 2006). Melting snow could aid search for climber's bodies; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.
13. Unknown Author. (August 18, 2006). Suspects identified in highway murders; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.
14. Unknown Author. (September 16, 2006). Reward offered in missing woman case; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
15. Unknown Author. (October 11, 2006). Pickton now suspected in one more case; [Early Edition]. Pg. A10.
16. Unknown Author. (October 11, 2006). Pickton now suspected in one more case; [Final Edition]. Pg. A10.
17. Unknown Author. (October 22, 2006). Woman missing in Lethbridge; [Final Edition]. Pg. B8.
18. Unknown Author. (October 28, 2006). Woman missing in Lethbridge; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
19. Unknown Author. (November 4, 2006). RCMP seek missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
20. Unknown Author. (November 11, 2006). Missing woman found dead; [Final Edition]. Pg. B8.

21.   Tetley, D. (November 18, 2006). Murder arrest gives hope to Alberta family: Link ruled out in Highway of Tears cases; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.

22.   Beacon, B. (December 12, 2006). Despite heavy hearts, Canadiens pull together: Will try to beat Bruins tonight for GM Gainey; [Final Edition]. Pg. F4.

23.   Unknown Author. (December 17, 2006). Abducted woman found unharmed; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.

24.   Unknown Author. (March 2, 2007). Woman charged for burning home; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.

The Chronicle-Herald

25.   Unknown Author. (June 6, 2006). Ontario police up murder charges to first-degree. Pg. A3.

26.   Unknown Author. (June 10, 2006). Found woman's name taken off B.C. list. Pg. A8.

27.   Unknown Author. (July 4, 2006). Slain woman's neighbour heads to court. Pg. A3.

28.   MacVicar, G. (July 19, 2006). Glace Bay woman still missing. Pg. B2.

29.   Unknown Author. (July 24, 2006). Probe into woman's disappearance stalls. Pg. B2.

30.   Camus, T. (July 25, 2006). Suspect charged in C.B. death: Woman, 22, found dead in rural cabin. Pg. A1.

31.   Camus, T. (August 2, 2006). Foul play not ruled out: Major crime squad investigating disappearance. Pg. A1.

32.   MacVigar, G. (August 23, 2006). Police say witness spotted missing woman in Ontario. Pg. B3.

33.   Unknown Author. (September 3, 2006). Missing woman case turns into criminal investigation. Pg. A8.

34.   Arsenault, D. (October 13, 2006). Wolfville mother reported missing. Pg. B4.

35.   Lightstone, M. (October 14, 2006). Lee's family has lost all hope. Pg. A1.

36.   Brooks Arenburg, P. (October 14, 2006). Tipster believes missing woman seen in Truro. Pg. B5.

37.   Brooks Arenburg, P. (October 18, 2006). Husband applies to declare wife dead: Son's approval needed in case of woman who went missing in 2004. Pg. B4.

38.   Unknown Author. (October 18, 2006). Still no sign of missing woman. Pg. B4.

39.   Brooks Arenburg, P. (October 19, 2006). A very public grief: Purcell says there's nothing evil about wanting wife declared dead; he just wants to move on. Pg. A1.

40.   Fairclough, I. (October 24, 2006). Missing woman's brother believes she is OK. Pg. B2.

41.   Fairclough, I. (October 27, 2006). Police: Husband not talking. Pg. B5.

42.   Fairclough, I. (November 1, 2006). Police scour Kings County property for traces of missing woman; husband's arrest unrelated. Pg. A1.

43. Delaney, G. (November 3, 2006). Cops hope farm clues will help them find missing woman. Pg. B1.
44. Unknown Author. (November 16, 2006). Elderly woman safe after spending night outside. Pg. B7.
45. Bethune, J. (November 17, 2006). National group to assist in search for C.B. woman. Pg. B2.
46. Bethune, J. (November 18, 2006). Group hopes for other witnesses in case of missing woman. Pg. B9.
47. Fairclough, I. (November 23, 2006). Body found in shallow grave. Pg. A1.
48. Fairclough, I. & Jeffrey, D. (November 24, 2006). Police confirm body female. Pg. A1.
49. Unknown Author. (November, 25, 2006). Help sought finding missing metro woman. Pg. B7.
50. Fairclough, I. (November 26, 2006). Remains ID'd as Conrad's: Family remembers slain woman as devoted mother. Pg. A1.
51. Fairclough, I. (November 28, 2006). Tips coming in after discovery of Conrad: Family thanks community for support after Valley woman's body found. Pg. B4.
52. Unknown Author. (November 29, 2006). Lives, interrupted. Pg. A1; B4.
53. Delaney, G. (December 2, 2006). Mourners bid farewell: Murder victim's family, friends fill church. Pg. B5.
54. Unknown Author. (December 7, 2006). Police await autopsy, test results. Pg. B2.
55. Unknown Author. (December 7, 2006). Four years on, woman's dad can only wait and wonder. Pg. B2.
56. Power, B. (December 10, 2006). Huge wave sweeps woman overboard: Picton Castle crew member missing off U.S. coast. Pg. A1.
57. Tutton, M. (December 11, 2006). Prospects bleak for missing sailor: Woman swept off tall ship on Friday is Bob Gainey's daughter. Pg. A1.
58. Ware, B. (December 12, 2006). Laura Gainey talked about clear nights and clear sailing. Pg. A3.
59. Montgomery, S. (December 16, 2006). Husband gets life for killing wife: Man stabbed pregnant young mother, dumped her naked body in a ditch. Pg. A5.
60. Shiers, K. (December 18, 2006). Gunmen took woman outside province. Pg. A1.
61. Unknown Author. (December 21, 2006). Missing woman reportedly seen. Pg. B7.
62. Unknown Author. (December 23, 2006). Police say missing C.B. woman has been spotted. Pg. B5.
63. Sunday Herald: The Nova Scotian. (January 21, 2007). Lost girls, lost souls. Pgs. 1-5.
64. Hayes, B. (January 28, 2007). Hope fades that mom, missing for year, will return. Pg. A6.

The Edmonton Journal

65. Meissner, D. (April 1, 2006). Grieving family seek answers to highway killings; [Final Edition]. Pg. G8.

66. Cormier, R. (April 21, 2006). Homicide detectives aid search for missing Mill Woods woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.

67. Audette, T., Loyie, F. & McLaren, A. (May 10, 2006). Another sex worker slain: Man charged; possible link to serial killings probed; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.

68. Audette, T., Sinnema, J., Loyie, F., Cormier, R. & Kleiss, K. (May 11, 2006). Victim missing 2 months: Theresa Innes known as popular, easygoing; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.

69. Loyie, F., Cormier, R. & Warnica, R. (May 20, 2006). Latest victim was street prostitute; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.

70. Shortt, A. (June 3, 2006). Raven and Ryka to the rescue: Dog handler and her German shepherd locate missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.

71. Unknown Author. (June 4, 2006). Highway of Tears report to go public; [Final Edition]. Pg. A16.

72. Unknown Author. (June 5, 2006). Search on for missing Canadian, U.S. climbers; [Final Edition]. Pg. A4.

73. Cormier, R. (June 15, 2006). Massive search for missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

74. Unknown Author. (June 16, 2006). Police seek public's help; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

75. Loyie, F. (June 22, 2006). Public's help sought in case of woman who went missing; [Final Edition]. B1.

76. Delisle, R. (June 23, 2006). Presumed victim of serial killer alive, well: Woman on 'missing' list living in Sask.; [Final Edition]. Pg. B12.

77. Sands, A. (July 17, 2006). Search of river fails to find missing teen; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.

78. Unknown Author. (August 31, 2006). Foul play suspected in Alberta lookout observer's disappearance; [Final Edition]. Pg. A3.

79. Unknown Author. (October 11, 2006). Police expand probe into missing woman case; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.

80. Unknown Author. (October 13, 2006). Victoria woman's DNA found at B.C. pig farm; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.

81. Unknown Author. (November 1, 2006). Missing woman's body pulled from river; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.

82. Purdy, C. (November 24, 2006). White swore he'd never hurt his wife; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.

83. Audette, T., Kleiss, K., Purdy, C., Staples, D., & Cormier, R. (January 3, 2007). Stumbled over body in bush, Svelka told police; [Final Edition]. Pg. A3.

84. Audette, T. (January 13, 2006). Homicide stats include missing fire tower worker; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.

85. Unknown Author. (February 14, 2007). Death of student shocks campus; [Early Edition]. Pg. B5.

86. Levitz, S. (February 15, 2007). Missing women mourned; [Final Edition]. Pg. F7.

The Gazette

87. Unknown Author. (May 17, 2006). Police search dump for body; [Final Edition]. Pg. A12.
88. Unknown Author. (May 23, 2006). Missing woman turns up in Boston; [Final Edition]. Pg. A12.
89. Unknown Author. (June 6, 2006). Search on for Canadian climber; [Final Edition]. Pg. A15.
90. Fisher, R. (December 11, 2006). Gaineys no strangers to glory- and grief; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
91. Block, I. (December 12, 2006). No trace found from air; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
92. Marlow, I. (December 28, 2006). Accident victim's name no longer a mystery: Struck by car, she lies in unconscious in hospital; [Final Edition]. Pg. A14.
93. Edson, K. (March 1, 2007). SQ officers arrest suspect in convenience store robberies; [Final Edition]. Pg. F18.

The Globe and Mail

94. Harding, K. (May 18, 2006). Who is responsible for the deaths of 15 women? Pg. A7.
95. Salinas, E. (June 8, 2006). Missing Lower Mainland woman may have been missing in U.S. Pg. S4.
96. Unknown Author. (June 10, 2006). Woman 'missing' in B.C. had been living in U.S. Pg. S3.
97. Unknown Author. (June 10, 2006). RCMP requests search for missing woman. Pg. S3.
98. Hume, M. (June 22, 2006). These nine women have been killed or disappeared along one desolate stretch of road in B.C.: Now communities have a plan to stop the anguish on the 'highway of tears'. Pg. A1.
99. Unknown Author. (June 23, 2006). Woman missing since 1991 found in Saskatchewan. Pg. A5.
100. Curry, B. & Mick, H. (June 28, 2006). Ottawa police doubted crazed man's tale. Pg. A1.
101. Kwong, M. (July 14, 2006). Police show footage of missing woman. Pg. S2.
102. Kari, S. (August 16, 2006). City of Richmond plays down casino-crime allegations. Pg. S1.
103. Meissner, D. (September 11, 2006). Highway of Tears tip 'serious,' detective says. Pg. A7.
104. Matas, R. (October 11, 2006). New evidence found in case of missing woman. Pg. A11.
105. Fong, P. (October 24, 2006). Missing woman's family makes plea for her return. Pg. A7.

106. Fong, P. (October 25, 2006). Police search car of missing pregnant woman. Pg. A8.
107. Fong, P. (October 26, 2006). Volunteers to scour park for woman. Pg. S4.
108. Fong, P. (October 27, 2006). Burned body is missing B.C. woman. Pg. A12.
109. Matas, R. (December 5, 2006). One of 'missing' women found, giving kin hope. Pg. A10.
110. Walton, D. (January 3, 2007). Alberta man facing second murder charge. Pg. A1.
111. Moore, O. (January 4, 2007). Picton Castle arrives in port. Pg. A7.
112. Harding, K. (January 5, 2007). Albertan pleads not guilty in pair of killings. Pg. A5.
113. Armstrong, J. & Matas, R. (January 20, 2007). More than 'drug addicted prostitutes.' Pg. A12.
114. Levitz, S. (February 15, 2007). Hundreds march in B.C. to honour missing women. Pg. A10.
115. Akkad, O.E. (February 15, 2007). Woman feared trapped after house explosion. Pg. A11.
116. Unknown Author. (March 22, 2007). Woman's frozen body found beside car. Pg. A9.

The Ottawa Citizen
117. Unknown Author. (April 10, 2006). Police seek missing 84-year-old woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. C5.
118. Unknown Author. (April 11, 2006). Missing woman, 84, spent night outside; [Final Edition]. Pg. C3.
119. Unknown Author. (May 14, 2006). Tichborne woman, 81, missing and presumed dead after fire; [Final Edition]. Pg. A14.
120. Unknown Author. (May 10, 2006). Arrest in Alberta prostitute's killing; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.
121. Olding, M. (June 16, 2006). Assaults on native women ignored; [Final Edition]. Pg. A15.
122. Unknown Author. (June 16, 2006). Municipal workers find missing woman; [Early Edition]. Pg. F3.
123. Unknown Author. (August 14, 2006). Police seek to find woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. C3.
124. Unknown Author. (August 15, 2006). Missing woman found near her home; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.
125. Unknown Author. (October 27, 2006). British Columbia: Body identified as pregnant teacher; [Early Edition]. Pg. A4.
126. Seymour, A. (October 28, 2006). 'What happened to her?'; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
127. Seymour, A. (October 28, 2006). Lost before she disappeared; [Final Edition]. Pg. E7.
128. Seymour, A. & Thompson, A. (October 30, 2006). Jaw bones, teeth missing from bones in canal; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.

129. Beacon, B. (December 11, 2006). Gauthier helps Habs through GM's crisis; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.
130. Seymour, A., Arseniuk, M. & Cockburn, N. (January 27, 2007). Woman, 91, found dead after wandering outside: Left retirement home wearing a light sweater; [Final Edition]. Pg. E1.
131. Fournier, S. (February 22, 2007). Trying to put an end to the tears; [Final Edition]. Pg. A14.
132. Unknown Author. (March 21, 2007). Manitoba: Missing since January, body of woman found; [Final Edition]. Pg. A7.
133. Unknown Author. (March 30, 2007). Police seek help to find woman missing for a week; [Final Edition]. Pg. F7.

The StarPhoenix
134. Coolican, L. (May 12, 2006). Search for missing mom goes on: Family appeals for help in two-year-old case; [Final Edition]. Pg. A3.
135. Unknown Author. (June 7, 2006). Project X performance memorial to Regina woman missing 22 years; [Final Edition]. Pg. B6.
136. Haight, L. (June 24, 2006). Woman meets her children after 15 years; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
137. MacDonald, S. (July 1, 2006). Family awaits word on identity of remains; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
138. Gopal, J. (July 6, 2006). Police identify remains found near Dundurn; [Final Edition]. Pg. B7.
139. Unknown Author. (July 14, 2006). Man wants answers from B.C. police; [Final Edition]. Pg. A8.
140. Cowan, P. (July 15, 2006). Walk to remember missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.
141. Cowan, P. (July 17, 2006). Hundreds march to remember missing aboriginals; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.
142. Kyle, A. (August 14, 2006). Memorial walk honours spirit of missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.
143. Arrowsmith, L. (September 1, 2006). Search for missing forestry worker intensifies; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.
144. Cowan, P. (September 27, 2006). Code red alert urged for missing Native women; [Final Edition]. Pg. A13.
145. Unknown Author. (September 29, 2006). Woman reported missing found safe Thursday; [Final Edition]. Pg. A4.
146. Warren, J. (October 5, 2006). Parents of missing woman take their story to Ottawa; [Final Edition]. Pg. A4.
147. Unknown Author. (October 5, 2006). Police ask for help finding missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A7.
148. Haight, L. (October 19, 2006). Police seek missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A7.
149. Unknown Author. (November 7, 2006). Woman pleads guilty to faking abduction report; [Final Edition]. Pg. A7.

150. Unknown Author. (November 16, 2006). Police need help finding missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.
151. French, J. (December 11, 2006). Missing Sask. women not cold cases; [Final Edition]. Pg. A8.
152. Unknown Author. (December 12, 2006). Coast Guard suspends search for missing sailor; [Final Edition]. Pg. C8.
153. Unknown Author. (January 18, 2007). Missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B7.
154. Unknown Author. (January 25, 2007). Police seek help to find missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.
155. Unknown Author. (January 26, 2006). Missing woman returns home safely; [Final Edition]. Pg. A10.
156. Unknown Author. (January 27, 2007). City woman missing more than a week; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.
157. Unknown Author. (February 15, 2007). New information on missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A7.
158. Haight, L. & Adam, B.A. (February 16, 2007). Woman dies after leaving stranded vehicle in storm; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.
159. Unknown Author. (March 1, 2007). Regina police seek missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A4.
160. Unknown Author. (March 10, 2007). Police seek missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A9.

The Times-Colonist
161. Unknown Author. (June 9, 2006). Public's help sought in missing-woman case; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
162. Unknown Author. (July 13, 2006). Saanich woman missing since Monday; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
163. Unknown Author. (July 14, 2006). RCMP release video of missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A5.
164. Unknown Author. (August 19, 2006). Caption only; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
165. Shaw, R. (August 27, 2006). Missing Saanich woman mourned; [Final Edition]. Pg. A3.
166. Unknown Author. (September 15, 2006). Reward offered in case of woman who vanished from forestry tower; [Final Edition]. Pg. D12.
167. Unknown Author. (September 24, 2006). Helicopter disappears, Canadian missing; [Final Edition]. Pg. A2.
168. Unknown Author. (September 28, 2006). Police searching for missing Langford woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.
169. Unknown Author. (September 29, 2006). Caption only; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.
170. Unknown Author. (September 30, 2006). Woman's car found, but still no clue as to whereabouts; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.
171. Unknown Author. (October 4, 2006). Missing Island woman found in Eastern Canada, police say; [Final Edition]. Pg. B4.

172. Dickson, L. (October 11, 2006). '91 case linked to Pickton probe; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
173. Culbert, L. & Dickson, L. (October 12, 2006). Police hope to lay charges in missing woman case; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
174. Unknown Author. (October 22, 2006). Police appeal for help to find vanished woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.
175. Auld, A. (December 10, 2006). Search for woman missing in Atlantic to continue today; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.
176. Unknown Author. (November 5, 2007). Caption only; [Final Edition]. Pg. A2.
177. Unknown Author. (January 6, 2007). North Saanich woman, 43, missing; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
178. Ward, D. & Cox, W. (January 14, 2007). Long road led to trial of Pickton: 26 women, one man charged in their deaths; [Final Edition]. Pg. D1.
179. Culbert, L. (January 14, 2007). Six lives: a patchwork quilt: 'Devoted' mother just vanished, says friend; [Final Edition]. Pg. D6.
180. Culbert, L. & Mertl, S. (January 14, 2007). 'Gentle soul' learned to battle the mean streets; [Final Edition]. Pg. D6.
181. Unknown Author. (February 17, 2007). Woman on wheelchair scooter missing; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
182. Unknown Author. (February 22, 2007). Caption only; [Final Edition]. Pg. A3.
183. Unknown Author. (February 28, 2006). Body identified as missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

The Toronto Star
184. Mitchell, B. (May 31, 2006). Police seek missing woman, 31; [Ont Edition]. Pg. B2.
185. Unknown Author. (June 4, 2006). News Ticker; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. A11.
186. Joling, D. (June 9, 2006). Searchers fear climbing duo stranded without food, fuel; Cloud stalls Alaska search pair need food, fuel; [MET Edition]. Pg. A19.
187. Pron, N. & Freed, D.A. (June 25, 2006). COLD CASES: Behind the 'forgotten' 25; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. A10.
188. Freed, D. A. & Pron, N. (June 25, 2006). Distinct beginnings, common endings; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. A11.
189. Rennie, S. (July 17, 2006). Stabbing victim's death stuns food shop workers; 'She was very nice. She always came in and did her job:' Police say body dumped in alley, woman killed elsewhere; [MET Edition]. Pg. A2.
190. Srikanthan, T. (September 24, 2006). Canadian woman missing in Nepal; Bad weather delays search for 24 aboard chartered flight; [MET Edition]. Pg. A3.
191. Unknown Author. (October 13, 2006). Brief; [MET Edition]. Pg. A6.
192. Doolittle, R. (July 29, 2006). Charge laid in woman's death; Police say 'community support' led to arrest: 20-year-olds body was found in garbage bag; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. A2.

193. Girard, D. (January 20, 2007). Families eager, afraid to know truth; Women's kin to finally learn their fate but know 'reality is going to whack you'; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. A13.

194. Unknown Author. (January 24, 2007). Toronto; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. C4.

195. Unknown Author. (February 3, 2007). 75-year-old woman lay helpless as car towed; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. A15.

196. Unknown Author. (February 12, 2007). Toronto; [Ont. Edition]. Pg. C2.

The Vancouver Sun

197. Unknown Author. (April 25, 2006). Geraldo to film story of young woman missing in Las Vegas; [Final C Edition]. Pg. B3.

198. Unknown Author. (May 30, 3006). Body of missing Quesnel woman found; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.

199. Unknown Author. (June 1, 2006). Missing woman last seen in Richmond; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

200. Unknown Author. (June 1, 2006). Police seek help in finding missing woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

201. Unknown Author. (June 2, 2006). Missing woman's body found; [Final C Edition]. Pg. B3.

202. Fowlie, J. (June 6, 2006). Human remains found in bushes may be those of missing woman Rong Lilly Li; [Final C Edition]. Pg. B2.

203. Culbert, L. (June 7, 2006). Woman who vanished in 1984 found alive in U.S.; [Final C Edition]. Pg. A1.

204. Hall, N. (June 7, 2006). Police still won't say if human remains found in wooded area are those of missing woman; [Final C Edition]. Pg. B2.

205. Culbert, L. (June 10, 2006). Police confirm ID of 'missing' woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.

206. Unknown Author. (June 10, 2006). Parents want help finding teen daughter; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.

207. Unknown Author. (June 12, 2006). Woman reported missing chose not to contact family; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

208. Culbert, L. & Hansen, D. (June 23, 2006). Woman on poster contacts police, says she's alive; [Final C Edition]. Pg. A3.

209. Ward, D. (June 27, 2006). Missing woman's kin: Peace at home is first; [Final Edition]. Pg. B3.

210. Hall, N. (July 14, 2006). Police find van, but not woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.

211. Vassalio, J. (September 16, 2006). Woman says Highway of Tears cold cases must be reopened; [Final Edition]. Pg. B7.

212. Vassalio, J. (September 21, 2006). Family of missing woman march the Highway of Tears; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.

213. Humphreys, A. (September 25, 2006). Heavy rain hampers effects to locate missing helicopter carrying 24 people; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.

214. Bohn, G. (September 28, 2006). Man charged in 'targeted' murder; [Final Edition]. Pg. B5.

215. Culbert, L. (October 11, 2006). Victoria sex trade worker linked to Pickton case; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.
216. Culbert, L. (October 12, 2006). Victoria woman's DNA at pig farm; [Final Edition]. Pg. A2.
217. Hansen, D. (October 23, 2006). Family fears the worst in mysterious disappearance of pregnant mother; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
218. Bolan, K. (October 24, 2006). Family makes desperate plea for daughter's safe return; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
219. Bolan, K. (October 25, 2006). Teacher 'untroubled' when last seen; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
220. Bolan, K. (October 26, 2006). Missing woman's kin await body ID; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
221. Bolan, K. (October 26, 2006). Missing woman and her husband a love story from moment they met; [Final Edition]. Pg. A6.
222. Bolan, K. (October 27, 2006). Who murdered Manjit and her unborn child?; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
223. Culbert, L. (November 11, 2006). Pain in the faces; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.
224. Hall, N. (November 18, 2006). 60-year-old arrested in 1990 murder case; [Final Edition]. Pg. B7.
225. Culbert, L. (December 4, 2006). Missing woman found alive; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.
226. Culbert, L. (January 12, 2007). Never to be forgotten: Series: Prelude to Pickton Trial; [Final Edition]. Pg. A4.
227. Culbert, L. (January 13, 2007). Lives remembered; [Final C Edition]. Pg. A4.
228. Hall, N. & Culbert, L. (January 22, 2007). Public to finally hear details today; [Final Edition]. Pg. A4.
229. Shore, R. (January 23, 2007). Victims honoured in ceremony outside court; [Final C Edition]. Pg. A4.
230. Wilson, T. (February 3, 2007). Leaving woman in car was a shocking oversight; [Final Edition]. Pg. C3.
231. Ward, D. (February 15, 2007). Sereena Abotsway once joined missing women march: Now she's among the dead honoured; [Final Edition]. Pg. B1.
232. Unknown Author. (March 5, 2007). Police hunt for missing schizophrenic woman; [Final Edition]. Pg. B2.
233. Hall, N. (March 6, 2007). Police reveal anonymous letter believed to be from killer of woman who went missing in 2002; [Final C Edition]. Pg. B2.
234. Bolan, K. (March 12, 2007). Husband and his brother charged; [Final Edition]. Pg. A1.

The Winnipeg Free Press
235. Unknown Author. (July 2, 2006). Native women under siege. Pg. B2.
236. Unknown Author. (January 23, 2007). Memory of murdered sex workers will live on. Pg. A6.
237. Unknown Author. (January 24, 2007). Manitoba's missing lives. Pg. B1.

238.   Owen, B. & McIntyre, M. (March 2, 2007). Three charged after body found. Pg. A6.
239.   Unknown Author. (March 6, 2007). In Brief. Pg. B2.
240.   Unknown Author. (March 15, 2007). RCMP searching for Gimli woman. Pg. A6.

REFERENCE LIST

Amnesty International. (2004). *Stolen sisters: A human rights response to discrimination and violence against Indigenous women in Canada*. Ottawa.

Bailey, F. Y. (2006). "Images of women," in Merlo, A.V. & Pollock, J. M. (eds.), *Women, Law and Social Control*. Boston: Pearson Education, pp. 32-46.

Balos, B. & Fellows, M. L. (1999). A matter of prostitution: Becoming respectable. *New York City Law Review*, 74, pp. 1220-1303.

Bannerji, H. (2002). "A question of silence: Reflections on violence against women in communities of colour," in McKenna, K. M. J. & Larkin, J. (eds.), *Violence Against Women: New Canadian Perspectives*. Toronto: Inanna Publications, pp. 353-370.

Benedict, H. (1992). *Virgin or vamp: How the press covers sex crimes*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Benjamin, A. (2002). "The social and legal banishment of anti-racism: A black perspective," in Chan, W. & Mirchandani, K. (eds.), *Crimes of Colour: Racialization and the Criminal Justice System in Canada*. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 177-190.

Berns, N. (2004). *Framing the victim: Domestic violence, media and social problems*. New York: Aldine de Gruyer.

Boritch, H. (1997). *Fallen women: Female crime and criminal justice in Canada*. Toronto: Nelson, Thomson Publishing Company.

Boyer, Y. (2006). *The discussion paper series in Aboriginal health: Legal issues: First Nations, Metis, Inuit women's health*. Ottawa: National Aboriginal Health Organisation.

Brennan, S. (2006). *Keeping the 'lady' in line: A media study of the date rape drug discourse*. Simon Fraser University: MA Thesis.

Brock, D. (2000). "Victim, nuisance, fallen woman, outlaw, worker? Making the identity 'prostitute' in Canadian criminal law," in Chunn, D. E. & Lacombe, D. (eds.), *Law as a Gendering Practice*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 79-99.

Canadian Newspaper Association. (2007). *2007 Daily newspaper paid circulation data.* http://www.cna-acj.ca.

Carrington, K. (1998). "Post modernism and feminist criminologies: Disconnecting discourses?" in Daly, K., & Maher, L. (eds.), *Criminology at the crossroads: Feminist Readings in Crime and Justice.* New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 69-84.

Chartrand, L. & MacKay, C. (2006). *A review of research on criminal victimisation and First Nations, Metis and Inuit peoples, 1990-2001.* Ottawa: Canada Department of Justice.

Chase, S. E. (2001). "'Good' mothers and 'bad' mothers," in Chase, S. E. & Rogers, M. F. (eds.), *Mothers and Children: Feminist Analyses and Personal Narratives.* New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, pp. 30-47.

Comack, E. & Balfour, G. (2004). *The power to criminalise: Violence, inequality and the law.* Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Comack, E. (2006). "Introduction," in Balfour, G. & Comack, E. (eds.), *Criminalizing Women.* Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, pp. 58-78.

Cossins, A. (2003). Saints, sluts and sexual assault: Rethinking the relationship between sex, race and gender. *Social and Legal Studies*, 12, 1, pp. 77-103.

Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics and violence against women of colour. *Stanford Law Review*, 43, 6, pp. 1241-1299.

Crenshaw, K. (1993). "Beyond racism and misogyny: Black feminism and 2 Live Crew," in Matsuda, M.J., Lawrence, C.R. & Delgado, E. (eds.), *Words that Wound: Critical Race Theory; Assaultive Speech and the First Amendment.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press, pp. 111-132.

Culhane, D. & Taylor, R. (2000). "Theory and practice: Clinical law and Aboriginal people," in Chunn, D. E. & Lacombe, D. (eds.), *Law as a Gendering Practice.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 120-137.

Culhane, D. (2003). Their spirits live within us: Aboriginal women in Downtown Eastside Vancouver emerging into visibility. *American Indian Quarterly*, 27, 3-4, pp. 593-606.

Day, T. & McKenna, K. M. J. (2002). "The health-related economic costs of violence against women in Canada: The tip of the iceberg," in McKenna, K. M. J. & Larkin, J. (eds.), *Violence Against Women: New Canadian Perspectives.* Toronto: Inanna Publications, pp. 313-350.

Ericson, R., Baranek, P. & Chan, J. (1989). *Visualizing deviance: A study of news organiation*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Ericson, R., Baranek, P. & Chan, J. (1991). *Representing order: Crime, law, and justice in the news media*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Farley, M., Lynne, J., & Cotton, A. J. (2005). Prostitution in Vancouver: Violence and the colonisation of First Nations women. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 42, 2, pp. 242-271.

Gannon, M. & Mihorean, K. (2005). Criminal victimisation in Canada, 2004. *Juristat*, 25, 7.

Hallgrimsdottir, H. K., Phillips, R.., & Benoit, C. (2006). Fallen women and rescued girls: Social stigma and media narratives of the sex industry in Victoria, B.C. from 1980 to 2005. *The Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, 43, 3, pp. 265-280.

Harding, K. (November 3, 2006). "Man will testify in own defence on charges he murdered his wife," in *The Globe and Mail*, Pg. A11.

Hendrik, H. (1997). "Constructions and reconstructions of British childhood: An interpretive survey, 1800 to the present," in James, A. & Prout, A. (eds.), *Constructing and Reconstructing Childhood: Contemporary Issues in the Sociological Study of Childhood*. London: Falmer Press, pp. 34-62.

Henry, F. & Tator, C. (2000). *Racist discourse in Canada's English print media: Executive study*. Toronto: The Canadian Race Relations Foundation.

Henry, F. & Tator, C. (2006). *The colour of democracy: Racism in Canadian society*. Toronto: Nelson; Thompson Canada Ltd.

Hill Collins, P. (2000). *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment*. New York: Routledge.

hooks, b. (2000). *Feminist theory: From margin to center*. Cambridge, MA: Southend Press.

Hubbard, P. & Sanders, T. (2003). Making space for sex work: Female prostitution and the production of urban space. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 27, 1, pp. 75-89.

Hunt, A. (1999). *Governing morals: A social history of moral regulation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Jeffrey, L. (2004). "Prostitution as public nuisance: Prostitution policy in Canada," in Outshoorn, J. (ed.), *Politics of Prostitution: Women's Movements, Democratic States and the Globalisation of Sex Commerce*, pp. 83-102.

Jenks, C. (1996). *Childhood*. New York: Routledge.

Jiwani, Y. (2002a). "The 1999 general social survey on spousal violence: An analysis," in McKenna, K. & Larkin, J. (eds.), *Violence Against Women: New Canadian Perspectives*. Toronto: Inanna Publications, pp. 63-72.

Jiwani, Y. (2002b). "The criminalization of 'race,' the racialization of crime," in Chan, W. & Mirchandani, K. (eds.), *Crimes of Colour: Racialization and the Criminal Justice System in Canada*. Peterborough: Broadview Press, pp. 67-86.

Jiwani, Y. (2005). Walking a tightrope: The many faces of violence in the lives of racialised immigrant girls and young women. *Violence Against Women*, 11, 7, pp. 846-875.

Jiwani, Y. & Young, M. L. (2006). Missing and murdered women: Reproducing marginality in news discourse. *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 31, pp. 895-917.

Joseph, J. (2006). "Intersectionality of Race/Ethnicity, Class and Justice: Women of Colour," in Merlo, A.V. & Pollock, J. M. (eds.), *Women, Law and Social Control*. Boston: Pearson Education, pp. 292-312.

Johnson, H. & Sacco, V.F. (1995). Researching violence against women: Statistics Canada's national survey. *Canadian Journal of Criminology*, 37, 3, pp. 281-304.

Johnson, H. (2002). "Methods of measurement," in McKenna, K. & Larkin, J. (eds.), *Violence Against Women: New Canadian Perspectives*. Toronto: Inanna Publications, pp. 21-54.

Larkin, J. & McKenna, K. (2002). "Introduction," in McKenna, K. & Larkin, J. (eds.), *Violence Against Women: New Canadian Perspectives*. Toronto: Inanna Publications, pp. 9-18.

Larsen, E. N. (1996). The effect of different police enforcement policies on the control of prostitution. *Canadian Public Policy*, 22, 1, pp. 40-55.

Leng, W. (2008). www.missingpeople.net.

Lowman, J. (2000). Violence and the outlaw status of (street) prostitution in Canada. *Violence Against Women*, 6, 9, pp. 987-1011.

Lowman, J. (2001). *Identifying research gaps in the prostitution literature.* Ottawa: Research and Statistics Division, Department of Justice Canada.

Miller, J. & Schwartz, M. D. (1995). Rape myths and violence against street prostitutes. *Deviant Behaviour: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 16, pp. 1-23.

Madriz, E. (1997). *Nothing bad happens to good girls: Fear of crime in women's lives.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

McCooey, P. (January 26, 2008). "He thought of everything, except the crushing guilt; This report describes what happened to Jennifer Teague and is based on testimony and evidence presented at a preliminary hearing for Kevin Davis that was subject to a publication ban," in *The Ottawa Citizen*, Pg. A1.

Monture-Angus, P. (1995). *Thunder in my soul: A Mohawk woman speaks.* Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Monture-Angus, P. (1999). "Standing against Canadian law: Naming omissions of race, culture, and gender," in Comack, E. (ed.), *Locating Law: Race/Class/Gender Connections.* Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, pp. 76-94.

Mooney, J. (2000). *Gender, violence and the social order.* Basingstoke: MacMillan Press Limited.

National Clearinghouse on Family Violence (NCFV). (2002). *Woman abuse: Overview paper.* Ottawa: Family Violence Prevention Unit, Healthy Communities Division, Public Health Agency of Canada (PHAC), Centre for Healthy Human Development, Health Canada. Http://www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/ncfv-cnivf/familyviolence/html/femviof_e.html.

Patterson, M. J. (2005). *Who is missing?: A study of missing persons in B.C.* Simon Fraser University: MA Thesis.

Pitman, B. (2002). Re-mediating the spaces or reality television: *America's Most Wanted* and the case of Vancouver's missing women. *Environment and Planning*, 34, pp. 167-184.

Pollock, J. (2006). "Gender, justice and social control: A historical perspective," in Merlo, A and Pollock, J. (eds.), *Women, Law and Social Control.* New York: Pearson, pp. 3-31.

Ramp, W. (2000). "Moral spectacles: Norm and transgression in the news media," in Bauman, L. (ed.), *New Perspectives on Deviance: The Construction of Deviance in Everyday Life.* Scarborough: Prentice Hall, Allyn and Bacon Canada, pp. 18-49.

Razack, S. (1998). "What is to be gained looking white people in the eye?: Culture, race and gender in cases of sexual violence," in Daly, K. & Maher, L. (eds.), *Criminology at the Crossroads: Feminist Readings in Crime and Justice.* New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 225-245.

Razack, S. (2002). "Gendered racial violence and spatialized justice: The murder of Pamela George," in Razack, S. (ed.), *Race, Space and the Law: Unmapping a White Settler Society.* Toronto: Between the Lines, pp. 122-156.

Reinharz, S. (1992). *Feminist methods in social research.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Richardson, J. E. (2007). *Analysing newspapers: An approach from critical discourse analysis.* New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Robson, K. (2005). "Canada's most notorious bad mother": The newspaper coverage of the Jordan Heikamp inquest. *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology,* 42, 2, pp. 217-232.

Sangster, J. (2002). "Defining sexual promiscuity: 'Race', gender, and class in the operation of Ontario's Female Refugees Act, 1930-1960," in Chan, W. & Mirchandani, K. (eds.), *Crimes of Colour: Racialization and the Criminal Justice System in Canada.* Peterborough: Broadview Press, pp. 45-63.

Sangster, J. (2006). "Introduction to regulating girls and women." In Glasbeek, A. (ed.), *Moral Regulation and Governance in Canada: History, Context, and Critical Issues.* Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press Inc, pp. 31-55.

Schmuck Murray, G. (1998). *American children's literature and the construction of childhood.* New York: Twayne Publishers.

Seshia, M. (2005). *The unheard speak out: Street sexual exploitation in Winnipeg.* Ottawa: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives.

Sev'er, A. (2002). "Exploring the continuum: Sexualized violence by men and male youth against women and girls," in McKenna, K. M. J. & Larkin, J. (eds.), *Violence Against Women: New Canadian Perspectives.* Toronto: Inanna Publications, pp. 73-92.

Stanko, E. (1990). "When precaution is normal: A feminist critique of crime prevention," in Gelsthorpe, L. & Morris, A. (eds.), *Feminist Perspectives in Criminology.* Buckingham: Open University Press, pp. 173-183.

Stanko, E. (1995). "Gendered criminological policies: Femininity, masculinity and violence," in Barlow, H. (ed.), *Crime and Public Policy: Putting Theory to Work.* Boulder: Westview Press, pp. 207-226.

Stanko, E. (1997). Safety talk: Conceptualising women's risk assessment as a 'technology of the soul'. *Theoretical Criminology*, 1, 4, pp. 479-499.

Statistics Canada. (2006). *Measuring violence against women: Statistical trends 2006.* Ottawa: Minister of Industry, Statistics Canada.

Sunderland, J. (2004). *Gendered discourses.* New York: Palgrave McMillan.

Thurer, S. L. (1994). *The myths of motherhood: How culture reinvents the good mother.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Valverde, M. (2006). "Introduction to the age of light, soap and water," in Glasbeek, A. (ed.), *Moral Regulation and Governance in Canada: History, Context, and Critical Issues.* Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press Inc, pp. 117-141.

Valverde, M. & Weir, L. (2006). "The struggles of the immoral: Preliminary remarks on moral regulation," in Glasbeek, A. (ed.), *Moral Regulation and Governance in Canada: History, Context, and Critical Issues.* Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press Inc, pp. 75-84.

van Zoonen, L. (1994). *Feminist Media Studies.* London: Sage.

Walsh, C. (2001). *Gender and discourse: Language and power in politics, the Church and organisations.* Harlow: Pearson Education Ltd.

Weaver, C. K., Carter, C. & Stanko, E. (2000). "The female body at risk: Media, sexual violence and the gendering of public environments," in Allan, S., Adam, B. & Carter, C. (eds.), *Environmental Risks and the Media.* New York: Routledge, pp. 171-183.

Wilcox, P. (2005). Beauty and the beast: Gendered and raced discourse in the news. *Social and Legal Studies*, 14, 4, pp. 515-532.

Wykes, M. (2001). *News, Crime and Culture.* London: Pluto Press.