

**“YOU DON’T HAVE TO BE A SCOTCHMAN”:
SPORT AND THE EVOLUTION OF THE VANCOUVER CALEDONIAN
GAMES, 1893-1926**

By

Eric Heath

B.A. (Honours), Simon Fraser University, 2003

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL
FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

in the Department
of
History

© Eric Heath 2005
SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
Spring 2005

All rights reserved. This work may not be reproduced in whole
or in part, by photocopy or other means, without permission of
the author.

APPROVAL

NAME: Eric Heath

DEGREE: Master of Arts (History)

TITLE: “You Don’t Have to be a Scotchman”: Sport and the Evolution of the Vancouver Caledonian Games, 1893-1926

EXAMINING COMMITTEE:

Jack Little
Senior Supervisor

Ian Dyck
Supervisor

Stephen Duguid
External Examiner

Date Approved: 15 April 2005

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY



PARTIAL COPYRIGHT LICENCE

The author, whose copyright is declared on the title page of this work, has granted to Simon Fraser University the right to lend this thesis, project or extended essay to users of the Simon Fraser University Library, and to make partial or single copies only for such users or in response to a request from the library of any other university, or other educational institution, on its own behalf or for one of its users.

The author has further granted permission to Simon Fraser University to keep or make a digital copy for use in its circulating collection.

The author has further agreed that permission for multiple copying of this work for scholarly purposes may be granted by either the author or the Dean of Graduate Studies.

It is understood that copying or publication of this work for financial gain shall not be allowed without the author's written permission.

Permission for public performance, or limited permission for private scholarly use, of any multimedia materials forming part of this work, may have been granted by the author. This information may be found on the separately catalogued multimedia material and in the signed Partial Copyright Licence.

The original Partial Copyright Licence attesting to these terms, and signed by this author, may be found in the original bound copy of this work, retained in the Simon Fraser University Archive.

W. A. C. Bennett Library
Simon Fraser University
Burnaby, BC, Canada

ABSTRACT

The Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society (VSACS), which included a number of the local élite, initiated its Caledonian Games soon after the city was born. Understanding that spectators were drawn largely by sports events, the VSACS began promoting these as the feature attraction, and by the early 1910s the Games were one of Vancouver's foremost track meets. World War One stalled the Games' progress, but in the 1920s the VSACS promoted them as a vehicle of city pride and development, resulting in the Games' inclusion in the Greater Vancouver Exhibition. The organizers had succeeded during an era when similar events across North America were in decline by promoting the Games as an athletic event rather than an exclusive celebration of Scottish cultural identity. That the city's annual booster fair bore a distinctively Scottish imprint nevertheless suggests much about the nature of "British" cultural identity and hegemony in early Vancouver.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Although authorship of this work is credited to me, I could not have dreamed of completing it without the input, guidance, and wisdom of many people. Dr. Jack Little, my senior supervisor, provided invaluable criticisms, comments, and corrections to the countless drafts that I submitted to him. If I have any claim to understanding Scottish-Canadian history, I owe it to him. I would also like to thank Dr. Ian Dyck, who has encouraged me since my days in his undergraduate honours class, and volunteered his time as secondary supervisor for this thesis. I must also thank Dr. Michael Prokopow, who, in his time at Simon Fraser University, piqued my interest in the discipline of history. Without his influence, I would never have considered undertaking such a project.

The entire graduate cohort at Simon Fraser University has made these past two years the most exciting and intellectually stimulating in my life. I owe a particular debt to Harry McGrath, whose answers to my impromptu questions in the History Department computer lab have often turned me towards sources that I might have erstwhile ignored.

My parents, Rick and Diane Heath, have provided solid support for my academic pursuits throughout my life, and I am truly thankful for everything that they have provided me over the years. Finally, I must thank Andrea Dahl, who has been an amazing influence throughout the entire process of creating this thesis. Her presence in my life has been my greatest motivation to succeed. If not for her love, encouragement, suggestions, and gentle nudging to start writing, I would be staring at a blank computer screen to this day.

CONTENTS

Approval	ii
Abstract.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
List of Tables and Figures	vi
Introduction.....	1
Chapter One	
Laying Foundations: Origins of the Highland Games and Sport in British Columbia	14
Chapter Two	
First Steps: The Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society’s Games, 1893-1908	25
Chapter Three	
Changing Meanings: The Games in Peace and War, 1909-1918	46
Chapter Four	
Final Destination: The Vancouver Caledonian Games and Civic Development, 1919-1926.....	64
Conclusion	78
Appendix: Vancouver Caledonian Games: Dates, Locations, Financial Results, 1893-1926.....	84
Bibliography	85

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 1 - Ethnic Origin of Athletes in Vancouver Caledonian Games, by Surname 73

Figure 1 - Advertisement for the Union Steamship Company and the 1894 Vancouver Caledonian Games. (*Vancouver World*, 6 August 1894) 34

Figure 2 - Advertisement for the 1926 Vancouver Caledonian Games. (Vancouver Province, 6 August 1926)..... 75

INTRODUCTION

The Vancouver Caledonian Games were the creation of the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society (VSACS). Founded in 1886, the society, like other Scottish societies in North America, aimed to foster and promote Scottish culture among its members as well as within the community. The VSACS pursued these goals most visibly with its Caledonian Games, which it administered from their inception in 1893 until the 1950s. For the first few years of the Games' existence, the society organized them on a shoestring budget. These early years allowed the VSACS to develop its organizational skills, and by the turn of the twentieth century, the society strove to turn the Games into one of Vancouver's premier sporting events. Having achieved this goal by the 1910s, the society turned its attentions to using the Games as an apparatus of civic development. The VSACS wanted the Games not only to be a showcase for the capabilities of Vancouver, but also a tool for developing the city's future citizens. In 1926, the Vancouver Caledonian Games were incorporated into the Greater Vancouver Exhibition, British Columbia's largest fair. This paper will examine the Vancouver Caledonian Games' progression from their origins as a small Scottish celebration to being a large sporting event designed to boost civic pride.

It is difficult to place the Highland Games within a single category of historical study. At a basic level, the Games are simply public celebration. Deeper than this, though, the Games are products of a series of complex interactions. At the Highland Games, sport and "Scottishness" intertwine. Fact and myth blend in descriptions of the Games' history. Place the Games in the context of late nineteenth and early twentieth century Vancouver and new relationships emerge. As a sport, the Games changed as the

competitive nature of professional sport challenged the ideals of amateurism. The Games had to adapt, as symbols of Scottish pride lost some of their significance in the face of a more diverse population in Vancouver. Additionally, the reaction to this diversity by the city's majority British population hints at why an ostensibly Scottish event prospered.

Highland Games had been a part of the North American sporting landscape for at least a half-century by 1893, and had achieved their greatest level of popular recognition and celebration between about 1865 and 1880. By the 1890s, however, the number of Games in North America was in rapid decline. Gerald Redmond argues that the main cause for the demise of the Games in the United States was the concomitant development of intercollegiate track and field, which he suggests was more approachable as a sporting event in the American cultural "melting pot."¹ Though largely based on Highland games in structure², the track meet was divorced from "the trappings of Scottish pageantry and peculiar Scottish events like caber-tossing and Highland dancing."³ Redmond, therefore, presents the decline of the Games in the United States in ironic terms: the Highland Games spawned the modern American track meet, which in turn largely caused the Games' decline. In addition, he argues that many Scottish societies in the United States were guilty of abandoning the promotion of Scottish heritage in favour of enhancing the profitability of the Games, generally by allowing non-Scots to participate in the sports.⁴ This decline of "Scottishness" helped decrease the popularity of the Games in the United States. However, in Canada, according to Redmond, the increased popularity of track and field was "only a temporary distraction to the Highland Games" because "the Scottish

¹ Gerald Redmond, *The Caledonian Games in Nineteenth-Century America* (Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1971), 73-96.

² Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 77.

tradition was so firmly rooted.”⁵ However, he does not give examples to support this claim. Apart from Vancouver, there appear to be few consistently held Highland Games in Canada during the early 1900s. Further research into the decline of the Caledonian Games in Canada is necessary, however, to explain why this is.

Historian Robert G. Carroon makes a similar argument to Redmond, though in a more overt manner. Reflecting on the Milwaukee Highland Games, which existed from 1867 until 1914, Carroon argues that deviation from Scottish tradition caused their demise.⁶ Carroon notes that, starting in 1891, athletic competitions at the Games were no longer limited to “men and women of Scottish birth [and] ancestry.” Furthermore, the Games’ organizers began including events such as bicycle races that were not “strictly Scottish.”⁷ These changes, he argues, altered the Games’ “character” beyond repair, and led “to their ultimate demise in Milwaukee.”⁸ Although Carroon admits that these changes resulted in large increases in attendance and revenue, he insists that they were still the primary cause of the Games’ death.⁹ Confusing the matter further, Carroon mentions wartime tensions between Milwaukee’s British and German populations. However, he does not fully explore the possibility that the city’s Scots did not want to exacerbate this ethnic divide with a celebration of their heritage.¹⁰ Carroon’s confusion stems from his assumption of an integral link between the seeming decline of Scottish symbolism and the decline of the Games as an event. The example of the Vancouver

³ Gerald Redmond, *The Sporting Scots of Nineteenth Century Canada* (East Rutherford, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1982), 199-200.

⁴ Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 65-66; 115.

⁵ Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 201.

⁶ Robert G. Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” *Milwaukee History* 2, no.4 (Winter 1979): 108-120.

⁷ Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” 116.

⁸ Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” 116.

⁹ Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” 116.

Games, explored by this thesis, suggests that combining these two interpretations of the “decline” of the Highland games is fallacious.

The confusion over the decline of the North American Highland Games is merely a symptom of a greater problem. As noted above, the various Highland Games celebrations in North America emerged from local Scottish societies as a means of celebrating and promoting Scottish heritage and national identity. Similarly, many authors of recent works about the Highland Games adopt a celebratory tone in their works. Drawing largely from comments from nineteenth century Games organizers and patrons, these authors conclude proudly that the Highland Games have always been a purely Scottish form of national celebration. For example, David Webster’s 1973 work, *Scottish Highland Games*, lauds the Highland Games as the source of the “real spirit of Scottish Highland gatherings” seen “on the shining faces of the young dancers and athletes.”¹¹ Emily Ann Donaldson’s *The Scottish Highland Games in America* sees the Games as a synecdoche: they are not just at a celebration, but also “a representation of a way of life.”¹² The Games, she states, are “a common bond that unites us all,” and the various sights and sounds “are experiences that ‘shake up our genes.’”¹³ While Donaldson’s book (like Webster’s and Redmond’s works) provides a starting point for study of the topic, it reads as a 250-page celebration of the greatness of the Games to Scots in the United States, rather than a critical study of their importance. Alyce Taylor Cheska applies this trope in “The Antigonish Highland Games: A Community’s Involvement in the Scottish Festival of Eastern Canada,” which celebrates the continuity

¹⁰ Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” 119.

¹¹ David Webster, *Scottish Highland Games* (Edinburgh: Macdonald Printers, 1973), 23.

¹² Emily Ann Donaldson, *The Scottish Highland Games in America* (Gretna, LA: Pelican Publishing, 1986), 6.

of the Antigonish Games from their inception in 1862, thanks to the Antigonish Highland Society “striving to maintain their ancestors’ culture and traditions.”¹⁴ Cheska pieces together a history of the Games based largely on Webster’s work as well as tenuous claims from Highland Games programmes. Drawing on limited sources, Cheska argues that the Games were a true and consistent representation of Nova Scotia’s Scottish heritage, though there appear to be large gaps when the Games either were not held or received minimal attention.¹⁵

Indeed, the Antigonish Games do not appear to have been revitalized until the 1950s, after the period of time in which, according to Ian McKay, Nova Scotia’s Scottish identity was “constructed” from a series of “hazy generalizations and ethnic stereotypes.”¹⁶ McKay describes a Scottish festival in 1876 that “featured Scottish music *and* a baseball game – and a noteworthy absence of claims about the supposed Scottish essence of the province.”¹⁷ He argues that Scottish societies and the Nova Scotia government earnestly promoted the province’s Scottish identity, partly because of a desire to support Scottish tradition (even if it was hazily conceived), but also as a ploy to attract tourists.¹⁸ Although authors such as Webster, Donaldson, and Cheska are trying to justify the Games’ current existence as a “traditional” and “authentic” form of Scottish culture, their use of selective and often questionable evidence undermines their arguments. McKay suggests a stronger conjunction between modern and anti-modern

¹³ Donaldson, *The Scottish Highland Games*, 6.

¹⁴ Alyce Taylor Cheska, “The Antigonish Highland Games: A Community’s Involvement in the Scottish Festival of Eastern Canada,” *Nova Scotia Historical Review* 3, no. 1 (1983): 51; Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 51.

¹⁵ Cheska, “The Antigonish Highland Games,” 59-61.

¹⁶ Cheska, “The Antigonish Highland Games,” 61-62; Ian McKay, “Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954,” *Acadiensis* 21, no. 2 (Spring 1992): 8.

¹⁷ McKay, “Tartanism Triumphant,” 14.

¹⁸ McKay, “Tartanism Triumphant,” 18, 21-23.

ideas in Canadian Scottish identity than these other authors do.

While I contest the academic value of works such as Webster's and Cheska's, the intent of this thesis is not to "expose" the claims to tradition in Highland Games as being "invented." Hugh Trevor-Roper undertook this task in his debunking of modern Highland identity in "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland," which argues that "the whole concept of a distinct Highland culture and tradition is a retrospective invention."¹⁹ While Trevor-Roper's evidence is fundamentally sound, his argument carries with it the implicit idea that this Highland tradition is devoid of "real" meaning. Regardless of the origins of these traditions, North American Scottish Societies were sincerely attempting to promote and celebrate their conception of Scottish heritage – a conception that they wished to share with those competing in, and attending, the Highland Games.

In much of the current body of literature on the Highland Games, deviations from that which is "strictly Scottish" at a particular Games is interpreted as a diminution of their "true" character. As described earlier, this double definition of "decline" in the Highland Games is tantamount to essentializing some idea of "Scottishness" in order to describe the Games' survival and success. While this might seem commonsensical at first – the Highland Games are Scottish, after all – a closer examination reveals it to be absurd.

If one accepts the main tenet of Trevor-Roper's argument – that "ancient" Highland tradition is in actuality a rather recent invention – then one must also accept that this tradition is a malleable one. The recent resurgence of interest in Highland

tradition and the Highland Games, though outside the scope of this thesis, speaks to this idea. Many contemporary competitors in the Highland Games (and certainly many of the spectators) are of partial Scottish ancestry; some have no Scottish antecedents whatsoever. The North American Scottish Games Athletics (NASGA) organization listed no fewer than 278 Highland Games in North America for the calendar year 2004, which implies a wide following.²⁰ Although there are many Scottish surnames among competitors, the NASGA database lists many French, German, Slavic, and Italian names (among others).²¹ Indeed, though the Games have moved away from being “strictly Scottish,” their popularity is currently rising. My study of the Vancouver Caledonian Games will demonstrate that this is by no means a recent trend. The Vancouver Games achieved a high level of popularity while maintaining a distinctive Scottish character, all the while diverging from the notion of strict “Scottishness” that other authors have ascribed as being essential to the survival of the Games.

The definition of “Scottishness” used in this thesis is based largely on E.J.

Cowan’s apt dissection of the term in “The Myth of Scotch Canada”:

‘Scottishness’, which is a notoriously difficult term to define, might be reaffirmed, experienced, or invented through such community activities as meetings of Scottish societies or Caledonian games. Music, literature, or costume might all play their part... What is included in such activities is an ongoing process of self-mythologization by people, who, for one reason or another, feel themselves to be Scots.²²

The symbols evoked in the above description – Caledonian Games, Scottish music and

¹⁹ Hugh Trevor-Roper, “The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland,” in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.), *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 15.

²⁰ North American Scottish Games Athletics (NASGA) website [online], 2004.

²¹ NASGA website.

²² Edward J. Cowan. “The Myth of Scotch Canada,” in Marjory Harper and Michael E. Vance (eds.), *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory* (Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1999), 49-50.

dress, and so on – all have roots in some era of Scottish history. However, the process of self-mythologization is manifested through a constant and overt re-affirmation of these symbols' *importance* to Scottish heritage. To paraphrase Benedict Anderson, the Caledonian Games are a cultural product of an imagined Scottish community.²³ The presence of this community in Vancouver served in part to buoy the Games by creating a notion of Scottishness, which, though malleable, was not entirely inclusive. As the Games increased in prominence, their unique identity became more closely tied to that of the city itself.

Purposes of the Study

This thesis is on one level intended to chronicle the Vancouver Caledonian Games from their beginning in 1893 until 1926, when they were incorporated into the Greater Vancouver Exhibition (the forerunner of today's Pacific National Exhibition). After struggling for survival during their first decade of existence, the Games became one of Vancouver's largest sporting events by the 1920s. The Games' structure changed dramatically over this time span. Beginning as a ramshackle gathering played with borrowed equipment, they grew to the point where they were a focal point of the city's marketed image. Competitors trained with the Games specifically in mind; sporting organizations fielded teams in events once contested by unaffiliated individuals; organizers polished the appearance of the sports to ensure sophistication.

The changes that the Games experienced as a sporting event relate to how they evolved as a Scottish festival during this period. Much of the extant literature on the topic of Highland Games portrays them as purely a Scottish institution unable to respond

²³ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, revised ed. (London: Verso, 1991), 141-143.

to the changes in sport, society, and the communities that surrounded and hosted them. Though the Highland Games were a celebration of Scottish heritage based on the image of the Highlander, this did not imply in any way that they were static in their constitution or their purpose. Were the Highland Games an immutable institution so reactionary that change from the “strictly Scottish” caused their downfall, as some authors have suggested? If so, then why did Vancouver’s Caledonian Games emerge and flourish in an era when many other cities’ Games disappeared? Did the inclusion of non-Scottish events and competitors alter the Games beyond recognition? How adaptable were the Games and their organizers in terms of anticipating or reacting to changing social conditions? The experience of Vancouver’s Caledonian Games in the years 1893-1926 sheds light on these questions, as well as the theoretical paradigms that have informed previous discussions about the Highland Games in North America.

This history is, on another level, a case study of a sporting event in early Vancouver. Several scholars have written on various aspects of Vancouver’s sports at this time, but a comprehensive picture is lacking. Robin Anderson’s article, “‘On the Edge of the Baseball Map’ with the 1908 Vancouver Beavers,” suggests that members of Vancouver’s middle and upper class supported professional sport during a period when central and eastern Canadian organizations touted the moral value of amateur sport. In short, Anderson argues that “the middle class social reform impulse was far weaker in Vancouver.”²⁴ However, it was precisely this impulse that prompted the VSACS to decide in 1911 to limit the Caledonian Games to amateur athletes, which suggests that Anderson’s thesis requires qualification.

²⁴ Robin John Anderson, “‘On the Edge of the Baseball Map’ with the 1908 Vancouver Beavers,” *Canadian Historical Review* 74, no. 4 (1993): 540.

Most of the information about the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society was found in their minute book, which is deposited in the City of Vancouver Archives. The society minutes were invaluable in providing organizational detail, especially in the early years of the Games when the organizers were still very inexperienced and their plans were documented thoroughly. For most years, the minute books also contain financial records from the Games. Other information about the Caledonian Games comes from a variety of sources including local newspaper reports and Games programmes. The newspaper accounts were valuable for identifying competitors' names, event results, and attendance figures, which were generally absent from the society's records. Changes in media coverage of the Games were also indicative of public perception. Whereas newspapers tended to place reports of the earliest Caledonian Games on their community page, by 1910, they were prominent in the sports pages.

Save for a small number of peripheral references, the Vancouver Caledonian Games are unmentioned in the existing histories of North American Caledonian Games, Canadian sport, or the city of Vancouver. Still, several works on Vancouver's history have influenced this thesis. Robert McDonald's *Making Vancouver: Class, Status, and Social Boundaries, 1863-1913* cogently analyzes class and status stratification in early Vancouver, though the author is somewhat reticent to link a particular ethnicity to the city's cultural image. Regardless, this study borrows his classifications of Vancouver's social strata.²⁵ Patricia Roy's *Vancouver: An Illustrated History* provides a good overview of the city's development during the period of this study. Roy's two works on

²⁵ Robert A.J. McDonald, *Making Vancouver: Class, Status, and Social Boundaries, 1863-1913* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1996).

racial tension in Vancouver as well as Peter Ward's *White Canada Forever* paint a vivid picture of the city's developing cultural identity.²⁶ Two older non-academic works, Eric Nicol's *Vancouver* and Alan Morley's *Vancouver: From Milltown to Metropolis*, provide vivid depictions of many aspects of life for early Vancouverites, although they are lacking in analysis.²⁷ This study will not only present the story of the Vancouver Games, but also place them within the context of British Columbian and Canadian sport history, and elaborate on their importance in the developing city of Vancouver.

The first chapter of the thesis provides the historical background to the Vancouver Games. Starting with the origins of Highland Gatherings in medieval Scotland, the chapter discusses the eventual rebirth of the Games in Scotland and North America in the nineteenth century. It also details some of the early developments in British Columbian and Canadian sport history.

The second chapter examines the development of the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society and the Vancouver Caledonian Games from 1886 (the date of the incorporation of the VSACS) until 1908. The events of these years are extremely important, as one sees the emergence of trends that would flourish in later years, as well as the Games' first steps towards recognition as part of Vancouver's sporting scene.

The third chapter traces the progression of the Games from 1909 to the end of the First World War. By the early 1910s, the Games were continually rising in popularity as a mainstream sporting event. The VSACS had consciously decided to market the Games

²⁶ Patricia Roy, *A White Man's Province: British Columbia Politicians and Chinese and Japanese Immigrants, 1858-1914* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1989); Roy, *Consolidating a White Man's Province: British Columbians and the Oriental Question, 1914-41* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2003); Peter Ward, *White Canada Forever: Popular Attitudes and Public Policy toward Orientals in British Columbia* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002).

²⁷ Eric Nicol, *Vancouver* (Toronto: Doubleday, 1970); Alan Morley, *Vancouver: From Milltown to Metropolis* (Vancouver: Mitchell Press, 1961).

in this manner, knowing that doing so would increase attendance, thereby filling the society's treasury. However, at the same time, many VSACS members showed their displeasure with the professional competitions that had been a part of the Games since their inception, and professional athletic competition was eliminated in 1911. Questions regarding professionalism, amateurism, and commercialism were put aside with the onset of war in 1914, when the society concentrated on using the Games as a rallying event for Empire. At the end of the war, the society was in a similar position as in 1909 – it again had to build the Caledonian Games' status as a sporting event.

The fourth chapter picks up coverage of the Games in 1919 and concludes in 1926, at which time the Games became a part of the Greater Vancouver Exhibition. Through the early 1920s, the society resolved the apparent contradictions that emerged from operating a sporting event that prided itself on the purity of amateurism, while also becoming increasingly commercialized by citing the importance of the Games to civic development. However, as the Games became a vehicle for city pride, celebration of Scottish heritage – once thought to be an essential part of the success of any Highland Games – became less important to their survival. Still, the fact that the Games were chosen as one of the exhibition's marquee attractions suggests much about the conception of Vancouver's cultural identity held by city boosters.

The primary aim of this thesis is to understand how the Games developed from a relatively small event that catered to Vancouver's Scottish population to a grand community event that appealed to a wider range of people. However, the study will serve additional purposes, if only by raising more questions. Though there is a great deal of scholarship on Canadian sport history in the years of this study, there is little dealing

specifically with British Columbia. No survey of Vancouver's sports history exists; this is an obvious impediment to writing a case study within said topic. This study will address to some degree questions relating to class and gender conceptions within the Caledonian Games in order to speculate on greater trends that might have existed. By tracing the decision-making process of the VSACS, and looking at the consequences of the decisions made, I hope not only to introduce the Vancouver Caledonian Games to the history of British Columbia sport history, but also highlight further avenues of research.

CHAPTER ONE

Laying Foundations: Origins of the Highland Games and Sport in British Columbia

If when visiting the Highlands for the first time you came upon a party of men in typical Highland costume, engaged in throwing a gigantic pole, measuring about 15 feet long, and weighing two cwt., you might wonder what on earth they are trying to do. But before you had been initiated into the mysteries of 'tossing the caber' ten minutes, you would vote it one of the most exhilarating (sic) pastimes you had ever attempted.

- *The Scottish Canadian*, November 1903, p. 293

Scottish sociologist Grant Jarvie has written several works on the origins of the Scottish Highland Games, and his studies have provided the basis of my understanding of the subject. The earliest antecedent to the Highland Games appears to be a "gathering of clans" that took place at the Braes of Mar under the direction of Malcolm Canmore, an eleventh-century Scottish king. It is said that here a race up Craig Choineach was held, ostensibly to select the most durable and hardy soldiers as well as the quickest messengers.¹ In this regard, early Highland Games and Gatherings seem to fit the paradigm of pre-modern sport serving as training grounds for military service.² Furthermore, the convening of clans meant that the assembled leaders were able to discuss business matters.³ Available evidence also suggests that the staging of large gatherings at the end of the harvest period served an important social role in marking the

¹ Grant Jarvie, *Highland Games: The Making of the Myth* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1991), 19-21.

² Webster, *Scottish Highland Games*, 9-11; Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 27-29.

³ Grant Jarvie suggests that this may have been the main reason for many of the Gatherings during this period, with the participation in sports as a form of entertainment that was facilitated by the gathering of Highlanders, rather than the reason for it. See Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 29-30.

conclusion of the year's agricultural toil.⁴ Beyond this, however, there is little evidence demonstrating the exact nature of most of the Highland Gatherings and Games between the eleventh and eighteenth centuries.

As English gradually supplanted Gaelic as the mother tongue in what is now the Lowland region of Scotland, the divide between the Lowlands and Highlands crystallized.⁵ By the time of the Act of Union in 1707, most English people and many Lowland Scots conceived of the Highlanders as primitive and uncouth. The image of the Highlander as an untamed savage permeated all aspects of the Highland identity - most early commentators saw the Highland dress, diet, and especially the landscape as symbolic of their primitiveness.⁶ A series of events in the early eighteenth century caused many in England and the Lowlands to view the Highlanders as not only primitive, but also dangerous.⁷ Following putative revolts in 1708 and 1715, the Jacobites (who supported the ousted Stuart dynasty) achieved moderate successes in their 1745-46 rebellion, before the English army quashed it at the Battle of Culloden.⁸

The backlash from the Jacobite Rebellion (or "the 'Forty-five," as it became popularly known) was immediate and harsh. Though not everyone who rebelled was of Highland origin, many influential clan chiefs were Jacobite supporters.⁹ Because of this, the image of the Highlander as backward Jacobite developed in the minds of many. Parliament proscribed all symbols of Highland life, deeming them too closely tied to the "uncivilized" and "warrior" spirit ascribed to Highlanders. Highland Games were not

⁴ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 29.

⁵ T.M. Devine, *Clanship to Crofters' War* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994), 1-4.

⁶ See, for example, Devine, *Clanship to Crofters' War*, 118-119; Rosalind Mitchison, *A History of Scotland*, second ed. (London: Methuen, 1982), 172-174; Peter Womack, *Improvement and Romance* (London: MacMillan, 1989), 1-4.

⁷ T.M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation, 1700-2000* (London: Penguin Press, 1999), 5-25.

⁸ Devine, *Clanship to Crofters' War*, 26-28; Mitchison, *History of Scotland*, 340-343.

exempt from this proscription. Although the Games had not existed in a modern “organized” form before Culloden, the gatherings and sports events that had taken place for centuries beforehand dissolved with the old Highland system.¹⁰

The catastrophic defeat of the Jacobites in the ‘Forty-five was the stimulus of a chain of events and decisions that redefined the image of the Highlander. With military defeat followed by widespread cultural suppression, by the end of the eighteenth century England and Lowland Scotland no longer perceived the Highlander to be a threat. The Highland image was essentially “domesticated.” Once seen as overly belligerent, the Highlander came to embody the standard of masculinity: physically sound but emotionally controlled, bellicose but loyal. No longer a poor filthy peasant, the Highlander represented rugged pre-modern man, able to mould nature to his needs. In an era of increased industrialization and modernization in Britain, such an archetype appealed to members of the middle and upper classes.¹¹ The increase of interest in the Highlands among England’s and Lowland Scotland’s élites during this era led to the popularization of the symbols of “Highlandism.” As this process continued, these symbols came to be representative of the whole of Scotland, not simply the region that inspired them.¹²

As interest in Highland symbols and culture increased among the upper and middle classes during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, interest in re-establishing Highland Games followed suit. The St. Fillans Society of Scotland held a

⁹ Devine, *The Scottish Nation*, 9.

¹⁰ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 44-45.

¹¹ This is a highly condensed explanation as to how the ideal of the Highlander became intertwined with the ideal of the gentleman in nineteenth century Britain. For more detail, see Caroline Bingham, *Beyond the Highland Line* (London: Constable and Co., 1991); Womack, *Improvement and Romance*; Jarvie, *Highland Games*, among others.

Highland Games in 1819, recognized as one of the earliest “modern” Highland Games.¹³ The Braemar Royal Highland Society, established in 1817, held its first Highland Games in 1832.¹⁴ The events that took place at these games, such as “putting the stone, throwing the hammer, tossing the caber, [and] running”¹⁵, were representative of the events that were part of in the prior gatherings and games. However, these games also reflected modern ideas. For the first time, event winners were given cash prizes by the Games’ organizers.¹⁶ Queen Victoria attended the 1848 Braemar Games, and royal recognition ensured that the Games had a high level of respectability among British élites.¹⁷ Thus, by adapting the symbols of the Highlands to the ongoing social and economic changes, it was British and Lowland Scottish élites who developed the modern Highland Games.

The development of the Highland Games and other modern sports was part of the greater process of industrialization that also led to mass immigration from countries such as Scotland to North America. Consequently, North America hardly lagged behind Britain in the development of modern sport (and the Highland Games). Many migrants from this era were essential to the early development of modern sport in Canada.

¹² J.M. Bumsted, “Scottishness and Britishness in Canada,” in Harper and Vance, *Myth, Migration, and the Making of Memory*, 91.

¹³ Grant Jarvie, “Highland Games,” in Grant Jarvie and John Burnett (eds.), *Sport, Scotland, and the Scots* (East Linton, Scotland: Tuckwell Press, 2000), 140-141.

¹⁴ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 20; Gerald Redmond, *The Caledonian Games in Nineteenth-Century America* (Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1971), 27-28.

¹⁵ Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 28.

¹⁶ Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 28.

¹⁷ Webster, *Scottish Highland Games*, 15.

Sporting Practices in Canada

Canadian sports organizations date to 1807 and the founding of the Montreal Curling Club,¹⁸ but until the 1840s sport remained largely tied to its pre-industrial origins.¹⁹ As in Scotland, industrialization changed the face of sport in Canada. Leisure time became a reality for more people, although it remained a luxury that but a small percentage of the population could enjoy. In the 1840s, 1850s, and 1860s, the number of sporting associations increased, as did the number of sport facilities.²⁰ This allowed for the creation of sports teams affiliated with particular athletic clubs. In the pre-industrial stage, team sport was informal, and limited transportation and population made large-scale sporting events tantamount to impossible. With greater organization, athletic associations formed around sports of a multitude of origins. Advances in transportation meant that inter-city travel was readily available, and soon, clubs in different cities were staging competitions against one another.²¹ Increases in the codification of sport were a result of the application of industrial notions of order to sport, and resulted in the “socially approved arousal of moderate excitement.”²² The Highland Games were one of the methods of excitation through sport, and they flourished in these social and economic conditions.

Highland Games in North America

Scottish immigrants founded fraternal organizations in North America not long

¹⁸ Alan Metcalfe, *Canada Learns to Play: The Emergence of Organized Sport, 1807-1914* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1987), 20.

¹⁹ Metcalfe, *Canada Learns to Play*, 21.

²⁰ Metcalfe, *Canada Learns to Play*, 24.

²¹ Metcalfe, *Canada Learns to Play*, 24-26; Henry Roxborough, *One Hundred – Not Out: The Story of Nineteenth-Century Canadian Sport* (Toronto: Ryerson, 1966), 27-29.

²² Norbert Elias and Eric Dunning, *Quest for Excitement: Sport and Leisure in the Civilizing Process* (London: Basil Blackwell, 1986), 65.

after their first wave of arrival following removal of the ban on Scottish migration to America in the early eighteenth century.²³ The first recorded Scottish society in North America was that of Charleston, South Carolina, founded in 1729.²⁴ In their earliest years, these organizations served as the basis for social gatherings among Scots, as well as “fostering and commemorating...Scottish patriotism and the memory of the Old Land.”²⁵ Furthermore, they served as charitable institutions that helped émigrés gain a solid footing an ocean removed from their place of birth.²⁶

The Highland Society of Glengarry, Upper Canada held the first North American Highland Gathering in 1819.²⁷ Most North American Scottish societies, however, did not organize gatherings for the express intent of holding Highland Games until the 1830s and 1840s. The Highland Society of New York held its first “Sportive Meeting” in 1836, when the decision “to renew the Sports of their Native Land” was made. Later that year, this society held the first reliably reported Highland Games in North America at Hoboken, New Jersey.²⁸ Throughout the next twenty years, Scottish associations in many cities began organizing their own Highland Games. Beginning in 1848, the Caledonian Society of Cape Breton organized Games that continued for many years. The Prince of Wales attended this society’s 1861 Games as part of his royal tour.²⁹ Boston’s Caledonia Club organized Games for the first time in 1853, and by 1866 cities as far west

²³ Eric Richards, “Scotland and the Uses of the Atlantic Empire,” in Bernard Bailyn and Philip D. Morgan (eds.), *Strangers within the Realm: Cultural Margins of the First British Empire* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1991), 70.

²⁴ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 52; Wilfred Campbell, *The Scotsman in Canada* (Toronto: Musson Book Co., 1911), 408-423.

²⁵ Campbell, *The Scotsman in Canada*, 407.

²⁶ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 52.

²⁷ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 52-54.

²⁸ Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 37.

²⁹ Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 163.

in the United States as San Francisco were holding their own events.³⁰ Highland Games were becoming extremely popular in the mainstream of the early North American sporting scene, and many Scottish associations began expending most of their energy and resources in pursuing and developing athletic endeavours rather than other forms of Scottish culture, such as literature and song.³¹

North American Highland Games achieved their highest level of success from about 1865 to 1890.³² During this period, the Highland Games were arguably the first North American spectator sport to achieve mass popularity. The *Canadian Illustrated News* often featured front-page illustrations of men competing in heavy events in front of a large crowd.³³ It was common for events in the larger Canadian cities to attract tens of thousands of attendees during the 1860s and 1870s.³⁴

As the interest of spectators was piqued, the organizers saw a financial opportunity in the Games. The amount of revenue that could be generated from having thousands of paying spectators attending a city's games meant that organizations began going to unprecedented lengths of advertisement. Some of the more well known Highland athletes took part in "world's championships" and "starring tours," where large cash prizes were supposedly on the line.³⁵ Greg Gillespie states that organizers often exaggerated or even completely invented these prizes (usually purported as being in the range of \$1,000 to \$2,000) in order to stir up interest in the events. This notwithstanding, the athletes participating in these starring tours were definitely paid comfortably for

³⁰ Jarvie, *Highland Games*, 54-55.

³¹ Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 162.

³² Redmond, *The Caledonian Games*, 42-43.

³³ Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 169, 178.

³⁴ Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 169-172.

³⁵ Greg Gillespie, "Roderick McLennan, Professionalism, and the Emergence of the Athlete in Caledonian Games," *Sport History Review* 31 (2000), 45-51.

competing.³⁶ Though these ostensibly “professional” athletes were the minority of Highland Games competitors, they were important in contributing to the Games’ development.

Sports in British Columbia

What is now British Columbia was a series of Hudson’s Bay Company trading posts for the first half of the nineteenth century. Britain founded the colony of Vancouver Island in 1849 and British Columbia in 1858. A series of gold rushes between 1851 and 1862 resulted in a rapid population increase. In 1866, Britain linked its two western Canadian colonies and founded the Crown Colony of British Columbia, which joined Confederation five years later. Not surprisingly, the increase in white settlement brought increased participation in organized sporting activities, particularly those imported from the British Isles. The first indication of “modern” sport in the region comes from 1849, when Captain Colquhan Grant of the Royal Navy brought some cricket equipment to Victoria to facilitate military sports.³⁷ It is difficult to determine the earliest instances of participation in hunting, rowing, and shooting as sport, though organized clubs for each were in existence in Victoria in the late 1850s and early 1860s.³⁸

Whereas in eastern Canada modern sport evolved from earlier, more informal, types of pre-industrial sport throughout the nineteenth century, British Columbia’s white population remained small until the “modernization” of sport in other provinces was almost complete. Victoria, the capital of the province, had a population of about 6,000 in 1881 and approximately 20,000 by 1901. Vancouver in 1901 was home to 27,000

³⁶ Gillespie, “Roderick McLennan,” 57.

³⁷ Derek Swain, “A History of Sport in British Columbia to 1885: A Chronicle of Significant Developments and Events,” (Unpublished MPE thesis, University of British Columbia, 1970), 86; 243.

people.³⁹ In comparison, the population of Montreal (where much of organized Canadian sport originated) exceeded 77,000 as early as 1851.⁴⁰ Although British Columbia's cities had a fledgling interest in sports, the lack of a major population base prohibited development to the level seen in eastern Canada. The early development of sport in British Columbia is closely tied to the presence of the Royal Navy, which was "instrumental in the establishment of such sporting activities as cricket, football, horse racing, rifle shooting, and rowing."⁴¹

Scots in various British Columbia and Vancouver Island cities had already held a handful of Highland Games on an intermittent basis. Celebrations for the Queen's Birthday in 1859 at Queensborough (later New Westminster) featured "foot and hurdle-races, putting shot, throwing the hammer, high and long jumps, [and] tossing the caber" as part of its programme of sports.⁴² During this era, Scots living on Vancouver Island organized their first Highland Games. The *Victoria Daily British Colonist* advertised a "Caledonian Gathering" and "PICNIC AND NATIONAL GAMES!!" on the property of one J.D. Pemberton on 4 July 1868. The abridged programme in the *Colonist* featured "Archery (for Ladies only)" and "other Games," as well as "National Dances and Music." The advertisement implored spectators to dress in an appropriately Scottish manner, requesting that "A respectable appearance of Tartans" be visible.⁴³ Two days following the Games, a columnist for the *Colonist* reported that "a more hearty day's pleasure was

³⁸ Swain, "A History of Sport," 28-29; 243-245.

³⁹ Jean Barman, *The West Beyond the West: A History of British Columbia*, revised ed. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 390.

⁴⁰ Canada, Board of Regulation and Statistics, "Census of the Canadas, 1851-2." (Quebec: J. Lovell, 1853), xvi, xviii.

⁴¹ Swain, "A History of Sport," 247.

⁴² Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 174-175; *Victoria Daily British Colonist*, 30 May 1859.

⁴³ *Victoria Daily British Colonist*, 4 July 1868.

not often enjoyed on the island.”⁴⁴ They held additional Games in 1871 and 1875, while the Mainland St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society (New Westminster) held its first Games at Langley in 1877 and its second at New Westminster in 1884.⁴⁵ When the Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society hosted its first Caledonian Games celebration in 1893, however, North American Highland Games had already reached their zenith of popularity.

While the population boom of the gold rush era encouraged the development of sports in Vancouver Island and British Columbia, it was not until the arrival of the railway that sport had a major impact. When the Canadian Pacific Railway designated Vancouver as its terminus in 1886, its potential for growth quickly outstripped that of any other city in the province. Its population surpassed Victoria’s by the end of the nineteenth century, and topped 100,000 by the 1911 census.⁴⁶ Although there are few detailed studies on Vancouver’s early sports history, the city’s earliest newspapers reveal that citizens were obviously eager to participate and watch. On the front page of the first *Vancouver News* following the fire that destroyed the city in June 1886, there is an advertisement for a roller rink featuring a “THREE-MILE RACE between LeLevre and Hannon!”⁴⁷ By 1890, sport was popular enough in the region that the CPR was running trains between Vancouver and nearby Port Moody and New Westminster with the sole

⁴⁴ *Victoria Daily British Colonist*, 4 and 6 July 1868. Swain mentions a *Daily British Colonist* article from 3 July 1865 that detailed an upcoming “Caledonian picnic” that would feature “dancing, athletic games, and other sports”, “A History of Sport”, 35. However, after researching the paper on these (and similar) dates, I was unable to find this article.

⁴⁵ *Victoria Daily British Colonist*, 4 July 1875; *Scottish American Journal*, 29 July 1875; *Mainland Guardian* (New Westminster), 22 September 1877; 13 August 1884.

⁴⁶ Barman, *The West Beyond the West*, 390.

⁴⁷ *Vancouver News*, 23 July 1886.

purpose of shuttling fans to and from lacrosse matches.⁴⁸ For the first Caledonian Games in 1893 (and indeed, for several afterwards) at Stanley Park's Brockton Point, the Union Steamship Company shuttled spectators on a ferry to and from the site.⁴⁹ Fueled by the industrialization and population brought by the railway, Vancouver was at the forefront of the sports scene of the province at the end of the nineteenth century.

There are very few existing studies on Highland Games in twentieth century Canada, which makes it very difficult to compare the Vancouver Games to similar contemporary events. Although Gerald Redmond argued that the Games remained strong in Canada throughout the century, he did not cite any examples to defend his assertion.⁵⁰ Alyce Taylor Cheska suggests the Antigonish Games existed continuously throughout the century.⁵¹ Some small Highland Games may have existed between Vancouver and Antigonish in the early twentieth century, but few appear to have endured as long. The Vancouver Caledonian Games thus serve as an example of an event that survived while others of its kind were floundering and disappearing. The following chapters are an attempt to both chronicle and explain their history.

⁴⁸ Barbara Schrod, "Taking the Tram': Travelling to Sport and Recreation Activities on Greater Vancouver's Interurban Railway – 1890s to 1920s," *Canadian Journal of History of Sport* 19, no. 1 (May 1988), 54.

⁴⁹ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 13 August 1893; 11 August 1894.

⁵⁰ Redmond, *The Sporting Scots*, 203.

⁵¹ Cheska, "The Antigonish Highland Games," 163-164.

CHAPTER TWO

First Steps: The Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society's Games, 1893-1908

Every member of the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society has reason to feel satisfied with the result of the first annual meet held at the Brockton Point grounds yesterday afternoon. No records were broken in the athletic sports, but every event was well contested. The dancing was particularly good, and brought out the best men in the Province, while the pipers got another opportunity to vie with each other in the production on the pipes of those thrilling tunes which have often lead (sic) their ancestors in warfare as in their festivities. The gay and picturesque Highland costume was seen in all parts of the field, but many who did not adopt the field regalia by some Scotch bonnet, badge or ribbon showed that on that day they remembered the land o' the heather.

- *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 13 August 1893

Good prizes will attract good sport; good sport will attract spectators.

- Archibald Lamberton, Chairman of Games Committee, 1907

The inaugural Vancouver Caledonian Games, as described by the *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser* of 13 August 1893, were a great success. The picture painted by the article is vivid: pipers blaring out "those thrilling tunes," dancers deftly performing the Highland fling and sword dance, athletes wearing the "gay and picturesque Highland costume" tossing the caber and hurling the stones, all enjoying a "braw Scotch day."¹ The first celebration of its kind in Vancouver, the Games were undoubtedly a thrill to the city's Scottish-born-and-descended population. Equally pleased with the Games' success were the members of the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society, who had

¹ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 13 August 1893.

organized them. At a later society meeting, the members gave the secretary “a vote of thanks ... for the Excellent way the Sports had been carried through.”² The society hosted Caledonian games on an intermittent basis for the following eight years, and in 1902 began sanctioning them annually. The early development of the Vancouver Caledonian Games sheds some light on how they would later come to be viewed as one of Vancouver’s most prominent sports attractions and a vehicle for civic expansion and development.

The Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society

Vancouver was a city born of the Canadian Pacific Railway. The CPR’s 1885 decision to extend its line from the original terminus of Port Moody to the town site of Granville on Burrard Inlet touched off a frenzy of land speculation in the tiny logging settlement. To many, the railway was the symbol of industrial and economic prosperity, and hundreds flocked to the region. On 15 February 1886, 125 settlers of Granville brought a petition to British Columbia’s Legislative Assembly, with the intent of “obtaining a charter, incorporating the said Village of Granville and its immediate vicinity, a city, under the name of ‘The City of Vancouver.’”³ The bill received royal assent on 6 April, the date of Vancouver’s birth.

On 9 June 1886, just over two months after Vancouver’s incorporation, a group of the city’s Scottish immigrants and descendants held “a meeting...for the purpose of organizing a Caledonia Club.”⁴ Those present at the meeting elected an executive of four

² City of Vancouver Archives (CVA), Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society Minutes (VSACS). Add MSS 453, Volumes 1 and 2 (Locations 562-F-2 and 562-F-3), 1 September 1886.

³ “The Founders of Vancouver: 1886,” pamphlet issued by CVA, 1956.

⁴ Vancouver *Daily Advertiser*, 10 June 1886.

members, including Mayor Malcolm A. MacLean as president.⁵ Four days later, a fire set by the CPR to clear trees, aided by an unexpected windstorm, raged out of control and destroyed the infant city, halting the recruitment of new society members. Three months after this setback, with Vancouver rebuilt larger and stronger than before, the club members reconvened to re-elect an executive and board of directors.⁶ Starting a trend that would continue throughout the next few decades, the society's officers represented early Vancouver's business and political élite. At the rebirth of the proposed "Caledonian Club" under the name of the "Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society," Mayor MacLean was again voted president. William Brown, the vice president, owned the *Vancouver Herald*. Among the original directors were J.M. Stewart, the city's first police chief; R.H. Alexander, the manager of Hastings Sawmill and runner-up in the mayoral election; Andrew C. Muir, the city's first lawyer; Gideon Robertson and John Cook Douglas, real estate agents in boomtown Vancouver; and Colin Ralston and Thomas Dunn, early industrial entrepreneurs.⁷ These men viewed the aftermath of the Great Fire as an opportunity to build a modern city on the ashes of a fragile town-site. They organized the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society to promote and celebrate their shared Scottish heritage in the new, soon-to-be great city.

According to the VSACS's first printed Constitution (published in 1887), the society had for its object

...the affording of medical, and other relief, to such natives of Scotland, and their descendants, as may from sickness or other causes have fallen into distress; *the encouragement of the national*

⁵ *Vancouver Daily Advertiser*, 10 June 1886.

⁶ CVA, VSACS, 10 September 1886; *Vancouver Daily Advertiser*, 11 September 1886.

⁷ CVA, VSACS, 10 September 1886; biographical information from Peter S.N. Claydon and Valerie A. Melanson, *Vancouver Voters, 1886: A Biographical Dictionary*. (Richmond, BC: British Columbia Genealogical Society, 1994) and "The Founders of Vancouver: 1886" (pamphlet issued by CVA, 1956).

costume and games; to cultivate a taste for Scottish music and literature; and of binding more closely together all Scotchmen, and those of Scottish descent.⁸

The society, like many North American Scottish societies, had two main objectives: to aid other Scottish immigrants and descendants in times of need, and to foster and promote Scottish culture among themselves and in the community. The first of these goals should not be downplayed; the VSACS often provided financial or other assistance to ill, injured, destitute, and grieving Scots.⁹ Although the society and its members were indeed benevolent, their second goal, the promotion of Scottish culture, heritage, and tradition was more visible to the community. The society viewed charity as an inward act and celebration as an outward one. Indeed, the VSACS pursued “the encouragement of the national costume and games” most visibly by holding Caledonian Games.

The VSACS first attempted to organize games in 1888. The members held a special meeting to “find out the best means to get up sports and Games on 1st of July.” However, after considerable discussion, the society deemed that there were no suitable places to accommodate such an event, and decided to hold a parade instead.¹⁰ The society’s minutes do not record any mention of hosting games until 1892, when a member again broached the topic. After some discussion, the VSACS executive commissioned a special “Committee on Caledonian Games” under the direction of Nicol

⁸ “Constitution of the St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society, City of Vancouver.” Vancouver, BC: Vancouver Herald Office, 1887, emphasis added.

⁹ The minutes of the VSACS contain numerous letters from citizens requesting assistance, for most of which no discussion was recorded, although the society’s annual financial records often listed how much money was committed to benevolent purposes. A later example of this is found in CVA, VSACS, 2 October 1914.

¹⁰ CVA, VSACS, 19 April 1888.

Allan, a charter member.¹¹ No record of the committee's findings exists in the minutes, so the reason for not holding games that year is unknown.

Though the VSACS did not host Caledonian Games in its first seven years, it encouraged Scottish culture largely through the promotion of Scottish literature as well as general social interaction between the members. Society members were still involved in the promotion of sporting events, though these were not always overtly Scottish in nature. Alexander C. Perry, one of the early members of the VSACS, was the secretary of the Vancouver Baseball Club from 1886 to 1887.¹² The society also engaged in good-natured rivalry with other national clubs, accepting a challenge from the Vancouver St. George's Society to a tug of war in February 1893.¹³ Later that year, society member Thomas McKinnon introduced the Scottish tug of war team "who won the international Tug of War in Vancouver, ...thereby upholding the honour, good name and favour of Scotland and her noble, brave and true-hearted sons."¹⁴ As the population of Vancouver exploded during this era, many VSACS members became participants in the burgeoning local sports scene. Still, the society had failed in its two attempts at organizing games, and many members felt that another attempt was necessary.

The Formative Years – 1893-1901

At an April 1893 meeting, the VSACS again "decided to hold Games in the Grounds at Brockton Point...some time during this summer."¹⁵ The society's Executive formed a special Games committee to research the preliminary details. Over the next

¹¹ CVA, VSACS, 3 June 1892; 10 September 1886; Claydon and Melanson, *Vancouver Voters*, 36-40.

¹² Claydon and Melanson, *Vancouver Voters*, p 562.

¹³ CVA, VSACS, 10 February 1893.

¹⁴ CVA, VSACS, 7 April 1893.

¹⁵ CVA, VSACS, 7 April 1893.

three and a half months, the society held a series of preparatory meetings. Although the Vancouver games would be relatively small compared to many of those held in eastern Canada decades before, organizing them was still complicated. Securing a venue for the event proved very difficult. The VSACS had stated its interest in the Brockton Point athletic grounds at Stanley Park, but the Games Committee noted that while the manager of Brockton Point was charging \$75.00 for use of the field, his counterpart at Hastings Park was offering those grounds free of charge in addition to \$20.00 in prize money.¹⁶ The VSACS initially decided to hold the games at Hastings,¹⁷ but after further discussion, it reversed its decision and went with the Brockton Point Association's original offer of a \$75.00 rental. While the rationale for the change of venue is absent from the society's minutes, it is reasonable to suggest that Hastings' unfavourable location was a major factor.¹⁸ Located in the eastern reaches of the city's bounds, Hastings was much further from downtown (and the residences of most of Vancouver's elite, including many VSACS members) than Brockton Point. This indecision among the organizing committee almost resulted in yet another aborted event. The society's vacillation meant that the VSACS and the Brockton Point Association reached an agreement on terms only eight days before the Games were scheduled.¹⁹

The organizers' inexperience in coordinating an event as complicated as Caledonian Games manifested itself on several other occasions. In mid-May, they realized that no society member possessed the equipment necessary for some of the heavy events. Recognizing that competition would be difficult without the proper tools,

¹⁶ CVA, VSACS, 5 May 1893.

¹⁷ CVA, VSACS, 5 May 1893.

¹⁸ CVA, VSACS, 2 June 1893; Schrodt, "Control of Sports Facilities in Early Vancouver," 29.

¹⁹ CVA, VSACS, 4 August 1893.

the organizers convened a special sub-committee in charge of “finding a 12 lb. Hammer and 16 lb. Shot” for the Games. Two months of weekly Games meetings passed before the committee reported that they had resorted to borrowing the necessary equipment.²⁰ Furthermore, while the VSACS originally planned to award cash prizes to the individual event winners, in mid-July, it decided instead to award medals and other non-monetary prizes to the victors.²¹ Two weeks later, the Prize Committee reported that it had been largely unsuccessful in canvassing for prizes. In the days before the Games, the society finally decided to award cash prizes in certain events.²² An advertising programme that ran in the *Daily News Advertiser* the week of the Games features both “amateur” and “open” events, with the VSACS offering the non-monetary prizes that it had been able to scrape together to the top two finishers in each amateur competition.²³ Cash prizes ranging from \$5 to \$12 were offered for the “open,” or professional, events. Not until the day immediately before the Games did the society report that everything was in place.²⁴

The Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society wanted to ensure that its inaugural Caledonian Games would embody the ideals of modernity that befitted a major sporting event. The programme printed in the *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser* contains a numbered list of thirty-three events, with strict instructions on how to enter competition. The Games were to start at 1:00 P.M. sharp. The National Caledonian Society’s rules would govern any disputes that might arise during competition. Referees and judges would preside over the day’s events to ensure that prizes went to the best competitors in each event. The society members took every precaution that they could

²⁰ CVA, VSACS, 12 May 1893; 7 July 1893.

²¹ CVA, VSACS, 18 July 1893.

²² CVA, VSACS, 4 August 1893.

²³ Programme listed in *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 12 August 1893.

think of to ensure that the Games were a sophisticated exhibition of sport in the new city. Granted, the competitors used borrowed equipment, the organizers had to pool money at the last minute because they were unable to canvas for prizes, and the local media highly doubted that the Games could be successful in any regard. Still, the organizers felt that they had overcome all of this, and that the Vancouver Caledonian Games would gain legitimacy as a modern, sophisticated sporting event.

On 12 August 1893, local athletes, tartan-clad pipers, and VSACS members gathered at Brockton Point for the first Vancouver Caledonian Games.²⁵ The *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser* reported that “[about] 2000 people crowded around the grand stand and surrounded the railing of the field of Brockton Point to witness the proceedings.”²⁶ A columnist from the *Vancouver Daily World* admitted that the VSACS had succeeded in entertaining the crowd despite “many doubts and misgivings as to the probabilities of making the affair even a partial success.” Somewhat begrudgingly, the commentator noted that “[the] Scotsmen of Vancouver, if they care to, can get up a list of sports equal to any in Canada.”²⁷

The society’s first Caledonian Games were by most standards a modest success. The weather had co-operated, the society collected a reasonable \$3.55 profit, and as mentioned, the crowd was quite large. However, not everyone in attendance felt that the day’s events befit the modern city of Vancouver. The fifteenth event listed on the programme was a novelty event, “catching the greased pig,” open to boys under fifteen

²⁴ CVA, CSACS, 11 August 1893.

²⁵ CVA, VSACS, 5 May 1893; 1 September 1893.

²⁶ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 13 August 1893.

²⁷ *Vancouver Daily World*, 14 August 1893.

years of age.²⁸ A columnist from the *Vancouver Daily World* described the pig chase as follows: “The frightened animal ran hither and thither to escape the crowd, who became wild with excitement. At last the dumb brute was run down with exhaustion and became an easy prey to the grasp of its captors, who appeared to be greatly pleased with their success in carrying off this squealing trophy.”²⁹ Three days after the Games, the *Daily News Advertiser* published a letter from “A Member of the ‘Band of Mercy’,” denouncing the VSACS for having “sadly marred” the day’s “otherwise innocent amusement” with the pig chase, disdainfully described as “a relic of a barbarous age [that] might well be dispensed with.”³⁰ The society was clearly sensitive to such criticism, for the greased pig event was left out of future Games. Despite this complaint, most of the two thousand spectators at Vancouver’s first Caledonian Games went home pleased with the day’s events. Encouraged by their \$3.55 profit and popular support, the society promptly indicated its intention to host Games the following year.³¹

The second annual Games, held in 1894, were described in the local papers as “an unqualified success...in every respect.”³² The *Daily News Advertiser* reported that “the grand stand [was] well packed while hundreds stood around the fence” to watch.³³ The *Daily World* described

...a perfect [day] and the attendance large (sic) there were a number dressed in the garb of the Gael, whilst many had on plaids and samples of the various textures belonging to the clans of ‘the land of brown heath and shaggy wool.’ There were pipers present and the slogan of many of Scotia’s martial arts was heard from a distance, for these brow chappies blew their chanterers from different quarters of the grounds. Then there was dancing by young girls as

²⁸ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 12 August 1893.

²⁹ *Vancouver Daily World*, 14 August 1893.

³⁰ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 15 August 1893.

³¹ CVA, VSACS, 1 September 1893.

³² *Vancouver Daily World*, 13 August 1894.

³³ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 13 August 1894.

well as by gentlemen....In brief, nothing better in the light fantastic line has been seen in Vancouver or on the Mainland.³⁴

Union Steamship Co. of B. C.
LIMITED

St. Andrews'
and **Caledonian**
Society

SPORTS

**BROCKTON
POINT : :**

**Saturday
August 11th**

By special arrangement with
the Society a Ferry will run con-
tinuously from 9 A.M., leaving
U. S. S. Co's Wharf.

Figure 1 - Advertisement for the Union Steamship Company and the 1894 Vancouver Caledonian Games. (*Vancouver World*, 6 August 1894)

The VSACS had arranged for the Union Steamship Company to begin shuttling spectators to the site of the Games four hours before their start (see Figure 1), which undoubtedly boosted crowd size. Despite this apparent success, the Games committee reported a loss of \$84.25.³⁵ Although the press had lavished the event with praise, the financial cost of the Games prompted the society to hold a picnic in their stead the following year.³⁶ When the picnic returned a deficit of over \$40, the VSACS had what it perceived to be the unenviable task of choosing between two money-losing celebrations

³⁴ *Vancouver Daily World*, 13 August 1894.

³⁵ CVA, VSACS, 7 September 1894.

³⁶ CVA, VSACS, 3 May 1895; 7 June 1895.

of Scottish heritage. Vancouver was in the midst of an economic depression – the bust that had followed the boom of the late 1880s – and as much as the VSACS wanted to celebrate Scottish heritage, it was difficult to do so while losing money.³⁷

In 1896, the VSACS was given new life – or, more literally, an injection of capital – when the City of Vancouver 10th Anniversary Carnival Committee invited the society to feature the Caledonian Games as part of the event. In addition, the St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society of Victoria proposed that the “Scotch Societies of the Province amalgamate for the purpose of holding sports,” offering financial and organizational support in holding the Games.³⁸ In time, the Vancouver Sons of Scotland and the Victoria William Wallace Society joined the coalition of Scottish societies administering the Games, though the Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society still held much of the organizational responsibility.³⁹ After negotiations, the city’s Carnival Committee granted a \$500 guarantee against the society’s potential losses stemming from the Games.⁴⁰ Though the financial statements from the Games are not available, by all accounts the celebration was successful. Not only did the local papers all extol the Games as being executed in an excellent manner, the *Scottish American Journal*, a New York publication, remarked that they provided “the most successful of all the days” of Vancouver’s “gala week.”⁴¹

The discussions surrounding the organization of the 1896 Games are particularly interesting in that they provide useful insight into how the VSACS dealt with several social issues. The means of presenting and promoting Scottish culture was always in the

³⁷ Morley, *Vancouver: From Milltown to Metropolis*, 111-113.

³⁸ CVA, VSACS, 5 June 1896.

³⁹ CVA, VSACS, 4 September 1896; Simon Fraser University Archives, Vancouver Sons of Scotland, Royal Scot Camp No. 172 Minutes (Location F-192-7-1), 16 July 1896.

minds of the organizers. The first draft of the 1896 Games programme included in it an “Irish jig” competition. Two members of the society immediately raised objection to its inclusion in the day’s events, presumably because of its non-Scottish character. This prompted a prolonged debate that led to a vote on the issue among the members present at the meeting, and eventually they expunged it from the programme.⁴² The members also discussed the sale of alcohol at the games, and resolved “to prohibit the Sale of intoxicating liquors at Brockton Point.”⁴³ Since the Games were in 1896 part of the larger Vancouver Carnival, the organizers did not want any alcohol-influenced misbehaviour to mar the proceedings. In later years, when the Games were again held as an independent venture of the VSACS, the sale of alcohol would be openly discussed and favoured by the society’s members.⁴⁴

Another issue discussed in the lead-up to the 1896 Games was the participation of women. Little is known about female participation in British Columbia sport during the late nineteenth century, but studies on other parts of the nation indicate that women became actively involved in sport during these years.⁴⁵ While the doors of participation had not been opened entirely, the Victorian image of woman being too frail to participate in athletic activity faded. In the 1893 and 1894 Games, a few events had been designated as “girls” events – a girls’ race was held in both years, as was a separate Highland fling.⁴⁶ Though all these events were designated for girls (that is, unmarried women), the

⁴⁰ CVA, VSACS, 30 July 1896.

⁴¹ *Scottish American Journal*, 16 September 1896.

⁴² CVA, VSACS, 4 August 1896.

⁴³ CVA, VSACS, 24 August 1896.

⁴⁴ For example, CVA, VSACS, 21 July 1902.

⁴⁵ See, for example, M. Ann Hall, “Women’s Sport in Canada Prior to 1914,” in *Proceedings of the First Canadian Symposium on the History of Sport and Physical Education*. (Ottawa: Department of National Health and Welfare, 1970), 71.

⁴⁶ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 12 August 1893; 12 August 1894.

programme for the 1893 Games had featured a “married women’s race” with a first prize of a pair of boots, and a second place reward of a handkerchief. Nevertheless, the newspaper recaps in both the *Vancouver Daily Advertiser* and *Daily World* make no mention of the results of this contest, and both papers’ excised the event from their tables of results. The most likely explanation is that there were no, or perhaps not enough, competitors registered for the event, and the organizers decided not to go ahead with it. Though ostensibly an athletic competition, it is likely that the organizers envisioned the married woman’s race as a novelty event – on par with the pig chase, sack race, and three-legged dash. The role of women at the Games was reflected by the *Daily News Advertiser*’s report of the 1894 event: “Amongst the crowd, the ladies were specially numerous. They seem the true worshippers of strength and manliness, and under their patronage the annual games cannot but meet with the most pronounced success.”⁴⁷ The sports were a place for the men to demonstrate their masculinity, and for the women to sit, cheer, and gasp in awe.

While the VSACS did not endorse female participation in sports, it was more liberal in the dance competitions. In the 1896 Games, the VSACS (along with the other sanctioning societies) decided to allow women to compete openly against men in the Ghillie Callum (sword dance) and Jack O’Tar (Sailor’s Hornpipe dance) events.⁴⁸ In both events, the winner was a Miss Corinne Tellor.⁴⁹ Though there is no direct evidence that the VSACS barred married women from these events (their minute book records that these competitions were open to all registrants) it does not appear that any enrolled to compete in them. Furthermore, open competition was evidently deemed objectionable by

⁴⁷ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 12 August 1894.

⁴⁸ CVA, VSACS, 24 August 1896.

a number of society members, and possibly people in attendance, for in a wrap-up meeting on the day following the 1896 Games, the joint societies decided to segregate all future competitions by gender.⁵⁰

In the last few years of the nineteenth century, women's participation in the Games was far from the most important question in the minds of organizers. Vancouver was still embroiled in financial depression, and few Vancouver citizens had the available funds and interest to attend public celebration. To cope, the combined Scottish societies of Vancouver and Victoria administered the Games, alternating them between the two cities annually from 1896 to 1900. Most VSACS members took a limited role in organizing the Victoria Games, choosing instead to observe them as outsiders.

This new perspective proved beneficial, as the Games held in Vancouver in 1898 and 1900 were the most lucrative in the society's history, resulting in profits of more than \$375 and \$400, respectively.⁵¹ In 1900, the profit from the Games represented nearly 60 per cent of the society's financial gains for the year.⁵² General economic improvement and better organization meant that by the turn of the twentieth century, the success of the Caledonian Games decided the fortunes of the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society.

In 1901, the VSACS decided that partnership with the Victoria Scottish societies was no longer required, and that henceforth the Games "should be held under the auspices of this Society, ...[with] the co-operation of the Sons of Scotland."⁵³ However, the VSACS did not start preliminary preparations for the games until mid-June. The

⁴⁹ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 4 September 1896.

⁵⁰ CVA, VSACS, 4 September 1896.

⁵¹ CVA, VSACS, 9 September 1898; 10 August 1900; 14 December 1900.

society's members soon realized that they did not have the time to organize an effective event, and thus decided (as was by then standard in such a situation) in favour of a more easily assembled picnic.⁵⁴ Despite this setback, the society members agreed that the profitability the Vancouver Caledonian Games merited hosting them annually. With this new level of organizational stability, the VSACS began to expand the Games' boundaries.

The Growth Years – 1902-1908

By the first decade of the twentieth century, Vancouver had withstood the economic depression that had slowed its growth in the late 1890s, and had entered another period of rapid economic and population increase, stimulated largely by the Klondike gold rush of 1897. Vancouver's population more than doubled between 1898 and 1905, and by 1910, it had more than doubled again. The value of the land within the city's bounds was skyrocketing; many plots of land increased in value hundreds of times between the 1890s and the late 1900s.⁵⁵ As a result, the fortunes of many Vancouver citizens improved, allowing them again to begin spending money on leisure time.⁵⁶ Local businessmen celebrated the advances, and their enthusiasm was summed up in Vancouver's unofficial anthem of the decade:

In nineteen-ten,
Vancouver then
Will have one hundred thousand men.
Move her! Move her!

⁵² The Games of 1900 had a profit of \$409.90, which was 58.1 per cent of the total \$704.84 in financial gains reported by the Society in its annual financial statement. CVA, VSACS, 14 December 1900.

⁵³ CVA, VSACS, 14 June 1901.

⁵⁴ CVA, VSACS, 19 July 1901.

⁵⁵ Morley, *Vancouver*, 120-121; McDonald, *Making Vancouver*, 91-93.

⁵⁶ Graeme Wynn, "The Rise of Vancouver," in T.R. Oke and Graeme Wynn (eds.), *Vancouver and its Region* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1992), 107.

Who? Vancouver!⁵⁷

The city was growing rapidly, and the VSACS felt that it had to ensure that the Caledonian Games kept pace.

In 1901, the VSACS and the Royal Scot Camp No. 172 of the Sons of Scotland (SOS) agreed to mutually sanction the Caledonian Games. However, the VSACS maintained full financial control, meaning that while both societies shared in the organization of the Games, the VSACS kept all profits.⁵⁸ The SOS, as a relatively new society (the Royal Scot Camp was formed in 1895), likely used the Games as a means of promotion. Although this partnership existed intermittently throughout the 1900s and 1910s, the considerable membership overlap between the two societies limited the direct influence of the SOS.⁵⁹ Essentially, the VSACS was the sole administrative body in charge of the Games.

After the problems in 1901, the VSACS quickly allayed any concerns regarding preparation time for the 1902 Games. In February, the secretary informed the Brockton Point Athletic Club of the society's intention to host Games on its grounds the first Saturday of August.⁶⁰ The preliminary programme for the 1902 Games contained (as in previous years) a number of professional events, though society members had begun to debate the issue of their existence. The minutes for 30 June 1902 record that "it was the feeling of the meeting that the professional elements should be cut down as much as possible."⁶¹ Despite making this resolution, the society did not act upon it. The

⁵⁷ Morley, *Vancouver*, 121.

⁵⁸ CVA, VSACS, 15 July 1901.

⁵⁹ Simon Fraser University Archives, Sons Of Scotland (Royal Scot Camp No. 172) Collection. Location F-192-7-1, Minute books and membership rolls, 1895-1899.

⁶⁰ CVA, VSACS, 14 February 1902.

⁶¹ CVA, VSACS, 30 June 1902.

Vancouver Daily News Advertiser's recap of the Games listed the following thirteen athletic events:

Amateur Events

- 100 yards race (boys under 14)
- 440 yards race
- Mile race
- 100 yards race (VSACS members)
- 16-pound hammer throw
- 14-pound shot put
- Running high jump
- Pole vault

Professional Events

- Throwing 56-pound weight
- Caber toss
- 14-pound shot put
- 16-pound hammer throw
- 220 yards race⁶²

Compared to the inaugural Games of 1893, where ten of the eighteen athletic events were open to professionals, this figure does show a proportional decrease in “the professional element.”⁶³ However, the 1900 Games in Vancouver had featured eleven amateur events and only six professional ones; thus, the ratio of five professional events to eight amateur events in 1902 was actually higher.⁶⁴ The available programmes for the 1893-1908 Games reveal that professional athletic competition remained standard.

The overt and continued professionalism of athletics in the early years of the Vancouver Caledonian Games might seem surprising, for this was an era when most sport in Canada organized by and for middle and upper class males of British descent was decidedly amateur.⁶⁵ Referring to professional baseball in the city, Robin Anderson

⁶² Programme for 1900 Caledonian Games, adapted from *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 4 August 1900.

⁶³ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 12 August 1893.

⁶⁴ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 5 August 1900.

⁶⁵ Bruce Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 20-22.

makes a compelling argument as to why circumstances differed in Vancouver: “One reason for the rank commercialism surrounding [Vancouver’s professional baseball squad] is that team owners and many of the game’s middle-class male fans used the game directly as a vehicle for profit or indirectly as a symbol of regional development.”⁶⁶ Indeed, these circumstances were true for the VSACS and the Caledonian Games as well. The Games were a consistent financial boon, averaging a profit of approximately \$150 per annum between 1903 and 1907.⁶⁷ As we will see, the society was beginning to recognize that this success meant that the Games could in fact become a medium for furthering civic development.

The increased success of the Games also meant that the society concentrated its efforts on presenting them in the most effective way possible. In the mid-1900s, the VSACS discussed the possibility of changing their venue. All of the Vancouver Games had been held at Brockton Point, which, with its ocean-side location in Stanley Park, was not very central for a population largely located in the downtown area and Mount Pleasant, and expanding further south each year.⁶⁸ In 1905, a group of local businessmen formed the Recreation Park Company and leased a plot of land from the Canadian Pacific Railway at the corner of Homer and Smithe Streets in downtown Vancouver where they built a large stadium.⁶⁹ Recreation Park soon became the focal point of Vancouver’s outdoor sports scene, and the VSACS decided to host the 1906 Games there.⁷⁰ The success of Recreation Park had come at the expense of the Brockton grounds, and before

⁶⁶ Anderson, “On the Edge of the Baseball Map,” 540.

⁶⁷ This information is obtained from the financial reports within the St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society’s minutes. See appendix on page 84 for a year-by-year financial summary of the Games.

⁶⁸ Morley, *Vancouver*, 120-122.

⁶⁹ Daniel Mason, “Professional Sports Facilities and Developing Urban Communities: Vancouver’s Recreation Park, 1905-1912,” *Urban History Review* 24, no. 1 (October 1997): 44.

⁷⁰ CVA, VSACS, 22 June 1906.

long, the Brockton Point Athletic Association (BPAA) was desperately trying to convince local sports associations to return to “the Point.”⁷¹ At the urging of the BPAA, the VSACS did so, scheduling their 1907 Games at the Stanley Park location. The week before the events were to take place, however, the BPAA asked the VSACS to remove the proposed football tournament from the schedule. As the society had already printed its programme, it refused to do so.⁷² Though the football tournament did go ahead as planned, Games organizers grew increasingly disenchanted with the BPAA. Poor business practices by the BPAA’s directors had resulted in a financial crisis, and the condition of the athletic grounds suffered consequently.⁷³ The Games committee noted in its 1907 report “that next year it [an argument about the use of the grounds] is more than likely to arise again, and...very early next year some provision should be made to avoid it.”⁷⁴

Indeed, in order to rectify the problem, the society reverted to Recreation Park as the venue for the 1908 Games. Though that year’s Games started as planned, the difficulty in hosting them in a facility that also hosted a baseball team became apparent by the end of the day. The *Daily News Advertiser* of 8 August 1908 listed the start time of the Games at 1:30 in the afternoon, with the Vancouver Beavers baseball club hosting Butte (Montana) in North West Baseball League action at 6:00 in the evening.⁷⁵ At 5:30, the management of the Park asked the organizers to clear the grounds so that preparations for the baseball game could take place. A disagreement between the parties followed,

⁷¹ Schrod, “Control of Sports Facilities in Early Vancouver,” 40.

⁷² CVA, VSACS, 2 August 1907.

⁷³ Barbara Schrod, “Control of Sports Facilities in Early Vancouver: The Brockton Point Athletic Association at Stanley Park, 1880 to 1913,” *Canadian Journal of History of Sport* 23, no. 2 (December 1992): 39-40.

⁷⁴ “Scottish Games 1907,” report by CVA, VSACS, 6 September 1907.

⁷⁵ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1908.

and the Recreation Park manager forced the VSACS members, competitors, and spectators to leave the premises before completing their programme. To the Recreation Park Company, the Caledonian Games were a one-off event that earned the company a minimal rental fee. The Vancouver Beavers, on the other hand, were in the midst of a championship season. Thousands of baseball fans attended home games on a regular basis, and in 1908, the Beavers were the primary source of revenue for Recreation Park.⁷⁶

The *Daily News Advertiser* downplayed the incident, stating that the end of “the programme had to be somewhat curtailed, some of the dances having to be decided later at the ball at English Bay.”⁷⁷ The society, on the other hand, was outraged by its treatment, as Archibald Lamberton, chairman of the 1908 Games committee, put it in the Games Report:

This committee desires to place on record its emphatic protest against the manner in which the Recreation Park company committed a breach of contract. The time legally at our disposal was from 1 to 6 pm but in spite of this we were threatened with an absolute prohibition unless we brought our games to a close at 5:30 at which time the manager of the Park C^{oy} and others began to clear us off the field leaving some of our events unfinished – we consider that a substantial reduction ought to be made by the Park C^{oy} in the rental charge on this account.⁷⁸

While the minutes make no record as to whether or not the society received any recompense for this alleged breach of contract, the incident influenced the Games’ later development.⁷⁹ It is clear that by 1908 the VSACS felt that it was in charge of one of Vancouver’s premier sporting events.

⁷⁶ Anderson, “On the Edge of the Baseball Map,” 538-574.

⁷⁷ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 9 August 1908.

⁷⁸ “Scottish Games 8th August 1908 Report of Games Committee,” CVA, VSACS, 4 September 1908.

⁷⁹ CVA, VSACS, 4 September 1909.

Conclusion

The Vancouver Caledonian Games went through a great deal of change between 1893 and 1908. While the earliest events had been ramshackle affairs put together on limited budgets, the society greatly improved its organizational techniques throughout the Games' first fifteen years. Despite the setback in 1908, the VSACS felt that the Games were poised to advance in the ranks of Vancouver's sports scene. Vancouver was growing rapidly in the early twentieth century, and changes to the city's economy and demographics played a large role in the progression of the VSACS and the Caledonian Games. Still, Archibald Lamberton's equation, quoted at the outset of the chapter, summed up the path that the VSACS had learned to follow in administering the Games: "Good prizes will attract good sport; good sport will attract spectators."⁸⁰

⁸⁰ Archibald Lamberton, "Report of the 1907 Games Committee," CVA, VSACS, September 1907.

CHAPTER THREE
Changing Meanings: The Games in Peace and War,
1909-1918

Sae, aince a year, at Brockton Green,
Oor Scots folk fain foregaiter-
Ilk buirdly chiel an' Sonsie quean-
As braw a crood as e'er was seen-
Amang their native heather.

There Scotsman born ayont the seas
Heare Scotia's native airs,
An' while a native's joy he prees,
'Neath Tartan shows his ain bare knees
As did his stoot forbears.

The fac' that ane may be a Scot
Yet ne'er tread Scottish ground,
Is juist as easy proved, I wot,
As that a cauf may grow a stot,
Nae matter whair it's found.

But whether hame or foreign grown,
We here hae demonstration,
As clear as e'er six could be shown,
That Scottish brain an' brawn an' bone
Win lasting admiration.

The world, in maist ways, forward moves,
Men roose her great advances,
But faith she'll rin in some fresh grooves,
An' ca' new pirns, ere she improves
Upon auld Scottish dances.

- Excerpt from a poem by A.D. McRae, read at the 1913 Vancouver Caledonian Games (City of Vancouver Archives, Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society Minutes)

What then is the duty of a good Canadian citizen at this present time? There must be absolute unity throughout the country. Let us loyally support our leaders, whether political or military. There is no greater enemy of this country than the man who publicly throws mud at our leaders. Let all help. For every citizen in the Empire there should be one all-dominating though – **HOW TO CRUSH THE HUNS.**

- Excerpt from a speech by H.O. Bell-Irving at the 1915 Caledonian Games (*Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1915)

The decade 1909-1918 was perhaps the most turbulent in the history of the Vancouver Caledonian Games. The Games faced a crisis of existence in 1909, when the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society was almost unable to find a local sporting association willing to lend its grounds. Faced with this problem, while Vancouver was destined, according to local entrepreneurs, to be one of Canada's and the world's finest cities, the society focused on promoting the Games as a mainstream sporting event. Vancouver's residents and media responded to this change almost immediately. Attendance at the Games rose sharply between 1910 and 1914, and they were more profitable than they had ever been. Local newspapers moved coverage of the Games from the community pages to the sports page, highlighting the triumphs of local athletes, while simultaneously turning the limelight away from the "purely Scottish" aspects, such as bagpiping and dancing. The onset of war in 1914 allowed the VSACS to use the Games as an instrument of patriotism. As the war continued over the following four years, the society emphasized its connections to the military, as well as the martial spirit associated with the Highland identity. Though the war delayed the growth of athletics at the Games, at its conclusion organizers were just as eager to promote the sports as they had been in the first half of the decade.

Crisis, Growth and Change

The debacle at the 1908 Games was a rude awakening for the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society. Although Vancouverites and the local media recognized the Caledonian Games as the foremost Scottish sporting institution, the society members felt that the Games should also be recognized as a top-level athletic

competition. However, the obstacles faced by the society in organizing the 1909 event would shatter that illusion. The secretary sent several letters to the Brockton Point Athletic Association in the first half of the year, asking for rental of its grounds, but, by early June, the society had yet to receive a response. Meanwhile, the Recreation Park Company offered its grounds for the same terms as in 1908, but the VSACS, obviously disenchanted, ignored the offer and considered the less profitable option of holding a picnic.¹ The society avoided this alternative at the last moment, as the BPAA finally contacted the VSACS in late June or July, and the two groups agreed to terms to return the 1909 Games to Brockton Point.² The VSACS had saved its prized Caledonian Games, but only by the slimmest of margins.

Because of the delay in finding a venue for the Games, the VSACS had scarcely any time to organize a large-scale athletic competition. Relying on their experience, the organizers quickly drafted a programme and began work on an advertising campaign. Part of their strategy involved tying the Caledonian Games and the VSACS to the history of Vancouver itself. Newspaper reports reveal that the VSACS billed the 1909 Games as Vancouver's "23rd annual," implying that they had been held each year since 1887.³ In essence, the society was intentionally participating in an act of self-mythologization. Although the practice of backdating Caledonian Games to the formation of the society that hosted them was not without precedent, the VSACS likely reckoned that doing so

¹ CVA, VSACS, 4 June 1909.

² CVA, VSACS, 22 July 1909; 3 September 1909.

³ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1909.

would link them with the formation of Vancouver itself.⁴ Indeed, this misleading claim was perpetuated annually at the Games until at least the 1930s.⁵

For the VSACS, tying the Games' origins to those of the city was a means of demonstrating their prosperity. The boosters who had cheered the city's rapid population growth the previous decade nearly saw their predictions come true: Vancouver's population first topped 100,000 in the 1911 census.⁶ Membership in the VSACS increased over this time as well, though not quite in the same proportion. While the society appears to have had a membership of about 30 in its first year, by 1906, it counted 128 men as members, and by 1910 the membership had risen to 411.⁷ According to Robert A.J. McDonald, Vancouver's growth meant that the small cadre of business élite at the top of Vancouver's industrial and commercial pyramid, faced with the increasing demands of managing larger and more sophisticated companies, had less time to devote to other affairs.⁸ The "wealthy business élite" that had once dominated VSACS membership was occupied in other business and social ventures. By the 1910s, most members came largely from what McDonald terms in *Making Vancouver* the "moderately well-to-do class": those who could afford the society's dues and had the leisure time to spend at a social club.⁹ Although the VSACS executive still had its share of lawyers, doctors, bankers, and merchants, its membership was solidly middle class.¹⁰

⁴ Donaldson, *The Scottish Highland Games in America*, 24n.

⁵ See, for example, *Vancouver Sun*, 5 August 1938.

⁶ Census data printed in Chuck Davis (ed.), *The Greater Vancouver Book: An Urban Dictionary* (Vancouver: Linkman Press, 1997), 780.

⁷ CVA, VSACS, 12 January 1906; 7 February 1913.

⁸ Robert A.J. McDonald, "The Business Elite and Municipal Politics in Vancouver, 1886-1914," *Urban History Review* 11, no. 3 (1983): 1-14.

⁹ McDonald, *Making Vancouver*, 175-200.

¹⁰ Information about occupations is based on a cross-reference of the VSACS executive (listed each year in the society's minutes) and the Vancouver Directory, published annually from 1886.

Connecting the birth of the city to the founding of the Games was also a way for the VSACS to stake a Scottish claim to Vancouver. Ethnic and “racial” tension had been prevalent in the city since before the anti-Oriental riot of 1907, when many began questioning the wisdom of allowing “foreigners” to contribute to Vancouver’s identity.¹¹ Developing sport that was particularly British or Scottish was a means of keeping the public image of the city “racially pure.”

With the city doubling in population roughly every five years, millions were spent improving Vancouver’s image.¹² Vancouver’s sports scene matured as a part of this process. The city spawned several interurban baseball leagues, in addition to the professional squad that had caused the Caledonian Games’ organizers headaches in 1908. Hockey’s famed Patrick brothers built the Denman Arena on Georgia Street that would, from 1911, house the Vancouver Millionaires, the only Vancouver team to capture the Stanley Cup.¹³ In 1910, the Vancouver Exhibition Association held its first fair. The Greater Vancouver Exhibition quickly became a prominent site for sporting events.¹⁴ The Vancouver interurban rail system introduced lacrosse trains in 1908, allowing spectators to journey between the city and New Westminster to watch championship matches.¹⁵ The 11,000-seat Recreation Park ceased operation in 1912 (no doubt to the delight of the VSACS), but two new stadiums, Con Jones Park and Athletic Park, opened shortly thereafter to fill that void.¹⁶ The VSACS recognized that Vancouver in the early

¹¹ Roy, *White Man’s Province*, 229-263.

¹² Morley, *Vancouver*, 126-127.

¹³ Nicol, *Vancouver*, 129.

¹⁴ Barbara Schrod, “Sport at the Fair: The Promotion of Urban Sport by the Vancouver Exhibition, 1910-1985,” *Journal of the West* 26, no. 1 (January 1987): 71-79; David Breen and Kenneth Coates, *The Pacific National Exhibition: An Illustrated History* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1982), 1-6.

¹⁵ Schrod, “Taking the Tram,” 54.

¹⁶ Mason, “Professional Sports Facilities,” 48.

twentieth century was a city that craved sport, and it was in a position to capitalize from that feeling.

The Caledonian Games as a Track Meet: 1910-1914

From its experiences in 1908 and 1909, the St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society learned that if the Caledonian Games were to be taken seriously as an athletic event, they would have to be marketed in that manner. Throughout the early 1910s, the society concentrated its efforts on maintaining organizational stability and raising the profile of the Games as an athletic event. At the same time, the City of Vancouver made a renewed effort to improve Stanley Park and its facilities. Relieved that the Games would not face a crisis like that of 1909, the society held them at Brockton Point during the following seven years. In the five years that preceded the First World War, the VSACS focused more on the "games" and less on the "Caledonian" aspects of its sporting event.

In 1910, the VSACS opened competition in athletic events to local sports clubs for the first time in the history of its Caledonian Games, and both the Vancouver Athletic Club (VAC) and local YMCA fielded teams for the event. The organizers of the athletic competitions encouraged a large number of entries in order to ensure a grand scale of competition. While the society put forth \$200 in prizes for the piping and dancing competition, the record number of sport competitors meant that "particularly handsome trophies and medals" and "prizes [totaling] over \$400" were available for the athletes.¹⁷ The VSACS promoted the 16-pound hammer throw and 200-yard handicap race as the focal points of the day's events, offering additional prizes to entice the city's strongest

¹⁷ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 6 August 1910.

and fastest athletes to compete.¹⁸ The society had put an unprecedented effort in presenting the 1910 Games as a sporting event with Scottish undertones, as opposed to vice versa. In their meeting following the Games, the organizers reported that the increased effort had been worthwhile, as the day had been a success in all regards. Not only had it set records for largest field of competitors and largest audience in the Games' history, but also the society had netted nearly \$500, the largest profit to that point. The Vancouver Caledonian Games were becoming a track meet with a Scottish theme.

The VSACS continued to seek legitimacy as a sporting event for the Caledonian Games in 1911. For the first time in the Games' history, the British Columbia Amateur Athletic Union sanctioned them, as they would any other track meet.¹⁹ The BCAAU's involvement in the Caledonian Games represented more than simply an attempt on the part of the VSACS to improve the Games' standing as a mainstream athletic event. The stringent rules defining amateur sport in the early twentieth century stipulated that any officially sanctioned amateur event could not be held in conjunction with professional competition. Thus, from 1911 onwards, athletic competition at the Vancouver Caledonian Games was strictly amateur.

The debate about professionalism in the Vancouver Games had been ongoing among society members since the turn of the century. As mentioned in the last chapter, some members had voiced concerns about the level of professionalism in the 1902 Games, though little, if anything, resulted from these concerns. Following the 1905 Games, W.J. Risk (one of the organizers, who would go on to be an official in the BCAAU) "called attention to so-called Professionals entering competitions merely for

¹⁸ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 6 August 1910.

¹⁹ CVA, VSACS, 4 August 1911.

gain and suggested stringent action for next year.”²⁰ Nevertheless, the programme for the 1906 Games included six professional events. Within a few years, however, the society would limit competition in the Games solely to amateurs, in an era when Vancouver’s sports scene was largely professional.²¹

Although professional sports had grown significantly in Canada since the beginning of the twentieth century, proponents of amateur sport still felt that they had the mighty weight of morality on their side, with amateur sport evoking the exemplary ideals of British sport and society. Supporters viewed amateur sport as a means of instilling “the work ethic, respect for authority, and loyalty to Canada as a British nation.”²² The strict rules defining amateurism meant that most associations deemed any individual a professional who competed in a sport with or against professionals, regardless of whether or not he had received payment. The BCAAU adhered to this definition through the 1910s, though it was liberal in reinstating players for minor violations of the “amateur code.”²³ Still, these restrictions served to limit participation in the Caledonian Games to athletes who could afford to participate in sport in their leisure time. After the Games became fully amateur, competitors unaffiliated with a local sporting association were scarce. Therefore, it is safe to infer that participation in Games was essentially restricted to middle and upper class men by the 1910s.

The change to amateur competition produced an interesting result in terms of the ethnicity of athletes at the Games. Although there is no evidence that the VSACS prohibited any competitors because of ethnic origin, most athletes in the Games of the

²⁰ CVA, VSACS, 11 August 1905.

²¹ Anderson, “On the Edge of the Baseball Map,” 573.

²² Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 50.

1890s and 1900s were of British origin (with a large percentage being Scottish).²⁴ Between 1907 and 1910, several competitors whose last names indicate French or German origin are listed in local newspapers as having competed at the Games. However, in the eight years after the VSACS restricted competition to members of amateur athletic organizations, only British names appear in the results lists.²⁵ Significantly, then, while the Games were increasingly representing civic development, they were also more exclusively British-Canadian in terms of participation.

Factors other than ethnicity dictated who could compete in the Games, and who was relegated to the bleachers. Women's participation in the VSACS and the Caledonian Games was rare during this period. Although M. Ann Hall writes that "by World War I Canadian women had ventured into every conceivable form of physical activity...[save] those in which body contact was possible," the only contests open to females at the Games continued to be girls' races.²⁶ As elsewhere, women (usually unmarried) played a more prominent role in the Highland dancing events. Rowland Berthoff observes that at this time, the dance events, which had been traditionally considered a masculine domain, "became a mainly feminine art."²⁷ Discussion about women's participation at the Games was rarely recorded in the VSACS minutes, which makes it difficult to ascertain the society's motivations for limiting it. The fact that women did not compete in regular athletics, however, suggests that members of Vancouver's middle class were still nervous about the idea.

²³ University of British Columbia Archives, Harry Archibald Fonds, British Columbia Amateur Athletic Association files. MSS A3B9, Box 1-3, 1911-1914.

²⁴ For a detailed breakdown of the ethnic origin of athletes at the Games, see Table 1 on page 73.

²⁵ See Table 1 on page 73.

²⁶ Hall, "Women's Sport in Canada," 79.

²⁷ Rowland Berthoff, "Under the Kilt: Variations on the Scottish-American Ground," *Journal of American Ethnic History* 1, no. 2 (1982), 13.

Changes in the Local Media Coverage of the Caledonian Games

Newspaper coverage of the Games shows that the local media responded to the changes that the VSACS made. A typical 1910s newspaper article about the games started with an imaginary conversation between two “Macs,” replete with colourful “Scottified” language describing the caber toss, piping, or whatever the writer felt was stereotypically Scottish and requisitely amusing. Having applied the necessary pseudo-Gaelic window-dressing, the article proceeded to detail which local athletes had particularly excelled in the track events. Results from the Highland fling and other dances, if mentioned, were at the end of the column or on another page towards the back of the paper. An article in the 7 August 1910 *Daily News Advertiser* (pictured below) is indicative of media coverage in the first half of the decade. Sub-headlined “Scottish Sports at Brockton Point Gladden Many Highland Hearts – VAC [Vancouver Athletic Club] Team Wins, Scoring 90 Points,” the article opens with an imaginary conversation between “Donal” and “Sandy” upon leaving Brockton Point.²⁸ It proceeds to devote three-quarters of its space to the athletic events, with the remaining space divided between the dancing and piping competitions. The *Vancouver Daily Province* recapped the 1911 Games in the sports section of its 30 July issue, and the reporter made no mention of the piping or dancing events, using the entire column to discuss the athletics.²⁹

By 1912, the local media evidently viewed the Games as a sports event with Scottish window dressing. An article in the *Vancouver Sun* describing that year’s Games opened with a rough translation of the St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society, *Nemo me impune lacessit* (No one provokes me with impunity). The reporter’s version was “if you

²⁸ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 7 August 1910.

²⁹ *Vancouver Daily Province*, 30 July 1911.

set out to trim a Highlander, you'll come home in an ambulance.”³⁰ After a lengthy dissection of the day's sporting events, the reporter offered this view of the bagpipe competition: “However trying the complaining of the pipes may be to the unappreciative Sassenach (a derogatory term for a Englishman) there is no doubt that for making music for fighting to, the pipes have no rival.”³¹ In the *Daily News Advertiser's* coverage of the 1914 Games, the only hint of the Games' Scottish heritage was the results of the caber toss.³² Without having attended the Games, one would not have realized that they also featured Highland dancing and bagpiping competitions, as all three major daily newspapers ignored these events. By 1914, the Vancouver media were solely concerned with the athletic competition at the Caledonian Games; all of the “Scottishness” was “trying” to the Sassenaches in the audience.

However, the Highland and British imperialist imprint of the Games was about to receive a significant boost. Three days after the 1914 Games, Britain declared war on Germany and the Empire joined the “war to end all wars.” The First World War, however, did not end all sport, though it did alter its meaning to many participants in, and organizers of, sporting events. For the Vancouver Caledonian Games, the war represented a break in the rapid development of the event as a mainstream athletic competition, albeit a break that had few lasting effects.

The VSACS and “Scots Sports in War Time”

I recall an old Scottish chieftain showing me the sword of his ancestors. On it was an inscription in Spanish:
‘Do not draw me without reason;
‘Do not sheath me without honor.’

³⁰ *Vancouver Sun*, 5 August 1912.

³¹ *Vancouver Sun*, 5 August 1912.

³² *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 2 August 1914.

There never was a better reason, and the sword never will be sheathed until victory is sure. Go and help win that victory.³³

These were the concluding words of a speech given at the 1915 Vancouver Caledonian Games by Henry Ogle Bell-Irving, Vancouver pioneer, prominent businessman, and past president of the VSACS. Canada was at war, and Vancouver's residents were committed to the cause. Though Vancouver had sent a contingent of seventeen soldiers to the Boer War in 1899-1900 (fourteen of whom returned), the Great War was the city's first major contribution of soldiers to international conflict. There were ten Vancouver regiments among the first Canadian troops sent overseas in 1914. One of these regiments, the 72nd Seaforth Highlanders, contained several members of the VSACS.³⁴ Many of Vancouver's citizens relished the opportunity to contribute to the Empire, and the VSACS was keen to ensure that it could play a role in the effort. During the First World War, the society emphasized its ties to the military, and used the Caledonian Games and other events as visceral demonstrations of the martial abilities attributed to the Highlander.

The topic of public celebration during the war years was controversial, as many people felt that fairs and festivals were a frivolity, given the international situation. In 1918, the Vancouver Exhibition Association responded to this suggestion with an impassioned defence of the importance of wartime community events. Exhibitions such as theirs and the Caledonian Games were "an influential means of educating and

³³ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1915.

³⁴ J.H. Hamilton, "Vancouver's contribution to the Empire: a souvenir of the First Overseas Contingent who volunteered for foreign service from the regiments of Vancouver and district." Vancouver: News Advertiser Printing, 1914.

inspiring the people” while also serving as “an important factor in maintaining ... equilibrium of communities in times of danger and unrest.”³⁵

Throughout the war, the VSACS conducted its activities with a firm eye towards staunch support of the Empire, hosting patriotic lectures that served as updates on the progression of the war, as well as affirmation of the Scots’ military prowess.³⁶ An example of these lectures was a speech delivered in early 1915 by society member and lawyer, Ian Mackenzie, covering “the historic & romantic evolution of the Highlander.” The lecturer, who would go on to be a long-serving MLA, MP, and Senator, presented his historical interpretation of the Highlander “from the mystic age of Ossian, down to the present stirring days of the trenches in Europe.”³⁷ The society members in attendance were overjoyed with Mackenzie’s jingoistic rendition of Scottish history:

No Scot present, be he Highland or Lowland, but who felt his pulses (sic) quicken & his blood leap, as the heroic tale of the ages was unfolded before his mental vision. No one listening to the lecturer could but fervently believe that, through the centuries to come, the Banner of St. Andrew would continue, as in the past, to unfold its colours over a free, courageous & independent people.³⁸

The society conceived of Vancouver as an Empire city, and the Scots as its most valiant citizens. (Mackenzie, himself, never ceased trying to keep Vancouver purely British, distinguishing himself during the Second World War by announcing “let our slogan be for British Columbia ... ‘No Japs from the Rockies to the sea.’”)³⁹ Indeed, the society had amended its constitution to include “the general promotion of the welfare and unity

³⁵ Vancouver Exhibition Association “Bulletin No. 9,” 1918, as cited in Breen and Coates, *The Pacific National Exhibition*, 21.

³⁶ Examples of these speeches are seen in CVA, VSACS, 8 January 1915; 5 February 1915; 4 June 1915; 2 July 1915.

³⁷ CVA, VSACS, 2 April 1915.

³⁸ CVA, VSACS, 2 April 1915.

³⁹ Kirsten Emiko McAllister, “Narrating Japanese Canadians In and Out of the Canadian Nation: A Critique of Realist Forms of Representation,” *Canadian Journal of Communication* 24 no. 1 (1999): 97.

of the [Scottish] race” within the city of Vancouver.⁴⁰ In his speech at the 1915 Games, Henry Bell-Irving called on the crowd to “devote the whole resources of the Empire” in order to accomplish the only important goal – defeating Germany.⁴¹ The society was initially willing to contribute in any way possible. In 1916, and likely in other years (financial information from the war years is scarce in the VSACS minutes), the VSACS invested a substantial amount of the revenue from the Games in War Bonds.⁴²

The society also demonstrated its support of Scottishness within the Empire in ways other than patriotic speeches and nationalistic quasi-historical lectures. Before the war, it might have been a joke to say that the bagpipes produced nothing more than good music to fight to, but no longer. Upon leaving for the front, Brigadier-General J. W. Stewart donated a trophy to the VSACS, stipulating that it be awarded (along with a \$1000 prize) to the champions of the Vancouver Games’ pipe band competition. At the 1915 Games, the 72nd Seaforth Highlanders pipe band captured the Stewart trophy, with the 50th Gordons battalion of Victoria placing second.⁴³ The 72nd went on to win every pipe band competition during the war years.⁴⁴

Following the 1915 Games, the society’s bard, Alex McRae, read a poem entitled “Scots Sports in War Time,” that, unfortunately, has been lost from the society’s minutes.⁴⁵ Development of the Games as a sporting event, however, was stalled during the war years. The *Daily News Advertiser* described the 1915 Games as the best athletic event “both in quality and quantity...held in this city for many months,”⁴⁶ but the

⁴⁰ *Vancouver Province*, 6 August 1917.

⁴¹ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1915.

⁴² CVA, VSACS, 29 August 1916.

⁴³ *Vancouver Sun*, 9 August 1915.

⁴⁴ *Vancouver Sun*, 7 August 1916; 6 August 1917; 4 August 1918; 3 August 1919.

⁴⁵ CVA, VSACS, 10 September 1915.

⁴⁶ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1915.

accuracy of this statement is debatable. The quality of sports held in Canada declined dramatically during the war years, as men in the prime of their athletic lives went overseas. Sporting events, including the Caledonian Games, were used as prime forums for recruitment campaigns, and the primary purpose of holding a sporting event during the early war years was imperial support, not improved sport.⁴⁷ Newspaper accounts from 1915 indicate that the majority of competitors were either reserve soldiers or else members of local police and fire departments. While the local media generally described the wartime games as having been “unqualified successes” and the “best Caledonian Games in Vancouver’s history,” such claims appear to be exaggerations. Only one British Columbia athletic record was set during the span – in the 16-pound shot put at the 1917 Games.⁴⁸ The *Vancouver Sun* reported that an “Immense Throng” that “[outnumbered] any previous attendance” witnessed the 1918 Games.⁴⁹ While this would appear to indicate financial success, the society barely managed to break even, taking in the least amount of money in over a decade of Caledonian Games.⁵⁰

As the war intensified and its grim realities began to be known on the home front, sporting events such as the Caledonian Games served not only as inspiration, but also as a convenient diversion. An article on the 1917 Games noted that “the large attendance of military men ... recalled the shadow of the war in Europe, but also the glorious record of the Canadian Scots who are fighting for freedom.”⁵¹ While the “track events were not as well contested as in some former years,” the athletics still provided the audience a day’s

⁴⁷ Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 39-40.

⁴⁸ *Vancouver Sun*, 6 August 1917.

⁴⁹ *Vancouver Sun*, 4 August 1918.

⁵⁰ CVA, VSACS, 5 September 1919.

⁵¹ *Vancouver Province*, 6 August 1917.

respite from conscription debates, domestic political crises, and a war that had claimed tens of thousands of Canadian soldiers' lives.⁵²

As the war continued, however, the society members found it harder to use the Games as an instrument of support for Empire. At a May 1918 meeting, an anonymous society member proposed a radical change for that year's event. He proposed that the society, instead of purchasing expensive prizes, award diplomas to the winners of each competition. The money saved, he argued, could be donated to a cause such as the International Committee of the Red Cross, or the Harry Lauder fund, a charity founded to aid disabled veterans of the war. Organizers countered that prizes were necessary to the success of the Games. Without adequate incentive, they argued, the best competitors would choose not to participate. The question eventually went to a vote, and the majority of members present sided with the organizers.⁵³ A.S. Matthews, one of the organizers, later told the *Vancouver Sun* that he expected the Games to be particularly prosperous, as "the prizes ... this year are probably the most valuable that have ever been offered by the society."⁵⁴ By 1918, even the staunchest supporters of the Empire needed a distraction from the war.

Despite the disjunction caused by the war, the Games broke into the mainstream of Vancouver sport in the 1910s. However, the racist and nationalist discourse espoused by many during the war years was a crystallization of the commonly held idea that Vancouver was to be a British city.⁵⁵ Many Vancouverites feared that immigration, especially from Asian nations, was threatening the "racial purity" of the city. Although

⁵² *Vancouver Sun*, 6 August 1917.

⁵³ CVA, VSACS, 3 May 1918.

⁵⁴ *Vancouver Sun*, 3 August 1918.

⁵⁵ Ward, *White Canada Forever*, 100-105.

the proportion of Asians in Vancouver was actually in decline throughout the first quarter of the twentieth century⁵⁶, many residents feared upheaval and sought to keep Vancouver “white.”⁵⁷ Popular acceptance of the Games and the VSACS’s willingness to link their origins with those of Vancouver itself suggests that the society was seeking a more specific cultural identity for the city. Vancouver was to be Scottish, or, more generally, British.

At war’s end, the Vancouver Caledonian Games were in about the same position as at the beginning of the century. In the years before the war, the VSACS accelerated its promotion of the Games as an amateur track meet, and the local media responded by treating them as such. Increased advertising and enthusiastic reporting of the Games resulted in a dramatic increase in popularity. Unprecedented financial successes met the Games between 1909 and 1914. The society therefore achieved victories on two fronts: the commercial success of the Games ensured their prosperity and development, and the inclusion of only amateur athletes ensured that they could claim moral superiority. However, this idea ran counter to that of many promoters of amateur sport at this time, who felt that increased commercialization took away from the purity of the competition. The onset of war meant that the society did not resolve this seeming contradiction until the 1920s. During the war, the Games (and other sporting events that did not fold operations) served the dual functions of fostering patriotism as well as providing a distraction from the horrors overseas. The VSACS emerged from the war facing a very

⁵⁶ Roy, *Vancouver*, 170.

⁵⁷ Roy, *Consolidating a White Man’s Province*, 26-31.

different Vancouver, but it was poised to return the Games to the status that they had held beforehand.

CHAPTER FOUR
**Final Destination: The Vancouver Caledonian Games and Civic Development,
1919-1926**

That here, 'neath Western sun's clear rays,
Her sturdy bairns are fain to prove her
Inspirer o' sport's brightest days
In splendid annals o' Vancouver.

- A.D. McRae, "Mither Scotia's Bairns"
Poem read at 1922 Vancouver Caledonian Games

The Vancouver Exhibition ... possesses a unique opportunity of becoming the great show room, the sample house, the great publicity bureau, the great educator and exponent of the wonderful God-given resources of the country.

- Vancouver Exhibition Association *Bulletin* No. 11 (1920)
as cited in Breen and Coates, *The Pacific National Exhibition*, p. 36.

With the armistice signed and the "turbulent teens" nearly over, the members of the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society were, like most Canadians, hoping for a return to "normalcy." Despite poor economic conditions, the VSACS had grown in prominence in the pre-war years largely because of the success of its Caledonian Games. After re-evaluating the state of the Games in 1909, the society focused on presenting them as a top-tier athletic event with particular Scottish overtones. The next half-decade was one of unprecedented growth for the Games. Attendance numbers increased sharply and greater profits followed. The VSACS achieved its goal of attracting a higher caliber of athlete, and many Vancouverites recognized the Games as one of the jewels in the city's summer sports crown. Although war had stalled these growth trends, the Games' organizers were determined to resume them. In doing so, they also had to resolve the

apparent contradiction that had fueled the development of the Games in the first half of the 1910s: namely, that the Games were a highly commercialized and marketed event that supposedly celebrated the purity of amateur sport. Consequently, in the 1920s, the society re-emphasized its role as an agent of “civic development,” with the Caledonian Games as a central focus. The VSACS achieved this goal in 1926, when it reached an agreement with the Vancouver Exhibition Association to incorporate the into the Greater Vancouver Exhibition, the city’s week-long “show window” for the rest of Canada to look through.

Vancouver after the War

Vancouver, after the First World War, faced the paradox of being a city of both prosperity and despair. Victory overseas ended four difficult years of wartime economy and spending, and Vancouver’s industry and commerce boomed. Technological advance made it possible to ship Canadian grain from Vancouver to Europe, a feat unattainable before 1918. The opening of the Panama Canal during the war further facilitated the transport of goods from the port to destinations throughout the world.¹ For Vancouver’s wealthy élite, this was an era of commercial opportunity and development.² Nor did everyone make their fortune on the right side of the law during this period, for the United States government’s prohibition of alcohol fostered an increase in the business of organized crime in the city.³ Yet, the prosperity (legal or otherwise) was not universal. The transition of men from the trenches of Europe to the city of Vancouver was supposed to be a shot in the arm for the city’s economy, as well as a welcome change to the war-

¹ Nicol, *Vancouver*, 144-146.

² McDonald, *Making Vancouver*, 160-163.

³ Morley, *Vancouver*, 153-155; Nicol, *Vancouver*, 147.

weary veterans. Despite record amounts of capital investment in British Columbia, and especially Vancouver, by 1920 the level of unemployment was extremely high.⁴ Veterans' associations beseeched local employers to hire returned men, but by 1921, Vancouver still housed more than 2000 unemployed servicemen among its 10,000 jobless.⁵ The postwar economic situation did not begin to improve until the mid-1920s, when European markets regrouped, and demand for Canadian exports increased.⁶ In addition to creating massive profits for the shipping magnates in the city, this necessitated the creation of thousands of jobs on Vancouver's docks.

The First World War had important effects on the development of sport in Canada. Although it had disrupted sports leagues and competitions domestically, military service allowed many a Canadian soldier to participate in intra- and inter-regimental competition.⁷ Returnees able to secure a job often found it working as grain elevator operators, longshoremen, or in other manual labour occupations.⁸ Professional sports also provided a career for men talented enough to compete at a high level. Numerous regional leagues of various sports were created in the postwar years, and major professional leagues such as the National Hockey League gained popularity nationwide.

Although large sections of the Canadian population embraced professional sports in this era, proponents of amateur sport still viewed this as a threat, and reacted accordingly. The number of regional, provincial, and national amateur sports

⁴ Morley, *Vancouver*, 152-153.

⁵ See, for example, *Vancouver Sun*, 4 August 1921.

⁶ John Herd Thompson and Allen Seager, *Decades of Discord: Canada 1922-1939* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985), 76.

⁷ Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 39-41.

⁸ See, for example, Michael Kevin Dooley, "'Our Mickey': The Story of Private James O'Rourke, VC.MM (CEF), 1879-1957," *Labour/Le Travail* 47 (2001): 171-184.

associations increased sharply.⁹ At the national level, the Canadian Amateur Athletic Union maintained its strict definition of an amateur athlete. The CAAU deemed anyone who had received any pay for athletic competition, taught sports for money, sold a prize won in an event, promoted a competition for pay, or received payment for missing work to compete in athletics to be irrevocably professional.¹⁰ This last condition – the prohibition on “broken-time” pay – made it exceedingly difficult for a worker to maintain amateur status, especially in the economic conditions of the 1920s.

Throughout this era, the VSACS strengthened its ties with the governing bodies of amateur sport. In March 1919, it appointed a delegate to the British Columbia Amateur Athletic Union.¹¹ Little information is available about the society’s involvement in the BCAAU, as the union’s minutes are limited and do not generally identify the member organizations of its delegates.¹² The VSACS minutes only record the society’s opinion on one vote, but it does provide some insight into the members’ conception of amateurism in sport. In 1921, the BCAAU debated annulling the rule that prohibited an athlete who had competed professionally in one sport from remaining amateur in another. Historically, athletes in violation of this rule could have their amateur status reinstated, although officials often based such decisions less on the merits of the case, and more on presumptions of the athlete’s “character.”¹³ The VSACS instructed its delegate, a Mr. Dickson, to vote in favour of scrapping the restriction.¹⁴ By

⁹ Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 54.

¹⁰ Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 55-56.

¹¹ CVA, VSACS, 7 March 1919.

¹² Some BCAAU files are stored at the University of British Columbia Archives, Harry Archibald Fonds, British Columbia Amateur Athletic Association files. MSS A3B9, Box 1-3.

¹³ University of British Columbia Archives. Archibald Fonds, British Columbia Amateur Athletic Association files. MSS A3B9, Box 1-3, 1911-1914; Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 54-56.

¹⁴ CVA, VSACS, 4 November 1921.

voting to liberalize the definition of an amateur, the society likely felt that it could attract a higher level of competitor while maintaining the “purity” of amateur sport.

Bruce Kidd, in *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, cogently analyzes arguments of amateur sport’s moral superiority made by Canadian promoters of the 1920s. Sport, it was said (and still is), developed “proper” conceptions of masculine behaviour in its participants. Teamwork, fair play, and sportsmanship, promoters claimed, were necessary not only to success in sport, but in the business of moving Canada forward. Professionalism, they argued, fostered beliefs antithetical to the aims of nation building. It encouraged at best selfishness, and at worst outright cheating. Thus, those who adhered to a strict definition of amateurism claimed a moral high ground. Commentators attacked professional sport on economic grounds as well. Journalist Leslie Roberts suggested that participation in professional sport would leave the athlete “at thirty, jobless and drifting around the fringes of the Big Time, looking for a job driving pegs.”¹⁵ While amateur sport taught the principles necessary to succeed, professionalism fostered vice, and left the athlete destitute when his physical prowess waned in middle age. As Kidd argues, “the amateur code...bound ‘the making of men’ to the broader project of nation building.”¹⁶ Analogously, the VSACS resolved the two sides of the Caledonian Games, namely, profitability and amateurism, by accentuating its contribution to the development of Vancouver and its young men.

If the war had caused a decline in the importance of the Caledonian Games as a sporting event, and of the quality of competition therein, the VSACS was ready in 1919 to return them to their previous form. The 1919 Games featured several impressive

¹⁵ Leslie Roberts, “Does Sport Pay a Dividend?,” *Canadian Magazine* (August 1931): 46, as cited in Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 56.

athletic competitions, prompting the *Vancouver Sun* to remark that “the scene at the Point recalled old times when the ‘Scotch sports’ were the big holiday event of Vancouver’s summer season.”¹⁷ The next year, the *Sun* reported that the “Big Programme of Sports Brings Out Big Crowd of Competitors,” which ensured that the Games had the “biggest Scottish sports crowd since before the war.”¹⁸ The society added the British Columbia five-a-side soccer championship tournament to the programme of events in 1921, which proved a popular addition.¹⁹ Eight teams battled under the hot sun to the delight of the record crowd of twelve thousand, with the Cumberland squad from Vancouver Island defeating the hometown St. Andrew’s club in the final. Spectators at the 1922, 1923, and 1924 Games were thrilled by the efforts of John Murdoch in the heavy events. Murdoch was indicative of the type of competitor the VSACS wanted at the Games; many saw him as an archetype of masculinity for the city. Tall and well-built, Murdoch was not only a fine contestant in the heavy events, but also a member of the Point Grey Police Department.²⁰ His athletic prowess extended well beyond the scope of the Vancouver Caledonian Games; he traveled to Paris in 1924 to compete in the Olympic hammer throw, where he placed eighth. Murdoch was a visceral representation of the society’s goal of linking athletic competition to the development of Vancouver.

The VSACS, Caledonian Games, Masculinity, and Civic Development

As mentioned in the previous chapter, the Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society frequently emphasized its ties to Vancouver’s historical development.

¹⁶ Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 44-93.

¹⁷ *Vancouver Sun*, 3 August 1919.

¹⁸ *Vancouver Sun*, 8 August 1920.

¹⁹ *Vancouver Sun*, 4 August 1921; 6 August 1921; 7 August 1921.

²⁰ *Vancouver Sun*, 4 August 1923.

That both the city and the society were born in 1886 was of great interest to members, as was the fact that the society's first president was concurrently the first mayor. After the war, the society began to reassert its importance as an institution of civic development in more proactive ways. While the VSACS always kept as part of its mandate the assistance of those in need, much of its public activity during the 1920s was geared towards the presentation of Vancouver as a notable city of the twentieth century. Society member Thomas Prentice described the mandates of the VSACS in a 1921 *Vancouver Sun* article. Along with the goals of Scottish promotion specified in the society's constitution, the VSACS also worked "for the development of Vancouver, the upbuilding of BC; for the purification of our national life, and for all that is best in Canadian manhood."²¹

The gendered nature of civic development in the 1920s is obvious in the above statement, as well as in the society's administration of the Caledonian Games. Though many commentators have characterized the 1920s as the "golden age" of women's sport in Canada, athletic competition at the Games remained a male-only pursuit. This did not change until 1929, when the society's directors allowed the Women's Amateur Athletic Federation of Canada to include its provincial championships as part of the Games' track programme.²² For most of the decade, however, the VSACS operated on the principle that amateur sports turned boys into good citizens who could become civic leaders in later life.

This sentiment was common in Vancouver at the time. The City of Vancouver hired the American city-planning firm of Harold Bartholomew in the middle of the

²¹ T.A. Prentice, "Vancouver Scotsmen Muster Behind Banner of St. Andrew in Steady Drive for Civic Development," *Vancouver Sun*, 23 January 1921, 20.

²² CVA, VSACS, 23 May 1929; 4 June 1929.

decade, with the intent of developing Vancouver as an efficient, modern city.²³ Integral to Bartholomew's plan for Vancouver was adequate room for sports and games within the city's bounds. As Vancouver had grown, Bartholomew claimed, the space necessary for young boys and girls (but especially boys) to play had diminished. With no space for games, boys invariably turned to delinquency. Introducing new parks, playgrounds, and sports fields would allow children and youths to partake in "acceptable" pastimes.²⁴ The VSACS joined the crusade for healthy activity among boys in 1922, when it added a junior athletic meet to the Caledonian Games. Consisting of eleven track events, none of which was "traditionally" Scottish, the junior event was open to boys only. Indeed, by 1922, the society had removed all of the girls' races from its programme, though most of the dance competitors were by this point female.

The Greater Vancouver Exhibition was first held in 1910, the product of three years' work on behalf of the Vancouver Exhibition Association, a conglomeration of twenty-six local businessmen.²⁵ The Exhibition served many purposes in its early years: it was a showcase for the produce of local industry and agriculture, and sports were common. As VEA President J.J. Miller argued, "[the] recreative and social side of our annual reunion are as necessary to the life of the institution and the people as the material and commercial objects in view."²⁶ The VEA often staged races – human, horse, bicycle, and vehicle – as a means of attracting spectators to the early Exhibitions.²⁷ In the 1920s, the GVE saw a steady increase in attendance, despite controversy at the organizational

²³ Oke, *Vancouver and its Region*, 122-123.

²⁴ Oke, *Vancouver and its Region*, 124-125.

²⁵ Breen and Coates, *The Pacific National Exhibition*, 1.

²⁶ Vancouver Exhibition Association, *Bulletin* No. 5 (1914), in Barbara Schrodt, "Sport at the Fair: The Promotion of Urban Sport by the Vancouver Exhibition, 1910-1985," *Journal of the West* 26, no. 1 (January 1987): 72.

²⁷ Schrodt, "Sport at the Fair," 72-73; Breen and Coates, *The Pacific National Exhibition*, 6.

level.²⁸ Many Vancouver residents questioned the wisdom of using the large piece of land that was Hastings Park primarily for a weeklong summer fair. Thus, throughout the decade, the VEA developed Hastings as a prime location for sports; between 1915 and 1925 the VEA sponsored the construction of facilities for lacrosse, soccer, basketball, tennis, and golf.²⁹ As a prime mover of civic development and celebration, the VEA was strongly in favour of including sport on the fairgrounds.

In January 1926, VEA director J.K. Matheson contacted the VSACS to discuss the possibility of holding the Games at Hastings Park as part of the GVE.³⁰ According to the VSACS minutes, Matheson “intimated that the Exhibition Committee were willing to do everything in their power to make the Games more attractive than ever before, should the Society decide to accept this proposal.”³¹ Translated into real terms, this meant that the VEA was willing to provide funding for the Games. The society negotiated a grant of \$700 for the 1926 Games and the promise of continued funding. The grandstand at Hastings was also capable of holding a much larger crowd than that of Brockton Point. With financial assurance and increased visibility as part of the largest fair in the province, the society reaped a sizable profit in 1926.³² In addition to financial security, alliance with the VEA represented a realization of the VSACS’s goal of civic development through sport. With an annual attendance of about 200,000, the society also had the opportunity to promote Scottish culture to a greater number of people than ever before.

²⁸ Breen and Coates, *The Pacific National Exhibition*, 25.

²⁹ Schrodt, “Sport at the Fair,” 73.

³⁰ CVA, VSACS, 16 January 1926.

³¹ CVA, VSACS, 8 January 1926.

³² CVA, VSACS, 3 September 1926; 1 October 1926.

“Scottishness” and the Vancouver Caledonian Games in the 1920s

The VSACS’s focus on promoting the athletic aspect of the Games combined with Vancouver’s increasing ethnic diversity meant that, throughout the 1920s, the more overtly “Scottish” aspects of the Caledonian Games continued to diminish in importance. The author of a *Vancouver Sun* article on the 1920 Games was keen to point out that while the “big event of the day from a purely Scottish standpoint was the pipe band competition,” it was the athletics that ensured that the “big grandstand was packed, and the crowd overflowed by several hundred on to the concourse below.”³³ Most newspaper coverage of the Games during the twenties focused on the size of the programme, the number and quality of competitors, and the size of the crowd, rather than the “purely’ Scottish” aspects. In 1925 and 1926, neither major Vancouver daily reported on the dancing and piping events. The Caledonian Games belonged on the sports page, and in the minds of the newspaper editors at least, Highland dance and piping were not sports.

Table 1 – Ethnic Origin of Athletes in Vancouver Caledonian Games, by Surname^a

Years	Total # of Athletes	British (% of total) ^b	Scottish (% of total) ^c	Other (% of total) ^d
1893-1900	84	82 (97.6)	38 (45.2)	2 (2.4)
1902-1910	127	122 (96.1)	59 (46.5)	5 (3.9)
1911-1918	181	181 (100)	73 (40.3)	0 (0)
1919-1926	161	149 (92.5)	57 (35.4)	12 (7.5)

^a National origin of surnames determined from Elsdon C. Smith, *New Dictionary of American Family Names*. New York: Harper & Row, 1972. These data are from newspaper reports of the Vancouver Caledonian Games from 1893 to 1926. In most years, newspapers listed the last names of the top two or three finishers in each event. Data reflect competitors in athletic competitions only.

^b “British” refers to names of English, Irish, or Scottish origin.

^c “Scottish” refers to the subset of “British” names of Scottish origin.

^d “Other” includes all other national origins. Nationalities suggested by “Other” names include French, Dutch, German, Spanish, Italian, and Japanese.

³³ *Vancouver Sun*, 8 August 1920.

Newspaper reports indicate that the ethnic origin of athletes began to diversify slightly in the 1920s, with a decline of Scottish surnames to just over a third of all participants listed in 1919-1926, and an increase of non-British names to twelve (7.5 percent) from none the previous eight years (Table 1). Scottish surnames could be misleading, as in the case of Lee Cowan, the winner of several track events in the Games of the early 1920s who was described by a *Vancouver Sun* reporter as “the local colored flash.”³⁴ A larger percentage of non-British names appear in accounts of the junior athletic meet, including J. Okumura, who captured the junior shot put title at the 1923 Games.³⁵ Although participation in the Games remained overwhelmingly British, the level of ethnic exclusivity had dropped significantly from the previous decade.

From time to time, the VSACS showed concern towards the seeming decrease of authentic Scottish culture at the Games. Remarking that fewer and fewer attendees and competitors of the Games were dressing in their tartans, in 1923 the society promoted “the encouragement of wearing the Kilts, by all those who can possibly do so” and advising that “[all] those in the Highland Garb [should] march behind the bands and help singing.”³⁶ However, a photograph in the *Vancouver Province* portraying seven past presidents of the VSACS posing for the camera at the 1923 Games reveals only two of them were sporting kilt, bonnet, and sporran.³⁷ Despite the appeals to wear the “national” Scots costume, the Scottish undertone of the Games remained just that; the track events, and newer additions such as cycling, remained the largest drawing cards.

³⁴ *Vancouver Sun*, 7 August 1921.

³⁵ *Vancouver Sun*, 5 August 1923.

³⁶ *Vancouver Sun*, 8 August 1920.

³⁷ *Vancouver Province*, 6 August 1923.

Grand
Added Attraction
The Mammoth Musical
Tournament
"COMMONWEALTH OF
NATIONS"
Assisted by the Famous Cold-
stream Guards Band

Saturday's Special Feature
CALEDONIAN GAMES
In Front of Grandstand All Day

Come, all ye Scotsmen—listen to the stirring music of the pipes, join the gathering of the clans and see the Caledonian Games at the Exhibition tomorrow! All day there will be a continuous programme of music, dancing, games, contests and feats of strength. Don't miss it—even if there isn't a drop of Scottish blood in your veins, you'll enjoy every minute of it.

Coldstream Guards Band
LAST DAY! **Two Big Concerts**

Tomorrow is the final day for the world-famous Coldstream Guards Band—the music that has delighted and enthralled thronging thousands at the Exhibition this week. Don't forget, it's their final day—two big concert programmes—be sure and come!

Exhibits of Particular Interest

to every man, woman and child in Vancouver are being shown this year. British Columbia is a vast-rich territory greater in productive area than the states of Washington, Oregon and California combined. Come and see why! See the high quality products of our forests, our mines, our agricultural lands and our industries. See the skilled products of varied arts and crafts. See the purebred livestock, the pets, the school exhibits, the demonstrations.

GREATER
VANCOUVER EXHIBITION
BRITISH COLUMBIA'S SHOW WINDOW

Programme
SATURDAY, AUG. 7, 1926
CALEDONIAN GAMES

9:00 A.M.—Gates Open. Exhibits in all Buildings and no entrance fee on Festival Day.

10:00 A.M.—Opening of Great Fortieth Caledonian Games in front of Grandstand, continuing all day. See the Great Musical Parade of Pipe Bands.

11:30 P.M.—Musical Concert by H. M. Coldstream Guards Band in Palace of Horticulture.

8:00 P.M.—Grand Pipe Band Concert by H. M. Coldstream Guards Band in front of Grandstand. Also Pipe Bands and Flavourers.

9:15 P.M.—Vocal Performance Musical Society "Commonwealth of Nations".
The Pavilion Roof Room has every facility.
Special Demonstrations in School Buildings.

Figure 2 - Advertisement for the 1926 Vancouver Caledonian Games. (Vancouver Province, 6 August 1926)

A 1926 advertisement demonstrates the competing and co-existing meanings of the Caledonian Games. In it, a drawing of a kilted piper is shown superimposed over a sketch of the fairgrounds. The advertisement hawks the “stirring music of the pipes” that will accompany “dancing, games, contests and feats of strength,” but reassures the reader that “even if there isn’t a drop of Scottish blood in your veins, you’ll enjoy every minute of it.” Along with the World’s Championship Stampede, the Agricultural and Horticultural Show, and the “skid road” (midway), the Games were a part of “The Show

Window of British Columbia,” according to the ad’s tagline (see Figure 2).³⁸ The VSACS had reason to be pleased with the Games’ inclusion in the GVE. Being placed at centre stage in the province’s largest public exposition opened the Games to tens of thousands of potential spectators.

By advertising the Games as one of the exhibition’s major attractions, Vancouver’s boosters also made a statement about the city’s cultural identity. Michael Dawson has noted that British Columbia boosters were actively promoting the province as “something different” in the late 1920s in order to distinguish it from the United States. Dawson argues that, especially in the minds of Victoria’s tourism boards, that “something” was Britishness.³⁹ The growth of the Games suggests that a similar process was underway in Vancouver. Amidst a changing demographic structure shaped by large numbers of non-British immigrants⁴⁰, the Caledonian Games were promoted as being a dominant part of Vancouver’s cultural fabric. Much like amateurism presented a threat to the moral purity of sport, to many, immigration presented a threat to the racial purity of the city. Therefore, although the Games might have become less Scottish in practice, Figure 2 suggests that they retained a distinctly Highland image, as boosters certainly wanted to ensure that Vancouver appeared no less British.

By the late 1920s, the Vancouver St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society could deem its Caledonian Games, as an institution, a success in many ways. A 1928 advertisement in the *Vancouver Province* labeled them the “Greatest Highland Gathering

³⁸ *Vancouver Province*, 6 August 1926.

³⁹ Michael Dawson, *Selling British Columbia: Tourism and Consumer Culture* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2004), 69-71.

⁴⁰ Doreen Marie Indra. “Ethnicity, Social Stratification, and Opinion Formation : An Analysis of Ethnic Portrayal in the Vancouver Newspaper Press, 1905-1976,” (Ph.D. thesis, Simon Fraser University, 1979), 97.

in North America.”⁴¹ While tartan-wearing dancers and wailing pipes were never absent, the *raison d’être* of the Games was certainly the athletic competition. The author of a 1930 article recapping the history of the Games noted that “more than one athlete of international reputation has been discovered at the Caledonian Day sports in Vancouver, and the cream of Pacific Coast athletes are invariably here to compete for the valuable prizes and strive for the prestige that always follows victory in such illustrious company.”⁴² More than just providing entertainment, though, the society viewed its commitment to sport as an essential part of developing the future men of Vancouver, and therefore, organizers reasoned, the city itself. The introduction of the junior track meet in 1922 and the incorporation of the Games into the GVE in 1926 demonstrated the society’s resolution to be involved in the “upbuilding of B.C.” and “all that is best in Canadian manhood.”⁴³

The story of the Caledonian Games in the 1920s facilitates the understanding of amateur sport, public celebration, and civic development in Vancouver. Given the decisions of the VSACS concerning the Games, it is safe to say that, by 1926, it had achieved its goals. The Vancouver Caledonian Games were a prominent billboard for the society and advertisement for the city, and although one did not need to be a Scotsman to enjoy them, the kilts still flew and the pipes still skirled.

⁴¹ *Vancouver Province*, 10 August 1928.

⁴² *Vancouver Province*, 8 August 1930.

⁴³ *Vancouver Sun*, 23 January 1921.

CONCLUSION

By the standards of an institution identified with an ethno-cultural minority, the Vancouver Caledonian Games were a great success story. After a humble first decade of intermittent existence, the Games grew to become the Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society's most important event. By the turn of the century, the VSACS devoted more time, money, and human effort to the Games than to any other of its regularly scheduled social events. Organizers were rewarded for their work as Vancouver's population attended the Games in large numbers throughout the 1900s, 1910s, and 1920s. After 1926, the Games remained as part of the GVE for several years, and then continued under the autonomous control of the VSACS until the Second World War. While Highland Games throughout the rest of Canada and the United States were declining in popularity and disappearing altogether, the VSACS's careful promotion of athletics ahead of Scottishness in a climate of growing concern about the city's "racial" composition ensured that the Vancouver Games did exactly the opposite.

An article in the 8 August 1909 *Daily News Advertiser* described the Games as follows:

They came with heather in their coats, with sporran, plaid and kiltie, breezy with the breezes of the Hielands, hale and hearty scions of the North...and the dancing and the piping and the broad, broad accents made an atmosphere of Macdom frightening and bewildering to the Southron. It is no light task to pick out the premier athletes or to comment on their prowess; the results and the victories show what clan can claim the honor of the best deed....The afternoon was well spent, and...weary Hielanders and weary lassies wended their way homeward, consoling their tired bodies with the thought that Scotland still is master and will be for ever in the hearts of their wandering sons.¹

¹ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 8 August 1909.

The intent of this account is obvious: to show that the Vancouver Games are as near to their Scottish ancestors this side of the Atlantic as one can find. Instead, the passage serves to explain in graphic detail the degree of mythologization involved in the presentation of the Games as authentically Scottish. Although Vancouver's Brockton point bears some semblance to the Highland landscape, few of the competitors would have been able to make the comparison firsthand. The closest approximation to a clan claiming honour of the best deed came the following year when the Vancouver Athletic Club won the aggregate team competition. The "weary Hielanders and lassies" might question that Scotland "would forever be master" when later advertisements would insist that "you don't have to be a Scotchman" to receive a dose of authentic Scottishness at the Games.²

The example of the Vancouver Caledonian Games also demonstrates interesting interplay between conceptions of modernity and pre-modernity. The VSACS consciously emphasized the modern aspects of organized sport in promoting the Games during the 1910s and 1920s. This runs contrary to Ian McKay's study of Scottish identity in Nova Scotia, where organizations created hazy notions of pre- and anti-modernity to promote Scottishness.³ Michael Dawson, in his recent study of British Columbia's tourist industry, argues that those in charge of shaping the province's image presented Vancouver as a "modern city" in a "marvelous scenic setting."⁴ Since Vancouver's image was never one of Scottish dominance, the Games organizers' emphasis was on progress and development, while the anti-modern idea represented by Highlandism was secondary.

² Advertisement for the 1927 Vancouver Caledonian Games, *Vancouver Province*, 12 August 1927.

³ McKay, "Tartanism Triumphant," 18; 21-23.

It is therefore interesting, and perhaps somewhat surprising, that the Vancouver Exhibition Association chose to mark their fair with a Scottish logo in 1926. By making the Caledonian Games a central piece of the exhibition, the VEA and VSACS – representatives of Vancouver’s middle and upper classes – made a clear statement regarding their perception of Vancouver’s cultural appearance. Such examples support Robert McDonald’s suggestion that the city’s British-born-and-descended population imposed hegemonic cultural values and norms.⁵ The Games’ success was not only because of the promotional abilities of the VSACS, but also because Vancouver’s boosters were quite receptive to using British and Scottish images to represent Vancouver. The Scottishness of the Games is less surprising when one considers that the Games’ rise in popularity corresponded to a rise in anti-immigration sentiment in Vancouver. Thus, the success of the Games cannot be fully explained without considering the impact of those who wanted to portray the city as British in order to exclude others.⁶

While the social structure of Vancouver was favourable to a British sporting event, the history of the Games also demonstrates the organizational success of the VSACS. The first Vancouver Caledonian Games were an outward demonstration of the society’s ability to host a prominent public celebration of Scottish culture and sport. The Games allowed the society, at least for a day, to be at the centre of Vancouver’s social and sports scenes. As a small organization (albeit one with many influential members), the society had hosted a number of balls and dinners before its games. Attendance at these events was generally limited to society members, relatives, and close friends. The

⁴ Dawson, *Selling British Columbia*, 107-113.

⁵ McDonald, *Making Vancouver*, 195-196; 60.

Games, however, were open to thousands of spectators willing to pay for a day's entertainment. Thus, not only did the Games serve as an advertisement for the society, but they were also potentially profitable. Indeed, when the society decided against holding games in 1895, it was largely because the previous year's event had been a financial loss. Often times, the society celebrated the financial results of the Games ahead of the quality of athletic, dancing, or piping competitions.

By the beginning of the 1900s, the VSACS proved that it was capable of putting on a successful public exhibition. Games organizers and the society executive were quite aware of the paramount importance of the athletic component of the event. An article in the 5 August 1905 *Daily News Advertiser* announced that “[the] Pipers’ Band, will, of course, be on hand for the Scottish Games to-morrow. They will leave the Hotel Vancouver at 10:30 a.m. and parade through the principal streets, so that those who do not appreciate the music of the bagpipes can take warning and hie them to the woods.”⁷ Though obviously jocular, the passage carried a grain of truth – to many in attendance at the Games, the “Scottishness” simply came along with the athletics. With sports being the prime attraction of the Caledonian Games, and the Games representing a large ratio of the society's proceeds in a given year, organizers valued the athletics more than dancing and piping, as their decisions demonstrate.

The society's elimination of professional athletics from the Games' programme in 1911 was another profound statement of purpose. Professional athletes had historically been a part of the North American Highland Games, regardless of geographic location.⁸ As professional leagues formed in other sports, however, organizations in central and

⁶ Ward, *White Canada Forever*, 118-141.

⁷ *Vancouver Daily News Advertiser*, 5 August 1905.

eastern Canada united to promote the benefits of amateurism.⁹ Although we do not know whether professionalism was any more rampant in British Columbia than in other parts of Canada, Robin Anderson has suggested that attitudes towards it were much less vituperative in this province.¹⁰ The “amateurization” of the Games in the name of moral uprightness and civic development brings this into question, as well as Anderson’s claim that the “middle class social reform” movement that defended amateurism was muted in Vancouver.¹¹

As Vancouver grew and changed, the VSACS changed the way that the Games operated. In the parlance of historians such as Robert Carroon, the level of “Scottishness” in the Games declined progressively.¹² Carroon argues that permitting non-Scots to compete and including sports of non-Scottish ancestry in the Games led to the demise of the Milwaukee Games.¹³ In Vancouver, we come to the exact opposite conclusion: by marketing the Games to non-Scots, the VSACS broadened their appeal. Because of this, society members delighted in the tongue-in-cheek nature of the call for non-Scots to run to the woods at the sound of the pipes. Organizers recognized that in a city where the Scots were a distinct minority¹⁴, reification of all things Scottish at the Games was more likely to cause their demise than to prolong their existence. However, they still wished to uphold the society’s goal of celebrating Scottish heritage. Although

⁸ Gillespie, “Roderick McLennan,” 47-51.

⁹ Kidd, *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*, 12-43.

¹⁰ Anderson, “On the Edge of the Baseball Map,” 543-545.

¹¹ Anderson, “On the Edge of the Baseball Map,” 540.

¹² See, for example, Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” 116.

¹³ Carroon, “The Milwaukee Highland Games,” 116.

¹⁴ In the 1911, 1921 and 1931 censuses, the percentages of Vancouver residents born in Scotland were 9.6, 9.1, and 8.8, respectively. Figures of ethnic origin are less readily available, though a reasonable estimate of the total Scottish-born-and-descended population can be ascertained from assessing the proportion of Vancouverites who claimed affiliation to the Presbyterian church, which approximated 25 percent in the first quarter of the twentieth century. See Patricia Roy, *Vancouver*, 169-170.

the VSACS did not promote the pipers and dancers as the prime attraction of the Games, they were always present to serve as a symbol of Scottishness for some and a curious attraction for others. Furthermore, they contributed to the “British” image of the increasingly polyglot city.

By the 1920s, members of the VSACS viewed their Games as part of a larger project that involved developing youth through participation in sport, bringing current and potential professionals and city leaders together, and showing off the city of Vancouver to the rest of Canada and the world. Scottish Highland symbols were constantly evoked, but their purpose was part of the self-mythologization of the Games, and not their driving force. The success of the Vancouver Caledonian Games was fueled by the organizers’ promotion of the athletic competitions. This challenges the theory that the inclusion of non-Scottish events and competitors hastened the downfall of the Highland Games, and lends credence to J.M. Bumsted’s notion that Scottishness is something that can be individually self-ascribed.¹⁵ The Games were a celebration of sport that allowed spectators to label themselves Scottish, if only for that day. The evolution of the Vancouver Caledonian Games shows that their success was due to the “games,” and not the “Caledonian,” part of their name.

¹⁵ Bumsted, “Scottishness and Britishness in Canada,” 97.

APPENDIX
Vancouver Caledonian Games: Dates, Locations, Financial Results,
1893-1926

Date	Location	Financial Result	Attendance (Est.)
12 August 1893	Brockton Point	\$3.55	2000
11 August 1894	Brockton Point	-\$84.25	-
3 September 1896	Brockton Point	-	-
27 August 1898	Brockton Point	\$376.50	4000
4 August 1900	Brockton Point	\$409.90	-
9 August 1902	Brockton Point	-\$14.64	-
1 August 1903	Brockton Point	\$51.80	6500
30 July 1904	Brockton Point	\$88.91	3000
6 August 1905	Brockton Point	\$178.90	-
11 August 1906	Recreation Park	\$230.75	-
10 August 1907	Brockton Point	\$84.30	2000
8 August 1908	Recreation Park	estimated loss	-
7 August 1909	Brockton Point	\$154.80	-
6 August 1910	Brockton Point	\$486.40	3000
29 July 1911	Brockton Point	\$458.25	-
3 August 1912	Brockton Point	\$347.95	5000
9 August 1913	Brockton Point	\$309.55	-
1 August 1914	Brockton Point	-	-
7 August 1915	Brockton Point	-	7000
5 August 1916	Brockton Point	\$645.40	6000
4 August 1917	Athletic Park	-	6500
3 August 1918	Brockton Point	\$94.75	6500
2 August 1919	Brockton Point	\$629.06	7500
7 August 1920	Hastings Park	\$1,500.00 (est.)	-
6 August 1921	Hastings Park	\$2,911.22	12000
29 July 1922	Hastings Park	-\$479.66	10000
4 August 1923	Brockton Point	\$835.45	4500
2 August 1924	Brockton Point	\$349.63	4000
1 August 1925	Brockton Point	\$605.51	-
7 August 1926	Hastings Park	\$850.00 (est.)	-

(- indicates no data available)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Archived Collections

City of Vancouver Archives. Add. MSS 453 Vols. 1 & 2. Locations 562-F-2 & 562-F-3. Vancouver St. Andrew's and Caledonian Society. Minute Books, 1886-1933.

City of Vancouver Archives. *The Founders of Vancouver, 1886: Our City is Their Monument*. Pamphlet issued by the Vancouver City Archives, Vancouver, BC, 1956.

Simon Fraser University Archives. Location F-192-7-1. Vancouver Sons of Scotland Royal Scot Camp No. 172. Minute Books, 1895-1899.

University of British Columbia Archives. MSS A3B9. Harry Archibald Collection, 1910-1916.

Newspapers

Mainland Guardian (New Westminster), 1877-1884.

Scottish American Journal (New York), 1875-1918.

The Scottish Canadian (Toronto), 1890-1907.

Vancouver Daily News Advertiser (also known as *Vancouver News* and *Vancouver Advertiser*), 1886-1916.

Vancouver Province, 1894-1930.

Vancouver Sun, 1912-1930.

Vancouver World (also known as *Vancouver Daily World*), 1893-1905.

Victoria Daily Colonist (also known as *Victoria Daily British Colonist*), 1868-1909.

Victoria Daily Standard, 1871.

Secondary Sources

Allison, Lincoln. *Amateurism in Sport: An Analysis and a Defence*. London: Frank Cass, 2001.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities*. Revised ed. London: Verso, 1991.

Anderson, Robin John. "On the Edge of the Baseball Map' with the 1908 Vancouver Beavers." *Canadian Historical Review* 77, no.4 (1996): 538-574.

Bairner, Alan. *Sport, Nationalism and Globalization*. Albany, NY: State University of New York, 2001.

Barman, Jean. *The West Beyond the West: A History of British Columbia*. Revised ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996.

Breen, David, and Kenneth Coates. *The Pacific National Exhibition: An Illustrated History*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1982.

Bumsted, J.M. "Scottishness and Britishness in Canada, 1790-1914." In Marjory Harper and Michael E. Vance (eds.), *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory*. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1999: 89-104.

Carver, John Arthur. *The Vancouver Rowing Club: A History, 1886-1980*. Vancouver: Audrey F. Roberts Ltd., 1980.

Cheska, Alice Taylor. "The Antigonish Highland Games: A Community's Involvement in the Scottish Festival of Eastern Canada." *Nova Scotia Historical Review*, 3 (1983): 51-63.

Claydon, Peter S. N. and Valerie A. Melanson (eds.). *Vancouver Voters, 1886: A Bibliographical Dictionary*. Richmond, BC: British Columbia Genealogical Society, 1994.

Clyde, Robert. *From Rebel to Hero: The Image of the Highlander, 1745-1830*. East Linton, Scotland: Tuckwell Press, 1995.

Cosentino, Frank. *Afros, Aborigines, and Amateur Sport in Pre World War One Canada*. Toronto: York University, 1998.

Cowan, E.J. "The Myth of Scotch Canada." In Marjory Harper and Michael E. Vance (eds.), *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory*. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing, 1999: 49-72.

Dampier, Paul. *Courage & Conviction: The YMCA in Vancouver, 1886-1986*. Vancouver: YMCA, 1986.

Davis, Chuck. *The Greater Vancouver Book: An Urban Encyclopedia*. Surrey, BC: Linkman Press, 1997.

Dawson, Michael. *Selling British Columbia: Tourism and Popular Culture, 1890-1970*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2004.

Devine, T. M. *The Scottish Nation, 1700-2000*. London: Penguin, 1999.

Donaldson, Emily Ann. *The Scottish Highland Games in America*. Gretna, LA: Pelican Publishing, 1986.

Dooley, Michael Kevin. "'Our Mickey': The Story of Private James O'Rourke, VC.MM (CEF), 1879-1957." *Labour/Le Travail*, 47 (2001): 171-184.

Elias, Norbert, and Eric Dunning. *Quest for Excitement: Sport and Leisure in the Civilizing Process*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986.

Gillespie, Greg. "Roderick McLennan, Professionalism, and the Emergence of the Athlete in Caledonian Games." *Sport History Review* 31, (2000): 43-63.

Gruneau, Richard. *Class, Sports and Social Development*. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press, 1983.

Hamilton, J. H. "Vancouver's Contribution to Empire: a Souvenir of the First Overseas Contingent who Volunteered for Foreign Service from the Regiments of Vancouver and District." Vancouver, News Advertiser Printing, 1914.

Howell, Colin D. *Blood, Sweat, and Cheers: Sport and the Making of Modern Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001.

Howell, Maxwell L., and Reet A. Howell. *History of Sport in Canada*. Revised ed. Champaign, IL: Stipes Publishing, 1985.

Howell, Nancy, and Maxwell L. Howell. *Sports and Games in Canadian Life: 1700 to the Present*. Toronto: Macmillan of Canada, 1969.

Hull, Raymond et al. *Vancouver's Past*. Vancouver: Gordon Soules, 1974.

Indra, Doreen Marie. "Ethnicity, Social Stratification, and Opinion Formation: An Analysis of Ethnic Portrayal in the Vancouver Newspaper Press, 1905-1976." Unpublished Ph.D. thesis, Simon Fraser University, 1979.

Jarvie, Grant. *Highland Games: The Making of the Myth*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1991.

Jarvie, Grant (ed.). *Sport in the Making of Celtic Cultures*. London: Leicester University Press, 1999.

Jarvie, Grant. "Sport, the Émigré, and the Dance Called America." *Sport History Review* 31, (2000): 28-42.

Jarvie, Grant, and John Burnett (eds.). *Sport, Scotland, and the Scots*. East Linton, Scotland: Tuckwell Press, 2000.

- Johnston, Hugh (ed.). *The Pacific Province: A History of British Columbia*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1996.
- Keller, Betty. *On the Shady Side: Vancouver 1886-1914*. Ganges, BC: Horsdal & Schubart, 1986.
- Kidd, Bruce. *The Struggle for Canadian Sport*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996.
- Mason, Daniel. "Professional Sports Facilities and Developing Urban Communities: Vancouver's Recreation Park, 1905-1912." *Urban History Review* 26, no. 1 (October 1997): 43-51.
- Matthews, Major J. S. *Early Vancouver* (2 vols.). Vancouver: Brock Webber, 1932 and 1933.
- McAllister, Kirsten Emiko. "Narrating Japanese Canadians In and Out of the Canadian Nation: A Critique of Realist Forms of Representation." *Canadian Journal of Communications* 24, no. 1 (1999): 79-103.
- McCrone, David. *Scotland: the Brand*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995.
- McDonald, Robert A. J. "The Business Elite and Municipal Politics in Vancouver, 1886-1914," *Urban History Review* 11, no. 3 (1983): 1-14.
- McDonald, Robert A. J. "Vancouver's 'Four Hundred': The Quest for Wealth and Status in Canada's Urban West." *Journal of Canadian Studies* 25, no. 3 (1990): 55-73.
- McDonald, Robert A.J. *Making Vancouver: Class, Status and Social Boundaries, 1863-1913*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1996.
- McDonald, Robert A. J. and Jean Barman (eds.). *Vancouver Past: Essays in Social History*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1986.
- McKay, Ian. "Tartanism Triumphant: The Construction of Scottishness in Nova Scotia, 1933-1954." *Acadiensis* 21, no. 2 (Spring 1992): 5-47.
- Metcalf, Alan. *Canada Learns to Play: The Emergence of Organized Sport, 1807-1914*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1987.
- Metcalf, Alan. "The Evolution of Organized Physical Recreation in Montreal, 1840-1895." In Morris Mott (ed.). *Sports in Canada: Historical Readings*. Mississauga: Copp Clark Pittman, 1989: 130-155.
- Metcalf, Alan. "The Meaning of Amateurism: A Case Study of Canadian Sport, 1884-1970." *Canadian Journal of History of Sport* 16, no. 2 (1995): 33-48.

- Morgan, Roland. *Vancouver Then & Now*. North Vancouver: Whitecap Books, 1983.
- Morley, Alan. *Vancouver: From Milltown to Metropolis*. Vancouver: Mitchell Press, 1961.
- Morrow, Don, et al. *A Concise History of Sport in Canada*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1989.
- Nicol, Eric. *Vancouver*. Toronto: Doubleday, 1970.
- Redmond, Gerald. *The Caledonian Games in Nineteenth-Century America*. Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1971.
- Redmond, Gerald. *The Sporting Scots of Nineteenth-Century Canada*. East Rutherford, NJ: Associated University Presses, 1982.
- Ray, Celeste. *Highland Heritage: Scottish Americans in the American South*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2001.
- Roxborough, Henry. *One Hundred – Not Out: The Story of Nineteenth-Century Canadian Sport*. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1966.
- Roy, Patricia. *Vancouver: An Illustrated History*. Toronto: James Lorimer & Co., 1980.
- Roy, Patricia. *A White Man's Province : British Columbia Politicians and Chinese and Japanese Immigrants, 1858-1914*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1989.
- Roy, Patricia. *Consolidating a White Man's Province: British Columbians and the Oriental Question, 1914-41*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2003.
- Schrodt, Barbara. "Sport at the Fair: The Promotion of Urban Sport by the Vancouver Exhibition, 1910-1985." *Journal of the West* 26, no. 1 (January 1987): 71-79.
- Schrodt, Barbara. "'Taking the Tram': Travelling to Sport and Recreation Activities on Greater Vancouver's Interurban Railway – 1890s to 1920s." *Canadian Journal of History of Sport*, 21, no. 1, (May 1988): 52-62.
- Schrodt, Barbara. "Control of Sports Facilities in Early Vancouver: The Brockton Point Athletic Association at Stanley Park, 1880 to 1913." *Canadian Journal of History of Sport*, 23, no. 2, (December 1992): 26-53.
- Sport Canada. *Proceedings of the First Canadian Symposium on the History of Sport and Physical Education*. Ottawa: Department of National Health and Welfare, 1970.

Sport Canada. *Proceedings of the Second Canadian Symposium on the History of Sport and Physical Education*, (Ottawa: Department of National Health and Welfare, 1972.

Swain, Derek Anthony. "A History of Sport in British Columbia: A Chronicle of Significant Developments and Events." Unpublished MPE thesis, University of British Columbia, 1970.

Swan, Joe. *A Century of Service: The Vancouver Police, 1886-1986*. Vancouver: Vancouver Police Historical Society and Centennial Museum, 1986.

Szasz, Ferenc Morton. *Scots in the North American West, 1790-1917*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 2000.

Thompson, John Herd with Allen Seager. *Canada, 1922-1939: Decades of Discord*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985.

Trevor-Roper, Hugh. "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition in Scotland." In Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.), *The Invention of Tradition*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Walker, Carl Ian. *Pioneer Pipers of British Columbia: A Biographical Directory of Pipers active in British Columbia by the 1950s*. Squamish, BC: Western Academy of Pipe Music, 1987.

Ward, Peter. *White Canada Forever: Popular Attitudes and Public Policy toward Orientals in British Columbia*. Third ed. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002.

Webster, David. *Scottish Highland Games*. Edinburgh: Macdonald Printers, 1973.

Womack, Peter. *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands*. London: MacMillan Press, 1989.

Wynn, Graeme and Timothy Oke (eds.). *Vancouver and its Region*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1992.