# Intuition and Intuition Development: Practices for the Inner Self

by Emily Sadowski

MA, University College London, 2009 BA, University of Toronto, 2004

Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

in the
Curriculum Theory & Implementation: Philosophy of Education Program
Faculty of Education

© Emily Sadowski SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY Fall 2017

Copyright in this work rests with the author. Please ensure that any reproduction or re-use is done in accordance with the relevant national copyright legislation.

# **Approval**

Name: Emily Sadowski

Degree: Doctor of Philosophy

Title: Intuition and Intuition Development: Practices for the

Inner Self

**Examining Committee:** Chair: Allan MacKinnon

Associate Professor

**Charles Bingham** Senior Supervisor

Professor

Sean Blenkinsop

Supervisor Professor

**Heesoon Bai** Internal Examiner

Professor

Alexander Sidorkin External Examiner

Professor

College of Education

California State University Sacramento

Date Defended/Approved: November 29, 2017

## **Abstract**

This project seeks to validate the kinds of intuitive experiences many people have, but which get subjugated, neglected, or rejected by institutions of knowledge. In particular, it responds to a scholarly silence about psychic, intuitive experiences like gut feelings, precognition, and 'just knowing,' that are unexplained by hegemonic epistemological framing, which often (inadequately) explains intuition as expertise. Motivated by a desire to make these experiences sensible within an intellectual culture wedded to analysis and objective knowledge production, this research seeks to fill a gap in pedagogical practice in the area of understanding and supporting the intuitive function.

Through a review of literature about intuition in philosophy and psychology, I recommend that intuition be conceptualized through an emergent psychological theory, transpersonal theory, that accounts for an extended range of inter-subjective and transpersonal consciousness. The dissertation then turns to the self-help realm, where a genre of intuition development books do the work of educating for intuition that formal educators have not. These books provide a framework for understanding intuition as a psychic sense, and recommend a programme of practice for educating the intuitive function. Intuition is presented as a relational, contextual way of knowing that relies on the coherence of the subject-knower, and the pedagogy for intuition directs practitioners towards transformative self-development.

Drawing from Foucault's analysis of ancient practices of care of the self, I argue that the programme of practice for intuition development relies on a framework of the self as being both contingent (thus able to transform), and capable of experiencing connection to realms of non-ordinary and non-discursive consciousness. I suggest that the work to become more intuitive challenges the deceit of a subject's alienation from her context.

Intuition development pedagogy contains contemplative and reflective practices that enables non-discursive and 'non'-ordinary experiences of consciousness. A similar programme may be a productive way forward to educating for intuition.

**Keywords**: intuition; pedagogy; transformative development; Hermeneutics of the Subject; transpersonal psychology; consciousness

Dedicated to the Great Mother.

# **Table of Contents**

| Approval   | ii  |
|--|-----|
| Abstract   | iii |
| Dedication   | iv  |
| Table of Contents  | v   |
| Chapter 1 – Introduction   | 1   |
| 1.1 How I came to study 'intuition'  | 3   |
| 1.2 The concept of intuition and its value to educational processes          | 7   |
| 1.3 A greater context of alienation and decontextualization                  | 9   |
| 1.4 Intuition development cultivates a 'way forward' from alienation         | 13  |
| 1.5. Road map to the dissertation  | 17  |
| Chapter 2 – Intuition: a disorderly concept                                  | 24  |
| 2.1 Introducing the concept, intuition                                       | 24  |
| 2.2 Five theorists on the function of intuition                              | 28  |
| 2.2.1 Bergson  | 28  |
| 2.2.2 Jung   | 30  |
| 2.2.3 Bastick  | 32  |
| 2.2.4 Noddings and Shore   | 34  |
| 2.2.5 Petitmengin-Peugeot  | 35  |
| 2.2.6 Summary of this section  | 37  |
| 2.3 Characteristics and correlates of the intuitive mode                     | 38  |
| 2.3.1 Flow & Gestalt   | 39  |
| 2.3.2 Certainty  | 42  |
| 2.3.3 Intuition compared to insight  | 46  |
| 2.3.4 Intuition in contrast to analysis                                      | 48  |
| 2.3.5 Summary of this section  | 50  |
| 2.4 Origins of intuitive content   | 50  |
| 2.4.1 Respectability politics and the unconscious                            | 51  |
| 2.4.2 The source of intuition as expertise: a predominant paradigm           | 54  |
| 2.4.3 The source of intuition as instinctual knowledge: an untestable theory | 57  |
| 2.4.4 The source of intuition as a (sixth) sense                             | 60  |
| 2.4.5. Framing intuition as psychic  | 62  |
| Chapter 3 – An alternate conceptual space for intuition                      |     |
| 3.1 The fruits of 'bookshelf inquiry'  |     |
| 3.2 New Age, self-help books as educational texts                            |     |
| 3.3 The guidebooks' transpersonal framework for intuition                    |     |
| 3.4 What the guidebooks teach - Intuition Development Pedagogy (IDP)         |     |
| 3.5 Intuition Development Pedagogy is an educational programme               | 94  |

| Chapter 4 - Intuition, subjectivity and truth: developing an intuitive way of being          | 98  |
|--|-----|
| 4.1 'Things as they are': Unpacking an assumption that intuition is always true 1            | 01  |
| 4.2 Two lineages on truth, subjectivity, & the practice of philosophy1                       | .05 |
| 4.3 'The subject must transform': IDP as a descendent of care of the self 1                  | 10  |
| 4.4 How the practices make intuition trustworthy: unpacking contemplative practice $\dots 1$ | 16  |
| 4.5 Caring for the self as ethical practice  | 22  |
| 4.6 IDP as transformative education: notes on an ongoing process                             | 31  |
| Chapter 5 - Intuition development as soul shaping: an offering for education1                | .38 |
| 5.1 The occlusion of intuition by an exclusionary epistemology 1                             | 38  |
| 5.2 'Intuition' as an alternative to alienation  | 44  |
| 5.3 Implications of educating for intuition development                                      | 51  |
| 5.4 Concluding thoughts  | 62  |
| References1  | 67  |
| Appendix A. List of Intuition Development Guidebooks1  | 78  |
| Appendix B. Guidebooks' Directions for Meditation1   | 79  |

# Chapter 1 - Introduction

"Whatever is unnamed, undepicted in images, whatever is omitted from biography, censored in collections of letters, whatever is misnamed as something else, made difficult-to-come-by, whatever is buried in the memory by the collapse of meaning under an inadequate or lying language - this will become, not merely unspoken, but unspeakable."

-Adrienne Rich (1979, NP)

My research story begins with a recognition that, even with a growing consensus that intuition is a valuable resource, there are few instructional resources in the realm of education scholarship that consider how to access, train or otherwise develop it. When looking for - and failing to find - such texts, I began to suspect that the lack of scholarly resources for practical intuition development may be due to a constrained view of intuition, prevalent in education theory. In particular, I was looking for texts that recognized the kinds of intuitive experiences with which I was familiar: so-called psychic experiences of empathic telepathy and pre-cognition, in addition to the more familiar hunches, gut feelings, and inexplicable 'just knowing.' A great many of us know these experiences firsthand. Common examples include sensing when a family member is in trouble, knowing in advance when a friend is about to call, or instantly recognizing an important opportunity in a seemingly off-hand mention. And yet there is a scholarly lacuna of theory that acknowledges what these are, let alone how we might teach and learn to enhance them. In response, I sought to find a way to conceptualize intuition such that education theory could account for a wider spectrum of intuitive experiences, including those uncanny ones I know to be true.

Where education theory regularly quarantines these experiences and thus effectively neglects both their value and their development, I found that in the popular sphere these experiences are recognized and even attended to with a programme of practice that, I suggest, would be informative for educators. As I will show, self-help books that teach intuition development teach that the way to enhance intuition is through transformative inner 'work' that orients the practising subject more strongly to the context of her experience, both inner and outer. This work has a lineage that extends deep into the history of Western philosophy: the tradition of working to transform oneself in order to become *better*. Drawing from this programme of practice, I will show that this

transformative development engages practitioners to become aware of a realm of conscious experience beyond that with which they were previously familiar.

Beyond the value of enhancing the intuitive function, the transformative practice of intuition development responds to the epistemological framework that does not, or cannot account for psychic experiences of intuition. The practice calls attention to the profoundly subjective nature of intuitive experience, but does not imply that it is any less real. Rather, it calls for a transformed framework that can account for psychic experience. Psychic intuition intimates at an understanding of consciousness that transcends individual human minds, and points to a more connected, intersubjective, and non-discursive way to conceive of the potentials of human experience.

In this introductory chapter, I describe how intuition became the subject of my doctoral research in Philosophy of Education. I explain that I turned to the popular genre of 'self-help' to find a reflection of intuition that was in accord with the colloquial use of the term that is rarely recognized in scholarly discourse. The next chapter provides a conceptual review for the concept of intuition. Despite the difficulty in saying anything about intuition in general - Rorty (2006) calls it an "impossibility" - I explore various ways the concept of intuition gets positioned, understood, and used, by education theorists, and by the philosophers and psychologists who influence education theory. I show that the concept of intuition is taken up according to the interests, beliefs, and foci of the scholars taking on the subject. I then spend time unpacking the content of the genre of self-help books that influenced my thinking about intuition and that contain a pedagogical program for enhancing the intuitive function. I recommend that educators consider this program seriously, despite its location in a 'non-serious', popular space, as this is where a pedagogy for intuition is to be found.

Next, I stake out philosophical claim for this self-help approach to intuition development. I argue that the transformative practices that comprise intuition development pedagogy are a form of existential, philosophic practice, and show that there is a contribution here in the area of critical knowledge production. The practising subject comes to identify with aspects of the self beyond individual ego, and to aspects of the world beyond those that are objectively knowable, and yet we need some way to account for the validity or truth of this subjective experience. I draw on Foucault's analysis of Ancient practices of care of the self to show these as existential practices

that situate practising subjects more consciously, where knowing is contingent on one's way of being; that is, inextricably oriented to connection and context. Finally, I draw conclusions about what I have done, and consider this study in the wider context of education theory that also recognizes a need for renewed attention to interiority without resorting to metaphysical claims about the self, or the intuitive function.

## 1.1 How I came to study 'intuition'

In the Spring of 2011, during the second semester of a PhD program, I came across a poster in the hallway of the University's Education Building. It was a call for papers for a conference on Authenticity, Values, Ethics and Leadership in Education that would be held in a nearby city the following Autumn. It would be a relatively small conference, and this seemed like a perfect opportunity to begin presenting to other academics, as part of my apprenticeship into scholarship in education theory. I decided to write a paper suggesting that intuition could be a way forward to cultivating authenticity in leadership. More precisely, I proposed that intuition *development* could support authenticity, thinking in particular, about the ways people go about improving their intuitive function – contemplative practices such as meditation, imaginative practices such as visualization, and self-awareness practices such as journaling – all of which attend to the self in a way that can lead to increased self knowledge. I pointed to a connection between intuition development practices, and an idea from transformative education theory, that "self-knowledge is at the heart of authenticity" (Dirkx, 2006, p. 29). I suggested that intuition is an aspect of the authentic self.

Although the poster with the call for papers seemed to have sparked my idea of positioning intuition development as a tool for transformation and authentic leadership, the idea must have been ruminating in my mind for years. I never forgot the impact of reading a new age self-help book about intuition, almost twenty years ago, borrowed off a roommate's shelf. I finished that book in a single afternoon, soaking up compelling anecdotes about the author's life and work as a practising, professional psychic, and her practical suggestions for how the reader can also become more intuitive, or 'psychic'. When I set out to write my conference paper about intuition development and authentic leadership, initial library searches led me to similar books – self-help books that teach people how to improve their intuitive - psychic - ability.

Even though I had wanted to think about intuition in conversation with scholarly, academic thinkers, I found that these popular books were more useful than any academic texts I could find. Where the academic books focused on arguing for the value of intuition, or endeavoured to explicate just what intuition is, the popular texts presumed its value, or motivated it just briefly, and then focused on providing practical advice for making use of, and improving, readers' lived experience of intuition. These popular books were educational tools, teaching a useful set of skills and practices. Further, while academic texts occasionally provide an account of what intuition is, the popular books represented a version of intuition that resonated more with what I thought it to be: that is, a psychic sense, involving uncanny, and often inexplicable experiences like telepathy, precognition, and other functions that sometimes get designated 'para-psychological.'

#### Links between intuition and transformation

The concept of authentic leadership is strongly linked to an area of educational studies called transformative learning theory, a theory that primarily considers adults' education, and "the deep changes they can undergo, leading to greater levels of self-awareness and consciousness of society" (Dirkx, 1997, p. 87). One of the founders of this theory, Jack Mezirow (1997), describes how "the process [of transformative learning] involves transforming frames of reference through critical reflection of assumptions, validating contested beliefs through discourse, taking action on one's reflective insight, and critically assessing it" (p. 11). I suspected that this process mirrors the process of transformation involved with the contemplative practices recommended for improving the intuitive function. That is, the process of developing one's intuition is not a matter of simply acquiring a new skill, nor is it achieved by a cognitive awareness of what intuition is and why it is of value. Intuition develops through practice, and specifically, through inner practices that increase self-awareness.

Five years on, while I am no longer interested in defining or advocating anything like an 'authentic self', the work of pursuing authenticity as an ethical ideal - acting in accordance with one's integrated belief and action – remains an important value. I have come to think of the pursuit of authenticity as a transformative practice. As I would come to understand, the transformation involved in intuition development is brought about by intentional practices that inculcate an intuitive orientation or attitude from within. Rather than a transformation based on 'critical reflection', this is an ontological shift, a change in the way of one's being.

### **Looking for Intuition in Academia**

My proposal to the values and leadership conference was accepted, and I delivered my paper later in the year. Attendees in the conference session seemed excited by the idea that intuition development could support the kinds of authentic leadership they hoped to cultivate in their students. The conference chair even invited me to revise my paper for inclusion in the organization's quarterly journal. I was pleased with this reception, thinking my foray into academic culture a success. However, with time and the insight it can bring, I realized that the paper I had written and delivered was very similar in structure and content to the new age intuition development guides I had been using as a resource. I had written a paper-length version of that kind of book: first, motivating intuition as a good and useful function; then, elaborating ways that the intuitive function can be developed. Thankfully, no one in the conference audience had noticed the similarity, but I was embarrassed to think that I might have plagiarized other peoples' ideas. However, as you may have already guessed, this experience became the impetus for the study you are currently reading. I decided that the subject of intuition needed to be translated from the popular literature where it is easily found, to a scholarly audience, whose engagement with the subject seemed to be limited. Without knowing the form it would take, I decided then that 'intuition' would become the topic of my dissertation research.

Although it seemed to me at the time that the subject of intuition needed to be brought to voice, in point of fact many scholars have considered the idea of intuition. Countless philosophers either allude to or directly address the concept of intuition, and psychologists have explored its function and considered how to improve it. The intuitive function is widely thought to improve with cultivation, and even the act of believing that this function is real and effective is said to improve individuals' intuitive results. While working on that first conference paper, I experienced this phenomenon myself, when even just thinking about intuition seemed to cause me to become more intuitive. One afternoon, I was working on the paper at home when I suddenly and out of the blue had a thought about some books I had ordered online, and I paused in my work to muse about when they were supposed to arrive. Moments after that awareness interrupted my focus, the doorbell rang - a delivery person had brought those books to the door. I learned then that there was juice here; intuition development guidebooks were on to something.

My first task in the project would be to sift through the numerous, diverse approaches made to conceptualizing intuition in education theory, and elsewhere. 'Intuition' most generally refers to sudden, direct perception. Frequently, intuition refers to a form of mystical awareness; while this is a valid meaning of the word, intuition can also refer to experiences that are quite mundane, like having a sudden awareness that the doorbell is about to ring. As a psychic sense, intuition can act like a defence mechanism, a genius generator, and a general approach taken toward the world that is open to unexpected outcomes and potential. Some people understand intuition to be primarily a mode of perception such as a sixth sense, which can describe instinctive knowing at a 'gut' level. This is perhaps the most common, colloquial use. Others consider intuition to be the result of deep (and/or unconscious) expertise, referring to the ability to put together clues in a sudden, holistic way that is somatically, affectively sensed. This definition is largely found in education theory, and especially relates to the usefulness of intuition in teaching and learning. In some cases, definitions for intuition include what is sometimes referred to as psychic experience, such as telepathy and precognition. This conceptualization is largely represented by popular writers, but tends to be discounted in academic scholarship.

When I communicated about my interest in intuition with acquaintances outside academia, I would occasionally be met with responses of brightened faces, a combination of surprise and sometimes relief. The idea that someone 'respectable' - a doctoral researcher - considered intuitive experience worthy for study, may have challenged what they understood about their own intuitive experiences (if any), and further, I'm guessing, their assumptions about academia. Other common responses came in the form of disclosure - 'I (or my mother, or grandmother, or friend) have those kinds of experiences' - or inquiry, where the person sought confirmation that some experience they have had is, indeed, intuition. The fact of my pursuing this line of research became a token of recognition for these people. Their lived experience was to be authorized as real and worthy of academic study. Some people were surprised that intuition could even be something that one could talk about in an academic venue. I believe that attitude rests on the assumption that, as a 'fringe experience' intuition has no place in rational, 'serious' discourse. I understand this position; nor had I ever encountered theory about intuition or intuition development anywhere in my education. Although intuition is widely, vaguely, judged to be valuable, I had never heard it named, and was never introduced to the idea that it could be cultivated. Intuition is a common enough experience, but one that suffers from silence. I had stumbled on to a subject regarded as "unspeakable" (Rich, 1979).

# 1.2 The concept of intuition and its value to educational processes

Intuition does get addressed periodically in education theory, but it never seems to take off as a pedagogical imperative. For example, in the 1950s, educational psychologist Jerome Bruner (1960) identified that intuition was a missing element in science and maths education. In a publication that followed up the 1959 science curriculum symposium at Woods Hole (USA), Bruner argued that intuition is a desired outcome of learning, noting its recognized value in scientific and technological advances. Bruner's treatment of intuition was framed by his awareness of the effects of values such as formalism and positivism on the way intuition was understood. He called for education 'beyond facts', and for the complementarity of analysis and intuition, arguing that intuition is important in that it "yields hypotheses quickly, that hits on combinations of ideas before their worth is known" (p. 60). He suggested that teachers might support intuitive function by modelling "non-rigorous" procedures of heuristic thinking, like "informed quessing" at answers, and demonstrating a willingness to be wrong. Unfortunately, Bruner's identification of intuition as one of the most important factors in science education ultimately went unheeded (see Fensham & Marton, 1992). In a 1990s paper, Fensham and Marton noted that even though more is known about the intuitive function in science, science education had not yet caught up, still not including intuition as a key concept informing its pedagogy (as Bruner had hoped).

In the 1980s, Nel Noddings and Paul J. Shore (1984) compiled a comprehensive philosophic survey of questions about and around intuition and education. Their *Awakening the Inner Eye* is to date considered a "notable exception" (Waks, 2006) in an otherwise under-represented area of educational theory, and it remains, more than thirty years after its publication, an important survey of intuition for educational theorists. In that text, the authors offer a conceptual history of the concept of intuition, and strive toward their own definition, which they do by focusing on the intuitive *mode*, the *function* 

of intuition. By their own admission, Noddings and Shore struggle with many of the ways intuition gets framed, such as with an affiliation between the concept of intuition and ideas about mystical experience. Even still, they aimed to overcome educators' "avoidance" of the subject (p. 3), based, in their assessment, on a lack of clarity about the meaning, coherent model, or definition for intuition. In their introduction, Noddings and Shore articulate the hope that their book would begin a dialogue on the subject of intuition and education. However, they also recognize that the field of education may not be ready for a serious discussion of the subject. I suspect that they were, unfortunately, correct.

In recent decades, professional schools, nurses, midwives, and management educators have all advocated for intuition's value as a desirable leadership quality, especially for its capacity to make rapid, intelligent decisions (c.f. Sinclair & Ashkenasy, 2005; Claxton, 2006; Rew & Barrow, 2007). Within faculties of education, intuition has been taken up by professional development educators and within other forms of adult education: Leadership educators such as Claxton (2006), Waks (2006), and Sadler-Smith (2008) have advocated that leaders should cultivate the intuitive function, recognizing in scholarship what successful leaders have long been actually doing in practice - following their instinct, and making decisions based on intuition (Branson, 2009). An educational programme to become more intuitive is thought to be useful to someone wanting to be more efficient at running a business or wanting to make better decisions in general. However, there is still a lack of programming to improve intuition for teaching and learning.

It has long been my suspicion that school educates intuition 'out' of us. In other words, most of us have access to some degree of innate intuitive ability, but it often withers away with under-use resulting from undervaluing, or non-recognition that this ability is available to us. Intuition is not taught to children – in fact the opposite: children in schools tend to learn to shut down whatever intuitive function they may naturally exhibit – 'show your work' is the desired norm, rather than rewarding 'just' knowing; imaginative play is often regulated and restricted, and guessing and being wrong are punished, rather than viewed as opportunities to explore yet-unknown possibilities. Indeed, Noddings and Shore (1984) found that "no philosophy embracing intuition contains a direct link to a practical theory of knowledge or education. It is worth asking why this is so. Lack of clarity in defining intuition is part of the explanation, but it is not

the whole reason" (p. 41). Noddings and Shore (1984) note that the "rational bias of Western thought" makes intuition questionable, which their attention to defining intuition works to amend. Yet a clear definition does not seem to be sufficient.

#### Search for Intuitive Practice

The modern, Western schooling system has a lot to answer for in teaching us to neglect important aspects of self (Bai et al, 2009; Bai, 2001). Noddings and Shore (1984) consider how teachers might integrate intuition into curriculum and instruction. They make suggestions about encouraging receptivity, and helping students maintain a "productive tension" (p. 113) between the uncertainty required for intuitive arrival, and the affective certainty with which it often arrives. However, their primary recommendation is that the reality of intuitive modes be acknowledged, noting that simply recognizing the possibility of intuition may support its function (Noddings & Shore, 1984). Some teachers might be tempted to teach intuition in schools by designating class time to 'intuition,' similarly to the ways we incorporate art or digital literacy. However, the popular guidebooks' approach to educating intuition confirms that merely including intuition into existing educational practice would be a mistake. Education for intuition development must be comprised of more than just adding it to the roster of what we already care about.

As I will argue, new age self-help guidebooks show that successful intuition development requires a programme of transformative self development, supported by a comprehensive conceptual framework that acknowledges a larger frame of consciousness. Intuition development in education requires us to reckon with our embeddedness in an objectivist, physicalist epistemology that rejects the possibilities of intuition as a matter of consistency. Preventing intuition from being 'educated out of us' is a starting point, but a transformative process of self development is also required.

## 1.3 A greater context of alienation and decontextualization

As I have explained, I initially came upon the idea to write about 'intuition' through thinking about values and leadership, and the intangible qualities we want leaders to have, such as authenticity. But truthfully, I had long been seeking a way to articulate my

suspicion that a spiritual, or existential, pursuit of meaning can support the pursuit to overcome alienation and estrangement on individual and socio-cultural levels. I see that such alienation is at least partially caused by a set of values and consequent lifestyle reliant on a positivist and decontextualized understanding of humans' place in the world. A feeling of disconnection from the earth and its systems on a broader scale, as well as from our lineages and ancestry on the personal level, contributes to existential anxiety (evidenced by depression, angst, etc.). One of my goals is to contribute to a shift in scholarly discourse towards acknowledging the fact of our interdependence, and to point a way forward to holistic well-being through recognizing a subject's agency within that interdependence. Ultimately, I am after nothing less than opportunities for transforming consciousness.

The alienation I refer to above has a centuries-long history but seems to have come to a coherent climax in late modern times. Over the last 200 years, the dominant, western culture has operated from a set of values that prioritizes technique, disaggregation, and fragmentation over process, emergence, and synthesis. Joe L. Kincheloe (2008) gave this epistemological position an appropriately ugly acronym, FIDUROD, standing for: Formal, Intractable, Decontextualized, Universalistic, Reductionistic, and One-Dimensional (p. 23). These descriptors comprise an epistemological framework that shapes the ways we produce and consume knowledge. In particular, knowledge here is understood to be "a domain of objects" (Foucault, 2001, p. 191), leaving aside the question of the knowing subject, who is irrelevant to the extent that they stay out of the way: FIDUROD relies on a positivist assumption that knowledge is only worthwhile to the degree that it adheres strictly to the scientific method (Kincheloe, 2010). Within such a framework, it is taken as an article of faith that knowledge is only reliably procured through the practice of objective science, where an observer merely observes and does not (and indeed must not) interact with that which she is observing.

A problem with the framework of FIDUROD is that it has exceeded its usefulness as a tool for understanding, and become a belief system, with adherents having forgotten that it is one, among many, possible ways to understand the process of acquiring and disseminating knowledge. As Charles T. Tart (1992) suggests, "we have unnecessarily confused the powerful *tool* of scientific method with a *philosophy* of physicalism" (p. 5). As a result of the widespread belief in the value of objectivity,

objectification has embedded the value of separation of self from everything else. Such separation effectively creates cognitive and emotional distance, seeding alienation (a sense of estrangement, or of being separate from). This critique is far from new, and has been articulated by many philosophers and educationalists (cf: Bohm, 1980; Bai, 2009; Kincheloe, 2010; Starhawk, 1988). For example, in 1936, Edmund Husserl noted that the effects of a positivist approach to knowledge eliminated the possibility for philosophical questions of meaning, instead leading to what he described as "an indifferent turning-away from questions which are decisive for a genuine humanity" (Husserl, 1970, p. 6). Through emphasizing the *object* of our focus, we effectively devalue ourselves, the supposedly 'neutral' observer.

The orientation to seeing our world in fragmented pieces likewise leads us to consider (and then constitute) ourselves to also be separate, individual beings, rather than connected. In an optimistic, humanist sense, this 'Enlightenment' has allowed individuals to become autonomous subjects (Foucault, 2010, p. 43) as we engage in an ongoing process of individualization. A consequence of that individualization has been the rise of the individual as a locus of agency, and the idea that individuals have choice over matters in their lives is an explicit aspect of modern culture (Oliver & Gershman, 1989). The individual and her agency have been elevated to mythologized status in the modern era, and there are many benefits to this development, for example the distribution of rights through an increasing sphere of concern. But what starts as differentiation from the tribe, city or whatever collective, taken too far becomes isolating, and the modern value of personal freedom and agency that supports our notions of freedom and self-autonomy has become the ironic author of our alienation and its compulsive search for meaning. This cycle has the effect of allowing us to forget, to dangerous effect, that humans still depend on the collective for both biological survival and psychological well-being. The fact of our interconnection has been obscured.

The values informing FIDUROD are represented in the mechanistic metaphors we use to describe reality, representative of a loss of connection to organism. Such "machine imagery ... the reductive, atomistic picture of explanation" (Midgely, 2003, p. 1) reifies the idea "that the right way to understand complex wholes is always to break them down into their smallest parts" (Midgely, 2003, p. 1). Rational intellect guided by modern values conceptualizes the world as essentially dead, and an ethos of separation extends from interpersonal relationships to the relationship we individually and collectively have

with the 'natural world.' In this framework, not only are mind and body understood to be distinct, but spirit is nonsense (literally, nonsensical), and the rational mind is privileged over the body, spirit, and context/relationships. Within this framework, the idea of intuition is laughable or simply incomprehensible, but either way it is dismissible. With respect to our understanding of perception, experience, and selfhood, intuition can only be understood in a limited way before it has to be excluded as 'woo', or derided as irrational and thus, within the modern ethos, non-sense. Intuition - especially psychic intuition - can evoke negative connotations of irrationality and mysticism which contributes to its ongoing exclusion and neglect by educational institutions.

The hyper-rationality of FIDUROD (Kincheloe, 2010) is found in socio-political institutions, "but also in the life goals of individuals ensnared in the culture" (p. 117). Further, "alienation brings about the loss of receptivity and sensitivity to that from which we are alienated" (Bai, 2001, p. 6). Individuals perceive and understand the world in a certain way because that is what has been normalized (Bai, 2003, p. 45). Unsurprisingly, this alienation determines attitudes towards intuitive experience. Even though studies have demonstrated that intuition objectively 'works' (Bastick, 1982; Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999; Arvidson, 1997), intuitive experiences that happen in daily life are not generally provable nor replicable. For example, consider the occasion of waiting for an elevator. If, just as the doors open, you suddenly get an insistent, intuitive impression - 'don't go in the elevator, how should that experience be understood? Such intuition, which happens prior to thought, may easily be interpreted as a moment of anxiety. It may even have a similar somatic signature to fear, where the breath shortens or tightens, or the shoulders or stomach suddenly tenses. In a culture alienated from its impulses, i.e. where we hold everything in, from stomachs to farts to feelings, these signals are more likely to be misinterpreted or simply, missed. After all, there can be a fine line between following up an instinct and indulging a neurosis or irrational fear, especially when one has not intentionally invested in knowing the difference. The problem of requiring provability is that if we do not go in the elevator, chances are that we will never know if there had been a 'real' reason not to go; intuition is not 'provable' in that sense, as we can only ever objectively know what did come to happen.

Intuition clearly requires a different epistemological framework in order for it to make justifiable sense. Beyond the framework of knowledge production based in FIDUROD, there is an acknowledgement that all knowledge is created and interpreted

through the lens of human subjectivity (Kincheloe, 2010). This framework heightens the importance of the subjects through whom knowledge is transmuted. Within the framework of Cartesian dualism, Western society became skillful at understanding and addressing 'outside' problems, but "accomplished very little in the attempt to comprehend our own consciousness, 'inner experience' and the assumptions behind knowledge production" (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 46). But as Kincheloe argues, in order to make use of our accomplishments and achievements, we need to become the best possible subjects. There is a need now for transformation beyond epistemic transformation. As subjects, in order to *know* differently, we need to *become* differently.

# 1.4 Intuition development cultivates a 'way forward' from alienation

Within a widespread context of decontextualized, inert knowledge production, the million-dollar educational question is, how do we come to know through a different framework? How can the embedded dualism and rationality be interrupted and disrupted so that, as subjects, we can be differently? A potential next phase of re-integration, holism, and synthesis cannot be merely adopted because it is not based in information: rather, the alternative is a shift in orientation or approach to life. This is something we cannot merely learn about, but is something we must do, or become, by an integration of theory and practice and through transformation. Kincheloe (2003) called for this approach in his articulation of critical ontology, which "explores self-production for the purpose of conceptualizing new, more just, and more complex ways of being human" (p. 54). New age self-help intuition development guidebooks also recommend selfcultivation practices that re-centre the self as a locus of knowledge and experience, but here the self is not necessarily conceived of as an individualistic, separate entity. The practice of developing intuition is not only a self-serving efficiency tool that strengthens the intuitive function, but is the work of knowing the self-in-context, in order to transform it.

By its commitment to self-awareness and engagement, new age intuition development offers a concrete response to the alienated consciousness described in the previous section and may work as an antidote to alienation or estrangement. Intuition

development guidebooks offer intentional strategies that people can do when they want to develop trust in their own experience. These involve acquiring self-knowledge such that one is able to recognize and interpret intuitive experience in a way that makes sense to the individual who is experiencing it. Intentionally cultivating one's intuitive function involves becoming increasingly aware of one's actions, reactions, interactions, behaviours, responses, and attention. People can train to become more intuitive by practising consciousness development, by developing self-awareness and a heightened sensitivity to the present moment. Such heightened awareness is a valuable skill set, and a sought-after leadership skill; intuition development represents an *orientation* to seeking an increased range of possibility.

One of the features of this self-awareness is coming to understand the factors influencing our social, cultural, and psychological lives; structures that govern our experience. Yet at the same time, the experience of intuition is extremely personal, appearing to each individual on their own terms, providing content that must then be interpreted in ways uniquely meaningful to each. Intuition (in its many diverse interpretations) has been mystified along with other non-rational, non-representational aspects of the inner self, in part due to a general scepticism with respect to that which cannot be seen. This means that valuing intuition as a valid way of knowing entails a critique of cultural practices which at best effectively prevent intuition's cultivation, and at worst contribute to a denial of its intrinsic value, or even its existence. Thus, there is work to be done, to give voice to the experience of intuition as a lived reality, and to support people's access to this inner resource, by showing that it can be made available, and by connecting that availability to a praxis of inner work.

In a social world where alienation is pervasive, valuing direct and personal experience itself becomes an act of resistance. Recognition may be achieved in part by simply naming intuitive experiences and pointing to their (widespread) existence. Educational treatments of intuition frequently put forward a notion of intuition that includes hunches and other unconscious reasoning but that excludes aspects of intuition that are not as readily explainable - psychic experiences sometimes referred to as non-ordinary or para-psychological. When the word *intuition* does appear in educational texts, it is usually not meant to be synonymous with psychic ability. Indeed, some authors are careful to distance themselves from these conceptualizations. For example, while Claxton (2006) acknowledges the problematic social attitude that prevents people

from recognizing their hunches, he insists that his treatment of intuition is a "non-mystical account" (p. 53). This clarification serves as a defensive measure, to create distance between the more accessible term 'intuition' and the less palatable 'psychic,' even when these are functionally (through experience) the same mode. Generally in modern Western cultures, psychic abilities are treated with intense suspicion. 'Psychics' have a bad name, mocked as charlatans, and the whole idea of psychic intuition is subjugated as nonsensical.

The subjugation of intuitive knowledge is observable in our attribution of intuition to women, or to mothers, which, within patriarchal culture, serves to simultaneously devalue and dismiss both women and the intuitive mode (see, for example, Belenky et al, 1986). This attribution further effectively denies the experience of intuition to many people (not least, to men) who are unwilling to be connected with a denigrated experience. Returning to Adrienne Rich on the silencing of that which remains unsaid, by studying intuition, I intend to take it out of the folk knowledge 'closet' in order to - at least - frame it as an ordinary component of human consciousness. To do this, I have drawn on the new age self-help texts that offer an important counterpoint to this narrative, as they represent psychic or intuitive activity as normal, and in line with many people's lived experience.

Additionally, to account for the wide range of intuitive experience that I wish to include, I draw on an emerging body of theory that explicitly recognizes so-called non-ordinary experience, accepting a range of human consciousness that transcends a limited modern, Western account of consciousness. Transpersonal psychology, or transpersonal theory, is a 20th century intervention into the conventional ordering of experience that speaks back to decontextualization. It recognizes that a "sense of identity or self extends beyond ('trans') the individual or personal to encompass wider aspects of humankind, life, psyche or cosmos" (Walsh & Vaughan, cited in Anderson & Braud, 2011, p. 3). As such, a transpersonal framework can more readily account for intuitive abilities such as knowing something in advance, or at a distance, beyond the boundaries of the immediate, and beyond the personally identified aspects of self, and for the possibility of intuitively knowing about something even if it has not been experienced personally. The transpersonal framework will thread throughout the dissertation, anchoring my understanding of the psyche and its extended consciousness, and to normalize so-called non-ordinary intuitive experience.

A transpersonal interpretation of intuition suggests that a holistic, inclusive view of personal experience must include what is typically called non-ordinary experience; this framework exemplifies a more inclusive epistemological structure wherein so-called non-ordinary experiences such as psychic intuition might be reclaimed as ordinary. Significantly, a transpersonal framework readily assumes that "the remedy for the existential malaise that besets humanity is to turn inside, look for the answers in our own psyche, and undergo a deep psycho-spiritual transformation" (Grof, 1998, p. 200). This assumption situates the inner practices of intuition development as important antialienation measures.

## Intuition development as transpersonal practice

The epistemological framework of FIDUROD becomes less relevant the more intentional consciousness development practice one does, as the work itself seems to enable experience of the non-dual, non-binary, inclusive and holistic reality that transpersonal theory accepts as a matter of course. The act of using intuition intentionally (as the guidebooks teach people to do in their daily lives) "affirms a world reality in flux and mutable and, therefore, challenges conventional notions of a static worldview that is separate and distinguishable from the knower" (Anderson, 2011, pp. 17-18). Within such non-dual thought structures, mind and body are not distinct, compartmentalized aspects of self. If we accept this as true, it becomes easier to consider that one can *just* know. Rather than be concerned with whether the feeling is communicating something objectively right or wrong, the visceral sensation of a gut feeling can be a valuable signal that something is off, or on the other hand, right. Within this logic, something can be known intuitively even while making no sense to the persona.

I have begun my dissertation with an assumption, that disconnection from intuition is a symptom of alienation and estrangement, and a hypothesis that attending to intuition, especially through the cultivation practices recommended in new age guidebooks, may be a remedy for that alienation. Self-cultivation techniques that invest in knowing and caring for the self pursue a bigger outlook, and a deeper engagement with the world and within. In this sense, interventions such as those recommended in new age self-help books lead the practising subject to the pursuit of wisdom, and engage the subject to find ways of being better. Rather than emphasize the subject in its

autonomy, freed from the limitations of rationalization, the subject is freed to recognize her interdependence and agency within a shared, transpersonal context.

## 1.5. Road map to the dissertation

In this introductory chapter, I have established my research interest in the topic of intuition, and distributed the main themes that inform my dissertation. Here, I unpack and outline the remainder of the dissertation.

## **Overview of Chapter Two**

The next chapter (Chapter Two) serves as a conceptual review of the concept of intuition. In order to point to the diversity of ways intuition is thought about, and integrated, into bigger epistemological frames, the reader is introduced to a selection of theorists who write about intuition as a stand-alone topic, or whose insights about intuition remain influential. Within this survey, I clarify that there are various uses of the word 'intuition' that are rarely differentiated in colloquial use. 'Intuition' can refer to content, as in the product of intuiting, while in other contexts it can refer to a suspected source of knowledge, standing in for something like consciousness itself. Finally, it can refer to a mode, or function of consciousness: the process of intuiting.

For the purpose of this dissertation and its emphasis on enhancing and developing intuition, Chapter Two focuses on concepts relating to the intuitive mode in particular. I elaborate common elements of the intuitive experience, as found by phenomenological description. For example, intuition is most often experienced as sudden, direct, and holistic, where the whole of a thing is understood in one moment. This holistic element suggests that intuition synthesizes clues, and can therefore perceive previously unthinkable solutions to problems and other inquiries. I consider how the intuitive function is facilitated by a mode of consciousness known as a flow state (Csikszentmihalyi, 1990), in which the mind is relaxed and focused, and in which it can be receptive to intuitive arising. Additionally, I explore the affect of certainty with which intuition often arises, noting that this affect suggests the synergistic function of intellect and emotion, which points to one of the elements required in intuitive development: receptivity and sensitivity to one's inner experience of embodied sensation, emotional

state, as well as willingness to entertain surprising or unexpected arrival of intuitive content.

Throughout Chapter Two, I draw attention to the complex ways the concept of intuition can reflect and intersect with concepts about consciousness more generally. I note how philosophers might overvalue intuition, letting it stand in for creativity or consciousness in general, or even for mystical awareness sometimes referred to as unity consciousness. In contrast, other philosophers use the term intuition as synonymous with guess or hunch, representing it as untrustworthy and confusing, and opposing it to analysis, where analysis is considered the height of intellectual capacity.

Whereas psychologists on the whole tend to be in accord with each other with respect to the functionality of intuition, they explain it variously according to underlying assumptions they hold about the causes of psychological processes. Some psychologists would represent intuition as a function of acquired expertise in particular domains (e.g. Hogarth, 2001), while others suggest that intuition indicates a lack of barriers between individual, conscious awareness and a collective unconscious (Jung, 1971). From the point of view of transpersonal psychological theory, I explore why the common explanation of intuition as expertise is limited, and instead focus on the depth psychology of Jung, who centred intuition as a primary psychological function that enables perception of ideas and events in such a way that the content seems to the subject as if it has always been known.

In order to further hone in on a useful way to conceptualize intuition, I highlight connections between intuition and the concept of insight, and consider intuition in contrast with the complementary mode of analysis. I offer examples where intuition is explained as a kind of instinct, suggesting that the links between intuition and instinct, while likely true, are discursively utilized in ways that are idealistic, and untenable. I argue that the reason we find intuition difficult to define or name is the dominant, rational, scientist lineage that tends to disavow that which cannot be seen or categorized neatly, and which undervalues that which is unconscious, uncanny or uncomfortable. I suggest that a helpful way to conceptualize intuition is as a psychic sense. Ultimately, I recommend that a transpersonal psychological framework is an appropriate framework for conceptualizing the intuitive function at this time. Transpersonal theory recognizes the legitimacy and importance of psychic experience, and conceives of these as

resulting through communication between aspects of the self, including aspects of which we may be unconscious. Drawing on studies in psychology and para-psychology, I recommend that intuition be conceptualized as a psychic sense connected to the future, made possible by accessing conscious awareness beyond the individually-contained self.

### **Overview of Chapter Three**

Chapter Three introduces the reader to the genre of intuition development guidebooks that comprise the material impetus of this study. I present these books as an alternate conceptual space of theorizing about intuition, as they reflect a concept of intuition that is much closer to the one I am bringing forward: intuition as a psychic sense, made possible by connection to a transpersonal dimension, that includes so-called 'para-psychological' experience as within a range of accessible experience. In the chapter, I defend my choice to look to popular texts as a resource for information about intuition, and especially, about intuition development. I suggest that self-help is an educational space representative of a post-modern learning culture, and recommend that educational theorists should consider taking their content seriously, as it reflects widespread interest in themes that are otherwise under-addressed in educational venues.

Intuition development guidebooks are self-help publications, written for a popular audience, and they motivate and teach their readers to take up an intentional programme of practice to enhance the intuitive function. This programme, relatively consistent throughout the genre, is comprised of contemplative and introspective inner work meant to help the practitioner uncover, or 'awaken' their intuitive function. Although there is no standardization or official coordination, the recommendations are consistent enough across the guidebooks that I show them to be a coherent programme of practice, a programme that I call intuition development pedagogy (IDP). I introduce the practices comprising IDP.

These guidebooks rely on a range of metaphors to explain intuition, which are unpacked in this chapter. There is a consistency in the ways the authors borrow from diverse models and traditions, pointing to a lack of language for intuition, and the way that it can be experienced. For the most part, the writers normalize intuition by claiming it as an ordinary experience, as opposed to non-ordinary, or extra-sensory. To make this

point, they borrow from traditional knowledges of diverse cultures that have mapped the etheric, or energy, body and that have a framework for explaining experiences of consciousness for which modern Western science cannot account. The chapter further provides an overview of the tone of intuition development guidebooks and shows how, as self-help books, they educate and inspire readers to pursue a programme of intuition development.

As a subgenre of self-help books, intuition development guides represent a New Age, spiritual culture, and reflect a cultural current interested in spirituality and in self-development. In analyzing the content of these guidebooks, I connect the pursuit of enhanced intuition to a quest of meaning-making characteristic of the New Age 'culture'. Drawing attention to the way these books teach readers how to improve their intuitive function, I cite heavily from one of these texts, Frances Vaughan's (1979) *Awakening Intuition*, an early version of this kind of book on which the others are likely modelled.

Finally, I elaborate the discursive framework that supports intuition development in this cultural milieu. The guidebooks explain the function of intuition with reference to a framework that largely draws on Eastern wisdom traditions' articulations about energy and interconnection. Some also refer to concepts from theoretical quantum physics to support their explanations. I present some of this lineage in order to suggest that there is a coherent logic represented here, and one that positions psychic intuition as a reasonable and valuable experience. While some of these influences have entered educational philosophy, there is room for deeper engagement with these themes.

### **Overview of Chapter Four**

In Chapter Four I provide a stronger philosophic basis for the praxis of intuition development (IDP). Whereas in Chapter Three I identified that the guidebooks' programme of practice largely draws from Eastern wisdom traditions, in this chapter, I demonstrate that these practices also have lineage in a Western philosophic tradition. I dialogue with Foucault, who analysed this Western tradition (as 'care of the self') and showed that it reflects a discourse about subjectivity and knowledge production. I draw from Foucault's analysis to explore a question that may need to be considered if intuition is going to become discussable in academic venues: how is it trustworthy?

Foucault's study of the transformative practices of Ancient philosophic schools considers the ways humans constitute themselves as subjects (Foucault, 2007; Foucault, 2007a), and thus, as ethical actors in the unfolding of their own lives. Identifying care of the self as a relationship between truth and subjectivity, Foucault (2001) recognized that the Ancient subject becomes "capable" of truth only after undergoing some form of transformation (p. 190). I argue that the practices recommended throughout the guidebooks are a contemporary version of care of the self, and I read them in a way similar to Foucault's representation of the Ancient version: as a reflection that reveals assumptions about what we believe about the self, and about truth. I argue that, like the Ancient practice, in the pursuit of intuition development: the subject must undertake a process of transformation in order to access the truth of intuition. I suggest that the truth of intuitive knowledge is derived as a result of the knowing subject having developed as a result of the work they have done on the self.

Chapter Four considers that because the intuitive function develops as part of holistic consciousness development, intuition development pedagogy (IDP), is, functionally, the pursuit of psycho-spiritual well-being. With a commitment to transformation, the inner practices comprising IDP are similar to those undertaken within Ancient Greco-Roman schools of philosophy. While the practices of IDP are presented as a path to improve the intuitive function, they are not unique to the goal of intuition development; on the contrary, they are the same kinds of exercises as those that have been undertaken for centuries for a more general purpose: that of seeking wisdom, happiness, wholeness, or enlightenment. The pursuit of such practices creates coherence in individuals who may then behave with more resilience, authenticity, and critical awareness of their experiential context.

The analysis in Chapter Four reaffirms that self-development is what it takes to achieve greater intuitive function. The practices that comprise intuition development pedagogy reveal the intuitive function to be an outgrowth of overall consciousness development, whereby one integrates attention, and develops a coherence of awareness, similar to the consciousness development supported by any form of mindful practice.

#### **Overview of Chapter Five**

In Chapter Five I draw conclusions from my exploration, and point to some implications for educational theory and practice. I remind the reader that a cognitive definition of intuition is partial at best, and that a comprehensive definition of the concept requires a framework inclusive of 'spirituality.' To that end, I recommend a transpersonal psychological framework, that can account for a broader spectrum of consciousness. As I motivate my thesis that a transpersonal epistemological framework is required for conceptualizing the psychic domain of intuitive experience, the framework for intuition development that I have been exploring throughout the dissertation will be opened back up and offered to educational theory. The praxis of intuition development is recommended as a plausible alternative to the mechanistic, dualistic logic that shapes current truth practices, as well as notions of the self and behaviours that result from these values.

I return to a discussion of the knowing subject, and to the role of intuitive development practice as subject-formation, in consideration of how that practice might contribute to transforming epistemology, such that psychic intuition can be understood as sensible. Effectively, this transformation begins when individuals have opportunities to experience non-discursive consciousness in ways that are validated and normalized. I offer examples of how this validation might occur, and recommend that it be integrated into teachers' professional development.

The constraints of FIDUROD have contributed to a deficient understanding and awareness of the inner landscape of consciousness, and Chapter Five engages with two areas of philosophy in education that respond to this concern. First, I explore the ways that intuition gets called upon as part of a solution to transforming culture, that is, in response to the ecological, anthropocentric crisis in which we are currently embedded. Second, I dialogue with education theory (Palmer, 1993; Biesta, 2009 and others; Kincheloe, 2003 and others) that calls for more attention to interior experience, especially where this attention has been lacking in the lives of teachers. I connect my analysis of intuitive subject-formation to recent work in contemplative education theory (Bai, 2015 and others) that seeks to create opportunities for people to experience non-discursive consciousness, one way of fulfilling an existential requirement of attending to the soul. I also connect this turning inward to the theory of critical ontology (Kincheloe, 2008), and I suggest that intuition development practice may serve as a pedagogical

approach to critical ontology, in its commitment to finding new and better ways of being (Kincheloe, 2008).

I then briefly discuss some of the potential implications of educating for intuition, both beneficial and potentially risky. In particular, I explore the inherent risks involved when authorizing subjects to identify truth within. I reiterate that intuition development represents an important move against alienation and towards participatory engagement in the practice of knowledge production, and suggest that any risks should be considered in light of the creative and visionary potentials of the intuitive mode.

# Chapter 2 – Intuition: a disorderly concept

"Precise definition in terms of observable behaviour is not readily within our reach at the present time. Obviously, research on the topic cannot be delayed until such a time as a pure and unambiguous definition of intuitive thinking is possible, along with precise techniques for identifying intuition when it occurs. Such refinement is the goal of research, not its starting place."

Bruner, 1960, p. 59

"Insight and intuition are central to creativity and learning, yet no suitable model or explanation exists for these concepts. Consequently writers on learning and creativity are completely at a loss in the many cases where their work directly relates to these concepts. Consequently they frequently admit the need for research into insight and intuition"

Bastick, 1982, p. 4

## 2.1 Introducing the concept, intuition

This chapter introduces the reader to the scope of the various versions of the concept of intuition in philosophy, psychology, and more broadly, in popular discourse. It should become clear that how we understand the nature of reality shapes how we account for intuition. Thinking about intuition leads to thinking about consciousness more generally, which is itself somewhat ineffable and mysterious. Even with evolving advances in neurobiology, we continue to have a relatively limited understanding of the range of functions and capabilities of the human mind, and sometimes, 'intuition' is used vaguely to mean awareness of inner-directed awareness, or self-conscious awareness: awareness of ones own thoughts or feelings. This use is represented by phrases such as knowing 'in my heart' or 'in my gut.' Later in the dissertation, I will elaborate the link between intuition and awareness, showing that intentionally developing one's intuition entails a practice of deliberate self-awareness and consciousness development. However here, I largely leave aside the question of cultivating intuition, to first establish a foundation for what intuition is.

In what follows, I review a number of considerations of the concept of intuition. I address the experience of intuition with reference to studies, including Bastick's metastudy of psychological literature that describes intuitive function, and Petitmengin-

Peugeot's phenomenological study that gathered first-person descriptions of the intuitive mode. Then, turning to analyze various conceptualizations of intuition, I argue that the reason we find intuition difficult to define or name is the systemic rational, scientist lineage that informs our framework of understanding, which tends to disavow that which cannot be seen or categorized neatly, and which undervalues that which is unconscious, uncanny or uncomfortable. Since educators' imperative rests in the hope that the intuitive function can be improved and then harnessed to facilitate educative encounters, it makes sense to focus on the phenomenal experience of intuitive function.

The chapter begins with an introduction to some of the diverse thinkers who have been important to understanding intuition in philosophy of education. In this survey, I have not included any theorists who conceptualize intuition as rapid cognition. Although this is a common way of conceptualizing intuition, I will explore in section 2.4 why this understanding is limited and limiting. Instead, I clarify various other uses of "intuition": as a source of knowledge, as the knowledge-product of intuiting, and as the function or mode of consciousness. Then, I highlight connections between intuition and correlating concepts, imagination and instinct, and consider how intuition is set up in a binary opposition with analysis. I discuss why a popular way of theorizing intuition (as expertise) is inadequate within a holistic framework. Finally, drawing on theories and experiments in psychology and parapsychology, I will recommend that intuition be conceptualized as a "psychic sense," and suggest that understanding it this way is facilitated by an emergent transpersonal framework.

## Wading through conceptual confusion

As readers are by now aware, the word intuition is applied to a range of meaning, loosely categorized as inner knowing. Definitions for intuition commonly begin with the Latin roots of the word, translating *in tueri* as "to look at or toward, to contemplate" (Deikman, 1982, p. 177) or "to look upon" (Noddings & Shore, 1984; Goldberg, 1983); or *intuitus* as "the act of achieving knowledge from direct perception or contemplation" (Laughlin, 1997, p. 19). These definitions point to intuition's inward-directed focus, and also to the direct, immediate nature of intuitive experience as it occurs within the subjective frequencies of the mind. "Intuition" is sometimes used interchangeably with insight, instinct or inspiration, and where intuition stops and other similar concepts begin is as fuzzy as consensual notions of consciousness. Even recognizing the experience of

intuition to ourselves is complicated by the fact that intuition is usually experienced at a level of consciousness prior to interpretation.

The word "intuition," then, is a conceptual workhorse, used to describe a range of phenomena – possibly too many to be properly meaningful. As Richard Rorty (2006) noted, because of this overly broad definition(s), "nothing can be said about intuition in general." Many writers on intuition begin their books and articles by pointing out the lack of a clear definition for intuition (eg Davis-Floyd & Arvidson, 1997; Dane & Pratt, 2007; Bastick, 1982), and then proceed to offer some version of definition. Even Rorty defines intuition somewhat, as "immediate apprehension," where apprehension can apply to "such disparate states as sensation, knowledge, and mystical rapport. [And] *Immediate* has as many senses as there are kinds of mediation: It may be used to signify the absence of inference, the absence of causes, the absence of the ability to define a term, the absence of justification, the absence of symbols, or the absence of thought" (Rorty, 2006, p. 722).

When a single word is so broadly applied to a wide range of events and experiences, a mystique tends to build up around it. We know this situation from attempts to define qualities such as "love" and "good," where often (in the English language, at least) clarity is surrendered to metaphor, projection, and universals. In the case of intuition, the concept gets labelled "ineffable," meaning too great to grasp, inexpressible, or beyond words. Yet when writers insist on intuition's ineffable nature and emphasize how difficult it is to language, they also amplify its mystique. This effect is observable in treatments that aim to normalize intuition and to demystify it by claiming instead that intuition is a completely ordinary, and *rational*, human experience.

To further complicate the conceptual confusion, the way writers explain the *mechanism* of intuition depends greatly on the conceptual framework they apply, such as their beliefs about what consciousness is, its primacy, and its limits. Discourse around intuition is often shrouded in writers' attempts to stake claim for a particular epistemological or ontological position. In general, philosophers either speak of intuition's value for knowing things deeply and inherently, or else challenge intuitive knowledge as contrary to reason, sometimes framing intuition as an unjustified belief. For example, within the discipline of psychology, concern over how to improve the function and accuracy of intuition is framed by disagreements according to the various

schools of thought: Gestalt psychologists, who view the mind as a complex whole, conceptualize the reliability of intuition differently from Behaviourist psychologists, who understand the intuitive function as learned rather than as a form of instinct (Bastick, 1982). Across disciplines, and within popular discourse, effective synonyms for intuition range widely, from guessing, to self-reflection, to 'extra-sensory perception' (ESP). The existence of such different attitudes, beliefs, and orienting frameworks inhabited by different thinkers leads to contradictory accounts of just what intuition is. I hope to clarify some of that confusion here.

The word intuition itself can be used in multiple parts of speech. Intuition can variously refer to the *mode* of intuiting (the function of the experience); the source of intuitive information (the cause or initiating mechanism); or the content (or object) of intuitive experience. As contents or results of intuitive experience, intuitions may appear to the subject as thoughts, intimations, recognitions, impressions, hints, and hunches, any of which may relate to personal or impersonal, intellectual, psychological, or symbolic material. This use (intuition as content) refers to having 'an intuition' - by which we often mean insight, as in discovery. In this sense, intuition refers to an inner awareness that arises without knowing how we know, or a kind of "knowing that can't be tracked" (Ferguson, 1987, p. 296). Descriptions of these contents lead to another area of confusion, whereby intuition is understood as a source of knowledge rather than the function of consciousness that becomes aware of it. This use is found in texts where intuition may be somewhat synonymous with soul. For example when Estés (1992) describes intuition as like a wise old woman who never leads you astray, she is attributing the source of such wisdom to "intuition" as if intuition is a conscious entity, itself capable of awareness.

These three different ways of understanding intuition are widely used indiscriminately. A 1992 study analyzed interview responses from scientists (Marton, Fensham & Chaitlin, cited in Fensham & Marton, 1992) on the question: "Do you believe in scientific intuition?" Marton et al also found three distinct ways the scientists referred to 'intuition': first, as an outcome, which "denotes an idea, a feeling, a thought, or an answer"; secondly, an experience, referring to "acts or events"; and thirdly, scientists referred to intuition as an individual capability, for example with reference to key, well-known examples of scientists such as "Archimedes, Kekule and Poincare, who are all alleged to have arrived intuitively at solutions to problems," where intuition is "more often

about starting points: finding, choosing a direction, a path" (Fensham & Marton, 1992, p. 117). Throughout the dissertation, the reader will recognize all three of these ways of referring to intuition, however in this chapter, questions about the source and function of intuition are given primacy. Content is the least interesting to me here, relevant only to the extent that intuitive content can relate to anything, and need not be limited to areas with which subjects are already acquainted (as in some of the ways intuition is represented). I suggest that the source of intuition is a complex of mind, body, and psyche that culminates in the experience of a psychic sense.

## 2.2 Five theorists on the function of intuition

This section introduces five theorists and their address of intuition. I have included these theorists because each has either contributed to the way we understand intuition, or else represents a way that it is used in educational discourse. The theorists presented here represent a diversity in approaches to conceptualizing intuition. For example, Bergson and Jung both wrote during a turning point of ideas to do with consciousness development, and the interactions of individual and collective manifestations of such development. Their concepts demonstrate the importance to intuition of valuing the irrational and non-rational. Focusing on the experience of the intuitive mode, both Jung and Petitmengin-Peugeot rely on first-person phenomenology to describe intuitive experience. On the other hand, Bastick's research utilizes a literature review to explore the concept of intuition, especially as it arises in various schools of psychology. Finally, Noddings and Shore also present a comprehensive literature review, but focus on philosophical texts, with the intention of recommending the concept of intuition to the discipline of education theory. This section presents these theorists chronologically, however, this arrangement is not necessarily meant to suggest a development in ideas. Rather, I intend to show how the concept of intuition has been harnessed within various frameworks, as well as demonstrate intersections between philosophical and psychological approaches to understanding intuition.

## 2.2.1 Bergson

The first theorist presented in this section is philosopher Henri Bergson, whose understanding of intuition is as a method by which the subject enters into communion

with the object being intuited. For Bergson (2007), intuition is a "kind of intellectual sympathy by which one places oneself within an object in order to coincide with what is unique in it and consequently inexpressible" (p. 5). Bergson believed that intuition could be cultivated and developed by a practice of attention (Kolakowski, 1985, p. 31), but also described intuition as difficult, remarking that it "is an often very painful effort to place ourselves directly at the heart of the subject, and to seek as deeply as possible an impulse, after which we need only let ourselves go" (2007, p. 53). Bergson's meaning of intuition is specific to his bigger philosophic project, and yet resonates to most vernacular uses of the word, as sudden, direct knowing.

Bergson's philosophy more broadly deals with the central idea that the reality of the world unfolds in a creative process (Kolakowski, 1985). In general, Bergson argued that philosophical prejudice (habits of thinking) prevented accurate awareness of experience, and he cited intuition as a method by which to understand the metaphysical nature of reality, available to be known only through intuition. In *An Introduction to Metaphysics* Bergson (2007) explains intuition as the "metaphysical function of thought" (p. 43n), which is the way to access the experience of being that he calls duration. Duration, he explains, "can be presented to us directly in an intuition, … can be suggested to us indirectly by images, but that it can never – if we confine the word concept to its proper meaning – be enclosed in a conceptual representation" (2007, p. 14). In other words, intuitive apprehension is the only way to access metaphysical understanding. For Bergson (1911/1944), intuition "goes in the very direction of life" (p. 291). As such, because it is direct and holistic, intuition is able to perceive what is normally out of bounds to the intellect.

Intuition here is in contrast with analysis, and possibly, for Bergson is a compensation *against* analysis, which can only ever be an "imperfect translation" (Gunter, 1982). Analysis "reduces the object to elements already known, that is, to elements common both to it and other objects. To analyse, therefore, is to express a thing as a function of something other than itself" (Bergson, 2007, p. 5). While analysis is useful, it is by intuition that we can "commune with reality" (Kolakowski, 1985, p, 8). Intuition is a difficult effort, because thinking is a habit that must be overcome in order to make intuition more possible (Bergson, 2007). By contrasting intuition to the reductive tendency of intellect, Bergson also emphasizes the global nature of intuition, as it is the way we access the coherence of reality (as opposed to the way that the intellect

perceives, in discrete moments of time or space). Intuition therefore creates the metaframe whereby thought takes place; thinking cannot occur without it. This position resonates with Jung's insistence on intuition's primacy.

Beyond intuition, Bergson theorized more generally about consciousness, suggesting that an aspect of the self remains mobile in the flux of the creative universe, though this aspect is inexpressible in language. Consciousness, which is never identical with itself moment to moment, is contrasted with inert matter (see Kolakowski, 1985, p. 18), and Bergson describes intuition as the way to achieve 'intellectual sympathy' within the dynamic flux of consciousness. This description resonates to the commonly recognized intuitive experience of discovery and creativity, where an idea, answer, or judgement comes fully formed (it arrives, as opposed to having to create it). Biomolecular researcher Barbara McClintock has described her Nobel-winning discovery in this sense. In an intuitive experience, McClintock became conscious of herself as the stalk of corn she was trying to understand. She was thus able to learn things from the level of corn itself through the intuitive 'method' of intellectual sympathy. Subjectively, McClintock's experience may have felt effortless – almost as if it were facilitated by a synergistic force.

## **2.2.2 Jung**

C.G. Jung understood intuition to be a foundational psychological function. Intuition is one of Jung's four psychological functions (or 'types'), along with sensation, thinking and feeling. These functions are familiar to many of us as they have been adapted by the Meyers-Briggs Type Indicator tests, which are used to describe personality aptitudes. As with Meyers-Briggs, people tend to be dominant in one of Jung's four main psychological functions, suggesting that some individuals may have an aptitude for intuition where others don't, just as others orient towards the function of sensation or thinking more strongly. In Jung's 'type' framework, intuition and sensation are primary functions, providing content for the secondary functions, thinking and judging. Whereas sensation perceives content through the body's senses, as "the function of unconscious perception" (1971a, p. 220), intuition "transmits images, or perceptions of relations between things which could not be transmitted by the other functions or only in a very roundabout way" (p. 221).

Each of Jung's functions have introverted and extraverted facets, and every person, regardless of dominant function, tends to be oriented in one of these two directions of attention. Introversion orients to the inner object, or "the contents of the unconscious" (1971a, p. 258), while extraversion is directly oriented toward what is - and in the case of future-oriented intuition, what may be – out in the world. Therefore, introverted intuition orients to subjective perception, perceiving "the background processes of consciousness" (1971a, p. 259), which are as real as objects for this type. Jung describes introverted intuition as "apprehend[ing] the images arising from the *a priori* inherited foundations of the unconscious" (1971a, p. 261), and as responsible for experiences such as mystical awareness of cosmic interconnection, empathic resonance with other people, and the 'aha moments' favoured by efficiency and creativity coaches, where everything all of a sudden makes sense. On the other hand, extraverted intuition, which is "wholly directed to external objects" (1971a, p. 220), seeks out and senses new possibilities, meaning, and implications, acting as the pre-cognitive sixth sense that 'sniffs out' potential in the world.

Jung's categories demonstrate the diversity within intuitive experience and suggest why the one word is popularly used to describe such a wide variety of experience. In terms of the phenomenology of intuition, Jung clarifies that while intuition is distinct from sense perception, feeling, and intellectual inference, "...it may also appear in those forms" (1971, p. 453). In particular, extraverted intuition is often experienced through sense impressions. Jung explains that the experience of intuition can be "difficult to grasp" because it is a largely unconscious process (1971a, p. 220), and our awareness on that level tends to be extremely subtle and unpractised. Importantly, Jung does not view the unconscious as inherently pathological, or with the suspicion that other psychologists have done. For Jung, the unconscious is not necessarily what is repressed, but merely what is unknown (and, we could add, what is yet-unknown), while the purpose of an examined life, and the foundation of the psychological maturation process he called "individuation" is to make what is unconscious, conscious. Additionally, Jung (1971) distinguished a personal unconscious from a collective unconscious, comprised of "the mythological associations, the motifs and images that can spring up anew anytime anywhere, independently of historical tradition or migration" (p. 485).

Further elaborating the typology, Jung describes the extraverted intuitive type as having "a keen nose for anything new and in the making... always he must be running after a new possibility" (p. 369). Of the introverted intuitive type, Jung (1971) states, "it can even foresee new possibilities in more or less clear outline, as well as events which later do happen" (p. 400). Jung's explanation of intuition's orientation toward possibility and time is an important contribution to contemporary understanding. For Jung, intuition is decidedly future-oriented; it perceives yet-unmanifest material, and sees possibilities – which is why intuition is often connected to that which is new (Anderson, 2011), and to insight in general. The future-orientation of intuitive types legitimizes using the same word, intuition, for creative insight and for psychic phenomena like pre-cognition.

Jung's contribution to intuition serves to redress an overemphasis on intellectual, rational modes, and challenges the embedded, perceived binary between subjective and objective experience. Jung notes that the certainty associated with intuition - the quality of being 'given' - is similar to that experienced through the function of sensation. We might think about the ways we do and do not trust subjective experience when it has a physical correlation (as with felt sensation) and when it does not (as intuition often does not). For example, we tend to trust as real and true what can be seen visually, though not so with *inner* sight; dreams and visions are still considered untrustworthy or held to a very high standard of proof to be true. This is a culturally specific bias; outside the western lineage there are many examples of dreams and visions being valued as important bringers of information and wisdom. However, within the intuitive mode, something may be true symbolically or mythically rather than literally or semiotically. Following Jung's lead to explain intuition as a psychological orientation among the other types may contribute to taking intuitive claims seriously, valuing subjective experience more strongly, and accepting the diverse ways perception can occur.

#### 2.2.3 Bastick

In 1982, Tony Bastick published his 'Theory of Intuitive Thought,' intending to "describe the personality characteristics and the type of environment that facilitates intuition" (p. 10). Bastick conducted a meta-review of psychological literature, searching for the term or concept of 'intuition' in over two million documents and reports, and finding it addressed in fewer than 100 of these documents. Bastick was motivated by this "dearth" (p. 6) of research into intuition, caused by what he saw as reluctance on the part

of psychologists to address intuition, especially due to a disagreement he perceived between behaviourist and gestalt psychologists in the way they understand the concept. As a result of this reluctance, Bastick acknowledges that any number of studies that would have referred to the term 'intuition', instead may have been "conducted under designations such as 'preconscious concept formation', 'preverbal concepts', 'instinctive knowledge', 'cognitive reorganization', etc" (p. 6). Although Bastick's study was published more than thirty-five years ago, its representation of how intuition is variably approached by different 'factions' remains valid. The disagreement he identified among schools of psychology is still in play today, with some researchers of intuition insisting on the central role of past experience and learned expertise, while others continue to insist that intuition is unfairly reduced by that explanation, citing the complexity of intuition's 'Gestalt' (Bastick, 1982, p. 5).

Bastick's position is that intuition is a psycho-physiological phenomenon, involving affect, emotion, and other embodied experience, "a product of accepted psycho-physiological processes of thought and behaviour that occur under particular conditions of personality, environment, and experience" (p. xxiii). He notes the interdependent relationship between intuition and analysis, identifying intuition as a complex and holistic process, which, as opposed to the more linear character of analysis, "uses feedback feelings for the whole field of knowledge simultaneously" (p. 53). Interested in how information is encoded emotionally, Bastick's study identified twenty properties and phenomena that correspond to intuition and creativity, noting that most definitions for intuition are actually descriptions of 'associated properties' such as creativity and insight.

Bastick's properties that correspond to intuition and insight include: knowledge that is global, but that often arrives incomplete; based on innate, instinctive knowledge; dependent on the environment and an overall sense of relations; needs not be objectively correct; a preconscious experience that may be experienced as empathy, kinaesthetically, or some other way; accessed through a dreamlike state (which he calls 'hypnagogic reverie'); associated with creativity and egocentricity; and quick, immediate, and sudden experience, in contrast with abstract reason, logic or analytic thought. These properties are consistent with other phenomenological findings about intuitive experience, and will be encountered throughout the dissertation. Bastick's choice to construct a definition through listing as many as twenty correlates demonstrates the

range of available subjective experience of intuitive knowing, and acts as a reminder that it may be experienced differently by different people.

#### 2.2.4 Noddings and Shore

In 1984, Nel Noddings and Paul J. Shore published Awakening the Inner Eye as a review of intuition for education. In that book, they aim to both clarify the meaning of intuition and to explore how intuition is involved in educational processes (p. 68). They review how the concept of intuition has been used philosophically over time, and correlate it with concepts such as care. Noddings and Shore clarify four major features of the intuitive mode: "involvement of the senses, commitment and receptivity, a quest for understanding or empathy, and a productive tension between subjective certainty and objective uncertainty" (p. 69). They suggest that intuition is facilitated by a "passivereceptive state" (p. 55), which is an altered state of consciousness often described in creative discovery. (I refer to this state below as the quality of flow, in line with other theorists who identify this quality of experience.) They interrogate the connection other theorists make between intuition and familiarity or expertise, and point out that familiarity is not necessary for many intuitive insights, nor is familiarity sufficient for intuition to activate (p. 65). And while they acknowledge that the word intuition colloquially stands in for a number of synonyms, they exclude from their discussion psi experiences like beingto-being contact (telepathy) (p. 60) and "knowledge of being-itself" (p. 61), labelling these aspects as 'alternative.'

Noddings and Shore explore a variety of explanations for intuition, including the idea that intuition is "an object oriented capacity, one that organizes the material of inner and outer perception into representation for both reason and Will" (p. 202). They echo Bergson by describing intuition as "that function that contacts objects directly in phenomena. This direct contact yields something we might call 'knowledge' in that it guides our actions and is precipitated by our own quest for meaning" (p. 57). They further suggest that intuition is "driven by the Will's quest for meaning" (p. 202), where the will is the intentional self, "a shorthand designation for the dynamic centre of self – the heart of being" (p. 53). Here, intuition is presented as the capacity to construct meaning out of experience, to make sense of the world. Although they emphatically do not suggest that intuition is necessarily spiritual, their explanation shows that it is difficult to say anything meaningful about intuition without referring to the soul, or to poetry and

the arts, or to aspects of self and of nature that are more-than, or beyond. And this may be why academic writers traditionally either ignore intuition altogether or else appeal to an explanation of it that emphasizes its rational, expert aspects.

Noddings and Shore acknowledge the need for a nonlinear, non-rational. conversation about intuition. In 1984, they editorialized that, "clearly, the general public and, to a lesser extent, some segments of the intellectual community are ready to listen to an explanation of the human mind that includes a nonlinear, non-rational. component" (1984, p. 199). However, they may have been too optimistic. Many years after their study was published, Noddings (2011, personal communication) explained that she discontinued her research interest in intuition because her peers in thinking about the subject were not the intellectuals with whom she had wanted to engage, but rather were researchers invested in the New Age, and too 'out there.' Instead, Noddings' research turned to focus on care, a theme already present in Awakening the Inner Eye. Noddings and Shore had tried to fill a void of scholarly literature about intuition, yet the readiness they thought they were reading in the general public had not yet extended into the intellectual community. Thirty years on, I cautiously submit that educational philosophy does seem to be more willing to include diverse epistemological positions – indeed there is a recognition that aesthetic, existential, and integrated ways of knowing are required for an inclusive, representative education.

## 2.2.5 Petitmengin-Peugeot

Motivated by the lack of language available to describe the experience of intuition (a lack that is compounded by scholarly neglect of this task, compared to availability of explanations for the concept of intuition, and references to intuitive contents), Claire Petitmengin-Peugeot's (1999) study aims to describe the subjective, phenomenal experience of the intuitive function. In recognition of how difficult it can be for people to become aware of intuition due to its nature as 'pre-thought' (p. 44), an issue Jung also notes, Petitmengin-Peugeot devised a study to help her subjects access language to describe intuitive experience. The study was undertaken under supervision of Francisco Varela, a leading thinker in embodied cognition, and utilized two types of "interviews of explication," followed by analysis and modelling descriptions of the experience. The interview technique was performed during moments of intuitive experience, and sometimes, after the fact. It involves the researcher guiding the subject to an interior

state in which they could relive previous intuitive experience, through evoking embodied, sensory affect, and then helping the subject find language to describe what they had experienced. This method was chosen to help subjects avoid speaking from their knowledge as opposed to their experience, since Petitmengin-Peugeot (1999) wanted to "verify to what degree intuition is an experience which mobilizes our whole being, not only its intellectual dimension but also its sensorial, emotional dimension" (p. 45). Petitmengin-Peugeot notes the difficulty of evoking language that specifically describes the singular experience of intuition, noting that interviewer intervention helped subjects to avoid commenting and judging the experiences as they described them. A further distillation of judgemental comments was done during analysis of the interview contents.

Petitmengin-Peugeot found that there is a "generic structure" to the intuitive experience, characterized by four distinct, major "internal gestures": letting go, which is a gesture of entering into the intuitive 'state'; connecting, i.e. with the object of intuition; listening, whereby attention is both "panoramic and very discriminating" (1999, p. 60); and the intuition itself. These four gestures are similar but not identical with Noddings and Shore's (1984) four major features. Petitmengin-Peugeot's gestures involve the senses and emotions as well as the intellect; for example letting go may include a shift in attention to the body rather than thoughts, and may be signalled by slowing of breath, change in physical posture, and heightened sensations throughout the body, such as a feeling of spaciousness around the crown of the head (p. 61). These descriptions are valuable for their recognition of the mind-body interconnection inherent in the intuitive experience.

Petitmengin-Peugeot (1999) clarifies that intuition is "immediate" or direct, with no mediation by a process of reasoning. She describes how "it surges forth with a leap, unexpectedly, out of our control" and "appears all of a sudden, complete" (1999, p. 44). Awareness of intuition itself arrives to individuals at different thresholds, at different times, and can depend on the attitude, or receptivity, of the experiencer. At the point of the arising of the intuition, the subject can respond to the moment in a number of ways, including chasing away or repressing the sensation; grasping the sensation, "weighing it down with emotions or interior commentaries that will disturb listening" (p. 72); or welcoming the intuition in silence, letting it develop patiently. These responses are learned, or habitual, and Petitmengin-Peugeot explains how the intuitive function can be educated:

"it is possible to encourage its appearing, and to accompany its unfolding, by a very meticulous interior preparation. This preparation does not consist in learning, in progressively accumulating knowledge. It consists in emptying out, in giving up our habits of representation, of categorization, and of abstraction. This casting off enables us to find spontaneity, the real immediacy of our relation to the world" (p. 77).

Intuitive gestures are more likely to occur when consciousness is engaged elsewhere, or is otherwise in a relaxed state. For example, a number of the study's participants noted that they experienced intuition when falling asleep.

Petitmengin-Peugeot's study demonstrates that attitudes towards intuition and its significance can influence how it is experienced. For subjects who are most aware of their intuitive experience, "intuitive sensations are always present; the only variable is the attention we bring to them" (p. 72). Such attention is complicated by the study's main conclusion: that we lack language to describe the interior gestures comprising the intuitive mode. Specifically, Petitmengin-Peugeot concludes that "our language is very poor for describing the essential aspects of the intuitive experience: its corporeal anchoring, the return of attention to the interior, the absence of intentionality, the fine line of attention brought to the singular situation which is lived out here and now, the loss of a feeling of individual identity" (1999, p. 76).

## 2.2.6 Summary of this section

The theorists discussed in this section represent similar enough conceptualizations of the intuitive mode. Among them, intuition is conceptualized as a psychological function that perceives or recognizes knowledge that seems to appear suddenly, without thinking, and without conscious processing. Intuition is identified as complex, and involving multiple processes including emotion, physical response, and hermeneutic associations.

I have presented a mixture of essential texts on intuition (and intuition in education), trying to be representative of various standpoints. Many other theorists who have considered the intuitive function are not included here, and some of these will be introduced throughout the remainder of this chapter. I encountered some of these (Claxton, 2000; Sadler-Smith, 2008; Waks, 2006) through their connection of intuition as a leadership skill. Others have theorized about affiliate concepts, like Polanyi's (1969) tacit knowing. Some (Bruner, 1960; Salk, 1983) explicitly consider how intuition can be

utilized as an educational skill. I have also found use for the cross-disciplinary perspectives on intuition included in a publication by participants in the Academy of Consciousness Studies, affiliated with the Princeton Engineering Anomalies Research (PEAR) Laboratory. These, along with Anderson's (2011) 'intuitive inquiry' offer examples of intuition as conceptualized through a transpersonal theoretical framework, and will be discussed further in section 2.5. In the next section, I summarize an area that almost all agree on – the phenomenological experience of the intuitive mode, and the psychological state that seems to facilitate its functioning.

#### 2.3 Characteristics and correlates of the intuitive mode

Regardless of whether there is agreement about what intuition is (i.e. where it comes from, and how it happens), there are undeniable similarities in the way it is experienced. A frequently cited (eg Laughlin, 1997; Arvidson, 1997; Anderson, 2011) meta-study done by Bastick (1982) combed extant literature to find common characteristics of the experience of intuition. Bastick was able to list a sense of certainty, a suddenness or immediacy of knowing, gestalt (holism), preverbal/ frequently ineffable, and an empathic aspect, among other characteristics. Petitmengin-Peugeot's (1999) study of the momentary and transient phenomenological experience of intuition found that the intuitive experience has a "generic structure" (p. 45) with particular affective keynotes, such as the characteristic suddenness of knowing, and the state of relaxed awareness that supports its arising. Noddings and Shore (1984) focus their discussion of intuitive modes on four major features: "involvement of the senses, commitment and receptivity, a quest for understanding or empathy, and a productive tension between subjective certainty and objective uncertainty" (p. 69). In addition, they note intuition's sudden, immediate character, as well as how it is served by relaxation into the intuitive process, rather than by stress or concern about the outcome. These characteristics show us what the experience of intuition is like, beyond having to speculate, and also point ahead to the practices that comprise intuition development, introduced in Chapter Three.

In this section, I have chosen to concentrate on three key characteristics of the intuitive mode: flow, gestalt, and the affect of certainty. These characteristics help to

demonstrate that intuition is a transpersonal, psychic function of consciousness that can be experienced through the whole body, and where consciousness is not experienced as contained within the individual form. Flow describes that intuition depends on relaxation (Petitmengin-Peugeot's 'letting go') and trust (Noddings' & Shore's 'commitment and receptivity'). My discussion explores how consciousness attains better 'flow' when consciousness is engaged in focused attention (Czikszentmihalyi, 1990). which establishes why meditation and guided imagination are included as part of intuition development. The characteristic of gestalt points to the heuristic function of intuition, and suggests why intuition is useful for understanding clues and patterns to synthesize meaning and see things in a new way. Gestalt helps to explain how intuition works on multiple sensory stations all at once, and is an important foundational difference between intuition and analysis. Finally, I discuss the characteristic affective certainty that surrounds intuitive experience. This characteristic is complicated by the intuitive mode thriving on uncertainty, and comfort with so-called 'negative capacity' the ability to accept uncertain outcomes for the time being, implicated in the option to either trust one's intuitive function, or not. If it is trusted, this uncertainty resolves. If it is not trusted, the uncertainty can interfere with action and follow up.

Beyond these three key characteristics of the intuitive mode, this section also analyzes two concepts that are often conceptually linked to intuition: insight (as a correlation), and analysis (as a contrast). Insight refers to the use of intuition in the creative discovery process, representing sudden understanding, and sudden knowing. Considering intuition alongside analysis, from the perspective of what intuition is not, allows for stronger consideration of what intuition is. I have included the themes of insight and analysis in order to unpack how intuition gets positioned within the scope of what we understand about cognition, consciousness, and epistemic agency, and to introduce the question of whether we do or do not trust the affective experiences involved with intuition, and importantly, whether we *should* trust such experience.

#### 2.3.1 Flow & Gestalt

Flow and gestalt are two related ideas that are helpful to understand the intuitive mode. Flow describes the relaxed yet alert state of consciousness that is most supportive of receiving and perceiving intuitive content, while gestalt points to the holistic nature of intuitive knowing, where content arrives to the conscious awareness whole and

complete. These two characteristics are involved with the difficulty in languaging intuitive experience, wherein the subject's consciousness is understood to be in resonance with the thing being intuited.

The concept of 'flow,' developed by positive psychologist Mihalyi Csikszentmihalyi (1990), is not meant to describe intuition per se, but does help to shape how we understand the experience of it, as it seems to describe the state of consciousness at the moment of intuition. According to Csikszentmihalyi (1990), flow is "the optimal state of inner experience ... in which there is *order in consciousness*. This [flow] happens when psychic energy – or attention – is invested in realistic goals, and when skills match the opportunities for action" (p. 6). Flow occurs when we feel that we are in control of, and are fully participating, in our lives, and is thus a source of happiness and subjective wellbeing. The opposite condition to this inner order is chaos, which Csikszentmihalyi identifies as a root of ontological anxiety and discontent. Flow can occur by chance, but more often must be pursued intentionally. To this end, Csikszentmihalyi recommends activities like games might be pursued; with rules to follow and goals to be achieved, one's attention can become immersed and benefit from a sense of discovery and creativity.

Flow is similar to the Taoist idea of wu-wei, doing-not-doing. Sometimes translated as 'being *in* the tao,' this is a relaxed-yet-attentive state in which intuition thrives. In this sense, the intuitive mode is like being in the flow of the cosmos itself. As Czikszentmihalyi writes, flow "is sometimes accompanied by a feeling of union with the environment" (p. 63), enabling the loss of self-consciousness which can inhibit access to the intuitive mode. In the flow state, "we lose, temporarily, the awareness of our separate self" (Miller, 1994, p. 2). This is a state of awareness sometimes referred to as 'nondual' or 'transpersonal' since it can connect the subject with a realm of experience beyond what is usually experienced as personal identity. Burenko (1997) offers a similar, 'nondual' explanation of intuition as flow. In his words, intuition "is not just thinking 'of' the world but embodied doing 'as' the world." In this conception, the knowing subject and the object being perceived are not distinct, an understanding of the intuitive mode that will become significant as a move to talk about intuition development.

Most simply, flow is a balance of relaxation and awareness within which we are more likely to be alert to the vague or unclear perceptions sometimes characteristic of intuition. Generally, writers on intuition use the concept of flow to describe a state in which intuition is more likely to happen, an explanation that is supported by empirical study. Petitmengin-Peugeot's phenomenological research showed that as someone intentionally engages the intuitive function, there is a distinct settling in to the body and 'letting go.' Noddings and Shore (1984) similarly describe a receptive phase in which "activity must cease in order that what-is-there may exercise its influence upon the intuition" (p. 74). Such receptivity may be best explained as an experience of flow, and it is reasonable to consider that intuition is a perceptual mode of awareness made available by being in the flow state. Intuition may be that aspect of consciousness that stays, always, in flow, even as the individual's awareness of herself moves in and out of her field of awareness.

A second common feature of the intuitive mode is its gestalt, or holistic, orientation. Intuitive content tends to present itself as whole and complete (Jung, 1971) and so is useful in perceiving the whole picture, or recognizing a broader scope of choices than one could imagine. Intuition synthesizes meaning from multiple directions at once, drawing from broad spectrum data comprising experience as it is happening, as well as from memory, inner vision, or emotional involvement (Bastick, 1982). The gestalt may even include content anticipated as potential from the future, before a thing has manifested. The holistic orientation of intuition finds patterns and connections - such as meaningful, synchronistic 'coincidences' - and synthesizes clues, impressions, memories, and subtle senses to construct meaning out of seemingly incoherent input. Bastick (1982) names the holistic property, 'global knowledge,' to emphasize that intuition "is not a linear step-by-step process, but a global non-linear process using information from global perception" (p. 172).

In his writing on tacit knowing, Polanyi (1969) describes an intuitive approach to inquiry that is guided by this gestalt orientation, whereby "each scientist starts then by sensing a point of deepening coherence, and continues by feeling his way towards such coherence" (p. 82). For Polanyi (1969), the characteristic of gestalt is inherent to intuition, which, he writes, "is a skill, rooted in our natural sensibility to hidden patterns and developed to effectiveness by a process of learning" (p. 118). In this description of intuitive process in the discovery realm, the feeling of coherence precedes its proof, which may be found later, by empirical means. Polanyi draws on gestalt psychology to explain tacit knowing as a kind of awareness in which the whole makes more sense than

the particulars of its parts. In other words, the intuitive mode makes sense of a pattern or theme by recognizing its gestalt, rather than by somehow cumulatively recognizing its parts. This supports an important distinction between intuition and analysis, which is more concerned with looking at parts. Intuition's gestalt character may be relevant to a growing field of holistic educators, as well as to any theorist who considers that analysis (with its trajectory of breaking stuff down) is more functional when applied in conjunction with its intuitive, synthetic correlate.

The gestalt characteristic of intuition is sometimes invoked as able to facilitate better understanding of the complexity we are starting to recognize as the nature of this world. Like Bergson's representation of intuition, many notions of the function are "linked to a holistic vision of human life and the idea of mind and body operating in harmony" (Noddings & Shore, 1984, p. 17). The intuitive mode may contribute to overcoming a fragmentary view of, and attitude towards, life itself. A gestalt framework is relevant for reasons of ecological well-being, interpersonal relationships and perhaps most importantly, for internal, psychological integration, since the global awareness of intuition requires and supports awareness of one's context, and the relationships we maintain to that context. Visual artist Woodward (2013) elaborates the gestalt of intuition well, writing that intuition offers

"a glimpse of the entangled meshwork we are all a part of, a glimpse of something outside of our assumed boundary of bodily and material existence, a glimpse into the possibilities for action and movement, both past and present, a glimpse of the entanglement. In this sense, intuition is never merely a hypothesis; rather, it is a moment amidst a process embedded within the very bringing forth of a reality itself" (p. 13).

In this understanding, the perceiving subject is necessarily embedded in context, inseparable from their environment, and the direct experience of this condition is nondual awareness.

# 2.3.2 Certainty

Intuitive contents have the character of being 'given' and they tend to arrive with an affect of certainty and conviction (Jung, 1971). A feeling of epistemic confidence is notable in 'aha moments' of insight and in the strength of conviction carried by what gets termed 'mother's intuition', and these can be an asset when one's intuition is

unexpected, or when its content is contrary to conventional wisdom. Jung notes that intuition's characteristic certainty occurs because intuition arises from within, so that it feels like we have always known its content. Bastick (1982) suggests that a reason for the affective certainty is the intuitive mode's reliance on reference from the physical body, and points out that the affect of certainty gets attached to the physiological relaxation and reduced tension that occurs at the moment of intuition, similar to Petitmengin-Peugeot's gesture of 'letting go.' Whatever the causal mechanism, the internal experience of certainty is one of the widely noted qualitative keynotes of the intuitive mode (Bastick, 1982; Noddings & Shore, 1984; Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999).

Certainty is a site of concern among theorists of intuition, in terms of the validity of intuitive claims, where it gets alternately framed as an asset and a liability. Most education theorists insist that intuitive content needs to be followed up by empirical confirmation, as opposed to simply trusting in the outcome. A common trajectory is to allow that intuition is valuable for inspiration, while insisting that its certainty is to be found in following up intuitive content by experimental or analytic means, especially in matters of science and invention. For example, Noddings and Shore (1984) argue that the affect of certainty connects intuition to an instinctual drive to understand, which is a starting point of curiosity, suggesting that the certain feeling "is in itself an indication that the quest for meaning and understanding is part of the intuitive function" (p. 53). However, they clarify that "a defensible view of intuition ... must not confuse the intuition itself with the feeling of certainty that often accompanies it. What seems intuitively correct or obvious may, indeed, turn out to be wrong" (p. 53), and so intuition must always be supported with empirical confirmation.

In more sceptical treatments of intuition, it is implied that the subjective sense of certainty leads an individual to be overly confident in their intuitive decision, logic, or perception, even when that judgement is misguided. For example, even while advocating for the usefulness of intuition, psychologist Hogarth (2001) cites multiple examples of intuitive experience that turn out to be wrong, such as laboratory tests where subjects' 'intuitions' were found to be inaccurate, and the often-cited Muller-Lyer perceptual illusion (Hogarth, 2001, p. 11). In the latter example, two arrows of the same length are presented in different frames, in a deliberate attempt to confuse, leading most people to mistakenly perceive one line as longer. Hogarth's assignation of these examples as 'intuition' (i.e. rather than guesses or hunches) should be considered

against other representations of intuition that claim it is never incorrect, like Vaughan's (1979) position, which suggests that when an 'intuition' does not turn out to be correct, it should be considered to have been a bad guess and not intuition. Vaughan (1979) argues that, unlike hunches, the intuitive function is always correct, and even "true by definition" (p. 45). This divergence may be a matter of language, indicating the different ways scholars are using the concept 'intuition.'

Bastick (1982) also suggests that intuition is never wrong, but in a different way from Vaughan (1979). Bastick argues that even if the *content* of intuition does not pan out to be objectively correct, in the immediate intuitive moment, the subjective *experience* of intuition is correct. Like other theorists who suggest that self-deception or wishful thinking commonly obfuscate the truth of intuitive content (Vaughan, 1979, p. 45), Bastick argues that any error seemingly the result of intuition should be understood instead as an error in processing and communicating the content, rather than in recognizing the arrival of the intuition itself. Often, intuitive content is fuzzy, grainy, or vague, and it has to be interpreted by the subject before it is understood (Bastick, 1982; Goldberg, 1983), and therefore intuitive errors may be the result of having incorrect interpretive tools or working with insufficient assumptions (Bastick, 1982). Bastick (1982) argues that precise decoding of intuitive content depends on correct and accurate introspection, pointing to the need for self-awareness as a prerequisite for confident intuitive functioning. With practice the symbols, itches, hunches, the unformed inklings become more coherent.

A scepticism about intuition's certainty also corresponds to exaggerated claims about intuition being a way to access metaphysical truths, such as in the philosophy of Bergson, where intuition is understood as the way to access a direct experience of universal life force energy. I expect that some of the scepticism found in educational writing on intuition is a response to this belief-based investment. However, within a transpersonal, gestalt framework, and a framework of existence as 'unfolding', we might consider that an intuition that seems 'wrong' may actually lead to an outcome that is ultimately 'right' for the individual or for the specific context. Intuition is information that arises to a subjective consciousness. Because of the idiosyncratic nature of intuitive perception and the intuitive process, intuition can only be subjectively appropriate rather than correct (Bastick, 1982, p. 323). The intuitive experience could lead to a different path, or to a different orientation within – these are subtle shifts that might never get

noticed but that are ultimately redeemed. Often, we recognize the big intuitive experiences, failing to realize that intuition can guide even the most mundane decisions.

Paradoxically, although intuition comes with an affect of certainty, it thrives when a certain amount of *uncertainty* is tolerated, which complicates the question of whether or not the intuitive mode is to be trusted, and heightens the need for self-awareness if intuition is to be functional. Uncertainty can be on the level of the fuzzy or vague character of the intuitive content, or, there may be a gap in time between knowing something intuitively, and that intuition being confirmed, requiring the subject to ride a tension between curiosity and relaxation of consciousness. Noddings and Shore (1984, p. 89) note the paradoxical tension between this subjective certainty and "a skeptical objective uncertainty" that for them, should remain in tension if intuition is to be useful. There is a space of potential in which intuition arises, and Noddings and Shore (1984, p. 113) suggest that education should move to helping students maintain what they call the productive tension of this paradox: that place or period of uncertainty before whatever it is works out.

The subjective certainty of the intuitive mode is similar to the 'givenness' felt with sensation, the other psychological function that Jung categorized as primary. However, we tend to believe what we experience in the sensory body as real and true, compared with the sceptical way intuitive awareness gets interrogated. The uncertainty of the intuitive mode requires trust in the process. In support of developing that trust there is the need to distinguish intuitive moments from impulses, projections, and bias (Boucouvalas, 1997). Such interpretive skill again highlights the role for reflexive practice, and for disciplined self-awareness, in order to facilitate discernment between these subjective experiences. In the limited number of studies that have investigated the phenomenal experience of intuition, research has found that the intuitive function is more accurate and successful among people who *believe* that they have the ability to access information that way (eg Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999), a confidence given by previous successful experience (Bastick, 1982). If the value of intuition is that it broadens possibility, cultivating trust in the potential that it is correct is worthwhile, and many educators along the way have suggested as much.

Finally, a subjective certainty of correctness highlights an important contrast between the intuitive mode and the analytic mode, the latter being characterized by doubt and uncertainty. Within the Western educational lineage, we are much more inclined to doubt first than to trust; this is a foundation of the scientific paradigm and of the mode of analysis itself. Unfortunately, starting from a default of doubt rather than trust can become a source of alienation and ennui; leading to a state wherein we can never be fully invested or immersed in something, always having to hold our subjectivity at bay. Often, this effort can cause anxiety or stress that interferes with the receptivity required of intuition (Bastick, 1982). The affective certainty that goes with intuition can be compelling, but intuition is a perceptual mode; it must be received and also paired with other functions in order to be useful. Intuition's affective certainty does not mean we should abandon our critical faculties and embark on blind trust, however its certainty holds space until the objective uncertainty can be clarified rather than dismissed.

#### 2.3.3 Intuition compared to insight

Like many functions of consciousness, intuition is often explained indirectly, by associations with similar concepts. In this section, I compare intuition with one of these concepts – insight - as a way to clarify a more nuanced understanding of intuition itself. Colloquially, the words intuition and insight are often used interchangeably, both referring to spontaneous, non-rational understanding. However, although the terms are regularly used in conjunction, insight and intuition are not necessarily identical functions. For example, Bastick's (1982) theory groups insight and intuition, ('twenty foundational properties of insight and intuition') yet he distinguishes the two functions by noting that insight is one type of intuitive content.

The idea of insight ('in sight') utilizes the visual metaphor so commonly associated with intuition (Noddings & Shore, p. 35). This association hints that we lack imagination in how to understand intuition and the ways it works, and we definitely lack language to speak about its functioning. Bastick (1982) suggests that "the term intuition is much older and more widespread than theoretical usage of the term insight" (p. 41), and suggests that the vocabulary of insight became more commonly used with the rise of gestalt psychology. This may be because the word, insight, acts as a metaphor for the process of holistic psychology that aims at subjects having 'inner sight' – or awareness of the psychological processes happening within. Noddings and Shore (1984), whose book title refers to the "inner eye," prefer to exclude sensory experience (like pain, etc.) from the domain of intuitive activity (p. 61), and yet incongruently refer to the Will as able

to 'see'. However, colloquially we do think of intuition as a kind of sensory activity, though without being able to identify the organ through which it is processed.

Insight may be the aspect of intuition that is speculative and oriented to possibility, useful in scientific and artistic creativity alike. Intuition is like insight in its characteristic of newness, wherein we suddenly have access to new information, or to a new way of seeing a problem. Anderson (2011) explains that "insight changes what can be seen," meaning that unexpected ideas occur to the intuitive researcher that could not have been anticipated through cognitive means. Similarly, Polanyi (1969) suggests that intuition allows people to "discover things that are most surprising and make men [sic] see the world in a new way" (p. 118). Intuition is a future-oriented, anticipatory sense, acting as a 'nose' that sniffs out potential (Jung, 1971), including what may be upcoming, impending, or just beyond the horizon of the manifest.

Others make a more specific distinction between insight and intuition. Insight is connected to flashes of ideas: sudden and complete solutions or comprehension, where there is an element of speed compared with rational processes. Sometimes, the insight of intuitive experience follows an intense period of work on a specific problem. Then, when we relax that focus or attention, the answer is revealed in a sudden, direct way. For Hodgkinson et al (2008), insight and intuition are particularly distinguishable based on whether or not there has been an incubation period preceding the occasion of insight. (For them, insight necessarily involves incubation). The incubation period is a wellknown concept (see Goldberg, 1983; Gladwell, 2005; Liljedahl, 2004) in creativity, math, and science. The chemist Kekulé is famously said to have had a daydream reverie in which the solution to a problem he had been working on – the structure of the benzene molecule – was revealed to him in a moment of insight (Goldberg, 1983). Yet incubation simply does not account for many intuitive experiences, and this becomes a point at which intuition and insight might be distinguished. This is not merely a linguistic difference: If intuition accounts for insight where there has been no incubation, nor prior consideration of a specific problem, this suggests the possibility of pre-cognitive awareness, and confirms a general future-orientation to the intuitive sense, rather than orientation to the past and to memory favoured by theorists of intuition as expertise. The concept of intuition as expertise will be addressed in section 2.4.

#### 2.3.4 Intuition in contrast to analysis

The issue of intuition 'versus' analysis arises often in the literature, with the two modes positioned as distinct and separate, and then ultimately reconciled as complementary. Noddings and Shore (1984) clarify the different approaches inherent to each mode: "when we contact objects analytically or conceptually, we lay structures on them, or we move away from the objects under study to other objects, operations, or principles that we relate to the original objects. When we contact objects intuitively, however, we continually return to the objects themselves: We look, listen, touch; we allow ourselves to be moved, appeared to, grasped" (p. 69). Where intuition is direct, analysis works through the creation of distance.

I have already addressed the well-noted requirement to follow up intuitive awareness by empirical means, as part of an undercurrent of scepticism towards intuition in general. Whether because intuition is too subjective, or not replicable, it is understandable to find a recurrent binary set up between intuition and analysis within an intellectual culture oriented primarily to the rational. Western subjects are trained in analytic methods, and our epistemological approach is to take things apart in order to know and understand them. Even so, scientists, artists, and leaders in every field acknowledge that they make decisions based on intuitive hunches rather than reasoned analysis. It is widely understood that an exclusively analytic process is insufficient, especially in terms of decision making, and in seeking creative solutions (Sadler-Smith & Burke, 2009). Intuition is quicker, with more creative potential; it is a way to see more possibilities (Vaughan, 1979), and facilitates awareness of things that are not otherwise knowable.

In some cases, intuition gets positioned as a counterpoint to too much analysis. For example, writing on behalf of the many scientists and educators who convened at Woods Hole to discuss a post-war, American science curriculum, Bruner (1960, p. 61) encourages his readers to support students' intuitive function because of its usefulness in the discovery process, noting the need to overcome whatever biases have omitted intuition from formal education. Salk (1983) similarly calls for intuition to be "liberated from bondage and constraints, and put in charge of a respectful intellect. If a respectful intellect becomes conscious of intuition and reflects upon what it observes, a self-correcting, self-modifying and self-improving process is established" (p. 80). Yet these

calls stand out within a struggle for the legitimacy of intuition that is embedded in a bias about the unconscious, that it is not to be trusted.

The task of understanding intuition in contrast to analysis is embedded in a legacy of the discipline of psychology working to make sense of the vast spaces of the mind while positioning itself as respectable in the eyes of other scientists; a science of the mind as opposed to a 'philosophy of mind'. This legacy is illustrative of a difference in the way contemporary philosophers and psychologists differently address the concept of intuition. For example, philosophers overwhelmingly value intuitive over analytic ways of processing information (Henden, 2004). Henden (2004) reports that in general, philosophers "define it [intuition] as rational and intellectual while analytical thought is seen as relative, incomplete and fragmented" (p. 12). Bastick (1982) notes that philosophers have traditionally overvalued the intuitive function, equating it to consciousness more generally and making grand claims on its behalf. On the other hand, according to Henden (2004), intuition is not similarly valued in psychology, where "the main tendency is to treat intuition as some sort of unconscious, automatic and biased processing devoid of proper rational qualities" (2004, p. 12).

In considering this 'debate,' I return to Jung's psychological types theory, and its clarification that the irrational functions of intuition and sensation provide content for the rational ones (thinking and feeling). Jung identifies the irrational functions as primary, since they *perceive* and *receive* input, while the rational, secondary functions process and make sense of data through *judging* and *analysing*. We might say that the intuition-sensation axis is *non* rational rather than use the now-loaded word (which Jung used), *irrational*. Yet the idea that intuition is subpar because it does not abide by what we understand as 'reason' is deep-seated. This idea is even integrated into our languaging, where 'reasonable' and 'rational' are synonyms for 'good' knowledge (Waks, 2006). Jung's framework identifies that analysis cannot happen without sensory or intuitive data, which at any rate happens after the experience. Rather than intuition being "contrary to reason," Jung (1971) describes intuition as "outside the province of reason." Each has a role, and the roles support different functions of consciousness.

Bergson (2007) says something similar regarding the complementary relationship of intuition and analysis, but with an advocacy of intuition *over* analysis. He notes that whereas intuition is "the kind of intellectual sympathy by which one places oneself within

an object in order to coincide with what is unique in it and consequently inexpressible [,] ... Analysis, on the contrary, is the operation which reduces the object to elements already known" (p. 5). In other words, Bergson argues that analysis offers an "always imperfect translation" even after the effort of complicated intellectual gymnastics, compared with the "simple act" that intuition is. Here, Bergson represents the tendency to romanticize intuition and the way philosophers sometimes reify it as perfect, or conflate the idea of intuition with grand concepts that are difficult to language, such as unity experiences, love, etc. Especially in an intellectual climate that overvalues analysis, intuition unfortunately sometimes gets leveraged to defend a more magical world view, rather than recognizing the strength of each mode as complementary.

#### 2.3.5 Summary of this section

This section has explored several aspects of intuition in order to clarify some boundaries around the concept. Even with a limited understanding of the mechanism of intuition, it is recognizable by its orientation to wholeness and to synthesis, compared with the direction of unpacking and breaking down, characteristic to the analytic mode. I compared the sudden, uncanny nature of intuition to the similar function of insight, which, unlike intuition, seems to require prior acquaintance with the content. In addition, I summarized three of intuition's most recognizable characteristics: an orientation to gestalt, which distinguishes the intuitive mode from the analytic mode; an experience of flow, the state of consciousness in which subjects become most receptive to intuitive experience; and an affect of certainty, which points to the need for further discussion about the role of the experiencing subject in distinguishing the truth or correctness of intuitive experience. The characteristic affect of certainty, as well as the arising awareness of holism through the positive condition of flow add up to a beneficent experience that links intuitive awareness with a sense of order or rightness, or even well-being.

## 2.4 Origins of intuitive content

Throughout this chapter, I have shown that the subjective, phenomenal experience of intuition seems to be quite consistent – suddenly, we know something,

and we are unable to trace how we have arrived at that knowledge. However, explanations and conceptualizations of that experience vary widely, depending on what the subject believes about intuition and about the nature of consciousness more generally. For example, immediate, 'just' knowing is sometimes interpreted as communication from one's personal unconscious, or less commonly, as an intervention by a metaphysical factor such as an angelic guide. Alternately, intuitive experience is explained as occurring as a result of cognitive or rational processing by a part of the brain not usually consciously available to us; precognition is sometimes explained this way, as an assimilation of clues that were only perceived subconsciously. In this section, I examine three different ways to frame the origin, or source of intuition: expertise, instinct, and sense. I explore some of the diverse ways intuition is represented in terms of its causal origins, and discuss how these representations relate to a more general respectability problem in scholarship about intuition. These conceptualizations matter, as the extent to which intuition is represented as valuable, and may provide clues into how the intuitive function is to be cultivated.

#### 2.4.1 Respectability politics and the unconscious

Because of its connection to the unconscious, or to subconscious processes, it is difficult to write about intuition without alluding to ideas about metaphysics, cosmology, and notions about consciousness that are often avoided. Writers deal with this difficulty in various ways: some strongly deny a connection between intuition and anything mysterious, while others 'lean in' to the metaphysical, even to the extent of claiming intuition to be divinely inspired. Within popular intuition development guidebooks, it is not uncommon for writers to present intuition as inspired wisdom. On the other hand, within educational scholarship, the most frequent explanation presents intuition as a function of expertise, wherein content is processed subconsciously, and then seems to appear to consciousness fully formed. Framing intuition as a result of expertise may be a rhetorical tactic used to create distance from explanations that are uncomfortable or unspeakable within a positivist paradigm. However, such treatments of the subject can be left 'thin,' reducing the complex perceptual, hermeneutic, and affective functions of intuition to a rational, intellectual process.

For example, educator Sadler-Smith (2008), who advocates for intuition as a valuable leadership skill, defines intuition generally, as "an involuntary, difficult-to-

articulate, affect-laden recognition or judgement, based on prior learning and experiences, which is arrived at rapidly, through holistic associations and without deliberative or conscious rational thought" (p. 31). This definition helpfully recognizes the bodily involvement in intuitive perception, and includes the gestalt and nonrational character of intuition, echoing descriptions found in phenomenological studies (e.g. Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999). However by advising that intuition is 'based on prior learning', or unconscious expertise, Sadler-Smith (2008) limits his definition of intuition to exclude experiences such as extra-sensory perception and other such uncanny events. These, he writes, are "likely to be generally perceived as unscientific (as opposed to non-scientific) and therefore it [intuition] has a credibility gap to bridge before its claims will be taken seriously..." (p. 28).

Elsewhere, Sadler-Smith and Burke (2009) insist that intuition is a normal, cognitive process that happens "below the threshold of conscious awareness" (p. 245). They believe that, "the starting point for fostering a better understanding of intuition is to dispel the myth of intuition as a mystical, magical, or paranormal sixth sense and the myth that it is always bad and never to be trusted" (p. 248). This statement is meant to portray intuition as ultimately valuable, however it represents non-ordinary experience and the unconscious in general as deceitful and untrustworthy. In education theory, where intuition is generally valued for its practical use in supporting good decision-making, leadership, and skillful classroom practice, the question of intuition's origin has implications for its perceived value, and for how intuition development might be pursued educationally. Unfortunately, creating discursive distance from the less rational function of intuition in favour of emphasizing its origin as expertise reinscribes the persistent assumption that intuition is better left to poets and philosophers than to practitioners, social scientists and psychologists hoping for real-world application.

As mentioned above, intuition has often been cited as having the character of being given rather than produced. This may be the result of intuition being perceptual but not necessarily sensory, and so we assume it is *a priori*. As Polanyi (1969) suggests, "the main clues on which perception relies are in fact deeply hidden *inside the body* and cannot be experienced in themselves by the perceiver" (p. 115), which contributes to an affiliation of intuition as mysterious. Sometimes, it seems that writers suggest that intuition itself is the source of intuitive content. This may just be lax languaging – content seems to arise as a result of intuition, therefore intuition is the source of the content

rather than that which perceives it. Yet beyond language, there is a latent attitude in this reference, about the agency in consciousness itself, and the source of anything we can come to know. Anderson and Braud (2011) note a tendency to think about the unconscious as "some location or entity within the bodymind" (p. 239) as opposed to a process or mode of function. This question may not be reconcilable, with the scope of knowledge we currently have about consciousness in general

When the source of knowing is not identifiable, the intuition may be attributed to 'preconscious' or 'unconscious' awareness (see Bastick, 1982, pp. 140 & 147), but the same experience could also be understood as deriving from external, internalized sources such as guides, angels or any other 'higher power'. In any of these ascriptions, intuition gets attributed to a source of knowing beyond the known individual self. The 'given' quality of the intuitive mode leads many to assume that there must be a 'giver,' which often gets personified. However Anderson and Braud (2011) caution that it is important not to reify the unconscious or whatever is 'responsible' for inner guidance, clarifying that "although they give the appearance of being autonomous beings or entities, these are other aspects of ourselves – other modes of our own knowing, doing, and being – that become active and more available under special conditions" (p. 240). This may eventually be resolved by re-conceptualizing 'consciousness' as a collective matter, existing beyond as well as within the individual, an idea that is elucidated within a transpersonal orientation.

With my focus on developing the intuitive function, it may seem irrelevant how intuition is conceived. But the intuitive function thrives when it is infused with trust - when the subject believes they can access intuitive content - and so framing really does contribute to success with intuitive development. The reluctance to address intuition as a serious concern is similar to the exclusion of discourse about spirituality. As I have started to discuss, much of the educational literature settles on the idea that intuition is a form of expertise, an essentially *cognitive* process that requires prior acquaintance with the object of knowing, and that arises as a result of unconscious processing, appearing to the conscious mind once fully processed. This truncated concept of intuition fails to account for many people's lived experiences, perpetuating a lack of awareness of and context for those experiences, and ultimately contributing to their ongoing mystification. A wide range of human experience thus remains occluded because of the limited framework within which it is conceived. In what follows, I explore this framework in more

detail, and address its (in)compatibility with ideas of intuition as an instinctual, psychic sense (i.e. a way of knowing that happens out of the blue and with no previous acquaintance with the subject).

#### 2.4.2 The source of intuition as expertise: a predominant paradigm

Intuition-as-expertise is a popular referent among leadership educators (Waks, 2006; Sadler-Smith, 2008), and other scholars who are concerned with educating the intuitive skills of decision-making and good (fast, yet accurate) judgment (Hogarth, 2001). As such, a comprehensive look at the intuition-expertise connection is in order. This explanation is based on the assumption that intuition is a form of processing or problem-solving done by long-term memory. In this theory, small amounts of information are saved, stored, built up with experience over time, and recalled instantly, as needed. This process is known as thin-slicing, or 'chunking'. Waks (2006) supports this framework, explaining intuition as based on one's "ever-expanding long-term, indexed, and cross-referenced memory" (p. 384). Waks refers to Malcolm Gladwell's (2005) bestselling book, Blink, which describes the experience of immediate prehension as fast reasoning or "instinctive thinking." According to Gladwell (2005), these judgements happen quickly because of prior intimacy with a subject. Using a machine model of consciousness, Gladwell (2005) explains that this process relies on the unconscious decision-making function or "internal computer" (p. 11) that makes decisions based on immediate - or very quick - unconscious processing, and that finds patterns based on "narrow slices of experience" (p. 23).

Hogarth (2001), who also sees intuition as "largely a function of experience" (p. 157), suggests that experts process information differently than novices, having learned

usually associate with 'thinking'" (np). And yet, the fast thinking represented in *Blink* is what many people think of when they try to conceptualize intuition, possibly because of its popularity, a lack of other popular discourse on intuitive matters, and also because Gladwell's description of the function of immediate

and operates a little more mysteriously than the kind of deliberate, conscious decision-making that we

prehension confirms how intuition is already so commonly understood. \\

54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Although Gladwell's journalistic writing and use of narrative examples has created a compelling and very popular version of this interpretation of intuition, Gladwell himself distinguishes *Blink* from intuition, clarifying on his website that: "Intuition strikes me as a concept we use to describe emotional reactions, gut feelings--thoughts and impressions that don't seem entirely rational. But I think that what goes on in that first two seconds [i.e., 'Blink'-ing] is perfectly rational. It's *thinking*--it's just thinking that moves a little faster

how to be more efficient by 'chunking' information (p. 158) and by having a storehouse of experience by which to make intuitive conclusions. Expertise is limited to particular domains (Hogarth, 2001), and these are where intuitive function would be expected. This explanation may be favoured among education theorists because it positions teachers as experts in their professional domain - in this case the classroom. Intuition is cited as the useful ability to 'read' a classroom, anticipate potential glitches in a lesson plan, or insightfully 'just' know which student will need extra attention on any given day (Mott, 1994). Although the particular students may change along with so many other factors varying day to day, the range of classroom experience becomes familiar enough for unconscious thinking to happen, so that the teacher can absorb, process, and problem solve without having to apply any conscious attention, and a solution or judgement seems to just arrive. Many teachers can identify with this presentation of practical, intuitive ability and the way intuition facilitates skillful practice.

The explanation from expertise makes sense for educators who hope that teachers develop intuitive facility with time. With accumulated expertise, intuition can help teachers and others in leadership positions do their work with confidence and conviction, so that decisions and actions appear to come from a place that might be recognized as solid, and rooted. A study of intuitive experience among reflective practitioners found that intuition plays three distinct roles in adult educators' reflective practice (Mott, 1994). First, intuition helps in "presentation and synthesis of perception" (Mott, 1994, p. 98), where perception includes learning, experience, memory and understanding. Second, intuition guides day-to-day practice, for example with creative problem posing, reframing situations in order to see them more clearly, anticipatory planning and decision making, and initiating immediate adjustments in action. Finally, intuition enhances educators' competence by strengthening interpersonal skills and prompting reflective thinking (Mott, 1994). Here, we may recognize the attitude of empathic resonance present in various descriptions of the flow state.

The explanation from expertise highlights the tacit nature of intuition, and validates the possibility of knowing without being able to articulate or even recognize how we know that thing (Claxton, 2006). Bastick has an interesting way of explaining the bias towards conceptualizing intuition as expertise, suggesting it is based in a misunderstanding about the incubation period, the idea that a problem has been "consciously 'shelved' or 'forgotten'" and where the solution suddenly – unexpectedly,

and after some period of delay – comes into consciousness. Bastick (1982) explains that "this incubation period has given writers the idea that the subconscious mind has been somehow 'reasoning' or working on the information in the same way as the conscious mind would reason, and when the answer is reached it pops into consciousness. Hence they wrongly infer that intuition is the same type of process as analytic reasoning but at a preconscious level" (p. 147). This error persists today: it is evident in the examples of Waks and others citing Gladwell's *Blink* as sufficient to explain intuition.

Although researchers have continued to interpret intuitive insight as effectively rational, expertise need not be merely rational. Expertise might also relate to instinct, the wisdom inherited from genetic and cultural ancestors, and connects to the innate drive for self-preservation, sometimes referred to as one's 'better' or 'higher' self. Unconscious processing can mean a robust inner dialogue, or communication between aspects of the self, validating the involvement of unconscious processes, and positioning these as helpful and normal occurrences. However, a further clarification needs to be made about the difference between experiencing subtle clues that we can become increasingly attuned to noticing, and experiencing no clues but yet still just knowing.

Ultimately, the explanation of intuition as expertise falls short because it cannot account for intuitive experiences that are not based on any prior experience. Expertise does not account for many of the common, yet uncanny intuitive experiences that really do not come from a manifest source, no matter how unconscious that source is thought to be. Experiences such as the sudden, certain awareness to take a different route home than usual, or thinking about a long-lost friend and then getting a call from them out of the blue; these are not explained by incubation or experience. Likewise, stored experience, and unconsciously-accessed clues contradict the Jungian version of intuition as a future-oriented function. In Jung's concept, no memory nor expertise is needed in the moment of intuition, though these could be useful in interpreting the initial intuitive experience.

While most educators settle on explaining intuition as expertise, some (Bruner, 1960; Noddings & Shore, 1984) are less definitive about the requirement for prior acquaintance. For example, Jerome Bruner (1960) writes that intuitive thinking "usually" rests on familiarity, "which makes it possible for the thinker to leap about, skipping steps and employing short cuts" (p. 58). Noddings and Shore (1984) are similarly inconclusive

about the *requirement* of prior acquaintance when they conclude that while familiarity does seem to enhance intuition (p. 65), it is certainly not required for intuitive function. On the contrary, they suggest that intuition itself becomes a foundation for familiarity.

Unfortunately, the effort to explain intuition within conventional conceptual structures reduces the complexity of our understanding of the range of potential for intuition. For the purposes of this project, which looks ahead to an alternate intellectual space for psychic intuition, the explanation from expertise is ultimately unsatisfactory because it leaves out a range of intuitive experiences that includes telepathy, precognition and prescience. Acquaintance over time cannot account for the insight that first-time mothers can have into their impending birthing process (see Davis-Floyd & Davis, 1997, for a rich discussion of this context). Similarly, while prior acquaintance might explain telepathy between people who know each other well, it does not account for other cases, such as when professional medical intuitives are able to comprehend the physiological conditions of an effective stranger, whom they may have only ever met on the phone, or not at all. Scholars insisting on intuition as expertise exclude these experiences from their analyses in order to secure their explanation. Ultimately, defining intuition as expertise, or as unconscious processing, devalues it, and furthermore discards or denies a whole range of psychic intuitive experience. In contrast, the next two sections explore alternate explanations about the source of intuition that better integrate the idea of intuition as a psychic sense.

# 2.4.3 The source of intuition as instinctual knowledge: an untestable theory

Sometimes, intuition and instinct are used interchangeably, similar to the way in which intuition and insight get conflated. Other times instinct is cited as the origin of intuitive ability, or a source of intuition. Dictionaries tend to provide several definitions for instinct, ranging from inherited and unconscious survival reflexes to the far more colloquial employment of the word as referring to natural talents that can be developed. Hogarth (2001) defines instinct as "an inherent response tendency that occurs automatically" (p. 250), and notes that the word is often used metaphorically, as in describing someone as "an instinctive leader." Whereas attributing the source of intuition to accumulated expertise limits the range of what can be included as 'intuitive', thinking about intuition as a form of instinctual knowing may shed light on para-psychological

types of intuitive experience like telepathy and pre-cognition that are notoriously difficult to conceptualize, and that seem to happen to us, prior to learning or intent. Like intuition, instinct operates outside the theatre of consciousness, so that information arrives to us as a given. However, unlike intuition, instinct does not appear capable of providing insight into new ways of understanding complex problems.

There is certainly much in common between instinct and intuition. Intuition is connected, for some theorists, to an ancient aspect of human consciousness: the instinctive impulse to survive and thrive, including the range of animalistic abilities and awareness that would have helped to ensure species' survival over time. Jung (1971) describes intuition as "instinctive apprehension" (p. 770), a phrase that evokes embodied experiences like gut feelings, 'spidey-sense', and other relational, intuitive experiences like telephone telepathy, mother's intuition, and the 'sense of being stared at' (Sheldrake, 2003). Many of us have had, or know others who have had, intuitive experiences like these, such as sensing when a family member is in trouble, knowing when a friend is about to call, or the uncanny awareness of knowing at a distance when a loved one has passed away. It seems that "instinctive apprehension" (Jung, 1971) might be something we need in order to be safe and well in a holistic sense, especially to the extent that we can learn to discern intuition from fear, anxiety or projection.

Intuition is often represented as helping us to make good decisions, in the immediate and ordinary contexts of our daily lives, as well as in the bigger sense of the direction of human development. Psychiatrist Daniel Cappon (1994) suggests that intuition is a distilled, evolved form of instinct, claiming that "over the long course of preverbal history, these instincts became a nascent intelligence, namely intuition, useful for survival and for further mental development" (NP). Other writers also connect intuition to evolution. Noddings and Shore (1984) similarly imply that a re-engagement of the instinct for well-being will help us make better choices to support our long-term, collective thriving, since intuition works "in the interest of our quest for meaning, for physical and mental and emotional survival" (p. 62). Claims like these that link intuition and instinct discursively reflect an anxiety about individual and collective well-being, and contain an implicit appeal for education: if it is so that our instincts are suppressed or damaged such that we cannot make skillful use of this function, this suggests a need for more proactively minimizing and/or redressing the damage that we do to instinct.

Jung's type theory suggests that intuition is an innate function, and also inherited. Joseph Chilton Pearce (1992) likewise considers intuitive awareness to be an inborn, endogenous ability. However Pearce cautions that unless it is supported, and its development nurtured, "intuition seems to fade around age seven" (Pearce, 1992, p. 150). Beyond that age, in most modern people, the intellect takes on the role of keeping us safe, "a role it is not suited for" (Pearce, 1992, p. 152). With the intellect, rather than intuition, in charge of decision making, fear grows and we develop technologies to fortify ourselves, "compulsively trying to compensate by engineering our environment and each other" (Pearce, 1992, p. 151). Pearce (1992) argues that intellect is insufficient as a system of protecting well-being, and, like Bergson, suggests that we need the complement of robust intuition. Pearce (1992) describes the loss of intuitive ability as "devolutionary" (p. 151), linked to a deep anxiety many people feel. Of course, intuitive instincts would be changed by the way many of us live in the 21st century: disenchanted, disconnected, alienated, and estranged from the natural rhythms of seasons and the daily cycle of night and day; and lacking both intimate connection to food cultivation and production, and cultural rituals that make sense of the cosmos and our place in it.

Feminist Jungian Estés' similarly links intuition to an inherited ability to perceive what is right, describing intuition as acting "like a wise old woman who is with you always, who tells you exactly what the matter is, tells you exactly whether you need to go left or right" (Estés, 1992, p. 74). For Estés, as for Pearce, intuitive ability is inherently tied to a process of development and mature self-authority. With attention and investment, intuition becomes like an ally or guide that can be totally trusted in one's decision-making. Within the context of her therapeutic work with women, Estés suggests that intuition is a women's concern, connected to a "wild woman archetype." Not that it isn't for men – she does not address this – but this does raise an important connection that is often made; intuition as 'women's intuition' is thought to be an instinctual connection reserved for females and problematically based on essentialism and biology.

Estés' presentation of intuition recalls Socrates, right at the foundation of Western philosophy, and his relationship to his Daemon, an inner guide or inner teacher. This hypothesis, that links intuition to instinct, speaks back to a concern that some people have, that the inner voice is egoic, or that it may reveal prejudice and other fears rather than intuition. To understand intuition as an instinctual ally, as Estés does, negates the possibility for intuition to lead us 'wrong'. But making use of such allyship

requires a well articulated relationship to one's inner nature, such as that which can be cultivated through contemplative and other self-development practices. Therefore the difference between instinct and intuition might be the condition of the subject in which it arises. Instinct does not seem to require self-consciousness in the way that intuition seems to.

One would think that figuring out the differences (& similarities) between instinct and intuition would help to distill just what intuition is, and what its function might be. Perhaps it is most useful to consider intuition to be the presentation of instinctual understanding to the self-aware consciousness.

#### 2.4.4 The source of intuition as a (sixth) sense

A third category of explanation about the origins of intuition suggests that it is a sensory (or extra-sensory) ability. When intuition is referred to as a sense, it is most often in a colloquial context, and there is very little research that seriously defends this categorization. As a discursive category, the idea of an intuitive 'sense' connects to the question of embodied perception, and might influence the perceived trustworthiness of the intuitive function. Intuition is commonly referred to as the sixth sense, and the phrase extra-sensory perception (ESP), recognizes that it operates beyond or outside of any of the five senses (although, as Jung noted, it may be experienced through any of them). Information that occurs on subtle (energetic, etheric) levels is not properly 'sensed' in the ordinary meaning of that word. However, intuition is frequently accompanied by a somatic component (see Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999; Bastick, 1982), such as how the familiar experience of 'gut feeling' intimates how intuition can be experienced by a disturbance in the belly. Other bodily experiences of intuition are clairvoyance (through sight) where content appears as an image in the mind's eye; clairaudience (through hearing), where it may be heard as a voice; and clairsentience (which can entail a range of sensations such as warmth, cold, tingling, twitching, restlessness, anxiety, or even pain as indicators of intuition) (Gee, 1999). Although any of the senses may be involved, intuition can also be like a heightened sensitivity to clues that are otherwise completely imperceptible to any 'sense.'

The question of whether intuition is a sense at all involves some unpacking of what counts as a sense. The work of anthropologist Katherine Guerts (2002) is

instructive here, as it challenges the assumption that all humans share identical sensory capabilities. On the contrary, Guerts' research found that, far from being universal, sensing is "profoundly involved" with a society's epistemology, cultural identity, and its "forms of being in the world" (2002, p. 22). Attitudes and beliefs about the senses influence how people conceive of the person, health, and reality. What well-being means, what the person and the self mean, are cultured and indicated by the range of included senses. For example, Geurts (2002) found that the Anlo-Ewe subjects of her research include the sense of balancing "(in a physical and psychological sense, as well as in literal and in metaphorical ways) as an essential component of what it meant to be human" (p. 22). Of course, non-Anlo-Ewe people balance, too, without counting it among primary human capabilities, but counting it as a sense indicates its discursive primacy among abilities.

The Anlo-Ewe example further serves to expand the imagination of what can count as a sense. Guerts' anthropological perspective suggests that we are capable of a wider range of perception and inner sense, beyond the five outward-focused senses. While we tend to think of sensing as innate rather than learned, cultural variations show that senses are indeed 'learned' or at least cultivated. On that basis, I would argue that it may be appropriate to start considering intuition a sense, and moreover, that its exclusion from our conventional repertoire of senses indicates one layer among many that has us focusing outward, valuing individuality, neglecting organic well-being, and consolidating disconnection from our place in the wider ecological and social order. Guerts' study was inspired by the question of why Western culture puts forward ESP or intuition as the most likely candidate for a sixth sense (as opposed to, for example, balance). In my view, it is because we recognize the lived experience of intuition, but have lacked sufficient language and context for the ability to perceive inwardly, a problem extending to ideas about consciousness more generally.

The idea to categorize intuition as a sense is supported by the work of biologist Rupert Sheldrake. Sheldrake (2003) recommends the descriptor 'seventh sense' for psychic experience, in recognition that 'sixth sense' has been "claimed by biologists working on the electric and magnetic senses of animals," such as the ability of eels to sense objects by a self-generated electric field in the dark depths of the ocean, and the heat-sensing abilities of snakes (Sheldrake, 2003, p. 4), which Sheldrake argues are abilities based on known physical principles as opposed to psychic experiences, which

are primarily evidenced by personal anecdote rather than replicable, empirical study. In *The Sense of Being Stared At*, Sheldrake (2003) considers the uncanny ability of humans and animals to become aware of when someone is looking at us – even from behind – as well as other uncanny experiences of perception. Sheldrake makes the case that telepathy and other para-psychological function suggest the existence of fields of perception reliant on an extended consciousness, rather than any of the other senses. In this explanation, consciousness is not confined to an individual's own neural system.

Recognizing that intuition is a psychic sense not collapsible to any of the other senses challenges conventions, yet at the same time it offers a convenient category for intuitive experience that includes uncanny, non-rational instances. Sheldrake's work reflects a transpersonal framework by valuing subjective experiences of psychic phenomena, even when these are not empirically validatable, and even when these violate taboos and beliefs about what is possible and the so-called laws of nature.

#### 2.4.5 Framing intuition as psychic

This section has presented a number of the different ways 'intuition' gets explained. Some of the definitions appeal to a rationalist, functionalist structure, where what gets called intuition may be better explained as rapid, unconscious cognition enabled by expertise and experience. Other explanations recognize the possibility of perceiving something that one has not (materially) perceived, either because it is not physically present or is not yet existent (i.e. except as potential). The ability to perceive in these uncanny ways may be an inheritance based in instinct, or the function of an overlooked sense. In an effort to provide an inclusive, general conceptualization that includes the range of lived intuitive experiences we know about, I recommend that intuition be conceptualized as a psychic function. This conceptualization depends on 'psyche' referring to the totality of conscious and unconscious processes (Jung 1971, p. 463). Framing intuition as a psychic function recommends it as a "state of communication, individually expressed in an interaction between the conscious and unconscious mind, through the medium of dreams, visions, and feelings" (Devereaux, cited in Sheridan, 1997, p. 60), which may help to account for why intuition can arrive unexpectedly, taking the persona by surprise, and why it can offer up unconventional and unexpected content. In the next section, I elaborate a framework that supports this suggestion, a transpersonal framework.

Any explanation that can reasonably account for the uncanny experiences of intuition will also point towards a bigger or more complex version of reality than that which is currently, conventionally posited, and suggests new ways of thinking about what is possible. Though the mechanism of intuitive events is not well-understood, it is likely better addressed by the transpersonal psychological tradition. Transpersonal theory "focuses on the self as beyond ordinary ego separateness, recognizing the complex interconnectedness of self with all, including the cosmos as a whole" (Friedman & Hartelius, 2013, p. xxiv). It further seeks to extend "the boundaries of knowledge and how it is produced, including the study of phenomena that may not adhere to the limits of reality suggested by a modernist metaphysic" (Friedman & Hartelius, 2013, p. xxvi). Transpersonal theory is particularly suited to support a concept of psychic intuition because of what intuition intimates about consciousness and reality. As Gadamer (2011) noted, "what people in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries like to call 'intuition" is brought back to its metaphysical foundation: that is, to the structure of living, organic being in which the whole is in each individual" (p. 26). For example, the way Bergson or Jung use 'intuition' implies metaphysical communion with a field of yet-unmanifest potential, a holistic, intuitive awareness that does not present to the other senses, but yet is still 'sensed' - in other words, the "direct experience of things as they are" (Hayward, 1997, p. ix). Transpersonal theory hints at why it is possible to access such perception.

Scholarly interest in intuition may be limited precisely because it upsets the dominant view of consciousness and its potentials. Mystification of intuitive experience is connected to a widespread denial of organism and interconnectedness, and a limiting understanding of consciousness. In opposition to this limited framework, researchers at the Princeton Engineering Anomalies Laboratory (PEAR) work to "address the interrelationships of consciousness and environment in the construction of reality" (Davis-Floyd & Arvidson, 1997, p. xi). PEAR uses interdisciplinary perspectives to reflect "the dynamic complementarity of science and spirituality" (Davis-Floyd & Arvidson, 1997, p. xii). Their published volume on intuition is committed to "cultivate an expanded metaphor of reality that embraces the subjective and interpersonal, as well as the objective and analytical, in a responsible way" (Davis-Floyd & Arvisdon, 1997, p. xii). PEAR investigated the effects of human consciousness on physical matter (Dunne, 1997), and was able to show, among other interesting findings, that the human ability to

"acquire information about spatially and temporally remote geographical targets, otherwise inaccessible by any of the usual sensory channels, has been thoroughly demonstrated over several hundred carefully conducted experiments" (PEAR, 2010, NP). Although the PEAR laboratory was closed in 2007, its work continues through an organization called ICRL, whose mission is "to promote a science of the subjective that will enable us to explore the role of consciousness in the establishment of physical reality" (http://icrl.org/, NP).

Scientific work on consciousness like that pursued by the PEAR lab disrupts the modern western narrative about consciousness by refusing to limit subject and object of knowledge to a simple binary. A second example of work that likewise rejects conventional explanations of consciousness is provided by Rupert Sheldrake's experimental research on consciousness and unusual perception in both people and animals. Sheldrake (2003) refers to a "kind of sensory system over and above the known senses, but a sense just the same" (p. 4). Rather than 'sixth sense', Sheldrake identifies 'the seventh sense' to express "that telepathy, the sense of being stared at and premonitions" (p. 5) are of a different order from senses based on known physical principles. A biological researcher, Sheldrake (2003) is aware that many of his hypotheses are considered taboo. However he remains committed to considering transpersonal explanations for experiences of consciousness, especially when they comprise "the only remaining explanation" (p. 8).

Drawing more explicitly on transpersonal theory, Rosemarie Anderson has developed and teaches 'intuitive inquiry,' a methodological practice that uses intuition as an integral and valuable component of discovery and understanding. Recalling Jung, Anderson (2011) describes intuitive inquiry as like "tapping into a collective or unconscious source of knowing" (p. 20). For Anderson, intuition "affirms a world reality in flux and mutable, and, therefore, challenges conventional notions of a static worldview that is separate and distinguishable from the knower" (Anderson, 2011, p. 18). In a similar articulation, Burenko's (1997, p. 83) "non-dual" definition for intuition explains it as "the enactment and presentation of the reality-process, of ever-present origin; it is not a re-presentation in concept or insight. It is not just thinking "of" the world but embodied doing "as" the world." This definition also resonates to Bergson's explanation that intuition is a way to understand something that cannot be accessed – in full – by any other way.

As I have pointed out throughout this chapter, the task of conceptualizing intuition is inseparable from sorting through ideas about consciousness, spirituality, perception, and beliefs. We will not know enough about intuition until we know more about these other factors. For now, it is enough to recognize that ideas about these concepts are interdependent, and that conceptualizing intuition as a psychic function implies a structure of consciousness that is different from the Cartesian dualistic subject-object. The transpersonal psychological perspective tries to make sense of the range of consciousness often considered non-ordinary or para-psychological by way of a nondual awareness that collapses subject and object, reading subjectivity and objectivity not as static but rather as relational descriptors. Personal consciousness is revealed to be only one way to experience conscious awareness. For example, Vaughan (1979) explains how "intuition allows one to see into the nature of things, not by learning about them, but by identifying with them in such a way that subject/object boundaries dissolve" (p. 29). In this conception, self and other are not a binary pair, which carries important implications about where knowledge 'comes from' and what it means to know; and even challenges the idea of 'agency' in the sense of questioning the nature of the subject 'who' is 'acting'.

Transpersonal theory offers a redress to most education theory, that largely neglects some parts of the psyche while over-emphasizing others, effectively undervaluing the contribution of the unconscious. Holistic education already relies on this philosophy (e.g. see Miller, 1994), and it should be acknowledged that many 'non-Western' cultures seem to have a much easier time integrating intuition as a meaningful function. Although a comparative analysis is beyond the scope of this conceptual review, readers can refer to others' work on this subject. For example, Gill (2006) explores how intuition is valued in Indian philosophy as an expected part of knowing (Gill, 2006). The way intuition is understood in Indian philosophy results from the Indian philosophic method being itself synthetic, integrating perception, reason, and intuition (Gill, 2006). Perhaps most importantly, Indian philosophic traditions do not separate out spirituality from philosophy: there is no distinct 'theology' (Gill, 2006, p. 19), and knowledge is valued for its ethical contribution rather than its logical consistency. Intuition is woven throughout everyday activities (Gill, 2006), and included as a matter of course.

The approach to intuition taken by Indian philosophy (in general) is not unlike the approach taken by other Indigenous philosophic systems, which also widely accept intuitive knowing as authoritative. For example, midwife Pineault (1997) describes how

her First Nations cultural heritage supported her to accept intuition as a matter of course, rather than weird, when her own intuitive experiences leaned towards psychic and visionary, beyond hunches.

In contrast, modern western culture has delegitimized intuition, allowing the 'one who knows better' to be projected outward as a religious or transcendent figure rather than an aspect of inner wisdom. More generally, modern western culture has a difficult time reckoning with spirituality, as we have conceptually extracted ourselves from a coherent unity within nature, and then, once separated, traded meaning for measurement. As a result, most western philosophical definitions of intuition are created from an epistemic bias; concerned with *what* we can know, believe, or rely on, rather than on the *experience* of intuition itself (Waks, 2006), and language about intuitive experience is lacking. Vermersch (1999) suggests that the lack of first-person insight is a problem for psychology in general. He argues that not only should we consider subjective experience alongside other forms of data, but that we need to consider first person experience *more prominently*, precisely because there is a lack of science in fields where first-person data is important (such as teaching, training, coaching and therapy).

Vermersch's (1999) call for more attention to first-person data is a call to prioritize introspective and contemplative practice. Valuing individuals' reported personal experience becomes even more crucial where intuitive experience sometimes contradicts what we believe to be possible; intellectual conventions about time and space (i.e. that time is linear, and space is three dimensional) can not account for experiences of precognition or telepathy. Because our conceptual structures are limited with respect to explaining the psychic sense, first hand experience is invaluable. A transpersonal framework of understanding may support acceptance of such experience, but one cannot become more intuitive without practice.

Throughout the remainder of the dissertation, consciousness development will be explored as supportive of the intuitive function, the cultivation of which relies on being differently in the world. This focus puts forward an interpretation of intuition as something that requires active cooperation across parts of the psyche (Estés, 1992). In the course of intuition development, one cultivates a dynamic relationship with the intuitive function that is supported by trust and listening, and that develops as the individual identifies with

the source of their knowing, and differentiates their thoughts from intuitive apprehensions. Estés (1992) refers to the "unfounded fear" that many people feel at the idea of following their intuition, especially when it leads to unknown or uncomfortable choices, noting (as others have) that listening to intuition is the easier part; the effort is in following up on its wisdom. So developing intuition, as a source of good judgement – is connected to well-rounded psychological maturity.

In the next chapter, I turn to new age popular books that teach people to develop intuition as a psychic sense. These books fill a niche in our culture by affirming the intuitive function for those in whom it has atrophied. Where scholarly explanations of intuition have fallen short, and likewise have not successfully recommended programs for intuition development, new age popular publications draw from a broad and eclectic conceptual framework to offer a comprehensive account of intuitive function, and their educational programme is drawn from these sources. As I will show, many of the practices that comprise intuition development are borrowed from wisdom traditions that include consciousness development as a part of a holistic education.

## Chapter 3 – An alternate conceptual space for intuition

### 3.1 The fruits of 'bookshelf inquiry'

For as long as I have been a reader, I have loved to browse bookshelves. Whether in a library, bookstore, or in someone's home, I find it relaxing and interesting to wander around and read titles, exploring what people are writing and publishing about. I do this often when taking a break from studying in the library, and frequently stop into neighbourhood bookstores, just to browse. Usually, I am not looking for anything in particular, but rather let myself be guided by whatever seems compelling. For many years, I would regularly find myself wandering through a particular section of shelves, labelled in most large bookstores in North America by some version of 'mind-body-spirit' or 'New Age.' Here, books on religion and spirituality mix with titles about popular psychology and self-help, along with occult and esoteric subjects such as astrology, divination, crystals, and energy healing. The content of these shelves reveals a persistent market for books about topics our culture tends to consider superstitious and taboo. I interpret the existence of this genre of books – the fact that they are published, and so widely available for sale – to indicate something we, as a cultural collective, are thinking about: 'mind-body-spirit' reflects a pursuit of happiness, meaning, or fulfilment.

When I settled on my dissertation topic of intuition, and recognized that it needed to be thought about more in the scholarly context of academia, I began to realize just how many books about intuition are published outside of academia, especially within this popular category, mind-body-spirit. Usually framed as how-to guides that teach readers to become more intuitive, many of these books about intuition are practical, self-help books that seem to be filling a particular niche by providing guidance about how to cultivate intuition. But these books do not merely teach readers how to improve their intuitive function. With an orientation to spirituality, to authorizing diverse forms of intuitive experience (including what I have been calling psychic experience), and to facilitating personal transformation, many of these guidebooks reflect the transpersonal orientation I have recommended for understanding intuition. That is, they reflect a search to experience the "so-called higher states of consciousness and possible spiritual realms" (Friedman & Hartelius, 2013, p. xxiv) that a transpersonal framework authorizes.

In their explanations for what intuition is and how one goes about enhancing its function, some guidebooks explicitly position intuition development as a spiritual practice, or else draw on spiritual traditions to explain the source of intuition. Spiritual revelation is also implied in the word choice 'awaken' that appears in the title of at least three of the guidebooks (Schulz, 1998; Gee, 1999; Vaughan, 1979), and this correlation seems to be a selling point of these practical, instructional resources.

In recent years I have collected over a dozen of these intuition development guidebooks, purchased new or second-hand, in large cities, small towns, big-box stores, used books stalls, and specialized New Age and metaphysical bookshops. My small personal collection of these books forms the basis of this chapter, which introduces intuition development (or 'psychic development') guidebooks, and the consistent programme for developing intuitive ability they contain. Although the sample size may seem small considering the number of published books on this topic<sup>2</sup>, over years of bookshelf browsing, I have come to realize that intuition development guidebooks tend to be very similar to each other in tone, purpose and content. The particular books have been chosen as a representative sample, and I use them as a starting point to examine the consistent themes therein<sup>3</sup>. Throughout this chapter, the reader will be introduced to the content and significance of these guidebooks, as they are where a contemporary pedagogy for intuition development (IDP) is to be found.

In the last chapter, I took up the question of how intuition gets framed throughout the discourses of educational philosophy and psychology, and demonstrated a wide range of meaning assigned to the concept, according to the framework of belief that guides different theorists. I suggested that explanations about intuition are often limited by theorists' adherence to an epistemic model that prioritizes cognitive experience, which results in explaining intuition in a stultified way, and in turn limits the range of

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> As an example of the availability of popular books about intuition, a search on the website of online bookseller amazon.com reveals 1402 titles found by searching 'Intuition' in the category 'Self-help'. Broadening that search to books about "intuition" within categories like 'Psychology & Counseling,' 'New Age & Spirituality,' 'Self-Help,' 'Spiritual Self-Help,' and 'Personal Transformation Self-Help' yields 5382 results. (https://www.amazon.com/s/ref=nb\_sb\_noss?url=search-alias%3Dstripbooks&field-keywords=intuition&rh=n%3A283155%2Ck%3Aintuition, accessed on October 12, 2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> A listing of the books in my collection is provided in Appendix A.

experiences that are counted as 'intuitive.' For example, experiences of extended mind and precognitive awareness are often excluded or denied by that model. In contrast to that limited conceptualization, I argued that psychic experiences often categorized as 'para-psychological' are within the range of many people's lived, intuitive experience and as such they need to be accounted for. I suggested that understanding intuition through the framework of transpersonal psychology allows for a conceptualization that more readily matches this diverse range of intuitive experience, as it theorizes how one can experience resonance with a collective unconscious, or access yet-un-manifest potential not perceptible by ordinary consciousness.

In this chapter, I locate that transpersonal concept of intuition in popular culture, and specifically in the sub-genre of New Age self-help books. I present intuition development guidebooks as artifacts of popular culture that can and should be understood as having educational importance. As informal educational resources, New Age intuition development guidebooks teach people how to develop their intuitive function. By fulfilling this educative role, the genre fills a niche that formal education might find useful. I suggest that educators look at this cultural niche seriously, not least because this is where learning about intuition is being taken up.

#### Taking New Age, self-help seriously

To date, there has been little serious dialogue in educational theory about the intellectual contribution that the New Age might make to questions of intuition. However, Noddings and Shore (1984) do acknowledge this conceptual 'space' in their book, noting that then-emergent popular writing "provides a suggestive basis upon which to build some generalizations about contemporary trends in thinking about intuition" (p. 199). In particular, they laud Vaughan's (1979) *Awakening Intuition* for its "serious attempt to bring some of the less accessible material on intuition to that audience" (Noddings & Shore, 1984, p. 178). They note popular interest in intuition and the way that Vaughan, as a transpersonal psychologist, takes up the themes of intuition and extended consciousness as aspects of potential human experience. However, Noddings and Shore ultimately deem Vaughan's text (and those like it) to be not useful for philosophers of education, citing its non-rigorous description and lack of definition for intuition. Their assessment seems to be fuelled by a concern that "such a non-rigorous approach ... may turn off sceptics who are reluctant to take intuition seriously" (Noddings & Shore, 1984, p. 177). They maintain that the lack of a clear definition, combined with claims

about the non-rational that are made in some of the popular literature, can alienate and discourage academic study of intuition. Even still, they recognize that the field of research about intuition is (or was, at the time of their writing), still maturing.

In the decades since Noddings & Shore's *Awakening the Inner Eye* was published, there has been increased scholarship about the New Age (c.f. Heelas, 1996; Berg, 2008; Crowley, 2011), and about the cultural import of self-help more generally (Field, 2000; Dolby, 2005). Much of this literature is critical, positioning spiritual self-help as a venue for capitalist consumption (Muir, 2007) or individualized identity formation (Heelas, 1996; Rindfleish, 2005). But other of this scholarship recognizes that there is something important happening here: people are not only seeking, but finding meaning in community (Crowley, 2011), and in spirituality that is de-centralized from religion (Redden, 2002). Self-help is slowly gaining recognition in adult learning scholarship as well. In a recent Canadian study, McLean (2014) concludes that "self-help reading is an important domain of adult learning and deserves far more attention from scholars of adult education that it has received in the past" (p. 18).

In light of this scholarship representing a shift in attitude to the legitimacy of this cultural niche, I aim to represent Vaughan's and other such 'alternative' texts as having a serious contribution to educating the intuitive function, despite Noddings and Shore's objections to the then-emerging transpersonal scholarship about intuition. In particular, regardless of the lack of an acceptably concise definition, educators can learn from the way these guidebooks represent intuition as a psychic experience, the development of which is inextricable from a transformative process of becoming connected with the unconscious, instinctual, and creative aspects of human experience.

This chapter situates intuition development guidebooks in their cultural context. As New Age self-help books, intuition development guidebooks represent a transpersonal framework that is integral to their program of practice, and that is embedded in their ways of conceptualizing intuition and the intuitive experience. I suggest that these books should be recognized as educational artifacts, representative of a post-modern learning culture wherein individuals turn to self-help books as part of an individualized learning economy. In what follows, I explore two main areas in which New Age self-help books are valuable to my study of intuition: first, they point to a useful conceptual framework for understanding intuitive experience; and second, they suggest

a pedagogical programme for intuition development. Beyond offering a program of practice, the guidebooks present a coherent framework for understanding intuition, dedicating pages and whole chapters to conceptualizing how intuition works. The guidebooks make sense of pre-reflective and inter-subjective intuitive experiences by invoking a syncretic logic that is coherent with their New Age foundation, drawing on language borrowed from Eastern wisdom traditions, and principles from quantum physics, to discuss concepts like energy and consciousness. In doing so, they provide much-needed language (Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999) for the psychic experience of intuition. After briefly exploring this conceptual framework, I outline and analyze the practices that intuition development books teach their readers: a pedagogy for intuition development (IDP).

### 3.2 New Age, self-help books as educational texts

Intuition guidebooks exist quite separately from other writing on intuition, such as texts intended to support professionals' leadership development, and philosophical or theoretical texts that examine the concept of intuition itself. For the most part, these guidebooks will not be found in university libraries. The books are popular not in the sense of their popularity (although many of them are popular sellers), but rather by virtue of their context in the popular cultural realm. While some educational theorists have made recommendations about how to foster intuitive capacities in educational settings specifically (eg Noddings & Shore, 1984; Bruner, 1960), the guidebooks presented here focus on practical intuition development as a function of self development. As opposed to scholarly, academic books, these books are written for a broad audience, even as they are instructional, motivational guides that aim to both educate and inspire readers. By appealing to readers wanting to become more effective, or efficient, at 'doing' life, the guidebooks belong to a broader category of texts known as self-help.

The particularly educational element of self-help books distinguishes them from other popular literature (Dolby, 2005, p. 37). Self-help books, perhaps obviously, offer their readers recommendations about some aspect of their lives, in the form of practical advice. As Dolby (2005) notes, they also motivate and encourage readers to improve their lives in some way. A quick look at any large bookstore indicates that topics of self-

help books range widely, with advice on physical and mental health, relationships, parenting, money, and "any number of practical skills" (Starker, 1989, p. 10). Typically, self-help books identify a problem, and offer guidance for readers on how to fix that problem. With intuition guidebooks, the stated problem is often some version of the idea that our lives are less fulfilling when we don't follow our intuition, leading us to make less than satisfactory decisions that don't reflect our 'true' desires. This problem may be framed as not living up to one's potential. One of the guidebooks in my collection, entitled *You can change your life through psychic power* (Chase, 1960), reflects a clear example of this approach: in addition to offering practical instruction in developing psychic skills, this book claims that "by paying attention to your inner self, you can bring happiness, success, and physical well-being into your experience" (Chase, 1960, p. ix). Similarly, other guidebook authors note that, "without [intuition], we are at a great disadvantage" (Gawain, 2000, p. xi), even suggesting that "engaging in this process might make an even better human being of you" (Naparstek, 1997, p. 3).

#### The self-help genre

Self-help books are hugely popular. In the year 2000, Americans spent \$563 million on books in this genre (Paul, 2001 in Bergsma, 2007). Their rise, initially, may have been linked to the availability of paperback books, a format that offers affordability (Starker, 1989, p. 5) but that also tends to promote a perception of their disposability. (Field (2000) links the short-livedness of self-help books - their "inbuilt ephemerality" (p. 50) - to the consumerist disposition for novelty, and the superficial nature of the culture from which they arise.)

Self-help books' accessibility is often secured by an informal tone, and the use of colloquial language and anecdote (Dolby, 2005). Writers typically employ a story-telling, narrative approach that connects with readers by adding an affective dimension. The use of personal anecdotes and story-telling is compelling, and contributes to the motivational aspect of self-help texts that is also consistent with New Age cultural norms. "New Age authors frequently use their life story as a model of spiritual progress to inspire their largely female readership – if they have been able to go from victimhood to realizing their potential through spirituality, then the reader can hopefully do the same" (Crowley, 2011, p. 30). An anecdotal style positions the author as a confidante, as one real person speaking to another. In the guidebooks, authors recount successes using their own intuition, meant to support readers to develop confidence in their own

capacities. Guidebooks' authors may or may not be formally educated, but their expertise in intuition development largely results from their personal life experience.

The authors' stories and confidential tone situate them both as teachers and as motivational figures, who inspire their readers to become better (see Dolby, 2005, p. 78). For example, Orloff (1996) frames her guidebook as a memoir, using her personal life story to motivate others to become aware of their intuitive capabilities. Day (1996) and Choquette (2004) pepper their texts with anecdotes about their clients' experiences, often demonstrating specific challenges that one might encounter when pursuing intuition development. Readers are told about how the authors and their students succeed and struggle with pursuing intuition development, and learn whether the authors were intuitive from a young age (as were Orloff, 1996 and Day, 1996) or realized their intuitive abilities later on (like Mariechild, 1981), or even somewhat reluctantly (Schulz, 1998). The authors' stories reflect and affirm the challenges readers are likely to face as they pursue a programme of intuition development, based on the trials that the authors have already experienced. The message is, 'if I can do it, you (and presumably anyone) can.' These anecdotes also normalize intuitive experience, especially that which is sometimes thought of as non-ordinary experience; even psychic intuition is framed as something that anyone can access, and everyone can improve (Vaughan, 1979).

By trade, many of the guidebooks' authors work in relational professions as psychotherapists, professional intuitives and psychics, or as spiritual teachers, yet they have come to write about 'intuition' from diverse starting points. Day (1996) knew about her psychic abilities from childhood, while Schulz (1998) is a medical researcher and physician who came to terms with her medical intuitive abilities later in life, after years of immersion in scientific medical study. Wendy Palmer (1994) has a 23-year practice of the martial art, *aikido*, that she credits with supporting her intuitive function, but she came to that practice with an established interest in physics, existentialism, and as she describes it, a lifetime of telepathic intuition with animals, and so was primed for the philosophical framework of *aikido* (namely Taoism) and understandings of inner energetics of the body that the martial art makes use of in its movement practice. Other authors are also 'natural intuitives' who somehow have an inherently well-developed intuitive sense, and who either had it supported by their family (Choquette, 2004) or who came to know themselves as intuitive in adulthood (Schulz, 1998). They may or may not have received explicit instruction or guidance to develop their own intuitive abilities (e.g.

Peirce, 1997 explains some of the formal training she received). Some of the writers (Day, 1996; Choquette, 2004) claim that intuition 'runs in their family.' Rather than understand this tendency as genetically transmitted, I interpret this statement as meaning that intuition had been normalized for them, in the sense that they would have seen it in use, and recognized its value from a young age.

#### The New Age

A frequent theme throughout intuition development guidebooks is their explanation that intuition development helps us to access something pre-existent, or more-than-personal (i.e., transpersonal). This orientation is consistent with the cultural zeitgeist from which the books arise, a loosely coherent set of themes known as the New Age movement. As an umbrella term, 'New Age' refers to "diverse spiritual, social, and political beliefs and practices that promote personal and societal change through spiritual transformation" (Crowley, 2011, p. 2). The New Age 'turn' has been made possible by the untethering of spirituality from religions, and the untethering of values from inherited dogma, so that people are enabled (and moreover, required) to find rituals, symbols, beliefs, and practices that resonate with them, rather than rely on inherited religious and intellectual authority. New Age culture reflects characteristics of a late modern culture, for example what Bauman (2007) calls 'liquid modernity': turning inward, focusing on the self as the locus of experience, and investing in developing that self. As Heelas (1996) explains, "New Agers universally suppose that it is crucial to 'work' on what it is to be a person" (p. 29).

The New Age occurs within a legacy of "validating personal experience from 'within'" (Crowley, 2011, p. 14), which the concept of intuition and intuition development certainly fits. With the perception of risk and uncertainty that pervades the culture, self-help texts that emphasize human agency, reflexivity and trusting oneself make sense (Field, 2000, p. 62). Personal meaning, which was formerly taken care of by institutionalized religion or other cultural institutions, has become individualized now, which is both an asset as well as a liability. Positively, this shift means that people are free to determine their own personal philosophies, and the quest to do so is well represented by the self-help genre. As such, New Age self-help culture, with its assumption that individuals can pursue technologies that will fill a felt sense of void, should be understood as one response to alienation.

Intuition development pedagogy conforms in particular with three main tenets of New Age 'self-spirituality' articulated by Paul Heelas (1996): firstly, an assumption that "your lives do not work" (p. 18), responsible for a feeling of discontent and subsequent search for resolution, meaning, or some road out of that angst or discontent. Secondly, the New Age appeals to a belief that each of us "are Gods and Goddesses in exile" (p. 19), suggesting that there is a 'higher self' or inner spirituality which can be sought. Followers are encouraged to listen to their intuition because the inner or higher self is assumed to know what is right and good. Thirdly, the New Age movement is infused with a hope that humanity will evolve to some kind of pinnacle state. There is a belief that, as a result of investing in self-development practices (like those recommended to improve intuition), the evolution of personal consciousnesses would contribute to social and political development and enable the movement towards a more ethical, equitable society.

The New Age is subject to persistent critiques. It is charged with contributing to individualism, of behaving more like a marketing ploy than spiritual movement (Redden, 2002) and of cultural appropriation (Muir, 2007). It has also been suggested that it "increases a susceptibility to irrationality and hysteria" (Crowley, 2011, p. 25)<sup>4</sup>. The promise of success in the New Age is not limited to the promise of materialist or egoic conquest; the New Age offers a psycho-spiritual version of fulfilment. In some analyses, New Age self-help has taken on a role previously occupied by formal, organized religion. For example, Starker (1989) makes sense of self-help books' popularity by noting that people turn to self-help literature in search of practical, but also moral and spiritual instruction (Starker, 1989). That is, people read them "for the same sort of reasons they went to church" (Starker, 1989, p. 37). Similarly, the life improvement promised by intuition guidebooks appeals to a sense of lack, or disenchantment, characteristic of self-hood in late modernity. Compared with the stability of social, political and cultural

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Crowley (2011) pushes back against these critiques, arguing that they are gendered, and dismissive of the value the New Age offers to its (mostly female) participants. I do not have space to address this analysis here, although it has resonance with the way the intuitive function is often dismissed at the same time it is linked with women, and feminized. Whereas 'New Age' is often used as a term of derision, in my analysis the phrase is neutral, in the sense that it reflects a trend of cultural thinking, a wave of interest in a particular area of life.

structures that characterized modernity, widespread "existential uncertainty" (Bauman, 2007, p. 92) is a feature of contemporary society that helps to make sense of the appeal of New Age literature.

#### A neoliberal logic of learning?

In addition to the critiques levelled at the New Age, self-help books in general are frequently read as representative of a "new" learning economy (Field, 2000) where education is sought as one possible panacea for unhappiness or alienation. Self-help therapy manuals are cited as one of the forms of individualistic and individualized learning that represent an "explosion" of learning opportunities outside formal institutions (Biesta, 2005). For example, Field (2000) groups self-help books with other individualized adult education activities such as "residential short courses, study tours, fitness centres, sports clubs, ... management gurus, electronic networks and selfinstructional videos" (p. 45). By this analysis, self-help books are evidence of a neoliberal logic of lifelong learning, by which people feel they must constantly improve themselves and develop their skills. Lewis (2013) argues that "self-knowledge and selfstudy become forms of self-management and self-governance" (p. 5), and the selfimprovement pursued by followers of self-help activities may be taken up in ways that soothe rather than disrupt readers' beliefs and lifestyles. However, we might consider intuition development somewhat more generously, through a lens of adult learning theory that understands such pursuits as "self-fulfilment through education" (Barrow & Keeney, 2001, p. 53).

The self-help genre does not *necessarily* contribute to a superficial, neo-liberal construct of self-making. It is reasonable to assume that readers are likely working to become more self-aware, and to experience more agency – in other words, more empowered or fulfilled. As Field (2000) notes, "much of the new adult learning is focused on a struggle with oneself, [and is] concerned with empowering individuals to take charge" (p. 46). In addition to personal empowerment, people may be also turning to self-help in search of a sense of community, or engagement with a greater sense of meaning, seeking a quality of 'moreness' (Braud, 2006) that, from a transpersonal or spiritual understanding, signals happiness, contentment, or even enlightenment. The pursuit of this better life can easily include the pursuit of developing and nurturing fulfilling relationships, gaining a sense of authenticity, or coming to feel satisfied with the direction of one's development. As self-help texts, intuition development guides could be

understood to represent a genuine desire for self-awareness, as they authorize or recognize a pre-existent, felt sense of 'moreness'. In this way, intuition development can be understood as a spiritual, existential pursuit.

Intuition development guides offer a path of practice to being more in touch with oneself. Their existence and popularity may also reflect a gap in educational provision about intuition. They are educational texts that also authorize readers' lived experiences of connection, and support their desire for greater connection. In the next two sections, I further unpack the content of these books. First, I summarize a metaphoric structure many of them use to explain what intuition is, and how it works. Consistent with their context in the 'new age,' the books use language borrowed from a range of sources consistent with a transpersonal framework. Then, I present the pedagogical programme they recommend as the way to enhance the intuitive function.

### 3.3 The guidebooks' transpersonal framework for intuition

Writers on intuition often mention its ineffable quality, which, it is noted, renders intuition notoriously difficult to talk about. This difficulty is likely because it is comprised largely of non-discursive experience: sense impressions, symbolic images; and because it occurs on a subconscious level. Claims to ineffability may be true, somewhat, but perhaps there is rather a lack of a shared vocabulary with which to report and conceptualize intuitive experiences in a 'respectable' way. This would explain the widespread availability of books about intuition coming from the popular realm. compared with relatively few academic books about the subject, and it accounts for why very few scholarly texts acknowledge intuition as a psychic sense, even though limiting the explanation for intuition to a cognitive, rational framework leaves a range of common intuitive experience unaccounted for. Whereas academic scholarship on intuition has either neglected the subject of intuition, or else contorted the concept in order to make it 'fit' within the current constraints of psychological norms, New Age self-help books make sense of intuition by incorporating ideas made available by a transpersonal framework. Situated as they are in the popular realm, and freed from constraints of scholarly rigour, New Age self-help quidebooks draw on a broad network of ideas, and therefore can language intuition in a way that resonates with many people's experience of it.

In this section, I explore how intuition development guidebooks use language and metaphor to frame intuition. As is typical of the New Age cultural movement, IDP guidebooks synthesize and absorb ideas, metaphors and images from diverse sources. In doing so they reference chakras, energetic vibrations, and ideas such as non-locality, drawn from influences such as Vedic teachings, Taoism, and theoretical physics. These borrowed, established frameworks are used to explain how psychic intuition works and supply a way for the guidebooks to represent concepts like subjectivity and self-hood. They presume the possibility of a more fully realized self, beyond egoic self-hood, that can arise as a result of the transformative inner work of IDP. While most of the guidebooks do not acknowledge the transpersonal by name (with the exception of Vaughan, 1979), the way they explain intuition and its function is coherent within a transpersonal or New Age framework. I discuss how this framework gets applied to ideas about consciousness and energy in ways that conceptualize the holism and flow that characterize intuitive experience.

#### **New Age 'borrowing'**

Since to a large extent the English language lacks vocabulary for subjective experiences of consciousness, intuition development guidebooks borrow from various of the world's wisdom traditions and their more elaborated vocabularies for 'inner' experience, including experiences of non-ordinary and non-discursive consciousness. Some of them (Vaughan, 1979; Naparstak, 1997) also incorporate ideas from theoretical quantum physics to explain how these experiences of consciousness are possible. For example, Naparstek (1997) dedicates a chapter to 'explaining intuition' with reference to David Bohm's implicate order and other teachings from physics (Naparstek, 1997). The guidebooks' use of these frameworks helps to anchor their authenticity in something ancient and established on the one hand, and 'scientific' and contemporary on the other.

The New Age in general has been accused of appropriating from, and commodifying, Indigenous and 'non-Western' cultures (Muir, 2007), but the use of these references is not only superficial or exotic; I understand this borrowing as largely arising from necessity. The references provide a vocabulary that helps to conceptualize the depth and breadth of experience they are trying to convey, beyond what a Western scientific framework can generally account for. Wisdom traditions have more expertise in communicating about experiences like psychic intuition. As Grof (1998) points out, Western psychology has focused on studying behaviour, and its observable, material

causes. In contrast, a transpersonal theory draws on psychologies that have been thoroughly elaborated in systems of thought that have persisted in exploring inner realms (Hinduism, Buddhism, Taoism, and others) (Tart, 1992). The resultant framework supports a climate that trusts subjective experience and values non-ordinary experiences of consciousness, making it appropriate for making sense of a wide range of subject experience.

Metaphoric borrowing, especially about inner experience, is not foreign to education theory. Holistic education similarly relies on a transpersonal framework that borrows from diverse wisdom traditions, making use of Eastern and Western conceptualizations of the spiritual realm (Miller, 1994). For example, Miller (1994) names Bohm's implicate order, Jung's collective unconscious, and Lao-tzu's *Tao* as conceptual mentors for languaging a realm he calls 'the invisible world', "a vaster reality beyond the physical" (p. 33), the experience of which is like "a great harmonious energy that sustains" (p. 34) people. The hypothesis of an invisible realm is widely accepted by the traditions that inform the transpersonal perspective, but is all but unspeakable in modern western culture, without drawing explicitly on religion, or, as it turns out, on advanced theoretical physics (eg Kaku, 1995).

Writers who are influenced by a transpersonal metaphoric structure often point to the interconnected unity of all things, as a cosmological 'fact' which is usually obscured by conscious awareness. As Vaughan (1979) writes,

"Transpersonal consciousness, in which the underlying oneness of the universe comes into awareness and the ordinary confines of time and space are experientially transcended, has commonly been dismissed as delusional or hallucinatory experience. Eastern mysticism, on the other hand, asserts that true reality is essentially one, or non-dualistic, and that all distinctions and separations are illusory. Thus personal consciousness has been rejected as illusory in the East, and transpersonal consciousness similarly rejected in the West. In fact, both these levels of consciousness are part of human experience, and both are necessary for the fulfilment of human potential" (p. 52).

In the West this "invisible world" is known as the perennial philosophy (Miller, 1994). It is accessed intuitively rather than cognitively, and usually only from within mystical and other non-ordinary states of consciousness. As Tart (1992) notes, "the traditional spiritual psychologies stress the importance of direct experiential knowledge of their subject matter" (p. 6). This more ultimate reality becomes accessible with training in

mind-body-heart disciplines such as meditation, martial arts, and yoga (Friedman & Hartelius, 2013, p. xxvi), which are reflected in the pedagogy for intuition development.

#### Transpersonal consciousness

The invisible world is like Bohm's (1980) implicate order, which conceptualizes a universe in which "everything in our world consists of this teeming, vibrating system of conscious energy" (Naparstek, 1997, p. 98). Thinking about consciousness through a quantum metaphor like this supports the transpersonal view of consciousness. For example, a cosmology described by quantum metaphors challenges a "widely held dualist assumption that consciousness and matter ('mind', or 'soul', and body) are entirely separate phenomena" (Zohar, 1991, p. 73). Philosophers and popularizers of the quantum framework teach that the physical form is not distinct from the energetic 'form.' Since we are subject to the physical laws of the universe, such as gravity and mass, then we should also understand ourselves subject to laws of energy, vibration, resonance, and non-locality. Consciousness as well as matter are subject to these laws, since "mind and matter are inseparable" (Bohm, 1998, p. 443).

Quantum entanglement offers a framework for the real condition of our interconnected state, a state that is generally imperceptible, but can be made increasingly available through intuition. Likewise, ideas such as quantum entanglement and nonlocality, borrowed from quantum physics, are used to help explain experiences of psychic intuition such as precognition, where future events can be perceived in advance, or telepathy, wherein two people can share information without communicating through language or any signs whatsoever (Naparstek, 1997). These experiences are supported by a perception of reality based on the principle which suggests that "the foundation of reality itself is an unfixed, indeterminate maze of probabilities" (Zohar, 1991 p. 12). For example, Day (1996) writes, "if everything is interconnected, then we must seriously revise our current notions of space and time. Intuition teaches us that things are separated neither in space nor in time" (p. 179). Similarly, Naparstek (1997) calls on Bohm's idea of the implicate order to explain how foreknowledge might be possible to a very sensitive, or sensitized, intuitive function. In Naparstek's representation, information exists within a vast, vibrating field, wherein everything is conscious and alive (p. 97). The existence of this "vast vibrating field" explains, as Grof (1998) articulates, "consciousness is not a product of the brain, but a

primary principle of existence, and that it plays a critical role in the creation of the phenomenal world" (p. 3).

Gawain (2000) presents a similar understanding, though with less explicit reference to quantum theory. In a chapter entitled 'What is Intuition', she begins: "There is a universal, intelligent life force that exists within everyone and everything. It resides within each one of us as a deep wisdom, an inner knowing. We can access this wonderful source of knowledge and wisdom through our intuition" (p. 21). Peirce (1997) also presents something similar, assuring readers that, "even when no one is near, you can be in silent conversation with the mysterious Presence that exists in your own body, in the air around you, ... An invisible entity pops up to meet you from every atom" (p. 93). These description of intuitive experience, central to the metaphoric explanation of intuition, are difficult to reconcile within a physicalist, anthropocentric understanding of consciousness. That there is informational content within inanimate objects sounds beyond irrational. But, the transpersonal framework, within which intuition development guidebooks represent intuition, takes coherence, synergy, and interdependence as fact.

#### Conceptualizing flow and energy

In her phenomenological study of intuitive experience, Petitmengin-Peugeot (1999) found that while the experience of flow is a consistent characteristic of intuition, there is also a lack of vocabulary to speak of this experience. Naparstek (1997) admits how difficult it can be to verbalize "the subtle expansion and movement of electromagnetic energy that occurs in and around the body just before and during these appearances of psi [her word for intuition]" (p. 86). Variously, the guidebooks use both Eastern spiritual traditions and quantum theory to speak of energy and its flow.

Naparstek (1997) is agnostic about her use of metaphors, representative of an attitude that would rather convey the idea than adhere to one specific system, when she recognizes that, "the kind of energy I'm talking about here has been called many things: chi, prana, biophysical energy, electromagnetic energy, orgone, vital life force, and many more" (p. 87).

With their references to energy and vibration, Choquette (2004), Gawain (2000), and others especially refer to features of what gets called the energy body (Gee, 1999), aura (Choquette, 2004, p. 107), or energy field (Naparstek, 1997, p. 87). These are the energetic pathways and vortices where nerves and consciousness constellate, and are a

mapping of the movement of flow through the body that is also fundamental to the practice of acupuncture and other traditional healing systems, as well as employed in martial arts, and articulated within the various forms of yoga. The energy body is understood as essential to the 'mechanism' of intuition, as the intuitive mode relies on energetic fields as loci of receptivity.

One of the important features of the energy, or etheric, body, chakra are energy storage centres ('wheels of energy') that correspond to areas of the physical body, where nerve plexi constellate. Schulz (1998), who tends to avoid borrowed language altogether, refers to the chakras as emotional centres, but notes that "Eastern philosophies and religions have described an anatomical structure of seven emotional centres in the body" (p. 126). Schulz's choice to represent chakras as emotional rather than energetic is not really incongruent. In this model, somatic, cognitive, emotional, and psychic (intuitive) experiences are not distinct; all may be involved in the transmission of energy, simultaneously and inextricably.

Of the seven major chakra said to align with the human form, the chakra that corresponds to the heart is most highly valued of all the chakras and energy pathways, and features in many of the guidebooks' representations. The practice of intuition development is described as a "heart-opening path" (Choquette, 2004), with the key to increasing intuitive capacity said to be in opening one's heart (Naparstek, 1997; Choquette, 2007). The intuitive sense itself is said to be "centred in the heart" (Choquette, 2004, p. xii), and the heart understood as "the source of ourselves" (Gee, 1999, p. 52). The heart centre is known in Buddhist thought as "the source of compassion and wisdom" (Bai & Scott, 2011, p. 135), and Naparstek (1997) borrows from this view when she equates open-heartedness with "internal coherence" (p. 67). An open heart in this view points to authenticity (in the existential sense of inner matching outer) and to a persona that is moving towards wholeness, or integration (Shepherd, 2010, p. 103). Metaphorically, in the western world, the heart is considered as the key to self-other relation (Schulz, 1998), and the quality of intuitive connections, as well as emotional receptivity or empathy, is also often thought to be centred in the heart (Choquette, 2004).

In Chapter Two, I referred to the concept of flow with reference to psychologist Csikszentmihalyi (1990), who described flow as the state of optimal experience in which

"consciousness is harmoniously ordered" (Csikszentmihalyi, 1990, p. 6). Csikszentmihalyi's *flow* is a state of consciousness, but in the guidebooks, and in the Eastern wisdom traditions from which they borrow, it is understood that what is flowing is energy, in the sense of actual, literal vibrations. Gawain (2000) teaches that when intuition is suppressed, "you may find that you feel a certain heaviness, lack of energy, a kind of deadness. This is because the life force is trying to come through and move you in a certain way and it is being blocked" (p. 84).

But flow can also refer to a transpersonal state of resonance with the cosmic flow, the receptive state deemed necessary for intuitive perception. This cosmic flow, or universal life force, is indicated when Choquette (2011/2013) writes, "when you enter the flow, your ego steps aside and allows your Spirit to completely take over" (p. 157). The guidebooks point practitioners to improve their experiences of life through developing an awareness of, and the ability to more readily enter, the condition of flow. For example, Peirce (1997) describes the process of intuition development as meant to teach practitioners to "learn to ride the current of consciousness" (p. 35), and Gee (1999) introduces an inner practice thus: "the relationship with Earth and universe creates a flow of subtle energy [through the body]" (p. 103).

Although these seem to be different qualities of the idea of flow - one meaning energetic vibrations, the other meaning a matrix of the coherent consciousness that permeates the human and more-than-human world - they are really the same. In this framework, the energy and its movement are not distinctive aspects (Hyakuten Inamoto, per. comm). The framework of energy and flow I have outlined here is marginal and incomplete. It barely accesses the depth of meaning these metaphors point to. However, in order to dialogue, teach, and learn about intuition and intuition development, we will need at least some semblance of shared language. Educators wanting to take psychic experience seriously will need to reckon with the limitations of the metaphors and frameworks they comfortably (or uncomfortably) are willing to use. To this end, I have investigated how intuition development guidebooks explain and describe the process of intuitive function. In the next section, I present the pedagogical programme that the guidebooks recommend for enhancing intuition; this program arises from and supports the transpersonal framework I have outlined.

## 3.4 What the guidebooks teach - Intuition Development Pedagogy (IDP)

A key feature of what I have been calling 'the guidebooks' is that they consistently recommend a programme of practices that, if followed, should serve to enhance the intuitive function. Although there is no standardization or coordination, the recommendations are consistent enough across the guidebooks that I consider them to be a coherent programme of practice that I have called intuition development pedagogy (IDP). IDP consists of work on the self that supports the development of a state of mind conducive to intuitive experience. Its practices entrain awareness, often using the breath as a target of attention, employ play and experimentation to prime the imagination, and generally aim to cultivate a receptive attitude to intuitive experience. The guidebooks recommend activities that aim for facility with creativity, helping individuals to recognize their unconscious thoughts, embodied sensations, etc, as well as to circumvent the dampening, editorial effect of the conscious mind, so that the intuitive voice can be 'heard.' Through IDP, practitioners learn to focus and turn inwards, and are encouraged to recognize shifts in energy and subtle clues, all of which are taken to signal intuitive process. Many of the practices comprising IDP are familiar as contemplative practices: they focus attention inward, calm the mind, and increase one's awareness of nondiscursive experience. Each of the guidebooks I have encountered recommend some form of contemplative or meditative practice as part of the programme for intuition development, even if the practice itself is not named as such.

In this section, I unpack the programme of IDP according to three categories of activity: attention practices, imaginative play, and meditation. These directives, for awareness and self-awareness, promote a stance, or attitude, that combines attention, trust, and relaxation, and encourages critical reflexivity, in order to discern which inner voices are to be listened to. However, more generally, these strategies are consistent with the values of transformation and 'seeking' of the New Age. The practices support adherents' ability to recognize their own meaning-making tools, and to identify the ways in which symbols and meaning have been inherited, which are directives that have been consistent within North American self-help since the early 1900s (Starker, 1989).

Like the conceptual framework that the guidebooks use to situate the idea of intuition, these practices are also borrowed. Some are recognizable from creativity

literature, but most are versions of practices taught by various wisdom traditions as "technologies of the sacred" (Grof, 1998, p. 193). Rather than teaching explicitly intuitive 'skills,' they bring about the conditions of consciousness that support intuitive experience. In some cases, as with meditation, intuitive development is a side benefit of the practice. For example, according to Owens (1992), the purpose of meditation within Zen practice is to change one's state of consciousness - that is, to create conditions of receptivity such that the 'true nature of the universe' is revealed. And while the practice of Zen meditation "may alter sensory perception" (Owens, 1992, p. 193), such shifts are not necessarily the main point. Likewise, an experience that commonly results from yogic practices is the ability to experience consciousness "beyond the subject-object dichotomy" (Chaudhuri, 1992, p. 262). While IDP does not necessarily teach that such awareness is required for access to the intuitive state, it points practitioners to pursue practices that create conditions that are conducive to intuitive function.

#### Paying attention & letting go

An initial step in IDP is cultivating an attitude of paying attention. The goal of this aspect of the pedagogy is to try and become aware of information on the subtlest of levels. The guidebooks counsel the cultivation of heightened awareness of situations, effects, thoughts, and signs – the whole of one's lived context. For example, Choquette (2004) counsels paying attention to feedback from the physical body, as well as to the language one uses, and generally maintaining acute awareness of the (inner and outer) circumstances of the current moment. Practitioners are encouraged "to become acutely, exquisitely alive to whatever you're sensing" (Day, 1997, p. 53), a directive based on the premise that intuitive skills "will grow just from greater moment-to-moment awareness of whatever it is you are doing" (Naparstek, 1997, p.160).

One important locus of awareness is the attention one pays to felt senses in the body. By paying attention to the embodied form, we nurture a venue through which our intuitive voice 'speaks'. The guidebooks elaborate the body's role in experiencing intuition, and direct readers how to make the most of whatever embodied sensations are noticed. "The more you *feel* your body and *listen* to the signals that your body is giving you, the more it helps you get connected to your intuition" (Gawain, 2000, p. 16). Peirce (1997) notes that intuitive information can be registered in the body along a scale of intensity; beginning with subtle resonance or instinctual urges, such as the experience of

turning a corner and getting a strong, contractive anxiety signal, recognizable as a 'gut feeling;' and moving up to what she calls the 'heebie-jeebies', or 'butterflies,' which is also a common experience. 'Paying attention' also requires a willingness to attend to such experiences as if they carry information. Peirce (1997) warns that each informative signal, if ignored, intensifies to a less subtle experience, even potentially leading to disease and illness. Unless we are attuned to register that sensations like these may have intuitive significance, we might respond to these sensations by seeking comfort in whatever behaviour soothes us (such as eating, or refreshing our email inbox). However Gee (1999) echoes and elaborates the risk in not listening to the intuition, warning that "all attempts to control, negate, and repress emotional states result in physical symptoms of pain and illness" (p. 52).

The call to paying attention is based on the assumption that most of us become aware of intuition when it spontaneously arises to a consciousness that is otherwise occupied, since the 'heightened' awareness is not tightly focused but rather diffuse. Consciousness becomes receptive enough for intuition to arise in those moments when we are doing something else (Choquette, 2004, p. 43), or when we are caught up in ordinary, everyday tasks. These more spontaneous scenarios are widely cited in creativity literature, sometimes explained as the 'bus-bath-bed' phenomenon, which refers to the locations where insights are most likely to occur. A relaxed yet attentive state of awareness can give rise to the optimal experience cited by Csikszentmihalyi (1990) as 'flow' experiences, known to support intuition. However, such quiet moments can be intentionally cultivated (Choquette, 2004). For example, when we pause to specifically relax the mind from a problem we have been working on, a receptive state of mind can arise, which is sometimes called 'incubation', or letting the problem gestate. Choquette (2004) suggests that going for a walk can serve this purpose, and Claxton (2006) recommends taking what he calls 'hunch breaks' (a short break to loosen the mind) as useful in problem-solving. Although it may seem counter-intuitive, in the context of a high-stress lifestyle, scheduling unstructured time in the day (Kezar, 2005) becomes a strategy for becoming intellectually relaxed, and more open to intuitive flow. Depending on the individual, constructive use of that time may involve going for a walk or run, writing in a journal, doodling in a notebook, building model airplanes, or any other activity that cultivates relaxation and creativity.

To support attention, a number of the guidebooks (Cartwright, 2004; Vaughan, 1979; Choquette, 2004) specifically recommend journalling, as an example of a creative activity that may help us to become aware of unconscious content. Through regular practice, writing can become stream of consciousness, whereby the unconscious has the freedom to express itself before the rational mind can interfere and censor the content as unreasonable. Free writing facilitates the flow of the symbolic, communicative language of our inner life, putting us in better touch with how we feel (Dirkx, 2006). The act of writing can then serve to attune the conscious mind to that which may be important, and some of the guides (Choquette, 2004; Naparstek, 1997) emphasize that journalling serves the useful function of recording intuitive content so it can be verified later on. Naparstek adds that journalling is "a concrete way of focusing your attention and of making what is unconscious, conscious" (p. 155).

#### Play & experimentation practice

There is consensus amongst the guidebooks that intuition occurs under conditions of feeling interested and aware, yet also receptive and relaxed. The pedagogy for intuition is structured to cultivate this receptive state, which is inhibited by stress. Hence there is significant attention to cultivating a state of relaxation, with diverse and plentiful opportunities to experiment with being intuitive. A number of the guidebooks (Peirce, 1997; Gee, 1999; Choquette, 2004) are structured as workbooks with activities, questionnaires, and blank pages for recording notes. Practitioners are encouraged to verify their intuitive impressions by keeping track of their accuracy, and to experiment with interpreting – and acting on – intuitive content.

The emphasis on play and experimentation fulfils the practical effect of increasing people's facility and expertise (the simple need to practice, as with any skill). In addition, imaginative experimentation inculcates a light-hearted attitude and playful demeanour, which contributes to the desired relaxed, receptive state and the "conceptual flexibility" (Goldberg, 1983, p. 157) supportive of interpreting intuitive content. Naparstek (1997) names the ideal stance for intuition, "passive volition," which she describes as detached and effortless, and most importantly, not inhibited by a pressure to control what we notice. The practice aims to observe impressions without interpreting them (Naparstek, 1997), and the ideal is to become comfortable with exploration and experimentation. This is another form of attention practice, or noticing.

For example, Gawain (2000) advises readers to "make a practice of noticing how you feel and what happens to your energy when you follow your intuitive guidance and when you don't" (p. 89). A playful, exploratory attitude is definitely recommended as supportive of all the exercises (Vaughan, 1979, p. 44). Choquette (2004) concurs, warning that "taking yourself too seriously is an obstacle to trusting your vibes" (p. 197).

Although practitioners are cautioned to suspend judgement in the initial phase of noticing intuition, the pedagogy also guides people to interpret what they have sensed. It is understood that it is important for practitioners to become familiar with their own subjective, interpretive network of symbols, their dream language, and the unconscious in general. As such, experimental practice with inner imagery is recommended as a "means of increasing self-knowledge" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 93). Anderson (2011) describes the way intuitives develop "unique – and sometimes idiosyncratic – means for navigating" (p. 20) intuitive states and the content they turn out. The process of learning to work with imagery, which is "the language of intuition" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 90) is twofold: "First one evokes inner imagery, then one interprets it" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 90). Likewise, although practitioners are encouraged to experiment with their imagination, and imaginal content, we are cautioned not to take imagination too literally (Goldberg, 1983, p. 190). There is a need to consider that the language of the unconscious is a symbolic language, and its meaning will vary depending on who is interpreting.

Dreams are a common reference for symbolic imagery. Most of us understand how imagery in dreams is sometimes specific to the individual, even though it is also often archetypal and symbolic. For example, Schulz (1998), recounts a dream that occurred in a period when she was experiencing serious back pain. In this dream, she lost her contact lenses. Later, (in retrospect) she realized that the image of the contact lenses was a symbolic representation of her own spinal discs, which were, on examination, degenerating, leading to a correct diagnosis for her long-experienced pain (Schulz, 1998, p. 53). In order to recognize the meaning in her dream, Schulz needed the state of mind to first consider that contact lenses were significant imagery from her dream, and then she needed the intuitive self-awareness to understand what the lenses could mean to convey within her personal, symbolic lexicon.

Some of the recommendations around play and experimentation have shown up in educational treatments of intuition. Noddings and Shore (1984) make suggestions for

educating intuition that are largely similar to those presented above. They acknowledge that, generally, schools "provide a poor environment for engagement in intuitive modes" (Noddings & Shore, 1984, p. 94), but consider that still, the intuitive mode can be enhanced, with attention to creating a safe, affective environment. They note that, as part of creating a receptive climate, it is important for intuition to be acknowledged aloud, and they urge educators to speak about it, and to share personal experience with the function. Noddings and Shore also call for helping students to reflect on their own conscious states (p. 102), and for encouraging receptivity by not always requiring students to analyze or define concepts, 'perform' comprehension, and suggesting that teachers assign open-ended tasks. They emphasize the importance of allowing time and space for incubation of ideas, noting the need for incubation and subsequent illumination. However, Noddings and Shore are explicitly careful to limit their educational recommendations to only those activities that can be construed as secular. They are concerned that, as affective education, educating for intuition development risks the possibility of foreclosing free, rational exchange.

Intuition development guidebooks address the difficulty in trusting ourselves, and point out many of the specific ways this is difficult. It is through practising this discernment that one comes to learn that there really are "differences between imagining things and knowing them" (Chase, 1960, p. 4). Sometimes intuitive content arrives as impressions, or images that need to be elaborated later on (Naparstek, 1997, p. 83). Still other times we might act on an impression because it feels right, but not get feedback until months or years later, if at all (Day, 1997, p. 76). The practice of recording impressions through journaling, for example, is one way to create a record of our accuracy, and can work in a positive feedback loop, with successes acting as motivation to persist in trusting.

While emotions are one important 'accuracy filter' to work around, similarly practitioners are encouraged to not let logic interfere with intuition, since the "logical mind tends to censor your intuitive impressions" (Day, 1997, p. 78). For example, in remote viewing experiments meant to test the accuracy of telepathic communication, subjects were more successful when they especially paid attention to "first impressions; to their more spontaneous and surprising impressions; to impressions that were multisensory as opposed to merely visual; and to impressions that carried an emotional

component" (Naparstek, 1997, p. 83). These experiments were less successful when practitioners allowed the thinking, judging mind to have input.

#### **Breath & meditation practice**

As preparation for the relaxed and receptive state of awareness that is most conducive to intuitive experience, IDP always includes the practice of mindful breathing or meditation. As Choquette (2004) explains, "breathing purposefully during stressful situations is intuitively intelligent, for it keeps you open to guidance rather than forcing you to succumb to a fight-or-flight stance that diminishes your awareness" (p. 34). Breath practice produces a progressive relaxation of physical stress in the body, allowing for greater internal awareness and also (temporary) intellectual withdrawal from focus on everyday matters. The very act of turning attention to one's breath turns attention away from the outer world, and toward inner experience. For example, the more we remember our breath and pay attention to how it feels, the more likely we are to recognize when our breath has become shallow as a consequence of a disturbed inner state. This is relevant because a disturbed inner state may be a prelude to, or concomitant of, intuitive awareness. In order to induce a relaxed state through paying attention to breath, Naparstek (1997) encourages starting with "deep, deliberate breathing which ... elicits relaxation and a dropping down into the body" (116). Gawain (2000) echoes the language of "dropping down" (47), describing it as becoming sufficiently relaxed such that "you can allow your attention to move out of your head and ... into a deeper place in your body, closer to where your gut feelings reside." Other versions of the directive to turn inward encourage practitioners to "get centred" (Peirce, 1997, p. 91) or "tune-in" (Chase, 1960, p. 4). All of these cues are meant to support the condition of inner receptivity that supports intuition, and evoke the experience of 'letting go,' a keynote of the intuitive mode (Petitmengin-Peugeot, 1999).

But the benefits of breath and meditation practice reach beyond relaxation; meditative practices also entrain perception of consciousness and subtle energies. As intentional breath practice relaxes the body and disciplines the mind, it serves as one of the ways to control consciousness (Csikszentmihalyi, 1990, p. 106), and focuses the mind towards one's thoughts, feelings, and other sense impressions. With persistent practice, meditation eventually limits the amount of chatter in the stream of consciousness through focusing attention. Palmer (1994) explains that "by cultivating our

concentration for staying with our sensations, we develop a kind of strength that enables us to stay in the present" (p. 17). Here, "staying with" means applying attention there, and while one part of the mind is occupied with that attention, other parts are free to relax. Meditators work to develop what is often called 'witness consciousness', a part of the self not invested in the unconscious habitual mind. By watching the mind to become aware of one's thoughts, we come to know what kind of stuff floats through; habits, beliefs, and new ideas. The 'witness' or watching self develops with practice, and with discipline, can become integrated so that it activates more regularly. The development of this form of consciousness is key to developing intuition. As Vaughan (1979) writes, "when you are in touch with the stillpoint at the center of your being, there is no need to use imagery or verbal exercises to activate intuition. It flows by itself, unimpeded by fears and preoccupations" (p. 177). Breath practice is known to elicit significant, deep effects, including becoming "internally coherent, [and] aware of the subtle energies" (Bai et. al., 2009). Or as Choquette (2004) describes, practising regular and deep breathing "instantly connects us to a higher vibration" (p. 34).

In summarizing the pedagogy for intuition development, Vaughan (1979) identifies that it involves "quieting the mind, ... learning to focus attention, [and] ... the cultivation of a receptive, nonjudgmental attitude that allows intuition to come into awareness without interference" (p. 34). Through self observation practices, the subject comes to understand how one is situated within oneself, so that a more open inner relationship can develop. The practices work to open out the inner stillness that can be attained, enabling a quiet within in which the intuitive awareness, the inner voice or vision, can come forth, no longer overwhelmed by the chatter of the narrative voice of the ordinary, everyday consciousness.

One important goal of meditation is cultivating the capacity of an "inner witness" (Gee, 1999; Vaughan, 1979), to become aware of the flux of physical, emotional, and other impressions, allowing their expression but not becoming overwhelmed by them. This is a neutral stance, a way of being in the flow of experience whereby one is aware, but not intervening. In line with the creativity practices, one has to get out of one's own way. To be aware of the flux of consciousness is to 'become identical with it.' Using one's breath to induce relaxation is a contemplative technique that focuses attention inward. As such, it works to redress normal, outer-directed focus and allows for the

experience of non-discursive reality. Meditation becomes a shift in orientation of the consciousness towards self-connection.

Even where meditation is not identified as such by name, as in Day's (1996) *Practical Intuition*, where readers are advised to "become acutely, exquisitely alive to whatever you're sensing so that you can consciously allow it to fade into the background" (p. 53), meditation is recommended as an aspect of awareness training and of cultivating the receptive, intuitive state. Exercises such as focusing one's attention on one's breath are advised and described. For example, Gee (1999) writes, "meditation is an intrinsic part of the spiritual path and its importance cannot be overestimated in the development of the intuition" (p. 133). In order to hear the inner voice, "beyond physically relaxing, we need to clear our minds of all the busyness, the 'mental noise' – analyzing, worrying, judging, remembering, looking ahead, comparing, associating, and scanning the environment – that we normally do" (Naparstek 1997, p. 54). "Meditation simultaneously clears and stills the mind" (Naparstek, 1997, p. 161), and when the mind is empty, free from preconceptions, intuition has the space to unfold (Vaughan, 1979).

Meditation is the most important intuitive development practice because it clears away "obstacles which ordinarily interfere with it [intuition] becoming conscious" (Vaughan 1979; 79). In particular, meditation "can help us experience the flow state" (Miller 1994; 5), which is known to facilitate the intuitive mode. Meditation practice is also known for contributing to "increased well-being, freedom from anxiety, sharpened mental and emotional faculties" (Sarath, 2003, p. 230). It "heightens and coheres consciousness" (Naparstek, p. 105). Through practising meditation, one can develop a 'working relationship' with the unconscious, in order to receive intuitive content, as well as interpret it reasonably. With the "silent mind" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 185), practice with meditation and other contemplative forms entrain a willingness to listen to messages from the body, and from the unconscious.

Through meditation, practitioners learn to dis-identify the temporal and flowing contents of the psyche from the more consistent inner observer, in order to see how we are and how we act from a different point of view. This dis-identification, taking a different 'seat' within ourselves, is sometimes referred to as the development of witness consciousness – the 'witness' being the part of the self that remains impartial within the stream of consciousness. The witness cannot be objectified (Deikman, 1982). That is, it

is not possible to recognize the boundaries of a self in order to distinguish a distinct witness. Meditation offers an experience that such duality is a convenience, or convention.

While not necessarily religious, there is an inherently spiritual connotation in the breath and meditation practices that the guidebooks consider to be key for intuition development. Noddings and Shore (1984) steered clear of a too-close affiliation with that culture. They perceived the New Age as a threat to critical thinking, noting that "if we consider the serious and the humorous, the spiritual and the intellectual, we can help to prepare our students for intelligent encounters with the esoteric psychologies and exotic religions which abound in our culture. The idea is to acknowledge the legitimacy and universality of the quest for meaning and to induce reflection on ways of pursuing it" (p. 92). Their concern to keep intuition enhancement strategies secular is a part of this claim for respectability. However, in the 30-plus years since the publication of their book, classroom culture has shifted, with mindfulness programming become more mainstream, and transformative learning (with its affiliation to transpersonal ideas) more widespread, especially in higher education. Like all the practices recommended as aspects of IDP, which create an attitude of willingness, acceptance, or receptivity, by prescribing meditation, the guidebooks are prescribing secular spiritual practices that focus inward in an effort to attend to aspects of awareness that the physicalist bias of our collective culture often ignores and neglects. As a coherent programme, comprising attention, relaxation, and imagination, the practices comprising IDP help practitioners to access meaningful, inner engagement.

### 3.5 Intuition Development Pedagogy is an educational programme

In this chapter, I have introduced an alternative space for conceptualizing intuition: New Age, self-help, intuition development guidebooks. I have argued that these guidebooks should be understood within their context of a post-modern, spiritually-interested 'New Age' culture, which is largely drawn from the broader field of transpersonal theory. As self-help books, the guidebooks authorize, normalize, encourage, empower, and teach their readers to develop an enhanced intuitive function.

However beyond practical instruction, the guidebooks reflect a popular movement to normalize and validate transpersonal awareness, and to accommodate theory and concepts that represent consciousness, and the means to access extended experiences of consciousness. They reveal a way of understanding intuition and its development that educators should take seriously.

As a (sub)genre of popular books, the guidebooks represent a set of self-consistent and coherent assumptions or orientations that articulate contemporary spiritual development. They outline a vision of connection and meaning that is to be found in the intuitive mode itself, and also in the pursuit of intuition development through IDP. Intuition development guidebooks exemplify a concern for the search for meaning, for something more in one's life. The pedagogy for intuition acknowledges the complexity of psychic structures, and recognizes the importance of the unconscious, a legacy drawn from transpersonal psychology.

Perhaps more than anything else, the programme of practice for intuition development (IDP) inculcates the value of, and the habit of, self awareness. The more one knows about one's own subconscious beliefs, assumptions, and patterns, the fewer distortions there are that might cause one to potentially miss or misinterpret intuition. "As you grow to understand yourself," Mariechild (1981) counsels, "you won't be caught off guard when some of this unconscious material rises to the surface" (p. 9). Impressions should be followed up not only by making sense of them, but asking *why* you notice what you do (Day, 1997, p. 53). Naparstek (1997) notes that "it is essential that you are well-versed in your own motivations" (p. 165), and Vaughan (1979, p. 26) cautions readers to observe attachments that might interfere with clarity. In particular, in order to make better assessments about the meaning of intuitive content, one must 'own' projections (Mariechild, 1981; Vaughan, 1979). The development of self-awareness leads to the ability to know the difference between different kinds of psychic contents, such as between intuition and fantasy, fear and desire (Goldberg, 1983).

As described in the details of intuitive pedagogy, interpretation may also require facility with deciphering symbolic representations arising in content from the unconscious. As interpreters of subjective content, we can learn to know the difference between different kinds of content. While the pedagogy encourages imaginative play, the authors do warn readers about the power of make-believe (Day, 1997, p. 75), especially

with respect to recognizing something to be true, "even when you don't like what it says" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 176). Practitioners learn discernment, so as to ensure "that what you are picking up is from a universal source and not your personal unconscious" (Mariechild, 1981, p. 9). Mariechild (1981) describes this process as 'getting clear', noting the problem that personal feelings and biases can interfere with the ability to accurately perceive psychic information. Mariechild (1981) specifically recommends a practice in which we can observe the contents of our minds "in non-judgemental ways. Most of us, having been raised in an atmosphere of criticism and competition, find it hard to really look at ourselves – after all, we might not like what we see" (p. 9). Contemplative practices support the attempt to witness the flow of thoughts, feelings and judgements with a curious, and detached attitude.

Throughout this chapter, I have situated a transpersonal framework in relief to the more familiar modern, western framework. Vaughan (1979) explains that

"transpersonal consciousness, in which the underlying oneness of the universe comes into awareness and the ordinary confines of time and space are experientially transcended, has commonly been dismissed as delusional or hallucinatory experience. Eastern mysticism on the other hand, asserts that true reality is essentially one, or non-dualistic, and that all distinctions and separations are illusory. Thus personal consciousness has been rejected as illusory in the east, and transpersonal consciousness similarly rejected in the west" (p. 52).

Both of these positions are useful, valid, and functional - they are not competing. Like analysis and intuition, they complement each other and each have a place. Vaughan concludes that both positions are necessary, but especially points to the importance of the transpersonal, writing that "once you have become aware of the transpersonal dimensions of your own being, with the joy and certainty that intuitive knowledge affords, you can begin to experience yourself more consistently as the *context* of your life experience, instead of identifying with the *contents*. Thus you will no longer be totally identified with any one aspect of yourself" (Vaughan 1979, p. 197).

By situating intuition development in a larger frame of personal development, I have shown that the guidebooks represent values that intuitive development practitioners are working towards, beyond simply becoming more intuitive. Arising from a transpersonal orientation, and informed by transformation as a value, the more intuitive 'self-hood' that IDP works towards is a self understood as holistic (including mind, body, and spirit); interconnected (situated in an interpersonal human community, as well as

ecologic and cosmic contexts); and contingent (there is no essential self, but rather the persona is constituted by its relationships and identity factors, and by the stories it tells itself; in other words there is an investment in a subject identity through intentional self-development). A transpersonal concept of intuition highlights the importance of context and subjective experience, where the self is understood as more than just the egoic individual. The effort to conceptualize intuition through a transpersonal lens is part of a wider struggle to integrate the idea that one's "feeling of subjectivity," that is, one's consciousness is actually inter-subjective, and that "the more open and grounded the subject is, the more the soul responds to the nonphysical presence of other subjects – to intersubjectivity" (de Quincey, 2005, p. 242).

As a programme, intuition development pedagogy (IDP) focuses on inner, subjective and inter-subjective experience. It requires that practitioners learn to value non-discursive experience and knowledge gleaned in that state. The New Age genre helps to normalize so-called non-ordinary and para-psychological experience that do not have many venues for validation in modern western culture. So while it is certainly possible to understand the goals of New Age self-help from a cynical standpoint, because of their orientation to increased awareness, and their requirement of doing actual work or practice to achieve that awareness, they also reflect a pursuit of something more than just better intuition. These books represent New Age 'seeking' — they demonstrate the desire for, and the pursuit of, meaningful experience, and the ability to understand one's own context. Seeking is a transpersonal pursuit in that it hopes to find meaning in something greater than the individual, 'independent' self. In a time where human beings are so disconnected from each other, and their contexts, and where our identities 'float free', intuition has been stifled by the same processes that have alienated us in other ways.

Intuitive development pedagogy aims to entrain practitioners' awareness to states of mind similar to contemplative states: creative, dispersed consciousness; a holistic, or nondual logic of both/and; and a space oriented to potential. This state of mind can only be learned through experience. Practice allows for the feeling of intuition so it can be recognized, and that intuitive content can be recognized, even when it is non-discursive, or symbolic. In order to enhance intuitive ability, the self must undergo changes to *become* more intuitive, engendering a new way of being.

# Chapter 4 – Intuition, subjectivity and truth: developing an intuitive way of being

"A personal work of inner preparation is an essential prerequisite before we can begin to receive clear information, answers to our questions, and unsolicited guidance" (Gee, 1999, p. 122).

"Awakening intuition is inseparable from developing self-awareness" (Vaughan, 1979, 69).

In the last chapter, I presented a programme of practice for enhancing intuition that I derived from popular, self-help, intuition development guides. I showed the program to be constructed of practices that prepare practitioners' consciousness for becoming increasingly receptive to intuitive experience, and that support practitioners' psycho-spiritual maturation, such that they become better prepared to interpret intuitive experience. This chapter further considers the self-awareness required for appropriately interpreting intuitive experience, and how intuition development practices in general work to support that awareness. The focus of my analysis in this chapter is to address a question that needs response if intuition is to become acceptable as a subject of concern in formal educational venues: that is, how is intuition trustworthy? Taking Vaughan's (1979) controversial declaration that intuition is always true ('true by definition') as a starting point, I translate this assertion to be reliant on a trust-worthy intuiting subject. and note that the function of Intuition Development Pedagogy (IDP) is the development of that subject. The requirement of self-development in order to access truth is coherent within a lineage of philosophy that seeks truth not through intellectual means, but through the practice of transformation, and is an orientation toward knowledge and subjectivity that challenges the objectivist approach to knowledge more frequently encountered in contemporary philosophy. The subjective truth of intuition highlights the difference between contextualized knowledge (which we might call wisdom) and decontextualized, or inert, knowledge.

In Chapter Three I explained that intuition development guidebooks provide a programme of practice that largely draws from Eastern wisdom traditions. In this chapter, I demonstrate that this practice has lineage in a Western philosophic tradition, albeit one that has been obscured behind a more dominant approach to knowledge. In the

dominant formulation, knowledge is considered to be more true the less a knowing subject interferes. This is the principle of objectivity, in which the subject is renounced in favour of the object of knowledge. On the other hand, in the framework that informs intuition development, the subject is inherently needed, as there is no intuitive function without the intuiting subject. Foucault makes a similar distinction in his analysis of Ancient philosophical practice ('care of the self'), where he explains how in the Ancient Greco-Roman framework, it was understood that in order to access truth, a subject had to transform, usually by way of performing 'work' (*askesis*) on the self. When Foucault analysed this tradition, he pointed out that not only does the subject matter to what gets known, it is assumed that the subject must undertake intentional development in order to arrive to that knowledge. I find a parallel structure in the contemporary pursuit of intuition development.

Throughout this chapter, I draw on Foucault's study of Ancient Greco-Roman philosophic lineage and its inner practices of care of the self, in order to analyze the effects of IDP on subject-making, and on knowledge more generally. I consider the intuition development program (IDP) that is presented in New Age self-help guidebooks as a philosophic practice that also centres the subject as an integral feature of what gets known, and suggest that, like Foucault's notion of truth and subject-making, the pursuit of intuition development be recognized as a practice of philosophy, in this case one that resists the obfuscation or denial of intuition as a reasonable way to knowing. Through this analysis I position intuition and its development as a response to the alienating, decontextualized knowledge that has become the hegemonic way of thinking about knowledge and knowledge production.

To date, the question of the truth of intuitive experience has been explained in various ways. I have cited Estés as suggesting that intuition is trustworthy because it is a part of yourself that 'knows better,' and a similar position posits that it is trustworthy because it has its source in a perfect, divine source of wisdom. These explanations, in effect, serve to discredit intuition within a secular, modern intellectual climate. However, by aligning the trustworthiness of intuition with a philosophic lineage that depends on the subject and her transformation, I intend to demonstrate that the truth of intuitive knowledge is derived as a result of the knowing subject having developed through work they have done on the self, and thus that IDP is a contemporary version of the

transformative spiritual practice of care of the self that contributes to the critical, ethical process of subjectivation, or subject-making.

To begin, I problematize the question of truth with respect to intuition, and identify the need for a framework of knowledge that highlight's the knower's subjectivity. Then, using Foucault's treatment as a guide, I explore the two divergent philosophic lineages the existential lineage concerned with care of the self, and the intellectualist lineage, concerned with knowledge of self. Next, I establish that IDP is a contemporary form of care of the self and suggest that the practice of intuition development troubles modern subjectivity by emphasizing the subject's relational context, and by enlarging the category 'subject' to recognize transpersonal, humanist psychological work of the last 100 years or so. Contextualizing the popular pedagogy for intuition development in the lineage of Ancient, existential philosophic practice, I rely on Foucault's examination of truth and the process of becoming a subject through enactment of askesis to consider IDP as an educational practice for enhancing intuition. I turn to the modern framing of knowledge, and suggest that IDP troubles modern assumptions about knowledge and truth, by inherently recognizing that truth is a subjective matter - it is not only accessed in the objective and decontextualized the way the dominant epistemological framework assumes. Finally, I suggest that, like care of the self, IDP can function as a critical, ethical practice, an enactment of critique that resists this imposed regime of rationality.

Supported by Bai's (2009, 2011, 2015) discussion about the effects of contemplative practice on ways of being in the world, and calls for social transformation that refer to a more intuitive way of being, I argue that like care of the self, the process of becoming more intuitive is transformative, and ethical (a responsibility). Reading IDP as transformative practice tells us what we need to know in order to successfully educate for intuition: intuition development is a philosophic pursuit reliant on post-Cartesian and transpersonal ethics, that de-centres the egoic persona while accessing non-discursive ways of knowing through care of the self. By recognizing the inherent transformation involved in intuition development, the guidance for developing intuitive ability is shown to support the ability to connect with oneself and one's context, filling a niche that formal education has so far left void.

## 4.1 'Things as they are': Unpacking an assumption that intuition is always true

A common conception of the intuitive function throughout the guidebooks frames intuition as "the direct experience of things as they are" (Hayward, 1997, p. ix). Evoking Bergson's understanding of intuition as a method of resonating with and as the object being intuited, this definition presumes that "when we experience the world directly, beyond the filter of conception we *live* that world" (Hayward, 1997, p. ix). Vaughan (1979) offers a similar description of intuition, suggesting that it is "true by definition" (p. 45). This claim is only reasonable to accept if truth is subjective, since the truth of intuitive content may only be legible to the one who is experiencing.

These conceptions are understandably challenging when read through the modern, Western framework of knowledge that is invested in a certain understanding of knowledge. When sharing my work with fellow academics, I have heard a concern about the possibility that someone might make the claim that the 'truth' of their intuitive knowledge trumps a collective judgement, or else is unclear about what should happen when someone claims that their intuition conflicts with what otherwise seems to be the rational position. How do we deal with a student, for example, who claims intuition as a way to make otherwise unreasonable assertions? Based on what I have learnt from considering the educational value of intuition development guidebooks - that the work to enhance intuition rests in the pursuit of inner work - I am arguing that the key to accessing the truth of intuition lies in having pursued transformative work on the self such that one is able to discern between different inner voices, recognizing what feels right versus what one hopes or wants to be right, etc. For example, Vaughan (1979) elaborates that "intuition allows one to see into the nature of things, not by learning about them but by identifying with them in such a way that subject/object boundaries dissolve" (p. 29). This view, and its assumption that it is possible to see things "as they are," clarifies why intuition development pedagogy includes non-discursive practices. The intuitive function becomes more accessible by thinning the veil of subject-object duality, an experience that can become more available through contemplative practice (Bai & Scott, 2011).

It might seem that I am arguing for intuition to be taken as trustworthy based on someone's claims about how much inner work they have done, or the extent of the

transformation they have undergone. This assumption might be implied in something like Bastick's (1982) suggestion that the inaccuracy of intuition is often due to poorly judged interpretation. By this logic, it would seem that if someone had done sufficient work on the self to be able to correctly recognize and then interpret intuitive content, they would be able to access the always-true content of intuitive experience. There is a concern that the intuiting subject who has practiced IDP would then have claim to say, 'just trust me, I have been meditating for years and therefore my intuition is correct.' Yet this is not what I'm suggesting. The truth or correctness is always to be found in evidence, even if sometimes this evidence is not obvious, or delayed, or not observable to an external observer. More accurately, the truth of intuition is always in a context, reliant on the intuiting subject and her self-awareness to determine intuitive correctness, which is why IDP inducts the subject to become increasingly aware of her context. Vaughan's reference to the inherent truth of intuition highlights something key to an idea of truth that I am pursuing: there is a difference between knowledge and truth, and truth is a reflection of the inner condition. That is, when what we are is coherent (within ourselves, as well as in accord with the cosmic flow), truth becomes more accessible to us.

Guidebook author Mona Lisa Schulz (1998) recounts an exceptional example of the subjective nature of the way the truth of intuition can be conveyed: During a stressful period of her life, Schulz was experiencing problems with her spine. Her nerves were affected and she experienced pain, and loss of sensation in her hands. Around that time, she had a series of dreams in which her contact lenses were swollen and would not fit into her eyes. Eventually, Schulz realized that the dreams about contact lenses contained information about her spine, and that the lenses were a symbolic representation for a medical condition relating to spinal discs. Objectively, Schulz had no reason to make sense of that symbolism. Interpreted literally, the dreams did not make sense. However, Schulz knew herself to be experiencing chronic back pain, and in her waking life was considering surgical options to relieve that pain. Additionally, from her medical education, she knew that the structure of spinal discs is similar to the shape of contact lenses. With this combination of context and self-awareness, Schulz was able to connect the intuitive content gleaned in a dream to content that made sense to her, and then confirm that information with medical imaging.

#### Two epistemological positions

This anecdote brings into relief two differing epistemological positions that need to be considered if intuition is to be thought about in the academy, and are already in play in various treatments of intuition I have considered throughout this dissertation. The first is a dualistic position, oriented to viewing things as separate, not least the assumption that knowledge is separate from the knower (Osberg et al, 2008). Kincheloe (2010) has labelled this epistemological standpoint, FIDUROD, an acronym that stands for knowledge that is formal, intractable, decontextualized, universalistic, reductionistic, and one-dimensional (p. 23). Characteristic of modern, Western culture, much of our intellectual culture, including educational practice, is based on this position. The second epistemological stance recognizes that knowledge is not separable from the knower. This position reflects reality as situational and dynamic, and includes the individual subject as part of a relational, interactive flow. This is the epistemological position most frequently reflected in intuition development guidebooks, and exemplified in the Eastern wisdom traditions and quantum physics theory upon which they rely. This second position explains why the guidebooks teach that "awakening intuition is inseparable from the development of self-awareness" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 176); it views knowledge as "transactional" (Osberg et al, 2008), with the knower and her context in an ongoing, unfolding relationship. This position clearly suggests that what we know relies inherently on the subjectivity of the knower. Schulz's intuitive interpretation of the meaning of her dream may not have been possible if she had tried to approach it from an objective stance; her subjectivity was required to make sense of the intuitive content.

A similar connection between knowledge and subjectivity has been well-articulated throughout critical philosophical theories, for example in Stanley and Wise's (1991) feminist theory of knowledge that they describe as "irrevocably rooted" (p. 191) in the knower's concrete and practical lived experience. Their theory serves as a critique of approaches to knowledge that "ignore or deny their grounding in ontology; that is, in the interests, competences, experiences and understandings of knowledge-producers" (p. 191). Stanley and Wise (1991) frame their critique as seeking to understand the relationship between body, mind, and emotions, beyond a framework in which the self is usually identified primarily as 'mind', in a dualistic relationship with 'body.' Similarly, contemplative educators Bai, Scott and Donald (2009) offer a theory of knowledge based on the assumption that "the kind of knowledge content we have is vitally dependent on the shape of the container—that is, the knowing person" (p. 327).

Kincheloe (2006) applies this critique to teacher education, suggesting that a missing piece of educators' reflective practice is an ontological critique that would interrogate the very identity structures of individual teaching subjects as a crucial piece of how and what they can know. These critiques - the feminist, the contemplative, and the ontological - look to reinsert the connection between truth and the subject, beyond the Western intellectual, philosophical tradition that encompasses Cartesianism, mind–body dualism, scientism, and positivism.

## Foucault on knowledge and truth

In his own version of this critique, Foucault looked to pre-Christian, Western philosophy to inquire about the connections to be found there between truth and the subject, finding that within Ancient Greek and Roman philosophic schools it was understood that preparatory work on the self is required in order for a subject to "be capable and worthy of acceding to the truth" (Foucault, 1997, p. 279). The idea of personal transformation might seem to be incongruent with the kind of critical philosophy usually associated with Michel Foucault. Foucault's philosophic project largely looked at how institutional discourses such as religion, psychoanalysis, and prison systems "produced and maintained the power structures that existed by limiting existential possibilities" (Infinito, 2003; 163). However his later studies also analyze the limits of freedom, and in his studies on the self and self-transformation Foucault seemed to be advocating that "we moderns learn to make an art of our existence" (Paras, 2005, p. 125), in line with the arts of living pursued in Ancient Greco-Roman philosophic schools, in which practitioners undertook work on the self as a way of enacting their philosophical commitments.

Foucault's analysis of Ancient Greco-Roman care of the self served to shed light on "the relation between truth, becoming a subject, and the practices (*askesis*) that connects them reciprocally" (Flynn, 2005, p. 612). I argue that this same approach towards truth is reflected by the pursuit of intuition development. The orientation to conceptualize intuition as true poses a challenge to the object-oriented understanding of knowledge that is pervasive in a post-Cartesian intellectual culture. Whereas a "Cartesian type of knowledge ... is knowledge (*connaissance*) of a domain of objects" (Foucault, 2001, p. 191), the notion of intuition under consideration here highlights that the alienating mechanism of abstraction does not support access to intuition. Thinking about intuition development as a modality of care of the self and as philosophic practice

in what Flynn (2005) calls the Socratic/existential lineage therefore points me to consider the nature of the subject/self posited by the guidebooks, and to think about the assumptions they make about knowledge and about truth. These conceptualizations have something to teach about educating for intuition, and possibly about intuition itself. In particular, thinking through the process of transformation that is recommended as the way to enhance the intuitive function points to the differences between (a) information vs transformation (practice), (b) contextualized vs decontextualized knowledge (notions of truth), and (c) each lineage's version of 'self;' all of which sheds light on how intuition can be trustworthy, and on what it means to know intuitively from within the transpersonal framework in which the guidebooks arise.

As the inner relationship involving self and world unfolds as a result of IDP, what is possible to know also expands and unfolds. In order to unpack these ideas, and to explore the ways in which IDP works to enhance intuitive function, I want to position the practice of IDP as care of the self, or what Foucault also called a 'technology of the self,' "a technique that human beings use to understand themselves" (1997a, p. 224). As a practice, or technology, work on the self such as IDP "permit[s] individuals to effect by their own means, or with the help of others, a certain number of operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being, so as to transform themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection, or immortality" (Foucault, 1997a, p. 225). In relying on Foucault's understanding of technologies of the self, I will make use of his differentiation between an existentialist lineage of philosophy that values and is enacted by care of the self, and an intellectualist lineage that is focused on 'knowing the self' instead. With respect to intuition development, individuals perform this work in order to enhance their intuitive function - but, as I will show, the nature of the practices means that this work has effects beyond the stated goal: like care of the self, this self-development is a basis for ethical action in the world.

# 4.2 Two lineages on truth, subjectivity, & the practice of philosophy

Foucault identified these two philosophic positions and made them a keynote of analysis in his series of lectures published as *Hermeneutics of the Subject* (HS). He

identifies the Ancient philosophic practice of "care of the self" (*epimeleia heautou*), as "actions by which one takes responsibility for oneself and by which one changes, purifies, transforms and transfigures oneself" (HS11). Identifying care of the self as a relationship between truth and subjectivity, Foucault recognized that the Ancient subject becomes "capable" of truth only after undergoing some form of transformation, or 'conversion': a modification of one's "mode of being" (HS190). He traces a transition in which a new understanding of the pursuit of knowledge came to be, wherein the subject of knowledge was released from the requirement to transform, and the value of care of the self was supplanted by the (more commonly known) value of knowing the self. The hinge of Foucault's argument is the concern that since the 'Cartesian moment,' when knowledge became a "domain of objects" (HS192), it has become possible to be amoral or 'impure' and still know the truth (Foucault, 1997, p. 279). That is, this shift meant that there was no longer any ethical commitment implied in the practice of philosophy.

The different emphases between Hellenistic times' care of self and the Christomodern era's knowledge of self arises, Foucault argues, from those cultures' different understandings of 'self,' and what an inner relationship with the self is supposed to achieve. In the Ancient notion, Foucault references an ideal that "produces effects" and "enlightens the subject" (HS16). Truth transforms the subject, fulfilling the subject as knowledge cannot (HS16). In this sense, opening access to truth through transformative practice means attaining a clearer understanding of oneself that can help inform what one should do, informing action and values. Likewise, in its cultivation of an intuitive subject, IDP transforms the subject to access a truth that produces effects, enlightens a subject, such that the subject attains a clearer recognition of what is true, and what one should do. As Vaughan (1979) writes, "each time you choose to take advantage of a new opportunity, trusting your intuitive sense of what is best for you, you are strengthening this habit, and the choices become easier and clearer. As your choices become increasingly self-determined and well-defined, you can have as much freedom as you choose" (p. 41).

Foucault insisted that care of the self is not a cult of self. It does not insist on uncovering a 'true' or essential self. The work of care of the self is not in search of some determinate, knowable 'true' self, but a subject continually made and unmade. Foucault finds liberatory promise in the Ancient lineage, "which are oriented above all by an autonomy to be gained" (Gros, 1981, p. 511). In aligning with a lineage in which

"subjectivity emerges" (Gros, 1981, p. 524), Foucault problematized the idea that technologies of care of the self are techniques of governmentalization or domination (Gros, 1982, p. 524). Specifically, he argued that "we have to promote new forms of subjectivity through the refusal of this kind of individuality which has been imposed on us for several centuries" (Foucault, 1982, p. 785).

Assuming that care of the self is an enactment of governmentality is an assumption based on a notion of the self that is entrenched in the intellectualist lineage, where it is believed that there is a true or essential self that needs uncovering. In contrast, Foucault's finding is based on the notion of subject held by the Ancients: the subject is a contingent being, not only able to change but *required* to actively pursue transformation as an enactment of the search for fulfilment, in whatever way the subject interprets that fulfilment. Although this approach to transforming subjectivity and to care of the self as a way of living seemed to go away during the Christian era, clearly it did not disappear completely. The contemplative and critically reflexive work that comprises IDP picks up the liberatory promise, and recognizes a subject capable of transformation.

## The existential lineage of care of the self

The expectation of transformation is embedded in intuition development guidebooks. The books are more or less explicit about this: intuition development practice is ultimately about trusting yourself, and to develop that trust, you must attend to yourself in a curious and nurturing way. The pedagogy for intuition teaches practitioners to come into contact with that which does not seem to change (the soul, or 'essential' self) in order to consider who and what we think we are, which both clarifies and changes as a result of the practice. The practice is meant to progressively strip away self deception, through inquiry: What do I believe (or know)? Why do I believe it? How might my lived experience contradict what I claim to believe about experience? In this way, intuition development is in accord with what Flynn (2005) calls the Socratic lineage of philosophy.

This is a difference between existential and intellectual threads of philosophy (Flynn, 2005), highlighted by the difference between care of the self (the Ancient reflection of philosophical practice) and the more familiar know thyself. In the Socratic/existential lineage, knowledge and the knowing self are understood to be inseparable, and who the knower is, matters to what she knows. As an opposing position

to FIDUROD, such a formulation of truth is a point of resistance against an alienating concept of knowledge. Where the scientific formulation works to ensure that the subject is all but irrelevant to what is known, the existential, or Socratic, position validates both inner and outer experience of the knowing subject as crucial to what gets known.

Flynn summarizes Foucault's survey of Ancient philosophic practice as calling attention to the "differentiation between theoretical and practical philosophy as well as the corresponding conception of knowledge and truth claimed to be operative in each alternative" (Flynn, 2005, p. 610). Foucault identifies that Plato's work diverged into two traditions, "namely the 'intellectualist' understanding of self-knowledge based on insight into the nature of the 'true self' in its form or essence and the 'existential' (my term) limb of self-concern that is concrete, practical and the fruit of certain *askesis* that Foucault calls 'practices' or 'technologies of the self'" (Flynn, 2005, p. 612). The principle of 'know thyself' is the intellectualist lineage, dominant in academic philosophy, while what Flynn refers to as the Socratic lineage remains an outsider to academic circles, and is mostly found in "non-academic domains of self-formation or 'spiritual exercise' as catechesis, political training, and psychological counselling" (Flynn, 2005, p. 609). This is the lineage to which IDP belongs: found in popular culture rather than in the halls of academia, excluded from respectable discourse yet with a potency that appeals to mass culture, despite being excluded from educational spaces.

### Care of the Self demands transformation

Care of the self is different from 'know thyself,' the more famous commitment, in that it makes demands of the knower (Flynn, 2005). The demands are of transformation. Care of the self is an "attitude," and "a certain form of attention" (HS10) whereby "we must convert our looking from the outside, from others and the world, etc, towards 'oneself'" (HS11). In particular, practitioners shift their point of focus towards the often-ignored inner direction. Since the acquisition of knowledge was understood to be subjectively and contextually contingent on the holistic well-being of the knowing subject, the subject had to engage in preparations to arrive at truth. Davidson (1995) summarizes the nature of philosophic practice in the ancient context:

"Rather than aiming at the acquisition of a purely abstract knowledge, these exercises aimed at realizing a transformation of one's vision of the world and a metamorphosis of one's personality. The philosopher needed to be trained not only how to speak and debate, but also how to live ... Hence,

the teaching and training of philosophy were intended not simply to develop the intelligence of the disciple, but to transform all aspects of his being – intellect, imagination, sensibility, and will. Its goal was nothing less that an art of living, and so spiritual exercises were exercises in learning to live the philosophical life. Spiritual exercises were *exercises* because they were practical, required effort and training, and were lived; they were *spiritual* because they involved the entire spirit, one's whole way of being. The art of living demanded by philosophy was a lived exercise exhibited in every aspect of one's existence" (Davidson, 1995, p. 21).

Care of the self, the practice of lived (existential) philosophy, is not merely cognitive, nor passive, but makes requirements of its adherents. For Foucault, the address to the Cartesian 'split' seems to be in putting the subject back into our understanding of knowledge through somehow, *being* other than we have been. Since the Cartesian assumptions are embedded into the everyday facts of the built environment, cultural practices, language, etc., recognizing it is necessarily an ongoing practice. In Hadot's language, this is philosophy as a way of life, a lived expression of the pursuit of wisdom.

The distinction, or rather the split between these two lineages of philosophic commitments, sheds light on why intuition has been occluded and why epistemological questions remain the most common challenge to intuition. Ongoing, widespread scepticism about the intuitive mode comes from norms embedded in the intellectualist lineage. In the intellectualist lineage, the subject has to remove their self from the process of knowing. This is inert, objectified knowledge that Foucault identifies as stemming from the 'Cartesian moment.' In an intellectual lineage of philosophy (Flynn, 2005), knowledge exists regardless of the subjectivity of the knower; the lineage that has become hegemonic, and represented by Kincheloe's acronym, FIDUROD. In contrast, IDP is solidly embedded in the existentialist lineage. In the existential lineage of philosophy (Flynn, 2005), knowledge depends on one's way of being, and one's way of being is influenced by what is known. The subject is inserted right back into the knowledge process as an integral component. Knowing this supports why intuition development takes place through care of the self. Knowing this reiterates how intuition can be said to be 'true' and even 'always true.' Knowing this situates intuition development as ethical practice and motivates not only why but how educators can proceed with educating for intuition.

In the lens of truth and subjectivity offered by Foucault in his analysis - that the subject must transform in order to access truth - I find implications for questions about

truth, about the subject, and about the philosophic practice of care of the self that brings about that transformation - implications for understanding intuition, and for understanding what people are doing in order to enhance it. The process of intuition development is a process of self-making. Intuition and its development depend on an assumption that knowing and being are not distinct functions, and instead reveal concretely that the subjectivity of the knower matters to what is (what can be) known. If we think about IDP as existential, philosophic practice, we can establish why educating for intuition using IDP results in the development of more trustworthy, knowing subjects, therefore making intuition a more compelling risk: Intuition is always true if and when it is experienced by a critically reflective, self-aware subject who is also primed to recognize non-discursive content, and to consider that the 'truth' of intuition might not be clear, nor immediate. In other words, it requires work. In the process of enhancing intuitive modes, the transformed subject becomes a more trustworthy intuitive subject. The transformation lets the subject become more masterful in relation to subjective awareness, highlighting the truth available in subjective knowledge, disrupting hegemonic assumptions about epistemological validity.

## 4.3 'The subject must transform': IDP as a descendent of care of the self

Intuition development guidebooks use words such as *awaken* (Vaughan, 1979; Gee, 1999; Schulz, 1998; Choquette, 2007), *unlock* (Day, 1997; Naparstek, 1997) and *discover* (Gee, 1999) to describe their approach to developing intuition. These words evoke their commonly shared understanding that intuition is already available and merely needs to be revealed. That is, it is not the intuitive function itself that needs to be developed, but rather the capability to access or recognize the innate, intuitive sense. Vaughan (1979) clarifies that, "although one cannot *make* intuition happen, there is much that one can do to *allow* it to happen" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 10). Throughout the guidebooks, this process is variously described as tuning in, getting prepared, and making space. Enabling intuition - preparing for it - occurs through transformation rather than knowledge acquisition. A significant shift in attitude is typically required - especially in a cultural context that occludes the intuitive sense, one has to develop an appreciation for its value. A shift in perspective is also required, refocusing attention towards inner

experience and awareness of a range of consciousness that does not usually occupy our attention.

'Awakening' evokes the 'conversion,' or transformation, that is perennially sought by philosophers in the pursuit of awareness and wisdom, in the sense of finding happiness, becoming better, or transcending oneself (which also evokes the notion of enlightenment). Foucault describes how Ancient Greco-Roman philosophic schools like Stoics and Epicureans practised care of the self, as an enactment of philosophy, and argues that work on the self is in effect a practice of subject-making. In this section, I show that it is appropriate to consider IDP a descendent of the philosophical practices of the Ancient philosophy schools, in the sense that IDP also pursues transformation in order to access truth. Like care of the self, IDP adheres to a particular philosophic vision, and then performs work on the self in order to come into better accord with that vision. Although the particular, philosophic vision may differ, such work can be understood as critical, ethical practice that also offers resistance to the hegemony of objective, inert knowledge.

The wisdom sought by Ancient philosophy was a matter of living well, and the work of philosophy was inherently work on the self in pursuit of this goal. In this tradition, the practice of philosophy makes us better on the level "of the self and of being" (Hadot, 1995, Philosophy as a Way of Life, hereafter: PWL, p. 83). Philosophy pursued as care of the self highlights truth over knowledge, making transformation a condition for access to truth (HS29). Inherently, the ancient practice of philosophy presumed that the philosopher would become other than they were as a result of their philosophic practice. In Foucault's words, "there is something that fulfills the subject himself, which fulfills or transfigures his very being" (HS16). In other words, they would transform. In a similar way, intuition development is a transformative, spiritual practice that aims at nothing less than the transformation of the practising subject. Guidebook author Gee (1999) uses the language of 'evolution' to describe this process, writing, "if you really make a commitment to your intuition, you will evolve more deeply and more thoroughly, and gain a greater lucidity about your process of evolution" (p. 16).

Within an academic culture embedded in the hegemony of analysis, intuition is often subject to epistemological problematization – How can it be true? How do you *know* it's true? These questions arise as a result of assumptions about knowledge that

are based in an objectivist, positivist discourse. But IDP conceived as care of the self refocuses that epistemological concern to an ontological one: the truth of intuition is reliant on the coherent, contextual experience of the intuiting subject. As a version of care of the self, IDP demonstrates a connection between truth and the subject. Truth in this case necessarily depends on the subject. The context and the subject determines what is true and relies on a cared-for, investigated subjectivity. Vaughan (1979) clearly acknowledges that the direct access to truth involved in intuition comes as a result of self-development, a consequence of inner practice, when she asserts that, "well developed intuition is a clear and accurate perception of reality, both inner and outer" (p. 29). "Well developed" is significant here; an investment of effort is required for the subject to attain "clear and accurate perception." In this sense, the truth that Vaughan insists on relies on the subject's ability to interpret intuitive experiences in a discerning way, informed by experience and filtered through a cultivated, maturing, self-awareness.

Whenever a subject aims to live in correspondence with a particular vision of the world (PWL58), they come into greater experiential connection with the worldly and metaphysical factors that correspond to that vision. While the goal of intuitive development practices is to become more intuitive, this enhancement is achieved by becoming more present, more aware, and more connected to the experience of being, and to the relational context in which that experience takes place. In effect, IDP is consciousness development that is undertaken to broaden the spectrum of available awareness. This includes so-called 'non-ordinary' states of perception, and a practitioner must become open to content from the unconscious such as archetypal and mythic content that communicates aspects of who we are in a collective or transpersonal sense. Awareness of these realms contributes to a more well-rounded spectrum of knowledge and therefore a more holistic experience of being human. As such, one's frame of reference shifts and broadens to allow for this transformation to occur.

In particular, IDP works through its primary practice of meditation and meditation-like practices. Although meditation is described in various ways, with different goals and activities emphasized, for the most part it begins by situating the practising subject in a different relationship to their self. By focusing inward, and by observing the contents of the mind, the subject can begin to perceive that the self they usually identify with is only a part of the entirety of that self. It is by becoming progressively more aware of the self in

this way, that transformation starts to occur, and access to the intuitive self becomes more available.

With its attention inward, and its focus on self-inquiry, IDP puts the subject's way of being into consideration as a relevant factor in knowledge. As Ambrosio (2008) recognizes, the aim of the ethical practice of care of the self is not merely self-awareness; it is self-formation. Self awareness connotes the notion of a true, knowable identity, whereas self-formation recognizes that the subject's experience is understood to be contingent, under development, multifaceted, and constructed within and between unfolding layers of complex relationships and contexts. Vaughan (1979) describes this complex and multi-layered experience of the self as a "stillpoint" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 198):

"Opening up to intuition implies opening up to the experience of life, whatever it may be. This willingness to experience whatever comes can be supported by the transpersonal awareness that everything is transient, impermanent, and changing. The stillpoint at the centre of your being, the empty matrix of your intuitive experience remains clear and unmoved. It is in this core of your being that you can know what is true for you" (p. 198).

It is through connecting with this centre, that intuition becomes – in Vaughan's words - always true.

### Trusting intuition within a doubt culture

Intuition development guidebooks emphasize the need to learn to trust oneself. This goal highlights that mistrust of intuition is a learned, educated position, and one that can and must be overcome as part of the preparation for intuitive development. As Gawain (2000) teaches, a loss of trust occurs when "we are taught from an early age to try to accommodate those around us, to follow certain rules of behaviour, to suppress our spontaneous impulses, and to do what is expected of us" (p. 39). Eventually, as Day (1997) concurs, such "mental censoring becomes an unconscious, automatic process" (p. 49). Instead of looking or listening within for answers and direction, we learn to look to outside authorities. This model is perpetuated by an education system, and Gawain (2000) points out that many New Age 'seekers' perpetuate this pattern by becoming dependent on teachers or a guru. There are many examples of the prominence of an outward-facing focus throughout a culture that requires objective confirmation for a thing to be considered true.

Complicating the issue of trust is the guidebooks' general presumption that intuition can never be wrong, and is even "true by definition" (Vaughan, 1979). Such a claim to intuition's infallibility may derive from the magical qualities it gets assigned; this happens in guidebooks, and also throughout intellectual culture, which may be a holdover of the idea that spirit is perfect, in contrast to flawed matter. The requirement to develop an attitude of trust recalls the various ways intuition (and the source of intuition) get conceptualized. There are frameworks that suggest intuition arises from a source that is part of the self (such as 'inner wisdom'), and conversely there are those that attribute intuitive knowing to a consciousness outside the self (such as Estés' description of 'the one that knows better' (Estés, p.74), a phrase that suggests intuitive authority rests in a Godhead, Spirit, or Guide, rather than as arising from a part of the self). If the agentic centre of intuition is thought to be located outside of ourselves, that would seem to indicate absolution for any actions arising from intuitive content (Mariechild, 1981).

However, there is widespread agreement among the guidebooks (with some exceptions - see Day, 1997) that the self is transpersonal or even semi-divine. For example, Vaughan (1979) cites Bentov, who suggests that intuition is like "tapping into the reservoir of knowledge contained in the Universal Mind" (p. 171), a source that may be similar to Jung's collective unconscious. Choquette (2004) describes the principle of trusting intuition as a spiritual law, suggesting that practitioners should be "expecting support from the Universe" (p. 157). These claims about intuition's transpersonal source make better sense within a transpersonal frame that recognizes multiple dimensions of consciousness, and the possibility of becoming aware of content within those dimensions. Even in the spiritually-oriented New Age context, belief is an inadequate basis for claiming intuition's truth. The issue of truth is represented as one of access to the transpersonal consciousness where truth can be known, and access to that consciousness results from undertaking the practices of self-development. When the claim is that intuition is a part of the self, access is also a result of a process of selfdevelopment. The difference between the two claims concerning intuition's source (within the self, or external to the self) dissolves within a transpersonal frame that views consciousness as a continuum. Perhaps functionally, the different approaches to the source of intuition lie in the degree of agency each model authorizes subjects to claim in terms of that knowledge, and the extent of the demands made on the knower, to engage in inner preparatory work.

The issue of trust is further complicated by a culture that values doubt as an essential feature of the scientific method. Because trust is so contrary to our usual, valued stance, intuition development pedagogy exists as a form of resistance to the entrainment we are used to. Taking on a default attitude of trust instead of doubt goes against the hegemonic direction of epistemological authority, which seeks an external source of authorization. Trust also disrupts normative assumptions about the psyche (where it is assumed the unconscious is inherently tricky and unreliable); and beliefs about intelligence, which relies on judgement and values doubt (the 'Cartesian legacy'). There is a foundational cultural assumption that what is real is necessarily external to us, and this is ultimately dehumanizing. Therefore the attention that intuition development pedagogy pays to the inner world, and to considering what is and what is not trustworthy is healing.

With IDP, the transformation required is in our relationship with ourselves, as well as an attitudinal change to both value and trust intuitive experience. Learning to trust one's intuitive faculties involves suspending judgement, and also adopting a hopeful, or optimistic attitude about the likelihood of receiving good, intuitive information (see Gawain, 2000, p. 46). Practitioners work to become both clear and authentic (Naparstek, 1997, p. 166), and hence coherent in their self presentation. This authenticity - not whatever is claimed to be the source of intuition - provides a basis upon which the truth of intuitive content can be judged. Investing trust in intuition creates an iterative process, whereby success feeds back and becomes evidence for further trust in the intuitive mode.

Similarly, introspection cultivates a relationship with the self that builds trustworthiness via excavating unconscious elements, bringing them to light and hence minimizing their shadow. So intentionally developing the intuitive function feeds a feedback loop that supports a more coherent self, and further trust in the intuitive process. Like scientific process, where verification of hunches is achieved through experimenting, in everyday life, we likewise follow up a hunch and see if it's right. Similarly, an individual subject is always responsible for their actions, even those arising as a result of intuitive experience. However, the crux of how intuition becomes true (in this confident sense of 'always true') relies on the breadth of self-awareness involved in intuition development.

## 4.4 How the practices make intuition trustworthy: unpacking contemplative practice

In Chapter Three, I described the content of New Age self-help books that teach people to activate and enhance their psychic, or intuitive, function. Within these books,<sup>5</sup> intuition is represented as a function of consciousness that can be enhanced when certain states of mind are intentionally cultivated. Additionally, the books contain recommendations for a coherent program of practices along with theoretical underpinnings that direct readers' self-development to more consciously and deliberately engage with the intuitive mode. This intuition development pedagogy (IDP) is comprised of contemplative, reflective, and imaginative practices that inculcate an intuitive attitude, or intuitive way of being. Much of the pedagogy is centred around heightening sensitivity and receptivity: cultivating an openness to hearing the inner voice (Estés, 1992; Jagla, 1994), and a willingness to act (at least tentatively, to test the validity) on that awareness (Gee, 1999).

The pedagogy for intuition entails expanding and refining awareness on a number of levels: to one's embodied, sensory experience, the contents of one's thoughts, and the subtleties of the flow of dynamic life energy (*chi* or *prana*) through one's body. Practitioners of intentional intuition development are counselled to develop attention to the whole situated context of their person, for example through self-reflective exercises that enable them to find out what intuition feels like for themselves, so that it can be recognized and integrated as a useful, personal factor. This programme of practice adds up to becoming increasingly relaxed within oneself, as well as progressively releasing attachment to thinking, analyzing, or interpreting. The practices prepare a practitioner's consciousness to more readily access the intuitive mode, through practising mindful attention, receptivity to the symbolic imagination, and self-inquiry (objectivizing the objects of one's mind), as well as generally paying attention to inner experience, including one's personal, intuitive 'tells' (signals from the body that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> A complete listing of the guidebooks referenced is available in Appendix A.

identify the intuition as meaningful, a development that takes place through practising inner discernment).

Since maps for intuitive content are individual and subjective, practitioners additionally work to develop literacy with their personal and cultural symbolic structures so as to be able to interpret non-linear and non-linguistic content in meaningful ways. This hermeneutic aspect of the pedagogy takes what has been perceived by the attention and awareness practices, and seeks to interpret and understand it in a reasonable way. Importantly, all of these practices require a willingness to trust one's experience, requiring development of the habits that give rise to advancing selfknowledge, including accommodating to uncertainty and a willingness to risk being wrong. The subject turns her attention inward in order to entrain and maintain relaxation and attention, enabling an enhanced experience of intuition and the subjective, inner climate more generally. In this section, I further unpack how meditation in particular supports the development of the intuitive function, and how that relates to the discussion of truth and the subject I am unfolding. I explore why contemplative practice is able to transform the subject to access trustworthy intuition, or in other words how meditation acts as a transformative practice of subject formation that allows the subject to access truth.

## **Meditation for altering consciousness**

One of the main approaches to this transformation as recommended for IDP is meditation. Meditation explicitly aims to alter one's state of consciousness, and contemplative, transformative practices such as meditation let the practitioner access non-cognitive or non-discursive aspects of experience not available through conceptual awareness (Bai & Scott, 2011). Intentional development of non-discursive awareness allows space and receptivity for non-linear, and non-rational forms of knowledge. It primes awareness to identify intuitive experience as meaningful.

Throughout this dissertation, I have been seeding the idea that a transpersonal framework is appropriate for studying intuition because it recognizes and values a range of experiences and observations that do not traditionally get studied or even thought to be real. This framework has a complex way of accounting for intuitive experiences as beyond expertise, including that consciousness can be collective, is not necessarily only the product of material and biological processes (Grof, 2012; Friedman & Hartelius,

2013), and it also recognizes that consciousness "transcends the boundaries of the body/ego and the usual limitations of linear time and three-dimensional space" (Grof, 2012, p. 147). Such a perspective presumes that contact with a collective unconscious and a cosmic consciousness are parts of the inner range of personal experience. It includes these so-called 'non-ordinary' experiences within the spectrum of human experience, whereas traditional psychology has often neglected to account for these. The hermeneutic self-cultivation involved in intuition development enhances the conditions for intuitive experience by priming the practising subject to connect more readily to these non-ordinary states of consciousness.

Meditation works by consolidating one's energies (Bai, 2015, p. 141), or in other words by developing coherence of one's internal (psychic or spiritual) energies, enabling quietude, peace, and more subjective experience of well-being (e.g. flow). Heesoon Bai and her collaborators have explored the educational implications of pursuing inner work for transforming consciousness, pointing out the role of such practice for overcoming an objectivist paradigm and the dualistic underpinnings of alienated Western culture. For example, Bai et al (2009) take the position that when education is focused on knowledge and information, objectified and alienated consciousness become entrenched. Bai and Scott (2011) argue that objectified consciousness, which perceives a duality between the self and the world/everything else, is not rectified by conceptualization; it must be integrated through experiencing the interconnected, non-dualistic realm. In other words, contemplation involves experiencing a quality of Being or Presence that reflection or sense experience alone cannot reach.

By recommending contemplative practice, IDP involves the practitioner in reframing how they *experience* 'consciousness' - including its limitations and its resources – and importantly, initiates the process of extracting the individual from their previous unconscious identifications with cultural biases, thereby effectively constituting resistance to the dominant culture, including its widespread aversion to the 'parapsychological.' Non-discursive, contemplative practice can progressively lead a practitioner to experience the self in an inter-subjective (transpersonal) way; that is, not as a discrete unit but a relational, contextual one. Through contemplative practice, mind-body duality can be experienced as a construct, and inter-subjectivity can be felt directly, with no need to take some authority's word for it. As Bai and Scott (2011) explain, "there are experiences that take us right out of the ordinary dualistic consciousness that

categorically separates self from non-self, and the knower and the known: non-dualistic, unitive, and typically timeless experiences that profoundly change, even if just for a moment, our perception and our understanding of who we are (p. 137).

At the non-discursive level of consciousness, we can connect with a larger reality and may be more likely to experience a sense of wonder, or the sacred. In other words, through meditation we can come to cosmological awareness. Content that arises from the unconscious, and from transpersonal realms (variously called collective unconscious, extended consciousness, non-ordinary consciousness, etc), often needs translation from non-discursive to discursive form. This makes sense of why, throughout IDP, there is a particular emphasis on training one's consciousness to make meaning from symbolic imagery, embodied sensation, and other forms of non-discursive experience, as opposed to relying on the words and concepts we have been educated to prioritize. As a non-discursive practice, meditation works to break the habitual intellectualizing in which modern, Western people are generally trained from very young, as we learn to value rational intellectualism above other states of consciousness. This training in rational intellectualism is enacted through constant privileging of intellectual, rational discourse in most areas of education (with the exception - perhaps - of the 'creative arts').

### **Meditation for self-awareness**

Underlying the practices of IDP is the assumption that "awakening intuition is inseparable from the development of self-awareness" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 176). To achieve this awareness, IDP calls attention to what is being experienced in the present moment, but crucially, it also calls to attention the one who is experiencing, and the existential context that situates the experiencing subject. Discernment of subjective, intuitive truth requires that one become conscious of the tendencies, habits, and proclivities of the everyday self that frame the interpretation of one's experience. To this end, a good deal of the inner work of IDP aims at coming to awareness of one's own inner map: the coordinates one relies on to recognize and then make sense of experience. It is in light of this pursuit of self-awareness that Vaughan (1979) insists that "meditation is the single most powerful means of increasing intuition" (p. 177). By habituating a more relaxed but aware inner state, contemplative activities like meditation serve to detach us from external input, and affirm for each practitioner that there is

indeed 'something' within, we are neither empty, nor blank. This awareness, gained through meditative practice, acts as resistance to the notion that the outer world is the only reality and further, that it is the same for all.

Whether through meditation, or through other introspective practice, the subject investigates her own mind in order to identify projections, archetypal structures, biases, and habits, using reflection to be a witness to herself, as well as identify frames of reference: attitudes and assumptions about consciousness and its potentials; and specific, personal quirks and habits, especially those that are usually unconscious. Readers are cautioned to "remember that self-deception is a formidable obstacle" (Vaughan 1979, p. 32), and so it is necessary that one "learn to distinguish genuinely intuitive hunches from those which are simply a product of anxiety or wishful thinking" (Vaughan 1979, p. 59). But at the same time, the effort of meditation does not merely seek a knowable, inner self. This is not a practice of self-knowledge, but one of care of the self, of self-development or self-cultivation. As such, it is exploratory. As Hadot describes the "movement of interiorization" (PWL211), underlying all practices of the self, is "inseparably linked to another movement, whereby one rises to a higher psychic level" (211). Through this second movement is made available "a new way of being-inthe-world, which consists in becoming aware of oneself as a part of nature" (211). To become aware of oneself in this way is to become increasingly aware of one's situatedness in a cosmic context.

Practitioners of meditation learn to turn the gaze inward and pull back from engagement in the world, stimulus of passions. This is like the Ancient context of philosophy, where the pursuit of wisdom is framed as a form of control over the passions, which in turn enables an ease, or happiness. Foucault describes this goal: "never allowing ourselves to be induced to make an involuntary movement at the behest of or through the instigation of an external impulse. Rather, we must seek the point at the centre of ourselves to which we will be fixed and in relation to which we will remain immobile" (HS207). IDP directs practitioners to gaze within, to observe thoughts, judgements, assumptions. There is a turning towards (or looking for) the soul centre, enabled by becoming quiet instead of listening to the usual overwhelming flow of thoughts. Such fixed attention is fundamental to the Stoics' spiritual exercise (PWL84), which also used meditation in an "attempt to control inner discourse, in an effort to

render it coherent" (PWL85). Wisdom (or enlightenment, or happiness) is attained by achieving a still centre.

Many meditation practices begin with focusing attention by way of following the breath, initiating a stance of witnessing the inner processes while limiting conscious interference in those processes. This focusing of attention on the breath allows the recognition that there is some aspect to the self that is autonomous from what we know as consciousness. The individual's egoic self (the part of the self that is usually identified as 'me') is revealed to be only a part of the 'self,' and no longer the centre of the experiential universe, since it does not control, and cannot control, the act of breathing. Cultivating that awareness, we can seat ourselves in a different relation to both the inner and outer world. This objective ('witness') stance is used to gain perspective, to see oneself within a bigger contextual frame of reference.

'Awakening the inner witness' means experientially dis-identifying from internal states in order to observe them. This process is key to intuitive knowing which "transcends distinctions between subject and object, knower and known" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 24). By enabling experience of a non-dual reality, the contemplative work of IDP lets practitioners experience the kind of awareness that informs the intuitive function, thereby exposing the contingency of a framework that separates knower from known. Bergson points to this contingency when he asks, "who can say where individuality begins and ends, whether the living being is one or many, whether it is the cells which associate themselves into the organism or the organism which dissociates itself into cells? In vain we force the living into this or that one of our molds. All the molds crack. They are too narrow, above all too rigid, for what we try to put into them" (Bergson, 1944, p. xx). Here Bergson is making the point that our conceptions are too small to contain the enormity of consciousness. Rational process is always less than what can be experienced. If we limit what we can know to the scope of rationality, we limit the whole experience of life. The point of meditation, then, is to open out the field of experience, to come to grasp that which is currently beyond what we already know.

Using a definition of critique provided by Foucault, "the art of not being governed quite so much" (2007, p. 45), not accepting the truth of an authority, the transformative work of IDP is, in addition to a spiritual practice of transformation, it is also a critical practice. Through this work, a critical attitude is applied to the self – our behaviour and

also psycho-spiritual make-up are under consideration. Foucault writes, critique is "a certain way of thinking, speaking and acting, a certain relationship to what exists, to what one knows, to what one does, a relationship to culture..." (2007, p. 42). This is a practice in which one seeks alternatives to what is currently available (Lemke, 2011). In particular, in this analysis, critique seeks the limits of subjectivity. Care of the self (and likewise IDP) works to cultivate one's subjectivity as both an expression of, and in pursuit of, freedom. Moreover, the whole endeavour of care of the self aims toward seeing what *is,* in order to transform the situation (our 'self', our outlook, our way of being) for the better. It engages individuals to resist against imposed limitations to that subjectivation.

## 4.5 Caring for the self as ethical practice

With his turn to care of the self, in which Foucault's career shifts from a focus on power to a focus on ethics (Gros, 2001, p. 508), he positioned work on the self - 'care of the self' - as an expression of freedom within the nexus of truth-subject-power he investigated throughout his career. In his pursuit of new forms of subjectivity, Foucault turns to pre-Christian cultures and how they went about cultivating subjectivity in the pursuit of wisdom. Foucault conceptualizes Ancient philosophic practice as work that is undertaken to transform the practising subject in order that they can access truth. He studies the transformative practices that were performed within Ancient philosophic schools as a jumping off point to consider the ways humans constitute themselves as subjects (Foucault, 2007a), and thus, as ethical actors in the unfolding of their own lives. In this section, I suggest that, like other forms of care of the self, IDP is similarly ethical: it focuses on the self so as to be more coherent, in an effort to live in accordance with what one believes. Furthermore, this work on the self has effects in the world that arise as a result of the transformation.

Practices of the self are inherently ethical, in that they encode for people how to live well in an authentic way, as opposed to acting by adherence to external social or moral codes (Gros, 2001, p. 530). Therefore, in Ancient Greece, Foucault tells us, it was thought mandatory for any leader worth following to have done work on the self. Foucault refers back to *Alcibiades*, and the first mention of care of the self (Foucault, 1997, p. 255), where the concern was preparation for political leadership. Followers of

subsequent philosophic schools such as the Stoics and Epicureans undertook care of the self in order to be better leaders, or better citizens. But beyond the instrumental goal of preparing leaders, at a certain point, the practices shifted from a pedagogical matter of learning how to be a better leader, to an ontological matter of learning how to be a better person, for one's own sake, to 'live as one ought to live' (Foucault, 1997, p. 260). Care of the self became an ideal of philosophy and for philosophers more generally - anyone wanting to live with more integrity, authenticity, and intention should pursue care of the self. Therefore, as an art of living, taking care of the self became an existential imperative (HS206).

## Hadot's objection

In a dialogue that occurred through text, Hadot accused Foucault of 'bracketing' – conveniently neglecting - a concept of the self as soul in order to focus on a subject-self and the aesthetic modifications one can make in order to live better (PWL208). Where Hadot emphasizes care of the self as a spiritual pursuit of finding more depth to experience, Foucault prioritizes the quest for freedom, and suggests that care of the self is an enactment of resistance against imposed limits to one's subjectivity. Hadot objects to the lack of focus on "the feeling of belonging to a whole" (PWL208) that is, he insists, essential to the Ancient care of the self. In one sense, care of the self *is* an aesthetic concern; valuing the pragmatic goal of living well, in the sense of attaining ease and freedom. This is true in intuition development guidebooks as well, where the development of intuition is connected to the promise of ease, and success (cf Chase, 1960; Gawain, 2000; Choquette, 2013). But living well is not merely aesthetic, as in both care of the self, and IDP, there is also an existential aim of living meaningfully.

The concept of 'self' under consideration here is significant: within a framework that understands self-hood as socially constructed, care of the self can easily mean aesthetic cultivation, like constructing oneself as an identity, a brand, or pursuing self-development in a never-to-be-satisfied quest for bigger, better, faster, more. However by 'self,' Hadot argues, the Ancients meant something more like 'higher self,' or soul, in pursuit of "the feeling of belonging to a whole" (PWL208). The whole in Hadot's sense is an ontological matter of belonging to "the world of nature," or the feeling that one has a place in the cosmic order (PWL211). For Ancient Greeks and Romans, self cultivation thus involved engaging the 'soul' in the world such that it affected and was affected by it

(Davidson, 1995, p. 24). Like a number of other holistic, spiritual systems, Ancient care of the self resists a concept of the subject as individualized, and isolated in favour of one that is contextual, inter-subjective, and always in relationship. The effect of care of the self, then, was to "bring guidance in our relationship to ourselves, to the cosmos, and to other human beings" (PWL274).

Hadot would likely refer to soul as something unchanging, but it is just as reasonable to understand the soul as contextual and contingent; like other aspects of the self, the higher self too evolves through inner practice. I do not see a fundamental difference between Hadot and Foucault here, just a different emphasis. In his focus on practices, Foucault is not ignoring the interior dimension of subjectivity, just focusing on the development of an emergent coherence that meets the world. Both are concerned with the effects of inner practice in the world. Hadot focuses more on the consequences with relation to the world and Foucault focuses on the freedom it brings to an individual.

## A reflexive process

In acknowledging the curative and therapeutic functions of care of the self, when taken on as a lifelong practice (HS496), Foucault also acknowledged that care of the self empowers individuals to be more engaged in the world as actors, and not just as experiencers of their own lives. The ongoing work of care of the self is not merely an interior concern. In a reflexive process, the engagement of care of the self progressively changes our experience of being ourselves. This gets reflected in changed ways of engaging in the world, which consequently changes how we experience life in the world, and hence, our self. This experience then informs the process of inner practice. While the practice is done on or to or with the self, it is experienced in relation. Cremonesi (2015) identified that conceiving of care of the self in the context of a contemporary ethics shifts the focus of ethics from a concern with the other to a concern with the self, with the starting point for this ethical focus being the work of self-transformation (Cremonesi, 2015). No ethical agency is possible without having done work on the self, and the consequence of not attending to the self with care "is an impoverished self who must accept his or her subjectivity (unaware that this identity has been defined for him or her) and accept the relations with others and the world that are proper to that subjectivity" (Infinito, 2003, p. 163).

The goals of care of the self are related to the transformative and ethical processes of *individuation*, making what is unconscious, conscious; and of *subjectivation*, cultivating the self as an agentic subject of one's own life. Work on the self is done to perceive the boundaries of one's context, in order to broaden them (and this can apply to external factors like identity categories, and internal factors like attitude). Foucault clearly recognizes that this work is 'spiritual' (HS15), defining spirituality as "the subject's attainment of a certain mode of being and the transformations that the subject must carry out on itself to attain this mode of being" (Foucault, 1997b, p. 294). In *Hermeneutics of the Subject*, Foucault expands this definition to note that spirituality in the Ancient West has three characteristics (HS16): First, a subject does not have the *right* to truth but has to transform in order to access it. Secondly, such transformation can occur through love, or through work/practice (*askesis*). Finally, it is the truth that enlightens the subject.

Where Foucault says 'truth', Hadot refers to 'wisdom'. In both cases, wisdom is not a matter of knowledge, at least, not knowledge of objects as distinct and separate from ourselves. For Hadot, wisdom is an embodied, lived, experience of being, a "mode of being and living" that corresponds to "the vision of things as they are, the vision of the cosmos as it is in the light of reason" (PWL58). For Hadot, "interiorization is a going beyond oneself; it is universalization" (PWL211). The point of the exercises of care of the self, Hadot insists, is that "we should be able to attain wisdom; that is, to a state of complete liberation from the passions, utter lucidity, knowledge of ourselves and of the world" (PWL103). Hadot explains that "wisdom is nothing more than the vision of things, the vision of the cosmos as it is in the light of reason, and wisdom is also nothing more than the mode of being and living that should correspond to this vision" (PWL58). The cosmic dimension is an integral piece of the Ancients' worldview (PWL208), where philosophers would pursue wisdom in order to bring their self into harmony, between the cosmos and one's way of being.

Within Ancient schools, practitioners aimed to 'live in the present moment,' applying "attentive concentration on the present moment in order to enjoy it or live it in full consciousness" (PWL59). While each school had a different sense of what it meant to "be defined by an ideal of wisdom" (PWL59), they shared the goal of striving to live in accord with Nature, or 'Universal Reason' as a means of self-realization and self-improvement (PWL102). Hadot explains that for the Stoic, "doing philosophy" means

both practising how to live freely and to live consciously. "Consciously, in that we pass beyond the limits of individuality, to recognize ourselves as a part of the reasonanimated *cosmos*. Freely, in that we give up desiring that which does not depend on us and is beyond our control, so as to attach ourselves only to what depends on us: actions which are just and in conformity with reason" (PWL86).

## Care of the self is existential practice

By positioning the self as a centre of concern, care of the self acts as a resistance against decontextualization of knowledge. The pursuit of 'conformity with reason' – wisdom or enlightenment that aims to access "cosmic consciousness" or contemplation of the Whole (PWL97), is a decidedly existential and spiritual aim that offers existential solace – the feeling that one is situated in a context larger than the individual self, and larger even than the material world. The technologies or practices that support subject formation, do so by connecting the subject to a bigger context, beyond the limits of individuality, to identify with what Hadot (PWL102) refers to as universal reason. By the dual movement of interiorization and exteriorization, as the worldview gets larger, even to the extent of including the whole of the cosmos, the inner world also expands, deepening into parts of the psyche that were previously unavailable and possibly unknown to the everyday consciousness. By moving the self into accord with whatever is understood as universal reason, spiritual practices are "a return to the self, in which the self is liberated from the state of alienation" (PWL103).

Care of the self as philosophical practice is existentially fulfilling. As a practice, this enactment of philosophy may thus be a way out of the "existential death" (Kincheloe, 2008, p. 120) brought on by de-contextualized knowledge. From a transpersonal perspective that values transformation, we would expect to see practitioners committed to pursuing a way of life that "directly and proactively addresses and promotes the need for human transformation" (Daniels, 2013, p. 24). This need for transformation is informed by the value of self-transcendence, the idea that an individual can become better; more connected, more mature, and achieve a greater sense of psycho-spiritual well-being; this goal is found consistently throughout transformative practice, such as in IDP, where the work supports practitioners to become 'more of who we are' (Vaughan, 1979, p. 10).

When the Ancients pursued transformation in order to access truth, they closed a gap between knower and known. Foucault's study of the transformation of the relationship between truth and the subject points to a similar discursive disruption as that made accessible through contemplative practice. Such practice enables experience of the world as "a living, breathing, constantly changing, implicit, interconnected, interpenetrating, unknown, intuitive, sensuous, embodied, and empathic world" (Bai, 2015, p. 141). With its commitment to transformation, transpersonal theory evokes philosophic practice in the Socratic tradition - based on the belief that one must work on the self, and care for the self and participate in the construction of the self such that the self can come to know what there is to know. Practices that enable the experience of non-ordinary consciousness assist us in our work to change our way of being.

In addition to representing an existential longing: to know oneself, and to be more agentic as an ethical agent, within the Greco-Roman philosophical understanding, the goal of self-cultivation practices was sometimes stated as a way to get hold of the passions so as not to be ruled by them, and in turn to become more able to act in accordance with whatever is deemed to be a good life. Articulating this idea, Foucault draws on a Pythagorean text to describe "the flight from all irrational action and discourse" as "primordial preparation for a life without regrets" (HS215). This work was initially driven by the desire to be more reliable in one's relations (a social, leadership motivation). In contemporary work on the self, the underlying motivation is similar. IDP quidebooks appeal to intuition as the wise aspect of oneself, holding "a place of tremendous importance in relation to our physical and spiritual well-being, our creative self-expression, and our ability to understand ourselves, others, and the experience of life itself" (Gee, 1999, p.3); touting the side benefits: "engaging in this process might make an even better human being of you, because it will ask you to open your heart in order to gain access" (Naparstek, 1997, p. 3); likewise, "intuition can empower you to be productive and active in any situation" (Day, 1996, p. 12).

Hadot also recognizes that spiritual exercises are a remedy for alienation. Philosophy, he argues, "raises the individual from an inauthentic condition of life, darkened by unconsciousness and harassed by worry, to an authentic state of life, in which he attains self-consciousness, an exact vision of the world, inner peace, and freedom" (PWL83). The transformation achieved through this practice liberates the individual from the illusion of individuality, and also from the isolation that goes with that

assumption, such that there is joy in transcending the self (PWL207). The subject comes to recognize an ecological sense of context within which one can orient to, and from. As Hadot writes, "all spiritual exercises are, fundamentally, a return to the self, in which the self is liberated from the state of alienation into which it has been plunged by worries, passions, and desires. The 'self' liberated in this way is no longer merely our egoistic, passionate individuality: it is our moral person, open to universality and objectivity, and participating in universal nature or thought" (PWL103). Hadot's use of "spiritual" here refers to an existential sense, encompassing transformation not of thought or intellect (PWL82) but the level "of the self and of being" (PWL83). Again, this was the goal of philosophy. It was not an intellectual exercise but a way of living (Nehemas, 1998, p. 164). Hadot further explains that the goal is not only to know the Good, but to "become identical with it" (101). That is, to become goodness; to enact goodness; to do good. In this understanding, the pursuit of wisdom was not to acquire knowledge but to live well, and to think of oneself as having lived well. This is an ideal that is consistent between Ancient Western and Eastern philosophic traditions. Hadot traces it at least to Plato, and similarly stated goals are found in contemporary mindfulness (with its lineage in Buddhism), framed as the pursuit of happiness, or enlightenment.

## Contemplative practice evokes an ethical attitude

Intuition is frequently cited in the literature as necessary for inculcating a more ethical way of being in the world (Anderson, 2011; O'Sullivan, 1999). This position presumes that there is a connection between the individual transformation that is sought in the pursuit of becoming more intuitive (or, more generally, through the practice of care of the self) and a broader socio-cultural transformation that might coincide with more people becoming more intuitive. When individuals pursue an enhanced intuitive function through work on the self, they do so by increasingly enacting an intuitive *way of being*. They take on an attitude of caring about and noticing intuition, which supports intuitive development, and they take on an approach to awareness that signals heightened sensitivity to intuitive content. But beyond intuitive capabilities, because intuition development procures a change in the subject's *way of being*, we can expect those changes to have effects in the world. Ancient Greco-Roman philosophic schools knew this: they performed exercises in order to be better able to live in accord with whatever they deemed a good life. IDP works by building a capacity to perceive intuitively:

holistically, symbolically, and non-discursively. Therefore, we might expect that the intuitive 'attitude' works against a Cartesian paradigm of knowledge.

Within a framework of understanding elicited by inner meditation practice, a different ethics is implicated (Bai & Banack, 2006). Reminding us that our ontology (perception of how the world is) constructs our way of being in the world, our ethical practice, or lack of it, Bai and Banack (2006) argue that an ethical position can emerge from the realization of deep interconnection that one comes to experience through contemplative practice. Contemplative practice "allows us to ... perceive reality in a new way" (Miller, 1994, p. 26). This shift of perception sometimes occurs literally; Bai (2015) describes an experience in which her visual perception became changed as a result of a meditative experience. From this position, "one perceives, senses, and feels the other's reality, even if vicariously" (p. 11). That is, the self-other boundary is thinned, and an empathic and intuitive awareness becomes more available.

On the other hand, a reductionist, deterministic, mechanical understanding of the reality of the world "disposes us to moral fundamentalism by virtue of objectivist language, imposing categorical and linear thinking as absolutes" (Bai & Banack, 2006, p. 7). Bai (2011) is specific about the real, ethical effect supported by dualistic consciousness when she argues that "to be educated into the modern Western worldviews, discourses, and practices means to embody these dualisms and to live out their ethical consequences" (p. 137). Similarly noting "the general problem of fragmentation of human consciousness," (Bohm, 1980, p. xi) Bohm proposes that widespread and pervasive distinctions between people originate in a "kind of thought that treats things as inherently divided, disconnected, and 'broken up' into yet smaller constituent parts" (p. xi). In other words, the Cartesian paradigm of knowledge, "knowledge of a domain of objects" (HS191) has real effects in the world, and these are not all desirable. One of these effects is to believe (and indeed, experience) the subjectself as distinct and separate from other subjects, which is ultimately a source of existential loneliness and alienation. In contrast, through cultivating an intuitive stance, which - like other contemplative practice - intentionally cultivates a non-discursive, nondualistic attitude, one can come to experience, or at least recognize, that we are actually connected.

#### An alternative ethical construction

While the practice of meditation can serve to resist modern Western binary constructions, a post-Cartesian, relational discourse can be illustrated by any number of examples; I briefly include one here as an illustration of a wisdom based, lived philosophy that evokes an approach to truth and subjectivity that is similar to the critical, ethical one I have described as supportive of intuition development. Ahenakew, Andreotti, Cooper and Hireme (2014) describe an ethical "practice of attention" that is based on an understanding of the self similar to the transpersonal subject found in the discourse of IDP. What they call 'Grandmother Ethics' "emerges from being, rather than knowledge, thus ethical principles are lived, not talked about. These ethical principles are not based on the Cartesian premise that thinking can engineer predictable behaviour, which requires the repeated declaration of belief in moral principles and engenders a normative morality" (p. 225). Rather, Grandmother Ethics are "based on an ontology that de-centres the (anthropocentric and Cartesian) self, engendering a practice of attention and observance in terms of nurturing balance and allowing the world to teach" (p. 225). Grandmother Ethics is a decidedly holistic framework, inclusive of the needs, teachings, and wisdom of ancestors, and of relationships, as well as of individual (human) subjects. It envisions an inclusive and non-dualistic umbrella of ethical consideration, including inner and outer landscapes (community and ancestors), and recognizes a range of opportunity for the lived experience of wisdom through care of self, where self is not limited to the individual, agentic subject. Crucially, while Western knowledge is understood as a human endeavour, "Indigenous knowledge [that informs Grandmother Ethics] comes from 'Being', an intimate visceral and psychic relationship with specific places, spaces, sounds and faces on Earth (and beyond)" (p. 222).

Ahenakew et al (2014) describe their larger project as aiming to enlarge frames of reference in order to reposition and de-provincialize Indigenous struggles, and to show that Indigenous frameworks are more than relevant now (Ahenakew et al, 2014). They identify their research as about "creating generative spaces where alternative relationships between knowing and being can emerge (p. 218). In order to do this, they "have prioritized ontological and meta-physical claims of an un-narrativizable reality not articulable by the Cartesian subject" (p. 218). Moral expectations derived from Grandmother Ethics are "determined...by an unbounded awareness of the connectedness of all things" (p. 222). This kind of awareness may be accessible within a non-discursive state of mind that can occur with contemplative practice (Bai, 2015). As

an alternative to the Cartesian legacy, Grandmother Ethics points to 'new' (although as the authors recognize, they are not new – just epistemologically excluded) ways of being that arise from an orientation that is sensitive to context, that configures the self-beyond-the-individual, and that does not segregate that context of the knowing subject from the act of knowledge.

The subject of this kind of ethics is not an exclusively autonomous moral agent, nor source of ideas (Bowers, 2012). Bowers (2012) suggests that in opposition to a Cartesian, decontextualized version of intelligence, 'eco-intelligence' involves "relying on the senses, awareness of ongoing changes in local contexts, awareness of the takenfor-granted assumptions of the culture" (p. 309). This is the kind of awareness that supports intuitive experience. Like transpersonal theory, which recognizes the psyche as a "local aspect of an interconnected whole" (Hartelius, et.al., 2013, p. 9), and the goal pursued through philosophy as a way of life (to become aware of cosmic consciousness), these kinds of articulations resist a 'Cartesian' dualism that conceives a distinction between mind and matter, between self and other, and between human and other manifestations of consciousness. As IDP works to weaken these distinctions, a new (yet old) ethical framework is available, to take its place.

## 4.6 IDP as transformative education: notes on an ongoing process

By hinging his discussion on truth, and on the transformation that the subject must undergo to access it, Foucault highlights an understanding of subjectivity as a process rather than a quest for a 'true' self that can be uncovered. If we do not deliberately engage with our experience, down to engaging with the fact that we experience our lives in particular ways, then we remain reactive in our relation to the world. On the other hand, care of the self is an engaged enactment of subject-formation: the more we care for the self, the more we participate in constructing agency and therefore increase the amount of freedom we can experience. In this section, I suggest that practices like intuition development, that comprise care of the self, can be used to enact transformative education.

Any undertaking of self-cultivation practices begins with the idea that the self is something one can work on in order to improve. If self development (or transformation) is possible, then the self can not be merely a static, pre-determined entity, but must instead be dynamic, and constituted in relationship to itself, others, and the world. The subject is a form of power, a dynamic playing field where restrictions and productions are enacted. If we think of the self in this way, as a "site of experimentation and exploration" (Infinito, 2003, p. 167), then choices we make about the ways we conduct ourselves can be taken up mindfully as spaces of potential for possibility and change. This self is meaningless outside of its relationships and identity positions. This is not the individual, atomistic selfhood of "European Christomodernism" (Kincheloe, 2003, p. 183), but rather a self in process: ensouled, and emergent, and always, also, in context. This is a self that builds agency, increasing its own freedom which can then be leveraged to undergo transformation to new ways of being, doing, and knowing, in a recursive process supported by ongoing practice.

The early Greco-Roman philosophic schools provide a model of culture that values care of the self, and offer a contrast to the dominant, contemporary philosophic attitude, wherein attention to the self is often discursively positioned as narcissistic or self-indulgent. It can be tempting to view inner work suspiciously, and it could be argued that pursuing contemplative practice may only add up to a selfish pursuit, offering a sanitized version of well-being for the individual only, and ultimately contributing to a form of governance, where governing means "to structure the possible field of action of others" (SP790). For example, one can find numerous – and lauded – examples of mindfulness being used in schools as behaviour intervention alongside its stated goal of well-being. Mindfulness programming has been accused of inducing such compliance, by helping people to 'bear the unbearable' (Krupka, 2015), and diverting concern away from real problems in the world.

Foucault addresses a version of this critique early on in *The Hermeneutics of the Subject*, when he acknowledges that positioning care of the self as an enactment of ethics can seem like a paradox within a contemporary culture more likely to view the notion of working on the self as egotistical, or as a form of disengagement (HS13). Foucault clarifies that to care for oneself "does not mean simply being interested in oneself, nor does it mean having a certain tendency to self-attachment or self-fascination" (Foucualt, 1997, p. 269). For Foucault, intentional, conscious consideration

of how we are and how we want to be is what makes care of the self ethical (Gros, 2001). When one's self is changed, Foucault argues, one is able to express ethical prescriptions authentically, not needing to be told what to do. Ancient philosophy was not an escape mechanism, but required effort. And while care of the self might be framed as individualistic within a culture that prioritizes individual success, Foucault found that within the Ancient paradigm, far from being egoistic or selfish, the pursuit of living according to a philosophically-informed framework represents "a concern for living in the service of the human community, and for acting in accordance with justice" (PWL274), which is why it was and continues to be performed in service of leadership.

Underlying transformative practice there is an assumption that accessing freedom requires knowing the confines from which it seeks to emerge. In that spirit, Foucault describes critique as an experimental attitude and practice of awareness that is intimately tied to the process of subjectivation: constructing oneself as a subject, and finding freedom to make choices about how one lives. A goal of critique is to find the unconsciously imposed limitations of experience, and to push back against them in order to access more freedom. Critical inquiry means to perceive the ways in which we are governed not only by external, institutional mechanisms but also by our own values, beliefs, and assumptions about the world. These inner discursive mechanisms are sometimes more pervasive, because they are harder to see, and it is difficult to perceive them as contingent. When the object of critical questioning is the self, and it is our very ways of being that are tested and targeted, then this is a form of critical inquiry known as critical ontology (Kincheloe, 2003). Like any critique, which includes a follow-up movement to transcend the limits it perceives, critical ontology involves creative and imaginative experimentation in the envisioning of better ways of being.

Transformative practice entails a heightened engagement with the experience of living; it motivates a critique of the limitations of one's current reality and creates space to imagine a new reality. Some versions of transformative education emphasize cognitive transformation, on the level of frames of references (Rowe & Braud, 2013). Other versions are concerned with questions of power, with transformative commitments that aim to "engage educational questions in terms of new ways of being, of deep structural transformation, ... all sorts of hitherto unimagined possibilities" (Morell & O'Connor, 2002, p. xvii). But many transformative learning theorists recognize that transformation does not rest in the act of cognitive knowing; not even with deep, critical

reflection or the most skillful use of reason. As Ambrosio (2008) writes, "we cannot transform ourselves through a simple act of knowing, through critical reason or reflection alone, but only by risking who we are, by voluntarily seeking out and testing ourselves in situations that illuminate the contours of our subjectivity, that destabilize our certainties" (p. 255). Transformation involving changes to one's way of being is the transformation that Foucault found within the Ancient philosophical practices of care of the self. Through practising care of the self, the limitations that have been imposed on one's subjectivity can be addressed in a deliberate manner. I have suggested that the work of intuition development is an enactment of a similar transformation.

Any analysis that dialogues with Foucault might reckon with the question: to what extent is the drive or desire to 'be better' the product of disciplinary governance that 'requires' modern subjects to construct themselves? This is especially pertinent with the tropes of new age self-help, when examined within a context of late modern neoliberalism. However, I have suggested that intuition development might be re-imagined as a critical practice, and that taking up intuition development practice can be read as an act of resistance against pervasive disengagement, and objective, inert knowledge production. Intuition development practice reflects an existential possibility for greater coherence between what one believes in and how one conducts their life, and pursuing this 'intuitive' transformation is an expression of spiritual development.

A brief introduction to 'Grandmother ethics' demonstrates the poverty of an ethical discourse that neglects non-discursive experience. As Bai & Scott (2011) have argued, there are some things that cannot be taught by thinking about them. However, although care of the self is committed to a desired outcome of experiencing cosmic consciousness (PWL), this goal is often omitted when contemplative work is brought to the mainstream, simply to make the practice more palatable to a secular public. The missing acknowledgement of a transpersonal coherence of any kind (cosmic consciousness) is a disservice to the potentially transformative outcome of this work. As Brian Swimme has written (cited in O'Sullivan, 2005):

"Unless we live our lives with at least some cosmological awareness, we risk collapsing into tiny worlds. For we can be fooled into thinking that our lives are passed in political entities, such as the state or a nation; or that the bottom-line concerns in life have to do with economic realities of consumer life-styles. In truth, we live in the midst of immensities and we are intricately woven into a great cosmic drama" (p. 60).

Through its emphasis on meditation as a major modality of intuition development, IDP ensures personal experience with non-discursive or non-ordinary states of consciousness and validates that experience as having existential value. To honour such experience requires what Grof (1993) has called, de-pathologizing the psyche (Grof, 1993); that is, "to look upon the 'inner core' of our being not as the source of metaphysical darkness or illness but as the source of health and as the wellspring of human creativity" (Grof, 1993; 85).

The pursuit of non-discursive and transpersonal ways of knowing (such as that of intuition development) are inherently critical, in the sense that they resist the hegemony of the intellectual mainstream. In particular, by cultivating a more intuitive way of being through IDP, the subject pursues an expanded consciousness, and does so even within an embedded cultural interdiction against psychic experience, founded in a belief about knowledge that it is separate from the emotional self, the instinctual self, the natural world and its cycles. Dei (2002) notes that, when leveraged as an educational strategy in resisting oppression (as is central to his articulation of transformative learning), 'Indigenous knowledge' means at least, "the absence of colonial imposition of the knowledge that is unique to a given culture or society" (p. 1). I take this to imply that the practices that IDP borrows might be liberating, but only if they are accompanied by a liberated understanding of subject agency, and of the potentials of consciousness. Dei continues, "Such knowledge reflects the common sense ideas and cultural resource knowledges of local peoples concerning everyday realities of living. It is knowledge referring to those whose authority reside in origin, place, history and ancestry" (p. 1). Likewise, with IDP, it is not enough to layer such practice on top of whatever else, with no analysis of why we have to intentionally do this work.

As an approach to resistance against the hegemony of analysis, IDP cannot be merely layered over a mostly rational educational program that idealizes decontextualized knowledge acquisition. It is foolish to think, as Noddings and Shore (1984) recommend, that practice time and time for intellectual wandering would be sufficient to inculcate an intuitive way of being. Nor, by this critical view, is it sufficient to do the work without interrogating why intuition and intuitive development practice are not already part of our common knowledge practices. That is, why do we need to learn to trust ourselves as knowing subjects? Why is this trustworthiness not already available? The context of modern, Western people seeking to become more intuitive is an

accumulated result of generations of learned scepticism (not all of which is bad!), accompanied by an inculcation into analysis, intellectualism, and decontextualized knowledge production. A lost connection with instinctual, or psychic, insight has eventuated over time. Intuition development entails and requires a 'new' way of being (which of course is not new), a transformation within to which both care of the self, and IDP specifically are oriented.

Work on the self is not easy, nor immediately satisfying. As with any transformation, "we risk the self when we participate in events without knowing in advance what will happen, where we will end up, or how things will turn out.

Transforming the self requires that we act with personal courage and develop a tolerance for uncertainty and vulnerability" (Ambrosio, 2008, p. 255). Cranton and Roy (2003) borrow the Buddhist image of 'the bottom falling out of the bucket,' to warn of the risk to the self in transformative practice, explaining that "initially, we feel a terrible sense of loss as we watch the water pour away, but then we create new meaning" (Cranton & Roy, 2003, p. 86). Some of that sense of loss is due to a limited notion of what we have been – an individual self, dis-embedded from the holistic context in which she exists.

There is an inherent period of ambiguity while transformation is underway. Yet a perceived incoherence between values and action is deeply unsatisfying, a source of ennui or alienation. Meanwhile the existential rewards are great.

With its practices of meditation, imagination and visualization, and reflecting on inner contents of the psyche, IDP drives us to develop discursive explanations that can more accurately reflect our experiences. It calls attention to the ways we interpret the experiences we have. Without undertaking transformative practice, it is likely that our lenses are clouded with projections and patterns we have settled on as ways to cope with a variety of difficult things (e.g. vast amounts of information, inherited belief systems that we may or may not ascribe to), in ways that we might not recognize. The heightened engagement required of IDP resists alienating cultural practices and habits that detach us from experience through numbing, and effectively 'parking' consciousness with the collective, whether through sports, TV or other mass culture, and by the 'othering' of aspects of our own nature and experience such as dreams, hunches, and imaginative wonderings.

Through the inner practices of intuition development, as we are encouraged to interrogate our interpretations, we can come to consider alternative ways of creating meaning. By enabling and valuing non-discursive experiences of interdependence and interconnectedness, IDP reveals what consciousness is available beyond the 'ordinary' sense, and allows us to access ways of being in the world that do not conform to the hegemonic mechanistic metaphor. However, embedded as we come to be within this intellectual orientation, cultivating space for intuition is difficult. Similarly to how Bergson noted the difficulty in the intuitive method, the work of becoming intuitive is an effort to become other than what we are used to. By engaging in IDP, practitioners become more conscious of the direction of their development: the work is done to become more intuitive, engaged, self-aware, etc. But in doing this work, IDP requires a loosening of our notions of who we are, effectively opening up the field for who we might become.

# Chapter 5 - Intuition development as soul shaping: an offering for education

"Listen to yourself and in that quietude you might hear the voice of God."

Maya Angelou's last tweet, @DrMayaAngelou May 23, 2014. 11:43 am Accessed June 1 2014, 11:24am PDT

"We do not need theories so much as the experience that is the source of the theory"

R.D. Laing, 1967, p. 15.

## 5.1 The occlusion of intuition by an exclusionary epistemology

I began this dissertation by identifying the general problem of alienation, a widespread, felt experience of disconnection and disenchantment that seems to be characteristic of postmodern, Western culture. I later addressed the related issue of alienated, inert knowledge, an approach to thinking about knowledge and knowing that is a consequence of a framework that separates the object and subject of knowing. This epistemology has been in place since 'the Cartesian moment' (Foucault, HS), and it is not difficult to trace experiences of alienation and disenchantment to the hegemony of that framework (e.g. Bai et al, 2009). Earlier, I referred to this framework as 'FIDUROD', a convenient acronym created by Joe Kincheloe that stands for knowledge that is formal, intractable, decontextualized, universalistic, reductionistic, and one-dimensional (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 23). Briefly, FIDUROD is an epistemological framework that focuses on objectively measurable factors, and data obtainable by the scientific method. Based in a belief that the world is essentially fixed and unchanging, it presumes that when something is true, it is true universally and objectively. Wedded to a foundational idea that truth is to be found in external reality (Kincheloe, 2010), this framework has devalued personal experience and therefore is a factor contributing to a widespread, alienated condition.

When the FIDURODian framework (which is, strictly speaking, a framework for engaging with the "external" world) is deployed to comprehend conscious experience, one of the consequences is that we lose sight of the dimension of personal agency in knowledge production. Inner experiences are effectively dismissed by this framework, which has led to ambiguity, and sometimes fear and resistance, to listening within oneself, and to according meaning and value to our inner voices, awareness and vision. Instead, in this tradition, consciousness tends to be framed according to a belief structure whose tenets include: that consciousness is produced by brain activity; analytic reasoning is the highest attainable accomplishment; logical inconsistencies indicate something is invalid; and individuals' nervous systems – and the minds they give rise to - are self-contained (Tart, 1975). These tenets, among others, structure the way we understand consciousness, and additionally limit the ways we experience conscious awareness, based on what we believe to be possible.

Throughout this dissertation, I have argued that the concept and experience of consciousness, and hence, intuition have suffered as a result of the hegemony of FIDUROD. Unsurprisingly, this framework does not easily integrate the idea of intuition as a valuable way to knowledge. Similarly, ideas about the unconscious have been influenced in the modern West by a legacy that frames the unconscious as a repository of repressed and cthonic material, leftover from early childhood, and lingering in a largely unhealthy way. Intuition tends to be represented in education theory by an explanation in accordance with the FIDURODIAN framework: as expertise, reasonably explained as based in long-term, indexed memory (Waks, 2006), or as a hermeneutic function related to the will (Noddings & Shore, 1984). While these descriptions do explain much of the range of intuition, they ignore a significant range of intuitive experience such as future-oriented anticipations, and knowing in advance, leaving these unaccounted for, and effectively, denied.

Beyond a context of FIDUROD, in order to allow for a broadening of the category of experience we call intuition, I began in Chapter One by asking how we might transform the epistemological framework such that it can better account for the integrated roles of the body and mind (and spirit), recognize an extended mind (beyond individual consciousness), and acknowledge that content can be subjectively and contextually true, even if not objectively replicable. I asked, what transformation might be necessary such that intuition can come to be recognized as a reasonable way to know?

While these questions are framed as asking about knowledge and knowledge production, they also inevitably raise the issue of the knowing subject. This is because, in the critical, contextual framework of knowledge that I have been exploring, knowing and being are much less distinct from each other than our dominant epistemology would lead us to believe.

In my study of intuition development guidebooks, I recognized that their underpinnings of transpersonal psychology offer a framework capable of accounting for a fuller range of intuitive experience. Through considering these guidebooks as a meaningful resource, I have identified that the way to conceptualizing intuition more fully, as well as to enhancing the breadth of its function, comes by way of a transformative practice, intuition development pedagogy (IDP). By positioning intuition as a *psychic* experience, and situating that explanation in a transpersonal psychological framework, I have opened up a new range of discursive, conceptual space to consider intuition for education, beyond deep acquaintance or expertise. And I have recommended that the practice of intuition development (IDP), an approach to self-development, has the potential to transform subject-selves so they can come to know and be differently.

This contribution may help to shift the conversation about intuition and education beyond what Noddings and Shore were able to do in their study, more than thirty years ago. It seems more possible to think about varied experiences of consciousness now, in ways that were less acceptable then. The conversation about intuition is now able to join a more diverse conversation about the role of spirituality in people's lives, including the recognition that spirituality can mean far more than adherence to religious belief and practice. I am certain that the popularization of so-called New Age ideas, including through mainstreaming of mind-body practices such as mindfulness and yoga have helped to open out this discursive space.

In this final chapter, as I consider the implications of my study for knowledge production and subjectivity, I connect my findings to two other intersecting conversations in education theory. The first, which is not limited to educational theory alone, has to do with an urgency about a human-generated, global, ecological crisis and what to do about it. The intuitive function is sometimes called on to play a part in the response to the crisis of the anthropocene; and a wide range of literature pleads for a more intuitive way of being as a way to address broad social and cultural problems (e.g. Ferguson, 1981;

Anderson, 2011; O'Sullivan, 1999). This trope is exemplified by Kincheloe (2010), when he asserts that "the ability to cultivate and make meaning from our emotional 'gut' feelings, our intuition, and our imagination is central to the next stages of human evolution" (2010, p. 225). The claim here is that the cultivation of intuition is dramatically linked to our survival.

The second, related, conversation is an ongoing recognition of a need to turn inwards, as a balance to the outward-looking focus that has widely dominated modern, Western culture. This turn inwards is not necessarily a regressive longing for Romantic ideals, but it is a call to look inwards towards a soul-centre or self, without the burdens of old assumptions (e.g. a presumption that the self has an essential, unchanging nature). Imagining this complex subjectivity beyond a metaphysical notion of the self is part of the call to turn inward, and is connected to the ethical action that the first conversation calls for. The concern is about what has been lost with the lack of attention to our inner experience. Throughout this chapter, noting the need for attention to interiority, I consider how intuition development pedagogy might be integrated into formal educational spaces. In particular, I suggest that attending to intuition through inner practice might best begin with educators themselves.

## In search of a way forward

Fifty years ago, when calling on curriculum designers to help students discover their 'intuitive gifts,' Bruner (1960) recognized that "the formalism of school learning has somehow devalued intuition" (p. 58). Bruner was speaking back to the occlusion of intuition throughout curriculum and curriculum theorizing, despite its obvious value in discovery, creativity, and other aspects of teaching and learning. However, rather than 'devalued,' I suggest that intuition has instead suffered from a lack of sensibility - that is, it simply does not make sense within the available (Cartesian) epistemological framework. Intuition is highly valued. Its value is cited in leadership theory (Claxton, 2000; Sadler-Smith, 2008), in business education (Sadler-Smith & Burke, 2009), and throughout teaching and learning. Numerous examples exist in education theory of attempts to address the topic of intuition (e.g. Bruner, 1960; Mott, 1994; Gill, 2006; Noddings & Shore, 1984; Waks, 2006; Agyakwa, 1988), and all of these recognize how valuable a function it is. Intuition's value is widely recognized in numerous best-sellers (e.g. Gladwell, 2005; Dennett, 2013), dissertations (Mott, 1994; Gill, 2006; Henden,

2004), and through a generalized, colloquial attitude that intuition is a valuable, if mysterious, asset.

The constraints of FIDUROD have contributed to a deficient understanding and awareness of the inner landscape of consciousness. To a large extent, we simply have not been looking 'in there'. This lack of attention to interior experience more broadly has resulted in an ignorance concerning intuition amongst educators. With a majority of our attention focused outward, to the observable mechanics, we have consequently failed to develop language for the diversity of experiences available to consciousness. Over the last four centuries human consciousness has been "grossly understudied" (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 217). Inner experience remains terra incognita in our intellectual culture, whose psychology tends to emphasize neuro-biological processes over the subjective experience of consciousness. As a result, in most mainstream educational environments, intuition is largely ignored, and de-legitimized by omission, even though the capacity for self-empowered knowing is an attractive 'skill' recognized throughout educational theory.

To date, much of the scholarly attention to intuition (and the very little about intuition development in particular) has tended to adhere to a regime of respectability (e.g. Hogarth, 2011; Claxton, 2006; Atkinson, 2000), that evades both the transpersonal dimension that accounts for so much intuitive experience, and the spirituality that is embedded in the pursuit of a more intuitive way of being. For example, I described, in Chapter Two, how educators are wont to "dispel the myth of intuition as a mystical, magical, or paranormal sixth sense" (Sadler-Smith & Burke, 2009, p. 248), equating these characteristics with "bad and never to be trusted." Likewise, even though Noddings and Shore (1984) include plenty of thoughtful suggestions as to how to integrate intuition into teaching and learning, and acknowledge the value many people find in psychic versions of intuitive experience, they deny the usefulness of a transpersonal theory for intuition, ultimately missing an opportunity to call attention to this framework for education theory.

Outside this context of respectability, New Age guidebooks that teach intuition development use colloquialisms like 'vibes' and sixth sense, and borrow language from quantum physics, yoga, and Buddhism to elaborate their understandings. In Eastern wisdom traditions especially, there are language, maps, and frameworks with which we

can begin to understand consciousness, and within which intuition also becomes comprehensible (Goguen et al, 1994). The quantum metaphors employed in some of the quidebooks also represents a rebuff to the requirement of objectivity in knowledge production. The domain of quantum theory is used as an important building block of a critical complex epistemology, in which "the traditional Cartesian-Newtonian-Baconian assumption of linear causality crumbles" (Kincheloe, 2008, p. 211). As Goswami (2016, NP) explains, "the theory of quantum measurement leads us to a legitimate scientific theory of both wholeness (when we are unconscious, not having experiences) and the separateness (when we are subjects looking at objects of experience). In this way, this theory also gives us a science of experience, all our experiences. Most importantly, the quantum worldview asserts that we create our reality in some sense." In a similar vein, as Goguen et. al. (1994) report, "the contemplative and spiritual traditions have always claimed to offer an insight into the problem of consciousness through the use of meditation and other transformative techniques, and they have developed an epistemology in which the understanding of the experiencer - the self - is paramount" (p. 6).

Conceptual borrowing has been useful to fill a gap in our ability to communicate about intuition, but the language is necessarily embedded in complex cultural frameworks. Ultimately, in addition to changing the way we think about consciousness, knowledge, and the experiencing subject of knowledge, what seems to be required for a conversation about psychic intuition, is a change in the way we relate to ourselves as knowing subjects. As the guidebooks show, this change can be achieved through experiential investigation of the contents of consciousness, undertaken through contemplative and transformative practice.

## The requirement of practice

Unsatisfied with educational theory about intuition, much of which has limited the concept to a range of experience that is sensible within a physicalist framework, I have recommended popular culture as an alternate conceptual space where intuition is represented as a function of transpersonal consciousness. Sometimes synonymous with "spiritual psychology" (Tart, 1992), transpersonal psychological theory is driven by "the desire to integrate our understanding of human nature and behaviour with the wisdom psychologies of the world's spiritual and religious traditions" (Anderson & Braud, 2011, p. 11). A transpersonal perspective lets us think about consciousness outside the

framework of FIDUROD, and insists that the knowing self is "inseparable from the process and product of knowing" (Friedman & Hartelius, 2013, p. xxx). It assumes that integration, rather than duality, is a true reflection of the nature of the universe, and that the psyche is "but a local aspect of an interconnected whole" (Hartelius et al, 2013, p. 9).

The theory is oriented to understanding integrative experiences (of wholeness), but it is based in practice, and requires techniques for investigating interior experience. Within a transpersonal understanding, the self is considered to be "capable of extending beyond the ordinary boundaries of self" (Hartelius et al, 2013, p. 9), to include "not only body and mind, but also relationship and situatedness in the world" (Hartelius et al, 2013, p. 9). This extent of consciousness is a non-discursive awareness, made available through non-discursive practice; it is beyond what we are able to think, but through the non-discursive practices that support intuitive development, we can - and do - experience ourselves this way.

# 5.2 'Intuition' as an alternative to alienation

Many individuals who have been acculturated into the alienating values of a Cartesian, FIDURODian understanding are struggling with its implications, and are seeking ways "to make sense of what's missing" (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 143). This struggle is reflected in the recent rise in religious fundamentalism, and in a rising interest in mysticism (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 143), and also in the enduring interest in New Age beliefs and practices. Educators are not immune from this existential struggle, and many of us are also seeking ways to feel more resilient and well within an institutional culture that would have us deny our interiority.

I personally witnessed a manifestation of this seeking in the Summer of 2013 when I participated in an at-capacity professional development workshop for educators in Toronto, on the topic of *Developing Intuition and 'Inner Wisdom'* (OISE continuing education series, Summer 2013). In the opening circle of the workshop, participants introduced themselves and why they had chosen to come. Many of the attendees (all attendees were practising teachers; all presented as women) shared that they were hoping, through the workshop, to access deeper meaning than that which they were used to experiencing regularly in their professional environments. Some of the

participants wanted resources to share with their students, in recognition of the general lack of attention paid to students' inner lives. Others were hoping to gain resources for themselves, either as coping strategies for the stressful workload and administrative nature of their jobs, or simply as a redress for the general lack of attention they normally give to existential or spiritual matters. These teachers' aspirations were not a revelation to me. Their struggle for meaning is consistent with a widespread, felt need to connect with inner wisdom, such as through the intuitive sense, or through the inner dimensions of consciousness in which intuition thrives.

The workshop facilitator led the group through a series of activities just like those found in intuition development programmes. First, through a guided meditation practice, we were encouraged to become aware of our bodies in the room, and to progressively move our attention inwards, to the sensation, pace, and possibly sound of our own breath. After a few minutes of silent attention in this way, we were led to envision a scene in the mind's eye: somewhere peaceful, safe, and relaxing. We were then instructed to imagine entering that scene, and to be open to whatever we found there. After talking us through this guided visualization, the facilitator became quiet, as the group continued to meditate silently for about fifteen minutes. At the conclusion of the session, the facilitator roused the group, and we were encouraged to record our experience on paper. Afterwards, participants were invited to share what had been experienced, and to ask questions.

This workshop experience represents for me how the pursuit of intuition development can be taken up as a pursuit of "what's missing" (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 143). The workshop leader provided an opportunity to create quiet, reflective experience, and then, importantly, to have that experience validated through group sharing. While the content of each participant's experience was not necessarily validated, the content is secondary in importance here. What mattered was making space for participants to experience the intuitive sense (and the spectrum of consciousness that makes intuition sensible). This workshop reflected back to participants that there is a meaningful spectrum of inner experience available, and it engaged them in experiencing it for themselves.

As a contrast to this workshop environment, the following example demonstrates what can happen when educators frame intuition in a 'scientific' or objectivist way. Guy

Claxton (2000) is a management educator who researches and teaches about intuition. He recounts an anecdote about a workshop he gave, in which, according to him, a number of participants were "deeply disappointed by the scientific tack which I was taking, and were eager, instead, to share experiences which seemed to them to be self-evidently beyond the bounds of scientific explanation" (p. 33). In other words, these participants arrived at his workshop hoping to have their intuitive experiences validated, but were instead met with a representation of intuition that denied the validity of their experiences. Like these participants, I am disappointed by Claxton's insistence on a "scientific tack" to address inner experience, especially in a cultural context that has very few opportunities for public recognition of such experience.

Claxton (2000) claims to remain 'agnostic' about whether or not 'non-ordinary' intuitive experiences, such as those brought forward by his workshop participants, should be counted as intuition, but complains that "the prevalence of such paranormal or even 'new age' interpretations of intuition reinforces the scepticism of a rationalist establishment" (p. 33). To the contrary, I contend that even the presence of these seemingly misled participants in Claxton's workshop, like the teacher participants at the OISE workshop, indicates a lack of resources for people wanting to make sense of their intuitive experience, and it is that lack that contributes to the ongoing mystification of such experience. Currently there are too few venues for changing that narrative. By denying the personal experience of his workshop participants, Claxton missed an opportunity to extend the range of what counts as intuitive experience, and possibly to begin to normalize, rather than mystify, what his participants know to be real.

Intuition is easily dismissable within a positivist attitude that believes the best knowledge comes from rigorous adherence to the scientific method. Reductionist epistemology "becomes a way of not listening to what human beings are saying about their cognitive experiences in the world" (Kincheloe, 2010, p. 140), and physicalist beliefs about consciousness (Tart, 1992) have resulted in a general neglect and denigration of intuition and intuitive modes; intuition is simply incomprehensible from a standpoint that understands consciousness to be a result of neuro-biological processes. By limiting what counts as knowledge, people's own innate knowledges are degraded. However by attending to experiences of psychic intuition in a serious way, we can reflect the lived experiences that people are already having, and show them as meaningful.

## Harnessing the visionary potential of intuition

The widespread alienation to which I have repeatedly referred is an existential problem - both literally, in that human survival may be at stake; and psychologically, in that responding to it calls for coming to terms with what it means to be human. Collectively, we seem to be in a dark night of the soul, a crossroads that is typically understood to be a personal, psychological process, but which now seems to also be occurring at a collective level. I view this as a choice being presented, between continuing on with a hyper-materialist, rationalist orientation, or finding a way to integrate our current consciousness with a more profound connection to the whole of life. Many theorists, in education and elsewhere, have contextualized their theorizing in response to this crisis, recognizing that a new way of being is needed as a 'way out' of the technorational industrial culture that is so destructive to our lived environment, and to ourselves (c.f. Anderson, 2011; Bai, 2015; Bauman, 2007; Berman, 1981; Cohen, 2015; Goodman, 2003; Kincheloe, 2010; O'Sullivan, 1999). Grof (2008) says it thus:

"Obviously we have a profound crisis. It's not difficult to imagine that if we continue at this rate, we will not make it as a species. I'm not talking only about atomic war or accidents, but also about the vast quantities of industrial pollution we're generating. Our use of fossil fuels is creating an environment hostile to life, whether the toxins go into the air, or the ground, or the water. Most people in the transpersonal movement believe that different aspects of the global crisis are ultimately the result of one thing: their common denominator is the state of consciousness of the human species. If we could change this, if our heads and hearts were in the right place, we could solve most of these problems. We have seen over the years that personal psychospiritual transformation helps create the kinds of individuals who would have a better chance at survival." (p. 167)

The consensus of these critiques is that a turn inward is necessary, to balance our collective direction of focus, along with a corresponding re-animation of the spiritual dimension. The development of a new way to value and inhabit the interior dimensions of experience will be a necessary component of this movement, and intuition development and its practices are well suited to play a role in this future.

This call to turn inward, and for the imperative to change consciousness, is a theme found throughout New Age culture, exemplified in Marilyn Ferguson's (1980) *The Aquarian Conspiracy*, which hypothesizes the inevitability of "social transformation resulting from personal transformation - change from the inside out" (p. 18). Jonas Salk (1983) makes a similar connection, writing that "we are approaching the limit of the

usefulness of our knowledge of the cosmos and are now in need of turning our attention to consciousness of ourselves" (p. 113). Salk (1983) proposes that a way out of the crisis is "a reconciliation of the intuitive and reasoning powers" (p. 107), and that "we need to develop new ways of seeing and of recognizing ourselves" (p. 113).

Intuition development is frequently taken up within this discourse, sometimes in the form of suggesting that there might be trickle-up effects arising from personal self-development, which could lead to mirrored effects on a socio-cultural scale. Self transformation, it is hoped, will contribute to socio-cultural transformation. In this literature, writers conceptualize the future role for intuition in a hopeful way; Salk goes as far as to suggest that reconciling intuition and reason is "the remedy for the human predicament, for the malfunctions in the human condition" (1983, p. 113). I cautiously share some of this optimism, and also hope that intuition can be cultivated to generate more aware, connected ways of living, to counteract the catastrophe we continue to create in the social, biological, psychological, and other dimensions.

If this transformation is to happen, it might be as a result of positioning intuition as a site for developing ontological authority, through which confidence in the inner voice provides fodder for resistance to the status quo perspective that tells us we are separate from the field of our experience. Attending to intuitive perception can be a way of overcoming the cognitive alienation, or "estrangement [whereby] we do not see ourselves as part of the world" (Starhawk, 1988, p. 5). As de Quincey (2005) and others have suggested, cognitive understanding alone is an insufficient foundation for responding to world issues, yet this approach is perpetuated by the education system when it "trains all of us to neglect and deny our deepest instincts" (de Quincey, 2005, p. 38). The rational abstraction we are inculcated to experience both insulates us from the immediacy of action, and progressively deprives us of opportunities to be intimately engaged.

However, if we can experience ourselves beyond the pretence that we are separate, and removed, then the dilemma we face becomes blunt. If we then choose to continue in the old ways, with feigned ignorance, we are also burdened with the understanding that we are personally and collectively hiding. However if we do engage, we accept that in acting, we act upon ourselves. The process of transformation being called for is not without risks, but it is not necessarily negative. Macy and Brown (1998)

refer to the potential here as a "positive disintegration" (p. 45), a transformative psychological process that would be essential to "awakening our will" (p. 6). Being responsible is then no longer a debatable ethical requirement, but a matter of intelligent self-interest, because we experience ourselves to be inextricably part of the collective totality.

### Calls to turn inward

There remain limited, practical interventions to cultivate the interconnection being called for, and in some cases, there is a lack of an imagination if not outright resistance towards practices that would open a road into a more connected relationship to ourselves and the world. Kincheloe (2010) recognizes that "logical understanding of criticality is not enough. Such insights have to be accompanied by a reconstruction of selfhood with affective and emotional investments in the tenets of criticality" (p. 251). Epistemological transformation is not sufficient to do this job. Rather, as Bai, Scott, and Donald (2009) have written, "it is through indwelling our own being that we overcome and heal the wounds of disconnect: the alienated states of our own consciousness" (p. 325). As this is not about the transfer of information, but about helping people navigate towards a new relationship within themselves, Bai's research and practice in contemplative education serves as an important intervention. As Bai, Scott, and Donald (2009) have written,

"the primary interest of contemplative education is in the formation of frames of reference, or as we prefer to call it, containers for other kinds of consciousness. Knowing that the kind of knowledge content we have is vitally dependent on the shape of the container - that is, the knowing person, contemplative education's primary interest is in shaping supple (non-discursive) and complex (nonlinear) consciousness. To do this, educators need new pedagogical tools such as contemplative methodologies that can inspire the discovery of hidden dimensions of reality" (p. 327).

It should go without saying that educators themselves need to experience these tools directly. We cannot expect people to teach inner directed practices unless they themselves have at least some familiarity with the territory.

As I sensed among the teachers from the 'inner wisdom' workshop at OISE, a lack of attention to interiors has reached a tipping point. Among educators and among the general public, there is a growing awareness that there must be something more. Psychiatrist R.D. Laing (1967) articulated the imbalance I am speaking of as a problem

wherein "we hardly know the existence of the inner world: we barely remember our dreams, and make little sense of them when we do" (p. 22). I like to imagine the range of what we could make sense of, and the meaning we might be able to access, if we did trust the inner world as providing access to meaningful truths.

## Bigger questions about spirituality in education

My investigation into intuition development as transformative practice inevitably connects to a broader discussion about spirituality in education, and the role that transpersonal discourses can play in support of meaning, and against alienation. The significance of employing a transpersonal framework for conceptualizing intuition is that it allows an imaginative 'outside' response to the outdated, mechanistic worldview, and the alienation that results from adhering to that view. "Spiritual discourses 'talk back' to the alienating, fragmenting conditions of the academy" (Manyimo & Riskes, 2011, p. 236). But beyond discourse, my recommendations to support transformative selfdevelopment as a means to enhancing intuition are, in effect, a call to spiritual practice. Without requiring adherence to any particular tradition or belief system, the work is, nonetheless, spiritual, at the very least in Foucault's (HS) sense of seeking transformation in order to access wisdom or truth. More directly, inner practice is spiritual in the sense that it takes the practitioner "out of the ordinary dualistic consciousness that categorically separates self from non-self, and the knower and the known: non-dualistic, unitive, and typically timeless experiences that profoundly change, even if just for a moment, our perception and understanding of who we are. In Eastern traditions, such experience is known as awakening (bodhi or satori)" (Bai & Scott, 2011, p. 137).

With that, I recognize that the topic of spirituality remains taboo for many. Often, ideas about spirituality are occluded within coded language. For example, educational theory identified as 'holistic' typically calls for spirituality in educational theory and practice (e.g. Miller, 1994). An increase in contemplative and mindfulness interventions in all levels of education, from elementary to higher education also reflects goals of spiritual development, even when couched in behavioural, secular goals. And while, as Manyimo and Riskes (2011) recognize, "the academy is a hostile place for the spiritually conscious researcher or educator" (p. 236), the effort to incorporate this discourse and its practices is worthwhile, and even essential to the project of educating for intuition development.

# 5.3 Implications of educating for intuition development

Education theorist Gert Biesta has made a different kind of approach to calling for educators to pay more attention to interiors. Biesta also situates his call within a context of a crisis, that of education itself. He identifies the loss of value to education when the concept of educating is replaced by a discourse of learning. Biesta (2012) elaborates that in a discourse of learning, perspectives and opinions are replacing truths; and the language of soul and existential development is being replaced by discourse of brains and neuro-language. Biesta acknowledges that the existential approach he recommends calls for first person, rather than third person perspectives (2012, p. 591); for forms of philosophizing "from the inside."

The educational endeavour is inherently risky (Biesta, 2014). It is necessarily so, Biesta notes, because it deals with human subjects (i.e. not robots). There is a case to be made that educating for intuition development exacerbates that risk, since it explicitly relies on the authority of the subject to know, and since often times there is very little way to objectively confirm intuitive content. On the flip side to this risk is the creative potential inherent to the intuitive mode. Intuition is variously credited with being creative, synthetic, integrative, holistic, deeply contextualized, and even visionary. More to the point, as a future oriented mode (Jung, 1971), it is a way we access the yet-unknown. (The unknown is better called the yet-unknown, which reframes it as a possibility, only one that is outside of the current structures of what is 'knowable'.) For a long time, intuition has been recognized as the way to perceive that which is not perceptible by any other way of knowing. As Vaughan (1979) writes, "intuition can open up new possibilities, sometimes by allowing you to see alternatives you have overlooked, sometimes by offering a fresh, creative solution to a situation in which you feel stuck. Being a nonlinear mode of knowing, intuition can frequently point the way out of a double bind" (p. 43). This creative, visionary perspective is useful in educating for problemsolving, maths, science, and lateral thinking - skills we want students to develop.

Authorizing intuitive knowing and its subjective truth could mean rejecting the requirement that knowledge be based on shared, objectivizable experience, and this is an obvious site of potential backlash. Such a critique may represent a fear about losing

control of one's classroom, pedagogical agenda, or curriculum content, if intuition and inner experience is given 'too' much credence. For example, people have asked me about the potential risks to reason, if someone claims that their intuition is telling them something problematic, such as that global warming is a hoax, or that stealing from a store is 'the right thing to do.' Claxton (2000) identifies a similar fear, acknowledging the potential for uncritically crediting gut feelings with validity (p. 33).

I contend that the fear about students - or anyone - making unreasonable claims based on 'intuition' is resolved by the requirement of self-development in enhancing intuition. This work lets practitioners gauge intuitive content for correctness and appropriateness. Additionally, it needs to be emphasized that intuition and analysis are complementary, and both should be cultivated by educational processes (Bruner, 1960; Ornstein, 1972). This is a position taken up consistently by those who advocate for intuition in education. For example, Anderson (2011) describes how in the research methodology she calls intuitive inquiry, "the researcher's psyche roams freely [but] not aimlessly so" (p. 18). Tangents are considered useful, but are always accompanied by breaks for thinking, evaluating, and analyzing, all in iterative process. These tangents allow the subject to be loose in her mind, to wander through many ideas, feelings and intimations, a valuable mode of functioning when dealing with apparently intractable situations. But eventually, the rational mind is employed to make sense of intuitive content.

Related to this perception of risk is a more general risk of supporting students' authority and creativity in ways that are, inevitably, unpredictable. This may be related to a fear of the unconscious, as Vaughan (1979) notes, "when you venture into the inner world you are invariably confronted with the unknown" (193). Skillful use of the intuitive function relies on a high degree of self awareness, such that intuitive content can be employed in appropriate ways. This is a complexity with the intuitive mode that will likely resolve as it becomes more acceptable to claim knowing by intuition. As the function becomes normalized, so will the possibility of recognizing the relationship between reason and intuition. Claims to intuition need not be naively accepted wholesale; often, they can be followed up with evidence. All of us need to learn this difference, but such learning is unlikely within a cultural climate that occludes the importance of the intuitive function.

## Intuition is risky because it is critical

The institution of formal schooling may be accused of contributing to the cultivation of subjects who are too much the same. Intuition development, with its orientation toward validating personal interior experience, disrupts that trajectory and actively invites the uniqueness of subjects (Biesta, 2009), to the extent of inviting the unpredictable subconscious as an acceptable and valued site of experience. Intuition development pedagogy has the transformative potential to precipitate the change in being and knowing that is being called for, to be what Terrence McKenna (1991) called "the deconditioning factor" (p. 56). McKenna was referring to the function that psychedelic hallucinogens - entheogenic substances - played in allowing people to have direct access to a spiritual realm, interfering with the authority of the priesthoods. However, the concept of de-conditioning explains the potential role intuition might play in education: enabling access to modes of perception beyond the current reality, and the ability to think otherwise. Like the psychonaut explorers of consciousness of McKenna's era, practitioners of IDP are investing in expanding their experiences of consciousness.

When people invest in their experience of non-rational (or, extra-rational) knowing, they begin a process of positioning themselves as authoritative knowers. outside the usually acceptable parameters of what we call 'knowing', and the transformative practices of care of the self can be understood as a mechanism of subjectivation, predicated on the idea that working on the self is an immanent expression of freedom within a struggle for more freedom. Practising IDP thus supports a subject to transgress imposed habits of mind, beliefs, etc., in order to "create oneself as other according to one's own inclinations" (Infinito, 2003, p. 158). The cultivated intuitive space of openness to potential and uncertainty poses resistance against a neo-liberal mindset that everything is predetermined, i.e. that there is no alternative. This is a critical stance as Butler (2001) describes it, a practice of suspending judgement that creates space for the development of new practices and values. Once that suspension of judgement has taken place, there is the possibility, or at least the potential, of finding meaning where we are not supposed to: in non-rational and therefore what are considered to be countercultural ideals. Through this lens one can see that IDP fulfils the requirement of a practice of critique (Foucault, 1997), by pushing back against the limits of the alienated consciousness into which we are entrained.

Education, a process of acculturation, is an initiation into an epistemological framework. And the epistemology that is currently inculcated is one that is estranged from direct experience. Rather than immersing young people in the world where they are, allowing their context to become known, education as it is most often enacted instead creates a context out of abstractions, effectively (if not intentionally) promoting a Platonic ideal that these abstractions are more real than what they are called on to represent. It is in this decontextualized state, that knowledge is traded. This is part of the reason for the need for valuing the intuitive function, and for working to envision a pedagogy that would nurture intuitive awareness. As Lewis (2013) writes,

"If we live in a biocapitalist age of technological enframing, then things no longer call to us as meaningful or significant, and education ceases to be about personal and social transformation and is reduced to mere calculation of outputs in the name of instrumental quotas. ... In such circumstances, there can be no intuitive sense of anything as anything at all. Rather, all that appears are mute resources waiting to be animated by a will (and thus reflect back to humankind its own self-image as 'man the producer')" (p. 31).

With its orientation of thinking what is yet-unthought, developing intuition through direct, experiential, inner practice is something we ought to incorporate into pedagogy.

## IDP as critical praxis

As conceptualized in the New Age, psychic intuition represents an aspect of resistance to decontextualized knowledge. Intuition and the practice of cultivating it challenges the physicalist, FIDUROD-ian framework that shapes the world through mechanisms and metaphors of hierarchy, fragmentation, and objectification. Within this framework, in which knowledge necessarily separates us from the world we live in, from each other, and from the range of personal experience, people are discouraged from developing complex psychic selves, as self-development often remains understood as either an external, consumption-driven pursuit, or an aesthetic one. The subject is positioned as a resource for the economy, ensuring the lack of unique, creative identity. In contrast, the very fact of intuition troubles assumptions about the range of the available capacity of human consciousness. It challenges who and what we think we are (ie individual, biochemical) and demonstrates inter-subjectivity and consciousness beyond ego-boundaries. It raises the issue of what consciousness *is*, and how it works. Thinking about intuition and its development leads to the realization that we are complex organisms existing within systems, further challenging the presumption that we are

linear, binary beings living in a linear, binary world. Rather than emphasizing the subject's autonomy, transformative development can let the subject recognize her interdependence, and agency within a shared, intersubjective context.

The challenge to established frameworks of knowledge extends to hegemonic assumptions about teaching and learning as well. For example, one of the ways that schooling functions to effectively shut down the intuitive sense is by *decomplexifying* students' lived experiences (Biesta, 2010), and reigning in the chaotic potential of real life, in favour of attending to particular outcomes. The logic of learning requires that *potentiality* be "sacrificed in order for the child to learn x skills for x purposes predetermined in advance by experts in the field" (Lewis, 2013, p. 7). When potential is minimized, imagination is stifled, and the diverse range of human experience becomes streamlined, as differences are smoothed over in service of a standardized learning experience, and standardized outcomes. With the loss of conceptual diversity and complexity, the freedom of the individual as a knowing subject is constrained. In this context, efforts to maintain a subjective, creative self should be understood as resistance to this logic of learning. How might we come to see things in a new way, to know things in a new way, and therefore to *be* in new ways? What work do we need to do to prime ourselves for a critical imagination?

Kincheloe (2003) appeals to the possibility of seeing the contingency of our discursive structures, as a starting point to being differently in the world. What Kincheloe calls 'critical ontology' is a response to alienated knowledge production, made possible by looking at the self as a contingent, historical construction rather than a metaphysical fact, and by pushing back on the boundaries that govern such things as subjectivity and choice. Critical ontology is not only concerned with the construction of our subjectivities and identities, but also our enactments of our identities and subjectivities. As opposed to FIDUROD where we are passive observers, critical ontology takes as its starting point that "all knowledge runs through the subjectivity of human perception" (Kincheloe, 2008, p. 37). It recognizes that how we are, who we are, and what we know and do are not distinct, discrete factors. Critical ontology does not rely on a distinction between outer-directed contingencies such as social identity construction (race, class, gender, etc) and more psychologically-oriented contingencies (eg assumptions about individuation, beliefs about individual consciousness). It understands that all of these factors contribute to our sense of identity, and therefore to what and how we know.

In the critical ontological context, "we engage in the excitement of attaining new levels of consciousness and 'ways of being'" (Kincheloe, 2003, p. 49). With effort, an individual can come to recognize that the identity we inhabit now is not the one we need inhabit. Crucially, critical ontology is not only cognitive, but "explores self-production for the purpose of conceptualizing new, more just, and more complex ways of being human" and is "a way of being that is aware of the ways power shapes us, the ways we see the world" (Kincheloe, 2003, p.49). Kincheloe recognizes that in order to know differently, the subject has to change on the existential level. That is, transformation is required.

Critical ontology considers the ways power intersects in the ways we make sense of our own lives and identities, and the relational interactions in which we engage. As an analysis of power, it requires that we become attentive to the socio-historical constructs of our selfhood. In this way, it works beyond the more commonly practised approaches to critical reflection by focusing at the level of the construction of our subjectivity, and by understanding discursive elements of our culture and our identity. It recognizes that reality is always unfolding and dynamic (we are always becoming-subject) and seeks places where movement, or resistance, is possible. Working on the self to *be otherwise* is an enactment of seeking more possible freedom within a framework that already exists and within which we continue to exist.

Kincheloe identifies five foundational theories for critical ontology: complexity theory, enactivism, critical theory, critique of Cartesianism, and poststructural feminist analysis (Meyer, 2011). Though he does not name what I have been calling transpersonal theory, it too could contribute to the critical framework, with its embedded critique of Cartesianism, and its recognition of an integrated mind-body-spirit. While Kincheloe did not offer pedagogical schema or suggest how critical ontology should be enacted he did recommend a "multilogical orientation" (Kincheloe, 2006; 185) to critical ontology, that would situate it within a diverse discursive framework. He specifically pointed to 'Indigenous' and enactivist epistemologies as "useful" for the practice, and neither of these rely on binary distinctions between knowing and being. But how to do this work he left vague, other than to say that what to do is shaped by how to be, which requires becoming somehow, different.

In the absence of a pedagogy for critical ontology, practices of care of the self such as IDP might be useful as a starting point for the introspective work required.

Intuition development is driven by critical goals that might be useful in the pursuit of critical ontology. On the one hand IDP is committed to the individual's authentic engagement in their own life rather than the experience of disconnection or alienation; and on the other, it works to incrementally, progressively develop awareness of the causes or intricacies of the systemic and epistemic structures that maintain that disengagement in the first place. As an orientation or attitude, cultivated through habit, and performed on the self as an act of subjectivation, the pedagogy for intuition development serves as an instructive model of transformative practice that can support a practice of critical ontology.

One of the implications of what I am suggesting here is that the non-dual and non-discursive framework within which intuition should be understood might also be thought of as useful in a critical practice of resisting alienation. The practices comprising IDP situate the self more comfortably in an uncertain, complex context, as well as support the development of coherent internal resources to deal with instability, which in addition to facilitating intuitive function, also contribute to a state of ontological security, beyond the culturally conditioned metrics which usually provide this security. Reigniting philosophy as a way of life, reducing a perceived gap between knowing and being, means that choices can be made based on a more coherent set of understandings and beliefs.

IDP can support critical ontological praxis through modelling self-awareness, and especially, by supporting cultivated attention to a space of possibility (rather than affixed to a particular object). IDP teaches people to enquire about the taken-for-granted aspects of their experience. By challenging epistemological frameworks and notions of truth, IDP works like other critical practice. It cultivates the practice of suspending judgement and analysis to allow non-rational and symbolic perceptions the space to arise and unfold, and engages us in an intentional willingness to entertain whatever does arise. It looks behind things, under things, between things to find more space, to have more freedom right now. By pushing back against limiting frameworks, the intuitive practitioner positions herself as receptive to what may become.

## IDP represents a turn inward

The practices I encountered at the professional development workshop at OISE, like those found throughout intuition development programmes, were based on the idea

that through turning inward, creating a sense of inner spaciousness (in this case, by visualizing a relaxing inner landscape) and quietly focusing on the breath, intuitive insight, or wisdom, would be facilitated. I left that workshop more convinced than ever that what looks like intuition development is actually the pursuit of an existential intervention to transform our relationship to context, truth, and ourselves as knowing subjects. Rather than looking to improve their intuitive - psychic - ability per se, the participants attended the workshop looking for meaning, and a sense of connection, or 'moreness' (Braud, 2006). There may be a similar motivation among many of the people who reach for intuition development guidebooks in bookstores' mind/body/spirit section. However, even if one initially takes up IDP with the intention to become more intuitive, I have suggested that the effects of IDP are more extensive than enhancing psychic ability: intuition development, work done to and with the self to become 'better', contributes to a more authentic, more conscious, or more coherent subject-self.

Intuition development guidebooks identify that the way to develop psychic intuition is through a practice of consciousness development. The programme of practice that I have called IDP is comprised of a complex of modalities, exercises and activities, that work synergistically with a conceptual framework to support the intuitive function and its characteristics of flow, uncertainty, and gestalt. By de-centring the knowing subject, and centring awareness itself, IDP requires that the subject perform work on herself to make her better able to perceive and interpret intuitive experience.

The case for a more intuitive citizenry is clear. Whether in science or business management, the skills associated with a cultivated intuitive function – flexibility, decision-making, trust-worthiness - are desirable. The intuitive function contributes to all inquiry, acting as a fine-tuner, providing data and information that technology might not (Boucouvalas, 1997, p. 5). But what academic scholars are missing is how this might come about: that is, intuition is enhanced not merely by inculcating skills, but by inculcating intuitive subjectivities within an epistemological framework that allows intuition to make sense. What has been presented here, then, is not only about attaining the goal of 'becoming more intuitive' but points toward the path we must travel, and the practices we need to engage, if we are to reclaim a connection to our innate inner world, validate our unique subjectivity, and move into a connected individuality that not only theorizes a connection to all life, but is able to experience it.

## A role for IDP in professional development

The critical, transformative work of IDP would be appropriate and valuable in teacher education, in the spirit of Parker Palmer's (1993) recognition that "we teach who we are" (p. 1). My experience at the OISE continuing education workshop suggests that teachers and teacher candidates would benefit from explicit recognition of intuition and its potential role in professional practice, along with opportunities to engage in the transformative practices of IDP. Attending to intuition development would represent a shift away from an emphasis on technique that sometimes dominates educational discourse (Biesta, 2012). Biesta points to the need for developing language for education that includes "appreciation for a sense of interiority" (p. 589), especially in the context of thinking about subjectivity and its existential implications, which fits well with Palmer's commitment to calling on the soul of the educator. As Palmer (1993) observes, "the way we teach depends on the way we think people know; we cannot amend our pedagogy until our epistemology is transformed. If teaching is reformed in our time, it will not be the result of snappier teaching techniques. It will happen because we are in the midst of a far-reaching intellectual and spiritual revisioning of reality and how we know it" (p. xvii). This revisioning is not a one-time-and-done engagement. Teachers need to be dynamically engaged with their own unfolding subjectivity as a transformative existential practice.

Subjectivity matters to intuition because it is the subject herself who experiences intuition, who chooses (to a large extent) whether intuition is experienced as meaningful, and how it gets interpreted, if it is considered worthy of action, etc. So there is a role here for teacher self-development, or what is sometimes thought of as leadership development. Subjectivity and subject-development are key pieces of teacher and leadership education, as well as a key pillar of any educational process (Biesta, 2009). Biesta (2012) argues that the way subject-formation is understood within education neglects the "existential uniqueness" (p. 589) of individuals - a quality he later suggests be referred to as soul. With this, Biesta (2012, 2014) is arguing for existence over essence, in line with postmodern thinking that "thinks of persons in process, in pursuit of themselves and, it is to be hoped, of possibilities for themselves" (Greene, 1995, p. 41), rather than a metaphysical understanding of subjectivity that relies on the idea of an essential element of an a priori self, or soul.

Contemporary language of subjectivity typically allows for two options: the point of view in which the subject is nothing more than the perception of continuity; or the idea that at the core of the self is an essential, never changing, soul. On the word 'soul,' Biesta (2012) suggests that we "perhaps begin to think of soul as denoting a quality of existence or an existential quality as in music with 'soul' or a book with 'soul'" (p. 589). Here, I read Biesta's use of the word soul like the word 'heart', an existential, affective quality we all might recognize. Soul is a triggery word. I have tried to avoid using it as much as possible, since I recognize that it typically evokes a religious association, and at a minimum suggests that a part of the self is essential and predetermined. However, as ensouled subjects in the existential sense, we can recognize that teachers (and others) are in an ever-unfolding process of subject-formation. And like the Ancient Greco-Roman understanding, the direction of this development can be molded rather than merely observed or experienced.

For Biesta (2012), referring to "soul" avoids "brain language" intersecting with neuroscience which is currently commonly harnessed to describe the psychological functions. In the next section, I further explore this suggestion: heart or soul being an affective descriptor that suggests a way that something connects or touches or affects us. It describes resonance. The transformative practice of IDP develops interiors so that there is something to be touched; something that meets the world.

#### The soul of the educator

Torin Finser (2001) writes of the process of intentional self-development practice as 'soul shaping.' He writes,

"Many people are living cyclones. Their inner lives are in a state of suspended animation, while their outer lives are a constant whirl of activity. This incessant movement is not just an outer phenomenon; it manifests in the inner life as well. ...This hastiness creates more inner restlessness, and a vague feeling of dissatisfaction seeps in. As for active inner work, which could counteract this nervous energy, many say they don't have the time" (p. 76).

This description is very much how Bai (2015) describes the state of agitation that contemplative practice addresses: a need to create coherence out of energy. Finser (2001) goes on to note that there are many ways to perform inner work. But in any case, "all this work on personal change calls for taking hold of one's conscious life and giving the soul new direction" (p. 78). Palmer (1998) agrees, proposing that "we need to learn

as many ways as we can of 'talking to ourselves'" (p. 32). In order to overcome the imbalance in which teaching technique is prioritized over a teacher's integrity and identity, and to correct an overemphasis on the powers of intellect (Palmer, 1998), attention to the inner lives of teachers has become both appropriate and necessary.

Palmer (1998) asks us to consider: 'Who is the self that teaches?' (p. 7). If what we *are* feels disconnected, lacking depth, connection, etc., then that is what is being modelled and conveyed. In contrast, an educator who is intentionally aware of the transpersonal realm, who invests in transformative work to develop their connection to the intuitive experience, can translate these 'skills'/'abilities to their professional practice. Christopher Bache (2009) is one such educator, and has written about the value he has found for his teaching practice, in paying attention to intuitive moments. He cites the way that intuitive moments - which he refers to as "gifts" - can "transform an otherwise predictable lecture into a lively improvisational exchange tuned to a specific audience" (p. 104).

"I found that if I took the risk and used these gifts, some of which seemed strangely off-target at the time, something magical would happen. Something new and unexpected would come forward. My answers seemed to hit the mark or ignite a vigorous conversation...The energy in the room would rise, students would brighten up, and we would move together in a creative excursion instead of in a predictable loop" (p. 107).

Bache (2009) describes the uncanny way these 'gifts' would seem to affect students deeply. He acknowledges or considers that the availability of intuitive insights come as a result of a long-time spiritual practice, which he explains as "about cultivating an experiential opening to the larger patterns of life and the deeper roots of one's existence" (p. 108).

Bache (2009) came to recognize the extent to which his personal spiritual practice affected what would happen in the classroom. He writes,

"eventually I realized the fact that my inner and my outer life - my 'private' spiritual practice and my public professional life - could not be kept entirely separate from each other demonstrated an important truth about the nature of consciousness and the deep structure of reality. It was actually demonstrating the validity of one of the core axioms of a perennial perspective: the inherent wholeness of existence; the integrated, interpenetrating nature of the universe ... Though I left my spiritual practice at home every morning when I went to the university, I could not leave

myself at home, and my spiritual practice seemed to be changing my energetic constitution at deep levels" (p. 111).

Transformative practice such as the inner work often described as spiritual practice, brings coherence to the self. This inner coherence reflects a balance to the usual outward direction of attention. "Much energy is usually directed toward manipulation and control of the external environment and of other people. If you withdraw that energy from the external world and turn it inward to self-observation, you can discover how to transform your experience by changing not your external circumstances, but your state of consciousness" (Vaughan, 1979, p. 179). The subject can experience enhanced overall well-being from this coherence (that is not to say that there are not challenges - even challenges brought by the work itself), and that coherence can be 'read' by other people as well.

# 5.4 Concluding thoughts

Faculties of education are natural centres for thinking about how we might move forward in addressing how to heal ourselves and our society. Themes comprising the educational process are ideas about human development, improving society, supporting well-being, and educating for the kind of world educators envision. However, the formal educational system has also been accused of being an institution that "trains all of us to neglect and deny our deepest instincts" (de Quincey, 2005, p. 38). In fact, some of the most insidious educational practices prevent intuition from developing at all.

Jerome Bruner's (1960) *The Process of Education* dedicates a whole section to education's intentional forgetting of intuition, and advocates for its inclusion. He and others, like Noddings and Shore have offered models for what an intuitive classroom might look like. Noddings and Shore (1984) want teachers to help students maintain a productive tension between knowing and not-knowing, and suggest that teachers can encourage students to recognize felt experiences of tension (and the reduction of that tension) as signals of learning and discovery. They advise that students can be guided to become comfortable in the liminal state between subjective certainty (the affect of being correct) and the objective uncertainty that exists unless and until intuitive content can be confirmed through elaboration, revision, analysis, et cetera (Noddings & Shore,

1984). They additionally recommend giving students greater freedom to express their thoughts, feelings, and hunches in whatever form, and to "let whatever-is-there come through, be revealed" (p. 113). Calling on educators to pay more attention to the process as opposed to the product, and to instill a spirit of curiosity, Noddings and Shore write, "we must make it possible for our students to listen, to try out, to enjoy the objects of knowledge without always demanding products that can be assessed as the results of satisfactory performance" (p. 110). This would require showing students that their intuitive content is welcome. Instead, when we demand that students 'show their work', we create a barrier to staying with the process, undermining intuitive abilities by stultifying the holistic and direct way intuition functions (Bruner, 1960).

I end with some remarks about intuition and childhood. I have already identified how processes of education tend to obfuscate the intuitive function, and my belief that intuition has become of interest in popular self-help because enough adults are recognizing that they have grown up without awareness or recognition of their own intuitive abilities.

Maria daVenza Tillmanns (2017), who works with children as a philosophy teacher, and as a philosophical counsellor, has written about the way that an emphasis on cognition tends to replace whatever innate intuitive sense children already have. In Tillmanns' understanding, children are naturally intuitive, and are able to understand concepts intuitively even when their cognitive capacities are not yet sufficiently developed. She argues that "intuitive knowledge is gradually replaced by the structures of thinking we are taught. Logic then comes to replace immediate experience" (NP). Tillmanns argues that induction into cognitive knowledge comes at the expense of children's relationship with the world in which they are immersed. "As a result," she writes, "we can train people to be very smart and knowledgeable, but at the expense of their inborn intelligence, rooted in their relationship with the world." (NP). Here, educational processes are singled out for their role in stifling the intuitive function.

Sonia Choquette, author of at least 20 self-help books on intuitive development, has written some of those books specifically about intuition development for children. Choquette's primary message is that children are best supported in their intuitive function by adults who are themselves attuned to the intuitive function in their own lives. This is a potentially rich area of study, and has implications for teachers of children as

well. Choquette (2007) shares anecdotes about parents who initially resisted when presented with their child's intuitive experience. According to Choquette, these parents'

"reactions stemmed from an ingrained culture that invalidates children's gut feelings (or anyone's, for that matter) without a second thought. As good mothers, they were more concerned about making the "bad" feelings go away than asking themselves what was behind them. They focused on reassuring their kids that all was well instead of considering that their children were messengers with important information" (p. 130).

This comment confirms that a broader cultural transformation, including a more inclusive understanding of the range of possible intuitive experience, can better support intuitive development in general.

If children are naturally intuitive, but what they encounter in schools and at home pushes them to forget or neglect that function, they may eventually lose contact with the intuitive function. Transpersonal psychologist Levin (2000) speaks of the 'forgetting' of whatever does not conform to the hegemonic paradigm as "related to the domination of a logic of binary, mutually exclusive oppositions, polarizations of experience that have deeply pathologized the nature and character of our experience..." (p. 275). This forgetting happens "at the expense of lived experience" (Levin, 2000, p. 275). Unfortunately, it may be that "as domains of experience become more alien to us, we need greater and greater open-mindedness even to conceive of their existence" (Laing, 1967, p. 23). Within such an educational context, it is understandable that many people turn to the self-help genre for guidance about how to recover this sensibility.

At a time when we are privileged with many choices about how to live, intuition can be called on to guide us towards good decisions. However aside from the pragmatic value of intuitive function, there are also existential, psycho-spiritual reasons for developing intuition. Education is no longer so much about learning new information; that content is available at our fingertips. Rather than being concerned with what to know, education can be about changing how we are; how to be. The guidebooks reflect this concern. They teach intuitive development by attending to the person, so that their latent intuitive function can be freed, or 'awakened.' Conceptualizing intuition by drawing on a syncretic, narrative lineage of wisdom traditions, the guidebooks recognize that the path to intuition development is ultimately a path of practice, requiring intentional engagement by the individual. In this way, the work of intuition development is like the work of

spiritual practice, and the pursuit of intuition might be understood as an existential quest for meaning.

Attending to intuition as an existential search responds to a broader concern in philosophy of education right now - that of figuring out how to heal ourselves and our society. This project of educating intuition can contribute to redressing an imbalance in human development; that is, the tendency towards cultivating highly educated rational intellects, while neglecting the non-rational and non-discursive functions, such as intuition. This goal of redress aligns generally with holistic education, a theoretical approach that includes body, mind, and spirit (Miller, 1994) as integrated facets of a complex, whole human being.

Within a cultural context that maintains a taboo against knowing who we are (Watts, 1966), care of the self such as IDP becomes an act of ethical responsibility. Mind-body practices such as meditation enable access to experiences of unity, coherence, empathy and connection and are therefore a way of reconnecting to a collective power that has been lost through disconnection, disenchantment, estrangement, and alienation. The more we validate the intuitive mode, the more we expand the possibility for a fuller expression of human potential.

By naming intuition and advocating for its value, I hope to incite others to imagine more possibilities to the range of human experience; not only to push against the boundaries within which we produce and reproduce knowledge, but to imagine new ways of being and knowing that make use of transpersonal theories. Intuition reflects values such as open-mindedness and critical thinking, as well as traditional ethics of teaching such as love, care, and empathy. Rather than conceptualizing intuition as a rarefied function, we can pursue a shift in consciousness that might support diverse and meaningful experiences of consciousness, including intuition.

At all levels of education, there is room to attend to the inner lives of students and teachers alike. As Thomas Moore (2005) writes, "An emphasis on mind has generated a neglect of soul. The mother of soul is taken up today by the fringe writers who are generally outside the culture of academia and professionalism, digging in the murky swamps of self-help and popular psychology. I think we need to bring soul more into the center, where we can study it seriously and allow it to have an impact on the culture at large" (p. 10). By engaging with intuition guidebooks, non-academic texts that

are nonetheless educational, I have waded into that "murky swamp" in order to retrieve intuition and consciousness development more generally, as a kind of show-and-tell to educational research. I agree with Moore: we cannot let these experiences be continually mystified.

# References

- Agyakwa, K. (1988). Intuition, Knowledge and Education. *The Journal of Educational Thought (JET) / Revue de la Pensée Éducative*, 22 (3) (December 1988), 161-177.
- Ahenakew, C., de Oliveira Andreotti, V., Cooper, G. & Hireme, H. (2014). Beyond Epistemic Provincialism. *AlterNative*, 10(3),216-231.
- Ambrosio, J. (2008). Writing the Self: Ethical Self-Formation and the Undefined Work of Freedom. *Educational Theory*. 58 (3), 251-267.
- Anderson, R. (2011) Intuitive Inquiry: The Ways of the Heart in Human Science Research. In R. Anderson & W. Braud (Eds.) *Transforming Self and Others Through Research* (pp. 15-70). Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Anderson, R. & W. Braud (Eds). (2011). *Transforming Self and Others Through Research*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Arvidson, P.S. (1997) Looking Intuit. In R. David-Floyd and P.S. Arvidson (Eds.), *Intuition: the inside story.* (pp. 39-56). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Bache, C. (2009). Spiritual Resonance in the Classroom. In Dennis Patrick Slattery & Jennifer Leigh Selig, (Eds.). *Reimagining Education: Essays on Reviving the Soul of Learning*. (pp. 103-112). New Orleans, LA: Spring Journal Books.
- Bai, H. (2001). Beyond Educated Mind: Towards a Pedagogy of Mindfulness. In B. Hockings, J. Haskell, & W. Linds (Eds.). *Unfolding Bodymind: Exploring Possibilities Through Education.* (pp. 86-99). Brandon, VT: The Foundation for Educational Renewal.
- Bai, H. (2003). The Stop: The Practice of Reanimating the Universe Within and Without *Educational Insights, 8*(1). [Available: http://www.ccfi.educ.ubc.ca/publication/insights/v08n01/contextualexplorations/bai/bai.html]
- Bai, H. & Banack, H. (2006). To See the World in a Grain of Sand: Complexity Ethics & Moral Education. *Complicity: An International Journal of Complexity and Education*. 3(1), 1-20.
- Bai, H. (2015). Peace with the Earth: Animism and contemplative ways. *Cultural Studies of Science Education*. 10, 135-147.
- Bai, H, Scott, C. & Donald, B. (2009) Contemplative Pedagogy and Revitalization of Teacher Education. *The Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 55 (3), 319-334.
- Bai, H. & Scott, S. (2011). The Primacy of Consciousness in Philosophy: A Role for Contemplative Practices in Education. *The Korean Journal for Philosophy of Education*, 33 (4), 129-145.

- Barrow, R. & Keeney, P. (2001). Lifelong Learning and Personal Fulfillment. In David Aspin et al (Eds.) *International Handbook of Lifelong Learning Part One* (pp. 53-58). Boston: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Bastick, T. (1982). Intuition: How we think and Act. Toronto: John Wiley & Sons.
- Bauman, Z. (2007). Liquid Times. Cambridge, UK: Polity.
- Belenky, M., Clinchy, B., Goldberger, N., & Tarule, J. (1986) Women's Ways of Knowing. New York, NY: BasicBooks.
- Berg, M.C. (2008). New age advice: ticket to happiness? *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 9: 361-377.
- Bergsma, A.J. (2007). Do Self-help books help? *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 9(3), 241-360.
- Bergson, H. (1944). *Creative Evolution*. (A. Mitchell, trans.). New York, NY: Random House.
- Bergson, H. (2007). *An Introduction to Metaphysics*. (T.E. Hulme, trans.). J. Mullarkey and M. Kolkman, eds. London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Berman, M. (1981). The Reenchantment of the World. Ithica: Cornell UP.
- Biesta, G. (2005). Against learning: Reclaiming a language for education in an age of learning. *Nordisk Pedagogik*, Vol. 25, 54–66. Oslo. ISSN 0901-8050.
- Biesta, G. (2009). On the Weakness of Education Philos Educ Yearbook 2009 p. 354-62 Philosophy of Education Society Director, School of Teacher Education, University of Northern Colorado, McKee 208, Greeley, CO 80639
- Biesta, G. (2010). Five theses on complexity reduction and its politics. In G. Biesta & D. Osberg (Eds.). *Complexity Theory and the Politics of Education*. Rotterdam: Sense. (pp. 5-15).
- Biesta, G. (2012). Philosophy of Education for the Public Good: Five Challenges and an agenda. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 44(6), 581-593.
- Biesta, G. (2014). The Beautiful Risk of Education. Boulder, CO: Paradigm.
- Bohm, D. (1980). Wholeness and the Implicate Order. London, UK: ARK.
- Boucouvalas, M. (1997). Intuition: The Concept and the Experience. In R. David-Floyd and P.S. Arvidson (Eds), *Intuition: the inside story*. (pp.3-18). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Bowers, C.A. (2012) Questioning the Idea of the Individual as an Autonomous Moral Agent. Journal of Moral Education, 41 (3), 301–310.
- Branson, C. (2009). Leadership for an Age of Wisdom. New York: Springer.

- Braud, W. (2006). Educating the "more" in Holistic Transpersonal Higher Education: a 30-year perspective on the approach of the institute of transpersonal psychology. *Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, 38(2), 133-158.
- Bruner, J. (1960) The Process of Education. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP.
- Burenko, G. (1997). Wheels within Wheels, Building the Earth: Intuition, Integral Consciousness, and the Pattern That Connects. In R. Davis-Floyd and P. S. Arvidson (Eds.), *Intuition: the inside story* (pp 81-100). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Butler, J (2001). What is Critique? An Essay on Foucault's Virtue. *European institute for progressive cultural policies*. http://eipcp.net/transversal/0806/butler/en Last accessed August 28, 2015.
- Butler, W.E. (1978). How to Read the Aura, Practice Psychometry, Telepathy and Clairvoyance. New York, NY: Warner Destiny.
- Cappon, D. (1994). IQ2: A New Approach to Intuition. Omni, Sep94, 16 (12), 34-43.
- Cartwright, T. (2004). Feeling your way: enhancing leadership through intuition. *LIA*. 24(2), 8-11.
- Chase, J. (1960) You Can Change Your Life Through Psychic Power. New York, NY: Pocket Books.
- Chaudhuri, H. (1992). Yoga Psychology. In C.T. Tart (Ed.), *Transpersonal Psychologies* (pp. 231-280). New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Choquette, S. (2004). Trust Your Vibes: Secret Tools for Six-Sensory Living. Carlsbad, CA: Hay House.
- Choquette, S. (2007). The Intuitive Spark: Bringing Inuition Home to Your Child, Your Family, and You. Carslbad, CA: Hay House.
- Choquette, S. (2013). Tune In: let your intuition guide you to fulfillment and flow. Carlsbad, CA: Hay House.
- Claxton, G. (2000). The Anatomy of Intuition. In T. Atkinson and G. Claxton (Eds.), The Intuitive practitioner (15-31). Buckingham, UK: Open UP.
- Claxton, G. (2006). Beyond Cleverness: How to be Smart Without Thinking. *Creative Management and Development* In J. Henry (Ed.) 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition London, UK: Sage (pp. 47-63)
- Cranton, P. & Roy, M. (2003). When the bottom falls out of the bucket: Toward a holistic perspective on transformative learning. *Journal of Transformative Education.*, 1(2), 86-98.
- Cremonesi, L. (2015). Pierre Hadot and Michel Foucault on Spiritual Exercises: Transforming the Self, Transforming the Present. In S. Fuggle, Y. Lanci, & M. Tazzioli (Eds.), *Foucault and the History of Our Present* (pp. 195-209). London, UK: PalgraveMacmillan.
- Crowley, K. (2011). Feminism's New Age. SUNY Press: Albany.

- Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1990). Flow: The Psychology of Optimal Experience. New York, HarperCollins.
- Dane, E. & Pratt, M. (2007). Exploring Intuition and Its Role in Managerial Decision Making. *The Academy of Management Review*, 32(1), 33-54.
- Daniels, M. (2013). Traditional Roots, History, and Evolution of the Transpersonal Perspective. In H.L. Friedman & G. Hartelius, (Eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Handbook of Transpersonal Psychology.* (pp. 23-42). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Davidson, A. I. (1995). Introduction. In A. I. Davidson (Ed.), *Philosophy as a Way of Life* M. Chase (Trans.), (pp1-46). Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Davis-Floyd, R. & P.S. Arvidson. (1997). Preface. In R. David-Floyd and P.S. Arvidson (Eds), *Intuition: the inside story*. (xi-xvii). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Day, L. (1996). Practical Intuition. New York, NY: Villard.
- de Quincey, C. (2005). Radical Knowing: Understanding Consciousness through Relationship. Rochester, VT: Park Street Press.
- Dei, G.J.S. (2002). Spiritual Knowing and Transformative Learning. *NALL New Approaches to Lifelong Learning*. Working Paper # 59. Available at https://nall.oise.utoronto.ca/res/59GeorgeDei.pdf.
- Deikman, A. (1982). The Observing Self: Mysticism and psychotherapy. Boston, MA: Beacon.
- Dennet, D.C. (2013). *Intuition Pumps and Other Tools for Thinking*. New York, NY: W.W.Norton.
- Dirkx, J.M. (1997) Nurturing Soul in Adult Learning *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, June 1997, Vol.1997(74), pp.79-88
- Dirkx, J.M. (2006). Authenticity and imagination. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 111, 27-39. DOI: 10.1002/ace.225.
- Dolby, S. (2005). Self-Help Books: Why Americans Keep Reading Them. Chicago, IL: University of Illinois Press.
- Dunne, B. (1997). Subjectivity and Intuition in the Scientific Method. In R. David-Floyd and P.S. Arvidson (Eds), *Intuition: the inside story*. (pp.121-128). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Estés, C. P. (1992). Women who Run with the Wolves: Myths and Stories of the Wild Woman Archetype. New York, NY: Ballantine.
- Fensham, P. and F. Marton (1992) What Has Happened to Intuition in Science Education? *Research in Science Education*, 1992, 22, 114-122.
- Ferguson, M. (1987). The Aquarian Conspiracy. Los Angeles, CA: J.P. Tarcher.

- Field, J. (2000). Lifelong Learning and the New Educational Order. Trent, UK: Trentham.
- Finser, T. (2001). *School Renewal: A Spiritual Journey for Change*. Great Barrington, MA: Anthroposophic Press.
- Flynn, T. (2005). Philosophy as a way of life: Foucault and Hadot. In *Philosophy & Social Criticism.* 31(5-6), 609-622.
- Foucualt, M. (1982). The Subject and Power. Critical Inquiry. 8(4), 777-795.
- Foucault, M. (1997). On the Genealogy of Ethics: An Overview of Work in Progress. In P. Rabinow (Ed.), *Ethics: Subjectivity and Truth,* (pp. 253-280). New York, NY: Perseus.
- Foucault, M. (1997a). Technologies of the Self. In P. Rabinow (Ed.), *Ethics: Subjectivity and Truth*, (pp. 223-252). New York, NY: Perseus.
- Foucault, M. (1997b). Ethics of the Concern for Self as a Practice of Freedom. In P. Rabinow (Ed.), *Ethics: Subjectivity and Truth,* (pp. 281-302). New York, NY: Perseus.
- Foucault, M. (2001). *The Hermeneutics of the Subject.* F. Gros (Ed.), G. Burchell (Trans.). New York, NY: Picador.
- Foucault, M. (2007). What is Critique? In S. Lotringer (Ed.), *The Politics of Truth,* (pp. 41-82). Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e).
- Foucault, M. (2007a). Subjectivity and Truth. In S. Lotringer (Ed.). *The Politics of Truth* (pp. 147-168). Los Angeles, CA: Semiotext(e).
- Foucault, M. (2010) What is Enlightenment? In P. Rabinow (Ed.), *The Foucault Reader*, (pp 32-50). New York, NY: Vintage Books
- Frattaroli, Elio. (2001). Healing the Soul in the Age of the Brain. New York: Penguin.
- Friedman, H.L. & Hartelius, G. (2013). Editor's Introduction. In H.L. Friedman & G. Hartelius, (Eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Handbook of Transpersonal Psychology.* (pp. iv-xxx). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Gadamer, H.G. (2011). *Truth and Method.* 2<sup>nd</sup> revised edition. J. Weinsheimer & D.G. Marshall, (Trans.). New York, NY: Continuum.
- Gawain, S. (2000). Developing Intuition. Novato, CA: New World Library.
- Gee, J. (1999). Intuition: Awakening Your Inner Guide. Boston, MA: Weiser Books.
- Guertz, K. (2002). Culture and the Sense: Bodily Ways of Knowing in an African Community. Berkeley, CA: UC Press.
- Gill, A. (2006). In search of intuitive knowledge: A comparison of Eastern and Western epistemology. Unpublished Dissertation. Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, BC.

- Gladwell, M. (2005). Blink. New York, NY: Little, Brown and Company.
- Gladwell, M. ND. "What is *Blink* about?" http://www.gladwell.com/blink/index.html. Accessed March 4, 2013.
- Goguen, J.A. & R.K.C. Forman. (1994). Introduction. *J. Of Consciousness Studies*, 1(1) 4-9.
- Goldberg, P. (1983). The Intuitive Edge. Los Angeles, CA: J.P. Tarcher.
- Goodman, A. (2003). *Now What? Developing Our Future.* New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- Goswami, A. (2016) 'A New Paradigm for Education: What Quantum Physics Tells Us About How We Should Educate Our Kids' http://www.amitgoswami.org/2016/07/15/a-new-paradigm-for-education-what-quantum-physics-tells-us-about-how-we-should-educate-our-kids/ (accessed October 2, 2017).
- Greene, M. (1995). Releasing the Imagination. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Grof, S. (1998). The Cosmic Game. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Grof, S. (1993). *The Holotropic Mind*. With Hal Zina Bennett. New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Grof, S. (2008) 'Birthing the Transpersonal.' *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, Vol. 40, No. 2 155-177.
- Grof, S. (2012). Revision and re-enchantment of psychology: Legacy of Half a Century of Consciousness Research. *Journal of Transpersonal Psychology*, 2012, 44(2), 137-163.
- Gros, F. (2011). Course Context. In F. Gros (Ed.) *The Hermeneutics of the Subject.* G. Burchell (Trans.) pp. 507-550). New York, NY: Picador.
- Gunter, Pete A. Y. (1982). Bergson and Jung. Journal of the History of Ideas, 43(4) (Oct. Dec. 1982), pp. 635-652. University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Hadot, P. (1995). *Philosophy as a Way of Life.* Michael Chase (Trans.). Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Hartelius, G, Rothe, G., & Roy, P.J. (2013). A Brand from the Burning: Defining Transpersonal Theory. In H.L. Friedman & G. Hartelius, (Eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Handbook of Transpersonal Psychology.* (pp. 4-22). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Hayward, J. (1997). Forward. In R. Davis-Floyd and P. S. Arvidson (Eds.), *Intuition: the inside story.* (pp. ix-x). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Heelas, P. (1996). The New Age Movement. Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Heelas, P. (2009). Spiritualities of Life: New Age Romanticism and Consumptive Capitalism. John Wiley & Sons.

- Henden, G. (2004) Intuition and its Role in Strategic Thinking. Unpublished Dissertation. BI Norwegian School of Management., Sandvika, Norway.
- Hodgkinson, G. P., et al. (2008). Intuition: A fundamental bridging construct in the behavioural sciences. *British Journal of Psychology* 99, 1–27.
- Hogarth, R. M. (2001). Educating Intuition. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Husserl, E. (1970). *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology* David Carr, Trans. Northwestern University Press: Evanston.
- Infinito, J. (2003). Ethical Self-Formation: A Look at the Later Foucault. *Education Theory*, 53 (2), 155-171.
- Jagla, V. M. (1994). Teacher's everyday use of imagination and intuition: In pursuit of the elusive image. Albany, NY: State University of New York.
- Jung, C.G.(1971a). Psychological Types, In J. Campbell (Ed.), *The Portable Jung*, (pp. 178-272). New York, NY: Penguin.
- Jung, C.G. (1971). *Psychological Types*. (R.F.C. Hull, Trans.). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Original work published 1921).
- Kaku, M. (1995). Hyperspace. New York, NY: Anchor Books.
- Kezar, A. (2005). What do we mean by "learning" in the context of higher education? *New Directions for Higher Education*, 131, 49-59.
- Kincheloe, J. L. (2003). Critical ontology: Visions of selfhood and curriculum. *JCT: Journal of Curriculum Theorizing*. 19(1), 47-64.
- Kincheloe, J. L. (2006). Critical Ontology and Indigenous Ways of Being: Forging a Postcolonial Curriculum. In Y. Kanu (Ed.), *Curriuculum as Cultural Practice:*Postcolonial Imaginations (pp.181-202). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Kincheloe, J. L. (2010). *Knowledge and Critical Pedagogy: An Introduction*. New York, NY: Springer.
- Kolakowski, L. (1985). Bergson. Oxford, UK: Oxford UP.
- Krupka, Z. (2015) How corporates co-opted the art of mindfulness to make us bear the unbearable. *The Conversation*. Available at http://theconversation.com/how-corporates-co-opted-the-art-of-mindfulness-to-make-us-bear-the-unbearable-47768.
- Laing, R.D. (1967). The Politics of Experience and the Bird of Paradise. New York: Penguin.
- Laughlin, C. (1997). The Nature of Intuition: A Neuropsychological Approach. In R. David- Floyd and P.S. Arvidson (Eds). *Intuition: the inside story*. (pp. 19-38).New York, NY: Routledge.
- Lemke, T. (2011). Critique and Experience in Foucault. *Theory, Culture & Society,* 28(4), 26-48. DOI:10.1177/0263276411404907

- Levin, D. M. (2000). Transpersonal phenomenology: The corporeal schema. *The Humanist Psychologist*, 28(1), 275-317.
- Lewis, T.E. (2013). On Study: Giorgio Agamben and educational potentiality. (Vol. 83). Routledge.
- Liljedahl, P. (2004) The AHA! Experience: Mathematical Contexts, Pedagogical Implications. Unpublished Dissertation. Simon Fraser University. Burnaby, BC. Available http://www.peterliljedahl.com/wp-content/uploads/Thesis.pdf last accessed October 11, 2017.
- Macy, J. & Brown, M.Y. (2008). *Coming Back to Life.* Gabriola Island, BC: New Society.
- Mariechild, D. (1981). *Mother wit*. Trumansburg, NY: The Crossing Press.
- Manyimo, E.L. & Ritskes, E.J. (2011). Conclusion: Extending the Dialogue. In N.N. Wane, E.L. Manyimo, & E.J. Ritskes, (Eds.), *Spirituality, Education & Society: An Integrated Approach*, (pp. 235-238). Rotterdam: Sense.
- McKeever, Sean and Michael Ridge (2015). Obvious Objections in S.G. Chappell (Ed.), *Intuition, Theory, and Anti-theory in Ethics.* (pp. 40-53). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- McKenna, T. (1991). The Archaic Revival. New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Mclean, S. (2014). Learning on the margins of adult education: Self-help reading about health, relationships, and career success. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 46(1), 4-22.
- Meyer, E. J. (2011). Critical Ontology and Teacher Agency. In K. Hayes, S. Steinberg, & K. Tobin (Eds.). *Key Work in Critical Pedagogy: Joe L. Kincheloe*. (pp. 219-226). Sense
- Mezirow, J. (1997) Transformative Learning: Theory to Practice. In P. Cranton (ed.), *Transformative Learning in Action: Insights from Practice.* New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, no. 74. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Midgely, M. (2003) The Myths We Live By. Taylor & Francis.
- Miller, J. P. (1994). The Contemplative Practitioner. Toronto, ON: OISE Press.
- Moore, T. (2005). Educating for the Soul. In J.P. Miller et al (Eds.), *Holistic Learning* and Spirituality in Education (pp. 9-15). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Morrell, A. & O'Connor, M.A. (2002). Introduction. In E.O'Sullivan, A. Morrell, & M.A. O'Connor, (Eds.), *Expanding the Boundaries of Transformative Learning*.(pp. xv-xx). New York, NY: Springer.
- Mott, V.W. (1994). A Phenomenological Inquiry into the Role of Intuition in Reflective Adult Education Practice. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Georgia, Athens, GA.
- Muir, S. (2007). The Good of New Age Goods. Culture and Religion, 8(3), 233-253.

- Naparstek, B. (1997). Your Sixth Sense. San Francisco, CA: Harper.
- Nehemas, A. (1998). *The Art of Living.* Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press.
- Noddings, N. & P.J. Shore. (1984). *Awakening the Inner Eye: Intuition in Education*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Oliver, D., & Gershman, K. (1989). Education, modernity, and fractured meaning: Toward a process theory of teaching and learning / Donald W. Oliver with the assistance of Kathleen Waldron Gershman. Albany, NY: SUNY.
- Orloff, J. (1996). Second Sight. New York, NY: Warner Books.
- Ornstein, R.E. (1972). *The Psychology of Consciousness.* San Francisco, CA: W.H.Freeman.
- O'Sullivan, E. (1999). *Transformative Learning: Educational Vision for the 21*<sup>st</sup> *Century.* Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press.
- O'Sullivan, E. (2005). Emancipatory Hope. In J.P. Miller, S. Kartsten, D. Denton, D. Orr, I. Colalillo-Kates (Eds), *Holistic Learning and Spirituality in Education*, (pp. 70-78). Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Osberg, D. Biesta, G., & Cilliers, P. (2008). From Representation to Emergence: Complexity's challenge to the epistemology of schooling. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 40(1), 213-227.
- Owens, C.M. (1992). Zen Buddhism. In C.T. Tart (Ed.), *Transpersonal Psychologies* (pp. 153-202). New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Palmer, P.J. (1993). To Know as We Are Known. New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Palmer, P.J. (1998). The Courage to Teach. New York, NY: Jossey-Bass
- Palmer, W. (1994). The Intuitive Body. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books.
- Paras, E. (2006). Foucault 2.0. New York: Other Press.
- PEAR (2010). Experimental Research. http://www.princeton.edu/~pear/experiments.html. Last accessed July 1, 2017.
- Pearce, J. C. (1992). Evolution's End: Claiming the Potential of Our Intelligence. San Francisco, CA: Harper.
- Peirce, P. (1997). The Intuitive Way. Hillsboro, OR: Beyond Worlds.
- Petitmengon-Peugot, C. (1999). The Intuitive Experience. In F. J. Varela and J.Shear (Eds.), *The View From Within: First-person approaches to the study of consciousness* (pp. 43-77). Thorverton, UK: Imprint Academic.
- Pineault, A. (1997). Sacred Land Sacred Stories: The Territorial Dimensions of Intuition. In R. David-Floyd and P.S. Arvidson (Eds.), *Intuition: the inside* story, (pp. 57-80). New York, NY: Routledge.

- Polanyi, M. (1969). *Knowing and Being: Essays by Michael Polanyi* In M. Grene, (Ed). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Redden, G. (2002). The new agents: personal transfiguration and radical privatization in New Age self-help. *Journal of Consumer Culture*. 2(33), 33-52.
- Rew, L & Barrow Jr., E M. (2007). State of the Science Intuition in Nursing, a Generation of Studying the Phenomenon. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 30(1), pp. E15–E25.
- Rich, A. (1979). Women and Honor: Some Notes on Lying. in *On Lies, Secrets & Silence: Selected Prose*. pp 185-194. New York: Norton & Co.
- Rindfleish, J. (2005). Consuming the Self: New Age Spirituality as "Social Product" in Consumer Society. *Consumption Markets & Culture*, 8(4), 343-360.
- Rorty, Richard. (2006). Intuition. In Donald M. Borchert. (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Philosophy.*. Vol. 4. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Detroit: Macmillan Reference USA. (pp. 722-732).
- Rowe, N. & Braud, W. (2013). Transpersonal Education. In H.L. Friedman & G. Hartelius, (Eds.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Handbook of Transpersonal Psychology.* (pp.666-687). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Sadler-Smith, E. (2008). *Inside Intuition*. New York: Routlege.
- Sadler-Smith, E. & Burke, L. (2009). Fostering Intuition in Management Education. *Journal of Management Education*, 33(2), 239-262.
- Salk, J. (1983). *Anatomy of Reality: Merging of Intuition and Reason*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Schulz, M. L. (1998). Awakening Intuition. New York: Three Rivers Press.
- Sheldrake, R. (2003). The Sense of Being Stared At. London, UK: Random House.
- Shepherd, P. (2010). New Self, New World. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic.
- Sinclair and Ashkenasy. "Intuition: Myth or a Decision-making Tool?" *Management Learning*, vol. 36, no. 3, 2005, pp. 353–370.
- Stanley, L. & Wise, S. (1993). *Breaking Out Again*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Starhawk. (1988). *Dreaming the Dark: Magic, Sex and Politics*. Boston, MA; Beacon Press.
- Starker, S. (1989). Oracle at the Supermarket: The American Preoccupation With Self-Help Books. Oxford: Transaction.
- Tart, C. T. (1975). 'Introduction' in C.T. Tart (Ed.), *Transpersonal Psychologies* (pp. 3-7). New York: Harper & Row.

- Tillmanns, M. daVenza. (2017). 'Children, Intuitive Knowledge & Philosophy' *Philosophy Now.* Issue 119, April/May 2017. https://philosophynow.org/issues/119/Children\_Intuitive\_Knowledge\_and\_Philosophy
- Vaughan, F. E. (1979). Awakening Intuition. New York: Anchor Books.
- Vermersch, P. (1999). Introspection as Practice. In F. J. Varela and J.Shear (Eds), *The View From Within: First-person approaches to the study of consciousness* (pp. 17-42). Thorverton, UK: Imprint Academic.
- Waks, L. (2006). Intuition in Education: Teaching and Learning Without Thinking. *Philosophy of Education 2006,* 376-378.
- Watts, A. (1966). *The Book: On the Taboo Against Knowing who you are.* New York, NY: Pantheon.
- Woodward, M. (2013). Being Through Painting and Weaving: A Brief Commentary on Intuition. Transtechnology Research Reader 2012/13 Plymouth, UK. ISBN 978-0-9538332-3-8
- Zohar, D. (1991). The Quantum Self. London, UK: Flamingo.

# **Appendix A. List of Intuition Development Guidebooks**

This is a complete listing of the selection of 'intuition development guidebooks' that were used in the research.

- Butler, W.E. (1978). How to Read the Aura, Practice Psychometry, Telepathy and Clairvoyance. New York, NY: Warner Destiny.
- Chase, J. (1960) You Can Change Your Life Through Psychic Power. New York, NY: Pocket Books.
- Choquette, S. (2004). Trust Your Vibes: Secret Tools for Six-Sensory Living. Carlsbad, CA: Hay House.
- Choquette, S. (2007). The Intuitive Spark: Bringing Inuition Home to Your Child, Your Family, and You. Carslbad, CA: Hay House.
- Choquette, S. (2013). Tune In: let your intuition guide you to fulfillment and flow. Carlsbad, CA: Hay House.
- Day, L. (1996). Practical Intuition. New York, NY: Villard.
- Gawain, S. (2000). Developing Intuition. Novato, CA: New World Library.
- Gee, J. (1999). Intuition: Awakening Your Inner Guide. Boston, MA: Weiser Books.
- Mariechild, D. (1981). *Mother wit*. Trumansburg, NY: The Crossing Press.
- Naparstek, B. (1997). Your Sixth Sense. San Francisco, CA: Harper.
- Orloff, J. (1996). Second Sight. New York, NY: Warner Books.
- Palmer, W. (1994). The Intuitive Body. Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books.
- Peirce, P. (1997). The Intuitive Way. Hillsboro, OR: Beyond Worlds.
- Schulz, M. L. (1998). Awakening Intuition. New York: Three Rivers Press.
- Vaughan, F. E. (1979). Awakening Intuition. New York: Anchor Books.

# Appendix B. Guidebooks' Directions for Meditation

This selection of excerpts from New Age self-help, intuition development guidebooks are included here to give the reader a sense of the contemplative directives the books recommend as part of intuitive development practice.

# Daily Ritual: Peel the Onion

Tuning in to your deepest knowing is like peeling away the layers of an onion. Each layer represents what is not your authentic and true Self. Practice connected breathing and visualize what might make up your layers. Your outer layer might be anger or anxiety, for example. Peel it away with your breath. Maybe the next layer is control or frustration. Again, breathe deeply and peel that away, as well. The next layer might be confusion or fear. Continue peeling away each layer of negative energy that's occupying your mind – one at a time – until you reach your heart, your Spirit.

The layers might peel off quickly, or they might barely budge. Don't worry about it – just notice where the layers stick and whether it's a thought, feeling, belief or old pattern controlling you at the moment. When you hit a block, sit with it, breathe into it, and observe it nonjudgmentally. Pay attention to the energy and how it controls you. Notice how your thought pattern feels, too. Your ego keeps you stuck in patterns that cause energetic contractions, inhibiting your breathing and interrupting the flow of life. Watch these patterns as you continue gently breathing.

(Choquette, 2013, p. 86)

## **Utilizing Our Breath**

Many meditation practices and relaxation techniques utilize the breath as a way to focus attention. The part of the breath that we focus on in basic practice is the exhale. We use the exhale to direct our attention down to either the *hara*, a point in the center of the belly two or three inches below the navel, or toward the center of the earth. Making an audible exhale and sustaining it for as long as possible makes this experience interesting enough to hold our attention. With our imagination we can enhance our interest in the experience. For example, using visualization, we could imagine a sun in our belly, and when we breathe into our belly the sun begins to glow brighter.

(Palmer, 1994, p. 23)

## Six Sensory Practice

This week, protect yourself energetically by consciously creating good vibes. Speak positively to yourself and others, and recognize who and what feels good. Pay close attention to the energy around you at all times. Remember not to take any negative vibration or energy personally – simply refuse to be harmed by someone else's missed opportunity to love. Shield yourself with positive, loving energy, and stop any unpleasant energy with intention. And know that if the vibes are really bad, you can always freeze them.

(Choquette, 2004 p. 70)

## Sacred Healing Power of Presence and Silence

The intuitive state is above all, a state of inner presence and silence. Entering into communion with ourselves, with our deepness, and with our truth, we can simply be. In this emptiness of inner silence, we find peace and, paradoxically, the fullness of the plenitude of our being. From a state of inner presence, we commune with nature, with light, and with the universe. We can enter into communion with the deepness of another and reflect back to them the truth of how we perceive them in their deepness. When we give an intuitive reading, words are the tools we use to communicate the perceptions we receive on an intuitive level. Words have a tremendous power and, thanks to them, we can share our perceptions. But we must also remember the power of silence, the power of atmosphere, and the power of presence as healing tools.

(Gee, 1999, p.210)

After about a month, suddenly, while meditating in class, something shifted. I don't know how or why. I hadn't really done anything different. With our neighbors belting out a particularly soulful "Rock of Ages," I tried to ignore my irritation and closed my eyes. As usual, my thoughts chimed in on cue and started blaring with the intensity of a loud radio in a tiny room. I guess I finally just tuned it all out. I's hashed over the same conversations in my mind so many times, but now the relentless jabbering became like white noise. I couldn't hear it or the music anymore. Instead there was stillness, a feeling of tranquility – my first taste of the comfort meditation could bring.

(Orloff, 1996, p. 175)

#### Visualization of Geometric Forms

Close your eyes and imagine that you are drawing a circle on a blackboard with white chalk. Make a white dot in the middle of the circle. Imagine that the image of the

white circle with a dot in the middle on a black background is suspended at the level of your eyebrows, about a foot away, in front of you. Hold it in your mind's eye for three minutes. Hold it perfectly still. Repeat this exercise using an equal armed cross or plus sign in place of the circle. Again imagine the cross to be white on a black background. If you have difficulty imagining it at first, imagine again that you are drawing it on a blackboard with white chalk. Hold the image for three minutes. Repeat the exercise once more, using an equilateral triangle in place of the circle and the cross. Again visualize the figure in white on a black background, as if you had drawn it on a blackboard, and hold it still.

(Vaughan, 1979, p. 20)

### Quick Intuitive Check In Meditation

Close your eyes and take a deep breath, exhaling slowly. Notice what's on your mind, what you've been thinking about. Notice how your body is feeling right now. How are you feeling emotionally? Do you feel like you are more or less "in the flow," following your own energy, or do you feel stressed, conflicted, out of sorts?

Take another deep breath, exhale slowly and let your awareness move into a deep place inside. Is there anything that you need to pay attention to that would help you feel more connected to yourself? Any gut feeling you need to be aware of? Whether or not you get any specific information or awareness, enjoy a moment of rest before you carry on.

(Gawain, 2000, p. 66)