

Sex Trafficking Discourse and the 2010 Olympic Games

by

Dalia Vukmirovich

B.A., Simon Fraser University, 2002

Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Arts

in the

Department of Sociology and Anthropology
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

© **Dalia Vukmirovich 2013**

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY

Summer 2013

All rights reserved.

However, in accordance with the *Copyright Act of Canada*, this work may be reproduced, without authorization, under the conditions for "Fair Dealing." Therefore, limited reproduction of this work for the purposes of private study, research, criticism, review and news reporting is likely to be in accordance with the law, particularly if cited appropriately.

Approval

Name: Dalia Vukmirovich
Degree: Master of Arts
Title of Thesis: *Sex Trafficking discourse
and the 2010 Olympic Games*

Examining Committee:

Chair: Dr. Cindy Patton, Professor of Sociology & Anthropology

Dr. Wendy Chan
Senior Supervisor
Professor of Sociology

Dr. Robert Menzies
Supervisor
Professor of Sociology

Dr. Sheri Fabian
External Examiner
Senior Lecturer, School of Criminology
Simon Fraser University

Date Defended/Approved: August 14, 2013

Partial Copyright Licence



The author, whose copyright is declared on the title page of this work, has granted to Simon Fraser University the right to lend this thesis, project or extended essay to users of the Simon Fraser University Library, and to make partial or single copies only for such users or in response to a request from the library of any other university, or other educational institution, on its own behalf or for one of its users.

The author has further granted permission to Simon Fraser University to keep or make a digital copy for use in its circulating collection (currently available to the public at the "Institutional Repository" link of the SFU Library website (www.lib.sfu.ca) at <http://summit/sfu.ca> and, without changing the content, to translate the thesis/project or extended essays, if technically possible, to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation of the digital work.

The author has further agreed that permission for multiple copying of this work for scholarly purposes may be granted by either the author or the Dean of Graduate Studies.

It is understood that copying or publication of this work for financial gain shall not be allowed without the author's written permission.

Permission for public performance, or limited permission for private scholarly use, of any multimedia materials forming part of this work, may have been granted by the author. This information may be found on the separately catalogued multimedia material and in the signed Partial Copyright Licence.

While licensing SFU to permit the above uses, the author retains copyright in the thesis, project or extended essays, including the right to change the work for subsequent purposes, including editing and publishing the work in whole or in part, and licensing other parties, as the author may desire.

The original Partial Copyright Licence attesting to these terms, and signed by this author, may be found in the original bound copy of this work, retained in the Simon Fraser University Archive.

Simon Fraser University Library
Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

revised Fall 2011

Ethics Statement



The author, whose name appears on the title page of this work, has obtained, for the research described in this work, either:

- a. human research ethics approval from the Simon Fraser University Office of Research Ethics,

or

- b. advance approval of the animal care protocol from the University Animal Care Committee of Simon Fraser University;

or has conducted the research

- c. as a co-investigator, collaborator or research assistant in a research project approved in advance,

or

- d. as a member of a course approved in advance for minimal risk human research, by the Office of Research Ethics.

A copy of the approval letter has been filed at the Theses Office of the University Library at the time of submission of this thesis or project.

The original application for approval and letter of approval are filed with the relevant offices. Inquiries may be directed to those authorities.

Simon Fraser University Library
Burnaby, British Columbia, Canada

update Spring 2010

Abstract

This thesis looks at how sex trafficking was constructed as a social problem by certain groups in the context of the 2010 Winter Olympics held in Vancouver, and examines what effects the Games were perceived to have on issues related to sex trafficking. The study is conducted as a qualitative, two-phase sequential multi-method project. Using participant observation and interview data, I argue that the concerns about sex trafficking were raised to problematize the male demand for commercial sex and call for abolition of prostitution in Canada through adoption of the Nordic legal model, which criminalizes those who purchase sex and decriminalizes those who sell it. While there has been no evidence to suggest that sex trafficking was an issue during the Olympics, the raising of the related concerns had important consequences. It shifted the understanding of prostitution toward that of sex trafficking, while relying on a discourse reflective of ideological positions that see women in the sex trade as victims who need to be protected.

Keywords: Sex trafficking discourse; social construction of social problems theory; sex work

For my grandmother, Milica – I am happy that I got to write some of this in your presence, after our morning coffee and a game of cards.

Acknowledgements

To everyone who took part in this project – thank you for your generosity in taking the time to talk with me and for what you taught me.

I would like to thank my supervisors, Dr. Wendy Chan and Dr. Bob Menzies, for your guidance, all your suggestions and for seeing me through to the end. Wendy, thank you for your trust and your patience. Bob, I much appreciate your enthusiasm for knowledge and your encouragement. To my external examiner, Dr. Sheri Fabian, I am happy you were a part of the process and deeply appreciate your interest in this project.

Dr. John Lowman – thank you for everything, including how you approach what you do, for getting me started with the puzzles and for answering my bird questions. Chris Atchison – thank you kindly for your generous friendship, your mentorship and your willingness to listen.

My gratitude goes to everyone who played a part in various aspects of this project, including helping me get to the finish line: Elysha Cohen and Renee Anne McCallum; my peers, especially Colin, Essya, Yuval, Kevin, Natalie and Julie; my family and friends for all your love – especially my sister Ina, my parents (mom, thank you for all your help), my cousin Tatjana, and Angela, Emme and Maja for previewing the presentation; Lisa, Vinetta and the Rhizome Cafe; everyone in the reading group; Dr. Ted Palys, for your care and inspiring my interest in research; Dr. Fernando De Maio, Dr. Dorothy Chunn, Dr. Michael Hathaway and Dr. Noel Dyck for your support, training, and guidance; my first mentor, Jay Hirabayashi, for what you taught me, and Barbara Bourget for your encouragement; Dr. Margaret Jackson, Deena Coburn, Joan Byron and Donna Robertson for being how you are and for how you care; Martin and HP for being there in big and small ways, in good and bad moments, and pushing me to go beyond.

Thank you to the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council and Simon Fraser University for their support of this research.

Table of Contents

Approval.....	ii
Partial Copyright Licence	iii
Abstract.....	iv
Dedication.....	v
Acknowledgements	vi
Table of Contents.....	vii
1. Introduction	1
2. Sex Trafficking in the Literature	5
2.1. Prostitution, feminism and human rights.....	5
2.1.1. Radical feminism and abolition of prostitution.....	6
2.1.2. Sex worker rights activism and liberal 'sex worker rights' feminism	8
2.1.3. Feminism and human rights	11
2.2. Crime and state security.....	14
2.2.1. Crime and human rights.....	14
2.2.2. State security and border control.....	18
2.3. Migration, histories and other contexts – looking beyond the 'prostitution dichotomy'	21
2.4. Sex trafficking research	25
2.5. Conclusion	27
3. Theoretical orientation and research methodology	29
3.1. Theoretical Orientation	30
3.1.1. Social Construction of Social Problems, Discourse and Ideology	30
3.1.2. Consequences of Discussions and Feminist Theory	37
3.2. Research Methodology.....	39
3.2.1. Research Questions.....	40
3.2.2. Research Strategy	41
3.2.3. Methods	41
3.2.4. Sampling and Recruitment.....	43
3.2.5. Data Analysis	44
3.2.6. Reflexivity	47
3.2.7. Ethical Considerations	48
3.3. Conclusion	49
4. Construction of sex trafficking as a social problem in the context of the 2010 Winter Olympics	50
4.1. Concerns about sex trafficking and the 2010 Winter Olympics	51
4.2. Addressing sex trafficking.....	60
4.2.1. Calling for public and government response	61
4.2.2. Prostitution and sex trafficking – establishing the relationship	63
4.2.3. Raising awareness through alliances	66
4.3. Conclusion	70

5. Sex trafficking and the 2010 Winter Olympics: Looking at the impact	71
5.1. What 'impact'? Looking beyond quantitative measures.....	71
5.2. Mobilization of organizations around sex trafficking	76
5.2.1. Educating about sex trafficking	77
5.2.2. Addressing trafficking in one's work	78
5.2.3. Forming alliances and looking to experts	81
5.3. Protection of women, prevention of trafficking	88
5.3.1. Women as victims.....	89
5.3.2. Protecting women	91
5.3.3. What about other stories?	94
5.4. Conclusion	101
6. Conclusion	104
6.1. Conclusions.....	104
6.2. Research Limitations	110
6.3. Research Significance.....	111
References	115
Appendices	128
Appendix A. Key Terms.....	129
Appendix B. Research Log	131
Appendix C. Interview Guide	133

1. Introduction

Prior to the 2010 Winter Olympics held in Vancouver, sex trafficking started to emerge publically and politically as a topic of discussion in relation to the Games. Some individuals and organizations raised concerns about the possibility of sex trafficking becoming an issue. These concerns rested on the assumption that there was a risk of an increase in the demand for prostitution, and that this demand could, at least in part, be met by trafficking individuals into the sex trade¹ (The Future Group, 2007). Other individuals and organizations questioned these claims, pointing to the lack of evidence that would suggest that a relationship between large-scale sporting events and sex trafficking exists (Bowen & Shannon Frontline Consulting, 2009). Instead, some argued that because of the uncertainty of the impact of hosting such an event, other concerns – particularly around the safety of local sex trade workers – should still be recognized and addressed (Bowen & Shannon Frontline Consulting, 2009). Overall, however, it was the issue of sex trafficking that received the most attention prior to the 2010 Olympics. One of the most visible ways in which these concerns were raised was in public forums held prior to and during the Games. These events were specifically advertised as a way of raising attention about sex trafficking in the context of the 2010 Olympics.

This thesis focuses on the discussions about sex trafficking and the 2010 Olympics. Two central research questions guide this project. First, the study looks at what concerns were raised about sex trafficking in the context of the Games. Second, this study examines what effects the 2010 Olympics had on issues related to sex trafficking.

¹ Please see Appendix A for definitions of 'trafficking' and 'prostitution' used in this thesis.

The discussions about sex trafficking prior to the 2010 Games were not the first to occur – other similar conversations have been held elsewhere when large-scale sporting events are being planned. Like the discussions in Vancouver, similar concerns have previously been raised about the issue of sex trafficking. Likewise, arguments over whether claims of alleged increases in sex trafficking can be supported by evidence have also been put forth (GAATW, 2011). Central to all these discussions are uncertainty and disagreements over sex trafficking – how it is understood and how large of a problem it presents. Discussions about sex trafficking and large-scale sporting events are tied to conversations about prostitution, with specific attention being paid to the demand for sexual services (GAATW, 2011; Hennig, Craggs, Larsson & Laczko, 2006; The Future Group, 2007). It follows that discussions about sex trafficking and the 2010 Olympics in Vancouver should also be considered within the context of ongoing conversations about prostitution, including those about prostitution law in Canada. Historically, debates about prostitution in Canada have focused on what prostitution is and how it should be dealt with in law (Lowman, 2011). More recently, calls to decriminalize prostitution, and calls to abolish it by adopting the Nordic legal model² have emerged as the two main positions in these discussions (Lepp, 2010; Lowman, 2011).

In this thesis I examine how sex trafficking was constructed as a social problem in the context of the Olympics. Specifically, I look at the claims that were made about sex trafficking, and the claims-making activities that were undertaken to bring this issue to public and political attention. In addition to the social construction of social problems theory, the discussion in this thesis relies on the concepts of 'ideology' and 'discourse'. The emphasis is placed on recognizing processes of how knowledge about a social problem is created, and the political positions and aims that underlie interests and actions of different stakeholders who are involved. Taking this perspective recognizes that there are different ways of understanding a social issue. There are also different

² The Nordic model of prostitution law was first adopted in Sweden in 1999, and later in Norway and Iceland. It criminalizes the buying of sex as well as third party involvement, but not the selling of sex (Lowman, 2011).

political and other interests invested in these various positions which then compete to be recognized as 'true' (Weedon, 1992). A position that is accepted as the 'truth' shapes how something is known and understood, eventually informing how a social problem is addressed and dealt with. Responses to the social problem can take the form of policies, laws, and regulations, which have the power to shape, regulate, govern, and in other ways have tangible consequences on people's daily lives.

The thesis starts by recognizing that there are different ways in which experiences of sex trafficking and related situations can be understood and explained. The work of scholars and researchers reflects a diverse range of perspectives on this issue. In some cases, these different perspectives are compatible and may overlap with one another. There have also been disagreements over the issue, particularly with regard to the potentially damaging effects of specific ways of understanding and addressing sex trafficking.

Despite the diversity in how sex trafficking is understood, there is one dominant approach that is the most visible and the most commonly available account of this issue. This approach describes sex trafficking experiences by emphasizing portrayals of brutality, illustrated by personal stories of female victims of this violence. The often graphic nature of these accounts makes it difficult for their audiences to stay unaffected and unmoved (Doezema, 2010). In this way, detailed descriptions of sex trafficking cases expressed through this discourse can play a significant role in the decision by individuals to get involved in anti-trafficking activist work (Cizmar, Conklin & Hinman, 2011; see also discussion in Perrin, 2010). By doing so, these individuals also accept these accounts as the 'true' representation of sex trafficking. While different perspectives on sex trafficking exist, not much focus has been placed on looking at how knowledge around this issue gets constructed. In other words, less attention has been paid to the processes and reasons for one position becoming accepted as the truth and, in turn, informing public opinion, and related responses, laws and policies (Doezema, 2010).

Drawing on the work by Doezema (2010) and Flyvbjerg (2001), this research acknowledges the importance of considering and examining processes through which the issue of sex trafficking comes to be understood and dealt with as a social problem. This is done by looking at a particular set of discussions that were happening around sex

trafficking at a specific place and time – in the context of Vancouver's hosting of the 2010 Olympic Games. The research pays attention to the ways in which concerns about sex trafficking can also become tied to discussions about prostitution. As such, these conversations can also have the power to shift how prostitution is understood. The research recognizes that discussions about sex trafficking can lead to tangible consequences in people's lives, particularly lives of individuals who work in the sex trade. As discussions about sex trafficking tend to focus their concern on racialised and/or non-Western women, it is these women who are likely to be impacted the most by these discussions.

This study is conducted as a qualitative, two-phase sequential multi-method project. The first question, or the first phase of the research, is addressed by relying primarily on participant observation data. The second question, or the second phase of the research, examines the notion of 'impact' by considering perspectives of individuals and organizations that work around issues related to sex trafficking as well as the sex trade in the metro Vancouver area. This latter question is addressed enlisting data from semi-structured interviews. The data used in this project were collected between 2009 and 2011. Most of the participant observation data referred to in the subsequent chapters were collected prior to the Olympics, while the interviews were conducted about a year after the Games in Vancouver took place. Additional data used and referred to in this thesis were collected throughout the project. They are mostly used as a way of triangulating, or simply better understanding, the complexities around the subject of sex trafficking and related discussions and activities.

This thesis is organized into six chapters. Following this introduction is Chapter 2 which offers an overview of the literature on sex trafficking. Chapter 3 outlines the theoretical orientation and the research methodology used in this project. Chapters 4 and 5 present the findings of the research: Chapter 4 looks at how sex trafficking was constructed as a social problem in the context of the 2010 Olympic Games. Chapter 5 examines the impact of Vancouver's hosting of the Games on issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade. Finally, Chapter 6 offers a conclusion to the thesis.

2. Sex Trafficking in the Literature

The existing research on sex trafficking challenges the commonly-available understanding of this problem. Specifically, it questions the notion that sex trafficking is an unambiguous issue, where the victims and the perpetrators are clearly identifiable (Doezema, 2010). Differing perspectives come mainly from the fact that not everyone agrees on the nature and the magnitude of the problem. Scholars have noted that efforts by governments and non-governmental organizations to deal with sex trafficking as an issue are complicated by these uncertainties, disagreements and the various ways of understanding what is taking place (Aromaa, 2007; Doezema, 2010; Monzini, 2005). Recognizing that sex trafficking can be viewed from different perspectives is important for how we study and address the issue (Aradau, 2007; Lee, 2011).

Scholars have noted that research on sex trafficking tends to adopt one of several perspectives. These points of view are not necessarily distinct from one another, nor are they static – they can overlap, shift in meaning, coexist or they can be incompatible with one another (Lee, 2011). As such, it is not surprising to find that different scholars identify, understand and describe the various approaches to sex trafficking using slightly different categories (e.g. Aradau, 2007; Lee, 2011). In reviewing the literature on this subject, this chapter examines sex trafficking in the following ways: as a feminist concern that is tied to the issue of prostitution, as a crime, and as an issue that needs to be considered within its wider contexts – through processes of migration, as well as local and global historical changes. In closing, this chapter examines how these different perspectives inform and shape sex trafficking research.

2.1. Prostitution, feminism and human rights

Contemporary mainstream concern over sex trafficking, often expressed as a human rights issue, has its roots in feminist conversations about prostitution.

Discussions about sex trafficking are connected to the expressed concerns about women's experiences in the sex trade, particularly around women's safety and wellbeing. Internationally, feminist concerns have been focused on the issue of violence, especially sexual violence. At the centre of these concerns are the concepts of 'choice' and 'consent'. Feminist work has used and applied these two concepts specifically in relation to women's bodies, reproductive rights and health, including discussions about women's involvement in the sex trade (Doezema, 2010).

The different feminist perspectives on the sex trade are said to be at the core of disagreements over how sex trafficking is understood and how it should be addressed (Jeffreys, 1997; Monzini, 2005). Within feminist work there are different opinions on how to apply 'choice' and 'consent' in relation to prostitution. The main positions that are often cited in discussions about the sex trade – and by extension, sex trafficking – are the radical feminist perspective, and the position connected to liberal feminism (see discussions in Doezema, 2010; Lowman, 2011). The first position tends to see prostitution as inherently harmful and calls for it to be abolished. The second perspective calls for prostitution to be seen as a form of work which a woman can, and sometimes does, choose. While the latter feminist perspective draws from the work of sex worker rights activists across the world, the understandings and interests of these two positions are not always the same. The overlap and the differences between the liberal feminist, radical feminist and sex worker rights activist positions have shaped international definitions and guidelines on trafficking in very significant ways (Doezema, 2010).

2.1.1. *Radical feminism and abolition of prostitution*

The radical feminist perspective views prostitution as inherently harmful. As such, this perspective considers it impossible for women to truly choose or consent to being involved in prostitution (see discussions in Doezema, 2010; Lowman, 2011). This notion is rooted in an understanding of sexuality as the focus of gender inequality – a view where sexuality is thought to be a realm of male power over women, and as such is understood to be oppressive to women (MacKinnon, 1983; Barry, 1995). Assuming that men and women occupy places of unequal power within the sexual sphere, this point of view problematizes sexual relations between men and women (MacKinnon, 1983). From this perspective prostitution is understood to be the ultimate way of exercising male

power over women. It is viewed as a complete reduction of women to a sexualized body for the purpose of fulfilling male sexual demands (Barry, 1984, 1995). Those who take this perspective challenge what they see as the normalization of prostitution and instead believe it is necessary for prostitution to be abolished³.

Scholars coming from the radical feminist point of view see sex trafficking as the expansion of the sex trade to global markets – a process through which global inequalities are incorporated into the sex industry (Jeffreys, 2009). A number of different factors are said to contribute to the trafficking of women from non-Western countries. These include changes to and weakening of local economies affected by globalization, as well as poverty, warfare, and increased military presence in those countries (Barry, 1984; Jeffreys, 1997, 2009). While work coming from the radical feminist perspective acknowledges larger political, economic, and social factors that may contribute to a woman's involvement in the sex trade, it prioritizes gender over all other inequalities⁴ (Jeffreys, 1997). Those who take this perspective place the emphasis on the importance of decreasing male demand for commercial sex and on abolition of prostitution (Jeffreys, 1997, 2009; Leidholdt, 2004).

The above perspective taken on sex trafficking tends to emphasize women's vulnerability and their experiences of violence in the sex trade (see discussion in Aradau, 2004; Agustín, 2007b). It especially highlights experiences of non-Western and/or racialized women. These women are said to be particularly, although not solely, targeted for and vulnerable to being trafficked for sexual purposes (Aghatise, 2004; Ekberg, 2004; Jeffreys, 1997; O'Connor & Healy, 2006; Raymond & Hughes, 2001). They are also often assumed to have experienced past traumatic events, including childhood or domestic abuse, incest, and sexual assault, in addition to the violence they

³ Not all who see prostitution as inherently harmful share the same understanding of sex trafficking or of violence experienced in the sex trade, or take the radical feminist perspective. For example, see work by Julia O'Connell Davidson (1998, 2006).

⁴ Some individuals who take the radical feminist perspective on prostitution, such as Sheila Jeffreys, acknowledge men's involvement in the sex trade as sex sellers. Jeffreys argues that because of gender differences, experiences of men and women in prostitution are inherently different even if they may share some similarities (Jeffreys, 1997).

experience as victims of trafficking (Leidholdt, 2004). As such, these women are seen as victims who are subjected to traumatic situations multiple times – by earlier experiences of abuse as well as by being trafficked (Aradau, 2004).

In accounts of sex trafficking which take the radical feminist perspective, women are understood to be victims of violence and exploitation, while men are assumed to profit either through controlling sex trafficking processes and networks, or through sexual gratification as clients who purchase sex⁵ (Leidholdt, 2004). Male sex buyers are thought to be responsible for violence against women because their continued demand for commercial sex is believed to be driving the need for prostitution and trafficking of women (Jeffreys, 2009).⁶ They are also seen as being responsible for violence towards women more directly: as perpetrators (see discussion in Weitzer, 2007), through their indifference over violence that women experience as trafficked victims, or by buying into ethnic and cultural stereotypes where women providing sexual services are seen as subservient to men in general, and Western men in particular (Jeffreys, 1997).

2.1.2. *Sex worker rights activism and liberal 'sex worker rights' feminism*

Scholars who take the sex worker rights-inspired liberal feminist perspective take a different approach from that of radical feminism when it comes to applying the concepts of 'choice' and 'consent' to understanding the sex trade. The sex worker rights-inspired perspective calls for the need to distinguish between situations of migration for sex work and sex trafficking. It differentiates between women choosing (i.e. consenting)

⁵ Some work also identifies women as being involved in sex trafficking as perpetrators of violence and exploitation. In some of these cases women are said to act as men's assistants (Leidholdt, 2004). They can also play a central role in ethnically-specific sex trafficking systems, such as reportedly do Nigerian madams in Italy (Aghatise, 2004; see also Monzini, 2005). However, the power differences that seem to exist among women in these examples are largely left unaddressed and unexplained.

⁶ While in some discussions that reflect this perspective there is reference to both 'prostitution' and 'sex trafficking', or 'prostituted women' and 'trafficked women' (see e.g. Jeffreys, 2009), it is not always clear whether, and if so how, these terms are distinguished one from another. Others who come from a radical feminist perspective explicitly state that prostitution and trafficking are not distinguishable one from another (e.g. Ekberg, 2004)

to work in the sex trade, and cases where consent is not given because of the presence of coercion, deception, or force (Doezema, 2010). Where sex work is chosen or consented to concerns over violence, safety and wellbeing of individuals who sell sex tend to be expressed as concerns over conditions of labour. Rights of individuals who sell sex are recognized as sex *worker* rights. Those who take this perspective argue for the need to assume a position that deals with and reduces the harms associated with working in the sex trade. This includes addressing the stigma that society attaches to women who sell sex (Monzini, 2005; O'Neill, 2003). Some scholars who take this perspective challenge the mainstream understanding of sex trafficking by pointing out that research has shown "that it is sex workers rather than 'coerced innocents' that form the majority of this 'traffic'" (Doezema, 2010, p. 8).

This point of view has shown that sex sellers deal with issues and situations that are more complex than what is portrayed in commonly available narratives of sex trafficking. For example, taking a sex worker rights perspective, Leyla Gulcur and Pinar Ilkkaracan (2002) suggest that the 'whore stigma,' imposed by the general society on women who sell sex,⁷ combined with ethnic and sexist stereotypes, contributes to violence that is experienced by migrant women from the former Soviet Union living in Turkey. Gulcur and Ilkkaracan argue that through the 'Natasha discourse' present in media and public discussions, women from the former Soviet Union living in Turkey have become labelled as 'Natashas' – women assumed to be sexually available. Foreign women in Turkey have been assumed to be responsible for an increase in sexually transmitted infections and HIV/AIDS, and have been the object of several community-level initiatives aimed at banning migrant women from their cities. Respondents in Gulcur and Ilkkaracan's research speak both of an increased financial and personal freedom that sex work makes available to them, as well as the harm and stress that can come from clients in the form of physical violence, and refusal to wear condoms or pay

⁷ 'Whore stigma' refers to the threat and impact of labels such as 'prostitution', 'prostitute' and 'whore' on a woman's reputation. Gail Pheterson argues that 'whore stigma' serves to restrict female behaviour and freedoms by punishing or threatening to punish behaviour seen as inappropriate to women but otherwise available to men, like risk-taking, and control over one's sexuality, mobility and economic decision-making (Pheterson, 1996).

for received sexual services. Women's well-being is further compromised by violence or threats of violence from the police, local communities and businesses, as well as by challenges presented by the illegality of undocumented sex workers in Turkey. The latter restricts their rights and affects basic needs, like the ability to open a bank account or find adequate housing (Gulcur & Ilkcaracan, 2002).

The liberal feminist position on prostitution as 'sex work' is not necessarily the same as the position that incorporates experiences, understandings, and interests reflected in the work of sex worker rights activists. Doezema (2010) explores some of these differences in her discussion of the negotiations around the United Nations protocol on trafficking, which will be examined in more detail below.

While discussions about prostitution often revolve around 'choice' and 'consent', some scholars have cautioned against relying on them to separate voluntary from forced prostitution. On the one hand, 'choice' and 'consent' have been used as important concepts around which to argue for the rights of sex workers to be recognized (Doezema, 2010). At the same time, a number of concerns have been raised about this approach. One concern is that the idea of 'consent' may be invoked to distinguish between women worthy of protection from those who are not (Doezema, 2010). Recognizing that a woman has consented to selling sex may be used by the state as a reason to absolve itself from the responsibility of offering or guaranteeing protection, such as in cases where working conditions are exploitative, dangerous or otherwise poor (O'Connell Davidson, 2006). Others have pointed out that there are always various social constraints on one's free choice. These constraints also raise the question about how best to determine whether one's choice is truly 'free'. Discussions organized around 'choice' tend to prioritize choices of Western women who live in societies established and maintained at the expense of other nations – including the women who inhabit them. Lastly, speaking of a women's 'choice' to engage in sex work becomes irrelevant in cases where sex work is understood to be inherently harmful, as it is by those who call for its abolition (Doezema, 2010).

Implicit in the meaning of 'consent' are gender stereotypes that show men's sexuality as active, while women's sexuality – understood as passive – requires them to consent to sex. Under liberal feminism, sexuality is still imagined as a realm of violence

against women. Relying on the concept of 'consent' asks that potential cases of trafficking be assessed based on whether a woman has consented to sex (Doezema, 2010). This position ignores other violations a woman might experience despite having agreed to sex. As O'Connell Davidson argues, it is difficult to assess what these violations are without having a baseline understanding – one that goes beyond 'choice' or 'consent' – of what working arrangements and conditions are acceptable (O'Connell Davidson, 2006). Understandings about sex trafficking that focus on 'consent', along with their implicit gender assumptions of women as victims, omit or treat as less significant violations experienced by men. They could also be used to exclude transgender and transsexual individuals, and those of other gender identities (Doezema, 2010).

Several collections of research and writing, such as those by Kempadoo and Doezema (1998) and Kempadoo (1999, 2005), focus on sex worker rights initiatives, including political activism and social justice movements taking place internationally (Kempadoo, 1998). This work compares and contrasts various experiences of sex sellers, emphasizing the importance of understanding these experiences within their social, cultural and historical contexts, and in relation to global political economy and governance (Kempadoo, 1999, 2005). At the same time, this work also challenges the privileging of Western experiences within discussions of sexuality, gender, and prostitution/sex work, as well as assumptions that these experiences are universally applicable to all women (Kempadoo, 1998). Some of this work will be further examined later in this chapter.

2.1.3. *Feminism and human rights*

Rather than seeing radical feminist and sex worker rights perspectives in opposition to one another, Doezema (2010) reminds us that much of the influential work around sex worker rights was developed using feminist terms and in conversation with anti-prostitution feminists. This 'conversation' between the two positions is also reflected in the mainstream understanding of sex trafficking, as well as in national and international discussions, politics and policy development around this issue.

Some scholars have noted that sex trafficking became visible as a contemporary international issue because of the global concern over AIDS, as well as an increase in

the strength of the feminist movement which drew attention to the exploitation of women (Wijers and Lap-Chew, 1997). More recently, feminist concerns over sex trafficking have been expressed using the language of 'human rights'. Doezema notes that "in the international policy arena, human rights remains the most prevalent discourse for articulating struggles around oppression and freedom" (Doezema, 2010, p. 20). In other words, framing feminist issues in terms of 'human rights' is the most effective way of ensuring that these concerns will be noticed and addressed at the level of international politics.

Kathleen Barry, the founder of the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW) (Doezema, 2010), points to the political and strategic reasons for taking prostitution, and by extension sex trafficking, to the global level of discussion. She takes a 'feminist international' approach and points to shared experiences among women worldwide. Understanding female subordination, or 'female class condition', from a radical feminist perspective – as an issue of sex power – she sees prostitution as the worst and the most explicit type of sexual exploitation of women by men (Barry, 1995). Understood as such, a focus on addressing or abolishing prostitution becomes centrally important to the struggle against patriarchy. Using the concept of 'human rights', Barry calls for sexual exploitation to be treated as a crime against humanity to be confronted globally (Barry, 1995; Jeffreys, 1997). Under this view, criminal acts which take place in situations of sex trafficking are understood to be primarily committed by exploiters of women in prostitution, which includes individual male sex buyers as well as traffickers. In its focus on the punishment of trafficking, this position tends to emphasize the need for state involvement and reliance on law enforcement to address this issue (Doezema, 2010).

Along with CATW, the Human Rights Caucus (HRC) was one of the major lobby groups involved in negotiations of the United Nations Trafficking Protocol,⁸ also known as the Palermo Protocol. HRC was made up of international non-governmental organizations such as Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women (GAATW), which sees prostitution as work and defines trafficking by the use of force during migration or in labour practices (Doezema, 2010). HRC distinguished between voluntary and forced prostitution, and called for protection of human rights of trafficking victims to be central to the prosecution of trafficking. However, the call for the protection of human rights from the HRC perspective was based on the argument that violence against sex workers occurs primarily at the hands of the state, including the police (Doezema, 2010).

The ways in which prostitution is understood are very important to discussions about sex trafficking (Doezema, 2010). The two main positions on the sex trade, as discussed above, have informed the development and wording of the Palermo Protocol. This document continues to guide national and international understandings and actions around sex trafficking. Different ways of understanding prostitution continue to shape and complicate other related discussions, knowledge and initiatives. They also shape the most common or mainstream perspective, which understands sex trafficking as a crime.

⁸ *The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime* was signed in 2000 in Palermo, Italy by over eighty countries (Doezema, 2010). It defines trafficking as "the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs" (United Nations, 2004, p. 42).

2.2. Crime and state security

A commonly accepted view of sex trafficking portrays it as a growing issue rooted in international and organized crime (Bales & Soodalter, 2009; Lee, 2011). In many accounts, sex trafficking is presented as a serious and a clear-cut problem where perpetrators are assumed to be criminals looking to profit from the sexual exploitation of women and children (Bales & Soodalter, 2009).

At the centre of this approach to sex trafficking are concerns about sex trafficking victims and the violation of their human rights (Stewart & Gajic-Veljanoski, 2005). This approach connects sex trafficking with other aspects of global criminal activity, such as the trafficking of drugs and weapons (Bales & Soodalter, 2009). Discussions about sex trafficking as a criminal issue also link this problem to concerns over illegal migration and security of state borders (Derks, 2000; Aradau, 2004; Lee, 2011). Concerns around sex trafficking and crime can be looked at under several different categories. For example, Maggy Lee has noted that human trafficking has been problematized as a form of modern-day slavery, as a consequence of globalization, as an aspect of transnational organized crime, as well as of illegal immigration (Lee, 2011).

Scholars have noted that when trafficking is defined as a violation of human rights it calls on the state – responsible for protection of these rights in its territory and on behalf of its citizens – to become accountable and responsible for fighting trafficking (Derks, 2000). States have been asked to consider possible threats that potential and actual cases of trafficking pose to their security (Aradau, 2004). Approaching sex trafficking as a criminal issue brings together two distinct points of focus: a humanitarian concern with protecting the human rights of trafficking victims, along with initiatives that aim to ensure state security (Derks, 2000; Aradau, 2004).

2.2.1. *Crime and human rights*

How sex trafficking is commonly understood and addressed in Canada and internationally is informed by stated concerns over human rights violations, crime and state security. This is reflected in agreements, policies, as well as legal and non-legal strategies for dealing with this issue. Criminalization, law enforcement strategies, and

initiatives aimed at immigration control are some of the more common strategies adopted when sex trafficking is seen as a crime problem (Lee, 2011).

The Palermo Protocol reflects this view of sex trafficking as a problem of international crime. The Protocol places primary focus on preventing and combating trafficking, on protecting victims and their human rights, and on using internationally coordinated solutions that prioritize law enforcement strategies. The Palermo Protocol specifically addresses concerns around state security and border control by requiring signatory states to change their national laws to be able to meet the objectives of the Protocol (United Nations, 2004).

As a signatory, Canada has addressed human trafficking in its Criminal Code⁹ and in the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA)¹⁰. Canada's approach to human trafficking is consistent with the priorities set out by the United Nations. Specifically, Canada focuses on prevention and prosecution of trafficking, protection of victims, and reliance on national and international partnerships in addressing this issue (Public Safety Canada, 2012). Individuals found guilty of trafficking can be subjected to fines, imprisonment, surveillance, collection of DNA samples, and entered into the national sex offender registry (Barnett, 2006). Trafficking victims may be eligible for state protection including temporary resident permits, work permits and health-care (Public Safety Canada, 2012).

Scholars writing about sex trafficking as a crime recognize that structural issues can play a role in this problem. For example, they may note that local, national and

⁹ The Criminal Code prohibits trafficking in persons (Criminal Code, 2005a), particularly trafficking of persons under 18 years of age (Criminal Code, 2010a), and gaining material benefit and withholding or destroying documents in cases of trafficking (Criminal Code, 2005a; Criminal Code, 2010b). The law places a focus on exploitation, and does not recognize consent of the victim to be a suitable defense. Unlike the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act, this law does not require that a person be moved across Canadian state borders for a trafficking charge to be possible. Charges can also be applied to cases of domestic trafficking (Barnett, 2006).

¹⁰ The IRPA prohibits trafficking of a person into Canada by using abduction, fraud, deception, force or threat of force (Minister of Justice Canada, 2001).

global changes – be they social, political or economic – contribute to the existence and continuing increase in sex trafficking (Monzini, 2005; Musacchio, 2004; Savona & Stefanizzi, 2007; Vocks & Nijboer, 2000). However, their analyses tend to focus on the criminal aspects of trafficking: the victim, the perpetrator, and the crime.

Some scholars focus on female victimhood when providing examples of specific sex trafficking cases. Detailed descriptions of violence experienced by women are commonly found in these narratives. Popular portrayals of sex trafficking describe cases where victims are deceived, taken against their will, and unknowingly moved into situations of sexual exploitation, as well as of physical and psychological violence (Doezema, 2010). In some accounts, female victims are shown to be stripped of their rights. These accounts portray victims as replaceable physical bodies that are repeatedly and brutally violated. Some accounts also show women being robbed of their rights as citizens – by having their passports and other identifying documents confiscated by their victimizers (Malarek, 2003; Musacchio, 2004). These accounts emphasize the seriousness and the severity of the crime, which can easily evoke the reader's outrage (for example, see Bales & Soodalter, 2009; Malarek, 2003; Monzini, 2005; Perrin, 2010).

While not all definitions of trafficking require the crossing of an international border, prevalent accounts often show the victim as a non-Western young woman who ends up in a foreign country in a situation of sexual slavery (Bruckert & Parent, 2002). In most, although not all, cases, traffickers are understood to be from the same ethnic community or the same country as their victims (Monzini, 2005). They can even have an existing relationship with the victim as acquaintances, friends or relatives (Malarek, 2003; Vocks & Nijboer, 2000).

Approaching sex trafficking as a criminal problem borrows from and remains compatible with the radical feminist perspective. Both positions prioritize victimization of women – especially those who are non-Western and/or racialized – as well as male culpability, and call for a law enforcement approach focused on victim protection and the punishment of individual perpetrators. Scholars have recognized that a shared focus on sex trafficking can serve as the basis for unlikely alliances, such as those that sometimes emerge between some feminists, conservative governments, and Christian

groups (Sayeed, 2006; Weitzer, 2007; Bernstein, 2010). Concerns over the long-term impact of these alliances have been raised, particularly because these groups otherwise hold vastly different opinions on other social issues (Sayeed, 2006).

Those who critique the understanding of sex trafficking as an issue linked to international organized crime, caution that taking this perspective can lead to feminists asking to be protected by the same – patriarchal – power which they struggle against in the first place (Doezema, 2001). This may be especially problematic when it comes to prostitution, given the lack of confidence by sex workers in state protection (O'Connell Davidson, 2006), the violence they experience by the police, and the detrimental impact of restrictive policies that are often implemented by states in response to the problem (Doezema, 2010).

The current approach to addressing sex trafficking, as set out in the Palermo Protocol, makes implementation of law enforcement and state security strategies mandatory, while leaving the protection of victims up to the discretion of individual states (Doezema, 2010). Prioritizing law enforcement strategies has raised concerns about their impact on the human rights of trafficking victims (Dottridge, 2007; Lee, 2011). Enforcement strategies have also had limited success in their attempt to fight trafficking (Lee, 2011). Further, recognizing the human rights of sex *workers* – rather than victims – presents a challenge if prostitution is not first recognized as sex work. Paola Monzini notes that, to a large extent, research which adopts the criminalization perspective places a focus on trafficking, traffickers and trafficking victims, while altogether failing to engage with the question of 'prostitution as work'. By doing so, this approach remains silent on issues such as processes of exploitation experienced by women in places where sex is being sold. The resulting lack of understanding in turn makes it difficult to examine the relationship between prostitution and trafficking in a way that would allow the discussion to avoid conflating the two terms (Monzini, 2005).

Scholars critiquing the law enforcement approach to sex trafficking have examined the impact this can have on prostitution, particularly on the experiences of migrant women working in the sex trade. They have also taken a closer look at how an emphasis on criminalization and law enforcement is related to issues of border control and state security.

2.2.2. State security and border control

When the issue of sex trafficking is tied to concerns over illegal migration, it calls on the state to implement stricter measures for controlling its borders. Legal restrictions and a focus on the need to increase law enforcement efforts can be implemented based on the concerns around preventing sex trafficking, protecting victims and punishing traffickers.

Work by some scholars highlights the connection between the concern about sex trafficking and increased border control. These scholars have noted that initiatives implemented to fight trafficking have been used as a way to restrict and regulate migration, particularly of women (Doezema, 2010; Kapur, 2005; Nieuwenhuys & Pécoud, 2007; Sharma, 2003). When sex trafficking is identified as a crime against the state, undocumented migration is targeted as a threat to state borders and state security. Scholars have pointed out that rather than asking for protection from traffickers, many undocumented migrant women – including some who could be identified as having been 'trafficked', and those involved in the sex industry – identify border control and other restrictions related to the crossing of borders as the most problematic (Andrijasevic, 2003; Sharma, 2005). When they are unable to enter countries through regular channels, these migrants may turn to various individuals and agents to help them organize all the necessary aspects of their travels. Greater legal restrictions implemented by state bodies, and increased border control initiatives undertaken in the name of 'protection' of trafficking victims, can instead make these journeys more expensive and dangerous (Sharma, 2005).

Various scholars have also critically examined the potentially harmful impacts of initiatives to prevent and address trafficking (Agustín, 2005; Andrijasevic, 2007; Andrijasevic & Anderson, 2009; Bernstein, 2010; Doezema, 2001; Kapur, 2005; Nieuwenhuys & Pécoud, 2007; Sayeed, 2006; Sharma, 2003, 2005; Weitzer, 2007). For example, some have problematized the emphasis on violence in the representations of female victims in awareness-raising anti-trafficking campaigns, as well as the gender, ethnic and racial stereotypes they perpetuate (Andrijasevic, 2007; Andrijasevic & Anderson, 2009; Nieuwenhuys & Pécoud, 2007; Sayeed, 2006; Sharma, 2005). These representations portray women as wounded female bodies, or passive, beautiful victims

of violence (Andrijasevic, 2007). At the same time, they rely on images of traffickers which perpetuate the assumptions of criminality being somehow inherent to the societies and cultures from which they come (Andrijasevic, 2007; Sayeed, 2006; Sharma, 2005). Others have noted that anti-trafficking campaigns have been used to dissuade emigration and can themselves serve as strategies of state migration control (Agustín, 2005; Kapur, 2005; Nieuwenhuys & Pécoud, 2007). It has been noted that incorporating this perspective into state policies has resulted in more stringent approaches to dealing with not only trafficking, but also prostitution (Weitzer, 2007). In addition, it has led to an increasing reliance on criminalization and 'militarized humanitarianism'¹¹ as anti-trafficking strategies (Bernstein, 2010).

Assuming that there is a singular experience of harm among migrant women involved in the sex trade ignores other issues that these women face (Andrijasevic, 2007; O'Connell Davidson, 2006). By focusing on images of violence assumed to be prevalent in non-Western cultures, this understanding shows these communities as being somehow culturally backwards in comparison to their Western counterparts (Doezema, 2001). Specifically, it sees women coming from these cultures as needing to be saved from the men of their own communities (Sayeed, 2006; Smith, 2008). By emphasizing the inherent violence and injury in prostitution, and focusing anti-trafficking campaigns on 'suffering bodies' of non-Western and/or racialized women, this can serve as the necessary justification for Western feminist interventionist practices (Doezema, 2001).

Research by scholars who acknowledge the possibility of choice in a person's involvement in the sex trade shows how complexities are not always apparent in mainstream approaches to sex trafficking. For example, some research shows that more often than not, migrant women know that they will be working in the sex industry, but may not know under what conditions (Doezema, 2010; Kempadoo, 1999; Weitzer, 2007; Wijers & Lap-Chew, 1997). In some cases women who turn to traffickers for help to

¹¹ Bernstein uses 'militarized humanitarianism' to refer to military interventions by the state, as well as the criminal justice-focused anti-trafficking activism (Bernstein, 2010).

enter destination countries are able to negotiate the terms and the methods of travel (Andrijasevic, 2003). Other research notes that migrant women may engage in sex work as a strategy, not only to meet their basic needs but also to improve their social positions (Brennan, 2002; 2004). Migrant women can, and do, also engage in the sex trade on a short-term basis rather than indefinitely (Scambler, 2007). Finally, as pointed out above, gender analysis of the sex trade has to recognize that male, transgender, transsexual, transvestite, intersex and individuals who use other sex and gender identities also work in the sex trade. As well, individuals of any sex or gender may sexually identify differently in their private lives than they do when selling sex (Agustín, 2007b). While these examples do not deny that women in the sex trade experience situations of exploitation and violence, they do caution against assuming that these issues characterize everyone's experiences in the sex trade.

Some scholars problematize the conflation of prostitution, or migrant sex work, with sex trafficking, and call for the need to recognize that individuals working in the sex industry have a right to migrate (Doezema, 2010). They have raised concern that a singular emphasis on violence prevalent in sex trafficking narratives – whether coming from a focus on crime or from the perspective of radical feminism – can lead to a 'moral crusade' aimed at this issue (Sayeed, 2006; Weitzer, 2007). Through these narratives the most extreme cases of exploitation and violence that migrant women who work in the sex trade experience come to define all aspects of the industry. The understanding of sex trafficking and the sex trade that emerges through these stories could, as a result, come to inform laws and policies on sex trafficking. Once established in law, this would have serious implications for a wider population of individuals in the sex trade (Weitzer, 2007; Pisani, 2009). Assumptions made about 'migrant sex workers' as individuals who need to be saved from the life of prostitution can be used to help justify police raids on places that employ them. This can criminalize women working in the sex trade as well as undermine their ability to earn money (Brock, Sutdhibhasilip, Gillies & Oliver, 2000). An approach to dealing with sex trafficking that prioritizes increased legal control and law enforcement initiatives under the name of protection can lead to policies and laws which may increase legal restrictions and force migrant sex sellers further underground (Sutdhibhasilip, 2002). Recognizing that discussions around trafficking can lead to greater control of the state over the sex industry, some sex worker rights activists have,

for this reason, been reluctant to give support to anti-trafficking campaigns (Doezema, 2010).

2.3. Migration, histories and other contexts – looking beyond the 'prostitution dichotomy'

Sex trafficking has also been examined within a larger context. For example, sex trafficking has been researched as a 'problem of migration' (Aradau, 2007; Lee, 2011). Others have called for sex trafficking to also be examined specifically within the field of migration studies. Some argue that understanding sex trafficking, as well as the sex trade cannot be achieved independently of specific historical, political and socio-economic situations in which they take place. Taking this kind of an approach tends to challenge the ability to explain sex trafficking and the sex trade in a single way.

While some work on the sex trade does acknowledge migration processes, stories of people who sell sex have, until very recently, largely been absent from the field of migration studies (Agustín, 2007b; Morokvasic, 2010). Agustín observes that within discussions of migrants who sell sex she "did not find these migrants treated as having a range of interests, occupations and desires - as being people who read newspapers, cook, go to church, films and parties or who count themselves as activists in any political or social cause" (Agustín, 2007b, p. 6). Agustín argues that using the concept of 'trafficking' is an inadequate way to think about the range of experiences of migrants involved in the sex trade (Agustín, 2007b). In addition, in restricting these discussions specifically to the field of prostitution or sex work, one perpetuates the idea that experiences of individuals who sell sex are somehow inherently different from the lives of other people, and specifically from the lives of other migrants (Agustín, 2007b). Ignoring migrants' involvement in the sex trade also seems to suggest that the field of migration studies has nothing significant to gain from considering the lived experiences of these individuals.

Research examining the sex trade as an aspect of migration has recognized that people can be constrained by existing socio-structural inequalities, and that they develop different ways of exercising agency in response. In some cases, rather than challenging

the existing gender structures, women may rely on their knowledge of how these function, and utilize them as opportunities for migration, or employment, or as ways of staying in destination countries (Morokvasic, 2007). For example, marriages between women from Eastern Europe and French men have given the women an opportunity to stay in France. Similarly, in the case of migrant women from the Philippines who come to Japan on short-term entertainment visas, marrying Japanese men presents an alternative to having to leave the country or overstaying one's visa (Morokvasic, 2007). The entertainment industry – some of which may include sexual labour – can also play a number of important roles in helping Filipina women in Japan navigate social structures and relationships that both benefit and constrain them (Faier, 2008, 2009). The hostess bars in which some Filipina women work can provide a source of income which can help ensure economic independence, as well as serve as a way of supporting women's families in the Philippines (Faier, 2008). The bars can also function as 'sites of encounter' between Filipina women and Japanese men, helping to facilitate romantic relationships which may eventually result in marriage (Faier, 2009). For women who experience marital problems and 'run away' from their husbands, these spaces can potentially provide freedom and independence lacking in their domestic lives. The bars can also serve as communities which connect Filipina women to one another (Faier, 2008).

For many women across the world, prostitution goes beyond "just sexual freedom or oppression but [also] concerns deeply-rooted dimensions of social inequality exacerbated by social change" (Truong, 1990, p. 55). Some scholars have emphasized the importance of considering the context – both larger socio-historical, and local, physical sites – within which selling and buying of sex takes place (Truong, 1990). Their work can also ask that both structural constraints as well as women's agency be considered when looking at their involvement in prostitution (see O'Connell Davidson, 1998). Scholars who take this approach to the topic of sex trafficking tend to challenge the dichotomy that sees prostitution either as inherently harmful or freely chosen as 'sex work'. Instead, they recognize that people's lives are a lot more complicated (Agustín, 2007b).

Research reveals that some migrants' experiences and working conditions in the sex trade are undoubtedly exploitative, while for others the sex trade may offer the best

of available working options. This is illustrated, for example, by Julia O'Connell Davidson's research with migrant domestic and sex workers in the United Kingdom and Spain (O'Connell Davidson, 2006). A similar point also comes from the research on Slavic women working in the sex trade in Canada (McDonald, Moore & Timoshkina, 2000). To claim that all women's experiences are equally exploitative, or that they are always based on free choices made by individual women also ignores the ways in which these experiences vary among different women. For example, women's experiences in the sex trade can be affected by the location where they sell sex, the amount of money they can charge for their services, and the demand they attract from men who buy sex based on how they present themselves (Agustín, 2007a; 2007b). Recognizing these different situations and contexts, and applying this understanding to discussions about sex trafficking and migrant sex work can move the focus away from the concepts of 'choice' and 'consent'. For example, it can instead point to a need to more closely examine relationships between people who cross borders and those who facilitate, benefit from, or exploit these situations (O'Connell Davidson, 2006; see also Agustín, 2007b; Andrijasevic, 2003; Kempadoo, 1999; Sutdhibhasilp, 2002).

Kamala Kempadoo notes that individuals who take the radical feminist or anti-trafficking position, as well as some sex worker rights activists, base their concern for non-Western and/or racialized women on neo-colonialist assumptions of western superiority, while failing to recognize "Third World sex workers' rights to self-determination" (Kempadoo, 1998, p. 12). She calls for "feminist theory to engage with racialized sexual subjectivities in tandem with the historical weight of imperialism, colonialism and racist constructions of power" (Kempadoo, 1998, p. 14). She believes the reluctance of feminists to adopt this approach is being based on colonial histories that have shaped assumptions about sexualities of non-Western and/or racialized women. She points to a common perspective that sees these women primarily as victims, and understands their lives in terms of dichotomies or simple hierarchies of power rather than pluralities. In order to move away from this point of view, there needs to be recognition and exploration of non-Western and/or racialized women's sexual agency, including that in prostitution (Kempadoo, 1998).

Some work on sex trafficking and prostitution makes links to histories of power dynamics that result from and are based on complex and geographically-specific sexual

relations between colonizers and colonized women (see for example, Brennan, 2004; Kempadoo, 1999, 2005; Kempadoo & Doezema, 1998; Truong, 1990). This includes concerns with regulation of sexual relations and sexualities that were present as part of colonial projects (Truong, 1990; Agustín, 2007b). Non-European and/or racialized women played a central role in providing sexual and domestic services to satisfy the needs of individual men as well as the economic and political needs of colonial powers. At the same time, formal recognition of mixed-race relationships and of the children they yielded was denied in order to maintain racial superiority of the white European rule (Truong, 1990; Agustín, 2007b). It is also in this context that European middle class women first raised the concern over sexual behaviours of non-European and/or racialized women, as well as over European women who sold sex in the colonies. Related discussions initially framed prostitution in terms of moral panics over the 'white slave traffic' of women, as well as over promiscuity and emotional indifference in sexual relationships. In these discussions moral reformers called for the protection of women, without acknowledging the complexities of power relations present within prostitution. These include the role that states and the commercial sex clients played in these sexual relationships (Truong, 1990). Worries over 'white slavery' as a matter of crime and deviance were subsequently incorporated into many national legal structures (Outshoorn, 2005). Although concerns over 'white slavery' are said to have likely been exaggerated (Barry, 1995; Doezema, 2010) or unfounded (Jeffreys, 1997; Weitzer, 2007), they continue to shape discussions related to prostitution and sex trafficking (see, for example, discussions in Barry, 1995; Doezema, 2010).

While some scholars emphasize the ways in which colonial histories continue to determine contemporary sex buyers' fantasies of the sexualized 'other', others caution that taking too simplistic a view of these ethnic and racial relations can obscure the complexities of colonial relationships as well as the role of the 'exotic' in contemporary commercial sexual relations (Agustín, 2007b). The organization and control of sex and sexuality – including social aspects of sexual labour – need to be understood within their appropriate historical, political and economic contexts, rather than assuming them to have a single, universal meaning and form (Truong, 1990; Kempadoo, 1998).

The focus of this chapter so far has been to outline the main perspectives taken on the issue of sex trafficking. The purpose of this discussion has been to show that

there are different ways of understanding sex trafficking. Each of these approaches is informed by different, underlying ideological positions, and in turn informs opinions of what should be done about sex trafficking. Different ways of understanding sex trafficking also shape how research – and by extension, further development of knowledge – is conducted. The last section of this chapter examines this point in more detail.

2.4. Sex trafficking research

While sex trafficking is recognized as a concern, there is disagreement over the extent of the problem or how best to understand it (Aromaa, 2007; Doezema, 2010). One of the main challenges is a lack of accurate and reliable data on human trafficking in general, and sex trafficking in particular (Albanese, 2007; Aromaa, 2007; Doezema, 2010; Goodey, 2008; Weitzer, 2007). Being able to quantify sex trafficking has been important because showing the magnitude of the issue can be necessary in attracting resources, as well as media and political attention (Aromaa, 2007; Weitzer, 2007). While many discuss the significance of measuring sex trafficking, being able to quantify this issue continues to present a significant challenge.

Weitzer notes that "there are no reliable statistics on the magnitude of trafficking" (Weitzer, 2007, p. 455). Measuring sex trafficking is complicated by the "clandestine and stigmatized nature of the sex trade" (Weitzer, 2007, p. 455). Quantitative data on sex trafficking, when it is available, is problematic for different reasons. For example, research on sex trafficking can suffer from lack of transparency in showing how it is conducted (Albanese, 2007). Research findings often conflict with one another, or produce numbers that are difficult to verify or compare (Aromaa, 2007; Goodey, 2008). Some have noted that figures obtained through research have been estimates with very large variation (Albanese, 2007; Doezema, 2010; Kempadoo, 1998). Others have pointed out that because findings can be vague and difficult to verify, they can be manipulated to serve ideological positions that underpin some of the anti-trafficking work (Weitzer 2005; 2007).

Difficulties with measuring sex trafficking are also related to the disagreements over the definition and meaning of sex trafficking (Aromaa, 2007; Doezema, 2010). While sex trafficking is defined in state laws and international agreements, there are many ways these definitions are interpreted (Aromaa, 2007).

These differences in understanding trafficking can exist not only among researchers but also between researchers and research participants. For example, in their research on women trafficked from Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union into Canada, McDonald, Moore and Timoshkina (2000) identify some of their respondents as having been trafficked while stating that none of the women taking part in the research identified themselves as such. Similar discrepancies show up in other studies: research has noted that some individuals do not want to be identified as 'victims' (Aromaa, 2007). They may use the 'trafficking victim' identity for the length of time that it may serve other purposes, such as helping them obtain legal status in a destination country (Sharma, 2005). A woman's understanding of her involvement in the sex industry can be different from how it is seen by researchers and service providers (Agustín, 2007a; Brunovskis & Surtees, 2008). Even in the cases when women have experienced violence, researchers note that victimhood may not be their only identifying characteristic, or even their primary one (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2008).

Differences in the understanding of sex trafficking can also be present among research participants. Aoyama's (2009) research shows that Thai women's involvement in the Japanese sex trade can be variously experienced as slavery, work, or somewhere in between, according to their perceptions of the subjective and objective conditions of that work. These variations can be experienced differently by different people, and differently even by a single person at various points in her life. Similarly, Anette Brunovskis and Rebecca Surtees' (2008) research with victims of trafficking in Southeast Europe found that victims' perceptions of their own experiences can shift in order to conform to expectations and assumptions made by anti-trafficking programs whose services they utilize. Some studies have shown that those who are sometimes identified as 'trafficking victims' are often aware that they will be working in the sex industry prior to migrating but may not know the nature of their working conditions before their arrival (see Doezema, 2010, p. 9, for a list of studies that illustrate this claim). In this way, situations that may be identified by some as 'sex trafficking' are to others viewed as bad

experiences of 'migrant sex work' (Agustín, 2007b). How these different understandings of sex trafficking are negotiated and resolved within the research on this and related topics is not always made clear. The uncertainty over what is being measured can subsequently affect comparability among research data (Aromaa, 2007). It can also make research findings and conclusions that are drawn from these studies confusing and misleading.

Despite these challenges, an emphasis continues to be placed on taking a positivist approach to the study of sex trafficking. This often translates into a search for improved methods for arriving at 'real stories', or a call for a definition of trafficking that better represents a more accurate 'reality' of this problem (Doezema, 2010; see also Albanese, 2007; Laczko, 2007; Tyldum & Brunovskis, 2005). A focus on gaining a better understanding of 'real' accounts of sex trafficking has also been seen as necessary for assessing the effectiveness of existing anti-trafficking measures and programs (Albanese, 2007; Laczko, 2007).

At the same time, the lack of concrete data or measures of sex trafficking has not alleviated concerns about it (Doezema, 2010). Even when they acknowledge problems with the existing estimates of the size of the problem, reports continue to cite problematic figures (Doezema, 2010; Kempadoo, 1998). Despite the inability to provide reliable measures, many also still take the position that trafficking is a 'large' and an 'increasing' global problem (e.g. Jeffreys, 2009; Malarek, 2003; Savona & Stefanizzi, 2007).

2.5. Conclusion

Acknowledging that there are different ways of looking at sex trafficking becomes important when one recognizes that how this issue is understood shapes outcomes and responses. Some scholars also recognize that views on sex trafficking can reflect and advance particular ideological and political standpoints. These scholars may see sex trafficking not only as a social problem but also as a set of discussions and a body of knowledge that can, and should be, looked at as a discourse, ideology, rhetoric, or by using a combination of those terms (e.g. Agustín, 2007b; Doezema, 2010; Sharma,

2005; Weitzer, 2007). Such an approach highlights the need to more closely explore the elements – including various interests and intentions – that inform how sex trafficking comes to be understood and addressed. In other words, taking this focus moves the attention away from describing the problem and shifts it to looking at how the problem comes to be understood.

Rather than calling for a positivist search for evidence to prove the phenomenon of sex trafficking as either true or false, it becomes important to first examine narratives about sex trafficking: how they are created and by whom, and what purposes do they serve. This shifts the focus to “a critical examination of the power involved in producing knowledge about ‘trafficking in women’ and the ways in which dominant constructions of the issue emerge and are incorporated into policy” (Doezema, 2010, p. 11). Such an approach to sex trafficking as an issue places the importance on examining how sex trafficking is constructed as a social problem.

3. Theoretical orientation and research methodology

This chapter describes the theoretical work that informs the project and examines how the research was conducted. As illustrated in Chapter 2, there are different ways of looking at and understanding sex trafficking. This project examines the process through which sex trafficking was raised as an issue in the context of the 2010 Olympics. It looks at sex trafficking through the social construction of social problems theory, focusing on the claims that were made, and how these claims were raised. In this thesis, claims-making activities are understood to be relying on discourses that are connected to ideological positions taken on an issue. Different ways of knowing are informed by beliefs, as well as political and other interests which stem from various ideologies. These differences are reflected in and play out through the power dynamics that exist in conversations and disagreements between different perspectives taken on trafficking.

Chapter 3 is divided into two main sections. The first section addresses the theoretical orientation of the research. The first part of this section focuses on social construction of social problems theory, as well as 'discourse' and 'ideology' – concepts which are employed to understand and explain how knowledge about sex trafficking is created. I argue that acceptance of any one position on sex trafficking over others has tangible, 'real life' consequences. It informs related decisions and actions which can affect people's daily lives. In this project the importance of these consequences is specifically examined from an intersectional feminist perspective which recognizes the intersecting structural constraints and opportunities shaped by various factors, including gender, race, ethnicity, class and sexuality.

The second part of this chapter outlines the research methodology. It reviews the research questions, the research strategy and methods used in the project. Issues of sampling and recruitment are discussed, as well as the process of data analysis. The

remainder of this section addresses the importance of reflexivity to this project and the ethical considerations related to the research.

3.1. Theoretical Orientation

Contemporary discussions about sex trafficking are related to expressed feminist concerns over the safety and wellbeing of women in the sex trade. Chapter 2 showed that one of the main points of disagreement within these conversations is whether prostitution is the ultimate example of patriarchal violence against women, or whether it should be understood as 'sex work'. Doezema's discussion about the process of developing the UN Palermo Protocol definition of sex trafficking illustrates the central role that negotiations over the meaning of prostitution play in informing how trafficking is understood (Doezema, 2010). At the same time, concerns raised about sex trafficking can be used as reasons to call for implementation of laws related to prostitution (see discussion in Lepp, 2010, 2013). Canada's ongoing discussions about the prostitution law (see discussion in Lowman, 2011), including the current *Bedford v Canada* Charter challenge, suggest that 'battles' over the meaning of prostitution are far from over. When conversations about sex trafficking include claims about prostitution, they point to the need to pay attention to how the relationship between the two concepts is established in these discussions, and how through these conversations these concepts come to be understood. With this in mind, using social construction of social problems theory, I look at how sex trafficking was constructed as a social problem in the context of the 2010 Olympics. I examine the relationship between the sex trafficking discourse that was used and the ideological positions on prostitution that it reflected. Turning to intersectional feminism, I argue that assessment of the 'impact' of the Olympics should include consideration of the consequences that constructing sex trafficking as a social problem could have on lives of women in the sex trade.

3.1.1. *Social Construction of Social Problems, Discourse and Ideology*

Social construction of social problems theory was developed by Malcolm Spector and John Kitsuse as a response to the lack of a 'sociology of social problems' (Spector &

Kitsuse, 1987). In *Constructing Social Problems* Spector and Kitsuse outline two main ways of looking at social problems that had previously been used. The first perspective they identify – consisting of functionalist and normative approaches – relies on the idea of 'social order' and focuses on examining conditions and behaviours that disrupt the functioning of the society. Functionalists seek to identify social problems and explain where they come from. Those who take the normative approach recognize that social conditions are defined as problems when they violate society's normative standards. The second perspective, referred to by Spector and Kitsuse as 'value-conflict', distinguishes between social conditions and definitions of social problems. This perspective argues that definitions of social problems do not necessarily reflect social conditions. As such, researchers should focus on looking at how and why social definitions of problems come to be. The issue with these perspectives, according to Spector and Kitsuse, is their inability to move the focus away from looking at social problems through examining objective conditions, towards examining how these conditions come to be defined as social problems. In other words, both functionalist/normative and value-conflict approaches rely on an assumption that there is an 'objective reality' against which to understand social problems. As such, these approaches are more suited to studying social conditions themselves than how social problems come to be (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987).

Spector and Kitsuse develop a definition of social problems and propose a way of studying them empirically. They define social problems as "*the activities of individuals or groups making assertions of grievances and claims with respect to some putative condition*" (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987, p. 75, italics in the original). For someone taking a social constructionist approach to looking at social problems, the importance of objective conditions "*is the assertions made about them, not the validity of those assertions as judged from some independent standpoint, as for example, that of a scientist*" (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987, p. 76, italics in the original). At the most extreme end of their argument, Spector and Kitsuse point out that even if the condition did not exist, this would not be relevant to the analysis of how that condition becomes constructed as a social problem (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987).

When social problems are understood in this way, the research focus is placed on claims-making activities rather than on social conditions. Regardless of the specific

social conditions that concern is being raised over, claims-making activities are common to the construction of all social problems (Best, 2013). The process of creating a social problem starts with an issue being raised by someone – a claims-maker – who makes a claim about a condition of concern and asks for it to be addressed. Activists, officials and legislative bodies responding to claims, media, those in the helping professions, and social scientists can all play a role in the claims-making processes (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987; Best, 2013). When someone initially identifies a condition as problematic and it becomes a subject of a claim, the issue becomes a 'troubling condition'. Not everyone will share the same view on a particular condition, and there are often multiple issues being raised as concerns at any given time. This means that claims-makers compete with one another for media, public and political attention. How successful a claim is at attracting attention might depend on the resources that claims-makers have available and on how compelling their arguments are (Best, 2013).

Construction of social problems can also be looked at in terms of their natural history – the process or sequence of stages that a social problem develops through (Best, 2013). There are a number of different ways that scholars have distinguished between the stages through which social problems are constructed. For example, Spector and Kitsuse identify four stages: identification of an issue and calls for it to be dealt with; recognition of the legitimacy of the group that is raising concerns; dissatisfaction over action implemented to deal with the original concern; and questioning of the legitimacy of existing institutions and their responses, as well as establishing alternatives in response (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987). Best outlines six different stages: claimsmaking, media coverage, public reaction, policymaking, social problems work and policy outcomes (Best, 2013). Not all social problems pass through all of the stages, and they may disappear as problems at any point of the process (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987).

While not all problems necessarily fit the same natural history model, the concept of 'natural history' helps to keep mindful of the process of problem construction (Best, 2013). Regardless of the specific stages that are identified, the process of how a social problem is constructed starts from claims-making, to gaining public attention, then moves to a policy outcome. Some see government response as the final stage of a social problem (see discussion in Spector & Kitsuse, 1987). Others develop their

understanding further, examining how a social problem might subsequently be incorporated into the work of those who enforce policies, or what reactions might come up in response to the implemented policy changes (Best, 2013). The latter may result in a new set of claims being made, "in which the solutions to previous problems... become the basis for renewed claims and demands" (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987, p. 142). Some researchers examine claims made about a social issue by looking at whether they follow all of the stages of a natural history model (e.g. Woolsey, 2009). Others may focus on a single aspect of the social problem development. For example, in his examination of the construction of sex trafficking as a social problem, Weitzer focuses on one stage of the natural history, explaining how activists' views became institutionalized in the United States state policy (Weitzer, 2007). While discussions about construction of social problems tend to place emphasis on conflict, some issues – such as child abduction – evoke a more uniform public response. In cases where an issue is accepted as a concern by a majority of citizens with little controversy, the development of issues into social problems can be a lot quicker, where the initial stages of the process are more difficult to distinguish one from another. Rather than providing a chronological sequence of events, the researcher may choose to focus on claims-making activities instead (Gentry, 1988).

Central to the construction of social problems is recognition that claims-making is driven by a desire for something to be done about a troubling condition (Best, 2013; Spector & Kitsuse, 1987). In other words, claims-making is undertaken with the aim of achieving a political goal, or working towards social change. Stemming from this recognition is the question of what is driving the development of a social problem: what beliefs inform the claims, and what goals are claims implemented towards? Spector and Kitsuse (1987) state that values and motives that inform claims-making should be used as data, not as ways of explaining social problems. Rather than informing social problems, values can be presented as the grounds for making claims. They can be strategic – used to articulate the claim in a way that is most likely to gain it attention. As such, values do not automatically correspond to the condition of concern. Motives serve as justifications for a problematic act that has already occurred and has been questioned. A person may choose a single motive to express in response to being questioned, and that motive may be one out of several that this person has available. If

motives are selected after an act has occurred, it cannot be assumed that they were also the reasons for that act (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987). While it may not be possible to know the 'true' reasons that inform choices of social actors, this does not prevent us from differentiating between the values and motives that are expressed in the different perspectives that exist around a social issue.

This research relies on concepts 'discourse' and 'ideology' to examine the various perspectives and dynamics reflected in the claims-making activities through which sex trafficking is constructed as a social problem. I use the term 'discourse' to refer to the specific narrative, including presented claims and solutions, that tends to be utilized to raise sex trafficking as a concern. I take 'discourse' to mean representations, practices and performances which lead to the production and legitimization of meanings (Gregory, 2000). It also refers to sites, tools and ways of transferring, producing and masking power (Flyvbjerg, 2001). Discourses can be seen as sites of struggle, in and through which human actors battle to have their claims accepted as 'valid' and as common sense. When this is achieved, they are able to discredit other positions or meanings (Weedon, 1992), in other words, others' claims. While dominant discourses are "always linked with institutional practices of control and discipline", they can never be completely separated from other, sometimes seemingly repressed or excluded discourses (Truong, 1990, p. 70). Power exercised through discourses is dependent upon social structures that simultaneously reproduce as well as challenge it. This understanding sees power as relational, multi-dimensional and productive, rather than being one-dimensional and always exercised from above. It recognizes processes of claims-making as dynamic, where a potential always exists that established social problems can serve as the basis for making new claims.

Best (2013) reminds us that claims can draw from different ideological positions. I use the term 'ideology' to emphasize the different political interests that underlie the struggle over the meaning of sex trafficking, as expressed through the process of claims-making. 'Ideology' can be used to mean a set of beliefs invested with the interests of a social group, which stem from and play out in material relations (Eagleton, 2007). Jo Doezema explains that ideology as a concept is "important for trafficking, as meanings about what trafficking is have been the site of major political conflicts between feminists, sex workers and states" (Doezema, 2010, p. 35). Doezema explains the relationship

between 'discourse' and 'ideology' with respect to sex trafficking as follows: "[i]deology effectively captures the idea of political struggle, of winners and losers, of strategies and compromise, of power given and taken: it foregrounds conflict in a way that the rather bloodless 'discourse' does not" (Doezema, 2010, p. 35). Once the discourse and the related claims are established in the position of 'truth,' they act as a way of maintaining and strengthening the ideology(ies) on which they draw, and of challenging or weakening competing ones. When specific claims about a condition are recognized as valid, an ideological position can come to define a social problem, and inform how it will be addressed in policies and laws. In this way an ideological position can come to 'produce reality' (Flyvbjerg, 2001) – shaping, but not necessarily determining, material relations.

When all knowledge is recognized as socially constructed, our attention moves away from evaluating claims, towards examining the process through which a social problem – or knowledge about it – is created. Taking a constructionist approach to concerns raised about sex trafficking may be particularly important given the disagreements over the definition and the magnitude of the issue. Doezema emphasizes that looking for the 'reality' of sex trafficking without first examining where related concerns come from and what interests they are informed by can have "devastating real-life consequences for sex workers and migrants" (Doezema, 2010, p. 45). Placing the focus on measuring the magnitude of sex trafficking as an issue has meant that less focus has been put towards looking at how knowledge becomes accepted as valid – whose perspective is adopted, and at the cost of which others (Doezema, 2010).

Recognizing problems as socially constructed raises the question about how to address different – and often conflicting – claims that may be made about a social problem. Best (2013) argues that when focusing research on claims-making we can take one of the two extreme positions. On the one hand, we can treat all claims as correct, or assume that there is some basis to the concerns that are being raised. On the other hand, we can assume that all claims are false and made out of the self-interest of claims-makers – a perspective which could lead to apathy towards social concerns (Best, 2013). Seen from yet another perspective, we can say that any idea or conviction which holds lasting power in a society at least to some extent reflects some 'real' needs or desires of those who are expressing or utilizing it (Eagleton, 2007). From there it

follows that rather than judging an idea as either true or false it becomes equally, if not more, important to examine the purpose that it serves and the effects that it has on lived realities. Resisting the temptation to evaluate a claim, or to examine which position taken in an argument is the most valid, is in part difficult because people tend to be more interested in asking if something is a problem rather than how it becomes a problem (Spector & Kitsuse, 1987; Best, 2002).

In looking at how issues become social problems, we can also engage with claims more critically, "so that we could weigh what we're told about social problems and make out own evaluations about the nature of those problems and the best ways of addressing them" (Best, 2013, p. 327). Woolsey (2009) points to two main ways that researchers taking the social constructionist perspective have approached the issue of claims evaluation. 'Strict constructionism' seeks to show that claims change independently of objective reality. This approach is criticised for relying on the notion of 'reality'. Researchers who take the 'contextual constructionist' approach evaluate claims as well as examine them. In many cases, evaluating claims according to this approach requires relying on others' research (Woolsey, 2009). Best (2013) reminds us that when engaging with claims researchers ultimately need to pick for themselves which conditions to worry about, which ideological positions they take, and which claims they are convinced by.

In this thesis I focus on looking at claims and claims-making activities in the context of the 2010 Olympics. Given that I focus on a specific event that served as an opportunity to raise attention around a social problem, I am less interested in looking at the natural history of sex trafficking. I also do not focus on examining whether or not claims and counter-claims made about sex trafficking are valid, or if one position is more valid than others.¹² The main way that claims are evaluated in this thesis is by considering their consequences. The position that informs this examination is discussed in the following section.

¹² In several cases I do refer to other work and other positions related to the presented claims, particularly where existing research challenges arguments made as part of those claims.

3.1.2. *Consequences of Discussions and Feminist Theory*

Focusing research on claims-making and the discussions about a particular subject does not need to result in work that is irrelevant to people's lived experiences. It also does not necessarily get in the way of "taking stands, making arguments or forming opinions" (Smith, 2008, p. xx). In other words, the "methodological decision to refrain from actively campaigning alongside some and against others in any particular social problems arena does not spare us from taking sides in sociological debates regarding the nature of what transpires in that arena" (Weinberg, 2009, p. 69). Examining claims-making processes through research becomes important when one recognizes the tangible, 'real life' effects of ideas. Processes of knowledge creation "are not mental exercises but urgent social contests involving such concrete political issues as immigration laws, the legislation of personal conduct, the constitution of orthodoxy, the legitimization of violence and/or insurrection, the character and content of education, and the direction of foreign policy" (Said, 1994, p. 332). This is important to remember when recognizing that discussions about sex trafficking often include ideas about who the victims and the perpetrators are. Identities constructed through discussions about sex trafficking can be used to determine how individuals labelled by those identities will subsequently be treated and what actions they will be subject to. For example, how sex trafficking is understood may be used to distinguish between those who are seen as deserving of protection and those who end up being persecuted and/or punished. How these understandings come about is important to consider when remembering that "the construction of identity is bound up with the disposition of power and powerlessness in each society" (Said, 1994, p. 332). Examining and understanding how this happens – where the knowledge comes from, from which ideological positions and with what aims – then becomes of central importance to social research (Flyvbjerg, 2001). Along with seeking to better understand the processes through which social problems are constructed, it becomes equally important to also look at the consequences of how something comes to be 'known'.

In this thesis the effects of how sex trafficking is constructed as a social problem are considered from an intersectional feminist position, placing a particular focus on how they impact women's lives. This position understands women's lives and experiences as existing within systems of "intersecting oppressions of race, class, gender, and

sexuality... organized through diverse local realities" (Hill Collins, 2000, p. 228). The discussion in this project focuses primarily on women due to the gendered nature of the discourse around sex trafficking (Agustín, 2005). At the same time, it is important to keep in mind that conversations about sex trafficking in various ways also have an impact on other gender identities, including male, transgender and transsexual. It is also necessary to note that it is not only women, but migrants of various gender identities who sell sex (Agustín, 2005).

This particular focus recognizes that at the centre of claims commonly made about sex trafficking as part of the sex trafficking discourse are concerns that are specifically related to non-Western and/or racialized women. These concerns emphasize women as victims of harm and violence – particularly within a sexual context – and focus on the notion that these women need to be protected. These discussions often include assumptions made about cultures from which women originate. As mentioned in Chapter 2, this is done by raising concern that even the closest of women's interpersonal relationships are not to be trusted. Reports of women being sold into sex trafficking by family members portray these relationships as suspect and potentially harmful. By doing so, sex trafficking discussions rely on and further very particular understandings of gender, race, class, ethnicity and sexuality.

Central to the feminist position adopted in this thesis is the importance of individual self-definitions, created in the context of, and not in separation from, larger communities to which a person belongs. This means that the primary concern should be placed on a person's ability to define their own experiences and needs for themselves, rather than have those be defined by others. Speaking specifically to the importance for Black women to define their own experiences, this perspective questions the "assumption that those in positions granting them the authority to interpret [women's] reality are entitled to do so" (Hill Collins, 2000, p. 114). It also calls for careful consideration of situations where individuals or institutions are asking for and implementing action based on their interpretation of another person's experiences.

This perspective seeks to acknowledge and draw strength from the diversity of the members of a particular community, placing self-definitions and self-determination as the bases on which to build coalitions with other communities (Hill Collins, 2000). It

stems from recognition that while common experiences among women can lead to "the formation of a group-based, collective standpoint", shared experiences will not necessarily always lead to "similar angles of vision" among all members of the group (Hill Collins, 2000, pp. 24-25). In other words, even when women can come together over having similar experiences, it does not mean that they will perceive these experiences in the same way (Hill Collins, 2000). Rather than excluding experiences that do not fall into a single understanding of a social phenomenon, this perspective is more interested in considering ways of accommodating diversity within these understandings.

Taking the above position recognizes that individuals who are in various ways involved in the sex trade can experience it differently from one another. Acknowledging the diversity of people's lives, as well as the importance of self-definitions, calls for the rethinking of prostitution as a unitary experience. This can mean taking the understanding of prostitution beyond one of the two main positions (for example, see Brock, Gillies, Oliver & Sutshibhasilp, 2000; O'Neill, 2003; Aoyama, 2009). It can also mean considering both structural inequalities and women's agency in discussions about the sex trade and sex trafficking (O'Connell Davidson, 1998). Such a perspective then calls for recognition that lived experiences are often complicated and complex. For example, it may challenge the assumptions that identifying victims and perpetrators is always an easy and clear-cut process.

Maintaining an awareness of the tangible, 'real-life' consequences of discussions requires that processes of claims-making and the resulting knowledge be examined more closely. Such a focus recognizes that it is important to look at and to question who is included and who is excluded when social actors seek to establish their concerns as social problems, and the consequences these processes can result in.

3.2. Research Methodology

The following section discusses how this project was carried out and describes the methodological decisions that were made along the way. This part of the chapter is organized into the following sub-sections: research questions, research strategy, methods, sampling and recruitment, data analysis, reflexivity and ethical considerations.

3.2.1. Research Questions

This project addressed two main research questions:

- 1) What is the nature of the sex trafficking discourse(s) which focused on, and emerged prior to, during, as well as continued after the 2010 Olympic Games held in Vancouver?
- 2) What were the effects of Vancouver's hosting of the 2010 Olympic Games on sex trafficking to the city and to Canada, from the perspectives of the organizations working around issues related to sex trafficking?

The first research question aimed to examine concerns that were being raised about sex trafficking in relation to the 2010 Winter Olympics in Vancouver. This was explored through several sub-questions: what kinds of discussions were taking place around sex trafficking and the 2010 Olympic Games? How was sex trafficking understood as an issue related to the Olympic Games? What kinds of responses were being called for to deal with sex trafficking? What were some of the counter-arguments that were being presented, who were they presented by, and how was this communicated publicly?

The second question aimed to critically examine the potential effects of the Olympics on issues related to sex trafficking. This question was approached by considering the perspectives of organizations working around sex trafficking and/or the sex trade, as well as with migrants, immigrants and trafficked persons, particularly those involved in the sex industry. Related questions included determining how different organizations understand and work around sex trafficking. It explored research participants' potential sex trafficking and related concerns around the Olympics, any initiatives they might have undertaken to address these concerns, and their perspectives on the nature of the impact of the Games. I attempt to situate the organizations' general understanding of sex trafficking, and more specifically their understanding of this 'impact' within broader discussions on issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade.

3.2.2. Research Strategy

This research was carried out as a two-phase qualitative sequential multi-method project. A multi-method project is defined as research conducted by “employing different types, or styles, of data-collecting methods within the same study” (Hunter & Brewer, 2003, p. 577). The choice of methods is driven by the needs of the research question(s) rather than a commitment to a single set of methods. A multi-method approach can combine quantitative and qualitative methods, or it can draw upon different types of qualitative or quantitative methods in a single study (Hunter & Brewer, 2003). This research used different qualitative methods in the collection of data.

Collection of data was conducted sequentially, or in two distinct phases (Creswell, 2009). Each of the two phases focused on one of the two research questions discussed above. I examined the time prior to the Olympic Games in the first phase, during which I looked at the concerns that were being raised about sex trafficking. The main focus of the second phase was the period during and after the Games. This part of the project looked at the consequences of Vancouver's hosting of the Olympics on sex trafficking and related concerns.

3.2.3. Methods

In the first phase of the research, the concerns that were being raised publicly about sex trafficking prior to the 2010 Olympics and in relation to the Games were explored through participant observation. I attended a total of seven public presentations and discussions (18 hours) related to the issue of sex trafficking which were held prior to the 2010 Winter Olympics Games. Additionally, I attended seven public events (13 hours) after the Olympics. Field notes were taken during and after each of these events. The complete list of the attended events, including their dates and locations, is provided in Appendix B. These events took place between 2009 and 2012. Each of the events lasted between 1 and 8 hours, with an average length of time of just over 2 hours. The data collected at these events consisted mostly of field notes taken during and shortly after each event. The data also included printed materials – such as brochures, posters and flyers – provided by organizations that participated in these events. These printed materials were made available for pick-up to the persons attending these events.

The second phase of the research looked at the impact of hosting of the Olympics on issues related to sex trafficking. This part of the project relied on ten semi-structured interviews conducted with individuals and organizations – specifically, their representatives, spokespersons or other employees – who work on issues related to sex trafficking, or who work with migrants and immigrants, including individuals who work in the sex trade. In this phase I examined the impact of the Olympics on sex trafficking by considering the perspectives of these individuals and organizations. The interviews took place between February and August 2011. A complete list of the interviews is provided in Appendix B, including information on how and when they were conducted. Interviews were done at the time and the location of each interviewee's choosing. Nine of the ten interviews were audio recorded and later transcribed. The remaining interview was not audio recorded upon the interviewee's request. Notes were instead taken during this interview.

The same general interview guide was used with each participant, although additional questions were asked in each interview to clarify or to help further understand some of the points the respondents raised. The interviews lasted between 30 minutes and 3 hours. The average interview lasted 1 hour and 20 minutes. The interview guide was loosely organized according to several different general areas of focus¹³. Each interview started with questions which aimed to get a better understanding of the respondent's organization and/or their work. Each participant was then asked about the concerns that he or she, or their organization, may have had about sex trafficking and the Olympics and how they addressed these prior to, during and after the Games. The focus of the interview on the concerns prior to the Olympics, activities undertaken prior to and during the Games, and the impact after the event, was loosely based on the questionnaire referred to in Henning, Craggs, Larsson and Laczko's (2006) research on the 2006 World Cup in Germany. Although the focus of the research is different from that

¹³ The interview guide is provided in Appendix C.

of Henning et al., the similarity between their research topic and this current study provided some useful ideas for composing the interview questions.

Along with these two specific phases of research, additional data were collected throughout this project. The primary purpose of this additional data collection was to help develop a deeper understanding of the issues and discussions related to sex trafficking. For example, I continued to follow discussions about sex trafficking well after the 2010 Games. I also followed the media coverage on sex trafficking and the sex trade throughout the project.

3.2.4. *Sampling and Recruitment*

This project primarily used purposive sampling. Purposive sampling is a way of selecting participants, sites or documentary material that will most effectively allow the researcher to address the research question (Palys & Atchison, 2008). Since the aim in this research was to access the most varied perspectives related to the issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade, specifically with respect to the 2010 Olympics, purposive sampling was an appropriate approach.

For the most part, I relied on publicly available and visible advertisements – such as posters displayed in public spaces – to locate public presentations and follow discussions related to sex trafficking which were held prior to the Olympics. All of the events inform my understanding of sex trafficking. However, field notes from three of these meetings (5.5 hours) were used in the data analysis, serving as the basis for the discussion in Chapter 4. This decision is further discussed and explained in the next chapter.

I subsequently contacted different organizations and individuals who are involved with the issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade and invited them to take part in interviews. Some of the participants that were approached had been a part of the public presentations that I attended. They include non-governmental organizations, researchers, front-line service providers, activists, community members, law enforcement and government officials who work on issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade. Participants who agreed to take part in the research were not asked to recommend additional potential participants. However, several offered this information of

their own volition. In some, but not all, cases these suggestions were followed up and resulted in additional participants. One of these participants spoke about her experiences of working with irregular migrants, most of whom were not identified as working in the sex trade. I included those whose work is related to the sex trade and migration along with those whose work is related to trafficking because of the conflation that sometimes occurs between these terms. While it is not my intention to conflate these terms in this research, I wanted to be able to consider the 'impact' of the Olympics from the perspectives of individuals and organizations that might not work directly on sex trafficking but might still be affected by related issues and discussions.

The interviews were conducted with: the E Division Human Trafficking Awareness Coordinator from the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP); the staff from the Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP); Kerry Porth, who at the time of the interview was the Executive Director of Providing Alternatives Counselling & Education (PACE) Society; Angela Contreras-Chavez, who at the time of the interview was the Coordinator at Supporting Women's Alternatives Network (SWAN) Vancouver Society; Michelle Miller, the Executive Director of Resist Exploitation, Embrace Dignity (REED); Esther Shannon, the founder of FIRST, a national feminist coalition for decriminalization of sex work in Canada; Annalee Lepp of Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) Canada; and Shauna Paull, a community advocate who in the interview focused on her experiences of doing direct service work with smuggled women, refugee claimants, and women in detention, and working with GAATW Canada. Additional interviews were conducted with two individuals who wished not to be identified in this study by name. Upon their request, they are instead referred in this thesis as *Researcher and Community Member*.

3.2.5. Data Analysis

In the first phase of the study, the analysis was conducted by looking for key themes that emerged about sex trafficking in the fieldnote data from the public forums I attended. Notes that were taken at each of the events were initially subjected to open coding and analyzed. This process included going through the notes and coding them using concepts and ideas emerging out of the data (Emerson, Fretz & Shaw, 1995). The focus of this coding process was on the concerns about sex trafficking expressed during

the events. The initial list of codes was then categorized into several main themes which were developed into the discussion presented in Chapter 4. In addition to the fieldnotes, this discussion also draws upon the expressed perspectives and opinions reflected in the printed materials, such as those that were made available at the public events. These include pamphlets, posters, postcards, and newspaper articles, some of which contained expressed concerns and thoughts by the same individuals who took part in the public forums as speakers. These additional materials helped to better understand the arguments presented by the speakers by providing further information to what they had spoken about at the events.

In the second phase of the project, transcripts from the recorded interviews, and the notes from the one interview that was not recorded, were read and fully analyzed line-by-line using concepts and ideas emerging from the research participants' responses. The initial list of codes that came out of the interview data was organized into several main themes around the concept of 'impact', as specifically related to the Olympics being held in Vancouver. The meaning of the 'impact' in relation to the issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade was developed through open coding of the interview data, rather than being pre-defined. This was done by looking at the answers to the interview questions that directly asked the respondents to talk about 'impact' (see 'Question 9' in the interview guide presented in Appendix B.). Responses to other questions were analyzed with attention to the same theme, explored through broader questions such as 'what changed?' and 'what was different?' in the respondents' discussions of issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade, at the time before, during and after the Games. The findings of the second phase of this study, presented in Chapter 5, are based on this analysis.

Some of the themes that emerged from the participant observation and the interview data stood out as particularly important. These included issues that were repeatedly raised and talked about throughout the interviews by different research participants. In some cases the significance of these points of discussion was not immediately clear, and some of the questions that seemed to arise from these 'key themes' remain partially or fully unanswered even at the completion of this thesis. In other cases, these themes were revisited multiple times at various points of the research, including in the coding process. They continued to be developed and 'teased

out' throughout the study. Paying attention to these ideas over a longer period allowed them to be developed into some of the central points that are discussed as the findings of this research. This includes data coded under the term 'collaborations', which became an important topic looked at later in the thesis. Exploring some of these themes during the research also helped to shift my understandings of issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade in important ways.

Lastly, triangulation was used extensively throughout this study. Triangulation means using different ways of collecting a variety of data on the same phenomenon in order to gain a better, deeper and a more accurate understanding of it (Jick, 1979). A number of data sources related to sex trafficking and the sex trade shape the understandings that underlie this project even if they are not mentioned, analyzed or in other ways directly included in the discussion.¹⁴ Triangulation was also used more directly in several ways. Collecting and reviewing printed material from public meetings helped to elicit a better understanding of the issues discussed at the public events than what would have been possible by relying only on the fieldnotes. Fieldnotes taken at all of the public events related to sex trafficking and the sex trade that I attended were analyzed for themes. Not all of these data were incorporated into the text of this thesis, but they did help to develop the research findings. Some of these additional data are briefly referred to in subsequent chapters. The data collected during one phase of the project were in some instances used to help clarify issues that emerged in another part of the research. A couple of examples of these instances are noted in later chapters.

¹⁴ This includes a number of viewed films on sex trafficking. Reviewing these films in any meaningful way is beyond the scope of this research. However, the documentary *Cinderellas, Wolves and One Enchanted Prince* (Araújo, 2009) – shown in Vancouver in July 2009 at the Brazilian Film Festival – needs to be highlighted for its recognition of complexities that arise in an attempt to understand the issue of sex trafficking and the sex trade in and from Brazil. The film is also notable for the director Joel Zito Araújo 's reflection on his own shifting understanding of the issues through the process of making the film, which includes challenges to his existing assumptions about victims and perpetrators. Araújo prioritizes women's own voices and experiences, noting that the "best way [for women interviewed in the film] to share their story was to get out of the way and let them tell it" (Crowe, 2009, para. 4). This notion of the importance of 'telling one's own story' also came up repeatedly in the research.

3.2.6. Reflexivity

Edward Said states that “no production of knowledge in the human sciences can ever ignore or disclaim its author's involvement as a human subject in his [sic] own circumstances” (Said, 1994, p. 11). He builds upon Antonio Gramsci's work to say that, prior to conducting any study, it is important to consider the historical processes which have been influential in one's life, and ultimately one's understanding of the world. This means that as a researcher, one has to recognize the forces, specifically those related to knowledge, that have shaped one's experiences and the position from which one comes to one's research question. While taking an inventory of all the ways that these experiences shape my approach to this project is neither relevant nor necessary, several points may be important.

I come to the community of individuals who work around issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade largely as an outsider, without prior personal and/or activist experiences around related issues. There are both advantages and disadvantages in approaching these subjects as an outsider. As I did not have the knowledge that comes with years of experience of living or working with these issues, I was worried that I might miss, misunderstand, or misrepresent something that others would consider important or common knowledge. Throughout the project, I remained aware that a more extensive experience within the community would have given me greater sensitivity and/or more acute understanding with which to approach this research. On the other hand, being an outsider placed me in a unique position which helped me navigate different arguments and settings – both physically and in the ability they provided to perhaps consider and engage with seemingly 'opposing' positions more easily. Arguably, my relationship to the places, people and arguments with which I came in contact during this research would have been different, and would have shaped this research differently, had I come to it with existing personal, work and/or activist experience.

I approach sex trafficking discourse first and foremost as an Eastern European immigrant woman who has been living in a Western country for an extensive period of time. My approach to discussions about this topic is based on experiencing critically, and questioning, Western representations of non-Western and/or racialized women as trafficked and sexually exploited. When drawing parallels between Eastern European

and other women discussed in sex trafficking narratives, there is a need to recognize the privilege of race that white women – Eastern European and others – hold, particularly within the North American context. Specifically, this recognizes that even when they come from places where they are seen as 'ethnic others,' white immigrants have the option to gain from the material benefits associated with assimilating and claiming 'white privilege' (Hill Collins, 2006).

In her discussion on the appropriation of knowledge, Andrea Smith remarks that the process of learning is necessarily very slow, requiring a person to spend time in a community, being quiet and listening (Smith, 2005). She juxtaposes this with “a colonial model of teaching, researching, and learning that undermines this approach” (*ibid.*, p. 134). This latter model includes educational requirements which focus on quick dissemination of knowledge, and a sense of entitlement that individuals often feel about their right and ability to access knowledge about a community even if they are coming to the community as outsiders. Smith specifically talks about academia and the appropriation of Native spiritual practices by non-Natives. However, her position touches on questions about knowledge and knowing which were ever-present in this project, both for me in my role as a researcher, and in the field in discussions about sex trafficking and the sex trade. The tension between the strengths I felt I was bringing to the project and the anxiety over my lack of experience in coming to this topic was ever-present and in many ways has shaped this research throughout.

3.2.7. Ethical Considerations

This project received approval by the Simon Fraser University's Office of Research Ethics in January 2011. A statement of the ethics approval is included at the beginning of this thesis.

Participant observation conducted as part of this research was based on publicly held meetings and so was not subject to research ethics board approval. As per Article 2.3 of the Tri-Council Policy Statement, "research involving observation of participants in, for example, political rallies, demonstrations or public meetings should not require REB review since it can be expected that the participants are seeking public visibility" where "the information is publicly accessible and there is no reasonable expectation of

privacy" (Canadian Institutes of Health Research, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, and Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, 2005, p. 2.4; see also Canadian Institutes of Health Research, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, and Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, 2010). Further, as noted in the discussion throughout Chapter 4, information presented in these meetings was often readily available publicly in other ways, as in media, and in online and printed materials from the organizations.

3.3. Conclusion

This chapter has outlined how this project was conducted. It has discussed both the theoretical basis and methodological decisions that informed how the project was carried out. Relying on participant observation and interviews, the project examines discussions about sex trafficking in the context of the 2010 Olympic Games. It also looks at the impact of the Games on local issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade.

Recognizing that sex trafficking is linked to understandings of prostitution, the project builds upon a perspective which looks at prostitution within a wider historical, political and economic context, and ties it to the issues of sex and sexuality. This perspective rests on the concepts of ideology and discourse, in order to take a closer look at processes of knowledge creation and related power relations. Lastly, it recognizes as important tangible consequences of discussions and created knowledge, and considers them from an intersectional feminist perspective. This thesis recognizes that discussions about sex trafficking can shape and affect individual lives. In this way, rather than looking for 'the truth' about sex trafficking, this focus recognizes that it is important to look at how knowledge comes about and what impact it can have.

4. Construction of sex trafficking as a social problem in the context of the 2010 Winter Olympics

Chapter 4 discusses the findings of the first part of this research, which examined the concerns that were raised about sex trafficking and the 2010 Winter Olympics in Vancouver. I have divided the chapter into two main parts. The first part examines the claims that were made about sex trafficking and the solutions that were called for. The second part looks at the strategies that were used to raise these issues publicly and politically.

In what follows I argue that sex trafficking was constructed as a social problem in the context of the Olympics. The concerns raised in public discussions, organized as part of anti-trafficking initiatives, largely focused on making claims related to prostitution, drawing connections between prostitution and sex trafficking. In the discussions that took place in the public forums organized around the concerns about sex trafficking and the Olympics, presenters emphasized the problem of violence that they saw as inherent to prostitution. They highlighted male demand for commercial sex as a central concern to the issues of prostitution and sex trafficking. Claims raised about sex trafficking emphasized the need for something to be done about it. Presenters called for the punishment of male clients and the abolition of prostitution as ways of addressing sex trafficking. They also asked for a public and a government response in dealing with these issues.

The chapter takes a detailed look at the discussions that took place in the public forums organized around the concern about sex trafficking prior to the 2010 Winter

Olympics.¹⁵ The discussion in this chapter – and specifically, the way in which the issues are understood and presented here – is primarily based on the key themes that emerged from the field notes I compiled during this research. These notes were taken at three of the public meetings held prior to the Olympics by the organization Resist Exploitation, Embrace Dignity (REED), as part of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign.¹⁶ Additionally, this chapter relies on printed materials and other resources produced by organizations that participated in these forums, mainstream and alternative media coverage of these issues, and articles from Christian communities in Canada.

4.1. Concerns about sex trafficking and the 2010 Winter Olympics

Concerns about sex trafficking started to emerge publicly prior to the 2010 Winter Olympics. One of the more visible anti-trafficking initiatives organized was *Buying Sex is Not a Sport*, a “grassroots campaign to raise awareness and effect change around sex trafficking and the 2010 Olympic games [sic]” (REED website, 2012, para. 2). The campaign was organized by REED, a faith-based anti-trafficking organization that works towards ending trafficking and sexual exploitation (Buhler, 2009; REED website, 2012). The campaign started in May 2009 with a public film screening and a forum discussion (McLaren, 2009).

¹⁵ In 2009 and 2010, I attended seven events prior to the 2010 Winter Olympics which were related to the topic of sex trafficking. The four events that this chapter does not focus on included discussion about sex trafficking, but their primary stated purpose did not appear to be the raising of concerns about sex trafficking and the Games. I continued to pay attention to public discussions about sex trafficking and the sex trade after the Games, and attended an additional seven events in 2011 and 2012 related to these topics. The full list of attended events is provided in Appendix B.

¹⁶ To the best of my understanding this was the only organized anti-trafficking campaign which focused specifically on raising awareness in the general public about the issue of sex trafficking and the 2010 Winter Olympics. Some of the organizations that participated in *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* forums also held their own, or participated in others', events, separately from this campaign. These additional events did not appear to be a part of any single ongoing campaign organized specifically in relation to the Olympics.

Buying Sex is Not a Sport campaign initiatives played an important role in making concerns about sex trafficking publicly visible in the Metro Vancouver area.¹⁷ Best points out that the success of claims-making initiatives relies in part on the ability of claims-makers to mobilize resources and make all the necessary arrangements for their activities. This includes choosing an appropriate location and time in order to attract as much interest as possible (Best, 2013). Several aspects of the *Buying Sex in Not a Sport* campaign can be highlighted for how they helped the campaign attract attention. For example, the public forums were open and welcoming. They were held in places such as a local university and a downtown church, and were accessible by public transit. These public forums were advertised through the use of visually appealing, attention-grabbing, full colour posters printed on heavy paper.¹⁸ The events drew somewhat diverse and fairly large-sized audiences. For example, one of the events held prior to the Olympics filled the room with about 40 people of various ages: from about mid-20s to about late 50s, of which just over half were women. The set-up of the space where this particular event was held – including plastic chairs arranged to face a panel of speakers – contributed to the feeling of the event being a low-key, 'community meeting'. The church where the forum took place has been used by other groups – including many secular groups – as a neighbourhood space for public events organized around different social justice topics. Other events organized as part of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign included public protests, or 'silent direct actions' (REED website, 2012). These were visible to passers-by, as they were held in public spaces such as in front of a local strip club (Weber, 2010), and in front of an Olympic event venue (REED website, 2012).

The campaign appeared to have the support of a diversity of voices that took part in raising concerns about sex trafficking. Presenters who took part in the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* public forums represented various local communities. These included

¹⁷ With assistance from the Canadian Baptist Women of Ontario and Quebec, the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign was also brought to Toronto (North American Baptist Women's Union, 2011).

¹⁸ The quality of the posters also speaks to the financial resources the organizers must have had to put towards publicizing the events.

women formerly involved in the sex trade, Aboriginal activist women, community service and faith-based organizations, and academics. Some of the organizations involved were REED, Aboriginal Women's Action Network (AWAN), Vancouver Rape Relief and Women's Shelter, and Experiential Voices Educating (EVE).

Forum speakers expressed a shared perspective in their presentations – their concerns about sex trafficking were framed around a call for the abolition of prostitution. Specifically, they expressed the ideological position on prostitution which claimed prostitution to be inherently harmful, and problematized the male demand for commercial sex. The posters which advertised the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* events described them as public forums "on how the male demand for paid sex fuels human trafficking, with a focus on the upcoming 2010 Olympics."¹⁹ One of the main objectives of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign was to bring attention to and problematize male demand for commercial sex. This was based on the belief that sex trafficking increases in relation to large-scale sporting events due to an influx of male visitors coming to the city to watch sports (McLaren, 2009). Presenters made claims that men would be more likely to purchase sex when coming to Vancouver, because they would be away from their families, and arguably away from social expectations, commitments and responsibilities to their communities. Presenters gave examples from previous sporting events where reports had emerged about alleged increases in sex trafficking. These included the 2004 Olympic Games in Athens, Greece, the 2006 World Cup in Germany and the US Super Bowls.²⁰ The examples were given as reasons to be concerned about this issue in relation to the 2010 Winter Olympics in Vancouver. The concern called for a need to specifically address both international and domestic sex trafficking.

Presenters who were taking part in the public forums claimed that an increase in the male demand for paid sex would 'further the exploitation' of women and children, expected to be coerced into the sex trade to meet the demand (see also REED website,

¹⁹ REED poster, copy on file.

²⁰ There have been conflicting reports around the relationship between large-scale sporting events and sex trafficking. See GAATW (2011) for an overview of some of these discussions.

2012). For example, REED's Executive Director Michelle Miller stated that "Vancouver is already a hot spot for trafficking and sex tourism... When you add thousands of visitors to the mix, the problem will be exacerbated" (Buhler, 2009, para. 6).²¹ Presenters argued that an increased demand for paid sex would, at least in part, be met by the trafficking of women from other parts of Canada and from outside the country. They described human trafficking as a large and growing international problem that disproportionately affects women and children. A *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* postcard – which was made available at the community forums – states that "[a]n estimated 21 million women and children are trafficked annually, the majority for exploitation in the sex industry."²² By focusing discussions about sex trafficking on the male demand for paid sexual services and the sex trade in general, presenters formed a link between trafficking and prostitution. In discussions, this link connected concerns about sexual exploitation of women and children – concerns that are central to the issue of sex trafficking – with discussions about the sex trade in general.

These discussions emphasized violence and other harms as the prevalent and defining experiences in prostitution. Presenters taking part in the public forums asked

²¹ The Future Group (2007) and Bowen and Shannon (Bowen & Shannon Frontline Consulting, 2009) both point to the RCMP estimates that about 600 people are trafficked to Canada and into the sex trade annually. The Future Group also argues that a number of factors, including its location and size, make Vancouver an attractive destination and a transit city for traffickers. Bowen and Shannon, however, caution that evidence of trafficking cases is, for various reasons, based on anecdotal information rather than formally documented reports (Bowen & Shannon Frontline Consulting, 2009).

²² The number '21 million' can also be found in the 2012 International Labour Organization Global Estimate of Forced Labour report. However, in this report 20.9 million is the estimate of the total number of forced labourers. The report estimates that 4.5 million (or 22%) of this total are sexual exploitation victims, while 14.2 million (68%) are forced labour exploitation victims. Of sexual exploitation victims, 98% are female, and 79% of those are adult women. Of the total number of forced labour victims, 15.4 million (or 74%) are adults, and 11.4 million (or 55%) are female (both adult and under 18) (International Labour Organization, 2012). The ILO findings are also cited by the United States Department of State 2012 Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report. The TIP report states that the ILO findings represent "what the U.S. Government considers to be covered by the umbrella term 'trafficking in persons'" (US Department of State, 2012a, p. 45). The TIP is an annual report which assesses sex trafficking internationally and provides a tiered rating of international governments based on their respective efforts to combat trafficking (see US Department of State, 2012b for more information).

that prostitution be addressed in terms of these issues. Trisha Baptie, one of the forum presenters, expressed her position in a commentary for a local weekly newspaper. She explained it as follows: "[o]ne of the most 'sex-positive' things you can do is make sure men cannot buy sex, because the buying of sex is violence against women and is a direct deterrent to women's equality" (Baptie, 2009, para. 3). By arguing that there is a link between sex trafficking and prostitution, or more specifically between sex trafficking and male demand for paid sex, presenters problematized the sex trade in general, and male demand for paid sex in particular. Under this view, prostitution was claimed to be uniformly harmful, regardless of where and under what conditions it takes place. This position was expressed to the public forum audiences through the emotionally charged nature of several of the presentations. Some of these presentations included detailed and graphic descriptions of violence experienced by women in the sex trade. Different speakers further emphasized the difficult nature of the material presented during evening events by periodically inviting audiences to take breaks or in other ways do what they needed in order to take care of themselves emotionally.

Presenters claimed that harm in prostitution is perpetrated and experienced as physical, sexual, and psychological or emotional violence. Presenters emphasized that in the sex trade women are treated as objects and commodities, and are routinely subjected to being beaten and raped.²³ Working in the sex trade, it was said, could also leave long term, traumatic effects on women who sell sex. Concern was raised about the potential for prostitution to harm relationships between men and women, as well as to lead to shame and negative self esteem among women involved in the sex trade. In this way, the harm associated with prostitution was highlighted in presentations. In literature there are different ways of understanding where the main harm in prostitution originates, how it is experienced, and how it should be addressed. The fact that in the public forum presentations, this harm was understood to be primarily gender-based and intrinsic to

²³ Discussions seemed to focus on cisgender women involved in the sex trade. Persons who sell sex and identify by other genders were not mentioned in these discussions. Presumably all of the sexual and other intimate relationships, both commercial and non-commercial, that were discussed were also assumed to be heterosexual.

prostitution, meant that the presenters took a very specific position on the sex trade. This view represented the ideological position that sees prostitution as inherently harmful, particularly to women, and calls for it to be abolished (e.g. Jeffreys, 1997).

The use of strong imagery – which in this case was provided in narrative form – can "increase the intensity and emotional resonance of movement frames" (Halfmann and Young, 2010, p. 4). Characterizing prostitution as inherently harmful and violent made it difficult to imagine a situation where a person was not in some way forced or deceived – or arguably by extension, trafficked – into the sex trade. Presenters emphasized the victimhood of persons involved in the sex trade. In several presentations the age of entry into prostitution was identified as being 14 years.²⁴ This suggests that an adult's involvement in prostitution is "an extension of the violence that most prostituted women experience as children" (AWAN pamphlet, copy on file). It also implies that violence in the sex trade is commonly experienced from an early age among individuals who sell sex. Several presenters mentioned that the demand for paid sex targets both women and children, describing both as problematic. Saying that, on average, individuals typically enter into prostitution prior to adulthood links adult prostitution with the sexual exploitation of children. While highlighting both adult and children's experiences of violence may help to draw attention to issues in the sex trade, as well as evoke outrage, failing to differentiate between these experiences suggests that both should be imagined and dealt with in the same way. Critics of this perspective also point out that the emphasis on 'women and children' also fails to recognize men's experiences of being trafficked (Doezema, 2010).

The presenters argued that harm from prostitution was primarily the result of gender inequality, which was seen as inherent to prostitution. This is evident in the

²⁴ It is not possible to know the average age of entry into prostitution in Canada from any one study based on a non-probabilistic sample, and no national study with a representative sample has been conducted to date (Lowman, 2013). Any cited age of entry into prostitution needs to be considered within the context of the research from which it was taken, and the sample which it is derived from.

following quote, which comes from AWAN's pamphlet made available at the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* public forum held on November 27, 2009:

If we truly understood that prostitution is sexualized violence perpetrated by men against women, we would be compelled to act decisively to stop it. (Lynne, 1998, in AWAN pamphlet, copy on file)

Similarly, presenters called for the need to recognize that violence experienced by women who sell sex is perpetrated by male clients and 'pimps'. In presentations, the sex trade was discussed as being grounded in gender inequality, and as simultaneously being a way of perpetuating this inequality. Presenters argued that women in prostitution are seen and treated as bodies used for the fulfillment of male sexual needs and desires, and women's own emotional and other needs come secondary, or do not come into consideration at all. This perspective sees the power dynamics in prostitution as being based on male privilege and female subordination. The existence of prostitution is seen as being driven by men's demand for sexual services, and their ability to obtain access to women's and children's bodies through commercial sex. Public forum presenters explained the power dynamics inherent to prostitution primarily in terms of gender and heterosexual relationships – or as the commercialized subordination of women (Jeffreys, 2009). Others, however, argue that these power dynamics are more complex, and that to explain them we need to look beyond 'patriarchy' and 'capitalism' (see Truong, 1990).

The gendered nature of prostitution was said to negatively affect all women, not only those involved in the sex trade. Presenters warned that the dynamics of harm, assumed to be inherent in commercial sex relationships, could be replicated in non-commercial heterosexual relationships as well. To Trisha Baptie, "[t]olerating prostitution affects everyone, because the inherent inequality in prostitution becomes a reference point for sexual and social relations, which are not rooted in equality, fairness, or respect" (Baptie, 2009, para. 5). According to this position, prostitution is a way of maintaining gender inequality between men and women. Baptie (2009) argued that prostitution also contributes to divisions among women, as a result of the oppositional views held on the issue. Some look at the sex trade as an issue of personal choice, while others view it as inherently harmful. Less commonly, the question is also raised

about the need to consider the occasionally conflicting interests of women who work in the sex trade versus those who do not. In particular, the latter would include women who have non-commercial heterosexual relationships, including involvements with men who themselves purchase sex (Truong, 1990; Grant, in Schlanger, 2013).

Public forum presenters suggested that the gender inequality inherent in prostitution is further supported by the state. This included the lack of government action in addressing issues faced by women who sell sex. Governments were further criticized for financially benefitting from regulation of some aspects of the sex industry. Gender inequality was also seen as reflected in prostitution laws and policies, which presenters claimed targeted women, while largely ignoring men. Presenters spoke about how, in Canada, existing laws have the power to criminalize both women who sell sex and men who buy it,²⁵ while in practice they are used mostly against women. It was pointed out that when medical and other regulations are implemented in relation to the sex trade, this similarly does not ask male clients to register or undergo medical exams, while it does subject women in the sex trade to these requirements.

Presenters also argued that harm in prostitution stems from inequalities based on race and ethnicity. In particular, several speakers talked about Aboriginal women in Canada, pointing out that they are disproportionately represented in the sex trade. Further, Aboriginal women also make up a large proportion of the missing and murdered women across Canada, and in particular in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside and the 'Highway of Tears'.²⁶ Presenters from AWAN emphasized the need to consider the history of colonialism as well as sexual and other abuses experienced by Aboriginal women. Presenters spoke about the sex trade as exacerbating existing gender, race and class inequalities experienced by Aboriginal women. As will be discussed in the next chapter, various research and community work highlight the need to recognize the wider

²⁵ Two of the three prostitution-related provisions of Canada's Criminal Code have recently been struck down as a result of a Charter challenge in *Bedford v. Canada*. The Canadian government is in the process of appealing a decision made by the Ontario Court of Appeal, which followed an earlier ruling by the Ontario Superior Court of Justice.

²⁶ AWAN pamphlet, copy on file.

context of violence, including the history of violence, experienced by Aboriginal women in order to better understand their involvement in the sex trade and locate possible solutions for their concerns. In the conversations which took place in the public forums, the issue of 'domestic trafficking' referred primarily to moving Aboriginal women into cities for purposes of exploitation in the sex trade.

Forum presenters spoke about class inequalities and issues of poverty in relation to prostitution. Cherry Smiley, one of the presenters who took part in public forums, addresses the concept of 'choice' when putting forth a critique of prostitution being the best of limited economic options available to women. She emphasizes her position by demanding "[r]eal choices for women and girls" (see Smiley, 2011, para. 8), explaining that:

A choice between unlivable welfare, a job that pays an unlivable wage, and the institution of prostitution on stolen native land in a culture that tells girls from birth that our bodies are for men's pleasure is no choice. (Smiley, 2011, para. 8).

Presenters who took part in public forums emphasized that prostitution is an inadequate option for women who do not receive appropriate social support. In addition, they argued that the exploitation of women in the sex industry economically benefits other parties, such as 'pimps' and brothel owners.²⁷ In the November 27, 2009 forum, a presenter drew connections between prostitution and the profitable global sex industry. Here trafficking and sex tourism were seen as a form of international expansion of the industry that catered to meeting male demand for paid sex (Jeffreys, 2009). Elsewhere, it has been noted that some of those who are assumed to be 'trafficked' are migrant sex workers looking for better economic opportunities (Doezema, 2010). Those who see prostitution itself as exploitative, place a focus on the need to end it (Jeffreys, 2009). Others argue that conversations should instead centre on how to improve the safety and working conditions of individuals in the sex trade, including those of migrants (e.g. O'Connell Davidson, 2006).

²⁷ Similar concerns were presented also in a pamphlet by AWAN (copy on file).

In addition to raising concerns about sex trafficking, and by extension the sex trade, presenters also called for the need to address them. By using sex trafficking discourse, discussions in public forums emphasized the fact that issues of violence in the sex trade and among trafficked women – in particular violence experienced by Aboriginal women, as well as other racialized and/or non-Western women – needed to be recognized as serious and immediate. As I argue in the following section, the particular ideological position on the sex trade that was put forth through the construction of sex trafficking as a social problem was strengthened in the context of the Olympics. This was done by encouraging public and government action, by drawing connections between sex trafficking and the sex trade, and by raising awareness about the issues presented through the formation of a number of alliances.

4.2. Addressing sex trafficking

In the process of raising concerns about sex trafficking, participants taking part in anti-trafficking initiatives framed their arguments around a single ideological view of prostitution. They claimed that prostitution is inherently harmful to women, in particular Aboriginal and other racialized and/or non-White women, and that it needs to be abolished through adoption of the Nordic legal model. As was mentioned in Chapter 1, adopting the Nordic model of prostitution law would criminalize third parties involved in prostitution, and buyers of sexual services, but not the sellers.²⁸ In the context of the 2010 Winter Olympics, this view of prostitution was arguably effectively communicated, gaining public and political attention. Three aspects of the ways in which concerns about sex trafficking were raised stand out. First, during public presentations about sex

²⁸ In Canada, the first time that this legal approach to addressing prostitution appeared in a federal government document was in the 2007 Standing Committee of the Status of Women report, *Turning Outrage into Action to Address Trafficking for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation in Canada*. This was also the first government report that "conflated prostitution, youth sexual exploitation, and human trafficking squarely within a 'violence against women' framework" (Lepp, 2010, p. 48). Lowman (2011) notes that witnesses invited to present evidence at the hearings that led to the report did not include researchers who questioned claims of those seeking prohibition of prostitution.

trafficking, audiences were called upon to 'do something' personally and politically about the issue. It was expected that their response should be based on the understanding that prostitution is harmful. Second, public forum presenters challenged individuals, organizations, and groups that disagreed with them. They challenged the notion that a woman can, and sometimes does, choose to work in the sex trade. Third, numerous alliances formed around the sex trafficking discourse, adopting the view that prostitution is harmful and connected to the problem of sex trafficking.

This second section of the chapter takes a closer look at strategies used to construct sex trafficking as a problem in the context of the 2010 Winter Olympics. I examine the proposed solutions, consider how other voices on these issues were addressed, and discuss the important role that alliances played in raising sex trafficking as a concern.

4.2.1. *Calling for public and government response*

Spector and Kitsuse argue that activities around construction of social problems often revolve around moral positions. Claims made about an issue communicate that some troubling condition should not exist, and that something should be done about it (Spector and Kitsuse, 1987). Presenters taking part in the public forums of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign asked that individual and government action be taken on sex trafficking, and called for prostitution to be abolished in Canada. They focused on targeting male demand for paid sex as a necessary step to reducing and ultimately getting rid of the need to 'supply' women to the sex industry. Through these arguments, presenters claimed that eliminating the demand for paid sexual services and the need for prostitution would also eradicate the problem of sex trafficking.

When they spoke about solutions to sex trafficking, presenters emphasized the need for the Canadian government to implement the Nordic law, which would criminalize buyers of sexual services and decriminalize the sellers. The ultimate goal of this law is the abolition of prostitution and eradication of sex trafficking. In Sweden, where this law was first implemented, "prostitution and trafficking in human beings for sexual purposes are seen as issues that cannot, and should not, be separated; both are harmful practices and intrinsically linked" (Ekberg, 2004, p. 1189). Presenters argued that adopting the

Nordic law would deter male clients from wanting to purchase sexual services, but would not punish sellers of sex, who were assumed to be female. This reflected the ideological position on the sex trade that sees it primarily in gendered terms, with male buyers of sexual services as the perpetrators of harm and violence, and female sellers as victims. The ability of men to desire and to obtain paid sexual services from women was here seen as the crux of the problem. This perspective sees prostitution as standing in the way of equality, and respect for human rights of women and children (Ekberg, 2004). By criminalizing clients, the Nordic law punishes those who are said to support prostitution through the buying of sex. By not tolerating prostitution, a message would be sent that women are valued members of society (Baptie, 2009). In other words, implementation of this law promises to shift public views on prostitution and on gender.²⁹

Presenters asked community forum audiences to politically and personally get involved in addressing sex trafficking. Presenters invited audiences to write to their Members of Parliament, or in other ways "advocate for laws to decriminalize the selling of sex and criminalize the buying of sex."³⁰ This meant that people coming to hear concerns raised about sex trafficking were being asked to take a position on prostitution law and support the implementation of the Nordic model in Canada.

People, and men in particular, could also take personal responsibility and address the issue of sex trafficking in their own lives. The *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* campaign website and postcards, which were made available at public forums, provided audiences with several suggestions on what they could do (see REED website, 2012). This included further educating oneself about sex trafficking and about how to address it. One could find additional information on topics and concerns raised in forum

²⁹ There have been mixed reports on how successful the 'Nordic law' has been in achieving what it aimed to accomplish when it was implemented in Sweden. Some of these issues, including those around the methodology used to evaluate the law to date, have been raised and are better addressed elsewhere (see for example Agustín, 2010; Anthony, 2010; Dodillet and Östergren, 2011). Further, a recent report from Norway suggests there has been an increase in violence experienced by women in prostitution since the country's adoption of the Nordic law (The Local, 2012).

³⁰ From a *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* postcard, copy on file; see also REED website (2012).

presentations on printed materials that were displayed and made available for pick up at these events. People could play a role in educating others by starting conversations about sex trafficking. They had the opportunity to take part in the *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* campaign by wearing the campaign T-shirt or by posting its stickers around the city. Wearing the T-shirt, for example, could draw attention to the campaign and its message, helping to start conversations about sex trafficking in one's community. These suggestions invited audiences to become part of anti-trafficking work by accepting concerns about sex trafficking raised in public forums and doing something about them.

Even when they acknowledged other issues, speakers maintained a focus on the abolition of prostitution and the ending of male demand for commercial sex throughout the public presentations. Some individuals spoke about the need to address other challenges that can affect women's lives, as well as the importance of connecting the issue of prostitution to a larger historical context. Clearly, legal change also needed to be accompanied by other structural shifts. As Trisha Baptie explained in an article published in a local newspaper, when Sweden introduced its prostitution law in 1999, it "also implemented exiting strategies, adequate welfare, and a huge awareness campaign" (Baptie, 2009, para. 15). It was not clear what kind of an impact legal change would have without the provision of additional services. In these conversations ending male demand for commercial sex and abolition of prostitution remained the focus: the main way of understanding both the problem and the solution.

4.2.2. *Prostitution and sex trafficking – establishing the relationship*

Despite the diversity of backgrounds of those who took part in raising concerns about sex trafficking, a single view of prostitution was put forth, challenging the validity of other understandings of the sex trade. Claims made about sex trafficking placed the focus on concerns about the sex trade, and closely linked prostitution to sex trafficking. Claims that were used to raise sex trafficking as an issue asked audiences to accept the ideological position that sees prostitution as inherently harmful. As presenters linked sex trafficking and the sex trade in their discussions, it became easy to associate prostitution with claims focused on exploitation and violence that are commonly found in the sex trafficking discourse.

When effective, graphic imagery can be used as a strategy to increase public support for one's claims while decreasing support for opposing positions (Halfmann and Young, 2010). Putting forth a single view of prostitution undermined other voices – those whose ideological positions reflect a different understanding of issues and solutions to concerns about the sex trade. Forum presenters criticized those who did not recognize prostitution as inherently harmful or who called for other ways of addressing prostitution in law. They specifically criticized those who saw prostitution as 'sex work' and advocate for the decriminalization and/or legalization of the sex trade³¹. Presenters referred to people in this group as the 'pro-prostitution' or 'pro-pimp' lobby and saw their position as supporting the harms and inequalities they saw as inherent to prostitution. Presenters stated that legalization or decriminalization of the sex trade would help to expand the sex industry as well as to normalize it. Prostitution would come to be seen not only as a legitimate form of work but also as an employment option forced onto women. Presenting prostitution as an employment option, it was claimed, could allow government to relieve itself from its responsibility to provide women with adequate social support. Finally, legalization or decriminalization of prostitution was seen as an example of society 'settling for less,' rather than demanding 'real' opportunities for women. This reflected a position that prostitution is not, and should not be, considered 'real work'.

By dismissing a range of individuals and organizations who did not necessarily share the same ideological position on the sex trade as a single 'lobby,' presenters failed to recognize the diversity among this group. They also did not examine the commonalities between their own concerns and those whose position they criticized, such as issues related to lack of adequate economic opportunities for women, housing issues, as well as harm and violence experienced by sex sellers. Perhaps these similarities are not surprising given that, as Melissa Gira Grant notes, arguments made in anti-prostitution initiatives have drawn upon some of the same concerns around inequity that sex workers have been pointing to for a long time (Grant, 2012).

³¹ See Lowman (2011) for a discussion of the difference between 'decriminalization' and 'legalization' of prostitution.

Forum presenters not only criticized other perspectives of prostitution, but they also challenged the right of those holding such views to speak out on the issue of sex trafficking. This meant that there was no room left for those who called for prostitution to be recognized differently. Individuals and groups who understood – or were said to understand – prostitution as a form of work were challenged on the grounds of their presumed gender, race, class, and other privileges. Claims were made that these individuals were operating out of self-interest rather than out of concern for women who sell sex. Their assumed privilege was seen as preventing them from experiencing and recognizing harm in the sex trade, and protecting them any future potential harm associated with prostitution. The question emerged of who can, and who has the right to, speak about prostitution – particularly about women involved in the street-level sex trade, and for Aboriginal and other racialized and/or non-Western women in the sex trade. The emphasis placed on individual lived experiences called for the need to prioritize culturally-specific ways of knowing and communicating knowledge, particularly when it comes to experiences of Aboriginal women (Smiley, 2011), or migrant and immigrant women in Canada.

Discussions that took place in public forums seemed to rely on, maintain, and reaffirm a dividing line between the two sides of the prostitution debate.³² In different conversations throughout this research, these two sides were referred to as the 'abolitionist' or 'prohibitionist' side, and the 'pro-prostitution', 'pro-pimp' or 'pro-john' lobby. In the public forum presentations, and subsequently in interviews, some individuals drew boundaries and distinguished between their own and others' viewpoints, either confirming or challenging the validity of different ways in which experiences in the sex trade were understood. For example, they based these distinctions on differences identified between experiential and community-based knowledge, versus knowledge that was coming from academia and other privileged social position – knowledge which was assumed to lack personal experience in the sex trade. In adopting the anti-trafficking

³² See discussions in Lepp (2010) and Lowman (2011) for the historical context of this division with respect to discussions about prostitution and the prostitution law in Canada.

position, the public presentations challenged the existence of prostitution and problematized the perspective of the individuals and organizations who called for its decriminalization.

4.2.3. *Raising awareness through alliances*

The effectiveness of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign and related initiatives relied on building alliances and networks to raise awareness. The role of alliances in claims-making activities is important considering that resources needed to raise awareness about an issue are often limited. This lack of resources can place organizations that are part of the same social movement in competition with one another over resources such as monetary donations, new members and media attention (Best, 2013). Forming alliances can allow organizations to share resources rather than compete over them. Connections formed around the sex trafficking discourse seemed to help strengthen the awareness of the problem that was raised. Thus, the role of alliances in constructing sex trafficking as a problem was not insignificant.

The public forums can be seen as a mechanism for generating support and building alliances for the anti-trafficking position. Whether or not audiences agreed with the presenters' perspectives they could still have walked away from the public forums feeling as though they were hearing something that was important, and something that needed to be raised as an issue and addressed. The aim of the discussion at the beginning of this chapter was to illustrate that the public forums themselves were advertised and organized in a way that encouraged different members of the public to attend. By inviting audience members to take personal and political action about sex trafficking, the hope was to generate more support for the position that was being presented.

The focus on abolition of prostitution and implementation of the Nordic law also united the presenters in public forums, many of whom were part of different backgrounds and communities. As mentioned above, the *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* campaign brought together feminists, Aboriginal women activists, academics, faith-based groups and other individuals and organizations coming from various ideological positions. These alliances, framed around a shared concern over sex trafficking and a common way of

understanding the sex trade, helped to strengthen the effectiveness of voices that took part in anti-trafficking initiatives related to the Olympics. The members of these alliances had the opportunity to rely on one another's networks as a way of expanding the resources they had available, such as audiences and their support base. Expressing their concerns using sex trafficking discourse gave participating organizations and individuals an opportunity to establish a place for themselves within the larger community of anti-trafficking work. At the same time, a diversity of participants coming together in support of concerns over sex trafficking gave greater legitimacy to the claims that were being presented as part of these initiatives. In other words, alliances showed sex trafficking – as it was understood and presented in the forums – to be an issue of concern that had the support of a wide diversity of communities.

In addition to the alliances formed between the participants who directly took part in the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign, concerns about sex trafficking were spread through networks beyond those of the campaign. The *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign and participating individuals and organizations were connected to other anti-trafficking initiatives related to the 2010 Olympics. There were at least four different initiatives organized in relation to the Games. Aside from *Buying Sex is Not a Sport*, these included work by the More Than Gold (MTG) network of Christian churches and ministries, the Salvation Army British Columbia's *The Truth Isn't Sexy* campaign, and the Citizens' Summit on Human Trafficking and the Olympics (Tidd, 2010) .

In particular, concerns about sex trafficking and the Olympics emerged as an important issue within the Christian communities across Canada (see for example, Stirk, 2009; Newman, 2010; Episcopal Commission for Justice and Peace, 2010; Coggins, 2010; Tidd, 2010). The communities placed the focus on addressing the “supply of children and women who can fall prey to traffickers; and lessening the demand for sex with prostitutes” (Stirk, 2009, para. 11). They called for a variety of responses, some of which included awareness-raising, education, community action, government assistance, services to help women exit prostitution, as well as prayer (see for example, Episcopal Commission for Justice and Peace, 2010). This included a Canada-wide prayer event, TheCry. About 10,000 people participated in this event which, among other things, encouraged participants to pray that the Olympics would not lead to an increase in human trafficking (Newman, 2010). While the above initiatives worked independently,

they also collaborated with one another, as well as worked with other individuals and organizations around the issue of trafficking. For example, MTG and the Salvation Army – itself an MTG member – partnered up in order to develop a strategy for "protecting sex workers and preventing future sex trafficking" (Peters, 2009, para. 7). MTG also worked in collaboration with the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign (More Than Gold, 2009b).

Within these communities collaboration allowed various organizations to utilize and share important resources. For example, partnerships with MTG allowed the work of anti-trafficking campaigns such as the Salvation Army's and *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* to be publicized among the many MTG network members. The *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* campaign also benefitted from their relationship with MTG by being able to hold at least a couple of their events in MTG-affiliated churches. In addition, organizations which participated in the *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* campaign events had the opportunity to present their particular concerns about sex trafficking and the sex trade while taking advantage of the extra publicity that the campaign attracted. Alliances helped establish avenues which could subsequently be used to raise trafficking as an issue on a wider scale than any participating organization or individual could have accomplished on their own.

Collaborations between different individuals and organizations helped to raise awareness about sex trafficking as a social problem both publicly and politically, by asking different segments of the society for a response. For example, *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* was a grassroots campaign that focused on individuals taking action, whether in their own lives or by appealing to the government. The Citizens' Summit, on the other hand, focused on asking for a government response on the issue of sex trafficking.³³ Collaborating with others and forming alliances helped to establish different avenues which could be pursued to raise these concerns and call for very specific actions to be taken in response.

³³ The fact that these initiatives each had a separate focus was also noted by an interview participant who took part in this project.

Within the alliances formed around the issue of sex trafficking and the Olympics, faith-based groups had an opportunity to play a particularly important role in raising awareness and taking action. Analysis of this role should also acknowledge the potential positions of influence that some of the organizations involved in anti-trafficking work held, both within and outside of faith-based communities. For example, both the Salvation Army and REED – the main organizer of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign – were identified as key stakeholders and were asked to participate in a Statistics Canada consultation process on how to measure human trafficking (Ogrodnik, 2010).³⁴ Also, MTG was officially recognized by the International Organizing Committee (IOC) for its work related to the Olympic Games. A member of the MTG Board of Directors, David Wells, was the coordinator and head of the multi-faith chaplaincy at the 2010 Winter Olympics, which offered services from five main religions – Christianity, Islam, Judaism, Buddhism and Hinduism (Kaye, 2010; Todd, 2010). 'More Than Gold' served as the brand name and identity for the network of Christian churches and agencies of different denominations which also provided outreach and services before, during and after the 2010 Games (More Than Gold, 2009a; Salvationist, 2009a, 2009b). Since 1996, the network has been involved with the Olympic Games as a way to provide a reliable volunteer base to the Games and visibility for the Christian community at large-scale sporting events (Kaye, 2010). As such, participating groups and organizations had – and used – a strong base of networks through which to raise concerns and interest around the issue of sex trafficking and the sex trade.

These alliances helped to increase the visibility of the claim that prostitution needed to be abolished in order to address sex trafficking. Speakers who took part in anti-trafficking campaigns encouraged a diversity of people to do something about the

³⁴ Inclusion of these organizations as consultants on sex trafficking showed government recognition of their legitimacy – an important stage that indicates one's social problem as officially accepted (Spector and Kitsuse, 1987; Weitzer, 2007). However, given that these consultations took place in 2008 – prior to the Olympics – this recognition is clearly not due to the claims-making activities related to the Olympics. At least some of the claims-makers who took part in the process of constructing sex trafficking as a social problem in the context of the Olympics had established themselves as 'stakeholders' well before the Games.

issue. Some of the individuals and organizations involved had political and social capital – resources which they presumably could mobilize to affect change. However, it is likely that not all had direct experiences with sex trafficking or the sex trade. One of the most visible of anti-trafficking initiatives, The Salvation Army's the *Truth Isn't Sexy* campaign, attracted strong criticism from sex worker advocacy groups, as well as from a local law enforcement agency for portraying "all sex trade workers as human trafficking victims who didn't enter the sex trade by choice" (CTV, 2009, para. 6). Concerns were raised in local media that the campaign was causing hysteria (CTV, 2009; CBC News, 2009). Vancouver Police Department Inspector John de Haas pointed to the graphic nature of images used in the campaign, questioning what else, aside from an emotional reaction, they were meant to achieve (CBC, News, 2009).

4.3. Conclusion

In this chapter I examined how sex trafficking was constructed as a social problem in relation to the 2010 Winter Olympics. I argued that under the concerns about sex trafficking a single ideological position on prostitution was put forth – one which claimed the sex trade to be inherently harmful and based primarily in gender inequality. The public forum presenters called for sex trafficking to be addressed through the abolition of prostitution and adoption of the Nordic legal model in Canada. In the claims presented as part of these events the other main perspective on prostitution was critiqued. Specifically, presenters challenged those who call for prostitution to be recognized as 'sex work' and decriminalized. Alliances that formed around the sex trafficking discourse helped to strengthen the public and political voice of those who asked that claims about sex trafficking be acknowledged and addressed as presented.

The next chapter examines the impact of Vancouver's hosting of the Olympic Games on issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade. As a continuation of the discussion presented in this chapter, Chapter 5 considers the impact of the discussions about sex trafficking and the Olympics on issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade.

5. Sex trafficking and the 2010 Winter Olympics: Looking at the impact

Raising concerns about sex trafficking in relation to a large-scale sporting event like the 2010 Olympics asks – even if implicitly – that the impact of the event be examined. This chapter looks at the impact of Vancouver's hosting of the 2010 Games on issues related to sex trafficking by focusing on two main points. First, I argue that constructing sex trafficking as a social problem helped to mobilize organizations around this issue, shifting and shaping the ways in which sex trafficking and the sex trade are understood and addressed. Second, I suggest that using sex trafficking discourse to emphasize concerns about the sex trade asked that the women at the centre of these concerns be first defined as victims, and highlighted the need to protect them. This understanding leaves little room for recognition of the diversity of women's experiences, including in the sex trade. The chapter raises concerns about the long-term impact this might have on the ability of other voices and experiences to be considered in discussions and decisions related to services, laws and policies around prostitution and sex trafficking. The discussion in this chapter is based on key themes coming out of ten interviews conducted with Metro Vancouver-based individuals and organizations that work around the issues of sex trafficking, migration and the sex trade.

5.1. What 'impact'? Looking beyond quantitative measures

[There's] a lot of speculation about what happens with sex work and trafficking and the Olympics, but not a lot of evidence.

("Community member")

The concern about the relationship between sex trafficking and large-scale sporting events is tied to claims that past events have led to increases in sex trafficking. Not everyone accepts these claims as valid, or, by extension, that sporting events necessarily lead to an increase in sex trafficking (GAATW, 2011). Conversations about

sex trafficking and large-scale sporting events are reflective of the larger context of trafficking research. As mentioned in Chapter 2, efforts to measure trafficking coexist with the recognition that no reliable measures or quantitative data on trafficking exist (Doezema, 2010; Savona & Stefanizzi, 2007). The issues with measuring trafficking that are commonly discussed in the literature – like problems with obtaining accurate measures, and issues with agreeing on the definition of trafficking (Aromaa, 2007; Doezema, 2010) – were brought up in this study and discussed by research respondents.

There are several reasons why relying solely on quantitative measures to assess the impact of the Olympics on sex trafficking would have been problematic for this project. This approach would also not have been the most appropriate way of addressing the claims made as part of the process of constructing sex trafficking as a social problem. First, several respondents stated they had not directly monitored trafficking in terms of 'numbers' during the Games.³⁵ For these respondents and their organizations, monitoring trafficking quantitatively was neither the focus nor the priority. Respondents spoke about the challenges that measuring trafficking presents, they questioned the legitimacy of some of the existing estimates of sex trafficking cases, and they challenged the understanding of sex trafficking that prioritizes its quantification. Some of the respondents spoke about issues with measuring trafficking as follows:

We never look at numbers... But even getting... real numbers... I mean, you've seen some of the trafficking number estimates, like 'oh, there's one so there must be 8000 of them'... Again, it's a criminalized population, how do you know... And the more criminalized it is, the more it gets driven underground. (Kerry Porth, PACE)

³⁵ Respondents who did report having formally examined sex trafficking are Annalee Lepp and Shauna Paull, who conducted research that looks at trafficking and the 2010 Olympic Games (see also discussion in Lepp, 2010). Further, the RCMP reported that they had monitored the online advertisements for sexual services on the website Craigslist. Michelle Miller of REED spoke about having monitored online and newspaper advertisements and wishing they had done deeper analysis with the information they had gathered.

Well [it's] not really one of our roles... to monitor. And it's... extremely difficult to monitor something when you can't really put a number to it initially, so how to monitor a clandestine crime like this is the challenge across the world. (OCTIP Staff)

I always knew from the moment the Olympics and trafficking question was raised, that it would be impossible to quantify a number. And yet, that is the fixation of the media, researchers – everyone wants a number. ("Researcher")

For these individuals sex trafficking was certainly an issue they were aware of, and one they followed in the media and in their work. However, it did not appear that engaging with this issue meant being able to first quantify it.

In one case where data were available, findings appeared to be conflicting.³⁶ Two respondents spoke about having monitored sex trafficking by following online advertisements for sexual services posted on the website Craigslist – one said there was an increase in the online postings, while the other found no such increase. Even without the discrepancies it would have been hard to know how these two initiatives each understood the relationship between advertising sexual services and to sex trafficking. In other words, even when measures of sex trafficking do exist, it is sometimes difficult to understand what the data refer to (Doezema, 2010). The discrepancy that may exist among research findings could be based on different methods of sampling, data collection and analysis, or different definitions of sex trafficking and the sex trade.

Some researchers have called for more uniform definitions of trafficking in order to make data comparison easier and more effective (Aromaa, 2007). However, the ways in which a definition is interpreted may also vary among individuals and organizations, including researchers. Calls for adopting a single definition should also be considered within the context of community work on sex trafficking. A need for a clear definition of a given concept to be used in research may conflict with an understanding, as several respondents pointed out, that “in community work the... legal definition doesn't matter”

³⁶ Conflicting findings were also reported by organizations through media. See for example Kloer (2010).

(Shauna Paull, personal communication, 2011).³⁷ Different actors involved in any given research project are likely to have different ideological positions and priorities when it comes to how they approach sex trafficking. These interests are likely to continue making it more difficult to establish a 'more uniform' trafficking definition.

How a subject is understood may also be influenced by the available funding, media, and other attention given to it. This focus can affect what knowledge is produced about sex trafficking and the sex trade (Agustín, 2002). Existing concerns over sex trafficking created funding opportunities and other possibilities for individuals and organizations to address this issue prior to the Olympics. While this may have helped focus the attention specifically on sex trafficking, it was more difficult to raise awareness about related concerns which were not framed in the same way, and have them be recognized as important. As Esther Shannon explained:

While we said we didn't believe there was going to be any trafficking, we still said that certain things could be done and should be done. [The media] couldn't make that leap. It was really astonishing to me how the constant question, no matter who was talking to them, and I was interviewed a couple times, was "Well you said there was no trafficking so why [have] you got these recommendations?"... It was just... staggeringly clear that they don't get... what goes on for sex workers.

While the availability of funding may create opportunities for organizations when their priorities align with those of funders, funders' research interests can also overshadow other issues which may arise from the community as more pressing.

A focus on measuring trafficking needs to be reconsidered by recognizing that anti-trafficking campaigns organized prior to the 2010 Olympics did not necessarily claim

³⁷ A similar point was also made in interviews by Michelle Miller from REED, as well as by Angela Contreras-Chavez from SWAN in response to my asking what definition of trafficking they use. That same question did not seem to be the best way of learning how a definition is interpreted or applied in practice. For example, while two respondents may state that they both use the Criminal Code or the UN Palermo Protocol definitions of trafficking, their work around this issue can sometimes reveal different understandings of what those definitions mean and how they are applied in practice.

there would be an increase in sex trafficking. This was emphasized in public discussions organized as part of the *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* campaign, during which presenters critiqued the 'obsession with numbers'. The public forums instead highlighted the need to maintain a focus on trafficking victims and on targeting the demand for commercial sex. One respondent explained this subsequently in the interview:

The very positive thing that I think the anti-trafficking movement, if we can call it that, or loose coalition of groups who work on this issue nationally and here in BC, they were all extremely careful not to give a number. And that was learning the hard way from seeing what happened in Germany, where this figure of 40,000 victims would pop up... And it's really why in the end you saw the sort of Citizens Summit group emerge with the theme "one is too many". And that was a very focused, deliberate decision that was made to try to get away from a debate about numbers to focus on people and the impact on their human rights and dignity of being exploited in sex, commercial sex. ("Researcher")

Moving the attention away from quantifying trafficking served to make any subsequent discussion about 'numbers' in response to these concerns less relevant.

Lastly, sex trafficking continued to be raised as a problem regardless of whether the Olympics led to an increase in this issue. Many of the respondents described the time during the Olympics, one way or another, as 'quiet'. They similarly mentioned that they did not hear about sex trafficking cases from their networks and their work partners. To date there has yet to be an official report saying that there was an increase in sex trafficking in relation to the Olympics.³⁸ Still, as will be shown in the concluding chapter of this thesis, concerns about sex trafficking continued to be raised after the Games.

A focus placed solely on obtaining quantitative measures might miss the opportunity to look at sex trafficking through some of the perspectives and issues raised by the research participants. Wanting to show what 'really' happened with respect to sex

³⁸ There were several other projects that were conducted that examine the issue of sex trafficking in relation to the 2010 Olympics, e.g. Deering, Chettiar, Chan, Taylor, Montaner & Shannon, 2012; Finkel & Matheson, 2013; GAATW, 2011; Lepp, 2013. Not all of these focus on measuring sex trafficking.

trafficking can fail to consider how that reality comes to be constructed and whose interpretations are accepted as valid (Doezema, 2010). The rest of this chapter emphasizes the importance of paying attention to the consequences of the processes through which a social problem becomes constructed, over the importance of examining the problem itself. I look at the impact that Vancouver's hosting of the Olympics had on sex trafficking, when examined from the positions of individuals who took part in this project. The discussion in the following section draws from the interview data collected as part of this study.

5.2. Mobilization of organizations around sex trafficking

Regardless of whether or not Vancouver's hosting of the 2010 Olympic Games actually led to an increase in sex trafficking, the attention raised around the issue itself seemed to have an impact on organizations and individuals whose work relates to sex trafficking and the sex trade. Connections made between sex trafficking and prostitution through the claims-making activities brought concerns about sex trafficking into discussions and work related to the sex trade. Increasing awareness about sex trafficking asked organizations to consider that cases of sex trafficking might exist in any situation where sex is being sold. This raised the question of how to address such cases in response.

This section argues that the increased attention being paid to sex trafficking as it was being raised as a social problem mobilized organizations around this issue. How this happened is examined through three main points. First, I suggest that the heightened profile of sex trafficking led organizations to participate in creating knowledge about this issue, including those that did not necessarily have concerns about it prior to the Olympics. Second, the increasing focus on this issue led to organizations needing to start addressing sex trafficking in their work. They did so in part by engaging with the sex trafficking discourse, or the common understanding of how this problem should be dealt with. The prevalent understanding sees sex trafficking as a growing international problem that calls for building of partnerships and requires the knowledge of experts. The last part of this section argues that attention around sex trafficking highlights the need to more closely look at the changing notions of 'experts' and 'expertise'.

5.2.1. Educating about sex trafficking

Discussions about sex trafficking and the 2010 Olympics helped to bring sex trafficking as a social problem to public attention. In our phone interview, Michelle Miller of REED spoke about the success she felt that her organization's campaign, *Buying Sex is Not a Sport*, had in getting people to think about men's entitlement to buying sex, and the role the campaign played in starting discussions around related issues. She said that while public activities organized as part of the campaign received some negative responses, they also garnered a lot of support and were welcomed by many. Some people commented that the campaign was bringing up issues that others were not raising.

Concerns that were publicly raised about sex trafficking led to requests for more information about the issue. Miller pointed out that the *Buying Sex Is Not a Sport* campaign attracted a lot of interest, including invitations for presentations from communities wanting more information about trafficking. Miller's organization was not the only one to receive requests for additional information about this issue. In interviews, the staff of the Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons (OCTIP) and the RCMP explained:

We certainly got a lot of requests for presentations in the lead up to the Olympics... We were very popular; we were very called upon to provide information about our office. (Staff, OCTIP)

[We] met with our partners and... we decided to really ramp up our education in regard to our front-line officers who would be dealing with the crowds every day and, you know, even the public; and Crime Stoppers is involved with us and they have a human trafficking campaign as well. (E Division Human Trafficking Awareness Coordinator, RCMP)

Education about trafficking was provided to various audiences, which included victim services workers, non-governmental organizations, law enforcement agents, schools and the general public.

As the awareness about sex trafficking increased among the general public, discussions about the issue started to include other organizations as well. A couple of organizations spoke about the effects of the public wanting to know more about sex trafficking and about getting involved in doing something about it:

It's mostly public education that's had a big impact. Because what started to happen was people started to ask me questions about trafficking...
(Kerry Porth, PACE)

In other cases, individuals and organizations got involved in related discussions as a way of initiating conversations with individuals and groups whose perspectives they disagreed with. Best argues that counter-claims are commonly used as a way for groups to confront the original claims in struggles over how a social problem will come to be understood. Counter-claims tend to reflect another way of understanding the issue and come from a different ideological position than the original assertions (Best, 2013). In the context of the Olympics, additional initiatives that were undertaken included organizing public forums in order to present and make visible other ideological perspectives on the issue of sex trafficking and the sex trade:

... I was involved in work [where we were trying to] get people to present evidence-based information around trafficking... and to argue against conflating prostitution and trafficking, so what that meant was that FIRST did a public forum on sex work and trafficking and... we met with the Salvation Army to try and get them to understand sex worker concerns...
(Esther Shannon)

As a result, even those who did not necessarily accept the claims that were being raised as concerns prior to the Olympics engaged in one way or another with discussions about sex trafficking, or the activities associated with constructing it as a social problem. In many cases this also meant that they themselves contributed to creating further knowledge about the issue.

5.2.2. Addressing trafficking in one's work

Awareness of sex trafficking expressed among the general public should be considered when examining the effectiveness of the anti-trafficking initiatives. Even organizations which did not necessarily have specific concerns about the Olympics were being asked to speak to how they were addressing the issue in their work. For example, in our interview, the OCTIP staff emphasized that their information sessions about trafficking were not specifically tied to the Olympics. The office started holding these events in 2007, and continued with the activities after the Games (OCTIP, personal communication, 2011). One of OCTIP's public presentations was held at an auditorium

in Downtown Vancouver's St. Paul's Hospital in January 2010. The audience consisted of about 50 people, many of whom appeared to be health care workers. The presentation included information about human trafficking meant to help recognize and assist potential victims. As health care providers, audience members were said to be in a unique position to intervene in trafficking cases where potential victims could be accessing health services. Since the session covered a lot of the basics about human trafficking, it was presumably meant as a way of introducing the issue, as well as providing information about the OCTIP office. Although the Olympic Games were not intended to be the focus of the session, they were still raised as an issue among those present in the room when an audience member asked about the Games during the question-and-answer period.

Increased awareness among the general public about sex trafficking led to people inquiring about what was being done about the issue and how they could help:

[In] those particular presentations leading up to the Olympics, the question from people [was] "Are you expecting an increase?" That was one question. The other question was, "How are you going to deal with the enormous amount of trafficked people during the Olympics?"
(Staff, OCTIP)

... I know that one way... all this... debate about sex work, human trafficking and the Olympics, one way that this all helped us was that we became more... visible to people who wanted to do something about it, who wanted to intervene or learn more about it. So we benefited by having offers from skillful volunteers, [who] wanted to offer their services to the women. (Angela Contreras-Chavez, SWAN)

While some organizations were raising awareness about sex trafficking, others had not placed much focus on this issue in their work. This meant that they had to educate themselves before responding to public inquiries about what they were doing to address the issue in their work. The emphasis placed on 'something to be done' about sex trafficking as a social problem translated to organizations having to respond to claims about this issue through their work. Not all respondents reported having had concerns about sex trafficking prior to the Olympics. However, related discussions impacted every participant's work in some way.

The increased attention placed on sex trafficking seemed to raise the concern that this issue could be present in any situation where sex is being sold. It follows that

any woman in the sex trade could be a potential victim of sex trafficking. As Aboriginal and other racialized and/or non-Western women are often at the centre of the sex trafficking discourse and worries about sex trafficking, this concern seemed to focus particularly on them. In addition, the anticipation surrounding the Olympic Games brought with it a lot of uncertainty over the impact that a sporting event of this scale would have on the city.³⁹ All of the research participants spoke about having had some concerns prior to the Olympics, even if they were unrelated to sex trafficking. Given this uncertainty, individuals and organizations prepared for the possibility that sex trafficking could be a problem even when they did not necessarily have specific concerns about it. One respondent expressed the need to address sex trafficking, and spoke about it in terms of 'responsibility':

[It's] sort of based on this idea that even if there is not a substantial increase, that there is an opportunity and a need to provide protection to these people... That there is an obligation if you're going to host a party like this, that you ensure that those who are the most vulnerable to potentially be exploited by this, that you provide assistance to them. ("Researcher")

For individuals and organizations in the city, looking to address sex trafficking in preparation for the Olympics involved educational and monitoring activities which brought concerns about this issue into their work:

I wasn't really expecting there to be trafficking... I just thought in case there is let's make sure that the agencies are known, and that there's a way of... responding. ("Community member")

... we've certainly talked to our members and within the context of other workshops about the identification of a trafficking victim and that we'd like to hear about it if they think that that's going on. (Kerry Porth, PACE)

³⁹ This was not unique to issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade. Similar concerns about what would happen because of the Olympics were expressed by different individuals, groups, organizations and communities prior to the Games around various other issues (CBC, 2010). These included concerns over the impact of the Games on the availability of affordable housing, the city's homeless population, the environment, and citizen rights due to the expected increase in security and police surveillance.

[We've] also had some dealings with a group of experiential women and men who we've... provided information to about our office and they were looking at the issue, specific issue in the run-up to the Olympics about some of... the issues that might arise. (Staff, OCTIP)

These activities included knowledge and other resource exchanges between various partnered individuals and organizations. For some organizations, including those working around issues related to the sex trade, this meant approaching others for information and assistance in how to deal with sex trafficking.

5.2.3. *Forming alliances and looking to experts*

All the respondents spoke about the importance of building alliances in their work. These alliances can serve as important and necessary ways of addressing the lack of resources – such as access to knowledge and available staff – that may otherwise be a barrier to the organizations' work. As individuals and organizations turn to others in response to claims about sex trafficking, the ways of exchanging and adopting knowledge raise questions about the emerging and changing notions of 'expertise'.

Respondents spoke about contacting others for information and additional resources. As discussed in Chapter 4, alliances played a significant role in allowing organizations to more widely disseminate concerns about sex trafficking in the context of the Olympics. Alliances also played an important role for other organizations wanting to develop ways of addressing sex trafficking in their work. For example, collaborations with community organizations allowed the OCTIP and the RCMP to rely on their partners for services they themselves do not have the capacity to provide. Members of the OCTIP staff described this 'coordination of services' approach as follows:

[We] wanted to... engage community agencies, provincial government and federal government partners in working with us, together, so that we could call on them if we had a trafficked person that needed services. So it wasn't only to find out what was going on but to actually develop a relationship with them, so that we could – and we do – call on them, and we specifically wanted them to agree to work with the trafficked person because not everybody has the capacity and is willing to... but we've had a very good, I would say, relationship for probably 4 or 5 years now, with some of the service providers and others where we're bringing into the model, our service model...

Similarly, the RCMP representative pointed out:

So when somebody is identified to us as a victim of human trafficking, I relate to them in regard to the enforcement portion of human trafficking. But if I feel that they have other needs which I can't address, such as psychological, or religious, you know, whatever the case may be... If they need housing, a safe place to stay, et cetera, I will reach out to our government [and] non-government organizations, and try and arrange something for the victim.

Some respondents mentioned that their organizations would turn, and have turned, to an office such as the OCTIP when they come in contact with a potential case of sex trafficking. These organizations spoke about different reasons for doing so, including their felt lack of knowledge or expertise on this issue, and a lack of resources to provide adequate assistance to victims of trafficking. SWAN, for example, also turned to OCTIP to help their organization learn about sex trafficking. Kerry Porth at PACE stated that "if we did identify a victim of trafficking we would likely call another agency. We simply don't have the expertise, and quite frankly there's only 3 of us who work here, with a membership of over 150".

Taking a collaborative approach is also encouraged by the UN Palermo Protocol that calls for human trafficking to be addressed through cooperation. However, this requires the existence of centralized bodies that have the capacity and resources to properly address trafficking, and to bring information about trafficking cases together in a way that can subsequently inform related practices. To some, this coordinated approach is a necessary precondition for effectively dealing with trafficking. A respondent pointed out:

You can't measure cases unless you're actively investigating them, unless you have an active criminal intelligence program in place [...] and unless you have a network of informants that would tell you about when and where people are moving victims and who the traffickers are. ("Researcher")

This approach to addressing sex trafficking gives bodies that have the capacity for such coordination an opportunity to emerge into leadership roles. For example, it can help to position governmental agencies such as the OCTIP and the RCMP as the 'go-to' bodies for coordination of knowledge about trafficking – about what it is and how it should be

dealt with. These agencies can play an important role in centrally collecting information about sex trafficking cases that their partners come into contact with, as well as in disseminating information to their partners about how trafficking should be dealt with.

Given that there are different ideological positions that underlie ways of understanding sex trafficking, it is important to consider how these differences are accounted for when knowledge about sex trafficking becomes centralized. In other words, how is 'expertise' on sex trafficking created among divergent viewpoints? Seeking advice from 'outside experts' on sex trafficking can take place alongside a strong emphasis among some organizations on having experiential knowledge provide the expertise and inform how they understand and address sex trade issues. As Angela Contreras-Chavez at SWAN explained:

... the idea of SWAN came out of [...] group of women..., all of them immigrants from Asia, [who] decided that this was something important for them. And some of these women are, or were, experiential, which means that they had themselves been sex workers or involved in the sex industry. And... we rely on their expertise, and their knowledge, and experiences to inform our way of doing our outreach services.

Concerns about a lack of knowledge and resources can make it necessary for organizations to turn to others for help when facing potential cases of sex trafficking. At the same time, a common assumption seems to be that sex trafficking is too overwhelming a problem to be dealt with by 'non-experts':

You and I don't have the access to these types of places, we can't safely or ethically, you know, go and start probing in places where sex is being sold to find out who is a child, who is a foreigner under duress, who is a Canadian woman who is in there under duress – it's not possible to do that without... the authority, legal authority..., and the training, and the backup, and so that's why it's really coming on the police to do that kind of work. ("Researcher")

The uncertainty that concerns related to sex trafficking raise, particularly when they emphasize the extent and severity of the problem, seems to encourage organizations to rely on 'outside experts' for assistance when dealing with potential cases.

The notions of 'expertise' and 'authority' implicit in discussions around sex trafficking need to be looked at more closely. For example, various communities

including sex workers' rights and Aboriginal women activists - have for a long time been facing and raising concerns about violence and sexual exploitation experienced both within and outside the sex trade. In some, but not all, cases, these have been described as situations of 'trafficking'. However, much of the work and the knowledge gained from these experiences started prior to the emergence of current concerns about sex trafficking. Earlier understandings of this problem seemed to be informed by experiences and ideological positions different from those that currently shape the sex trafficking discourse. As a couple of respondents explained:

[Everyone] from the group came from a different location from within BC... [from different] communities that were working on sex work issues, and so they all had some experience with trafficking victims or had been trafficked, according to the definition. And many of us also had been part of pretty much removing individuals who wanted to leave situations... where they were trafficked, and being held against their will... in our neighbourhoods, in our communities. ... I think we were maybe the first to even talk about domestic trafficking... because... it wasn't on people's radar. ("Community member")

[We] have done some crisis intervention in the past, with people who are classified as trafficked and... we've done some direct services, but generally what we do is ensure, for example, that the person has legal representation, housing, those kinds of things... Some of that work has now been taken... up by... a more central office, like the OCTIP office in Victoria... and much of our crisis intervention sort of pre-dated the more... established institutions that have been... established in the last couple years. (Dr. Annalee Lepp, GAATW Canada)

Failing to recognize knowledge coming out of communities with members who have personally experienced and dealt with situations that are problematized in the sex trafficking discourse ignores the individual and collective expertise that already exists. It also risks needlessly repeating the work that has already been done, and in some cases continues to be performed at the community-level without adequate support (Hunt, 2010).

Perhaps most importantly, knowledge and expertise coming from first-hand experiences can point to issues that are important to address – issues that others may fail to acknowledge. For example, a study that asked sex workers in the British Columbia and Yukon to apply the concept of 'trafficking' to their own lives pointed to the need to also examine the role that larger structural and societal factors play in this issue. When

asked about the factors that contribute to their being forcibly moved to a new area, respondents noted several concerns. They not only spoke about individuals who traffic them, but also identified poverty, law enforcement, government interests, as well as "social rejection and the lack of places where street level sex work can take place" (Bowen, 2006, p. 36). Sarah Hunt's work raises similar points when looking at the violence experienced by Aboriginal communities in British Columbia and across Canada, particularly that faced by women as well as by girls. Hunt cautions against conflating sex trafficking and sexual exploitation, and emphasizes that these issues need to be recognized and examined within their larger context. Rather than being treated as a 'new' problem, they need to be traced "back to the roots of colonial violence and structural inequality" perpetrated against Aboriginal peoples (Hunt, 2008, p. 1). While within Canadian Aboriginal communities there are different views of prostitution and of how it should be dealt with in law (see discussion in Hunt, 2013), various members of these communities have similarly called for the need to address violence – within and outside of the sex trade – in their historical contexts and various systems of inequality and oppression. These include residential schools, foster homes and churches, as well as systems of justice and the government itself (Smiley, 2011; see also Hunt, 2008, 2010, 2011; Yee, 2009; Kingsley & Mark, 2001; AWAN, 2011). When sex trafficking is understood as a dangerous issue linked to organized crime, it is difficult to recognize or imagine that some of the responses to related concerns have already been – and continue to be – undertaken at the community level, or that this is how these concerns should be addressed.

As individuals and organizations come together and turn to others for assistance in addressing sex trafficking, their individual ways of understanding and addressing issues may clash with others'. It can become a "fine dance" for an organization to assess and negotiate the potential harms of others' ideological positions and priorities with their clients' need for resources (Angela Contreras-Chavez, SWAN, personal communication, 2011). This is how one research participant spoke about negotiating alliances across existing differences:

... [My] experience is, there have been days when I would pick up and call someone who doesn't agree with me about these issues if I thought that she might have room in her transition house, and to her credit, she did her best to try and find room. So when push came to

shove I just called anybody, personally, that's what I did... some people don't have the ability to walk into what might be a conflict for the sake of someone else.... [Somebody] else might just feel that they might not be safe there, and that's a real consideration.

(Shauna Paull)

For some individuals and organizations, looking to form alliances with others has to be balanced with ensuring that those who are accessing services are properly respected in the process. When it comes to addressing sex trafficking, this can include making sure that their potential partners' ideological positions on the sex trade are compatible with their organization's perspectives. For some individuals and organizations ensuring that the expertise gained through experiential knowledge in the sex trade continues to be recognized is an important priority.

The need to consider issues that may come up in the process of forming partnerships may be particularly important given the present-day context of declining funding opportunities. Concerns over the uncertainty and the lack of available funding were expressed by several participants in this research, who spoke about the ways in which these obstacles limit their work and make it more challenging. Andrea Smith emphasizes that decreasing access to resources calls for the crucial need for 'rearticulation' of alliances, or consideration of new potential allies, which can be used to accomplish political or other goals (Smith, 2008).

One research participant spoke about the increasing importance of the role that faith-based groups play in providing services in the context of decreasing government funding:

And it's, again, an outcropping of the fact that there has been so much dismantling on the part of government for NGO supports, and inadequate resources for state-supported secular human rights organizing, and organizations and service provisions. Even the immigrant, you know, even the settlement services are getting large cuts... if we can say that there is a predominance of certain kinds of thinking in the enforcement community, certainly we can say that about faith-based groups.... Where it gets tricky, though, is where that paradigm comes with blinders and limited life experience. And there is no question for me that those groups are desiring dignity for those women, but if you can't talk about sex in your church... where could she possibly find her way with you?

... the only people left with resources to do this work are faith-based groups that rely on volunteers. We need to have people who are

trained in trauma, and who know how to actually respect the rights of people to find their way doing that work. (Shauna Paull)

The increasing presence of religious organizations in social justice, political and other activist work points to a need to better understand the nature of their involvement (Smith, 2008). Certainly, the extent to which the Christian communities took up the concern about sex trafficking, as discussed in Chapter 4, highlights the importance of further examining the role that they play in claims-making activities related to sex trafficking.

It needs to be recognized that the coming together of individuals and groups can be used for purposes of progressive political action, or it can lead to the introduction of new, oppressive power relations (Smith, 2008). Rather than assuming that some collaborations are automatically constructive and others problematic based on the underlying ideological positions of their partners, it is important to recognize that relationships with others are always being assessed and negotiated by partnering individuals and organizations in order to ensure that they remain relevant and beneficial. For one research participant, the assessment of potential alliances means ensuring that partners are respectful and that they do not cause harm to individuals to whom they are supposed to be providing services:

[One] challenge that we [have experienced] since the beginning is that there are very few services for sex workers, for ESL [English-as-a-second-language] sex workers. And... there is the issue of shame and stigma. We have been able to provide support for women and then refer them to... agencies where the women will tell us they don't want to go there, because they know that from the moment they become a public victim, everybody will know about them. So it's difficult to bring them out and get help outside their workplaces.

(Angela Contreras-Chavez, SWAN)

These negotiations of partnerships were also evident in several respondents' discussions about their work with the OCTIP. While some talked about turning to the office for assistance, others reported that they instead preferred to contact other partners who they felt provided them with similar connections. To some, the OCTIP was seen as playing a very important and unique role in addressing trafficking, while others wondered about the usefulness of the office. An organization such as the OCTIP, which serves as kind of a hub between different organizations, seems to be presented with the task of negotiating between various ideological positions, state and NGO interests, all the while

having to maintain, and arguably prove, its relevance among its partners, particularly different community-level organizations.⁴⁰

Heightened awareness about sex trafficking prior to the Olympics encouraged organizations – including those working around issues related to the sex trade – to join an increasingly centralized sphere of related concern and action. This was in part done through the formation of partnerships, as well as an increasing reliance on 'formal expertise' on sex trafficking. Rather than evaluating these changing connections as either 'good' or 'bad', progressive or conservative, it is more useful to recognize these relationships as complex, dynamic and ever-changing. Relationships formed between different social actors – who may hold very different ideological positions from one another – can be opportunities for challenging existing power structures and dynamics, as well as potential sites of oppression (Hill Collins, 2000; Smith, 2008). If alliances formed around the sex trafficking discourse – which includes a specific understanding of the issue and the solutions – are thought of as being similarly dynamic, then we are better positioned to assess their aims, and their potential and actual consequences. In the following section I argue that putting forth concerns by relying on the sex trafficking discourse could in itself lead to very specific, intended and unintended, outcomes.

5.3. Protection of women, prevention of trafficking

[The] assumption is that a trafficked person is someone who can't think for themselves, they have no capacity for decision-making, and

⁴⁰ One of the research respondents brought up a similar point about the OCTIP. The complexity of the OCTIP's role around trafficking issues was also suggested by the fact that other interview respondents expressed both praise and hesitancy towards the office. The fact that the OCTIP is consulted by individuals and organizations that take various positions on issues related to trafficking and the sex trade separates it from many, if not most, other organizations in the city. In relation to this research, the OCTIP staff seemed knowledgeable, as well as forthcoming in sharing information about different local and other activities around sex trafficking. It is beyond the scope of this research to examine to what extent this diversity of knowledge informs the OCTIP's work. Significant funding cuts that the Office experienced in 2011 should also raise concerns about the OCTIP's future ability to consider these issues and consult with a variety of perspectives.

that is taken away from them, you know, there is this assumption that they have no... capacity, because they are pure victims.

(Dr. Annalee Lepp, GAATW Canada)

The fact that some organizations highlighted concerns about the sex trade under the problem of 'sex trafficking' could in itself have consequences. Relying on the sex trafficking discourse to address violence experienced by women in the sex trade – particularly Aboriginal women, as well as other racialized and/or non-Western women – requires seeing women as primarily victims that need protecting. In the context of the Olympics, a single ideological perspective on the sex trade gained recognition through the claims-making activities focused on constructing sex trafficking as a social problem. The attention that this position attracted raises questions about the ability of other voices and experiences in the sex trade to make themselves heard, and to be considered in public and political discussions and decision-making.

5.3.1. *Women as victims*

Showing women to be victims of sexual, physical and psychological harm is emphasized in the sex trafficking discourse. Emphasis placed on the experienced harm is important to claims-making activities around sex trafficking because it helps to illustrate the argument that sex trafficking is a serious social problem that needs to be addressed (Weitzer, 2007). Jo Doezema, building on the work by Wendy Brown, reminds us why viewing women as victims is problematic:

... identity based on injury cannot let go of that injury without ceasing to exist. This paradox results in a politics that seeks protection from the state, rather than power and freedom for itself. In seeking protection from the same structures that cause injury, this politics risks reaffirming, rather than subverting, structures of domination, and risks reinscribing injured identity in law and policy through its demands for state protection against injury (Doezema, 2010, p. 133).

Relying on such a 'politics of injury' asks that women – specifically when they are involved in the sex trade – be defined first and foremost as victims, and highlights a need to protect them (Doezema, 2010).

When concerns about women's vulnerability are emphasized publicly and politically, they can have immediate as well as long-term repercussions. Several

respondents spoke about some of the consequences of focusing on women's vulnerability and experiences of violence in discussions about sex trafficking. Michelle Miller of REED, for example, mentioned that in response to their presentations male audience members sometimes expressed an interest in getting involved in anti-trafficking work by 'rescuing' women from brothels. She mentioned that her work discourages men from taking on this 'rescue mentality', describing it as unhelpful. Kerry Porth of PACE raised another issue by explaining:

[When] you continue to talk about... women and children, when you lump them together like that, you infantilize adult women. But when you continue to talk about them in terms of victimology, and having something wrong with them... and [that] they're vulnerable... you're speaking directly to predators. And they've heard that message loud and clear.

Claims that emphasize women's vulnerability and lack of power can contribute to the assumption that women are helpless and powerless, particularly in the face of violence. It can also obscure ways in which individuals exercise agency and power in their own lives. When concerns about sex trafficking focus on women who are racialized and/or non-Western, their identities are constructed primarily through assumptions and concerns about victimization.

Seeing women as victims who need to be protected makes it difficult to recognize the same women in leadership roles, and as experts and key decision-makers. This includes the roles they play in fostering understanding and informing responses around issues related to prostitution and sex trafficking. This expertise, especially among individuals who have had personal experiences in the sex trade, is already recognized and honored by organizations and communities, including in cases where those with experiential knowledge take on the role of community organizers and leaders (Doezema, 2010).

A focus placed on claiming women to be victims, particularly women who are racialized and/or non-Western, is also susceptible to being co-opted by organizations and groups with conservative political aims. Observing some of the collaborations that form around sex trafficking, many have raised worries about the 'strange bedfellows' – alliances made up of feminists, Christian faith-based groups, law enforcement agencies,

and conservative governments that come together over shared concerns about sex trafficking (O'Connell Davidson, 2003; Sayeed, 2006; Weitzer, 2007; Bernstein, 2010; Zimmerman, 2010, 2011). Certainly, within the collaborations that took place in anti-trafficking campaigns prior to the 2010 Olympics, faith-based groups featured prominently. Approaches taken in some anti-trafficking initiatives, such as the above-mentioned Salvation Army's campaign, were criticized for the strong underlying ideological position they took against the sex trade. Several of my respondents raised concerns about the claims-making activities such as those by the Salvation Army, as well as about the potential impact of collaborations that formed around the issue of sex trafficking more generally.

While collaborations and alliances can offer important benefits to groups and individuals, their negative impact should also be considered. Andrea Smith points out that collaborations that form around the concerns about sex trafficking are problematic because they tend to reinscribe "colonial relationships with indigenous women, Third World women and women of color" (Smith, 2008, p. 164). Claims-making activities around sex trafficking organized in the context of the 2010 Olympics rested upon and advanced an image of women – particularly Aboriginal and other racialized and/or non-Western women – as vulnerable and lacking in agency (see also Lepp, 2010). As I show in the section below, this understanding of women leads to calls for very particular ways of addressing the problem that ask for protection, rather than freedom, from structures of domination. Interests represented in this approach taken to addressing sex trafficking do not necessarily reflect those of sex workers themselves (Doezema, 2010).

5.3.2. *Protecting women*

Relying on the notion of women as victims prioritizes the need for them to be protected, particularly by the state (Andrijasevic, 2003; O'Connell Davidson, 2003, 2006; Anderson and Andrijasevic, 2008; Doezema, 2010). Arguments made as part of the sex trafficking discourse tend to focus on the punishment and criminalization of traffickers and male sex buyers, while relying on increased state intervention to do so (O'Connell Davidson, 2003; Sharma, 2005). The emphasis on the individual perpetrators as being responsible for violence experienced by victims of sex trafficking has been criticized for obscuring the more political nature of sex trafficking as an issue (Sayeed, 2006).

When protection of those identified as trafficking victims includes implementation of legal measures, this can translate into further restrictions on freedoms and choices of individuals who sell sex, including their opportunities for migration. As Nandita Sharma points out, expressed concerns about sex trafficking can be used to "legitimize increasingly regressive state practices of immigration control" (Sharma, 2005, p. 89). Supporting such legal measures without considering the larger context of sex trafficking can fail to "address how states tie anti-trafficking laws to repressive anti-immigration laws that control the labor of Third World women who are not trafficked" (Smith, 2008, p. 163). Kerry Porth from PACE reflected on this issue as follows:

... this ultimately is going to go to a bad place. It's restricting women's autonomy... you don't have to like the choices that a woman makes but you have to respect them, and you have to respect her right to make those choices.

Defined as potential victims of sex trafficking, women can find themselves being subjected to increasing control in the name of protection. Defining a situation as one of 'trafficking' also makes it difficult to talk about any aspect of these situations in terms of 'choice'. O'Connell Davidson argues that the feminist abolitionist ideological position that associates trafficking with 'modern slavery' "has no opposite in the shape of freely chosen sex work" (O'Connell Davidson, 2006, p. 17). It is impossible for a 'victim of sex trafficking' to claim rights in the sex industry. As a victim, a person can only ask for protection – or rescue – from the industry itself (O'Connell Davidson, 2006). This makes it difficult, if not impossible, to consider whether there are certain aspects of these situations that women would prefer to change, rather than do away with altogether.

Research that looks at the experiences of migrant women, including those working in the sex trade and some who could be defined as having been trafficked, shows discrepancies between what women identify as important and what others think they need. Research has shown that women point to laws that restrict one's ability to migrate, and to enter and remain in destination countries with required documentation as posing some of their greatest challenges (Sharma, 2005; Andrijasevic, 2003; Sutdhibhasilp, 2002). Restrictions on their ability to migrate force women to turn to more dangerous options, making them more vulnerable to exploitation (Sutdhibhasilp, 2002). Discrepancies in how women's needs are understood by various parties become even

more complicated in situations where there are conflicting interests in how the problem is understood and what solutions are proposed for dealing with it. Angela Contreras-Chavez spoke about the way these issues come up in SWAN's work:

... we find that the... decision-makers, policy-makers, and... most of the... research, academia community are more interested about what to do with the issue of legalization of prostitution or what to do with... violence against women and... so immediate responses of how the law will take care of the situations, but in the more global arena or context what we are seeing without necessarily analyzing it, that systematically is that there are other things that need to be taken into consideration, like the global migrations, legal or illegal or documented or undocumented... how the immigration system in Canada... promotes that the only way for women, single women, single moms, or young women, or any women, racialized women or from global South countries, to come to Canada is... by... situations of human smuggling or human trafficking, and then... there is very little being done to prevent that from happening, to prevent women to being vulnerable to... abuse of power by others.

The concerns expressed over reliance on increasing legal measures for dealing with situations included under the 'trafficking' label should be noted when considering that in 2012 Canada passed an amendment to the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act as part of the omnibus crime bill, Bill C-10: Safe Streets and Communities Act. This amendment gives immigration officers the authority to “deny issuing work permits to applicants who are vulnerable to abuse and exploitation” (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 2011, para.1). Critics have argued that these changes, called upon as a way of dealing with issues of exploitation, will disproportionately target women and prevent them from entering Canada (Canadian Council for Refugees, Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, Metro Toronto Chinese and Southeast Asian Legal Clinic & Colour of Poverty Campaign, 2012).

Framing claims around sex trafficking around a single story of violence experienced by women in prostitution, and calling for protection of women from this violence, can lead to having this understanding define the experiences of all women who are perceived to be at risk of trafficking. This single story can overshadow all other experiences. It can also lead to responses that may not be appropriate to situations where other issues are identified as more pressing by individuals who may not see themselves as 'victims'.

5.3.3. *What about other stories?*

... I... always accepted and... not just accepted, really always endorsed the idea that, the feminist notion, principle, ethic... that women who are oppressed have the right to name their oppression and organize around their oppression, and that the responsibility of feminists in those dynamics, if they're not a member of that group, is to decide... whether they can be allies to that group.

(Esther Shannon)

Perhaps most importantly, the impact of Vancouver's hosting of the 2010 Olympics needs to be considered for the context it provided in which to ask that a single understanding of sex trafficking, and by extension of the sex trade, be accepted publicly and politically. Spector and Kitsuse remind us that when one group's definition of a social problem is adopted, it can force terms and related meanings associated with other groups' perspectives into obscurity (Spector and Kitsuse, 1987). What becomes accepted as 'the truth' about sex trafficking and the sex trade could affect public visibility of other perspectives on these issues. When claims that help establish sex trafficking as a social problem are strongly informed by a single perspective – the abolitionist ideological position on prostitution – it makes other voices on related topics, including migration and the sex trade, more difficult to hear. This includes experiences and situations where women are asking not to be treated primarily or solely as victims, where they are not asking for protection, or where they see their stories extending beyond their experiences of victimhood and violence (Brunovskis & Surtees, 2008). If discussions about sex trafficking centre around claims-making and countering those claims with 'opposite' arguments, perspectives which do not take either of these positions can also be left out of the conversations.

Differences in how sex trafficking is understood are often explained by pointing to the two prevalent ideological positions on prostitution – one that sees it as a question of choice, and one that understands it as inherently harmful. I had assumed this would also reflect in the research participants' perspectives. I expected that respondents' views on these issues would be clear and easy to identify and categorize.

Instead, throughout this research participants both directly and indirectly challenged and evaded my attempts to simplify their perspectives or to understand them primarily through a single side of the debate around prostitution and sex trafficking.

During interviews, different participants asked me for and offered clarification, and corrected the way I posed a question or interpreted something. This often created a space in the conversation, and subsequently in my understanding, which replaced existing rigid categories and simple explanations. It seemed to dissolve much of the need and ability to neatly compartmentalize a respondent's position on sex trafficking or the sex trade. While this made for some awkward and confusing moments in the interviews, the respondents' insistence on correcting points of discussion was crucial to shifting, in significant ways, my views of issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade which had been present at the start of this research.

Throughout the interviews sex trafficking and the sex trade emerged as complex issues. In some cases, these complexities were revealed when participants spoke about how they understand issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade in their work. For example, Kerry Porth of PACE addressed some of the attempts by others to simplify her organization's position on these issues as follows:

... PACE is sometimes being accused of being a pro-sex work organization and we don't actually take a position either for or against prostitution, because the circumstances for sex workers are so different, depending on their individual life history and their experiences. ... I believe that every person's choices are constrained, by their upbringing, their belief system, their experiences, and how they process those experiences. [For] someone to truly identify as a victim of trafficking, I think the victim has to identify as being trafficked. They have to identify as being a victim of exploitation, not having choice, being forced or held against their will. And I don't think it's up to anybody else to determine who is truly trafficked and who is not.

Complexities were also evident when respondents talked about cases that they might come across in their work. As the E Division Human Trafficking Awareness Coordinator from the RCMP explained when talking about suspected victims of sex trafficking:

You know, if she doesn't consider herself a victim of human trafficking and she's not willing to speak of that, how do you ever put charges together? Because it is such a clandestine offense, as we already

spoke. I can't see into somebody's bedroom, or their house, I don't know how the trafficker is treating her... [There still] can be [charges], certainly. But they wouldn't be human trafficking charges. They'd be procurement or living off avails of prostitution or running a bawdy house.⁴¹

The notion that there is a single way of understanding and addressing sex trafficking is challenged when it comes to dealing with potential and actual trafficking cases. The interviews demonstrate how situations of sex trafficking and the sex trade, as well as of the work around them, are a lot more complex than is often suggested.

Respondents who seemed to acknowledge and incorporate complexities within their understanding of the sex trade and in potential cases of sex trafficking spoke about the importance of placing the focus on a person's own experience of their situation and their needs. This was perhaps most directly addressed by respondents who talked about their experiences of providing direct services to individuals, including migrant women working in the sex trade. Dr. Annalee Lepp of GAATW Canada referred to this as taking a 'human rights centered approach':

[If] you take a human rights approach, or a human rights centred approach, the person that you're accountable [to] is the trafficked person... that is the person that you're ultimately accountable... to. You're not accountable to funders, you're not accountable to... the state, you're not accountable to... a particular ideological position, you're accountable to that person... and respect for that person, and... recognition for where that person is at...

This process seems to allow for relationships of trust to be built between the organization – or maybe more specifically, individual workers – and the persons to whom it provides services. These relationships help to create a space within which individual

⁴¹ These charges refer to Canada's prostitution law – sections 210, 212 and 213 of the Criminal Code. Section 210 of the Criminal Code prohibits keeping of a common bawdy house (Criminal Code, 1985a), section 212 prohibits procuring and living on avails of prostitution (Criminal Code, 2005b), and section 213 prohibits communicating for purposes of prostitution (Criminal Code, 1985b).

service recipients can speak about and ask for what they need. This was illustrated by SWAN's Angela Contreras-Chavez:

[There are] all these universal definitions and tools and... legal information and all of that, and... for us, what informs our understanding is what the women tell us about their needs and their own resources, so we rely on their own feedback or communications to tell us; perhaps yes they might be... trafficked, but they are not asking us... to call the police, to denounce the trafficker. They're asking for things like... it's about their immigration status, it's about finding another job, it's about [learning] English...

When this kind of a process is prioritized over relying on a single established understanding of the problem and the solutions, what people say they need may not always align with what others may assume they need. This approach seems to instead be a slow, committed and long-term process of being present, building trust and developing a relationship with the other party over time. This is what taking such an approach might look like when applied by an organization in their work:

[The] first years of SWAN, say from 2002-2005, most of the energies were dedicated to [finding] where the massage parlours were located and how many women work there, and what languages they speak, or spoke, and it helped a lot having women who knew the industry from inside out, so it helped having them around, because they could help us do the interpretation, language, they helped us [in] becoming more aware about when, where... what strategies we needed to develop to, to have access to these places without... negatively impacting the women. So it was those first years [that were] difficult for us in that many of the outreach volunteers experienced aggressive responses from the employers [who] didn't want anyone to help their employees, or their women... [It] took years, several years, to develop a... relationship with the massage parlours, the owners and the women, and also it took time to have strong membership, to have volunteers who... [are] committed to [doing] this, not just a month or 3 months but for periods longer than that. So it took us a lot of energy... [to] establish trust and also to... have them interested in calling us. After about say 3, 4 years, SWAN has started receiving phone calls from the... owners of these businesses, that they want us to visit the women and to bring a nurse or to bring [an] English tutor to help them. So we were getting a good... response, in that we were not the only ones who obviously were interested [in] helping, that they wanted our services.

(Angela Contreras-Chavez, SWAN)

Working in this way, organizations allow for each situation to be treated as unique, where the issues and the solutions are assessed and addressed as they emerge. This

approach requires "identifying individuals who are willing to listen to the needs and experiences of sex workers and who can act as allies and advocates" (Hunt, 2013, p. 94). It is a position that would be impossible to take if every woman in the sex trade is seen as a victim who, above all else, needs to be taken out of prostitution.

The process of creating a space for people to define for themselves their own situations and ask for what they need also allows for an ever-evolving understanding of the problem and assessment of the most appropriate solution for each particular situation. In cases where a person expresses a desire to change or to leave a given situation – as in sex trafficking cases – this can help ensure that an awareness of and sensitivity to victims' safety and well-being are prioritized and addressed appropriately. A couple of respondents touched on this point:

[You] need to have bodies that are knowledgeable and present and able to take action when that window opens... because realization and choices about one's life... are part of a process of becoming, right? It doesn't have a beginning and [an] end... And if you can provide the services for someone to gather herself, and if you can be present as she takes on her autonomy again, that's the only thing that really will transform our communities... otherwise we're just, you know, doing power over...
(Shauna Paull)

... when it becomes personal, when people know one another, people know members of their community... you have to be aware when you refer a woman to see a settlement service provider... there is a potential there for the woman not being comfortable by meeting with this person, feeling that she'd rather go see somebody who is from a different community than someone from their own communities... it's very hard to find... cultural- and language-appropriate services that will not make an issue out of these women being sex workers, and being victims of other situations...

We know for sure that in the Aboriginal communities, the women are taking care of their own young women and the elder. Not just because of what happened with the missing women, but because [there is] just more awareness about exploitation, and vulnerabilities and suicide, and all these things happening with Aboriginal youth, so there is a lot of that. And communities take care of themselves, and in this case we're talking about women who are new to Canada. They don't have a community that they belong to, and... the communities that they tend to, as immigrants, to look for... seek help from, is the immigrant settlement services agencies... and many of them, they don't know how to... help without judging or without impacting negatively.

(Angela Contreras-Chavez, SWAN)

Within this process, being able to provide cultural awareness and sensitivity, along with a non-judgmental space within which to talk specifically about issues related to the sex trade, seems to be crucial to developing trust in relationships. Speaking about Indigenous people in the sex trade, Sarah Hunt points out that "discourses of victimization... on the surface... aim to draw attention to marginalization and colonial violence but fail to provide a space for Indigenous sex workers to speak for themselves and define their own struggle" (Hunt, 2013, p. 89). Hunt emphasizes that listening to voices of sex workers and recognizing their agency – respecting individuals' decisions rather than making choices on their behalf – is central to addressing their needs. This first requires challenging the existing societal stereotypes and assumptions, particularly those related to the sex trade (Hunt, 2013).

The importance of self-definitions and self-determination has been emphasized in processes whereby individuals and communities reclaim the power to interpret their own realities (see for example, Hill Collins, 2000; Hunt, 2010, 2013). Some research participants spoke about the ways in which respecting a person's agency and choices underlies – and should underlie – the basics of providing services to others. This includes choices that a person makes around their involvement in the sex trade. Kerry Porth of PACE raised this issue as follows: "How can you extend that hand to help... a woman who is afraid to identify as a sex worker?" As Shauna Paull explained in the quotation provided above, being present for another person in a way that allows them to self-define – including to interpret and articulate their own situations, needs and choices – then becomes an important aspect of recognizing that person's own power (Hill Collins, 2000).

The ability to self-define can also point to the diversity that exists within any one community. It can challenge the assumption that groups, as well as the experiences of all who are part of those groups, are homogeneous. This notion should apply to individual experiences in the sex trade as well. Some interview participants talked about the importance of 'speaking out' and participating in wider conversations around the sex trade and sex trafficking. Some of this work may take place as part of, or it can be in response to, others' claims-making activities. This process can help groups ensure that their experiences are heard and considered in related conversations, particularly those that shape how these issues are understood and dealt with. Angela Contreras-Chavez at

SWAN pointed out that when her organization does not "have an outreach presence, it seems that nobody thinks about the immigrant sex workers or the indoor sex workers." Being left out of conversations raises concerns that one's perspective will not be considered. These concerns include worries that others will instead speak on one's behalf, or will not speak at all, and that the understandings of sex trafficking and the sex trade which emerge out of related discussions will not adequately represent one's experiences and needs. In some cases the desire to present a unified voice in order to reach the political goal of having one's claims accepted as more valid than others' can stand in the way of recognizing and accepting diversity. Angela Contreras-Chavez explains:

There is pressure often put on us that we need to make, take a position – are we against or in favour of prostitution, and... we prefer not to have [an] official position. But that's the thing... some of the organizations will work with us only if we disclose where we stand.

For organizations that take a different focus in their work from the dominant position(s) this can be problematic. It can also be detrimental to developing an accurate understanding of a social problem which would subsequently inform the most appropriate ways of dealing with it.

If diversity of experiences is not recognized as valuable, then the knowledge that is developed about sex trafficking can be at best partial. If different points of view are not sought out or considered, the development of understandings and ways of addressing the issue can become centralized in the hands of individuals who are the most successful at attracting attention around their definition of a social problem, or who possess the resources – the power and means – to have their voice and their claims heard. This can include individuals and organizations that are far removed from realities of those who would be impacted by the knowledge and actions that are subsequently developed and implemented. Several respondents raised related concerns during the interviews:

[The] decision around what stays and what goes happens in... an environment that's very, very far away from the community.
(Esther Shannon)

[When] you have a top-down conversation like that, that's responding to a sort of international shaming because we did get a Tier 2 rating at one point, and if you're the kind of person who worries about those sorts of ratings... then you have this top-down conversation which is not connected at all to women's experiences, and I think that in very large measure, and coupled with the attack on migration, and migrants, and refugees, and asylum-seekers in general, and the increase in border securities that go along with that, I think that the conversation is just now completely detached from women's experience. And so therefore the laws and policies are also detached from their experience, and they're really all about posturings of being tough on crime and tough on organized crime...

(Shauna Paull)

[We] don't have a way of making strong arguments either way for how we should respond. Because a lot of the discussion is... it's sort of out of our hands, we're not involved... And if we're not involved as community organizations and advocates and some of [us who] have been trafficked, if we're not involved, then we know for sure the victims are not involved, so then who is setting the agenda...?

("Community member")

Individuals who end up being included in discussions about sex trafficking, and by extension the sex trade, may have different priorities, commitments, and understandings about the issue than those who would be the most impacted by the resulting decisions.

The assumption that there is one story of sex trafficking – where victims and perpetrators are easily and clearly identified and defined – obscures stories of other individuals involved in the sex trade. Without knowing these stories – how individuals themselves experience them – it is difficult to know how to best address the related concerns. Assuming that every woman involved in the sex trade, particularly racialized and/or non-Western, has the same experiences and the same needs, denies women autonomy over their own lives. It can also lead to ineffective, if not potentially harmful and dangerous, responses.

5.4. Conclusion

This chapter has examined the impact of the 2010 Olympics on the issue of sex trafficking by focusing on two main points. I first argued that raising concerns about sex trafficking as a problem in the context of the Olympics mobilized organizations around

related claims. I also considered the impact of using sex trafficking discourse to highlight concerns about the sex trade. I suggested that calling for protection of women and prevention of trafficking restricts women's freedoms and has a potentially negative impact on women's lives, particularly women who are racialized and/or non-Western.

One of the main concerns that needs to be addressed is the long-term impact of the focus that the discussions about sex trafficking might have on how this issue is understood and dealt with. On the one hand, there seemed to be a tendency to move towards a more centralized approach to sex trafficking, increasingly led by expert knowledge and partnerships formed around this issue. On the other hand, as suggested by this research, these processes were navigated and challenged through alliances and relationships built between various individuals and groups dealing with this issue in their work.

Interviews revealed different ways of experiencing and understanding sex trafficking and the sex trade, and pointed to various forms of 'expertise' that exist around these concerns. Organizations that directly work with individuals in the sex trade emphasized experiential knowledge as particularly important for informing their practices and ensuring that individual needs are appropriately addressed. Different perspectives that emerged through this research each provided important and unique insight into the issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade. Bringing together these points of view and different forms of expertise can help to appropriately address the complex nature of some of the related situations:

... that's something else that we want to see happening within the nearer future – more communication and collaboration between agencies, among agencies, and not just being pressed to do something without knowing how to do it properly.

(Angela Contreras-Chavez, SWAN)

[Sometimes] different forms of expertise or advertisement are needed and so... that's sort of how it works. [Regardless] of what [actor?] is working on an issue, or their particular piece on that, I think those networks are fairly established, even though, you know, there are ideological differences around what human trafficking is. But simultaneously those networks are established knowing who is doing what.

(Dr. Annalee Lepp, GAATW Canada)

When a single ideological position is used to inform the understanding of a social problem, it is difficult to recognize the complexities that can exist in real-life situations. In cases of sex trafficking and the sex trade, this can stand in the way of arriving at solutions which adequately address these complexities.

6. Conclusion

This thesis has looked at the concerns that were raised about sex trafficking prior to the 2010 Olympic Games, and has examined the impact of Vancouver's hosting of the Games on issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade. Underlying this project was the recognition that there are different ways of understanding sex trafficking. This served to problematize from the start of the thesis the single, dominant sex trafficking discourse, or the notion that sex trafficking is a straight-forward issue where victims and perpetrators are easily identifiable. Using participant observation and semi-structured interviews, I explored the main research questions as a two-phase qualitative multi-method sequential study. I looked at sex trafficking through the social construction of social problems theory, while also using the concepts of 'discourse' and 'ideology'. This focus allowed me to examine claims-making activities while making connections to the ideological positions they are informed by, as well as the political aims of these positions and their consequences. The project was conducted with awareness of the importance of tangible, 'real life' effects of discussions and processes of knowledge creation related to a social problem. Consequences of how something comes to be understood were examined from an intersectional feminist perspective, a position which placed a particular emphasis on the importance for individuals to be able to define their own experiences.

Chapter 6 starts with a summary and a discussion of the research findings, as well as some concluding observations coming out of the project. It ends with a discussion of research limitations and the significance of the study.

6.1. Conclusions

The findings coming out of this research were organized and discussed in Chapters 4 and 5. In Chapter 4 I argued that the 2010 Olympics provided an opportunity

and a context in which to construct sex trafficking as a social problem. Public forums organized as part of the Buying Sex is Not a Sport anti-trafficking campaign had a number of groups and individuals come together presenting claims on the subject of sex trafficking in the context of the Olympics. Public discussions suggested sex trafficking to be a clear-cut issue. These discussions raised concerns that the sex industry was the problem that underlies sex trafficking. Prostitution was identified as being inherently harmful to women, particularly Aboriginal and other racialized and/or non-Western women. Presenters taking part in these discussions highlighted male demand for commercial sex as the main reason for the existence of prostitution, and by extension, of sex trafficking. In this way, claims made on the topic of sex trafficking argued that the harm in a commercialized sexual exchange is determined and shaped by women's inequality with respect to men, and made worse by issues of racial and class inequalities.

Presenters framed their concerns around a shared ideological position that prostitution is inherently harmful and that it needs to be abolished to deal with sex trafficking. Discussions about sex trafficking that took place prior to the Olympics asked that issues of violence in the sex trade and among trafficked women needed to be recognized as serious and urgent, and addressed by the public and the government. These arguments specifically called for Canada to abolish prostitution by adopting the Nordic legal model which criminalizes persons who buy sex but not those who sell it. The perspective taken in public presentations represented a single ideological position within past and current discussions about how prostitution is understood and how it should be dealt with in Canadian law. In the context of the Olympics, this perspective was spread through alliances and among organizations and individuals coming together and expressing a shared concern about sex trafficking. This viewpoint attempted to strengthen its position within conversations about sex trafficking and the sex trade even further by challenging the perspective of those who call for a different understanding and a different legal approach to prostitution, specifically its decriminalization. The validity of

the ideological position of those who see prostitution as 'sex work' was called into question in conversations about sex trafficking.

In Chapter 5 I argued that while available research did not show an increase in sex trafficking in the context of the 2010 Olympics,⁴² discussions about this topic seemed to have a number of important consequences for organizations that work around issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade. I showed that the focus placed on 'impact' on sex trafficking should include looking at the claims-making activities that took place in the context of the Olympics. Activities associated with the construction of sex trafficking as a social problem seemed to have a number of important consequences for organizations that work around issues of sex trafficking and the sex trade. These included changing ways of understanding and addressing sex trafficking and, by extension, the sex trade. Concerns that were raised publicly and politically encouraged organizations that provide services to individuals in the sex trade to seek out and address sex trafficking in their work. This also seemed to make these organizations more likely to turn to outside experts for information and assistance in dealing with potential trafficking cases.

The chapter pointed out that using sex trafficking discourse to raise attention around the violence experienced by women in the sex trade – particularly Aboriginal as well as other racialised and/or non-Western women – calls for these women to first be identified as victims who need protection. This leaves little room for other experiences – and by extension voices – of women, as well as other individuals, who work in the sex trade. Prioritizing 'protection' as the solution to tangible and perceived issues related to sex trafficking can also lead to restrictions on women's choices and their mobility. It can undermine the willingness to recognize that these individuals have taken and continue to take leadership roles in identifying and addressing issues related to sex trafficking and the sex trade. This chapter cautioned that using the sex trafficking discourse – with its clear-cut understanding of victims and perpetrators – to draw attention to issues in the

⁴² For example, see Deering, Chettiar, Chan, Taylor, Montaner & Shannon, 2012; GAATW, 2011.

sex trade could have negative effects on women's lives. This includes women involved in the sex trade, and specifically migrant women and/or women who are racialized and/or non-Western.

Concern and attention raised about sex trafficking calls for implementation of more formal, and more stringent interventionist practices, or ways of addressing issues associated with these identities. This can include introduction of local, state-level and international responses, such as legal, law enforcement and border control strategies. Accompanying these strategies is the need for expert knowledge as a necessary way of guiding action in addressing sex trafficking. The context of the Olympics helped to introduce a particular view of the problem and the solutions associated with the sex trafficking discourse more widely, or specifically, more deeply, into functioning of organizations, political discussions and the more general public awareness. It encouraged the view of racialized and/or non-Western women as suspect of being potential victims, and encouraged that they be sought out 'for their own protection'. It asked that stories of sex trafficking and the sex trade continue to be revealed and that more knowledge is acquired about these issues. When considering that identities presented in sex trafficking discourse are strongly defined along gender, racial and class lines, then the mechanisms of control called for and implemented to address sex trafficking can be expected to be deployed most strongly along those lines as well. Such focus on seeking out trafficking cases and stories may then lead to the development of identities that are closely tied to their histories of injury, and result in increased regulation of people's lives (Doezema, 2010).

The importance of the Olympic Games as a context for discussions about sex trafficking should also be considered within the history of Canadian discussions about prostitution and prostitution law in Canada. These conversations – held over the last several decades – have repeatedly revolved around questions of what is prostitution, where should it take place and what should be done about it (see Lowman, 2011). The Olympics provided an important opportunity for individuals and organizations to open these issues up for discussion publicly and politically through claims-making activities organized around sex trafficking. Those voices that were visible and audible in making claims about sex trafficking asked the public and the government to accept the connection between sex trafficking and the sex trade. Through the process of

constructing sex trafficking as a social problem presenters asked that the ideological position that sees prostitution as inherently harmful be accepted over other positions on prostitution and to have this understanding inform changes to Canadian prostitution law. In other words, in opening up the discussion claims-makers involved in showing sex trafficking to be a problem provided the answers to the long-standing questions on the sex trade. Using sex trafficking discourse to illustrate the importance of their arguments, they claimed that prostitution is violence against women, and that it should be abolished. By barely, if at all, distinguishing between prostitution and sex trafficking, presenters left little room in future conversations about sex trafficking for those who argue for prostitution to be recognized as 'sex work,' or as being anything other than inherently harmful.

That concerns about prostitution were central in the anti-trafficking campaign *Buying Sex is Not a Sport* was openly discussed by participants who took part in public forums. This focus is also evident by considering events held after the Olympics that focused specifically on raising concerns about the sex trade. One of the events – which featured Gunilla Ekberg, who played an important role in the development and implementation of the prostitution law in Sweden (Westender, 2011) – filled a 300-seat Vancouver Public Library room to capacity. The event was organized by REED as part of International Women's Day. It featured some of the same speakers who had taken part in anti-trafficking events prior to the Olympics. This event's title, Prostitution and Women's Equality: Imagining More for Women, was explicitly focused on prostitution rather than sex trafficking. The audience, comprising men and women of various ages, was greeted by a speaker who commented that she was glad to see so many people in attendance interested in alternatives to normalized prostitution.

As concern about sex trafficking spread publicly and politically, it helped to strengthen the position that sees prostitution as inherently harmful. What emerged out of these discussions was stronger attention being placed on *sex trafficking* – along with its underlying view of prostitution – rather than an engagement with all the different positions taken in discussions on prostitution and prostitution law in Canada. This asked that organizations and individuals engage with the presented concerns either by adopting the language of the sex trafficking discourse or by making counter-claims in opposition to it. The polarization over sex trafficking and prostitution can add to divisions

among activists and their communities. This polarization also has the potential to leave out experiences and voices of individuals and organizations which do not fall neatly into either definition or understanding of prostitution or do not politically align themselves explicitly with any one position.

The discussion in Canada continues to acknowledge that something needs to be done with the issue of prostitution. Several interview participants – coming from various sides of the prostitution debate – pointed to the historical lack of attention and concern shown by governments and the public to women who are involved in the sex trade, and/or migrant women, particularly Aboriginal and other racialized women. The emphasis placed on graphic accounts of violence, followed by calls for 'something to be done' – as is often the case in discussions about sex trafficking – is a powerful persuasive tool that can draw public and government attention to the issue of violence and harm experienced by the women in the sex trade, particularly Aboriginal and other racialized and/or non-Western women. It demands that historical inaction on the issue of violence against women, particularly those in the sex trade, be addressed. However, attempts to fast-track how an issue is understood and addressed runs the risk of perpetuating the same issues of harm and violence that are raised as concerns in the first place.⁴³ Concerns over women in the sex trade – when expressed as concerns over sex trafficking *victims* – can, in the name of 'protection', lead to implementation of more restrictive policies and laws, as well as a top-down approach to dealing with prostitution. When this position asks that women in the sex trade be recognized as victims, it does not leave space for those who are not asking to be protected. As was discussed in Chapter 5, this risks shutting out communities, including experiential voices, from discussions about what women in the sex trade themselves feel and say they need.

⁴³ This concern was raised in the Bloc Québécois minority report in response to the Status of Women report on human trafficking mentioned earlier. Bloc Québécois did not support the Status of Women report, expressing concern over the report's underlying ideological position and the perceived attempt to fast-track a solution to questions about Canada's prostitution law (see discussion in Lowman, 2011).

6.2. Research Limitations

The project focuses on a specific time period and a specific location. Conversations about sex trafficking have been taking place internationally around other large-scale sporting events. While there might be some similarities between those conversations and the ones discussed in this thesis, it is important to remember that Vancouver prior to, during and after the 2010 Olympic Games provided a very specific context in which conversations about sex trafficking and the sex trade took place. While some aspects of this context are addressed in this thesis, it is beyond the scope of the study to meaningfully examine it fully at this time. However, caution should be exercised when attempting to generalize from the findings of this project to other locations, time periods or other sporting events. On the other hand, taking a comparative approach to examining the activities of how sex trafficking becomes constructed as a social problem can help make visible the underlying social processes that inform similarities and differences among various places (Best, 2013).

There are likely many other voices aside from those presented in this research that would have important arguments to add to the discussion presented in this thesis. This includes individuals who were themselves involved in the selling of sexual services during the 2010 Olympics. These are also organizations other than those that participated in the project. The research also does not include perspectives of individuals and organizations who did not respond to or declined the invitation to participate in the research. Some of the voices included in this thesis would also likely have points to add to this discussion that have arisen subsequent to the interviews. Further, since the interviews were being conducted well after the Vancouver 2010 Winter Olympics had taken place, there were concerns about research participants' recall bias, or their ability to remember what exactly had taken place prior to or during the Games. While it is certainly a possibility that asking people to reflect on a past event frames the research findings, none of the individuals who took part in the research expressed concerns about their ability to recall the time of the Olympics. Had any of the individuals felt that they had nothing to share with respect to the Olympics, they would not have agreed to participate in the project in the first place.

6.3. Research Significance

This research contributes to the ongoing discussions about sex trafficking and by extension the sex trade, specifically in the context of a large-scale sporting event such as the Olympic Games. Discussions that addressed the issue of sex trafficking in Vancouver prior to the Games looked back to similar conversations that had taken place in the past (for example, Bowen & Shannon Frontline Consulting, 2009; The Future Group, 2007). Similar inquiries related to sex trafficking have also been undertaken with respect to other cities (GAATW, 2011; Hennig, et al., 2006). Future hosts are likely to look to Vancouver if sex trafficking continues to be raised as an issue in the context of large-scale sporting events.

This research highlights the role that alliances play in raising and addressing social issues. All respondents spoke about the ways in which they work with others. Alliances seemed to be of key importance, not only in the role they have played in helping to raise concerns about sex trafficking publicly and politically, but also as a way of sharing information, resources and experiences around related issues. Andrea Smith speaks of the importance of alliances when it comes to meeting political and economic goals for purposes of social change. This calls for a rethinking of assumptions about who potential partners are, at times leading to some unlikely and unexpected alliances (Smith, 2008). Some specific concerns about alliances that form around the issue of sex trafficking were noted in this thesis (Bernstein, 2010; Sayeed, 2006; Smith, 2008; Weitzer, 2007). However, the potential for alliances to be progressive and/or oppressive is not necessarily determined by the ideological positions of individual parties. Their consequences are uncertain and can never be fully predicted (Smith, 2008). The importance of rethinking some of the potential alliances may become even more significant in the context of increasing awareness about sex trafficking, the conflation of sex trafficking and the sex trade within these conversations, as well as decreasing resources available to various service-providing individuals and organizations. These changes may lead to organizations having to think strategically and with awareness of how to balance their own and their partners' ideological positions and political interests. As the role of alliances continues to increase, it becomes more important to better

understand the dynamics that inform them, and to be aware of the aims and intentions of their individual members.

This research argues that looking at how sex trafficking becomes constructed as a social problem should be crucial to the overall understanding of this issue. Taking this focus allows us to examine some of the processes and power dynamics involved in establishing what sex trafficking is and how it should be dealt with. It can help explain why sex trafficking continues to be understood as a large and growing problem despite the fact that there are no reliable measures of trafficking (Doezema, 2010). Concerns about this issue continued to be raised after the 2010 Olympic Games, despite the fact that there has been no official report released that would suggest sex trafficking was a problem. In March 2011 alone – over a year after the Olympic Games were held in Vancouver – several different public events related to sex trafficking were held in Metro Vancouver. Continued efforts aimed at raising sex trafficking as a problem did not seem to be impacted by the lack of measurable proof that this issue should be of concern.⁴⁴ In this research I show that how social problem is constructed can in itself affect people's lives in significant and tangible ways, regardless of whether or not it can be proven that it is a problem.

The assessment of the impact of the Olympics takes into consideration the space that the Games provided in which to publicly pose the questions 'what is prostitution?' and 'what should be done about it?'. The claims made about sex trafficking served as a way of problematizing the male demand for paid sexual services and prostitution in general, by helping to incorporate the sex trafficking discourse into the public and political understanding of prostitution. This helped to make a case for the ideological position that says prostitution is inherently harmful and should be abolished through the

⁴⁴ I have also been surprised at the lack of public interest in wanting to know if sex trafficking increased because of the Olympics. I have not come across this being raised as a question in any notable way in the media or at any of the sex trafficking-related events I attended after the Olympics. Yet the issue continued to attract interest long after the Games were held. On the other hand, the question of whether or not sex trafficking increased was one of the most common responses I received after telling someone about my project.

implementation of the Nordic prostitution law in Canada. While the public and politicians were encouraged to 'do something' about sex trafficking, this call to action relied on seeing women in the sex trade solely as victims, rather than as agents in their own lives. This understanding presented sex trafficking as a one-sided and uncontested story. It did so by leaving out and challenging other voices which had different ways of understanding the problem and the actions needed to address it.

Lastly – and perhaps most importantly – this research challenges the idea that the two main perspectives that are often identified in relation to sex trafficking and the sex trade are inherently different, and that they can easily be distinguished from one another. While there are disagreements over the legal solutions to the questions around prostitution in Canada – as well as some strong positions taken on 'each side' – during this research I did not find anyone arguing 'for sex trafficking' or in defense of abusive situations and practices. More often than not I heard commonalities among the concerns that were expressed, including lack of government response to some of the long-standing issues in people's lives, including lives of migrant women and/or women who sell sex. The assumption that the views on sex trafficking and prostitution can be separated into two distinct and mutually exclusive sides was not easy to confirm in practice. In the process of this research my attempts to draw clear dividing lines between positions and opinions on the issues of prostitution and sex trafficking repeatedly failed. These humbling moments of failed attempts also served as opportunities to shift the existing assumptions which initially informed aspects of this research. Some of the instances that felt the most important in the process of conducting this project were those that allowed me to witness other people experiencing what seemed like similar moments of having one's assumptions challenged. These included situations in which there appeared an unexpected potential to shift some previously-held understanding, or an opportunity to recognize another person as a possible ally with similar perspectives. In many cases, those moments were barely visible – they took the form of a sentence, a pause, a silence or a gesture. While not all of those opportunities were necessarily taken, they seemed important enough in the potential they held for someone to choose to do or think differently. These instances served as reminders that every moment and every interaction holds the power to shift some understanding or action. As such, the full consequences of any one interaction can never be completely predicted.

The notion that there are two mutually-exclusive sides taken on prostitution and sex trafficking can lead to the primary focus being placed on making claims to prove one of the sides as valid while undermining the other's position. This tendency can deflect attention from addressing the more tangible needs and concerns expressed by individuals working in the sex trade (Agustín, 2005). It can also result in voices being left out of conversations that do not neatly fall into any single category of experience. These can include voices of those who are likely to be the most directly impacted by the resulting decisions made through conversations around sex trafficking and prostitution. When initiatives that claim to protect individuals are created on the basis of a single experience and a single understanding of that experience – regardless of the diversity of voices who tell it – they cannot be expected to best serve the needs of 'everyone'. If this is the case, such exclusion of voices and experiences raises the need to consider whose interests they are serving and whose they are leaving out.

References

- Aghatise, E. (2004). Trafficking for Prostitution in Italy, Possible Effects of Government Proposals for Legalization of Brothels. *Violence Against Women*, 10(10), 1126-1155.
- Agustín, L. (2002). The (Crying) Need for Different Kinds of Research. *Research for Sex Work*, 5, 30-32.
- Agustín, L. (2005). Migrants in the Mistress's House: Other Voices in the "Trafficking" Debate. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society*, 12(1), 96–117.
- Agustín, L. (2007a). Questioning Solidarity: Outreach with Migrants Who Sell Sex. *Sexualities*, 10(4), 519–534.
- Agustín, L. (2007b). *Sex at the margins: migration, labour markets and the rescue industry*. London ; New York: Zed Books.
- Agustín, L. (2010, July 23). Big claims, little evidence: Sweden's law against buying sex. The Local. Retrieved July 23, 2010, from: <http://www.thelocal.se/27962/20100723/>
- Albanese, J. (2007). A Criminal Network Approach to Understanding & Measuring Trafficking in Human Beings. In E. U. Savona & S. Stefanizzi (Eds.), *Measuring Human Trafficking, Complexities and Pitfalls* (pp. 55-71). New York: Springer.
- Anderson, B., & Andrijasevic, R. (2008). Sex, slaves and citizens: the politics of anti-trafficking. *Soundings*, 40(1), 135–135.
- Andrijasevic, R. (2003). The Difference Borders Make: (Il)legality, Migration and Trafficking in Italy among Eastern European Women in Prostitution. In S. Ahmed, C. Castaneda, A.-M. Fortier, & M. Sheller (Eds.), *Uprootings/ Regroundings: Questions of Home and Migration* (pp. 251–272). Berg.
- Andrijasevic, R. (2007). Beautiful Dead Bodies: Gender, Migration and Representation in Anti-Trafficking Campaigns. *Feminist Review*, 86(86), 24–44.
- Andrijasevic, R., & Anderson, B. (2009). Anti-trafficking Campaigns: Decent? Honest? Truthful? *Feminist Review*, 92(1), 151–155.

- Anthony, A. (2010, August 1). Göran Lindberg and Sweden's dark side. *The Guardian*. Retrieved October 24, 2012 from: <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2010/aug/01/goran-lindberg-sweden-crime-palme>
- Aoyama, K. (2009). *Thai migrant sexworkers: from modernisation to globalisation*. Basingstoke [England] ; New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Aradau, C. (2004). The Perverse Politics of Four-Letter Words: Risk and Pity in the Securitisation of Human Trafficking. *Millennium - Journal of International Studies*, 33(2), 251–277.
- Aradau, C. (2007). *Rethinking trafficking in women: politics out of security*. Basingstoke [England]; New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Araújo, J. Z. (Director/Writer). (2009). *Cinderelas, Lobos e Um Príncipe Encantado* (Cinderella, Wolves & One Prince Charming). (Documentary film). Brazil: Pipa Produções.
- Aromaa, K. (2007). Trafficking in Human Beings: Uniform Definitions for Better Measuring and for Effective Counter-Measures. In E. U. Savona & S. Stefanizzi (Eds.), *Measuring human trafficking: complexities and pitfalls* (pp. 13–26). New York; London: Springer.
- AWAN. (2011). Declaration presented by AWAN Members Cherry Smiley & Fay Blaney at Women's Worlds 2011, July 6, 2011. Retrieved February 26, 2012 from: <https://www.facebook.com/notes/aboriginal-womens-action-network/declaration-presented-by-awan-members-cherry-smiley-fay-blaney-at-womens-worlds-/10150229870221691>
- Bales, K., & Soodalter, R. (2009). *The slave next door: human trafficking and slavery in America today*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Baptie, T. (2009, June 12). Trisha Baptie: Why prostitution, the world's oldest oppression, must be stamped out. *The Georgia Straight*. Retrieved February 26, 2012, from <http://www.straight.com/news/trisha-baptie-why-prostitution-worlds-oldest-oppression-must-be-stamped-out>
- Barnett, L. (2006, January 12). *Bill C-49: An Act to Amend the Criminal Code (Trafficking in Persons)*. Retrieved July 27, 2010 from: http://www2.parl.gc.ca/Sites/LOP/LegislativeSummaries/Bills_Is.asp?Parl=38&Ses=1&Is=C49#1immigration
- Barry, K. (1984). *Female sexual slavery*. New York ; London: New York University Press. (Original work published 1979)
- Barry, K. (1995). *The prostitution of sexuality*. New York: New York University Press.

- Bernstein, E. (2010). Militarized Humanitarianism Meets Carceral Feminism: The Politics of Sex, Rights, and Freedom in Contemporary Antitrafficking Campaigns. *Signs*, 36(1), 45–71.
- Best, J. (2002). Constructing the Sociology of Social Problems: Spector and Kitsuse Twenty-Five Years Later. *Sociological Forum*, 17(4), 699–706.
- Best, J. (2013). *Social problems*. New York: W.W. Norton & Co.
- Bowen, R. (2006). *From the Curb: Sex Workers' Perspectives on Violence and Domestic Trafficking*. Retrieved June 14, 2013 from http://bccec.files.wordpress.com/2010/01/final-report-violence_and_domestic_trafficking_bccew.pdf
- Bowen & Shannon Frontline Consulting (2009). *Human Trafficking, Sex Work Safety and the 2010 Games: Assessments and recommendations*. Retrieved February 9, 2010 from <http://vancouver.ca/police/assets/pdf/reports-policies/report-human-trafficking-2010-games.pdf>
- Brennan, D. (2002). Selling Sex for Visas: Sex Tourism as a Stepping-stone to International Migration. In B. Ehrenreich & A. R. Hochschild (Eds.), *Global woman: nannies, maids, and sex workers in the new economy* (pp. 154-168). New York: Metropolitan Books.
- Brennan, D. (2004). *What's love got to do with it?: transnational desires and sex tourism in the Dominican Republic*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Brock, D., Gillies, K., Oliver, C., & Sutdhibhasilp, M. (2000). Migrant Sex Work: A Roundtable Analysis. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 20(2), 84–91.
- Brock, M. (2010, March 29). Vancouver Olympics = Rise in Demand. *Hope for the Sold*. Retrieved from <http://hopeforthesold.com/vancouver-olympics-rise-in-demand/>
- Bruckert, C., & Parent, C. (2002). *Trafficking In Human Beings and Organized Crime: A Literature Review*. Ottawa: RCMP.
- Brunovskis, A., & Surtees, R. (2008). Agency or Illness -The Conceptualization of Trafficking: Victims' Choices and Behaviors in the Assistance System. *Gender, Technology and Development*, 12(1), 53–76.
- Buhler, D. (2009). Countdown to 2010 – Faith and Sports Meet in Vancouver. *Christianity.ca*. Retrieved from <http://www.christianity.ca/page.aspx?pid=13921>
- Canadian Council for Refugees, Ontario Council of Agencies Serving Immigrants, Metro Toronto Chinese and Southeast Asian Legal Clinic & Colour of Poverty Campaign. (2012). *State of Immigrant and Refugee Women's Status in Canada – 2012, A Joint Report*. Retrieved from: http://www.ocasi.org/downloads/State_of_Immigrant_Refugee_Women_in_Canada_2012.pdf

- Canadian Institutes of Health Research, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, and Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. (2005). *Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans*. Retrieved February 5, 2010 from: <http://www.ger.ethique.gc.ca>
- Canadian Institutes of Health Research, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, and Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. (December 2010). *Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans*. Retrieved August 12, 2012 from: http://www.ethics.gc.ca/pdf/eng/tcps2/TCPS_2_FINAL_Web.pdf
- CBC. (2010, January 12). Activists to use Olympics to get media attention - British Columbia - CBC News. Retrieved February 26, 2012, from <http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/story/2010/01/12/bc-protest-schedule-olympics.html>
- CBC News. (2009, September 28). New anti-sex-trafficking campaign before Games: police. Retrieved February 27, 2012, from <http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/story/2009/09/28/bc-salvation-army-human-sex-trafficking-police.html>
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada (2011). Backgrounder — Safe Streets and Communities Act: Protecting Vulnerable Foreign Nationals against Trafficking, Abuse and Exploitation. Retrieved from: <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/backgrounders/2011/2011-09-20.asp>
- Cizmar, M., Conklin, E., & Hinman, K. (2011, June 29). Real Men Get Their Facts Straight. *The Village Voice*, pp. 13–23.
- Coggins, J. (2010, February 25). Olympic Games inspire a spectrum of Christian response. *Canadianchristianity.com*. Retrieved from <http://canadianchristianity.com/nationalupdates/2010/100225spectrum.html>
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research Design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- Criminal Code, R. S. 1985a, c. C-34, s. 194.
- Criminal Code, R.S. 1985b, c. 51 (1st Supp.), s. 1.
- Criminal Code, R.S.C. 2005a, c. 43, s. 3.
- Criminal Code, R.S.C. 2005b, c. 32, s. 10.1.
- Criminal Code, R.S.C. 2010a, c. 3, s. 2.
- Criminal Code, R.S.C. 2010b, c. 3, s. 3.

- Crowe, A. (2009, December 10). Students Meet with Award-winning Brazilian Filmmaker. *SOC News*. Retrieved August 12, 2012 from <http://www.american.edu/soc/news/brazilian-filmmaker.cfm>
- CTV.ca News Staff. (2009, September 25). Vancouver sex workers angry at Sally Ann ads. *CTVNews*. Retrieved March 14, 2012, from <http://www.ctvnews.ca/vancouver-sex-workers-angry-at-sally-ann-ads-1.437706>
- Deering, K. N., Chettiar, J., Chan, K., Taylor, M., Montaner, J. S. G., & Shannon, K. (2012). Sex work and the public health impacts of the 2010 Olympic Games. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, 88(4), 301-303.
- Derks, A. (2000). *From White Slaves to Trafficking Survivors: Notes on the Trafficking Debate* (Working Paper #00–02m). Presented at the Conference on Migration and Development. Retrieved August 17, 2012 from <http://www.nswp.org/resource/white-slaves-trafficking-survivors-notes-the-trafficking-debate>
- Dodillet, S., & Östergren, P. (2011). The Swedish Sex Purchase Act: Claimed Success and Documented Effects (pp. 1–36). Presented at the International Workshop: Decriminalizing Prostitution and Beyond: Practical Experiences and Challenges, The Hague. Retrieved June 21, 2012 from http://www.plri.org/sites/plri.org/files/Impact%20of%20Swedish%20law_0.pdf
- Doezema, J. (2001). Ouch! Western feminists' "wounded attachment" to the "third world prostitute." *Feminist Review*, 67(1), 16.
- Doezema, J. (2010). *Sex slaves and discourse masters: the construction of trafficking*. London: Zed.
- Dottridge, M. (2007). Introduction. In *Collateral Damage. The Impact of Anti-Trafficking Measures on Human Rights around the World* (pp. 1–26). Bangkok, Thailand: GAATW. Retrieved January 22, 2011 from http://www.gaatw.org/Collateral%20Damage_Final/singlefile_CollateralDamagefinal.pdf
- Eagleton, T. (2007). *Ideology: an introduction*. London ; New York: Verso. (Original work published 1991)
- Ekberg, G. (2004). The Swedish law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services. *Violence Against Women*, 10(10), 1187–1218.
- Emerson, R. M., Fretz, R. I., & Shaw, L. L. (1995). *Writing ethnographic fieldnotes*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Episcopal Commission for Justice and Peace (2010, January 27). *Pastoral Letter on Human Trafficking*. Retrieved December 3, 2012 from: <http://www.cccb.ca/site/eng/media-room/official-texts/pastoral-letters/2744-pastoral-letter-on-human-trafficking>

- Faier, L. (2008). RUNAWAY STORIES: The Underground Micromovements of Filipina Oyomesan in Rural Japan. *Cultural Anthropology*, 23(4), 630–659.
- Faier, L. (2009). *Intimate encounters: Filipina women and the remaking of rural Japan*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Finkel, R., & Matheson, C. M. (2013). Sex trafficking and the Vancouver Winter Olympic Games: perceptions and preventative measures. *Tourism management*, 36.
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2001). *Making social science matter: why social inquiry fails and how it can succeed again*. Cambridge ; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- GAATW (2011). *What's the cost of a rumour?: A guide to sorting out the myths and the facts about sporting events and trafficking*. Thailand: Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women. Retrieved December 28, 2011 from <http://www.gaatw.org/publications/WhatstheCostofaRumour.11.15.2011.pdf>
- Gentry, C. (1988). The Social Construction of Abducted Children as a Social Problem. *Sociological Inquiry*, 58(4), 413–425.
- Goodey, J. (2008). Human trafficking: Sketchy data and policy responses. *Criminology & Criminal Justice*, 8(4), 421-442
- Grant, M. G. (2012, January 27). DNA Database of Men Who Pay for Sex? The Strange Push to Make Cops Collect DNA from Suspected Johns. *AlterNet*. Retrieved from http://www.alternet.org/story/153918/dna_database_of_men_who_pay_for_sex_the_strange_push_to_make_cops_collect_dna_from_suspected_johns
- Gregory, D. (2000). Discourse. In R. J. Johnston, D. Gregory, G. Pratt, & M. Watts (Eds.), *The Dictionary of Human Geography (4th ed.)* (pp.180-181). Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.
- Gülçür, L., & İlkaracan, P. (2002). The “Natasha” experience: Migrant sex workers from the former Soviet Union and Eastern Europe in Turkey. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 25(4), 411–421.
- Halfmann, D., & Young, M. P. (2010). War Pictures: The Grotesque as a Mobilizing Tactic. *Mobilization: An International Quarterly*, 15(1), 1–24.
- Harcourt, C., & Donovan, B. (2005). The many faces of sex work. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, 81(3), 201–206.
- Hennig, J., Craggs, S., Laczko, F., & Larsson, F. (2006). *Trafficking in Human Beings and the 2006 World Cup in Germany - Draft Report*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration. Retrieved November 3, 2009 from http://www.iom.ch/jahia/webdav/shared/shared/mainsite/projects/documents/World_Cup_2006_CT_Draft_Report.pdf
- Hill Collins, P. (2000). *Black feminist thought: knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment*. London; New York: Routledge.

- Hill Collins, P. (2006). *From Black Power to Hip Hop, Racism, Nationalism, and Feminism*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Hunt, S. (2008). Trafficking of Aboriginal Girls and Youth: Risk Factors and Historical Context. Retrieved from http://www.interfaithjustpeace.org/pdf/sara_hunt-human_trafficking/sara_hunt-human_trafficking.pdf
- Hunt, S. (2010, July). Colonial Roots, Contemporary Risk Factors: a cautionary exploration of the domestic trafficking of Aboriginal women and girls in British Columbia, Canada. *Alliance News*, (33), 27–31. Retrieved June 14, 2012 from http://www.gaatw.org/publications/Alliance%20News/Alliance_News_July_2010.pdf
- Hunt, S. (2011, September 14). Seeking the Breaking Point: Violence and Justice in Canada. *Media Indigena*. Retrieved from <http://www.mediaindigena.com/sarah-hunt/issues-and-politics/seeking-the-breaking-point-violence-and-justice-in-canada>
- Hunt, S. (2013). Decolonizing Sex Work: Developing an Intersectional Indigenous Approach. In E. Van der Meulen, E. M. Durisin, & V. Love (Eds.), *Selling sex: experience, advocacy, and research on sex work in Canada* (pp. 82–100). Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Hunter, A. & Brewer, J. (2003). Multimethod Research in Sociology. In A. Tashakkori & C. Teedlie (Eds.), *Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social & Behavioral Research* (pp. 577-594). Thousand Oaks; London; New Dehli: Sage Publications.
- Jeffreys, S. (1997). *The idea of prostitution*. North Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Jeffreys, S. (2009). *The industrial vagina: the political economy of the global sex trade*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Jick, T. D. (1979). Mixing Qualitative and Quantitative Methods: Triangulation in Action. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 24 (4), 602-611.
- Kapur, R. (2005). Travel Plans: Border Crossings and the Rights of Transnational Migrants. *Harvard Human Rights Journal*, 18, 107–138.
- Kaye, A. L. (2010, January 14). Christian Organization Affiliated with VANOC has 24-year History with IOC. *The Vancouver Observer*. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from <http://www.vancouverobserver.com/olympics/2010/01/14/christian-organization-affiliated-vanoc-has-24-year-history-ioc>
- Kempadoo, K. (1998). Introduction: Globalizing Sex Workers' Rights. In Kempadoo, K., & Doezema, J. (Eds.). *Global sex workers: rights, resistance, and redefinition* (pp. 1-28). New York: Routledge.
- Kempadoo, K. (1999). *Sun, sex, and gold: tourism and sex work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, Md: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

- Kempadoo, K., ed. (2005). *Trafficking and prostitution reconsidered: new perspectives on migration, sex work, and human rights*. (2005) (1st ed.). Boulder, Colo: Paradigm Publishers.
- Kempadoo, K., & Doezema, J. (1998). *Global sex workers: rights, resistance, and redefinition*. New York: Routledge.
- Kingsley, C., & Mark, M. (2001). *Sacred Lives: Canadian Aboriginal Children and Youth Speak out about Sexual Exploitation*. Retrieved June 15, 2013 from http://www.gov.mb.ca/fs/traciustrust/pubs/sacred_lives.pdf
- Kloer, A. (2010, March 11). Initial Reports on Human Trafficking at Olympics Clash. *Abolish – Liberate - Emancipate NOW*. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from <http://mgjack.wordpress.com/2010/03/11/initial-reports-on-human-trafficking-at-olympics-clash/>
- Laczko, F. (2007). Enhancing Data Collection and Research on Trafficking in Persons. In E. U. Savona & S. Stefanizzi (Eds.), *Measuring Human Trafficking, Complexities and Pitfalls* (pp. 37-44). New York: Springer.
- Lee, M. (2011). *Trafficking and global crime control*. London ; Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Leidholdt, D. A. (2004). Prostitution and Trafficking in Women: An Intimate Relationship. *Journal of Trauma Practice*, 2(3-4), 167–183.
- Lepp, A. (2010, July). Gender, Racialization, and Mobility: Human trafficking and the 2010 Vancouver Winter Olympic Games. *Alliance News*, (33), 47–51. Retrieved June 14, 2012 from http://www.gaatw.org/publications/Alliance%20News/Alliance_News_July_2010.pdf
- Lepp, A. (2013). Repeat Performance? Human Trafficking and the 2010 Vancouver Winter Olympic Games. In E. Van der Meulen, E. M. Durisin, & V. Love (Eds.), *Selling sex: experience, advocacy, and research on sex work in Canada* (pp. 251–268). Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Lowman, J. (2011). Deadly Inertia: A History of Constitutional Challenges to Canada's Criminal Code Sections on Prostitution. *Beijing Law Review*, 2(2), 33–54.
- Lowman, J. (2013). Crown Expert-Witness Testimony in *Bedford v. Canada*: Evidence-Based Argument or Victim-Paradigm Hyperbole? In E. Van der Meulen, E. M. Durisin, & V. Love (Eds.), *Selling sex: experience, advocacy, and research on sex work in Canada* (pp. 230–250). Vancouver: UBC Press.
- MacKinnon, C. A. (1983). Feminism, Marxism, Method, and the State: Toward Feminist Jurisprudence. *Signs*, 8(4), 635–658.
- Malarek, V. (2003). *The Natashas: the new global sex trade*. Toronto: Viking Canada.

- McDonald, L., Moore, B., & Timoshkina, N. (2000). *Migrant sex workers from Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union: the Canadian case*. Ottawa: Status of Women Canada.
- McLaren, C. (2009, May 22). "Buying sex is not a sport": sex work campaign | The Hook. *The Tyee*. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from <http://thetyee.ca/Blogs/TheHook/Olympics2010/2009/05/22/CampaignProstitutionOlympics/>
- Minister of Justice Canada. (2001). *Immigration and Refugee Protection Act*. Retrieved from: <http://laws.justice.gc.ca/PDF/Statute/I/I-2.5.pdf>
- Monzini, P. (2005). *Sex traffic: prostitution, crime, and exploitation*. London; New York: Zed Books.
- More Than Gold. (2009a). More Than Gold - About Us. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from <http://www.morethangold.ca/content/about-us>
- More Than Gold. (2009b). Social Initiatives. Retrieved December 3, 2012 from: <http://www.morethangold.ca/groups/social-initiatives>
- Morokvasic, M. (2007). Migration, gender, empowerment. In I. Lenz, C. Ullrich, & B. Fersch (Eds.), *Gender orders unbound: globalisation, restructuring and reciprocity* (pp. 69–97). Opladen: Barbara Budrich.
- Morokvasic, M. (2010). Feminization of migrations? *Stanovništvo*, 48(2), 25–52.
- Musacchio, V. (2004). Migration, Prostitution and Trafficking in Women: An Overview. *German Law Journal*, 5(9): 1015-1030.
- Newman, J. (2010, February 2). Searching for God in Vancouver. *Charisma Magazine*. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from <http://www.charismamag.com/spirit/evangelism-missions/8816-searching-for-god-in-vancouver>
- Nieuwenhuys, C., & Pécod, A. (2007). Human Trafficking, Information Campaigns, and Strategies of Migration Control. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 50(12), 1674–1695.
- North American Baptist Women's Union. (2011). Awareness, Advocacy, and Action in Canada. Retrieved February 28, 2012 from: <http://www.nabwu.org/Action.html>
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (1998). *Prostitution, Power and Freedom*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003). "Sleeping with the enemy"? Some problems with feminist abolitionist calls to penalise those who buy commercial sex. *Social policy and society*, 2(1), 55–64.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2006). Will the Real Sex Slave Please Stand up? *Feminist Review*, 83(83), 4–22.

- O'Connor, M. & Healy, G. (2006). Prostitution and Sex Trafficking: A Briefing Handbook. Retrieved October 21, 2009 from: <http://www.embracedignity.org/?page=trffckng>
- O'Neill, M. (2003). Feminism(s) and Prostitution. In M. O'Neill & R. Matthews (Eds.), *Prostitution* (pp. 327–371). Aldershot, UK; Burlington, VT, USA: Ashgate.
- Ogrodnik, L. (2010). *Towards the Development of a National Data Collection Framework to Measure Trafficking in Persons*. Statistics Canada.
- Outshoorn, J. (2005). The Political Debates on Prostitution and Trafficking of Women. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society*, 12(1), 141–155.
- Palys, T., & Atchison, C. (2008). *Research Decisions. Quantitative and Qualitative Perspectives (4th ed.)*. Toronto: Thomson/Nelson.
- Perrin, B. (2010). *Invisible chains: Canada's underground world of human trafficking*. Toronto: Viking Canada, Penguin Group.
- Peters, J. (2009, November 1). The truth about sports isn't sexy. *ChristianWeek*, 23(16). Retrieved from <http://www.christianweek.org/stories.php?id=699>
- Pheterson, G. (1996). *The Prostitution Prism*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Public Safety Canada (2012). *National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking*. Retrieved August 1, 2012 from: <http://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/prg/le/cmbt-trffkng-eng.aspx>
- Raymond, J. & Hughes, D. (2001). *Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States. Coalition against Trafficking in Women*. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice.
- REED website. 2012. *Buying Sex is Not a Sport*. Retrieved March 12, 2012 from: <http://embracedignity.org/?page=buyingsexisnotasport>
- Said, E. W. (1994). *Orientalism*. London: Vintage Books. (Original work published 1978)
- Salvationist. (2009a, March). More Than Gold Campaign Aims High. *The Salvation Army | Salvationist.ca*. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from: <http://salvationist.ca/2009/03/more-than-gold/>
- Salvationist. (2009b, October 1). More Than Gold Campaign. Interview with Sharon Tidd. *The Salvation Army | Salvationist.ca*. Retrieved March 12, 2012, from <http://salvationist.ca/2009/10/more-than-gold-2/>
- Savona, E. U., & Stefanizzi, S. (2007). Introduction. In E. U. Savona & S. Stefanizzi (Eds.), *Measuring Human Trafficking, Complexities and Pitfalls* (pp. 1-3). New York: Springer.

- Sayeed, A. (2006). Making Political Hay of Sex and Slavery: Kansas Conservatism, Feminism and the Global Regulation of Sexual Moralities. *Feminist Review*, 83(83), 119–131.
- Scambler, G. (2007). Sex Work Stigma: Opportunist Migrants in London. *Sociology*, 41(6), 1079–1096.
- Schlanger, Z. (2013, February 15). Waging War On Sex Workers. Zoe Schlanger interviews Melissa Gira Grant. *Guernica, A Magazine of Art & Politics*. Retrieved June 13, 2013, from <http://www.guernicamag.com/interviews/the-war-on-sex-workers/>
- Sharma, N. (2003). Travel Agency: A Critique of Anti-Trafficking Campaigns. *Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees*, 21(3), 53–65.
- Sharma, N. (2005). Anti-Trafficking Rhetoric and the Making of a Global Apartheid. *NWSA Journal*, 17(3), 88–111.
- Smiley, C. (2011, March 18). *AWAN address to the People's Tribunal on Commercial Sexual Exploitation, March 18-20, Mohawk Territories (Montreal QC)*. Presented at the People's Tribunal on Commercial Sexual Exploitation, Montréal, QC. Retrieved from <http://www.apneaap.org/policy-work/our-resources/awan-address-peoples-tribunal-commercial-sexual-exploitation-march-18-20-2>
- Smith, A. (2005). Spiritual Appropriation as Sexual Violence. In *Conquest: sexual violence and American Indian genocide* (pp. 119–135). Cambridge, MA: South End Press.
- Smith, A. (2008). *Native Americans and the Christian right: the gendered politics of unlikely alliances*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Spector, M., & Kitsuse, J. I. (1987). *Constructing social problems*. New York: Aldine de Gruyter.
- Stewart, D. E., & Gajic-Veljanoski, O. (2005). Trafficking in women: the Canadian perspective. *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 173(1), pp. 25-26.
- Stirk, F. (2009, July 31). Salvation Army to help Deter Olympics Sex Traffickers. *British Columbia Division*. Retrieved March 14, 2012, from <http://www.salvationarmy.ca/britishcolumbia/2009/07/31/salvation-army-to-help-deter-olympics-sex-traffickers/>
- Sutdhibhasilp, N. (2002). Migrant Sex-workers in Canada. In S. Thorbek & B. Pattanaik (Eds.), *Transnational prostitution: changing patterns in a global context* (pp. 173–192). New York: Zed Books.
- The Future Group. (2007). *Faster, Higher, Stronger: Preventing Human Trafficking at the 2010 Olympics*. Calgary, AB: The Future Group. Retrieved April 27, 2010 from: <http://www.law.ubc.ca/faculty/Perrin/web/pdf/2010-Faster-Olympics-TIP.pdf>

- The Local. (2012, June 22). Rip up prostitution law, says top Oslo politician. *The Local*. Retrieved June 22, 2012, from: <http://www.thelocal.no/20120622/rip-up-prostitution-law-says-top-oslo-politician>
- Tidd, S. (2010, January). Caught in Traffic. *Women's Perspectives*, (75), 3. Retrieved from www.presbyterian.ca/womensperspectives
- Todd, D. (2010, February 18). Canadian Pentecostal performs rare multi-faith role at Games. *The Vancouver Sun*. Retrieved from <http://www2.canada.com/vancouvercolumnists/story.html?id=18a2446a-0c3e-4c7f-bba7-d9f68d6105f1>
- Truong, T.-Đ. (1990). *Sex, money, and morality: prostitution and tourism in Southeast Asia*. London ; Atlantic Highlands, N.J: Zed Books.
- Tyldum, G., & Brunovskis, A. (2005). Describing the Unobserved: Methodological Challenges in Empirical Studies on Human Trafficking. *International Migration*, 43(1-2), 17–34.
- United Nations (2004). *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto*. New York: United Nations.
- United States of America Department of State (2012a). *Trafficking in Persons Report – June 2012*. Retrieved from: <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2012/>
- United States of America Department of State (2012b). *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Retrieved from: <http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/>
- Van der Meulen, E. (2009, February 28). Sex work and the state, An interview with Kara Gillies. Retrieved August 15, 2010, from <http://briarpatchmagazine.com/articles/view/sex-work-and-the-state-an-interview-with-kara-gillies>
- Vocks, J., & Nijboer, J. (2000). The Promised Land: A Study of Trafficking in Women from Central and Eastern Europe to the Netherlands. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 8(3), 379–388.
- Weber, C. (Producer). (2010, February 18). At The Vancouver Olympics - Buying Sex Is Not a Sport. 100 Huntley Street. Vancouver, BC. Retrieved from http://www.100huntley.com/video.php?id=Hn7wM_cCFSU
- Weedon, C. (1992). *Feminist practice and poststructuralist theory*. Oxford, UK ; New York, NY, USA: B. Blackwell. (Original work published 1987)
- Weinberg, D. (2009). On the Social Construction of Social Problems and Social Problems Theory: A Contribution to the Legacy of John Kitsuse. *The American Sociologist*, 40(1-2), 61–78.
- Weitzer, R. (2005). Flawed theory and method in studies of prostitution. *Violence Against Women*, 11(7), 934–949.

- Weitzer, R. (2007). The Social Construction of Sex Trafficking: Ideology and Institutionalization of a Moral Crusade. *Politics & Society*, 35(3), 447.
- Westender. (2011, March 9). Reforming prostitution laws. *WE Vancouver*. Retrieved from: <http://www.wevancouver.com/news/136341008.html>
- Wijers, M., & Lap-Chew, L. (1997). *Trafficking in Women, Forced Labour and Slavery-like Practices in Marriage, Domestic Labour and Prostitution*. Utrecht: Foundation Against Trafficking in Women (STV).
- Woolsey, B. J. (2009). *A Social Constructionist Analysis of Canadian Conservative Blogs on Islamic Terrorism* (M.A. thesis). Simon Fraser University, School of Criminology, Burnaby, B.C.
- Yee, J. (2009, February). Supporting Aboriginal Sex Workers' Struggles. *Canadian Dimension*, 43(1), 45–47,8.
- Zimmerman, Y. C. (2010). From Bush to Obama: Rethinking Sex and Religion in the United States' Initiative to Combat Human Trafficking. *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion*, 26(1), 79–99. doi:10.2979/FSR.2010.26.1.79
- Zimmerman, Y. C. (2011). Christianity and Human Trafficking. *Religion Compass*, 5(10), 567–578.

Appendices

Appendix A.

Key Terms

Sex Trafficking

In this thesis I understand 'sex trafficking' as a discourse. Taking this perspective problematizes from the start the notion that 'sex trafficking' is a monolithic concept. There are a number of commonly found elements in the narrative that tends to be used to raise concerns about sex trafficking, such as in stories told through mass media and in film. These accounts consist of assumptions about 'typical' victims and perpetrators, they tend to rely on emotionally charged personal stories of trafficking experiences, and they emphasize that 'something needs to be done' about the issue. Commonly available reports show 'sex trafficking' to mean "young women and girls being transported and forced into prostitution" (Doezema, 2010, p. 1). At the centre of the sex trafficking discourse are concerns about women from Asia, Africa, eastern Europe and former Soviet countries, and Latin America as being at risk of being trafficked. Discussions often include warnings about traffickers coming from women's own communities and cultures (see for example Monzini, 2005).

Presenting sex trafficking as an unambiguous issue obscures the fact that there are ongoing disagreements over the definition and the magnitude of the problem (Doezema, 2010). While Canadian and international definitions seek to establish a single meaning for the concept, there are challenges to applying these definitions to 'real life' situations. Ambiguity in the definitions of trafficking, such as lack of international agreement over what is meant by 'exploitation' or how abuses are understood (O'Connell Davidson, 2006), leaves room for uncertainty over what is being discussed. 'Sex trafficking' is a contentious issue in part because of the various interests that are involved in discussions about this topic. In these conversations, "different agencies and groups identify trafficking as a problem for very different reasons and have very different political agendas" (O'Connell Davidson, 2006, p. 7). Disagreements over how sex trafficking is understood are said to be closely connected to the ideological perspectives taken on prostitution. Battles over the meaning of sex trafficking can also then be seen as closely connected to understandings of prostitution.

In this thesis I use 'sex trafficking' with recognition that some find the term problematic, preferring to instead reconceptualise related situations – including those that involve exploitation, abuse, deceit, use of force or threat of force in cases where sex is being sold – as processes of 'migration'. Scholars have pointed out that in many cases migrants engage in sex work as a means of supporting their travel, which they undertake either out of necessity or to seek opportunities (Kempadoo, 1998; Agustín, 2007b). This research is organized around the term 'sex trafficking' in order to better understand how this issue comes to be constructed as a social problem within a particular context. It is the concept of 'sex trafficking' – and the very specific ways of understanding what it is and how it should be addressed – that has over the years gained it international attention as a global issue.

Prostitution, Sex Trade and Sex Work

This thesis distinguishes between 'sex trafficking' and 'prostitution', 'sex trade' or 'sex work'. 'Prostitution', as used in this research, refers to the exchange of direct-contact sexual services for money (Harcourt & Donovan, 2005) or other forms of payment. This includes both street-based and indoor prostitution such as escorting (Van der Meulen, 2009). The term 'sex trade' can be used to refer to other forms of exchange of money for sexual services, in addition to prostitution, such as exotic dancing, phone sex, erotic massage, and professional dominance and submission (Van der Meulen, 2009). Not all aspects of the sex trade necessarily involve direct contact between the sex seller and the buyer. For the purposes of the discussion in this thesis, 'prostitution' and 'sex trade' are used interchangeably to mean exchange of sexual services for money or other forms of payment. I use 'sex work' to refer to the specific position which acknowledges 'prostitution' as a form of work.

Individuals may describe their experiences of selling sex in a variety of ways – including different working conditions, employment relations, and understandings of 'choice' as applied to their involvement in the sex trade. This includes individuals who would not necessarily think of themselves as sex 'workers', but they would describe their experiences differently still from the processes associated with the concept of 'trafficking' (Agustín, 2005).

Appendix B.

Research Log

Date	Time	Duration	Activity	Location	Subject
Jun 16, 2009	7-9pm	2hr	Participant Observation	Vancouver Public Library, Central Branch, Alma Van Dusen & Peter Kay rooms	Trafficking Facts and Fictions: A FIRST Public Forum
Nov 4, 2009	12:30-2:30pm	2hr	Participant Observation	Simon Fraser University, MBC Atrium Cafeteria, Burnaby	Buying Sex is Not a Sport
Nov 23, 2009	6:30-9:00pm	2.5hr	Participant Observation	Vancouver Public Library, Central Branch Alma Van Dusen & Peter Kay rooms	Sex Workers, Clients and the Law: A FIRST Public Forum
Nov 27, 2009	7-9pm	2hr	Participant Observation	Grandview Cavalry Baptist Church, Vancouver	Buying Sex is Not a Sport
Dec 5, 2009	10am-5pm (event from 10am-6pm)	7hr	Participant Observation	Vancouver Public Library, Central Branch	Remember, Resist. 20 th Anniversary memorial for the Montreal Massacre. A Day of Action on Violence Against Women
Jan 13, 2010	12-1pm	1hr	Participant Observation	St. Paul's Hospital, Hurlburt Auditorium – Vancouver	Understanding Human Trafficking in BC and Globally
Jan 22, 2010	7:30-9pm (event from 7-9pm)	1.5hr	Participant Observation	First Baptist Church, 969 Burrard Street, Vancouver	Buying Sex is Not a Sport
Feb. 22, 2011	11-11:40am	40min	Interview	Office	N/A
Mar. 2, 2011	7pm-9pm	2hr	Participant Observation	SFU, 9660 Blusson Hall - Burnaby	Film

Date	Time	Duration	Activity	Location	Subject
Mar. 10, 2011	10-10:30am	30min	Interview	Office	N/A
Mar. 10, 2011	7pm-9pm	2hr	Participant observation	Vancouver Public Library, Central Branch Vancouver	Prostitution and Women's Equality: Imagining More for Women; Presentation with Gunilla Ekberg
Mar. 24, 2011	6:30-8:30	2hr	Participant observation	Westpointe Church, 2715 W. 12th Avenue, Vancouver	Screening of "Hope for the Sold"
Mar. 28, 2011	7-8:30pm	1.5hr	Participant observation	UBC, Vancouver	Panel Discussion on Prostitution and Human Trafficking
Apr. 5, 2011	2-2:55pm	55min	Interview	By phone	N/A
Apr. 7, 2011	2-2:38pm	38min	Interview	By phone	N/A
Apr. 25, 2011	5-7:15pm	2hr 15min	Interview	Home	N/A
Apr. 29, 2011	3:30-4:09pm	39min	Interview	By phone	N/A
May 11, 2011	3:30-6:30pm	3 hr	Interview	Office	N/A
June 28, 2011	01:30-2:40pm	1hr 10min	Interview	Office	N/A
July 26, 2011	6:00-7:15pm	1hr 15min	Interview	Pub	N/A
Aug. 15, 2011	7:00-9:00pm	2hr	Participant Observation	Coastal Church, 1160 W. Georgia Street, Vancouver	Miss Canada 2011 Tara Teng's Ignite the Road to Justice kickoff event
Aug. 17, 2011	10am-1pm (interview 2hr26min)	3hr	Interview	Private Residence	N/A
Nov. 27, 2011	7-9:30pm	2.5hr	Participant Observation	Vancouver Public Library, Central Branch - Alma Van Dusen & Peter Kay Rooms	Presentation by Laura Agustin
Jan. 26, 2012	1-2pm	1hr	Participant Observation	SFU –Maggie Benston Building, Atrium	Sex Trade, Social Justice & You – presentation by Jessica Yee

Appendix C.

Interview Guide

1) Could you tell me about your work/organization/office?

2) Can you tell me about the people/clients that you/your organization/office work(s) with?

Do you/Does your office/organization work with persons involved in the sex trade? If you/your organization do(es) work directly with individuals involved in the sex trade, can you tell me about the nature of this work? If not, do you work with other organizations that do so?

3) How do you/does your organization/office define sex trafficking? What would you say is the biggest challenge when it comes to sex trafficking as an issue?

How did you/your organization/office become concerned about issues related to sex trafficking?

4) Do you work with other governmental or non-governmental organizations/offices or individuals on these issues? Can you tell me more about this?

Can you tell me about any outreach activities you/your organization/office may do? If yes, what kind of a response have you had about such activities?

5) Do you/Does your organization/office work with individuals who are trafficked? If yes, can you tell me more about this work? What is the process of identifying individuals as trafficked? How do you find out about trafficking cases? How do you respond to trafficking cases?

6) In the time leading up to the Vancouver 2010 Olympic Winter Games, do you recall if you/your organization/office had any specific concerns relating to sex trafficking?

7) In the time leading up to the 2010 Winter Olympics, do you recall if you/your office/organization undertook any special activities to address concerns you had in general or relating to sex trafficking in particular?

8) Do you recall if you/your organization/office undertook any special activities to address any concerns during the 2010 Winter Olympics, including any which may have been specifically related to sex trafficking?

9) Did you/your organization/office monitor the effects of the 2010 Winter Olympics during the Games in any way? Can you tell me more about this? What were your findings?

Did you/your organization/office specifically monitor sex trafficking during the 2010 Winter Olympics? If yes, how was this done? What were your findings? If not, why not?

10) How would you summarize the overall impact of Vancouver's hosting of the 2010 Winter Olympics on issues and discussions related to sex trafficking? Did this have any impact on your work/the work of your organization/office, whether prior to, during or after the Games, as specifically related to sex trafficking or otherwise? Can you tell me more about this?

Looking back, would you have changed anything about your/your organization's/office's work in anticipation of or during the 2010 Winter Olympics, with respect to sex trafficking or related issues?

11) How have you/has your organization continued to work around issues related to sex trafficking since the Olympics?