CONSTRUCTING AND RECONSTRUCTING IMAGES OF CHINESE WOMEN IN LIN YUTANG'S TRANSLATIONS, ADAPTATIONS AND REWRITINGS

by

Fang Lu
B.A., Beijing Normal University, 1987
M.A., Beijing Normal University, 1990

THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Under Special Arrangement

Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences

© Fang Lu 2008

SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY

Spring 2008

All rights reserved. This work may not be reproduced in whole or in part, by photocopy or other means, without permission of the author.
APPROVAL

Name: Fang Lu
Degree: Doctor of Philosophy
Title of Thesis: Constructing and Reconstructing Images of Chinese Women in Lin Yutang's Translations, Adaptations and Rewritings

Examining Committee:

Chair: Jonathan C. Driver
Dean of Graduate Studies

Dr. Jan Walls, Senior Supervisor
Professor Emeritus, Humanities

Dr. Kathy Mezei, Supervisor
Professor, Humanities

Dr. Roy Miki, Supervisor
Professor, English

Dr. Anne-Marie Feenberg-Dibon, Examiner
Associate Professor, Humanities

Dr. Patrick Hanan, External Examiner
Victor S. Thomas Professor of Chinese Literature
East Asian Languages and Civilizations
Harvard University

Date Defended/Approved: [Signature]
Declaration of  
Partial Copyright Licence

The author, whose copyright is declared on the title page of this work, has granted to Simon Fraser University the right to lend this thesis, project or extended essay to users of the Simon Fraser University Library, and to make partial or single copies only for such users or in response to a request from the library of any other university, or other educational institution, on its own behalf or for one of its users.

The author has further granted permission to Simon Fraser University to keep or make a digital copy for use in its circulating collection (currently available to the public at the "Institutional Repository" link of the SFU Library website <www.lib.sfu.ca> at: <http://ir.lib.sfu.ca/handle/1892/112>) and, without changing the content, to translate the thesis/project or extended essays, if technically possible, to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation of the digital work.

The author has further agreed that permission for multiple copying of this work for scholarly purposes may be granted by either the author or the Dean of Graduate Studies.

It is understood that copying or publication of this work for financial gain shall not be allowed without the author's written permission.

Permission for public performance, or limited permission for private scholarly use, of any multimedia materials forming part of this work, may have been granted by the author. This information may be found on the separately catalogued multimedia material and in the signed Partial Copyright Licence.

While licensing SFU to permit the above uses, the author retains copyright in the thesis, project or extended essays, including the right to change the work for subsequent purposes, including editing and publishing the work in whole or in part, and licensing other parties, as the author may desire.

The original Partial Copyright Licence attesting to these terms, and signed by this author, may be found in the original bound copy of this work, retained in the Simon Fraser University Archive.

Simon Fraser University Library
Burnaby, BC, Canada

Revised: Fall 2007
ABSTRACT

As an important modern Chinese writer and a cross-cultural personality, Lin Yutang (1895-1976) and his works have attracted considerable attention among literary critics both in China and in the West. However, the images of Chinese women that Lin constructed and reconstructed in his English translations, adaptations, and rewritings have not yet been systematically studied.

This dissertation examines Lin’s ideological intentions, as well as his cultural and translational strategies in changing negative stereotypes of Chinese women. The representation of Chinese women to Western readers before Lin is presented through three cases: the missionary A.C. Safford, the bilingual Chinese intellectual Gu Hongming, and the American novelist Pearl Buck. Lin’s rise and the formation of his feminist thought are addressed by investigating his familial, educational, cultural and political background. His article “Ancient Feminist Thought in China,” the chapter “Women’s Life” in his My Country and My People, and his only drama, Confucius Met Nanzi establish a context for the female images he reconstructed. Four of these images are selected for detailed examination: Yun in Six Chapters of a Floating Life, and three marginalized women in Widow, Nun and Courtesan. In addition, Lin’s translation craft is examined by comparing his translation Six Chapters of a Floating Life to two other translations. His use of La Dame Aux Camelias as a cross-cultural analogue is highlighted in his rewriting of the courtesan Miss Du.

This dissertation demonstrates that Lin was a pioneer in allowing stronger voices of Chinese women to be heard in the West. His success derived fundamentally from his selection of source materials and his strategies in presenting these materials. Lin’s contribution in this area is much greater than generally believed in academia and remains invaluable today.

This study further reveals that Lin’s long-ignored translated, adapted and rewritten works function as a strong basis for his later more influential works. The
distinctive voice on women that Lin used in his English essays and novels developed and matured in the process of translating and adapting these works. Therefore, my investigation contributes to a more comprehensive genealogy of images of women in Lin’s translingual literary practice.

**Keywords:** Lin Yutang; cross-cultural; literary translation; literary adaptation; literary rewriting; Chinese women; missionary; post-colonial; feminism; modern Chinese literature

**Subject Terms:** Lin Yutang; cross-cultural literary studies; translation, adaptation and rewriting; missionary translation; Chinese women; feminism; modern Chinese literature; comparative literature
DEDICATION

I dedicate this to my parents, whose love and support have given me the confidence to undertake this work.

I dedicate this to my homeland, which is forever the source of my inspiration.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My deep appreciation first and foremost goes to my senior supervisor, Professor Jan Walls. Without his intellectual guidance and unfailing support, this dissertation would not have been possible. He recognized the seed of this project, encouraged me to find my own voice, and painstakingly went through several drafts of this manuscript. His erudition and insights, his enduring patience, and his wit and humor, made my dissertation journey pleasurable and fruitful.

I am deeply indebted to my supervisor Professor Kathy Mezei. Her profound knowledge of post-colonial translation theories, her constructive criticism on my drafts, her suggestions on the structure of the dissertation and her editorial advice, were truly inspirational and helpful. My sincere gratitude also goes to my supervisor Professor Roy Miki, who offered me thoughtful advice and has always been supportive and patient. I would like to thank my internal examiner, Professor Anne-Marie Feenberg Dibon, for her critical reading and insightful suggestions.

My special thanks go to my external examiner, Professor Patrick Hanan, whose books and articles have often been inspirations for my research. His incisive comments and thought-provoking questions pointed me in directions I had not been able to see, and opened up a grand view for my future research.

My sincere appreciation goes to Dr. Jonathan Driver, Dean of Graduate Studies, whose special arrangement made this cross-cultural and interdisciplinary project happen, and who chaired my examining committee. I am also grateful to Ms. Vivian Blacker for her effective assistance and patience at various stages of my PhD studies.

I wish to thank my previous teachers on the other side of Pacific for their encouragement and support, especially, Professor Zhaoming Lou for his intellectual advice. My warm thanks also go to my friend Virginia Lyster, who carefully read my drafts, corrected my grammar, and encouraged me constantly. Heartfelt thanks are due
also to my friend Laura Lechner for her attentive reading, keen editorial skills and valuable suggestions.

Last but not least, my deep appreciation goes to my dear son Luke, my husband Xiaojiang Xu, and my family in China. Ten-year-old Luke has spent much of the past year listening to my stories of Lin Yutang, and he is now able to engage in lively discussions with me. His spontaneous and brilliant feedback has been most encouraging. I appreciate Xiaojiang for his love and support. During the years of my PhD study, he and Luke spent many happy times by themselves, allowing me to sit quietly and write this dissertation with a peaceful mind. My greatest debt of gratitude is to my parents, who patiently and confidently waited for me, so I could pursue my dream.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Approval ........................................................................................................ ii
Abstract ......................................................................................................... iii
Dedication ..................................................................................................... v
Acknowledgements ....................................................................................... vi
Table of Contents ........................................................................................ viii

## Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
   I. Lin's Influence in Changing the Stereotypical Images of Chinese Women ........ 1
   II. Previous Academic Studies on Lin Yutang and my Research Plan ............... 3
   III. Perspectives on Gender in Post-colonial Cross-cultural Translation .......... 7
   IV. The Structure of the Dissertation and Outline of Chapters ...................... 8

## Chapter One: Re-presentation of Chinese Women for Western Readers
before Lin Yutang ....................................................................................... 10
   Introduction .............................................................................................. 10
   I. Missionary Images of Chinese Women as Reflected in Safford's Translation .... 12
      The Historical and Cultural Context of Safford's Translation .................... 13
      The Relationship between the Translation and the Originals .................... 16
      Safford's Strategies in Shaping Images of Chinese Women ..................... 21
      Influence and Aftermath of Safford's Translation .................................. 34
   II. Challenges in Rewriting the Missionary Discourse on Chinese Women ........ 37

## Chapter Two: The Rise of Lin Yutang and the Formation of his Distinctive
Voice on the Subject of Chinese Women .................................................. 47
   I. The Rise of Lin Yutang ........................................................................... 48
      Lin's Early Education and the Growth of his Post-colonial Consciousness .... 48
to the West ............................................................................................. 51
   II. The Formation of Lin's Feminist Spirit and Thought ............................... 64
      The Impact of Lin's Family Tragedy ..................................................... 64
      A Male Feminist in the May Fourth Era .............................................. 66
      Lin's Interpretation of Feminist Thought in Ancient China .................... 70
      Introducing Women's Life in My Country and My People .................... 74
   III. The Importance of Female Images in Lin's Work, and Nancy--the Precursor
      Image Lin Constructed and Reconstructed ......................................... 84
      A Gallery of Images of Chinese Women .............................................. 84
      Nancy--the Earliest Spokeswoman for Chinese Feminism .................... 88
      The Selected Images for my Case Studies .......................................... 100
Chapter Three: Yun, One of the Loveliest Women in Chinese Literature--
Why and How Lin Yutang Translated Six Chapters of a Floating Life...........101

Introduction .........................................................................................................................101
I. Cultural and Cross-cultural Motives behind Lin Yutang’s Translation of Shen Fu’s Memoir ..............................................................102
   A Text for Studying and Introducing Chinese Cultural Essence .......................105
   A New Model of the Chinese Female Ideal ...............................................................106
   Speaking to Lin’s own Aesthetic Ideals “Xing ling” and “Xianshi”; Promoting the Art of Living in the West ........................................111
   A Choice Reflecting Lin’s Romanticism .....................................................................116

II. How Lin Yutang Translated Fu sheng liu ji with Reference to Shirley Black’s and Pratt and Chiang’s Translated Versions .........................117
   Perspectives on Translation Reflected in the Prefaces or Introductions ...............118
   A Brief Analysis of Characteristics of Fu sheng liu ji ............................................124
   A Judgment on the Translators’ Critiques and their Decisions .............................128
   A Comparative Analysis of the Craft and Strategies of the Three Translators ....135
   Conclusion: the Influence of Fu sheng liu ji on Lin’s Work and Career .............152

Chapter Four: A Widow, A Nun, and A Courtesan--How the Images of Three Marginalized Chinese Women are Represented and Reconstructed in
Lin Yutang’s Adaptation, Translation and Rewriting .......................................................154

I. Widow Quan--“Queen Bee” of a Chinese Village ......................................................155
   Cultural Background for Lin Yutang's Selection of “Widow Chuan” .....................155
   Widow Quan’s Personality and her Survival Strategies ...........................................158
   Lin Yutang’s High Opinion of Quan Clan Village and his Purpose in
   Adaptation ...................................................................................................................163
   Lin Yutang’s Adaptation of Quan Clan Village with the Purpose of
   Sharpening the Image of the Widow .........................................................................164

II. Nun Yiyun--A Wild Orchid in a Secluded Valley .......................................................167
   What Kind of Nun was Yiyun? ....................................................................................169
   How did Yiyun Achieve Enlightenment and Liberation? ......................................171
   Yiyun as the Embodiment of Lin’s Religious and Female Ideals ............................176
   The Adaptations Lin Made in his English Translation .............................................178
   The Impact of “A Nun of Taishan” on Lin’s Creative Rewriting and Writing .......179

III. Chinese ‘Camellia’ Blossoms in America .................................................................180
   Background for Lin’s Selection and Rewriting the Story of Du Shiniang .............180
   Narrative Changes and their Positive Impact on the Image of Miss Du ................186
   Recreating Courtesan Culture in Ming China and Enhancing its Accessibility .....189
   Strategies in Idealizing and Romanticizing the Image of Miss Du .......................191
   Problems Created by Lin’s Reconstruction and the Impact on the Image of
   Miss Du .........................................................................................................................200
   Contribution to Cross-cultural Literary Rewriting ..................................................207

IV. Conclusion ..................................................................................................................208
   The Commonalities among these Three Images of Chinese Women ..................208
   Lin Yutang’s Feminist Spirit in Connection with that of other Male Writers ..........209
   Adaptation and Rewriting for the Purpose of Sharpening the Images of
   Women ..........................................................................................................................209
Impact of this Book on Lin’s Future Projects on Chinese Women .................................210

**Conclusion**  ..................................................................................................................211

I. Re-evaluation of the Historical and Bicultural Context and of the Genealogy of Lin’s Female Images .................................................................211

   The Relationship of Lin’s Work to the Historical and Bicultural Context ..........211

   A More Comprehensive Genealogy of Lin’s Female Characters ..........................212

II. Critical Strategies Lin Developed and his Limitation ............................................214

   Principles in Selecting Source Materials .................................................................214

   Strategies in Reconstructing Images of Chinese Women and Influence of Readership on his Strategies .................................................................215

   Art and Craft in Literary Translation ........................................................................218

   Lin Yutang’s Limitations and Problems .................................................................218

III. Significance of Lin Yutang’s Bicultural and Translingual Practice .........................220

   The Voice of a Male Chinese Feminist and its Correspondence to Contemporary Historical Studies of Gender ...............................................................220

   Lin Yutang and the Increasingly Globalized World .................................................221

**Bibliography** ....................................................................................................................222
INTRODUCTION

My dissertation focuses on the role and power of Lin Yutang’s translingual literary practice in constructing and reconstructing the images of Chinese women from traditional to early modern time for English readers. The goal of my dissertation is to explore the formation of this influence by studying Lin Yutang’s ideological intention, his cultural and translational strategies in changing negative stereotypes, and in presenting more positive images of Chinese women in his literary translations, adaptations and rewritings.

I. Lin’s Influence in Changing the Stereotypical Images of Chinese Women

Before the 1920s, images of Chinese women in the Western mind were largely dependent on interpretations made by the Westerners themselves, especially those of missionaries to China. Chinese women presented to the West were deeply filtered through an Orientalist view:¹ they remained mysterious and submissive in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, and became more accurate when China was forced to open its doors to the West in the late nineteenth century. However, even then, the image of Chinese women turned out to be extremely negative in Protestant missionary writings and translations. Chinese women appear to be weak and passive victims in a patriarchal culture: “downtrodden yet stoic, lacking in legal rights, hobbled by the binding of her feet, and at the service, body and soul, of her husband and his family” (Guisso and Johannesen 36).

These stereotypical images were pervasive and powerful in the West. They were challenged in the early twentieth century by the bilingual Chinese intellectual Gu

¹ The Westerner’s view of the Orient as explained in Edward Said’s Orientalism.
Hongming (1857-1928). Through his writings in English, he attempted to promote the ideal of Chinese woman with Confucian virtues. However, his work was insufficient to create substantial change in the Western view. The bilingual American writer Pearl Buck (1893-1973) also challenged these stereotypical images in her popular book *The Good Earth* (1931), with its humanistic appeal and sympathy. Yet, in effect, she created new stereotypes of Chinese women as primitive and self-sacrificing earth mothers. Buck’s images became quite influential in the American mind.

The most effective response in contravening this Orientalist and Confucianist perception came in the 1930s from Lin Yutang (1895-1976), the bilingual Chinese writer, thinker, and translator. *My Country and My People*, his first influential English-language book published in America, brought a fresh and distinct understanding of Chinese women to Western readers. The Chinese women in his English translations, adaptations, rewritings, and novels, were talented, independent, and intelligent. Many of Lin’s works were widely read in the West and thus they significantly improved the impression of Chinese women in the Western mind.

As Lin Yutang was not the first native Chinese intellectual who let his voice be heard in the West, then why was Lin so successful in influencing the prevailing view of Chinese women? “It makes us ponder, as Edward Said would put it, how knowledge that is non-dominative and non-coercive can be produced in a setting that is deeply inscribed with the politics, the considerations, the positions and the strategies of power” (Alvarez and Vidal 2).

With this dissertation, I endeavor to tell the story of Lin Yutang’s influence on Western perceptions of Chinese women. I explain how Lin’s post-colonial consciousness and his bilingual as well as bicultural competence became established and how his distinctive voice concerning Chinese women was formed and developed. I will investigate the strategies Lin used in representing Chinese women and in making their

---

2 Gu Hongming was a pioneer in Chinese-Western cross-cultural writing and translation. He was born in Malaysia, educated in Europe. In 1885, he began working for Qing government.

3 At the turn of the twentieth century, there were only a few Chinese intellectuals who were able to translate Chinese into foreign languages, such as Su Manshu (1894-1918), Chen Jitong (1851-1907), and Gu Hongming. Gu Hongming and Chen Jitong were the only two who produced works that influenced the West before the 1920s, and Gu was the more influential and widely read in Europe.
voice be heard in the West. Meanwhile, I will explore Lin’s limitations which affected the authenticity of his voice on Chinese women and his female images.

II. Previous Academic Studies on Lin Yutang and my Research Plan

Lin Yutang first became well-known in the late 1920s and early 1930s in China for his humorous essays, cultural critiques, the three literary journals he created, and for the only drama he wrote, Confucius Met Nanzi. He caused a sensation in the U.S when he published My Country and My People in 1935, introducing Chinese life and customs to Western readers. This book immediately became a best seller and was considered by Pearl Buck to be “the truest, the most profound, the most important book yet written about China” (Introduction to My Country xvi). His more than thirty books of fiction, non-fiction and translation in the following thirty years were widely read and well-received in America, creating a legacy of Chinese culture in the West. He is recognized as a prominent interpreter and critic of Chinese culture to this day. Lin and his works were silenced from 1949 to 1979 in Mainland China due to his stance against the Communist Party, but he became a cultural icon in Taiwan when he moved there in the mid-1960s. Interest in Lin Yutang was revived in Mainland China in the 1980s, and has grown stronger in the last ten years. Lin is now generally recognized as one of the most important writers of modern China. His enormous success in Chinese and English and the legacy he created have attracted attention among literary critics. Meanwhile, his bilingual and bicultural skills have challenged both Chinese and Western scholars, particularly those with monolingual or monocultural backgrounds.

Lin Yutang’s life and thoughts, especially his cross-cultural experiences, have been the main focus in the field of Lin studies. There are several well-written biographies on Lin Yutang, both in Chinese and English, such as the one in Chinese by Lin’s daughter, Lin Taiyi, Biography of Lin Yutang (Lin Yutang zhuang) (1989), and the English dissertation by Diran John Sohigian, “The Life and Times of Lin Yutang”

---

4 The three influential literary journals Lin Yutang and others created in the 1930s are Lunyu (《论语》 Analects), Renjianshi (《人间世》 This Human World), Yuzhou Feng (《宇宙风》 Cosmic Wind).
Systematic studies of Lin’s cross-cultural values and the formation of his cultural and personal identity, along with critical interpretations of his famous works, have appeared in recent years. In English, there have been Qian Jun’s “Lin Yutang: Negotiating Modernity Between East and West” (1996), and Shen Shuang’s “Self, Nation, and the Diaspora—Re-reading Lin Yutang, Bai Xianyong, and Frank Chin” (S. Shen) (1997). In Chinese, Wang Zhaosheng’s dissertation, “Lin Yutang’s Cultural Choices” appeared in 1998, and Shi Ping’s Lin Yutang: The Personification of Cultural Transformation was published in 2005. Lin’s famous non-fiction English works such as My Country and My People, The Importance of Living (1937), With Love and Irony (1940), and novels such as Moment in Peking (1939), Chinatown Family (1948), have been at the center of their studies.

Few of these scholars examine Lin’s feminist beliefs. Female images in Lin’s English novels, such as Mulan in Moment in Peking (1939), Danni in A Leaf in the Storm (1942), Rou’an in The Vermillion Gate (1953), and Mudan in The Red Peony (1961), and Juniper in Juniper Loa (1963), are analyzed separately in some of the above research works. However, the images of Chinese women that Lin constructs and reconstructs in his English translations, adaptations, and rewritings have so far not been systematically studied. The influence that Lin’s translations exerted on dispelling the

---

5 The first PhD thesis in English on Lin’s thoughts and life, it includes extremely rich materials on Lin Yutang’s cross-cultural experience and thoughts, as written in English and in Chinese.

6 Qian’s dissertation focuses on the particular ways in which Lin negotiates Chinese modernity by responding to a number of key issues such as politics, aesthetics, individuality, traditionality, nationalism, gender, and immigrant identity.

7 The first part of this thesis focuses on Lin Yutang’s cross-cultural identity formation in Shanghai in the 1930s. Shen argues that Lin’s perceptions of cultural and national identity were shaped by this specific context and carried to America.


9 This book focuses on the cross-cultural formation and transformation of Lin Yutang’s thoughts, aesthetics and cultural choices.

10 Wang Zhaosheng writes one chapter on Lin’s feminist thought and the female images in Lin’s English novels. Sohigian touches on Lin’s concern about Chinese women in his thesis. Qian Jun discusses briefly Lin’s feminist thought while analysing the female protagonist Mulan in Moment in Peking and Mother Fong in Chinatown Family in the last chapter of his thesis.

11 For instance, Wang Zhaosheng discusses several female images in Lin’s English novels. Both Qian Jun and Shen Shuang address the female images in Lin’s Moment in Peking, and Chinatown Family. Qian Jun also discusses the woman soldier Xie Bingying briefly. But none systematically address the female images in Lin’s translation, adaptation and rewriting.
stereotypical images of Chinese women has not yet been seriously addressed. In my view, Lin’s translated, adapted and rewritten literary works have played an equally significant roles as have his English novels in changing the Western view of Chinese women. They support and illustrate the views which he expresses in his non-fiction works, such as My Country and My People. The Chinese women Lin creates in his English novels are similar to those in stories which he translated and rewrote. In addition, the female images Lin selected for translation or retelling illustrate various aspects of the Chinese cultural essence and embody his personal literary and aesthetic ideals. Studying these images thus will provide new perspectives on the roots of Lin Yutang’s cross-cultural influence.

Images of Chinese women in Lin’s English translations appear as early as 1930. The girl soldier, Xie Bingying, who appears in the ‘war diaries’ and ‘letters’ that Lin translates as Letters of a Chinese Amazon and War-Time Essays (1930), is a modern Mulan: brave, rebellious, patriotic, and literary. The ancient queen in Lin’s translation Confucius Saw Nancy (1931) is not only powerful, but also adept in conversation, and artistically talented. She possesses feminist spirit and Daoist wisdom. Yun, the housewife in Shen Fu’s memoir Six Chapters of a Floating Life, translated by Lin in 1935, is an intelligent and romantic artist. Yiyun, an independent and intelligent young nun, originally created by Liu E in The Travels of Lao Can, is presented in Lin’s translation A Nun of Taishan and Other Translations (1936). Yiyun transcends the suffering of love through her unique understanding of Daoism and Buddhism. Several images of Chinese women from Tang dynasty tales also appear in A Nun of Taishan and Other Translations.

12 Books examining Western conceptions of China such as Colin Mackerras, Western Images of China (London: Oxford University Press, 1999), and Harold R. Isaacs, Scratches on Our Minds: American Views of China and India (New York: John Day Co., 1958), have not paid serious attention to the images of China and its people in translated works.


15 This is a translation of his own drama Confucius Met Nanzi (《子见南子》, 1928).

16 The memoir by Shen Fu was first published in 1877.

17 The original by Liu E was first published in 1907.
such as Qianniang in “Disembodied Soul of Qiannü,” who pursues her love and freedom by disembodifying her soul and human form. Yun, Qianniang, and a few more women from folktales and unofficial histories, such as Mengjiang Nü\(^{18}\) and Zhao Feiyan\(^{19}\) were selected by Lin in his edited book, *The Wisdom of China and India* (1942), to illustrate Chinese life.

In 1951, Lin’s translated and adapted work *Widow, Nun, Courtesan* was published. In addition to the nun Yiyun who appears in *A Nun of Taishan and Other Translations*, two more images of marginalized Chinese women are presented to Western readers. “Widow Chuan [Quan],”\(^{20}\) which Lin translates and adapts from his contemporary Lao Xiang’s *Quan Clan Village*, illustrates a rebellious and capable village widow who turns all the assumptions about Chinese widowhood upside down. “Miss Du” is a completely rewritten novella by Lin, based on the Ming dynasty writer Feng Menglong’s “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger.” Lin reconstructs this tragic tale, presenting an unusually talented and romantic courtesan, Miss Du, who chooses to die when her love is shattered, defying Confucian society. In 1952, Lin published in New York a translated and retold book, *Famous Chinese Short Stories*, which includes a series of tales from the Tang, Song, Ming and Qing dynasties. In addition to Qianniang, a few more finely-tuned images of Chinese women appear in these stories, such as the lovesick girl Cui Yingying from “The Story of Yingying,” the determined and intelligent duster girl Zhang in “Curly-Beard,” the devoted and unyielding lover Meilan from “The Jade Goddess,” and the romantic and liberated wife Madame D in “The Wife from Di Clan.”

These images, together with the images Lin creates in his English novels, broaden Western readers’ horizons and direct them ideas which writers before Lin Yutang had not explored. They demonstrate the diversity, complexity, and richness in the lives of Chinese women, and the possible freedom and independence they could have in a Confucianist-controlled society. They are substantially different from those stereotypes found in Protestant missionary writings and translations, and are richer and more refined.

---

\(^{18}\) The tale is about Mengjiang Nü, a distraught widow in Qin dynasty whose tears melt down a portion of Great Wall upon finding her husband had died as a forced labourer building the Wall.

\(^{19}\) (c.32 BC-1BC), an empress of Han dynasty. She was famous in the unofficial history for her beauty and her licentious court life.

\(^{20}\) I use standard pinyin Romanization throughout this thesis, but retain the Wade-Giles or other Romanization schemes that appear in other people’s publications.
than the images promoted by Gu Hongming and Pearl Buck. Embodying various aspects of Chinese cultural spirit, these images also become vehicles for introducing Chinese culture to the West.

While it is equally important to study the female images in Lin’s English novels, my research, due to space limit of this dissertation and my primary interest in literary translation studies, mainly focuses on Lin’s motives and strategies in constructing and reconstructing images of Chinese women in his English translations, adaptations, and rewritings.

III. Perspectives on Gender in Post-colonial Cross-cultural Translation

Translations are “always embedded in cultural and political systems, and in history” (Bassnett and Trivedi 6), and always imply “an unstable balance between the power one culture can exert over another” (Alvarez and Vidal 4). Translators, as Andre Lefevere points out, “are at home in two cultures and two literatures, they have the power to construct the image of one literature for consumption by the readers of another. They share this power with literary historians, anthologizers, and critics […] They are image makers, exerting the power of subversion under the guise of objectivity” (Translation 6). In my view, Lin’s change of Protestant missionary impressions of Chinese women exemplifies this important theory in post-colonial cultural translation. His translingual practice gains broader significance and is better understood in a larger social, political, cultural context.

My study is thus contextualized within the history of Western images of Chinese women during the period from the late nineteenth century to just past the middle of the twentieth century. It is linked to the work of several other cross-cultural translators and writers who played significant roles in creating the images of Chinese women, such as the Protestant missionary translator A.C. Safford (1873-1890), the influential missionary writer Arthur Smith (1845-1932), the pioneering bilingual writer Gu Hongming, and the bilingual American writer Pearl Buck. Lin’s purpose in selecting the originals for translation, his cultural and translational strategies and the role his personal identity played in making these choices will be investigated in detailed case studies.
Lin's writing, rewriting and translation is "a political activity aimed at making language speak for women." In my opinion, Lin was a male feminist in China's early modern era. The Chinese women, both ancient and modern, who appeared in Lin's translations, adaptations, rewritings and creative writings, are psychologically and physically healthy and strong, exceptionally self-reliant and intelligent. They are not only different from the stereotypes in missionary literature, but also from the image of women created by other influential modern Chinese writers. Lin's work reveals his positive view of Chinese women, "associating them with qualities of nurturing, cooperation, ecological sensitivity as well as considerable psychological and physical strength" (Flotow 7). My study will demonstrate his pioneering effort in defending Chinese women, and in reconstructing positive images of these women for Western readers at a time when their own voices could not be heard. In addition, I will address the limitations and controversies inherent in a Chinese male intellectual speaking for Chinese women, and other factors (such as readership) which affect the authenticity of the female images Lin presents in English.

IV. The Structure of the Dissertation and Outline of Chapters

Chapter One focuses on the representation of Chinese women to Western readers before Lin Yutang. It establishes the historical context for the rise of Lin's voice. I take the previously ignored case of the missionary Anna Safford's translation Typical Women of China (1891) to illustrate that literature translated under colonization was used for political and religious purposes. I use the cases of Gu Hongming and Pearl Buck to show the difficulty of erasing stereotypes, and the serious task set for Lin Yutang in attempting to do so.

Chapter Two focuses on the rise of Lin Yutang in the modern Chinese and Western literary worlds, and the formation of his distinctive voice concerning Chinese women in a post-colonial, cross-cultural world. I investigate how Lin's values developed, and how his bilingual and bicultural competence formed. I examine Lin's positive views

21 These are Lotbiniere-Harwood's words, "My translation practice is a political activity aimed at making language speak for women. So my signature on a translation means: this translation has used every translation strategy to make the feminine visible in language." See Sherry Simon, Gender in Translation: Cultural Identity and the Politics of Transmission (London and New York: Routledge, 1996). 15.
on women in his English essays and the importance of his early work on Nanzi (Nancy), the story of an ancient queen.

Chapters Three and Four are detailed case studies. Chapter Three analyzes the personal and cultural reasons behind Lin Yutang’s choice of translating Shen Fu’s *Six Chapters of a Floating Life* and his strong admiration for Yun, Shen Fu’s wife. Then, I examine Lin Yutang’s translation strategies by comparing his work to two other translations. I demonstrate why Lin is the ideal translator for this unusual text.

Chapter Four investigates how images of three marginalized Chinese women, are represented and reconstructed by Lin Yutang. Part One examines why and how Lin translates and adapts the image of a capable and rebellious widow from Lao Xiang’s novella *Quan Clan Village*. Part Two evaluates the cultural and personal reasons behind Lin’s translation of Liu E’s story of a nun of Taishan. Part Three studies Lin’s cross-cultural rewriting of an intelligent, yet desolate, Chinese courtesan. In this part, I highlight how Lin uses Dumas’s *La Dame Aux Camélias* as an analogue in his rewriting, and point out problems this created. The principles and strategies Lin applied in translating, adapting and rewriting these three stories are valuable contributions to cross-cultural literary practice.
CHAPTER ONE: RE-PRESENTATION OF CHINESE WOMEN FOR WESTERN READERS BEFORE LIN YUTANG

Introduction

Before the middle of the nineteenth century, the images of Chinese women were surrounded by myth and mystery. Most Westerners were unable to observe the real lives of Chinese women nor were authentic materials available about their lives. The images which eventually emerged after China was forced to open its doors to the West were extremely negative. Bound feet were hidden under lavish robes. Female infants were abandoned on every street corner. Young girls were sent to their future husbands’ homes as sources of labor, or were sold to pleasure houses. Married women were enslaved to their husbands; and widows committed suicide to preserve their sexual purity. In addition, Chinese women and men were portrayed as soulless due to their worship of unfamiliar and un-Christian gods.

These initial images of Chinese women emerged in the letters and reports that American Protestant missionaries sent back to their homeland, and were later reinforced in several popular books written by missionary writers, such as Justus Doolittle’s Social Life of the Chinese (1868), Adele M. Fielde’s Pagoda Shadows (1885), Arthur Smith’s Village Life in China (1899) and Chinese Characteristics (1894), and R.L. McNabb’s Women of the Middle Kingdom (1907). Although some relatively positive portrayals of Chinese women did appear among the writings of missionary and non-missionary Westerners, such as Mrs. Archibald Little’s Intimate China (1899), and Sarah Pike Conger’s Letters from China with Particular Reference to the Empress Dowager and the Women of China (1909), they were few, and were overshadowed by the dominant
negative presentation. Missionary writings, therefore, are commonly considered to be a major force in constructing the passive and victimized image of Chinese women.

There was yet another force shaping this inaccurate and biased impression of Chinese women. That was missionary translation. Some scholars have already noted that missionary writers of the late nineteenth century were particularly fond of citing the same paragraphs from Chinese classics (which had been translated by their peers) to reinforce information and images they wished to convey (Weidner 2; Garrett 21). For instance, certain sections on the rigid rules for woman’s speech and activities in The Book of Rites (Liji) and a poem about the preference for a baby boy over a baby girl in The Book of Poetry (Shijing) were frequently quoted by missionary writers to buttress their arguments on the inferior position of Chinese women. However, few studies have seriously questioned the reliability of these missionary translations. In addition, no analysis has been made of the power the translations themselves exerted in constructing the stereotypical images of Chinese women in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

Recent theories on translation have questioned the traditional view that translation is a transparent representation of the original and that the translator is an unbiased, innocent medium. Translations are always deeply seated in the cultural, political and historical context of the work and the translators (Bassnett and Trivedi 6), and therefore imply an unstable balance of power between cultures (Alvarez and Vidal 4). Missionary translations during the colonial period could therefore be considered “an expression of the cultural power of the colonizer” (Simon "Introduction" 10). Missionary translators could manipulate the text for their own intention, and these manipulations could be “concealed by a promise of equitable textual relations” (Bassnett 21).

In this chapter, I first explore the powerful role missionary translation played in constructing and shaping the collective images of Chinese women in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century when China was semi-colonized. I take the case the

---


23 The book 《诗经》 was also translated by James Legge. See The She King or Ancient Poetry, trans. James Legge (London: Trubner, 1876).

24 For instance, these quotations both appeared in Arthur Smith’s Village Life in China, and R.L. McNabb’s Women of the Middle Kingdom.
missionary Anna Safford’s translation Typical Women of China to illustrate how images of women from the classics of Chinese literature were selected and manipulated for the translator’s own religious, cultural and political purposes. Safford’s work reinforced existing stereotypical images created by other missionary writers, thereby producing a lasting influence on the Western mind. Then I discuss pioneering attempts to change these stereotypical images by introducing Gu Hongming, a native Chinese bilingual intellectual, and Pearl Buck, an influential Western woman with strong sympathies towards China. Unfortunately, the work of Gu and Buck actually created new stereotypes. Therefore, by the 1930s, various stereotypes of Chinese women were waiting for Lin Yutang to change and reconstruct. Thus this chapter establishes the historical context for Lin’s influence on the subject of Chinese women.

I. Missionary Images of Chinese Women as Reflected in Safford’s Translation

Anna Safford’s Typical Women of China was published in Shanghai in 1891. The book claimed to be a translation and abridgement of the famous Chinese book Records of Virtuous Women of Ancient and Modern Times, which includes biographies of famous Chinese women of all rank, both ancient and modern, representing the typical Chinese woman’s life. In the translator’s introduction, Safford states:

The origin of the Chinese work dates back to nearly two thousand years, to Liu Xiang, a distinguished author of the Han dynasty. As written by him, it contained only a few chapters, but it was a ‘recognized model of style.’ It was enlarged by an author of the Ming dynasty, and now contains three hundred and thirteen chapters, in four volumes, treating respectively Woman’s Virtues, Words, Deportment, and Employments. (Typical iii)

Safford’s translation appears to be the first work to be rich in material about the lives of authentic Chinese women. In the preface the editor claims that Safford “hoped the book might serve to interest the women of Christian lands in the condition of their

25 Anna Cunningham Safford was born in 1836 in Oglethorpe County, Georgia, USA. She died in 1890 in Shanghai, China. She was one of the first Protestant missionary women to arrive in China. She lived in Suzhou, China during 1873-1890.

26 The editor’s name is not in the book. It turned out to be Dr. John Fryer (1839-1928), an influential British writer and translator in Shanghai. see K. James Hazen, In Memoriam Miss Anna C. Safford (Richmond, VA: Presbyterian Committee of Publication, 1892). 25.
sisters in China, by drawing aside the veil which during the ages has hidden so many millions of lives from the rest of the world, and revealing what are the motives by which Chinese women are still actuated as well as the models which they profess and attempt to follow” (Typical i). The book was reprinted one year after its initial publication, indicating its warm reception in English world.

A comparison between Safford’s version and the original sources shows how brutally the original was abridged and altered, as well as the many sophisticated and manipulative strategies the translator developed at nearly every stage of its production. As Bassnett and Trivedi point out, “the strategies employed by translators reflect the context in which texts are produced” (6). Safford’s text was published in the 1890s when Protestant missionaries were very active in China. Armed with strong beliefs and protected by Western gunboats, they were anxious to convert Chinese men and women to Christianity. The purpose of Safford’s translation, as stated by the editor, was “that the mothers and daughters of China may soon be brought under the benign influences of that holy religion” (Typical ii). Such a premise would certainly have influenced Safford’s translation practice, from the selection of the source text, to the development of the strategies for presenting the images.

A. The Historical and Cultural Context of Safford’s Translation

In Women of the Middle Kingdom, missionary R.L. McNabb writes: “One of the serious questions that confronted the early Christian workers in the land of Confucius was how to reach the women of China” (94). Chinese customs and gender taboos did not encourage women to appear in public spaces, nor to meet men outside their family. In addition, bound feet made it difficult for Chinese women to go out (95, 96). However, missionaries were fully aware of the role and power that Chinese mothers had in their families, and realized that the conversion of these “heathen” mothers was an efficient means to Christianize foreign lands (Hill 5). “Without reaching the women, who were the wives and mothers of converts, the entire work was in jeopardy. Christianity stood little chance of taking root in Asia without the aid of the Christian home” (qtd. in Hunter
At the time, there were only a few women missionaries working among native women. It was thus an urgent task to encourage Christian women, especially educated young women, to go to China in support of Christianization. The missionary reports and other literature were used to encourage young Christian women for their work, and to help them understand the significance and urgency of their task. The more severe and miserable the Chinese woman’s situation was perceived to be, the more important and urgent it became to save “the soul of their perishing sisters of the Orient” (McNabb 96). This was an important motivation for Safford to translate and edit this book.

Anna Safford arrived in Suzhou, China, in September 1873. She was one of the earliest Presbyterian missionaries assigned to China. At the time there were only a few hundred Protestant missionaries from Britain and the United States in China. By 1890, that number climbed to 1,300 (Liu’s Introduction to Smith Characteristics ii). As Jane Hunter points out:

To missionaries arriving from turn-of-the-century America, China seemed mired in the timeless dirt, death, and degradation of the ages. [...] the respect paid to the dead, the public pathos of the dying, and the ritual wailing of the bereaved left witnesses from the American new world steeped in melancholy, confusion, and distress. [...] most missionaries found ‘the first impression of China a depression.’ (1)

The American women’s emancipation movement flourished in the middle of the nineteenth century. “The organization of the Women’s Missionary Societies is but one of a remarkable series of movements among women that had made the nineteenth century known as the Women’s Century” (Montgomery 3). Safford had been the principal of Cartersville Female Seminary in Medway, Georgia before she joined the foreign mission.

She arrived in China with revolutionized concepts about women’s roles and with the ambition to spread these new feminist ideas to China. For her, the contrast between the women’s situations in the East and West at that time must have been sharp and stark. As the historian Helen Montgomery said in her book Western Women in Eastern Lands, 27 This was a declaration of the missionary boards in the United States.

28 According to the missionary historian Helen Montgomery, the women’s Foreign Missionary Society of the Presbyterian Church “[...] had been the training school and inspiration of so many of the pioneers, and developed splendid powers of growth from the very first.” See Barrett Helen Montgomery, Western Women in Eastern Lands (New York: Macmillan Co., 1910). 32 Members of these organizations were likely to possess the pioneering feminist ideas of their time. This information provides important background knowledge for estimating Safford’s role in Suzhou China among missionaries.
"We live in a country where the discussion of 'women's right' is ever to the front. We are to study lands where they are just beginning to recognize women's wrongs--lands where the slogan 'Ladies First' is consistently and persistently 'Ladies Last' (49).

Safford's devotion to Christianity and her personal interest in women's education motivated her to learn conversational Chinese as well as classical Chinese; she developed a strong interest in Chinese literature, "especially all that she could find relating to women, their ideas, customs, position, etc." (Hazen 8). It was very popular at that time for missionaries to hire Chinese assistants to help them with their translation (Chinese Fiction 89). Although Safford does not mention using a translator, she writes that one room in her newly built "Sibley House" for single missionary women in Suzhou was prepared for her Chinese teacher ("Woman's Home"). Therefore, it is probable that she had a native speaker to assist her throughout the process of selecting and interpreting these classical sources.

At the time Safford was translating her work, missionary ethnographical writing on China and the Chinese was taking a new direction. Arthur Smith's Chinese Characteristics took a new, complex, and anthropological view (based on an implied cultural relativism) of native Chinese characteristics, and caused an immediate sensation among English readers (Hayford 165). By classifying Chinese women into "distinct" virtue types (styles of behavior and speech, and type of work and even working attitude), Safford mirrors this new trend of ethnographic writing. 29

Ethnographic interest in Chinese women was growing among missionaries in the late nineteenth century. Allen Young (1836-1907), 30 who worked for 30 years as chief editor of the influential missionary newspaper "The Chinese Globe Magazine" (1874-1907) 31 was particularly interested in investigating and comparing the customs and

---

29 In her introduction to the reprint version of Chinese Characteristics, Lydia Liu points out that the theory of "national character" was "extremely popular in the late eighteenth century through the nineteenth century and swept across popular sociology, psychology and philosophy with a long-term impact on the studies of cultures and races in Europe, North America, and elsewhere." See Liu's "Introduction" to Arthur Henderson Smith, Chinese Characteristics, ed. Lydia Liu (Norwalk: East Bridge, 2002). iii. Therefore, Arthur Smith and other missionary writers and translators were influenced by this trend.

30 A famous American missionary journalist in China at the turn of the twentieth century.

31 From 1868-1874 The Chinese Globe Magazine was called The Church News (Jiaohui xin pao 《教会新报》). It ceased publication for a year and then continued under the name "The Chinese Globe Magazine" (Wanguo Gongpao, 《万国公报》) until 1907 when Allen Young died.
characteristics of women from various nations. Articles discussing Chinese women’s status appeared as early as the 1870s in his newspaper. By the late 1890s, long essays analyzing the connection between women’s issues and China’s prosperity were printed (Chin 49). Young asserted that women’s status in society reflected the level of civilization of the culture: “Western nations are fully civilized, so they treat women equally. The Eastern countries are half-civilized, they treat women unequally” ("Woman's Status"). He also translated and wrote many articles on women’s status around the world. Allen Young’s newspaper and his writings on women were very influential at the turn of the twentieth century. From the themes of Young’s writings and Safford’s book, we can sense that their works were related to each other. Safford intends to make Typical Women of China an English encyclopedia on Chinese women. The “original evidences” she reveals are meant to provide historical evidence for the established missionary portrayal of the Chinese woman’s situation. This approach to translation can be considered a sophisticated type of ethnography.

B. The Relationship between the Translation and the Originals

Lawrence Venuti reminds us,

Foreign literatures tend to be dehistoricized by the selection of texts for translation, removed from the foreign literary traditions where they draw their significance. And foreign texts are often rewritten to conform to styles and themes that currently prevail in domestic literatures, much to the disadvantage of more historicizing translation discourses that recover styles and themes from earlier moments in domestic traditions. (67)

32 The magazine revealed an interest in women’s issues from the beginning. In 1878, it published “Female Education in China.” See Hue-Ping Chin, "Refiguring Women: Discourse on Gender in China, 1880-1919," The University of Iowa, 1995. 46-47.

33 In 1900, Allen Young translated a long article on women’s status in India. In 1904, he wrote an article entitled “Woman’s Status in Europe, Past and Present,” and translated another on women’s emancipation in the West. In 1906, the magazine printed two short articles reporting on women’s status in Sweden and New Zealand. See Chin, "Refiguring Women." 49.

34 I adopt the term “ethnography” from Edwin McAllister’s dissertation, referring to “ethnographic writing”—“writing that presents itself as non-fictional and purports to represent one race, society, culture, or ethnic group to another, and not to the specifically anthropological genre of ethnography. The broad category includes texts from almost every imaginable genre.” However, he does not list missionary translation in the category of ethnographical writing. See note 3 in Edwin John McAllister, "Inclusion Acts: The Ideological Work of Nineteenth-Century American Missionary Ethnography," University of Oregon, 1997. 37.
A clear understanding of the cultural and historical context of *Lienü Zhuan* will allow us to identify the motives and politics behind Safford’s work.

“Lienü Zhuan” (列女传) originally meant, “biographies of various women.” The first extant work was compiled by Liu Xiang (刘向, 77 - 6 BC), a noted Confucian scholar official and a prolific editor of the Western Han dynasty (206 BC-24 AD). Liu selected one hundred and twenty-five biographies of women from the Confucian Classics for the purpose of admonishing women and rectifying the morals of society. As the first collection of women’s biographies, Liu Xiang’s *Lienü Zhuan (Biographies of Women)* was influential. Official historians of later generations imitated it and made special sections in their historical records for the biographies of these women. Separate editions of *Lienü Zhuan* were produced by individual *literati* of later dynasties. In the *Notes on Books in the Imperial Library Catalogues*, we can find seven or more *Lienü Zhuan* compiled by official historians, and a few other expanded or rewritten versions compiled by individual writers, including those from the Ming dynasty (1369-1644) (O’Hara 4).

It is noticeable that the original Chinese author is omitted from the title page of *Typical Women of China*. Although Safford mentions Liu Xiang as the earliest author in her introduction, the Ming dynasty author is not named at all. When the book was reprinted a year later, the publisher ambiguously claims Liu Xiang as the original author. Hence, *Typical Women of China* has been regarded by scholars as the first translation of Liu Xiang’s *Biographies of Women (Lienü Zhuan)*, and is still recorded that way in library catalogues. This absence of the original author’s name brings home the problematic nature of Safford’s translation.

While Safford describes Liu Xiang as the “earliest original author,” only about half of his *Lienü Zhuan* appears in her version and his text is heavily abridged. According to Safford, her translation is primarily based on the “enlarged version” produced in the Ming dynasty. After researching versions of *Lienü Zhuan* from the Ming dynasty, I concluded that Safford adopted the vast majority of her content from Lü Kun’s *Within

---

35 Such as *The Classic of Poetry* and *The Classics of History*, two of the Five Confucian Classics.
Baton-Door Standards (Gui Fan), and a small amount from another expanded version of Lienü Zhuan compiled during the Ming dynasty. This text was edited by the famous Ming playwright, Wang Daokun (1525-1593), and titled Illustrated Biographies of Women. The subtitle of Safford’s translation, “Records of Virtuous Women of Ancient and Modern Times,” is identical to the title of Biographies of Women Ancient and Modern (Gu Jin Lienü Zhuan), the earliest expanded version of Lienü Zhuan in the Ming dynasty, which was compiled in 1403 by Xie Jin (1369-1415) and other scholars under orders from the first Ming emperor. The rest of the contents of Typical Women of China are selected from The Book of Rites (Li Ji), Han dynasty woman historian Ban Zhao’s Commandments for Women (Nü Jie), the Han dynasty Historian Sima Qian’s Records of the Grand Historian (Shi Ji), Song dynasty historian Sima Guang’s The

36 Lü Kun (呂坤 1536-1618), a native of Henan, China, famous Ming writer and editor, and Neo-Confucian scholar. He obtained Jinshi degree (Imperial Scholar who passes the examinations for the highest civil service degree) during the Ming emperor Wanli period (1572-1620). Within Baton-Door Standards (《閹範》 Gui Fan) was published in 1590. Albert Richard O’Hara, the first translator of Liu Xiang’s Lienü Zhuan, points out that Safford translated very freely from the Ming dynasty scholar Lü Kun’s Gui Fan. See Albert Richard O’Hara, The Position of Woman in Early China According to the Lieh Nü Chuan, "The Biographies of Chinese Women" (Taipei: Mei Ya Publications, 1978). 4. Marsha Wiedner also mentions the same source in the introduction to her book Flowering in the Shadows: Women in the History of Chinese and Japanese Painting. See Marsha Weidner, "Introduction: Images and Realities," Flowering in the Shadows: Women in the History of Chinese and Japanese Painting, ed. Marsha Weidner (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1990). 20. I could not identify all of the content in Safford’s translation from Lü Kun’s version, as Lü Kun’s Gui Fan does not have “three hundred and thirteen chapters” as Safford states in her introduction. In addition, the illustrations in Safford’s translation are different from those in Lü Kun’s version. Moreover, the illustrations are in the style of famous Ming painter Qiu Ying (1494-1552), one of the Four Great Masters of the Ming Dynasty.

37 Wang Daokun (汪道昆 1525-1593), famous Ming playwright. Wang’s Illustrated Biographies of Women (《绘图列女传》) was purportedly published during the Ming Emperor Wanli’s regime (1573-1620). This is the version referred to in Safford’s introduction. It has 313 chapters, and illustrations by the famous painter Qiu Ying. Since Qiu Ying passed away circa1552, I deduced that the book was published before 1550, about 40 years earlier than Lü Kun’s version.

38 Gu jin lienü zhuan (《古今列女传》), was completed in 1403 by Xie Jin (1369-1415) and several other scholars. It is the first expanded version of Lienü Zhuan in the Ming dynasty. Both Wang Dakun and Lü Kun use this text as a reference and adopted many of its stories. But apparently this is not the version Safford used. See Jin Xie and Others, eds., Gu Jin Lienü Zhuan [古今列女传] (Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshu guan, 1983).

39 Ban Zhao (班昭 ?-116), a notable female historiographer and educationalist in the Han Dynasty. Commandments for Women (《女诫》) works out a series of clear and practical rules based on Confucian Classics for training girls and women in personal behaviour and family relationships.

40 Sima Qian (司馬遷 c.a.145-90 BC), was a prefect of the Grand Scribes (太史令) of the Han dynasty. His Records of the Grand Historian (《史記》) covers the history of China over two thousand years, from the Yellow Emperor to Emperor Han Wudi (漢武帝). This book establishes the foundation for later Chinese historiography.
Comprehensive Mirror for Aid in Government (Zizhi Tongjian),\(^{41}\) and the two Tang female scholars Song Ruohua's Analects for Women (Nü Lunyu)\(^{42}\) and Ms. Zheng's Classic of Filial Piety for Women (Nü Xiaojing).\(^{43}\)

Safford's Typical Women of China is a selective combination of several different source texts and other interrelated materials. She categorizes her material into four chapters: women's virtues, women's words, women's deportments, and women's employments. These chapter titles are adopted from the "Four Virtues" used by Ban Zhao as the four headings in her Nü Jie. By selecting and reorganizing her original sources, she functions as an editor of Chinese women's biographies, not merely a translator.

In the "Introduction," Safford explains to her readers,

This book [Lienü Zhuan], we are told, is read by all cultured native women, and the highest aspiration of many of them is to obtain a fame like that of its heroines. Its influence has extended through centuries, an apt illustration of the tendency of the national mind to 'go on in its old ruts by sheer vis inertias.' (Typical vi)

Safford attempts to convince her readers that there is no significant difference between the ancient Lienü Zhuan compiled by Liu Xiang and the modern versions by Ming authors. She highlights the popularity and importance of this book, making it sound like a Bible for Chinese women. She concludes that this book reflects the Chinese national mind, implying that it is static and unchangeable.

However, Safford's editorial stance is hardly accurate. First, Lienü Zhuan had long been the expression of the Confucian, and therefore male, ruling class's ideological prescriptions for women and represented the ruling class's wish to control women's thoughts and behaviors. Lienü Zhuan can not be viewed as representing all Chinese women. There are many other rich sources in Chinese tradition, such as legends, folktales, drama, biographies and local gazetteers, which represent the multi-dimensional

---

\(^{41}\) Sima Guang (司马光 1019-1086) was a Chinese historian and statesman during the Northern Song dynasty. His The Comprehensive Mirror for Aid in Government (《资治通鉴》) covers the period from 403 BC to 959 AD.

\(^{42}\) Analects for Women (《女论语》) was written by the famous Tang female scholar Song Ruohua (宋若华). Instructions such as "When you are seated, do not spread out your knees like a fan." (Typical women of China, page 144) are obviously selected from this book.

\(^{43}\) Classic of Filial Piety for Women (《女孝经》), written by Mrs. Zheng 郑氏 in the Tang dynasty. Her husband was a high official in the Tang court. Several biographies of filial daughters in Safford's version are selected from this book.
faces of Chinese women. By choosing Lienü Zhuan and referring to it as the best source, Safford intentionally narrows a rich and broad literary tradition and thereby presents Chinese women from a one-dimensional perspective.

As a prominent Confucius scholar, Liu Xiang could not avoid the general belief of male superiority over women, but his attitude toward women, compared to those in later versions of Lienü Zhuan, was fairly positive. In many of his biographies “women are praised for their intelligence, independence of mind, and their achievements as well as their feminine virtue” (Lee 3). He presents both exemplary and evil women and “praised or criticized as was common in writing about men in Chinese histories” (Chin 13). However, Liu Xiang’s relatively broad definition of female virtues changed and became more restricted as Lienü Zhuan was added to over time. Ban Zhao’s Nü Jie, which was written during the Eastern Han dynasty (25-220), emphasizes female inferiority, humility, obedience and diligence. Later Neo-Confucian scholars of the Song dynasty (960-1279) single out chastity as the most important attribute of the virtuous woman. The situation became even more restricted during the early Ming dynasty (early fifteenth century), as the emperor Taizu made female chastity a matter of official policy (Sung 71), and organized a committee to compile Biographies of Women Ancient and Modern (Gu jin lienü zhuan). As a consequence, the size of Lienü Zhuan dramatically increased, and several new versions compiled by individual literati were published. Both Wang Daokun’s and Lü Kun’s texts were published in this dark “Middle Age” for Chinese women. Wang’s version includes biographies from various dynasties’ Lienü Zhuan, stories from local gazetteers as well as genealogies of his time and his own clan. It contains richest examples of the suffering women in the Lienü Zhuan tradition, such as

44 Although Ban Zhao was a highly educated woman, her views on women were very similar to those of the dominant male Confucian authorities. Ban Zhao was from a prominent Confucian scholar’s family. Her father, Ban Biao, and brother, Ban Chao, were both well-known scholars who had worked on The History of Han (Han Shu). Ban Zhao continued their work after they died and completed The History of Han. She was deeply immersed in the male-dominant Confucian thoughts and writings, therefore her teachings were welcomed by the Han ruling class. Nü Jie started a didactic tradition for women: a series of similar books written by women were produced in later generations, such as Analects for Women (Nü Lunyu), and Classic of Filial Piety for Women (Nü Xiaojing) in the Tang dynasty.

45 Neo-Confucianism was an ideological movement aimed at revitalizing the Confucian tradition and was popular during the Song dynasty. The central figure was Zhu Xi (1130-1200).

46 Namely zhen (贞, chastity) and lie (烈, describing women who were faithful to their husbands and women who chose death instead of the humiliation of impurity). See Chin, "Refiguring Women."14.

47 First Emperor of Ming dynasty (1368-1644).
stories of widows who commit suicide to prove their marital fidelity. This is the version cited in Safford’s introduction as her primary source, although it was in fact only a supplement for her translation. It provides Safford with rich examples to illustrate her ideas, but Safford complains that this book is voluminous and repetitive, providing her an excuse for her dramatic abridging and editing. Lü Kun’s Gui Fan includes selective biographies from Liu Xiang’s version (about half), and other Lienü Zhuan from various dynasties, especially the Ming dynasty. Safford’s version, in style and spirit, is based on Lü Kun’s version, a mixture of women’s biographies and didactics for women. However, Safford does not mention this version, and most of the personal comments and criticisms included in Lü Kun’s text do not appear in Safford’s version. This is a point I will discuss later.

By choosing among several versions of Lienü Zhuan and other sources, Safford darkens the images of Chinese women. By adopting several versions without mentioning the authors, she chose whatever she needed to build the images she wanted to present. She mixes and switches authors, texts, and the roles women play in different historical periods. By doing this, she de-historizes the originals from their Chinese context, and removes them from the tradition “where they draw their significance” (Venuti 67).

C. Safford’s Strategies in Shaping Images of Chinese Women

To further explore how Safford shapes the images of the “typical” Chinese women she presents to her readers, we need to investigate the cultural and narrative strategies she applies.

One of the notable features of Safford’s Typical Women of China is the translator’s notes concerning the omission of the original chapters. Safford uses numerous excuses for these omissions, such as they are either too wearisome or repetitive, or because they are not edifying. In her “Introduction,” Safford explains:

The original matter is interwoven with numerous extracts from Chinese Authors of more or less eminence, Confucius and Mencius heading the list. Many pages are but prolix, modifying repetition of the merest platitudes, so that the translator has found it necessary to leave out whole paragraphs, and even chapters, rather than conduct the reader through such tedious wastes of dullness. Yet, it is hoped that in this abridgment, nothing has been omitted essential to exhibit the Chinese ideas of what a woman’s character and training should be, or to furnish a true
picture of the typical Chinese Woman's life. [...] The translation doubtless has many defects. It makes no pretensions to being the work of a critical scholar. It is an honest effort to convey the real meaning of the original, 'translating rather in accordance with the sense than precisely in harmony with the letter,' and often paraphrasing the sentences and taking some license in expanding the sententious brevity of the Wen-li, in order to bring out the meaning more fully. (Typical vi)

This explanation appears reasonable; however, her last sentence alerts the reader to her manipulation strategies. A careful investigation led me to conclude that her complaints about the repetitiveness of the original are designed to excuse her manipulation, and suggest her view of the subordinate position of the text and of the Chinese culture which produced the text. 48 I will show how her additions and omissions follow her own standards and principles. In essence, Safford develops a radical, foreign version of Lienü Zhuan, which narrows and distorts the Chinese original. She herself could also be said to be the earliest editor and rewriter of Biographies of Chinese Women in English.

1. Blurring the Historical Sources on Time and Place; Confusing the Concepts of Ancient and Modern

The locations and time periods of the stories are muddled and confusing in Safford's translation. This could be an understandable mistake for a non-native writer and translator, however, this is not an excuse in Safford's case. According to biographical records, Safford completed the draft ten years after she arrived in China (Hazen 11, 25). Her capabilities in the Chinese language and her knowledge of Chinese history and culture, especially in the classical sources on Chinese women, were praised by her contemporary missionaries (Hazen 8). In addition, it is highly probable that she had hired Chinese assistants. Thus, most of Safford's ignorance of time and place, and the ambiguity of historical or geographical information must have been intentional. Through

48 In the introduction to their book Post-Colonial Translation: Theory and Practice, Susan Bassnett and Harish Trivedi address a significant translation phenomenon: "In the nineteenth century, an English translation tradition developed, in which texts from Arabic or Indian languages were cut, edited and published with extensive anthropological footnotes. In this way, the subordinate position of the individual text and the culture that had led to its production in the first place was established through specific textual practices." See Susan Bassnett and Harish Trivedi, "Introduction: Of Colonials, Cannibals and Vernaculars," Post-Colonial Translation: Theory and Practice, eds. Susan Bassnett and Harish Trivedi (New York: Routledge, 1999). 6. Safford's translation, produced in the same historical period, fits right into this larger tradition. Although she did not give extensive anthropological footnotes, the explanations and comments she makes on the selected stories disclose a similar attitude.
her radical re-categorization and deletion of individual tales, Safford herself must have found it difficult to identify when and where events take place, and to distinguish among characters. This becomes an opportunity for her to mix different dynasties and locations, and to blur the ancient and the modern. This allows her to give readers the impression that Chinese women are similar and unchanging, no matter which dynasty or province they come from and no matter which class they belong to. She implies that what has happened in the past will happen again in the future.

The prejudice of a changeless China was quite popular among missionary writers in the late nineteenth century. Arthur Smith talked about this in the last chapter of his book *Chinese Characteristics*:

(...) the face of every Western land is towards the dawning morning of the future, while the face of China is always and everywhere towards the darkness of the remote past. [...] We believe that they have long since done all that are capable of doing, and that from them there is no further fruit to be expected. [...] An intelligent British official, who knows “the terrible *vis inertiae* of Oriental apathy and fatalism—that dumb stupidity against which Schiller says even the gods are powerless.” *(Characteristics 320-23)*

This echoes Hegel’s prejudice toward East Asian history, that “China had no history”, or as Medhurst observed: “Her language and her customs remain unaltered,” “the genius and spirit of the people are the same as they were in the patriarchal age” (qtd. in Dawson 15).

2. Re-Categorizing the Biographies in “Four Virtues”; Rewriting the “Chinese Author’s Preface”

Safford’s *Typical Women of China* is divided into four chapters: virtues, words, deportments, and employments. These four qualities are interpreted by Ban Zhao in her *Nü Jie*: women’s virtue is to be chaste and yielding, yet calm and upright; women’s speech should not be talkative, yet agreeable; women’s carriage and appearance should be restrained and exquisite; women’s occupation is careful handiwork. 49 Stories or classical teachings from the original sources are deleted by Safford if they did not fit into these categories.

Safford rewrites the “Chinese Author’s Preface.” The rewritten preface starts with “Four Virtues,” “Three Obediences,” and “Seven Reasons for Divorce.”

Girls should learn about Woman’s Virtues, Woman’s Words, Woman’s Deportments, and Woman’s Employments.

Confucius said: “Woman is subject to man; she cannot herself direct any affairs, but must follow the Rule of the three Obediences. At home [before marriage] she must obey her father; when married, she must obey her husband; after her husband’s death she must obey her son. She may not presume to follow her own judgment.

There are seven causes for which a wife may be divorced, viz., undutifulness towards her husband’s parents; having no son; immorality; jealousy; having a leprous disease; talkativeness; stealing [...]. (Typical vii)

By presenting these strict rules at the beginning of the preface, the inferior and passive position of Chinese women is emphasized immediately.

Safford continues the preface by quoting more classical sayings, especially from Ban Zhao’s Nü Jie on women’s subservient position, her limited indoor space, heavy household duties, and her yielding relationships with husbands and family. This infamous paragraph from Nü Jie, is fully quoted:

In the early times a daughter, three days after birth, was laid under the bed, given a tile to play with, and sacrifices were offered to the ancestors. Laying her beneath the bed typified her future helplessness and subjection; the tile was the type of a laborious life, to be spent in serving her husband; and the sacrifices signified that it would be her duty to perpetuate that husband’s ancestral line. These things are the chief end of a wife’s existence. (Safford Typical viii)

Ban Zhao is Safford’s sage on Chinese women’s education; “Three Obediences” and “Four Virtues” are the key editorial principles for reconstructing Typical Women of China.

Shirley Garrett points out that when images of Chinese women “fit into the church’s accepted models of womanhood or remained visible as a sufferer, the church was comfortable” (Garrett 22). Safford’s “Chinese Author’s Preface” is echoed in what Helen Montgomery wrote in 1910, that the Chinese woman “is not desired at birth, is

\[50\] “Three Obediences” originated in The Book of Rites, and were later emphasized by Ban Zhao. In Chinese “三从”, “未嫁从父，即嫁从夫，夫死从子.” See 《仪礼》. 丧服. 自夏传.

\[51\] Also originated from The Book of Rites. See 《仪礼》, 《大戴礼记》.

\[52\] This paragraph was rewritten by Ban Zhao from a poem in The Book of Poetry.
subject to father, husband and son, and is denied the privileges of education”
(Montgomery 48).

3. Deleting the Individual Title; Cutting Stories into Pieces

Safford deletes all of the titles of the original biographies. She groups biographies under lead paragraphs which often include sayings from Confucian Classics and Ban Zhao’s Nü Jie. She uses the biographies to illustrate the titled precepts of women’s qualities such as obedience and filial piety. The original titles often indicate geographical locations, names of individuals, or an individual’s influential deeds. For instance, titles such as “The Daughter of Qi’s Official Taicang” (Qi Taicang Nü), “Tang Clan Woman Nursed her Mother-in-law” (Tangshi Ru Gu), and “Yang Xiang Strangles a Tiger” (Yang Xiang Yi Hu) were all deleted. These stories become paragraphs under the main topic: Filial Daughters of China. By removing the titles, the comprehensiveness of each story is lessened, and the differences between the individuals are reduced, thus making women more generalized. Some become disembodied and de-personalized, functioning as codes for Safford’s precepts. In contrast, the selected precepts become more centralized and impressive, and essentially become the “protagonists” of the book.

In order to fit the selected biographies into the four categories, Safford occasionally separates one story into two or three parts, and locates them in different categories. Stories such as “A Girl with a Large Tumor from State Qi” (Typical 45, 97), “Mencius’ Mother” (Typical 69, 170), “Tao Kan’s Mother” (Typical 110, 72), “The Couple of Liang Hong and Meng Guang” (Typical 7, 142), are divided and rewritten into separate stories. This undermines the stories and their images, and creates Safford’s own repetitiveness.

4. Mixing Didactic Theories and Fiction with Realities

The above evidence reveals that the aim of Safford’s book is chiefly didactic. More significantly, her editorial strategy creates the impression that the book is about actual, living Chinese women. As Lowie (1883-1957) points out in Primitive Society, “It should be noted that the treatment of woman is one thing, her legal status another, her opportunities for public activities still another, while the character and extent of her
labors belong again to a distinct category” (136). Safford intentionally fuses the place assigned to women in Confucian theories to women’s real position in society, and mixes female ideals with the women who are supposed to emulate them.

In a similar way, she selectes fictional sources and presents them as real-life biographies. For instance, the fictional tale of how a filial daughter lies upon a frozen stream for ten days until the ice melts and the fish jump out so the daughter may use the fish to cure her mother (Typical 25-26), is used by Safford from Wang Daokun’s version, to create the impression of foolish and stubborn Chinese filial daughters.

5. Deleting Lü Kun’s Comments; Adding Safford’s own Comments

One of the most important characteristics of Gui Fan is the insightful comments Lü Kun gives to each biography. Although Lü Kun’s attitude toward women is primarily Neo-Confucian, many of his personal comments demonstrate a humanistic conscience, intellectual comprehensiveness and integrity. Through his comments he infuses freshness and vitality into the Confucian concepts of “rites,” “filial,” “rightness,” “bravery,” and so on. His comments are a valuable part of Gui Fan, and read along with the individual biographies, help the reader absorb its teachings. However, most of his critical comments and interpretations are omitted. Instead, she adds her own comments on the stories, which spotlight her thoughts and intensify the depicted situation.

For instance, Safford selects several stories both ancient and modern, to illustrate Chinese women’s self-restraint in obeying ‘Li’ (rites); one story is about a woman named “Bo Ji.”

The lady Poh Ki [Bo Ji] was the wife of the Duke of Sung, who died when they had been married ten years. After this, there was a great fire in the place of Ki’s residence, and the flames finally caught on her house. On every side the people called to her: “Lady, escape from the fire.” But Poh Ki declined, saying: “It is the rule that, the senior officer of the household being absent, no women shall leave the palace at night. I shall await that officer.” “But the fire, will it wait?” all cried. “I can but die,” answered Poh Ki, “better to do so and keep the rule of righteousness, than to transgress it and live.” She waited, but the officer came not, and she perished in the flames. The Historical Classics related her virtues that all women under heaven may be stimulated to observe the laws of propriety. (Typical 46-47)

53 I use the pronunciation system of pinyin, therefore this is “Bo Ji.” Safford uses Wade Giles, one of the very early pronunciation systems for Romanizing Chinese language, therefore is “Poh Ki”.

26
Lü Kun adds the comment: “[…] So strict was Bo Ji in following ‘Li,’ during the past thousand years, she was the one and only one!” (566). Safford selects the story of a queen from the state of Chu who, for the sake of ‘Li,’ dies in a flood (Typical 47-48). Again, Lü Kun praises the queen’s faithfulness to the king, but also expresses his deep regret at her inflexible understanding of ‘Li’ and her unnecessary death. Safford summarizes these two cases in this way: “Both these ladies regarded their characters sacred even as the hill Tai (a mount in Shandong, the most famous and sacred in China), and thought it no grief to preserve them unsullied by dying, keeping virtues even to the end” (Typical 48).

By deleting Lü Kun’s comments and emphasizing the protagonists’ willingness to die, and the praise they received, Safford illustrates the strictness of ‘Li’ and makes these women appear stubborn and foolish. Many other stories are used in the same manner by Safford. She presents these stories as models which Chinese women have followed and would continue to follow voluntarily for generations to come. Safford leaves readers with the impression that “Li” is barbaric. In this way, she heightens the urgency of using Christianity to save these hopeless, ignorant, and pitiful women.

In one section, Safford begins by citing the famous Song Dynasty Neo-Confucian scholar Cheng Hao’s words: “To starve to death is a very small matter; to lose purity is a very great affair” (Typical 54). She follows this with many stories of self-mutilation and suicide in order to illustrate the value of marital fidelity which includes not remarrying after a husband’s death. The stories, which she translates in full, include sensational ones such as “Widow Liang Cuts off her Nose” (Typical 57), “The Daughter of Ling Family Destroys her Face” (Typical 57), “Huangpu’s Righteous Wife” (Typical 59), and “Lady Li Who Cut Off her Arm” (Typical 60). In his comments on these tales, Lü Kun reveals his shock and his belief that these behaviours are extreme. After the story “Lady Li Who Cut off her Arm,” Lü Kun comments: “[…] This is a way that women should definitely avoid” (586). Safford omits Lü Kun’s comments, and ends the story with: “Even to ten thousand ages of heaven and earth this deed of the lady Li shall be remembered” (Typical 60). Her readers may conclude that it was typical in ancient China for women to disfigure themselves.

54 All the translations in this thesis from the original Chinese are my own unless otherwise noted.
After translating these brutal stories, Safford comments:

The reference in the last chapter to the woman cutting off her hair, and attempting to cut off her ear, in token of her sincerity in vowing not to marry again, seems made to an ancient custom. According to this, the woman disfigured herself by cutting off, with an oath not to marry again, either her hair, her nose, or her ear, or by mutilating the two latter, so that no man would wish to marry one so disfigured. This barbarous practice appears to be obsolete at the present day, but the same principle relative to second marriages prevails now, and the woman who refused one is held in the highest respect. She 'is a true Chinese heroine, rejoicing in her chains, and preferring to remain single in her widowhood, even against the wishes of her parents.' (Typical 53)

Chaste widows who commit suicide or disfigure themselves are not following an ancient custom, as Safford claims. Only a few cases are collected in those early Lienü Zhuan. According to Jennifer Homgren, the number of these cases in the Lienü Zhuan of Northern Wei Dynasty (386-534) was quite low (174). The numbers increased during the Tang (618-907) and Song dynasties, and reached their height in the Ming dynasty, the dark “Middle Age” for Chinese women. Omitting this historical background, and adding her misleading comments, Safford suggests this custom had existed since ancient time.

Safford’s interest in these practices echoes many of her contemporary missionaries. Justus Doolittle describes this phenomenon in detail in Social Life of China (48); Arthur Smith reports that “Every year thousands upon thousands of Chinese wives commit suicide […]” (Village Life 286). Missionary writing attempted to highlight the immorality of “heathen” Chinese in customs and practices. Widow suicide attests to the extremely low and inhuman position of Chinese women. R.H. Graves in his Forty Years in China (1895) connects this brutality to the Chinese national characteristics: “the Chinese have always had the name of being a cruel people. […] Human life is held very cheap […]” (88). The missionary historian Helen Barrett Montgomery agrees with Arthur Smith, that “The death roll of suicides is the most convincing proof of the woes endured by Chinese women” (49). Safford’s full translation of these stories and emphatic comments exaggerates this situation in Chinese history, and solidifies the images of suffering and barbarism among Chinese women.
6. Repeating the Image of Subordinate Women; Calling Attention to the Antiquity of Chinese Misogynist Views

Although Safford complains of the dullness and wordiness of the original text, she doesn’t mind repeating topics of particular interest to herself. In order to show the inferior position of women, she takes an extract from the *Book of Poetry*:

Daughters shall be born to him: They will be put to sleep on the ground, they will be clothed with wrappers, they will have tiles to play with. It will be theirs neither to do wrong nor to do good. Only about the spirits and the food will they have to think, and to cause no sorrow to their parents. (*Typical* 169)

This appears first in the “Chinese Author’s Preface” of *Typical Women of China* which Safford rewrote, and she repeats it several times throughout the book.

Safford also repeats the idea that woman must remain at home. “Within it is the province of woman to preside over the inner apartments [...]” (*Typical* 117). In one chapter she repeats it three times: “Women should remain home, don’t go outside” (*Typical* 145). The same idea appears quickly: “Until old age women should not leave the doorway [of the inner apartments]. They should also keep their maid-servants within bounds” (*Typical* 145). These “rules” shape the image of Chinese women as prisoners, and are repeated by McNabb in his book *Women of Middle Kingdom*:

The Chinese woman, whether her home be a thatch-roofed mud hut or gilded palace, knows nothing of the freedom and little of the comfort that her Western sisters enjoy; for she is a slave girl, a plodding labour, or a tinselled plaything in the house of her lord. Her home is her prison, and her husband is the prison master. (70)

In order to demonstrate the “antiquity of Chinese misogynist views” (Weidner 2) and the Chinese fear of women’s power, Safford repeats the “image of a hen” five times in the chapter “Women’s Words.” The hen image appears first in an empress’s words, “Do not look upon these words as ‘a crow of the hen announcing the dawn,’ but receive them (as humbly offered)” (*Typical* 100). It is repeated when Safford introduces the topic on the danger of female rulers, “If the hen rules the morning it indicates the dissolution of the family [...]” (*Typical* 117). And once again, “If she is wise and intelligent, if she understands thoroughly ancient and modern lore, then she ought to assist and exhort her husband, if she does not conform to this, then ‘the hen rules the morning’ and calamity is at hand” (*Typical* 170). The image of a “hen” appears only twice in Lü Kun’s version.
Safford cites "hens" from other sources, such as James Legge's translation of The Classic of History (Shoo King 302-03). She uses the repetition as a strategy to sharpen the effect she wanted to achieve.

Safford also highlights the Chinese male’s ancient fear towards female beauty and intelligence: “I have heard that great beauty is certain to cloak great wickedness. In our history we may trace the ruin of three dynasties to the intrigues of beauties” (Typical 125). Safford uses Legge’s translation to emphasize this:

A wise man builds up the wall (of a city), but a wise woman overturns it. Admireable may the wise women be, but she is [no better than] an owl—A woman with a long tongue is [like] a stepping-stone to disorder, [disorder] does not come down from heaven; it is produced by the women. Those from whom come no lessons, no instructions, are women and eunuchs. (Typical 137).

Safford concludes the chapter of “Women’s Words”: “according to the above, all the wise words of women, of which we have read, must have ‘averted danger,’ even as the cackling of the geese saved Rome [...]” (Typical 137).

7. Why Mulan Is Left Out--Stories Omitted and Simplified by Safford

Hua Mulan, the girl warrior, is a popular Chinese legend. She has become a symbol for the nation’s life force and spirit. She appears in both Lü Kun’s Gui Fan (526) and Wang Daokun’s Illustrated Lienü Zhuan (880). Lü Kun considers her a chaste girl, a filial and brave daughter. Yet, the warrior Mulan is left out of Safford’s translation.

The Ballad of Mulan first appears in the Northern Wei period (386-557). It is about a girl who disguises herself as a man and takes her old, ill father’s place in the emperor’s army. She leaves home and fights for twelve years. None of her army companions suspects her gender. When the fighting ceases, she returns home an accomplished soldier, throwing off her ‘iron clothing,’ and ‘wearing once more a skirt.’ She becomes again a dutiful daughter. Over the centuries, the Mulan story has been retold and altered in China to suit the different times. In 1975, it was retold in America by Maxine Hong Kingston in Woman Warrior. Kingston articulated Mulan from a Western feminist’s viewpoint; she placed the emphasis on women not fitting into a tradition-

---

bound society. In 1998, the Walt Disney team created an animated movie based on the Mulan tale which quickly became a childhood classic.\(^{56}\)

As Lefevere points out, “If the source text clashes with the ideology of the target culture, translators may have to adapt the text so that the offending passages are either severely modified or left out altogether” (Translating Literature 87). Safford adopted the “Three Obediences” and “Four Virtues” as her general principles for selecting biographies. Meanwhile, she held the church’s accepted images of Chinese women as gentle, obedient and suffering as an important standard. Mulan was militant, independent and daring. This was an image the church wished to avoid. “Self-imposed illusions, some common to all images making and some rooted in the special needs and preconceptions of the church in America, made it difficult to accept the wide varieties of women who began to appear after the 1911 revolution” (Garrett 29).

In Safford’s version, stories like Mulan’s are omitted, and many other stories of talented and active women are weakened, softened, or summarized, such as “Chu Yuling’s Wife” (Typical 34), “The Daughter of a Ferry Boatman” (Typical 131), “The Wife of Jin Bow-Maker” (Typical 134), “The Daughter of the Qi Officer who Hurt a Scholar tree” (Typical 133), and “The Daughter of Qi Officer Taichang” (Typical 23). Their intelligent words, active roles and contributions to their families and the state are reduced. The collective images of Chinese women are reshaped by Safford to be more gentle and passive.

8. Adding Supplementary Sources to Illustrate Images of Superstitious Chinese Women

To create the images she wanted, Safford adds information from sources outside the Lienü Zhuan tradition. For instance, Safford adds the concept of the superstition Chinese woman:

Most women believe in the gods, both good and evil, and for this reason the sorceresses and Buddhist nuns fearlessly carry on their incantations, wishing to deceive, that they may increase their gains, and the women fall into their snare [...]. “Disreputable women must not enter the gate,” is a precept carefully handed down to us from the ancient sages.--and nuns belong to this class. (Typical 83)

\(^{56}\) Mulan, was produced by Disney Studios in 1998 and directed by Tony Bancroft and Barry Cook.
This notion—"the virtues of exposing and resisting superstition," is far-fetched. None of these examples and theories are identifiable in existing versions of Lienü Zhuan; instead, they are selected from Han dynasty historian Sima Qian's The Records of a Grand Historian (Shiji), Song dynasty historian Sima Guang’s The Comprehensive Mirror for Aid in Government (Zizhi Tongjian), sayings from Liu Bowen (a famous statesman of the Ming dynasty), and unknown sources about court ladies’ religious activities.

The first biography on this topic concerns a group of evil sorceresses, who deceive local people and are punished by a magistrate. It is originally a famous chapter titled “Ximen Bao governs the County Ye,” written by Sima Qian in the section of Huaji Liezhuan (Biographies of the Intelligent and Humorous Men) in his Records of Grand Historian. Safford highlights the evil sorceresses and the village women who worship river gods and suffer under spells cast by sorceresses, in order to construct images of superstitious women.

To reinforce the authenticity of these images, Safford quotes two pages of Sima Guang’s criticisms on superstition:

[...] The tales of the priests move the hearts of the middle and lower classes of the people hither and thither as the waves of the sea, and make them restless as the striving ants, veining with their fellows in toil. [...] The priests declare that all women in particular who have borne and nourished children, have incurred great sin thereby, and that the worst hell is kept for them, and they exhort the sons and daughters diligently to employ priests to offer sacrifices, and chant the name of Buddha, in order to win deliverance for their mother. Thus these unprincipal priests trouble society, that they may gain their own food and drink from these offerings to the gods [...].” (Safford Typical 88)

The original essay, which expresses Sima Guang’s criticism of the spread of superstitious practices, is abridged and used out of context. Safford uses these theories and examples to buttress her presentation of superstitious Chinese women.

Missionaries regarded China as a “land of idolatry and death” (Jetter 141). Justus Doolittle believed that the Chinese were trapped in traditional superstitions and idolatrous ritual (48); they were “victims of enslavement” (116), held in intellectual bondage to

57 “西门豹治邺,” is recorded in Shiji 《史记·滑稽列传》. The protagonist, Ximen Bao, is a capable man and intelligent magistrate. He intelligently designed tricks and solved a local sorcery trouble, and successfully founded the earliest irrigation work in the region of the Yellow River.

58 Original is in Sima Guang’s The Comprehensive Mirror for Aid in Government (Zizhi Tongjian 《资治通鉴》).
Confucius and Mencius and in ritual bondage to Taoism and Buddhism (52). Missionaries paid special attention to “the mental darkness and degradation of these women” (Mateer 111). McNabb observed that “Taoism touches the life of the Chinese female in a thousand different ways, and like the devil-fish, holds her in its strong embrace until her life is sapped away;” “Buddhism also finds the larger numbers of its votaries among the gentler sex” (87). In the eyes of these missionaries, the moral degradation of Chinese women was directly related to China’s three religions and women’s ignorance of “the existence of an everywhere present, omniscient, almighty, and infinitely benevolent God” (Doolittle 54). Dolittle lamented, “How much do they need the light of the Bible to illuminate their dark minds!” (55). Typical Women of China was a clear response to the overall call to Christianize China.

Thus we can see how Safford’s strategies of deletion, addition, reorganization and repetition are organically interrelated. Her translation turns out to be a radical process of simplification, dehistorization, and depersonalization, an extensive rewriting in order to emphasize her Christian and missionary values. The tradition of Lienü Zhuan, which was initially inclusive rather than exclusive, is further narrowed and distorted by Safford. As Homi Bhabha points out:

The stereotype is not a simplification because it is a false representation of a given reality. It is a simplification because it is an arrested, fixated form of representation that, in denying the play of difference (that the negation through the Other permits), constitutes a problem for the representation of the subject in significations of psychic and social relations. (75)

The first collective images of Chinese women in the Western world were likewise simplified and “a false representation of a given reality.” Behind these stereotyped images of women was a timeless, changeless and hopeless China. Nearly all of the essential aspects of Confucian culture, such as rites, filial piety, and fidelity, were attacked. These obedient, imprisoned, suffering, diligent, and foolish Chinese women needed more missionary women to save them.
D. Influence and Aftermath of Safford’s Translation

On January 1st, 1892, The North-China Daily News praised Typical Women of China and recommended that everyone working in the field of women read Safford’s translation. It stated,

Miss Safford has conferred a lasting benefit on missionaries, missionary societies, the foreign community in China, and the English-speaking world at large, by the book she has given them. Very few questions can arise as to the state of womankind in China, both past and present, that cannot be solved somewhere or other in the perusal of these pages. [...] It is to be feared that much missionary work is done at random through want of this knowledge. (Hazen 26)

Safford’s book soon became a favorite source for other missionary writers. Arthur Smith quoted from it soon after its publication, and commented in his Village Life in China that Safford’s book was very authentic (Village Life 307). R.L. McNabb’s Women in the Middle Kingdom, one of the most popular missionary books on Chinese women, was published a few years after Safford’s Typical Women of China in 1907. McNabb cites Safford’s translation in almost every chapter of his book, such as the following:

[...] China’s greatest teacher says: “Man is the representative of heaven, and is supreme in all things. On this account, woman can determine nothing for herself, and should be subject to the three obediences--to her father, husband, and son. Her business is to prepare food and wine. Beyond the threshold of her own apartments she should not be known for evil or for good. If her husband dies, she should not marry again.” (37)

The influence of Safford’s translation, however, was far broader than citations and footnotes. The stereotypical images she shaped, together with those presented by the missionary writers, had an enormous impact on the China mission at the turn of the twentieth century.

Shirley Garrett points out, “The image of the sufferer was crucial to the success of the China mission, for it had great appeal and usefulness to the churchwomen in America who supported that mission so faithfully” (24). Safford’s translation must have encouraged church women to join missions to China. In the 1890s “women constituted 60 percent of missionary volunteers and proved to be particularly persuasive voices in the crusade for American influence in China” (Hunter 2). “Numbers of single women missionaries also increased drastically. In 1898 single women missionaries constituted 26% of the total mission force (256 out of 968) and married women missionaries were
By 1919 the single women missionaries were 29% and married 33% (Hunter 270, 77). Women were two-thirds of the American missionary community” (Chin 25). They worked as teachers at girls’ schools, doctors and nurses for women’s hospitals, helpers for refugees, and campaigners for health and protection .... On one hand they committed their mission to “rescue these female victims”, on the other hand, they were trying to transform Chinese women by using “the white, middle-class church women who embraced Victorian ideals of womanhood” as the standards of ideal womanhood, and attempted to eliminate the “otherness” of the native women (Chin 33). They formed organizations against footbinding, establish local schools for girls, and began to play an active role in Chinese women’s emancipation at the turn of the last century.

Although the publication of Safford’s work was delayed until 1891, its influence started long before. During the year of her sabbatical leave (1884-85), her experiences, and probably examples from the draft of this translation, were the basis for her talks to church audiences. Safford received a tremendous welcome when she returned to the U.S. in 1884. Her friend Mrs. J. L. Stuart, another missionary in Hangzhou, wrote later in her memoir:

Her ‘talks’ on China called out large, enthusiastic audiences, and were everywhere spoken of as most interesting and instructive glimpses of life in the Celestial Empire. [...] The interest in her personally extended to her work, and thence to the cause of Foreign Missions generally. (qtd. in Hazen 37-38)

As Edwin McAllister points out, missionaries were figures of tremendous cultural authority in nineteenth century America. They were “lionized by most middle class Christian Americans as figures who combined courage and piety in a peculiarly attractive and, in some sense, peculiarly American, mixture” (21).

When the missionaries returned for sabbaticals, they often spent the better part of their time addressing church audiences and ecumenical gatherings. They had a tremendous, admiring, credulous audience ready to believe their words; then, their work would be more likely to influence the beliefs of their audiences than other kinds of colonial texts [...]. (21)

Missionaries earned a reputation for reliability, primarily because their writings were published as nonfiction. In fact, they were “probably more influential than most

59 Chin cited this information from Sheila Rothman Woman’s Proper Place, and Patricia Hill, The World Their Household, chapter two.
journalism, travel writing, or writing from colonial administrators because of their source” (22). Therefore, “Evangelical audiences received with an enthusiasm and credulity they rarely accorded to secular forms” (6). Missions “influenced the lives and thinking of more Americans than almost any other social movement of the nineteenth century” (21).

In his influential essay, “The Formation of Cultural Identities,” Lawrence Venuti claims: “In the long run, translation figures in geopolitical relations by establishing the cultural grounds of diplomacy, reinforcing alliances, antagonisms, and hegemonies between nations” (66-67). This was true for Arthur Smith, who became a respected authority on the subject of China. “In 1906, President Theodore Roosevelt welcomed Smith to the White House to hear his views regarding U.S.-China relations and Smith helped shape American public opinion” (Liu’s Introduction to Smith Characteristics i). This was also true for Safford. Shortly before her death, she was recognized as an authority on women’s missionary work in China, and a specialist on Chinese women and culture. In May, 1890, she was selected to write a report for the Great Conference of Chinese Missionaries in Shanghai, which was titled “Woman’s Missionary Work in China” (Hazen 27).

In discussing the influence of Arthur Smith, Lydia Liu points out that he became known as an example of antiquated Orientalist views. “Nevertheless, the fate of oblivion in the West may well be a measure of his success, for much of what Smith said or wrote over a century ago has metamorphosed over the years into the familiar discourse of Chineseness that no longer requires the sanction of authorial signature (Liu’s Introduction to Smith Characteristics i). This would be applicable to Safford as well; the long-lasting stereotypical images she reconstructed can be traced even today in Western society. For instance, the preface to the anthology, Chinese Women: A Thousand Pieces of Gold (2003) echoes what Safford wrote a century ago:

Having survived infanticide in times of desperation, girls were restricted in childhood, rarely educated, and treated as annoying expenses, really belonging to their future parents-in-law. Some were brought as children by their future in-laws and were treated as servants. Others were bought outright as slaves. (White xvii)

Safford is an insignificant translator and an anonymous woman today. However, for a short while, she had “the power to construct the image of one literature for
consumption by the readers of another” and shared this power with “literary historians, anthologizers, and critics” (Lefevere Translating Literature 14). Her influence was in the tailwind of Protestant missionaries at the turn of twentieth century; the stereotypical images she presented played an enormous role in shaping the American perception of Chinese women and of China.

II. Challenges in Rewriting the Missionary Discourse on Chinese Women

Missionary portrayals of Chinese women such as Safford’s reached the West when there were no Chinese writers were bringing Chinese views to the attention of Western readers. This situation was due to the scarcity of bilingual Chinese intellectuals as a result of a long term closed-door policy of the Ming and Qing dynasties, and further worsened by the national psychological tumult—an unprecedented identity crisis among the Chinese. After shocking humiliations in the two Opium Wars and a series of unequal treaties between Chinese and Western powers, the “Middle Kingdom complex” was crushed. The unknown, yet ferocious and powerful West became an obsession for the Chinese. The long and painful process of searching for China’s modernity began. Saving China from colonization, either by incorporating Western science and technology without changing the political and cultural soul of China, or by embracing not only science, but also political and social theories, became the anxious cry among political and intellectual forces within China. In this atmosphere, Chinese intellectuals did not, or were unable to consider how China was presented in the West, let alone how Chinese

---

60 China, during its long imperial history, considered itself the Middle Kingdom of the universe, and other nations as tributaries. This attitude was recorded by Lord Macartney (1737-1806) in his journal about his impression of the arrogant, self-claimed Qianlong while Macartney traveled in China for King George III. See Jonathan Spence, "Western Perceptions of China from the Late Sixteenth Century to the Present," Heritage of China: Contemporary Perspectives on Chinese Civilization, ed. Paul S. Ropp (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1990). 4-5.

61 Led by Zeng Guofan (1811-72), Li Hongzhang (1822-1901), and Zhang Zhidong (1837-1909), who, in their positions as ministers for the Qing Court, attempted to “Zhongxue wei ti, Xixue wei yang” (to preserve the Chinese cultural and political soul, and adopt the Western science and technology for practical use).

62 Led by Kang Youwei (1859-1927) and Liang Qichao (1873-1929), and soon represented by May Fourth intellectuals, a movement which became more radical.

63 This has dominated China’s intellectual discourse again and again in modern and contemporary Chinese history.
women were presented in the West. In the eyes of many iconoclastic intellectuals of the
time, traditional Chinese culture was hindering China’s modernization. Chinese women
had suffered the most under the traditional feudal system.

This silence was first broken by a European-educated Chinese intellectual Gu
Hongming (辜鸿铭). Gu was born in 1857 and was raised in a Chinese family in the
British Straits Settlements of Penang, Malaysia. He moved to Scotland when he was
ten, and attended boarding school in Great Britain. He received his master’s degree in
English literature in 1877 from the University of Edinburgh and a PhD in civil
engineering from the University of Leipzig. He also studied at Cambridge and at the
University of Paris. He mastered eight foreign languages and was fluent in English,
German and French. Gu Hongming returned to China in 1882. In 1885 he began working
for Zhang Zhidong, a prominent minister in the late Qing court. At that time, Gu
immersed himself in Chinese literature and philosophy, let his queue grow and wore long
Chinese gowns.

Unlike the majority of Chinese intellectuals at that time who were iconoclastic,
Gu valued Chinese civilization and provided a unique perspective in his cultural critique
of Western imperialism. He pointed out that “‘culture’ contained an important discursive
power in resisting the more immediate and menacing effect of imperialism: its material
interests” (Qian 152). He enthusiastically promoted the Confucian cultural spirit and
believed that Confucianism contained the prescription for curing the ills of European

---

64 Gu Hongming (1857-1928), a pioneer in Chinese-West cross-cultural writings and translations. His
English articles appeared in all the popular English magazines and newspapers in China and England
around his time, such as the North China Daily News, Japan Weekly Mail, Beijing Daily News,
Millard's Review of the Far East, North China Standard, The Times. His English books include Papers
from a Viceroy's Yamen: A Chinese Plea for the Cause of Good Government and True Civilization
(Shanghai: Mercury, 1901), The Story of a Chinese Oxford Movement (Shanghai: Mercury, 1910) and
the most influential Spirit of the Chinese People (Peking: The Peking Daily News, 1st ed., 1915), which
was soon translated into German and Japanese. It caused a sensation in the East and in the West. He was
famous as a cultural critic and for his conservative attitude toward China’s Westernization. His most
important translations include three of the Four Chinese Classics: Analects, The Doctrine Mean, and
The Great Learning.

65 Gu’s family was one of the earliest Chinese families to be influenced by colonization in the southern
China Sea area. His grandfather was the first local Chinese Captain appointed by the British Colony. His
father worked as a manager in an English rubber plantation.

66 The owners of the rubber plantation where Gu’s father worked, brought him to Scotland when he was
While Gu Hongming respected the true teaching of Christianity, he vehemently attacked the active co-operation between the missionaries and the colonizers (Gu "Defensio"). In his first published paper, “Chinese Scholarship,” written in 1884, Gu systematically examines English writings on China, and English translations of Chinese classics. These translations were primarily produced by missionaries and the so-called famous European “savants” (Spirit 123). Gu reveals that many misinterpretations, mistranslations and distortions of the originals existed in this scholarship. He argues that this caused misunderstanding and bias against Chinese culture and presented stereotypes about the Chinese to the West. To change this, Gu started to translate and interpret the Confucian Classics into English, finishing three of the four Confucian Classics. His translations allowed Western readers to better understand the Chinese originals. These translations, together with his books such as Papers from a Vincent Yamen, and especially The Spirit of the Chinese People, became influential in Europe, particularly in Germany, after the First World War. He was regarded by Somerset Maugham as “the greatest authority in China on the Confucian learning” (Y. Lin From Pagan 9).

In his influential English-language book, Spirit of the Chinese People, Gu Hongming includes a chapter entitled “The Chinese Women,” in which he openly defends Chinese women on the international stage for the first time. Gu’s arguments read like a response to Allen Young’s opinion of women as symbols of civilizations. Though there are no records to indicate Gu’s awareness of Allen Young’s articles, we can deduce that Gu must have been familiar with missionary views on Chinese women from the popularity of the Chinese Globe Magazine at the turn of the twentieth century, and from

---

67 In Gu’s view, European civilization had a voracious desire for material goods and was too aggressive in colonization.
68 Gu seemed be unaware of Ms. Safford’s Typical Women of China.
69 This word in Chinese is “儒家.” Some of the European sinologists called themselves this at the time.
70 These three Classics were named by Gu Hongming in English as: The Discourses and Sayings of Confucius, The Universal Order, or Conduct of Life, and The High Education.
71 One of his translation strategies is that he cited the sayings of Goethe, Carlyle, Arnold, Shakespeare, to annotate the Chinese Classics. This is enlightening for East-West cross-cultural understanding. Lin was greatly inspired by Gu’s methods.
Gu’s position as a *Yamen* secretary for the Qing government. Gu’s chapter could be also a response to Arthur Smith’s miserable images of Chinese women in his *Village Life in China* (1899). However, as “the last of the Confucianists” as Lin Yutang called him ("Last " 122-23), Gu presents a picture of Chinese culture and people filtered through his Confucianist’s view and limited to Confucian wisdom and canons. His views were extremely negative when he wrote about women.

In his chapter “The Chinese Women,” Gu Hongming states that the essence of a civilization is best represented by the male and the female, and that women are the flowers of the civilization (*Spirit* 74). Gu believes that the Chinese feminine ideal—a helpful wife and exemplary mother—is similar to the feminine ideal in Indo-European and Semitic nations (*Spirit* 74). He declares that the Chinese feminine model is a housewife—“an ideal with a broom in her hands to sweep and clean the rooms with” (*Spirit* 74). “Four Virtues” and “Three Obediences” are exactly the feminine ideal handed down from Chinese tradition. Gu interprets the “four virtues” in the same way that Ban Zhao had done in *Nü Jie*.

Womanly character means not extraordinary talents or intelligence, but modesty, cheerfulness, chastity, constancy, orderliness, blameless conduct and perfect manners. Womanly conversation means not eloquence or brilliant talk, but refined choice of words, never to use coarse or violent language, to know when to speak and when to stop speaking. Womanly appearance means not beauty or prettiness of face, but personal cleanliness and faultlessness in dress and attire. Lastly, womanly work means not any special skill or ability, but assiduous attention to the spinning room, never to waste time in laughing and giggling and work in the kitchen to prepare clean and wholesome food, especially when there are guests in the house. (*Spirit* 75)

In Gu’s view, the “Three Obediences” mean three self-sacrifices: “when a woman is unmarried, she is to live for her father; when married, she is to live for her husband; and, as a widow, she is to live for her children.” He concludes that “a true Chinese woman has no self” (*Spirit* 76).

---

72 This was actually a high-ranking position. Gu was working directly for the minister Zhang Zhidong. “*Yamen*” is the term for government offices in traditional China.

To his way of thinking, concubinage is “not such an immoral custom as people generally imagine.”

By Law in China, a man is allowed to have only one wife, but he may have as many handmaids or concubines as he like. [...] The Chinese feminine ideal is, for a wife to live absolutely, selflessly for her husband. Therefore when a husband who is sick or invalided from over work with his brain and mind, requires a handmaid, a hand rack or eye rack to enable him to get well and to fit him for his life work, the wife in China with her selflessness, gives it to him just as a good wife in Europe and America gives an arm chair or goat’s milk to her husband when he is sick or requires it. In fact it is the selflessness of the wife in China, her sense of duty, the duty of self sacrifice which allow a man in China to have handmaids or concubines. (Spirit 76-77)

Though Western-educated, Gu lived with a Chinese wife (who had bound feet) and a Japanese concubine during the late Qing and early Republic era. He was notorious for his witty defense of concubinage when he answered the enquiries of a group of American ladies, “You can have one teapot and five cups, but show me who can have one teacup and five teapots?” (qtd. in Y. Lin From Pagan 49). He declared:

It is the Religion of selflessness, the absolute selflessness of the woman,—the gentlewoman or lady and the love of the husband for his wife and his tact,—the perfect good taste of a real Chinese gentleman, which, as I said, makes concubinage in China, not only possible, but also not immoral. (Spirit 81)

Gu also discusses wedded love and equality in marriage. “There is love between husband and wife in China, although they have not seen each other before the marriage” (Spirit 89). “Beyond all doubt that in China this is perfect equality between man and woman, between husband and wife” (Spirit 85). However, the examples he employs to prove these points are ineffective. He selects a few Tang dynasty poems, which show how a woman misses her absent husband, and how a husband expresses his deep love to his wife. He even includes a poem he wrote for his deceased wife (Spirit 74, 81-83, 89). To show the power of Rites (Li 礼), Du uses many pages to describe the complicated wedding ceremony, emphasizing its role in securing love and equality between the bride and bridegroom (Spirit 83-88). He points out the fundamental difference between a marriage in China and in the West,

The marriage in Europe and America,—is what we Chinese would call a sweet-heart marriage, a marriage, bound solely by love between the individual man and the individual woman. But in China the marriage is, as I have said, a civic
married, a contract not between the woman and the man, but between the woman and the family of her husband, --in which she has obligations not only to him, but also to his family, and through the family, to society,--to the social or civic order; in fact, to the State. [...] It is this civic conception of marriage which gives solidarity and stability to the family, to the social or civic order, to the State in China. (Spirit 87)

Gu proposes a few ideal characteristics that are distinct to Chinese women, such as “perfect submissiveness,” “divine meekness,” to the point of “absolute selflessness” (Spirit 76-79); modesty, bashfulness, purity, chastity, and the need to nourish the requirement to their “exceptional beauty” in seclusion (Spirit 90-93). He claims that the modesty and virtue of Chinese womanhood is superior, and expresses disgust for Western feminist organizations such as “Natural Feet Society” (天足会) and their influence in China (Spirit 94-95).74

Gu Hongming’s portrayal of the “Chinese feminine ideal” did reveal some of the authentic characteristics of Chinese women and did reflect certain truths of Chinese women’s lives. His method of presenting a Chinese feminine ideal by comparing Eastern and Western womanhood was pioneering.75 However, his image of Chinese women was very problematic. It was chiefly defined by “Three Obediences” and “Four Virtues”—the male-dominated Confucian theoretical ideals on Chinese women. It was further restricted by his own chauvinistic views. Thus, his defense of Chinese women was insufficient. His portrayal of Chinese women was supportive of the existing stereotypical images, and echoed the dominant missionary picture of Chinese women.

Scholars who study Western images of China, such as Marsha Weidner and Colin Mackerras, generally agree that the portrayal of China was the worst at the turn of the twentieth century and only started to improve after the 1920s. At that point, “Western ideas had brought enormous changes to at least the upper levels of Chinese urban society, and Westerners and Chinese were coming to know much more about one another” (1-2). More moderate views and more varied perspectives on Chinese women appeared. However, the “taste for exoticism and focus on the stereotypical females of Chinese

74 The British writer Mrs. Archibald Little (1845-1925) was the founder of the “Natural Feet Society.” Gu was also notorious for his fondness for bound feet.
75 It inspired Lin Yutang to write about ideal womanhood in China from an East-West comparative perspective in his book My Country and My People.
literature—the 'sweet beguilers,' ‘temptresses,’ ‘kingdom wreckers,’ and ‘frail favorites’—still continued in Western and missionary portrayals of Chinese women (4). Colin Mackerras asserts in his book *Western Images of China*, that Western perceptions of China and the Chinese were getting more positive in the 1930s.

Pearl Buck played a prominent role in formulating Western images of China in the first half of the twentieth century through her novel *The Good Earth*. In particular, she both influenced and represented a trend resulting in images that were enormously more positive by the time the Nationalist Party fell in 1949 than they had been when the Boxers besieged the foreign legations half a century earlier. (59)

Pearl Buck (1893-1973, Chinese name 赛珍珠) was born in West Virginia, and moved to Jiujiang, Jianxi in Southeast China with her missionary parents when she was six months old. She spoke both English and Chinese, and grew up, in her own words, in a 'double world,' "embracing both the large white clean Presbyterian manse inhabited by the American world of her parents and the large living merry and 'not too clean' Chinese world of her servants, neighbors, and playmates" (qtd. in Croll 210). In 1910 she went to America to study at Randolph-Macon Women's College in Virginia and returned to China after graduation in 1914. In 1917 she married John Buck, an agriculturalist who worked for the Presbyterian mission board. They moved to the countryside in Northern Anwei, where Buck was frequently invited into Chinese homes. She learned about the domestic and social life of peasant families and befriended many local women. She was especially impressed by their closeness "to the earth, to birth and death, to laughter and to weeping" (Croll 225). During this period she traveled a great deal with her husband, gave birth to their only daughter, and periodically taught English at various local schools, and later at Nanking University. Witnessing the social and political turmoil in China in the early twentieth century and observing Chinese life so intimately, Pearl Buck picked up her pen with passion. After her first novel *East Wind, West Wind* (1930) was published by the John Day Company, she was encouraged by the publisher Richard Walsh (who later became her second husband) to continue writing. When her best-known novel, *The Good Earth*, was published in 1931, it became the best-selling book of 1931 and 1932, and won the Pulitzer Prize. In 1934, Buck divorced and moved back to America. She won the Nobel Prize for Literature in 1938.
Growing up as the daughter of a missionary minister and spending nearly all of the first four decades of her life in China, Pearl Buck considered herself a “cultural bifocal” (Conn, Preface). She was intensely aware of “the tension and misunderstandings which subsisted on the jagged cultural edge between China and the West” (Hunt 35). In her autobiography she stated that even as a child she felt the burden of the history of the whole of the ‘white’ person’s behavior towards China and the Chinese, and was aware of the growing anger of the Chinese against Western arrogance and dominance (Croll 242). She was skeptical about foreign missions, and assumed that missionaries went to China to claim the superiority of their God, not due to their understanding of the needs of China (Croll 244).

With a deep sympathy for the Chinese, Buck felt that she should help American better understand China. Noting that American missionaries had sent back reports conveying their own impression, but “nobody had given the Chinese point of view and reactions to the persons and message of the foreign missionary,” she decided to do it herself (Croll 247).

Buck’s novels transcend “the cultural arrogance endemic to many previous fictional portrayals of Chinese by Westerners” (Baker 24), such as Dr. Fu Manchu and his evil daughter in Sax Rohmer’s popular fiction. Buck is famous for her humanistic and compassionate depiction of Chinese peasants in her novel The Good Earth (1931). The hero of the novel, the hardworking, stable and traditional peasant Wang Lung, has evoked the sympathy of millions of readers. Henry Canby, the journalist, proclaims that The Good Earth “made us feel of the Chinese peasant that all men are brothers” (Canby 10).

However, the novel does not make the reader feel that “all women are sisters.” Wang Lung’s wife, O-lan, is homely and silent, working diligently each day in the fields and at home. She endures much hardship and suffering, raising one child after another while helping Wang Lung rise from a poor peasant to a rich landlord. Yet she never manages to win his passion or his love. Other women in the novel, such as Wang Lung’s

---

76 Sax Rohmer (1883-1959) was a prolific English novelist in the early twentieth century, who produced stereotypical images on Chinese men and women, in a series of detective novels, such as The Mysterious Dr. Fu Manchu (1929), The Return of Dr. Fu Manchu (1930), and Daughter of the Dragon (1931).
concubines Lotus and Pear Blossom, are described as delicate beauties whose personalities are not well developed by Buck. As Colin Mackerras asserts, “Buck portrays an utterly sexist society in which the rich male gets everything and the women are seriously downtrodden. She does not gloss over the dangers inherent in the excessive emphasis on Confucian family relationships or the sufferings they can cause” (71). O-lan echoes the uncomplaining, hardworking women that Safford presents in Typical Women of China. Indeed, in Pearl Buck’s view, it was this capacity for hard work that made Chinese women great (Garrett 25).

Pearl Buck was the first popular Western woman writer to give readers “their first images of and insights into the domestic and social life of Chinese peasants” (Croll 209). However, her presentation of the Chinese reflects the limitations of her own experience and perspective. When Buck won the Pulitzer Prize, she received criticism from Chinese intellectuals in both the United States and China. They felt that although peasants formed the majority of the Chinese population, they could not be considered representative of the Chinese people in general. “The Good Earth gave a ‘common view’ of China rather than of the great literary and cultural tradition of Chinese intellectuals” (qtd. in Croll 237).

Buck’s view on Chinese women was inevitably influenced by her consciousness of being a woman from an advanced country living in a land where a woman’s position was extremely low. Her feminist consciousness was influenced by her mother, who though “long suppressed in her own household, was determined that her daughters should have every possible advantage over their future husbands,” and should always have a sense of independence (Croll 221). During her college years in America, Buck must have been deeply influenced by the feminist movement, when she “threw herself into being wholly American. […] Although she knew that within her lay concealed another life, she lost her heart to America” (Croll 222). When she returned to China, her perspective on the inequality of the Chinese women’s life must have been intensified.

77 In the fourth chapter “Women’s Employment” of Typical Women of China, Safford added some new sources outside of the Lienu Zhuan tradition to present an image of hardworking Chinese woman. From picking mulberry leaves to raising silkworms and weaving clothes, Chinese women, ranging from queen to peasant woman, aged mother to young maiden, were all and always working, and none of them complained, even to the point of sickness or death. Their laborious work from dawn to dark became indispensable for each family. In many cases, they worked even harder than the men. Safford considered this uncomplainingly hardworking as one of the best qualities of Chinese woman. See chapter four “Women’s Employment” in A.C. Safford’s Typical Women of China.
Furthermore, as a writer publishing in America about China and the Chinese, Buck was influenced by the asymmetrical power relationship between the two cultures. As Mackerras comments, “For all her very genuine sympathy with the Chinese peasantry, Pearl Buck’s view was essentially in accord with Western interests, which is why it could be so enthusiastically promoted and received” (77). She intended to make the images more familiar to her readers in the West and to make her characters fit into the acceptable range of “images of Chinese women,” meaning the popular view of submissive and innocent Asian women within the Confucian system. This purpose motivated her to accentuate women’s suffering, to reduce the richness and complexity of the original characters, and to manipulate images into her own stereotypes. The 1937 movie version of The Good Earth reiterated this stereotype and enhanced its impact with sound and visual effects. For decades, many Americans have taken this hard-working, one-dimensional view of the peasant woman as a representative picture of all Chinese women, regardless of their class and geographical location.

Stereotyped images are hard to dispel. As Raymond Dawson points out in his 1964 book, The Legacy of China.

A healthy skepticism must therefore inform our attitude towards what we read about China. Old misconceptions of her civilization live long and die hard, for there is a certain inertia in our historical beliefs, so that they tend to be retained until they are ruthlessly questioned by original minds perhaps centuries after they have ceased to be true. (18)

However, the image of Chinese women in the West changed considerably in the middle 1930s. The most effective effort to contravene Orientalist and Confucianist perceptions finally came from Lin Yutang. The diverse and comprehensible images of Chinese women in his English writings and translations significantly improved the general impression of Chinese women and were well received by English audiences. Colin Mackerras states that, “one of the most important of all developments of the first half of the twentieth century was the beginnings of major attempts by the Chinese themselves to influence Western images of their own country.” He names Lin Yutang as one of the most important writers to promote a “positive view to Western readership” (64-65).
CHAPTER TWO: THE RISE OF LIN YUTANG AND THE FORMATION OF HIS DISTINCTIVE VOICE ON THE SUBJECT OF CHINESE WOMEN

This chapter focuses on the rise of Lin Yutang in the modern Chinese and Western literary world, and the formation of his distinctive voice concerning Chinese women in a post-colonial, cross-cultural world. The chapter is divided into three parts. In Part One I introduce Lin’s family background and his early education, explaining how the post-colonial seed germinated in his spirit, and how his bilingual and bicultural experience began. I then examine the strong impact the May Fourth Literary Renaissance and Gu Hongming had on Lin’s intellectual growth, and how Lin’s move to the U.S. increased the influence of his English works in the West. In Part Two, I explore the reasons behind Lin’s strong interest in portraying Chinese women and the influences on the formation of his feminist thought by examining the impact of a family tragedy on Lin and his participation in the May Fourth male intellectuals’ discourse on Chinese women’s problems. I interpret Lin’s feminist views in his article “Ancient Feminist Thought in China,” and the chapter “Women’s Life” in his My Country and My People. In Part Three, I outline a gallery of female images which appear in Lin’s translations, rewriting, adaptation and creative writing. I take the image of Nanzi (Nancy), an ancient Chinese queen in Lin’s drama Confucius Met Nanzi, as an example to illustrate how Lin’s feminist thought and translational strategies were formed and developed in the process of recreating this image. Finally, I explain the reasons why I select four women: Yun, Yiyun, Widow Quan and Miss Du in Lin’s translation, adaptation and rewriting for detailed examination in subsequent chapters.
I. The Rise of Lin Yutang

A. Lin’s Early Education and the Growth of his Post-colonial Consciousness

Lin Yutang (林语堂) was born Lin Holok (林和乐) into a Chinese Presbyterian minister’s family in 1895 in the town of Poa-ah [Banzi, 坂仔] in Southern China Fujian province. This coastal province was impacted early by Western colonization, and directly affected by China’s defeat in the First Sino-Japanese War. Later, Lin wrote that the year he was born was “the year of the Treaty of Shimonoseki between China and Japan, which ceded Formosa and recognized the independence of Korea, after the disastrous war with Japan in the previous year” (From Pagan 19).

Lin grew up during a critical period of China’s transformation from traditional to modern. Lin’s early contacts and education were closely related to the Western Christian tradition. However, the realities he saw and experienced—the missionaries’ arrival in China at the same time as the arrival of gunboats and opium, and the suffering of his country and people, planted an anti-colonial seed in his heart.

Lin’s childhood memories were filled with church and ministry. “One of my earliest recollections as a child was that of sliding down the roof of the church” (From Pagan 19). Lin’s father, Lin Zhicheng, according to Lin Yutang, was an “idealist,” “an incorrigible dreamer,” and a church builder (Memoirs 12-14). He was devout and often zealous, not only about Christianity, but also about Western studies and reform. He lived a life of turmoil and poverty, and sincerely hoped that China would be strengthened and modernized through learning from the West (Memoirs 21). “My father, I believe, read all that was available about the Western world.” Allen Young’s Chinese Globe Magazine was one such influence on the Lin’s household. Lin said that his father was an “ultra-
progressive" among Chinese ‘progressive’ Christians; he spoke often of the Western schools in Shanghai and the universities of Berlin and Oxford, and was determined to provide his children with the best learning available in both the Chinese and Western traditions (From Pagan 24).

When Lin was ten, he left home to attend a missionary school on the island of Kulangsu (Ku-lang-yu), Amoy. Later, he entered the Union Middle school there. The island of Kulangsu, since 1903, had been governed by a six-member Council (under the control of the United States, Great Britain, Germany, Holland, Spain and Japan) and a Chinese “representative of the Taotai of Amoy.” It was officially the International Settlement, the residential quarter of the diplomatic, mercantile and missionary communities.” Every month, approximately seventy-five to one hundred foreign ships entered the harbor (Sohigian 37). “From 1904 to 1910 Lin lived between the two worlds of the foreign settlement (during the school year) and his native mountain village (in the summer)” (Sohigian 39). His adolescent memories were marked by a series of ‘first contacts’ with the West: the treaty-port world of foreign gunboats, missionaries and merchants, a feeling of “fascinating,” and “speechless” admiration for the ‘movements of a steam engine on a coastal steamer’ (Sohigian 49), and a young Chinese’s awareness of the missionaries’ cooperation with colonization. Lin recalled later: “As far as the Chinese could see, the missionaries were nice enough to take care of their souls, so when the gunboats blew our bodies to bits, we were bound to go up to Heaven” (From Pagan 36).

After Lin graduated from middle school, his father borrowed money to send him to St. John’s University in Shanghai. Lin spent five years there. The school was considered the best in English education at that time in China. “Though Episcopalian,” Lin described, “its sacred mission for the majority of the students was to produce successful compradors as aides to Shanghai tycoons” (From Pagan 29). Lin enjoyed the college life, being especially active in sports. He was also diligent in learning. As a freshman he read almost everything in the library (Memoirs 29). However, he soon discovered that his classes could not meet his intellectual thirst, and they kept him from knowledge of his own people and culture:
[... ] there were also disadvantages to a Christian education that soon became apparent. I had cut myself off not only from Chinese philosophy but also from Chinese folklore. Not to know Chinese philosophy as such was excusable in a Chinese, but not to know the common ghosts and folk tales of China was obviously ridiculous. What had happened was that my Christian upbringing was too perfect. There was an element of Calvinism in it. [...] I had been cheated of my national heritage. [...] I determined to plunge into the great stream of our national consciousness. (From Pagan 34)

His interest in religious studies thus retreated rapidly. He dropped out of the Theological School though he remained at St. John’s, and graduated as the second best student from the university.

"After graduation, I went to Peking to teach at Tsinghua [Qinghua]. To live in Peking then was to come into contact with authentic Chinese society, to see, as it were, ancient China made manifest" (From Pagan 33). Lin spent three significant years in Beijing, from 1916 to 1919, plunging into the “great stream of our national consciousness,” and became further detached from his Christian education (From Pagan 35). This was during the time of the First World War, the tumultuous beginning of the Republic of China, and the stirrings of the May Fourth Cultural Movement. It was the time of Lin’s intellectual foundation and growth, for re-evaluating his own value system, and also the beginning of his great writing career. In 1919, Lin married Liao Cuifeng, a daughter of a wealthy banker and a graduate of St. Mary’s School in Shanghai. The same year he received a half-tuition scholarship to attend Harvard. With a monthly stipend of forty dollars and another thousand dollars from his wife’s dowry, Lin and his new bride left for the United States, to begin four years of study aboard. Lin completed his Master’s Degree in Comparative Literature at Harvard in 1921 and his PhD in Chinese Linguistics at the University of Leipzig in 1923. That same year, Lin accepted a teaching position at Beijing University and returned to China.

---

80 The May Fourth Movement (五四运动) took place on May 4, 1919. It was ignited by the secret selling of China by the Allies at the Versailles Conference after the First World War. It started with student demonstration in Tiananmen Square, and soon grew into a nation-wide, anti-imperialist, cultural, and political movement. It marked the rise of Chinese nationalism, the re-evaluation of traditional Chinese culture, and the growth of the New Cultural Movement.

81 Lin was also fluent in German, but he did not publish in the German language other than his PhD thesis.
B. The Growth of Lin’s Individual Voice in the May Fourth Era and Lin’s Move to the West

Lin belonged to the young generation of May Fourth Chinese intellectuals. He met Hu Shi, the leading intellectual of the May Fourth Cultural Renaissance in 1917 and considered Hu one of the “two first-class minds which left an indelible influence” on him (From Pagan 44). Lin recalled that their first meeting “was an electrifying experience, I felt instinctive sympathy for the whole progressive attitude of the movement,” and was captivated by its anti-Confucianist and liberal force (From Pagan 44). Lin was abroad during the most dramatic stage of the May Fourth movement, but once he returned to China he immediately joined a series of cultural and literary groups. He became an active member of several influential literary journals, such as Yusi, and Benliu, where he worked together with Lu Xun, Zhou Zuoren, and Yu Dafu, prominent May Fourth writers. Lin’s intellectual growth was profoundly influenced by these writers; his personal spirit was permanently marked by iconoclasm, romanticism and individualism of the May Fourth movement.

---

82 Hu Shi (胡适 1891-1962), one of the leading intellectuals who initiated the literary revolution. He advocated the change of normal literary expression from classical to vernacular Chinese while he was a postgraduate student at Columbia University under the supervision of John Dewey. He returned to Beijing University in 1917.

83 May Fourth Literary Renaissance, also called May Fourth New Cultural Movement, started in 1917, lead by Hu Shi, Chen Duxiu, Lu Xun, etc. The literary journal New Youth (Xin Qingnian 新青年), which was established in 1915 in Shanghai, was the centre for expressing their intellectual voices. This movement marked the beginning of modern Chinese literature. For more detailed discussion please read Jonathan Spence, The Search for Modern China (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1990), and Vera Schwartz, The Chinese Enlightenment: Intellectuals and the Legacy of the May Fourth Movement of 1919 (London: The University of California Press, 1986).

84 When Lin was in dire financial straits while in America, Hu Shi sent him two thousand dollars of his own money. See Lin, Zizhuan, 74.

85 The first year of the May Fourth Movement, 1919, included student demonstrations and a series of direct conflicts with the government.

86 Yusi (语丝), literally means “threads of the words.” It was a famous literary journal in the 1920s and 1930s. A group of writers headed by Lu Xun and Zhou Zuoren, contributors to this journal, were called “Yusi Writers.” Lin Yutang was one of them.

87 Benliu (奔流), which literally means “Racing Current,” was another important left-wing journal in the 1920s, edited by Lu Xun and Yu Dafu.

88 Lun Xun (鲁迅, 1881-1936), born as Zhou Shuren (周树人), a prominent modern Chinese writer and thinker, was considered to be the leader of left-wing Chinese writers in the 1930s. Zhou Zuoren (周作人 1885-1967), Lu Xun’s younger brother, was a famous yet controversial writer and thinker in modern China. Yu Dafu (郁达夫 1896-1945), important modern Chinese writer. His writing was deeply influenced by Western Romanticism. He was one of Lin Yutang’s closest friends.
Lin, however, developed his own voice among the May Fourth intellectuals. While most writers wanted China’s cultural transformation to be achieved by abandoning traditions and importing Western ideologies (Schwartz 107), Lin turned his gaze to the past to illuminate the importance of integrating culture and tradition into China’s modernization. Lin’s Christian and Western education as well as his experiences abroad provided him with an alternative viewpoint by which to examine and interpret his own national culture. His cross-cultural consciousness was one that many other May Fourth writers did not have, and was one he shared with Gu Hongming, the pioneering Chinese bilingual intellectual.

Lin later noted the critical role Gu Hongming played in the direction of his beliefs and career. While a student at St. John’s University, Lin began reading everything Gu Hongming published. He admired Gu’s “first-class mind,” his “insight and depth,” and was greatly inspired by his attempts to introduce Chinese culture to the West (From Pagan 46). It was Gu Hongming’s call to rediscover Chinese history and heritage that stimulated Lin to begin his own exploration of traditional Chinese culture and to explore “the obscure, luxuriant jungle of Chinese thought” (From Pagan 57). Gu’s high estimation of Chinese civilization and his effort to correct the misinterpreted Confucian spirit to the West first inspired Lin’s cross-cultural writing.

1. Early Effort in Interpreting Chinese Culture in English

As early as 1917, Lin published in English, “Li: The Chinese Principle of Social Control and Organization,” aimed at correcting certain misinterpretations of “Li” (礼), the Chinese rites. At the beginning of this article, Lin highlights the importance of using a Chinese viewpoint in interpreting China’s cultural essence:

The task of trying to observe a foreign country and explain its social and political phenomena, without the assistance of a correct appreciation of the native ideals and aspirations, is perhaps too great for any observer, however keen he may be. Details often magnify out of their proper proportions; motives are only vaguely guessed at; things lose their perspective; the personal equation of the writer always comes in to disturb the balance. ("Li" 106)

Lin believes that the nation’s “true ideals and motives” and “the guiding conception of its own unity” could be found in the Chinese Classics ("Li" 106-07). He points out that
"China has never been systematically interpreted as a national unity with one faith and ideal," thus a better interpretation of these Classics will help an outsider to understand China and its people. Moreover, Lin considers this interpretation an urgent task, as "in this present age of fundamental conflicts it behooves us to regain our own perspective and see where our strength in the past lay" ("Li" 107). In Lin’s view, "Li" is an important principle of the Chinese social organization, a moral code of social control.

Li is the vital possession of man. It is the instrument to inculcate mutual honesty and promote peaceful relationships, to strengthen the important relations of life. It is the great system to nourish the living, to give due funeral to the dead, and to worship the spirits. It is the great channel through which we bring ourselves into harmony with the principles of Heaven and of human nature. ("Li" 116)

Lin then analyzes the “practicableness” of Li in a time of drastic change owing to the contact with Western civilization ("Li" 117). He sees an unavoidable conflict, as “Li is essentially connected with the family system which is in spirit and in principle clearly contradictory to Western individualism.” In addition, the moral conduct of “Li” “is more or less stiff and artificial.” He worries that “the principle at its very basis may possibly be ruled out entirely,” and “when this degree of change is reached, the change will certainly involve more loss than gain.”

It all depends on how well the present social scheme can stand the stress of the new industrial environments and the influx of new ideas. But one thing is clear wherever the western ideas prevail, individualism will be found the deadliest foe of Li. In the fight or the adjustment of these two principles, will the future structure of Chinese society be mainly determined. ("Li" 118)

This article, published when Lin was twenty-two, reveals his deep concern for China’s radical transformation through modernization, and his intention to integrate the traditional cultural essence into China’s modernity. It also signals the start of his ambitious and lifelong project to change the stereotypical images about China, and to provide a more accurate and positive picture of his country to the West.

Like Gu Hongming, Lin intended to use ‘culture’ as an important discursive power in resisting Western imperialism and the missionary interpretations of the Chinese. While Gu focused on the Confucian tradition, Lin moved beyond Confucianism and emphasized the strong influence of Daoism and Buddhism in the lives of the common people. This provided a broader and more multi-levelled tradition which truly reflected
“the breadth or broadness of Chinese, but also the simplicity and delicacy and depth” (From Pagan 57). He was interested in authentic Chinese classics and historical records, and also in “inauthentic” materials, such as fiction, dramas, legends, tales, and autobiographies of common people. Not only did he study the lives of Chinese men, but also those of Chinese women. After he returned to China in the 1920s, Lin read many books of ancient philosophy and literature, and became a Chinese scholar. This education created a strong and rich base from which he could write. At this time, the Republic of China was failing, which ironically provided a remarkably free intellectual atmosphere. It was also a period in which native intellectuals in many countries emerged to resist colonial domination by Western imperialism and to establish their own voices. The political and social environment both in China and in the world played a significant role in Lin’s intellectual growth.

2. Promoting his own Literary and Aesthetic Ideals in a Time of Political Crisis

In the late 1920s and the early 1930s, Lin Yutang gradually rose to become one of the brightest and most influential writers on the Chinese literary scene. He was recognized for his humorous and leisurely personal essays, and his poignant cultural critiques. He was also widely known for his one-act tragicomedy Confucius Met Nanzi, which was performed in many large cities in China. Lin was especially well-known in literary circles for his enthusiastic promotion of “xing1ing” (xing1ing expression of personal nature), “xianshi” (xianshi leisure) and “youmo” (youmo humour) in three popular journals, Lunyu (The Ana1ects), Renjianshi (This Human World), and Yuzhou Feng (Cosmic Wind). In addition, he was well-regarded for his Chinese to English, and English to Chinese translations, as well as his translation theory.

89 In Confucian tradition, fiction, folklore, and popular drama were considered as inauthentic and not worthy of serious consideration.
90 “Xingling” is also translated as “native sensibility,” or “self-expression.”
91 Lunyu was created in 1932.
92 Renjianshi was created in 1932.
93 Yuzhou Feng was created in 1935.
“Xingling,” “xianshi” and “youmo,” were three of Lin’s important literary, aesthetic, and philosophical ideals, which were reflected in his literary practice and ideological pursuit.

a. Xingling

Lin believed that literature and poetry must express the true feelings of personal nature. His interest in “xingling” started when he was a graduate student at Harvard. He appreciated J.E. Spingarn’s literary theory of “art is expression” which emphasized “the unbound freedom and individuality given to the artist and art work” (Qian 78). After he returned to Beijing and worked for the Yusi journal, Lin started to promote his own ideal of “art is expression.” One of his earliest translations (from English to Chinese) was *New Literary Criticism* (Xin de wenping 《新的文评》, 1929), which included essays by Spingarn, Croce, and others. This provides a theoretical footnote for the literary practice in Yusi. Meanwhile he searched for literary theorists in the Chinese tradition who held similar views (Qian 78).

In 1934, Zhou Zuoren published *Sources of New Chinese Literature*, in which he traced the origins of modern propositions of ‘New Literature’ to the late Ming “xingling” school as represented by the three Yuan brothers, Yuan Zongdao, Yuan Hongdao and Yuan Zhongdao of the ‘Gong’an school’ (Qian 62-63). The central belief ‘Gong’an school’ was that “literature is the expression of one’s xingling or personal nature; the more authentic the expression of that nature, with the least obstruction from the forces of tradition and convention, the better the literature will be” (Hanan Invention 34-35). Lin was thrilled with this study of the “xingling” school (Qian 62-63), believing

---

94 This school challenged the “Neo-Humanism” school of moralists led by another Harvard professor, Irving Babbitt. Lin was Professor Babbitt’s student, but he was attracted by Spingarn’s aesthetic stance. See Jun Qian, "Lin Yutang: Negotiating Modernity between East and West," University of California, 1996.73-78.

95 The book was developed from his series of lectures given at Furen University in 1932.

96 Yuan Hongdao (袁宏道 1568-1610) was an important poet of the Ming dynasty, and one of the three Yuan Brothers, who were known as the masters of the Gong’an literary school, as they were all from Gong’an of Hubei Province.

97 A companion book, *A Selection of Essays from Recent Times* (Jindai Sanwen Chao 《近代散文抄》) was also compiled by Shen Qiwu (沈启无), in which major writings of the ‘xingling’ school, starting from the Yuan brothers to Jin Shengtan (金圣叹 1610-1661), Li Liweng (李立翁 1610-1680) and Yuan Mei (袁枚 1716-1797), were represented. See Qiwu Shen, ed., *Jindai Sanwen Chao* [近代散文抄] (Hongkong: Tianhong Chubanshe, 1957).
that he had found “a cross-cultural affinity” between the Western Expression School and the Chinese “xingling” school, which “also carries a modern significance” (Qian 80). In the same year, Lin, working with Liu Dajie,98 edited and published The Complete Works of Yuan Zhonglang. He also wrote the article, “On Literature” (“论文”),99 (“On Literature [论文]” in which he claimed that “Yuan Zhonglang, his “xingling” school and the Western expressionist criticism have both arrived at the same insight from different historical and cultural backgrounds concerning literary creation” (Qian 80). Lin defined “xing” as one’s “personal nature” and “ling” as one’s “soul” or “vital spirit”, and “xingling literature” as the unrestrained and free expression of one’s individuality (“gexing”). He believed that this was where the life of literature really lies (Sohigian 511; Qian 80-81). Zhou Zuoren’s theoretical exploration and Lin Yutang’s fervent proclamation “made “xingling” and Yuan Zhonglang suddenly the talk of the town (Qian 63), and brought to light Yuan Zhonglang’s prose which had been long forgotten. These were some of the finest essays in classical Chinese literature “revealing the inner working of the individual often told in a deliciously humorous manner” (Sohigian 524).

**b. Xianshi**

Lin also promoted the concept of “xianshi” (leisure) which he considered a philosophy for enjoying life. He believed “xianshi” was a model for expressing “xingling” in real life, and “xiaopin” (小品, short piece) was the best literary form to represent this style. Lin translated “xiaopin” as “familiar essays,” denoting its personal, leisurely style. This style, in Lin’s description, is “leisurely and chatty and suave, as disarmingly hospitable as a friend’s chat by the fireside and as poetically disorderly as the recluse’s dress, a style trenchant and yet mellow, like good old wine” (My Country 323-24). Lin launched the literary magazine Renjianshi (This Human World) to encourage the writing of “xiaopin.” According to Lin, any essay ‘with self as centre,’ and ‘xianshi’ as style was a “xiaopin”; the subject could be as great as ‘the universe,’ and as tiny as a ‘fly’ (qtd. in T. Lin 83). Lin’s promoting of, and his own “xiaopin” writing, played a leading

role in the revival of personal essay writing in the 1930s in China. It also helped Lin to
develop, both in Chinese and in English, an attractive writing style, which allowed him to
establish a familiar and leisurely rapport with his readers.

c. Humour

Lin was called the “Master of Humour” in the literary circles of China during the
1930s. He was the first Chinese to introduce and transliterate the word ‘humour” (as early
as 1924), and was one of the few writers to produce humorous literature (such as his
personal essays and his play Confucius Met Nanzi). In addition, he created the literary
journal Lunyu (Analects) to promote humour. According to Lin, “Humour is a state of
mind. More than that, it is a point of view, a way of looking at life” (My Country 66).
“Subtle common sense, gaiety of philosophy and simplicity of thinking are characteristic
of humour and must arise from it” (Living 79). He valued the function of humour highly:
“I doubt whether the importance of humour has been fully appreciated, or the possibility
of its use in changing the quality and character of our entire cultural life” (Living 76).
George Bernard Shaw, particularly admired by Lin, wrote, “My way of joking is to tell
the truth; it is the funniest thing in the world.” Lin used humour to advance his
thoughts in his literary practice. In some of Lin’s essays in Analects, he poked fun at
diehards and militarists, and delighted his readers with both criticism and entertainment.

Like Lin’s view of “xingling,” his theory and practice of humour were also cross-
culturally formulated. Lin’s 1934 essay, “On Humour,” was developed from George
Meredith’s essay “On Comedy.” Lin agreed with Meredith’s statement, “One excellent
test of the civilization of a country [is] the flourishing of the comic idea and comedy; and
the test of true comedy is that it shall awaken thoughtful laughter” (qtd. in Qian 107). He
believed that “Theoretically, at least, the Chinese people should have humour, for
humour is born of realism; and the Chinese have an overdose of common sense” (My
Country 66-67). In responding to these Western theories of comedy and humour, Lin

100 Lin translated George Bernard Shaw’s play Pygmalion into Chinese, and highlighted this sentence in his
preface to the translation of Pygmalion. See Lin, Mingzhu. 27: 87.
101 First published in the Journal Lunyu (Analects) 33&34 (1934). It was reprinted in Lin, Mingzhu. 14: 4-17.
102 See the discussions in Jianwei Shi, Lin Yutang Yanjiu Lunji (Shanghai: Tongji University Press,
1997).1&2; Sohigian, “The Life and Times of Lin Yutang.” 494; Qian Jun’s discussion in Qian, "Lin
Yutang: Negotiating ". 103-107.
painstakingly researched the humour in ‘Chinese earth’ and thirstily absorbed the humorous “nutrition” of Chinese philosophers, poets, and writers, such as Zhuangzi, Confucius, Tao Yuanming, Li Bai, Du Fu, Su Dongpo, and Yuan Mei, thereby developing his own distinct understanding and style of humour (My Country 67). Lin’s enthusiasm for humour made “humorous” literature an important phenomenon on the modern Chinese literary scene. The year of 1932 was called the “Year of Humour” due to the launch of *Lunyu*.

All three literary journals, *Lunyu*, *Renjianshi*, and *Yuzhou Feng*, were very popular in the 1930s, especially among young intellectuals. A group of writers who shared Lin’s literary and aesthetic ideals contributed to the journals regularly, such as Zhou Zuoren, Yu Dafu, Lao She,103 and Lao Xiang.104 Their familiar essays brought Chinese literature a fresh atmosphere and unconstrained tone. However, these journals were criticized by writers with different ideologies. For instance, Lu Xun, the prominent May Fourth writer and a personal friend of Lin’s, was opposed to what Lin promoted. In his essay “Scholars Scorn Each Other (2)” written in early 1935, Lu Xun declared that literature should function as a “political weapon” against the evils of the society. “A writer should attack what he dislikes just as fervently as he praises what he approves.” “Xiaopin,” for this purpose, was thus too compromising and passive (“Scholars” 175-82). While Lin Yutang was the master of “xiaopin,” Lu Xun was the master of the “zawen” (barbed essay). These “barbed essays” were short and satirical social critiques. Lu Xun also did not agree with Lin’s promotion of humor. In an essay he wrote for the journal Analects, he claimed that there is no humor in China; humor is “a kind of plaything which only a people [like the British] who like to attend round table conferences could invent; in China we can’t even come up with a rough equivalent for it” (qtd. in Sohigian 483).

Lu Xun and Lin Yutang’s views reflected two different literary ideals in Chinese tradition, ‘zai dao’ (载道 didacticism) and ‘yan zhi’ (言志 individual expression). However, this ideological and aesthetic conflict was intensified by the political turmoil.

---

103 Lao She (1899-1966), a noted novelist and dramatist of modern China. His work was infused with humour.
104 Lao Xiang (1901-1968), another noted humorist from modern China. He wrote the original story of “Widow Chuan.”
existing in China in the 1930s. The Nationalists and Communists were attacking and killing each other. Both sides wanted to “dictate what literature should be,” and claimed that their “panacea” for “national salvation” had a monopoly on the truth (Sohigian 467). Meanwhile, Japanese was getting more aggressive in invading China. A representative of the “writers of national literature,” Lu Xun developed a strong disagreement with Lin Yutang. Lu Xun mocked Lin’s humor as obliterating class distinctions. He said that Lin Yutang who collected royalties on his “humor magazine” could laugh, but “how can those who inhabit the bomb craters and areas devastated by floods speak of ‘humor?’” A group of Britons at a round table conference could be humorous, “but between guest-invaders and conquered-hosts there will be no use for ‘humor.’” (qtd. in Sohigian 486). Meanwhile, Lin was also attacked by the rightist moralists, as his “humorism” troubled the “Spartan New Life Movement” which had been initiated by the Guomindang government (Sohigian 491). However, such criticism and attacks made Lin even more widely known and his magazines increasingly popular, especially among students. Analects eventually became the most popular magazine in China at that time.

d. Translation Practice and Theory

In the late 1920s and early 1930s, Lin translated a series of English books into Chinese, such as New Literary Criticism, Dora Russell’s Women and Knowledge, and Bernard Shaw’s Pygmalion, and A Biography of Henrik Ibsen by George Brandeis. He also translated several Chinese books into English, such as Letters of a Chinese Amazon and War-Time Essays, and the translation of his own play, Confucius Saw Nancy. In the course of this work, Lin developed his own translation theory.

In 1933, Lin published a lengthy article “On Translation,” in the journal Philological Discussions (语言学论丛). Unlike other articles on translation written at that time, which primarily addressed the translator’s personal experience, or particular aspects of translation, such as how to translate names or poems, Lin’s article analyzed

---

105 This essay was the most systematic and comprehensive translation theory to appear in China in the 1930s. His translation theory was based on his knowledge and skills in both languages, as well as on his broad interdisciplinary background in linguistics, psychology, aesthetics, and creative writing. The critics he cites include Croce, Sapir, and Palmer. The essay was reprinted in Yutang Lin, “On Translation,” Selected Essays on Translation, ed. Chia-Teh Huang (Shanghai: Xi Feng Society, 1941). 6-32.
translation from linguistic, literary, psychological, and cross-cultural perspectives. He focused on the essential requirements for a translator and the basic standards for translation. He claimed that “translation is an art.” He saw fidelity to the original as the translator’s responsibility; fluency as the translator’s responsibility to the readers in the target culture, and beauty as the responsibility to art. Lin’s article became a cornerstone in the field of translation studies in China. 106

Though Lin made important contributions to the theory of translation and to the practice of translating English works into Chinese, his primary interest lay in translating Chinese works into English. In the early 1930s, Lu Xun advised Lin Yutang to devote more energy to translating English works into Chinese. 107 But Lin said that he would first translate Chinese works into English and follow Lu Xun’s advice in his later life. He considered translating Chinese into English a more urgent task and wanted to do it during the most energetic years of his life. 108 This response made Lu Xun unhappy, and caused problems for their friendship. Lin’s response to Lu Xun’s suggestion, however, reflected Lin’s attitude towards the relationship between China and the West in the context of modernizing China. Lin’s views were different from those mainstream Chinese writers who focused more on importing Western ideas into the Chinese world, thus stressed the endotropic translation. Lin’s emphasis on the urgency of exotropic translation revealed his cross-cultural concern that other May Fourth writers did not emphasize, and reflected the strong influence of Gu Hongming.

3. Growing Influence in the West

Lin’s ambition was to introduce Chinese culture to the West, not merely by translating Chinese works into English, but also by writing his own works in English. During the early 1930s, Lin was a regular contributor to English language journals in

---

106 Lin’s main concept of translation and his insights were innovative for China in the 1930s. They are commensurate to the spirit of the descriptive translation studies in the West, which started in the 1980s, and have become popular since the 1990s.

107 This was recorded in a letter Lu Xun wrote to his friend Cao Juren in 1934. See Xun Lu, Lu Xun Quan Ji [The Complete Work of Lu Xun 鲁迅全集], 16 vols. (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chubanshe, 1981). 12: 505-506.

108 Lin’s own explanation of this issue was recorded by his friend Tao Kangde. See Kangde Tao, "Lin Yutang and Translation," Yijing [逸经] 11 (1936).
Shanghai such as Tien Hsia Monthly\textsuperscript{109} and The China Critic.\textsuperscript{110} In these essays, Lin reinterpreted the Chinese cultural values from a modern intellectual’s perspective, acting as a mediator between East and West. It was in T’ien Hsia Monthly that Lin published his essay “Feminist Thought in Ancient China,” and the preface to his book History of the Press and Public Opinion in China (1936), a history about protest and censorship in China and a critique about the then-current publishing world in Shanghai. It was also in T’ien Hsia Monthly that Lin first published his Chinese-English translation Six Chapters of a Floating Life.\textsuperscript{111} By providing a fresh look at China’s past and a vigorous critique of current social and political conditions, Lin’s writings and translations in these journals became popular among English readers living in China at that time, and caught the attention of Pearl Buck. She was deeply impressed by Lin’s insight into both Chinese and Western culture and by his bilingual talent. She encouraged Lin to write about China in English, and offered her help in publishing such a book in America. Lin accepted Buck’s proposal, and completed My Country and My People during the summer of 1935.

\textbf{My Country and My People}, published in New York in 1935 by the John Day Company,\textsuperscript{112} caused a great sensation in the United States. In this book Lin introduces Western readers to Chinese history, character, arts and aesthetics, and way of life. Taking an ethnographic approach, similar to Arthur Smith’s, Lin presents certain characteristics of the Chinese, such as mellowness, patience, pacifism, contentment, humour, and conservatism. Lin presents these qualities in a much more positive manner than had Arthur Smith.\textsuperscript{113} He illustrates the importance of Confucianism to Chinese character and culture, but also emphasizes the impact of Daoism and Buddhism on Chinese life and especially on Chinese art. He believes that “the Chinese are past masters in the art of

\textsuperscript{109} (1935-1941), a prestigious English journal in Shanghai. Both Chinese and Western scholars contributed to this journal.

\textsuperscript{110} The China Critic, the Only Chinese Edited English journal, was founded in 1928 by a group of Western-returned Chinese intellectuals, intended to introduce Chinese culture to the West, Western culture to China, and present the Chinese view on current affairs. See Shuang Shen, "Self, Nation, and the Diaspora--Re-Reading Lin Yutang, Bai Xianyong, and Frank Chin," The City University of New York, 1997.53.

\textsuperscript{111} I discuss Lin’s translation of Shen Fu’s 1706 memoir, Fu sheng liu ji, in Chapter Three.

\textsuperscript{112} Pearl Buck’s second husband Richard Walsh was the publisher of the John Day Company.

\textsuperscript{113} Chinese characteristics listed by Arthur Smith were: face, economy, industry, politeness, the disregard of time, the disregard of accuracy …. See Arthur Henderson Smith, Chinese Characteristics, rev. ed. (New York: F.H. Revell, 1894).
living,” and “in China the spiritual values have not been separated from the material values, but rather help man in a keener enjoyment of life as it falls to our lot. This accounts for our joviality and our incorrigible humour” (My Country 326). While characterizing the Chinese cultural distinctions, Lin also draws readers’ attention to the similarities and differences between Chinese and Western civilizations. In addition, Lin’s narrative style is highly personal, creating a disarming and humorous tone, which makes his voice lively and convincing. My Country and My People immediately became a best seller, reaching its seventh reprinting by March of 1938. Pearl Buck considered it “the truest, the most profound, the most important book yet written about China” (Preface to My Country xvi). She praised Lin as “a modern English-writing Chinese who was not so detached from his own people as to be alien to them, and yet detached enough to comprehend their meaning, the meaning of their age and the meaning of their youth” (Preface to My Country xvi). After this book was published, Lin’s readers extended to a general Western readership.

4. Political Rift and Lin’s “Walking the Tightrope”

In the mid-1930s, the attacks on Lin Yutang from both conservative and ultra-radical political writers were getting worse. Lin refused to make a choice between the increasingly polarized “armed camps”--the Communist and Kuomintang. He insisted that literature be treated with traditional “reverence,” and not be put to use in political doctrine and propaganda. Lin’s beliefs and his literary practice during this politically critical time made him feel that he was “walking on a tightrope at the circus” (qtd. in T. Lin 69): while delighting the audience by his talent, he was also aware of the hidden danger. Lin’s interests in “xingling,” “humour” and “leisure” gradually estranged him from mainstream May Fourth writers. Several literary magazines such as Xin Yulin (新语林), Tai Bai (太白), and Mangzhong (芒种), were launched by leftist zealots specifically to assail Lin and the “Analects school” (论语派) (T. Lin 84). Lin was criticized not only for being “trivial,” “self-indulgent,” “hedonistic,” and out of tempo with the Chinese reality, but also for being “a jester whose laughter bred widespread pessimism and apathy in the face of national crisis and humiliation” (Sohigian 528). In a special 1935 New Year’s issue of Wenxue (Literature), Hu Feng
Luo Ping (1903-1985), a key leftwing literary critic, wrote an article “On Lin Yutang,” (“林语堂论”) which systematically attacked Lin’s literary and aesthetic stances and his interpretation of “individualism.” Hu Feng asserted that Lin’s literary ideals did not fit into the immediate political and social atmosphere of China. Lin fought back. In his article “An Inquiry into the Orthodoxy of Square-Capped Officialdom” (“方金妻研究”), Lin ironically called some of these critics the modern version of the antiquarian “square-capped” scholar-officials (i.e. the Neo-Confucian scholars). In the preface to My Country and My People, Lin stated that his book was aimed at those “who have not lost their sense of ultimate human values.”

It is inevitable that I should offend many writers about China, especially my own countrymen and great patriots. These great patriots—I have nothing to do with them, for their god is not my god, and their patriotism is not my patriotism. Perhaps I too love my own country, but I take care to conceal it before them. [...] I am able to confess because, unlike these patriots, I am not ashamed of my country. And I lay bare her troubles because I have not lost hope. China is bigger than her patriots and does not require their whitewashing.” (My Country xvii-xviii)

Encouraged by Pearl Buck, Lin Yutang moved to the US with his family in 1936. This move precipitated a momentous change for Lin, which turned him from a mainly modern Chinese writer to a significant translingual figure. “Times create heroes.” A new chapter of his life opened. Soon, Lin published his second book in English, The Importance of Living (1937), in which he offers his insights into the simple joy of existence found in ancient Chinese wisdom, and discusses the differences between Eastern and Western cultures. The book became a national best seller for all of 1938 in America and was translated into eight languages. Lin thus established his reputation as a cosmopolitan writer and Oriental philosopher “with no peer in the West”, and was identified as an interpreter of Chinese culture “in a way no person has ever done before” (qtd. in T. Lin 156). In the following thirty years, Lin published more than thirty fiction and non-fiction books in English, including translation and reinterpretation of philosophical and literary works. Lin created a legacy of Chinese culture in the West that no one has surpassed, even today.

---

114 The article “方巾气研究” was published in 1934. It was collected in Lin, Mingzhu. 14: 168-173.
115 Lin and his family lived in New York for about 30 years, until they moved to Taiwan in 1966.
116 A Chinese idiom, “时势造英雄.”
II. The Formation of Lin’s Feminist Spirit and Thought

Chinese women and feminine qualities occupy a significant portion of Lin’s work in English. Lin not only wrote an article on feminist thought in traditional China and a specific chapter on women’s life in his book *My Country and My People*, but also presented a large number of images of Chinese women in his English translation, adaptation, rewriting, and creative writing. Why was Lin so keen on the subject of Chinese women? How was his thought on Chinese women cross-culturally formed and developed? How significant are these images in expressing his feminist thought and in introducing Chinese culture to the West? What are the factors that subtly affected his English voice on the subject of Chinese women? These are the questions I address in the following discussion.

A. The Impact of Lin’s Family Tragedy

Many factors, including his personal experience and the social environment of early twentieth-century China and the West, motivated Lin Yutang to write about Chinese women. The women in his life: his mother, sisters, childhood girlfriend, the romantic lover of his youth, his wife, and their three daughters, all played significant roles in Lin’s understanding of Chinese women and developed his feminist spirit. According to Lin’s second daughter, Lin Taiyi, during the years Lin and his family lived in America, the daughters frequently encountered questions such as “why don’t you have small feet?” or “why aren’t your eyes two ends up?” (Lin and Lin 103-04). Lin’s effort in introducing a positive picture of Chinese women and countering the stereotypes must have stemmed, at least in part, from his love and protectiveness for his wife and daughters. However, the root of Lin’s lifelong interest in the subject of Chinese women, in my view, was deeply embedded in his youth.

Lin grew up in a poor, yet happy, family with five brothers and two sisters in the countryside at the turn of the twentieth century. Lin’s mother, Yang Shunming (杨顺命), was born into a non-Christian family, and had bound feet. In Lin’s memory, she was a

---

117 According to Lin’s biography written by his daughter Lin Taiyi, Lin experienced romantic and bitter love when he was senior at St. John’s. He passionately fell in love with Chen Jinduan, a beautiful and talented girl, who was a student at St. Mary’s School in Shanghai. However, Chen’s father, an enormously rich merchant, separated them and arranged his daughter’s marriage into a wealthy family.
simple, guileless soul.” Her “love knew no bounds […]” and was “like no other under heaven, […] unlimited and unfathomable as the rivers run constant and the sands numerous, never scolding me and only loving me” (qtd. in Sohigian 23). Yet as the son of a progressive Christian minister, Lin was familiar from a young age with the status of women in the Western countries. During the late 1890s and early 1900s, the period of Lin’s early education and middle school years, Allen Young’s Chinese Globe Magazine published many articles on women’s status in different nations and the importance of women’s education. As Lin recalled later, his father, often sighed with admiration over these stories. Once, he commented about an article written by a woman, ‘I wish I had such a girl for my daughter-in-law!’” (Zizhuan 11). In this way, American women’s intelligence, independence, and freedom were introduced to Lin as an ideal.

In his memoir, Lin described two missionary women teachers, who inspired his lifelong interest in the English language and Western music. His first English teacher, Miss Dunnel, was “an intelligent, refined and beautiful soul.” “[…] when I heard the English these ladies spoke, I felt it was so extraordinarily beautiful, surpassing anything I heard in my own language” (qtd. in Sohigian 51). At that time, about sixty percent of Protestant missionaries in China were women, and nearly three-quarters of the missionaries in the Amoy region where he attended school were women (Sohigian 51).

Although Lin’s father was a progressive Christian and highly admired American women’s education, intelligence and independence, he did not value his own daughters’ education as highly as he valued his sons’, and did not provide his daughters the same opportunities as his sons. This attitude reflected his emotional roots in the Confucian tradition.

Among the seven siblings, Lin was closest to his second sister Meikong, who was exceptionally bright and talented. Lin considered her his childhood “mentor and companion” (qtd. in Sohigian 21).

Having graduated high school in Amoy, my sister wanted to go to a girls’ college in Foochow [Fuzhou]. I heard her pleas after the family prayers. But it was all futile. She did not want to be married right off; she wanted to go to college. […] My father would not think of it. My sister pleaded and coaxed and made promises, but my father said, “No.” To me it was dreadful. I do not blame my father--dreamer that he was, he saw no way to do it. College education for a girl was a luxury which our family simply could not afford. (From Pagan 26-27)
Eventually Meikong had to marry at twenty-two. The boat that would take her to her groom’s village was the same boat on which Lin started his journey to St. John’s University (From Pagan 28). When Lin was in his eighties, he wrote:

On the morning before the wedding, she took out forty cents from her dress and said to me, “Holok, you are going to college. Don’t waste your opportunity. Be a good man, a useful man and a famous man. That is your sister’s wish for you.” [...] Knowing her desire so well, I felt the full force of these simple words. It made me guilty about the whole thing. They burned into my heart with the oppressive weight of a great load, so that I had the feeling I was going to college in her place. (Memoirs 19)

About a year later, Meikong died of the bubonic plague when she was seven months pregnant. The tragedy of Meikong’s life haunted Lin. He “came to believe that Chinese women like his sister learned early to make hard sacrifices in life and confront hard realities while Chinese men like himself were a ‘spoiled and pampered.’” (Sohigian 71). From Meikong, Lin developed a strong belief that Chinese women could be as intelligent as men if they could get the same opportunities. Lin later wrote,

[...] After long hours of philosophizing, I am now willing to make the brave and hard admission that women are just human beings like men--equal in ability to make judgments and mistakes, if you give them the same world experience and contacts; in ability to do efficient work and keep a cool head, if you give them the same business training; in social outlook, if you don’t shut them up in the home; and finally, in the capacity to rule and misrule, for if women should rule the world, they couldn’t possibly make greater mess of it than men have in present-day Europe. (With Love 18-19)118

B. A Male Feminist in the May Fourth Era

The development of Lin Yutang’s feminist thought and the inspiration for his literary practice on the subject of Chinese women, however, were deeply seated in the May Fourth Chinese male intellectuals’ discourse on Chinese women. The emancipation of women was a very important topic during the May Fourth era because it was closely associated with reforming and modernizing China. Leading intellectuals, such as Hu Shi, Chen Duxiu, Lu Xun, Zhou Zuoren, all expressed their deep sympathy concerning the subjugation of Chinese women in traditional China, and

118 The book was published in 1940, but it collected some of Lin’s early essays written in the 1920s and 30s.
denounced the Confucian system which produced customs such as chastity widowhood, footbinding and concubinage. A series of articles were published in the leading literary journal of May Fourth cultural movement, *Xin Qingnian* (New Youth). In 1916, Chen Duxiu published “The Way of Confucius and Modern Life” (“Kongzi zhi dao yu xiandai shenghuo,” “孔子之道与现代生活”) bringing the concept of women’s emancipation to the public. In 1918, Zhou Zuoren published his translation of “My Conception of Chastity” (“Zhencao lun,” “贞操论”), an article written by the Japanese female poet and feminist Yosano Akiko (井原了子, 1878-1942). The article caught the public’s attention as it broke convention in addressing the sensitive topic of chastity, and highlighted the sense of self and independence in womanhood and femininity.

Hu Shi and Lu Xun immediately responded to Zhou Zuoren’s translation. In the same year, Hu Shi wrote “The Issue of Chastity” (“Zhencao wenti,” “贞操问题”) (“Zhencao”), Lu Xun wrote “My View on Chastity and Martyrdom” (“Wo zhi jieli guan,” “我之节烈观”) (“Jieli Guan”). In “The Issue of Chastity,” Hu Shi praised Yosano Akiko’s bravery and insight, and condemned the cruel reality in Republic China, where the double standard of chastity was popular, and laws still existed encouraging widow suicide. Hu strongly believed that,

> Chastity is not an individual matter, but is something between people; it is not a one-sided affair, but a two-sided business. If a woman respects a man’s love for her, is intent on following this road and unwilling to love another, that is chastity. Chastity is the attitude of one “person” toward another “person.” Because of this, men should have the same sort of attitude toward women. If men cannot likewise return respect, they are not worthy of receiving this kind of treatment.

---

119 The *Xin Qingnian* (New Youth) I read is a reprinted version published by Shanghai Shudian (上海书店) in 1988.

120 English translation of this article is available in Hua R. Lan and Vanessa L. Fong, eds., *Women in Republic China a Source Book* (New York: M.E. Sharpe, Inc., 1999). 5-8. Chen played critical role in bringing the topic of women’s emancipation to public at the early stage of May 4th Cultural Movement. See his translation of Max O’Reill’s “On Women” in *Xin Qingnian* 1.1 (1915); his article “Ouzhou qi nüjie” (“Seven Outstanding European Women”) in *Xin Qingnian* 1.3 (1915) and “Nuweizi ru zi xuanju guan” (“Women’s Rights of Voting in Norway” in *Xin Qingnian* 1.4 (1915).

121 English translation of this article is available in Lan and Fong, eds., *Women in Republic China a Source Book*. 8-18.

In other articles Hu published in 1918 such as “On Ibsenism” (“Yibusheng zhuyi,” “易卜生主义”) (“Yibusheng”), and “On American Women” (“Meiguo funu,” “美国妇女”), Hu called for women’s economic and spiritual liberation, expressed his admiration for the independent spirit of American women, and advocated that Chinese women become more independent. Similar to Hu Shi, Lu Xun’s “My Views on Chastity and Martyrdom” also criticized the traditional views on chastity and the moral burden that Neo-Confucian scholars put on Chinese women.

These translations and articles demonstrate that male Chinese intellectuals paid special attention to women’s emancipation from the beginning of the New Cultural Movement. After calling for women’s economic liberation, the male intellectuals also raised the topic of women’s sexual liberation, a topic which directly attacked the traditional moral system, and a topic that most Chinese women at the time did not dare address. Several female authors indeed published articles in Xin Qingnian, but their voices did not cause strong reactions from society. Thus, men became the strongest voices in calling for women’s emancipation, and made the Chinese feminist movement “male led” from the beginning.

Along with the theoretical discussion, the subject of women’s emancipation also became an important literary theme. Xin Qingnian published a special issue in 1918, introducing the Norwegian playwright Henrik Ibsen (1928-1906) and his modern realistic drama. This introduction caused a great sensation in China and directly helped the rise of Chinese modern drama (Huaju, 话剧). Ibsen’s A Doll’s House and his other plays were performed on the stages of the major Chinese cities. Nora, the protagonist of A Doll’s House became a symbol for women’s emancipation and individualism. Inspired by Ibsen, a group of young Chinese intellectuals, such as Ouyang Yuqian (1889-1962, 欧阳

---


124 A special section on “Women’s Problem” (“女子问题”) was arranged in Xin Qingnian from vol.2 no.6 through vol.3 no. 4 (1917). Articles by female authors, such as Li Zhang Shaonan (李张绍南), Chen Qian Aichen (陈钱爱琛), Liang Huanan (梁华南), Gao Susu (高素素), Wu Zenglan (吴曾兰) were published during this period. But soon their voices disappeared.

125 This special issue of Xin Qingnian 4. 6 (1918) includes Hu Shi’s famous article “Yipusheng zhuyi” (“Ibsenism”), Yuan Zhenying’s “Yi Pusheng zhaun” (“The Biography of Ibsen”) and the translations of several of Ibsen’s plays: A Doll’s house (translated by Hu Shi and Luo Jialun), An Enemy of the People (translated by Tao Lugong), and Little Eyolf (translated by Gong Ruonan).
Guo Moruo (1892-1978, 郭沫若), Tian Han (1898-1968, 田汉), and Hong Shen (1894-1955, 洪深) who had organized the influential drama societies such as the Spring Willow Society, the Southern Country Society, 126 started to write their own plays. These plays denounced traditional morality and promoted women’s liberation, and thus created many Chinese “Noras.” Besides addressing women’s problems in their society, some of these playwrights also started to rewrite stories of famous or infamous women in Chinese history and literature, aiming to change the stereotypical images of women existing in China. 127

The formation of Lin Yutang’s feminist thought and the inspiration of his creative writing on the subject of Chinese women, were deeply influenced by these leading May Fourth male intellectuals and their literary practices. Meanwhile, Lin was one of the first modern Chinese intellectuals to be influenced by Western feminism. During the years when Lin was studying in the United States and Europe, Western feminism was rising to a new height. In 1920, American women got the right to vote, and they used it to oust President Wilson (Sohigian 235). Fashion magazines predicted skirts would rise …. Women wore socks … (Sohigian 236). Lin was impressed by the growing spirit of American women’s independence and their new opportunities. He observed the different trends in feminist thought, and paid attention to well-known women who had clear feminist spirits, such as Dora Russell (1894-1986) and Isadora Duncan (1877-1927). Lin also noted a few Western male thinkers and writers, such as Henrik Ibsen, H. L. Mencken, Walt Whitman and George Bernard Shaw, who all in their own way acknowledged women’s intelligence and showed strong sympathy for their independence. After Lin returned to China, he translated several books with feminist viewpoints from English into Chinese, such as Dora Russell’s Women and Knowledge, and George

126 Spring Willow Society (Chunliu she 春柳社), founded in 1906, and Southern Country Society (南国社), founded in 1924 were pioneering modern Chinese drama societies and influential in the early twentieth century.

127 For instance, in 1928, Ouyang Yuqian published a play Pan Jinlian (《潘金莲》) in which he rewrote the character of the notorious woman Pan Jinlian from the Ming dynasty novel Jin Ping Mei (《金瓶梅》) and presented her as a woman who pursued true love and freedom but tragically was killed.
Brandeis' *Biography of Ibsen*. He also translated George Bernard Shaw’s *Pygmalion* into Chinese, which influenced Lin's creation of his only play, *Confucius Met Nanzi* (1928), a tragi-comedy that made Lin Yutang famous nationwide. This play was definitely feminist-purposed, which I will address later in this chapter.

After Lin returned from abroad, he worked closely with Zhou Zuoren, one of the few May Fourth scholars who had done extensive research on womanhood. Lin came to believe that natural differences between men and women do not imply that restraints should be imposed on women, but, instead, project a harmony in relationships between men and women. This thinking led Lin to avoid evaluating the degree of a woman’s emancipation against a male standard, and to avoid constant comparison between female and male intelligence, talents, courage, and physical strength.

In the early 1930s, Lin researched extensively the works of several male Chinese scholars in China’s past who had strong sympathy for Chinese women. Lin gradually formed his own feminist thoughts, and articulated them in his English article “Feminist Thought in Ancient China,” which was published in Shanghai in the English literary journal, *Tien Hsia Monthly* (天下月刊), in 1935.129

**C. Lin’s Interpretation of Feminist Thought in Ancient China**

In “Feminist Thought in Ancient China,” Lin states: “It is a truism that Chinese ethics is essentially a masculine ethics. What particular form and development this masculine ethics took, however, is not quite fully known to the West” ("Feminist" 112). Lin declares his feminist stance and the task of his article to explain the roots of the women’s problems in China to his Western readers. He takes Chinese history to illustrate this masculine bias, and points out that “whenever the men rulers made a mess of the business of government and lost a dynasty, the men scholars were always able to point out a woman as the cause of their downfall. ‘Cherchez la femme,’ they seem to say” ("Feminist" 112).

---

128 The Chinese translations of Dora Russell's *Women and Knowledge*, George Brandeis's *Biography of Ibsen*, *易卜生传* and Bernard Shaw’s *Pygmalion*, *卖花女* were reprinted in Volume 27 of Lin Yutang Mingzhu Quanji [Complete Collection of Lin Yutang's Famous Works].

129 This article was later collected in his English book *Confucius Saw Nancy and Essays about Nothing* in 1937.
Queen Tachi [Daji] was made, by common consent, responsible for the downfall of the Shang Dynasty during the reign of the tyrant King Chou [Zhou]; Another Queen, Possu (Baosi), was, [...] responsible for the fall of the East Chou [Zhou] Dynasty under another tyrant King Yu. It seems very curious that these scholars never noticed the point that it was the virtue of Queen Possu [Baosi], and not her immorality, that provoked the catastrophe; [...] And so on ad infinitum [...].

("Feminist" 112-13)

Lin implies that, had history been written by women, it would have been quite different. He asserts that Chinese feminists have a slightly different task than that of Western feminists, owing to the fact that they “had to fight against a different background or a different social system from that of the West.”

While the general trend may be the same, such as, for instance, the fight for a single sex standard and the privileges of education for women, there are different evils of injustice to women, such as concubinage, footbinding, and encouragement of a woman’s suicide in defence of her chastity and the forbidding of widows to marry, which form the special objectives that any independent Chinese thinker with a feminist leaning had to fight against in the first place.

("Feminist" 113-14)

Lin targets Song dynasty Neo-Confucian scholars and “the puritanico-sadistic background” they created for the late imperial China. He asserts that these scholars “had drifted a long way away from the sane and healthy humanism of Confucius, and turned it into a kill-joy doctrine.”

These Confucian village school-masters, with their large mouthfuls of morality and righteousness, were always anxious to maintain the sanctity of society’s morals, but being men themselves, naturally threw the great burden of upholding social morality upon the shoulders of women. ("Feminist" 114)

Lin stresses the negative influence of Neo-Confucianism on women’s life in the late imperial China, which made the “forbidding of widows to remarry” into a doctrine, promoted the “heroic women” (Lienü 烈女) tradition, encouraged women’s suicide for chastity and the custom of footbinding, and invented a doctrine that “In a woman stupidity is virtue (女子无才便是德)” ("Feminist" 115-16).

Lin explains that it was against this barbarism that a few independent intellectuals’ voices in the late imperial dynasties arose, yet “not a single woman’s voice was to be heard [...]” “which is but a reflection of the tyrannical power of the Confucian system of ideas” ("Feminist" 116-17). Lin discusses three such independent, less
orthodox Chinese thinkers and writers. They are the scholar Yu Zhengxie (余正燮 1775-1940), the poet and rebel thinker Yuan Mei (袁枚 1716-1799), and Li Ruzhen (李汝珍 c. 1763-c.1840), the author of Jinghua Yuan (Flowers in the Mirror, 镜花缘). Lin defines them as “male feminists” with distinct Chinese characteristics, and praises their sense of equality between men and women, as well as their criticism of Neo-Confucianism.

Yu Zhengxie called “the system of encouraging chaste widows a "shameless" masculine point of view to enslave women” ("Feminist" 119). He said, “According to ancient rites, the husband and wife are united in wedlock on an equal basis, but some scholars have lowered the position of the wife” ("Feminist" 119). Yu handled the problem of women’s jealousy in the system of concubinage from the perspective of mutual devotion in marriage, and protested against footbinding on the ground of its effect on physical health. Lin comments that Yu Zhengxie’s ideas “contain the seeds of true sexual equality and a system of monogamy in marriage” ("Feminist" 121-22), and praises that “Yu approached his problem with the calm and dignity of a scholar” ("Feminist" 118).

Lin appreciates Yuan Mei’s rebellious attitude towards the Confucian tradition and his liberal view on sex, because “Chinese feminism could fight its way out to the open, not by a more austere view of sexual morality, but only by pointing a mocking finger at the really obscene puritanism of the then prevailing type of Confucianism” ("Feminist" 124). In Lin’s view, Yuan “threw down the gauntlet against the entire pack of Confucian Tartuffes, and with his great vogue as the first poet of his times, definitely wielded an important influence for the emancipation of women” ("Feminist" 117).

In this essay, Lin also interprets the feminist thought in the novel Jinghua Yuan, and admires that “the novelist Li Ruzhen made the novel a channel for

---

130 This novel was published in 1825. The heroines are a hundred talented girls, who all passed examinations and became officials under the regime of the Empress Wu of the Tang Dynasty. This novel was translated and adapted by Lin Yutang’s daughter Lin Taiyi, and published in 1965 by University of California, Berkeley.

131 C.T. Xia, in his 1977 article “The Scholar-Novelist and Chinese Culture, A Reappraisal of Ching-hua yuan,” opposes Lin (and also Hu Shi)’s opinion of calling Jing Hua Yuan a feminist novel, and considers it “an allegoric romance in total support of Confucian morality and Taoist wisdom.” See C. T. Hsia, "The Scholar-Novelist and Chinese Culture: A Reappraisal of Ching-Hua Yuan," C.T. Hsia on Chinese Literature, ed. C. T. Hsia (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), 188. The different opinions between C.T.Xia and Lin Yutang, in my view, are caused by the different standards of feminism they used to evaluate the novel. While C.T. Xia uses the modern Western feminism to
propagating his ideas, and the adopting of this channel gave him a free scope for satires on men, and on the system of footbinding in particular" ("Feminist" 118). Lin also notes, 

> These three writers had to establish their plea, not by an appeal to logical arguments alone, but by profuse quotations from Chinese history to show that such existing evils were by no means traceable to Confucius, but were the inventions of later days, in that way tearing away from them the cloak of time-honoured sanctity. ("Feminist" 117)

Lin’s investigation of feminist thought in traditional China shows his effort to reveal the root of the on-going May Fourth discourse on Chinese women. His study indicates that the modern and radical views on Chinese women’s problems, expressed by the May Fourth scholars, had similar voices in traditional China, and the early modern Chinese feminist movement was male-led due to the distinct Chinese social and moral environment. This article thus provides an historical perspective for understanding the nature of the May Fourth intellectuals’ discourse on Chinese women, and gives a modern significance to the traditional Chinese scholarship.

Lin’s admiration for these traditional scholars and writers reflects his own identity as a Chinese male feminist. His enthusiasm for Yuan Mei indicates that Lin, to a certain extent, identified with this defiant scholar and poet of the Qing dynasty. Similar to them, Lin believed that the original Confucianism was relatively sane and healthy, and it was its later development, especially the Neo-Confucianism, that made it hypocritical and misogynistic. This attitude differentiates Lin from the radical May Fourth intellectuals, who demonized the whole Confucian tradition. It also reveals that Lin’s feminism was, to certain degree, characterized and restricted by the male Chinese intellectual tradition.

“Feminist Thought in Ancient China” demonstrates Lin’s strong interest in and concern for the situation of Chinese women. His historical and cross-cultural perspective allows him to bring readers a new understanding of the differences between the Chinese and Western feminist movements. The article thus prepares him theoretically and strategically to introduce the lives of Chinese women to the Western readers.

examine a novel produced in traditional China, Lin takes the patriarchal society reality as the starting point and develops a “male Chinese feminism” to evaluate the novel, as he believed that Chinese feminism was different from the Western feminism. Lin’s opinion provides an important reference for us to evaluate his own feminist thought.
D. Introducing Women’s Life in My Country and My People

Lin’s extensive research on Chinese women’s life and his mature views are reflected in the chapter “Women’s Life” in My Country and My People, in which Lin introduces Chinese women to general Western readers. Lin highlights the importance of understanding Chinese women in order to understand Chinese life in its sexual, social, political, literary and artistic aspects:

An understanding of the life of women and the home will lead to a consideration of the Chinese social life, and only from a true understanding of the social life will it be possible to understand the administration of justice and government in China. The study of these visible aspects of Chinese life will naturally lead to an inquiry into the subtler and less known problems of Chinese culture, especially in the field of art, with an outlook and a history of development, peculiar to the Chinese people and totally different from the West. (My Country 135)

The chapter is divided into eight sections: the subjection of women, home and marriage, ideal of womanhood, education of our daughters, love and courtship, the courtesan and concubinage, footbinding, and emancipation. By selecting these topics, Lin ambitiously addresses almost all aspects of Chinese women’s life.

In discussing the subjugation of women, Lin admits that “something in the Chinese blood never quite gave woman her due from primeval times.” This is evidenced in the Chinese dualistic outlook, “with the differentiation of the yang (male) and the yin (female) principles” expressed in one of the oldest Chinese Classics, Book of Changes. In the Book of Poetry, the earliest collection of Chinese folk songs appears: “when a baby boy was born, he was laid on the bed, and given jade to play with, and when a baby girl was born, she was laid on the floor and given a tile to play with” (My Country 137), a poem existing in China long before Confucius was born. However, Lin points out that “woman was not subjected until she was civilized. The progressive subjection of women followed pace by pace the increasing development of Confucianism.”

The original Chinese social system was a matriarchal system, and this is important, for something of this spirit still survives in Chinese womanhood to the present day. The Chinese woman is, on the whole, a constitutionally sounder animal than her male companion, and we still have plenty of matriarchs even in the Confucian households. (My Country 136)

Lin points out that the family name in the Zhou dynasty (1122-156 BC) was the woman’s name, a man had only a personal name (My Country 136). He claims that in The Book of
Poetry. “we fail to see any traces of the seclusion of women,” instead, we see something of the freedom in the choice of mates, and songs of women who ran away with their lovers (My Country 137). Lin takes the records in Zuo Zhuan, the earliest Chinese work of narrative history which covers the period from 722 BC to 468 BC, as an example to demonstrate that the marriage system in the times of Confucius did not include severe bondage of women; and that the sexual relations of men and women, “especially those prevailing in the upper classes, had something analogous to those in the days of decadent Rome.”

Woman, who is always powerful in China, was powerful then. The Queen of Wei made the King summon the handsomest man in the country to her boudoir. Divorce was still easy and divorcees could remarry. The cult of feminine chastity had not yet become an obsession with men. (My Country 138)

Lin claims that the Confucian attitude towards women “before it came under the influence of the later men scholars” was quite tolerant, and women’s position in the home was also quite as equal to men.

Confucianism also gave the wife an “equal” position with the husband, somewhat below the husband, but still an equal helpmate, like the two fish in the Taoist [Daoist] symbol of yin and yang, necessarily complementing each other. It also gave the mother an honoured position in the home. In the best spirit of Confucianism, this differentiation was interpreted, not as a subjection but as a harmony of relationships. (My Country 139)

Lin admits that “the basic notions of woman’s inferiority” did exist in early Confucianism, such as the typically feminine virtues codified by Liu Xiang in the Han Dynasty, and the “three obediences and four virtues” propagated by Ban Zhao. However, it was the Song scholars, the most conservative of Confucian intellectuals, “who imposed a secluded life on women and made the remarriage of widows a moral crime” (My Country 140). “In the Ming Dynasty, the doctrine of chaste widowhood even became an official institution.” However, “it was this doctrine of chaste widowhood that caused Confucianism to be denounced during the ‘Renaissance’ of 1917 as a ‘man-eating religion’” (My Country 141).

In tracing the development of chaste widowhood, Lin observes that “It would be dangerous to lend too much weight to academic theory, for the Chinese are always a realistic people and have a way of withering theories with a laugh.”
Practice must have lagged behind theory, and even as late as the Manchu times [the last dynasty] chaste widowhood was expected of the wife of a scholar with official titles but not of the common women. Even in the T’ang Dynasty the daughter of the great scholar Han Yu married a second time. Of the T’ang princesses, twenty-three married a second time and four of them married a third time. (My Country 140)

While discussing the impact of Confucianism on women’s lives, Lin reminds readers that “More important than the influence of Confucianism was the fact that men controlled the purse. For while Confucianism had erected chaste widowhood into a religion, jewels and pearl necklaces, which had nothing to do with Confucianism, turned women into concubines and cocottes” (My Country 141). It was in this environment that the institution of footbinding fully developed, “which was the last sophistication of male fancy” (My Country 142).

In the section of “Home and Marriage,” Lin discusses the position of Chinese women at home, and the relationship between marriage and women’s power. He asserts: “Have women really been suppressed in China, I often wonder? The powerful figure of the Empress Dowager immediately comes to my mind. Chinese women are not the type to be easily suppressed” (My Country 144). This assertion may well have surprised his Western reader. He disagrees with the prevalent notion of Chinese women’s total dependence on their men, and believes that although Chinese women have suffered many disadvantages, they “have ruled nevertheless in the home […]. And what is still more important, women have been deprived of every right, but they have never been deprived of the right to marry.”

The more one knows Chinese life, the more one realizes that the so-called suppression of women is an Occidental criticism that somehow is not borne out by a closer knowledge of Chinese life. That phrase certainly cannot apply to the Chinese mother and supreme arbiter of the household. Anyone who doubts this should read the Red Chamber Dream, a monument of Chinese home life. (My Country 145)

Lin admits that “men have every advantage over women outside marriage,” but inside marriage, “women have every advantage over men,” because he believes that “nature has ordained that man and woman should meet in their intimacies as equals.” In every nation, the happiness of women does not depend on how many social advantages they enjoy, but on the quality of the men they live with. Women suffer
more from male tyranny and coarseness than from the disqualification to vote. When men are naturally reasonable and good-tempered and considerate, women do not suffer. (My Country 147)

He explains that “certain fundamental relations, like that between husband and wife, differ much less in the different countries than one would imagine from travellers’ descriptions.”

Westerners are apt to imagine Chinese wives as mute slaves of their husbands although actually Chinese husbands, on the average, are fairly reasonable and considerate beings; while Chinese are apt to think that, because the Westerners have never heard of Confucius, therefore Western wives don’t look after their husbands’ laundry and stomachs, but simply go to the beach in pyjama suits or live in a continuous round of dancing parties. The unique and the exotic make such interesting after-dinner stories, while the central and common truths of humanity are forgotten. (My Country 147-48)

Lin then asserts that in real life, “women have not really been oppressed by men […]. The only remaining possibility is that daughters-in-law may be oppressed by the mothers-in-law and this is often what actually happens. […],” because “a marriage in China is not an individual affair but a family affair […]. A daughter-in-law, therefore, has more severe obligations toward her parents than toward her husband” (My Country 148).

In a similar fashion, Lin continues his arguments for the existence of a certain degree of a woman’s power, freedom and independence. In the section “Ideal of Womanhood,” he discusses an important connection between women’s seclusion and the traditional Chinese ideal of womanhood, the “helpful wife and wise mother.” While this phrase is often ridiculed in modern China, “especially by those modern women who desire above all ‘equality,’ ‘independence,’ ‘self-expression’ and who regard wives and mothers as dependent upon men,” Lin presents a different perspective. In his view, when a woman becomes a mother, her position is no longer “dependent” on the pleasure of her husband. “It is only when she ceases to be a mother that she feels her utter dependency” (My Country 151). Lin agrees that there are some talented women whose “self-expression has a more important meaning than just bearing children,” “but for the common people, whose number is legion, let the men earn bread to feed the family, and let the women bear children” (My Country 152), since a woman’s nature enables her to do a better job in taking care of children than a man. Lin reminds readers that “There was
a time even in the West when motherhood and bearing and rearing children were not despised by society or by the women themselves. A mother seems to fit in with her position, a very highly honored position, in the family" (My Country 151). He asserts that “Of all the rights of women, the greatest is to be a mother” (My Country 152).

In the section “Education of our Daughters,” Lin explores how the Confucian ideal of womanhood influenced the training of Chinese daughters. He points out that the training for girls was much more severe than for boys:

Girls learned this family discipline earlier and were consequently soberer and better behaved than boys of the same age. She learns, above all, demureness, at the cost of sprightliness. [...] she does not laugh but only smiles. She is conscious of her virginity [...]. She cultivates the charm of mystery and distance [...]. She learns embroidery [...]. (My Country 153)

In educated families girls also learn to read and to write:

The content of this literary education was necessarily limited to literature, poetry, history and human wisdom, as absorbed from the Confucian classics. The girls stopped there, but really the men did not advance very much further. Literature, history, philosophy and the wisdom of life, together with some special knowledge of medicine or the rules of government, were the sum of human knowledge. The education of women was still more definitely humanistic. The difference was in intensiveness rather than in scope. (My Country 154)

Since too much learning was considered to be a dangerous thing for women’s virtue in Confucian tradition, girls were not encouraged to learn in depth. But “in painting and in poetry they often played a hand,” and “the writing of short lyrics seemed especially suitable to women’s genius.” “The tradition of woman’s poetry has been practically unbroken until in Manchu times we can count almost a thousand women who left poetry in print in this dynasty alone.” Lin explains that “writing poetry did not really interfere with women’s duties as wife and mother” (My Country 154).

Lin admits that the Chinese girl in ancient times was less socially accomplished than the Western girl, but believes that “she had a better chance of succeeding as wife and mother,” as “she had no career except the career of wife and mother” (My Country 154). Though Lin regards “the increased knowledge and education as an improvement,” he believes that “her soup will still be better than her poetry and that her real masterpiece will be her chubby-faced boy.” He claims that “the ideal woman remains for me the wise, gentle and firm mother” (My Country 155).
In the section “Love and Courtship,” Lin asserts, “In youth and romance and love, the world is pretty much the same, only the psychological reactions differ as a result of different social traditions. For secluded as women may be, no classical teaching has yet succeeded in shutting out love” (My Country 155). However, due to the seclusion of women, “premarital love was a forbidden fruit in old China, open courtship was impossible, and she knew that to love was to suffer” (My Country 156). Lin points out that love “was mixed with tears and sadness and longing in Chinese thought, and the effect of this seclusion of women was to introduce a plaintive, languorous tone in all Chinese love poetry” (My Country 158).

In the section “The Courtesan and Concubinage,” Lin explains the cultural background for the popularity of courtesans in ancient China, and acknowledges their contribution to the development of Chinese music and poetry. Since too much learning was considered by Chinese men to be dangerous for family girls’ virtue, “The sing-song girls cultivated these things because they did not need ignorance as a bulwark of their virtue” (My Country 160). In Lin’s view, “The courtesan supplied the need for courtship and romance which many men missed in their youth before marriage” (My Country 161). “Besides, she carried on the musical tradition of the country, which without her would have died off.” In this sense, Lin believes that a courtesan “was more cultivated, more independent, and more at home in men’s society than were the family women; in fact, she was the emancipated lady in ancient China” (My Country 162).

Lin claims “Concubinage is as old as China itself, and the problem behind concubinage is as old as monogamy.” In his view, “concubinage in a way takes the place of divorce in Western countries.”

When the marriage is unhappy the Oriental solves it by going to the sing-song girl or taking a concubine, while the Occidental solves it by keeping a mistress or having occasional escapades. The modes of social behaviour are different, while the fundamental problems are curiously the same. What makes a difference is the social attitude, especially that of women, toward such behaviour. Chinese take mistresses with public consent, while Westerners have the decency not to talk about it. (My Country 163)

While exploring the reasons for the existence of the concubinage custom, Lin points out the numerous evils this custom brings to Chinese women. He also denounces Gu Hongming’s useless defence for this system (My Country 165).
In the section of “Footbinding,” Lin points out that “the nature and origin of footbinding has been greatly misunderstood. Somehow it has stood as a symbol of the seclusion and suppression of women, and very suitably so.”

Actually, footbinding was sexual in its nature throughout. Its origin was undoubtedly in the courts of licentious kings, its popularity with men was based on the worship of women’s feet and shoes as a love fetish and on the feminine gait which naturally followed, and its popularity with women was based on their desire to curry men’s favor. (My Country 165-66)

Lin explores the persistence of footbinding from the perspective of the power of fashion: “All those who understand the power of fashion over women will understand the persistence of this institution” (My Country 168). He compares this custom to nineteenth century English girls’ willingness to squeeze their bodies into whale-bone corsets, and the tiptoe dancing of Russian ballet under the honoured name of an art.

Lin berates the male sexual fetish and aesthetic which had distorted women’s appetite for fashion and caused enormous suffering for Chinese women. He points out that this “monstrous and perverse” institution was condemned by at least three scholars, Li Ruzhen, Yuan Mei and Yu Zhengxie. The Qing emperor Kangxi even issued orders to stop this practice. “But the custom was not abolished until the Christian missionaries led the crusade, a debt for which Chinese women ought to be grateful. Yet in this the missionaries have been fortunately helped by the force of circumstances, for Chinese women have found in the modern high-heeled shoes a tolerable substitute” (My Country 168).

In the last section “Emancipation,” Lin claims that “the seclusion of women has now gone:” “The girls of the present generation differ in temperament, grace, bearing and spirit of independence from the “modern” girls of ten or twelve years ago. Myriad influences are at work, causing this change. In general, they may be called the Western influences” (My Country 169). He acknowledges the positive influence from the West in ending foodbinding, and in bringing China a healthier female ideal. He believes that the modern liberalizing influences would work for the good of Chinese womanhood and therefore the race.

The first important effect is on the girl’s physique. [...] With the development of physique comes a more naturally graceful movement than the boudoir-cultivated movements of the bound feet. Consequent upon this physical change is a change
in the ideal of female beauty, from the repressed quietness of former days to the more natural sprightliness of a human being, approaching that of European ladies. [...] The artificial restraint and over-sexualization of women under Confucianism must give place to a more human view, and can no longer come back. (My Country 171)

Lin, meanwhile, worries that some of these changes could bring “déssexualization and of the total loss of the womanly woman,” as “the idea of women trying to ape men in their manners is in itself a sign of women’s bondage.” He thus hopes, “Let women be proud of their own sex, for only in the fulfilment of their sex and its grave responsibilities will they be truly great” (My Country 171).

This chapter can be viewed as a strong response to the missionary discourse on Chinese women, such as the assertion that China was only half-civilized due to the unequal treatment of its women (Allen Young’s view), and the exaggerated portrayal of victimized Chinese women (Smith Village Life 258-311). Fresh, provocative, and versatile, Lin’s voice completely surprised Western readers, who had long been used to the stereotypical images of Chinese women. Unlike the general opinion, which emphasized the passivity and suffering of Chinese woman, Lin emphasized the Chinese matriarchal spirit and the considerable power women held at home, and highlighted a certain degree of equality between a man and a woman within marriage. Similar to his intention of integrating the traditional Chinese cultural essence into China’s modernity, Lin insisted on preserving certain positive aspects of traditional womanhood for modern Chinese womanhood. His chapter also appears to be a dramatic revision of Gu Hongming’s chauvinistic Confucian view of Chinese women. Though Lin never specifically criticized Pearl Buck’s views, Lin aimed to provide revisions to the stereotype Buck created, in which women were tireless and uneducated labourers.

In this chapter, Lin uses several cultural and narrative strategies to gain readers’ understanding and acceptance. He uses a storyteller’s narrative voice, clear and fascinating, with a mellow, gentle, and humorous tone. By first tracing the matriarchal spirit in China’s remote past and comparing the lives of women in the Zhou Dynasty and those in the Roman Empire, Lin establishes an historical context and provides an East-West perspective, and brings the reader’s attention to the similarities existing in human beings. He opens the reader’s mind by explaining the humanistic spirit and
reasonableness of the original Confucianism, and that there are differences between Confucian theory and its practice in real life. In addition to the moral force of Confucianism, other complicated factors, such as economic power, caused the subjugation of Chinese women. He highlights how prejudice and ignorance in the West could cause misunderstanding of Chinese life, and reminds readers not to forget "the central and common truths of humanity." In a similar way, Lin makes those seemingly mysterious and inhumane customs such as footbinding and concubinage interpretable from a more humanistic view, and tries to reveal the social, cultural and psychological reasons behind these customs. Lin opens the eyes of his Western readers to many remarkable and interesting details of the lives of Chinese women using historical sources and literature. These details make his arguments attractive, insightful, and convincing. By providing readers multiple perspectives into the understanding of the woman's situation in China, Lin was able to present a reasonable and fair picture of her life under Confucian system.

The chapter reveals that Daoism had a great influence on Lin's perspective on Chinese women and their lives. Lin is more a Daosit than a Confucianist. In the preface of Lin's translation of The Wisdom of Laozi, Lin admits: "If compelled to indicate my religion on an immigration blank, I might be tempted to put down the word ‘Taoist,’ […]" (Laozi 15). His passion for and insight into Daoism are reflected in his translation and interpretation of several classical Chinese works of Daoism. Daoism worships the power of femininity and considers motherhood as the origin of the world. This explains why Lin emphasizes the honoured position of "mother" in Chinese culture, and takes the "wise, gentle and firm mother" as his ideal woman. Daoism's opposition to artificiality and rigidity explains Lin's appreciation of the missionary effort to end footbinding, and bring a healthier concept of womanhood to China. Daoist beliefs may also explain why Lin worries about the modern feminist movement, which had the danger of "desexualization" and losing "the womanly woman." In this way, Lin tries to offer Doist wisdom to the then on-going Western feminist movement, and to bring a balanced understanding of ideal womanhood, whether in the East or the West.

132 Lin translated and introduced several Chinese Classics of Daoism into English, such as The Wisdom of Laozi, the sections of "Laotse, the Book of Tao," and "Chuangtse, Mystic and Humorist" in his edited book The Wisdom of China and India.
The chapter also reflects the influence of Western feminism on Lin Yutang, and his strong interest in bridging Chinese and Western ideas of womanhood. Dora Russell, in her book Women and Knowledge, calls for women’s independence, equality, freedom, and rights for gaining knowledge, and claims that “We were rebels against a system of masculine repression which had lasted almost unbroken since the beginning of history” (Russell 2). Russell also highlights the importance of womanhood, and promotes a healthy education for girls in preparing for their motherhood. By translating Dora Russell’s book into Chinese, Lin shows his appreciation of her views and finds cross-cultural affinities between her view of motherhood and the Daoist emphasis on following Mother Nature.

However, Lin’s limitations as a male feminist are revealed in “Women’s Life.” As Zhou Zuoren points out, “When man comes to talk about women, no matter how hard he tries, he is still unable to see through into the depth” (qtd. in Shu 47). Some of Lin’s views in addressing women’s intelligence, independence and sexuality, may be said to be quite chauvinistic, and were so even during his time. Some points Lin makes are inconsistent with his own opinions expressed in his other articles such as Feminist Thoughts in Ancient China, in which he had a more critical attitude toward women’s life under the Confucian system. Chinese women in the early modern era were fighting for their freedom and rebelling against confinement to the home, yet Lin advises them to return there. This may reflect Lin’s realistic concern about women’s emancipation in China’s patriarchal society during the early modern era. Since the society was not yet ready to provide women sufficient opportunities, both economically and politically, for their independence, Lin may have thought it best to remind them not to ignore their power at home. Lin’s romantic passion for Chinese women is also found in this chapter. For instance, his high admiration of the courtesan’s role in music and art, as well as his view of the courtesan as “the most emancipated woman in ancient China,” reflect his male limitations in ignoring the courtesan’s viewpoint of her profession. By considering women as co-conspirators in the footbinding practice, Lin underestimates the imbalance of power between men and women, and societal (male) influences which kept the practice in place.
While all these factors may have influenced Lin’s view on Chinese women and their lives, Lin’s consideration of readership must have also played an important role in his expression of his feminist view. When speaking to the Chinese audience and the small English population in China who were very close to the life of the Chinese woman, Lin adopted a more straightforward criticism. Speaking to the general readers in the West who are not familiar with Chinese culture but may have already been influenced by the stereotypical images, Lin strategically adopts a more romantic and optimistic tone, and switches his emphasis to provide fundamental knowledge about Chinese women, and to gain understanding and acceptance from general readers.

Despite the problems caused by his perspectives as a male feminist, his romantic passion, his occasional overemphasis of Daoism, and his subtle considerations for readership, Lin brings Western readers a fairly comprehensive and authentic picture of women’s life in China. “Women’s Life” surpassed all other interpreters’ efforts to introduce the life of Chinese women to the West.

III. The Importance of Female Images in Lin’s Work, and Nancy--the Precursor Image Lin Constructed and Reconstructed

Lin Yutang’s English essays provide Western readers with a basic understanding of Chinese women’s situation. The female images he presented in his translations, adaptations, rewritings, and creative writings supply readers an even more comprehensive and vivid understanding of women’s characters and lives. Women were main characters in his work throughout his lifelong career. Some appeared long before his English essays in 1935; some as much as thirty years after My Country and My People. These images played a significant role in forming, developing, illustrating, and revising Lin’s thoughts and arguments about Chinese women.

A. A Gallery of Images of Chinese Women

The first image of Chinese women Lin presents to English readers living in China was the twenty-year-old girl soldier, Xie Bingying, whom Lin met in 1927 during the Nationalist Revolutionary War. She was unusually brave, rebellious, and patriotic, almost a modern Mulan. Like other women soldiers, she joined the revolution partly for patriotic
motives and partly to escape an arranged marriage (Lin's Introduction to Hsieh, xiv). She wrote a series of war diaries and letters, recording her feelings and personal experiences during the war. Her writing attracted wide attention when published in the “Literary Supplement” to the Chinese Central Daily where Lin worked as a chief editor. In 1930, Lin translated these diaries and letters into English and published them in his book, Letters of a Chinese Amazon and War-Time Essays. Lin describes her appearance in war attire, “with a small face and bright eyes, light, joyous, enthusiastic, and with still something of the tomboy in her.” “She talked in a winning manner in a husky, staccato voice, on account of the bad throat contracted from a night’s exposure on the homeward voyage” (Introduction to Letters x). Lin considers that she “had all the easy ways of young China” (Introduction to Hsieh, xiii). Clearly, by introducing Xie Bingying to the West, Lin intends to announce the appearance of emancipated women in China, who were physically and mentally stronger than women in traditional China.

In 1928, Lin wrote a one-act tragicomedy, Confucius Met Nanzi (孔子见南子), reconstructing the image of Nanzi (c.a.526- c.a.446 BC), a powerful, ancient queen of the state of Wei during the Spring and Autumn period (722- 481 BC). Nanzi was notorious in Chinese historical records for her beauty and power, but in Lin’s play, she is portrayed not only as powerful, but also as a talented musician, dancer and conversationalist. She possesses Daoist wisdom and a strong feminist consciousness. The play was translated by Lin into English in 1931 as Confucius Saw Nancy, bringing an unconventional image of an ancient Chinese queen to the West.

In 1935, Lin translated and published in Shanghai Six Chapters of a Floating Life, the autobiography of Shen Fu, an unknown painter and scholar from the Qing dynasty, in which Shen records the life he shared with his wife, Yun, an exceptionally intelligent woman with a romantic and artistic personality. She is very different from the stereotypically miserable housewives in Protestant missionary writings and translations. In 1936, Lin’s A Nun of Taishan and Other Translations was also published in Shanghai, and includes more positive images of Chinese women. “A Nun of Taishan” is a story originally from Liu E’s The Travels of Laocan. This beautiful, intelligent, and independent nun completely reverses the Western impression of Chinese nuns, and reveals the spiritual world of Chinese women where religion plays an important role.
Images of women from Tang dynasty tales (one of the most imaginative storytelling genres, *chuanqi* 传奇) also appear in this translated book. Qianniang, from the tale "The Disembodied Soul of Qiannü," divides herself into two beings in order to pursue her love and her freedom.

While translating these traditional Chinese stories and tales, Lin also began writing fiction in English. *Moment in Peking*, his first English novel, was published in New York in 1939 during the Sino-Japanese war. It captured the attention of West readers and became very popular. The bright and intelligent heroine, Yao Mulan, called by Lin "the daughter of Dao," became known to millions of Western readers. Her love and suffering attracted the readers' interest and concern. Mulan represents Lin's ideal woman; she was a combination of his female ideals. Lin even claimed that had he been a woman, he would have liked to be Mulan. 133


Ambitious and almost obsessed, Lin continually presents different types of Chinese women, one after another. In 1951, his translated and adapted work *Widow, Nun, Courtesan* was published in New York. In addition to the "Nun of Taishan," which had been published previously in Shanghai, two new images of a widow and a courtesan appear. He translated and adapted "Widow Chuan" from *The Quan Clan Village* written by his contemporary, Lao Xiang. This rebellious, intelligent and capable village widow illustrates how Chinese women dealt with the theory of a chaste widowhood in reality. "Miss Du" is entirely rewritten by Lin Yutang based on Feng Menglong's *Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger* from the Ming dynasty. Lin reconstructs this tragic tale about a courtesan's love into an English novella, presenting an unusually talented and

---

133 Lin's daughter Adet Lin asserts this in the preface she wrote for the Chinese translation of *Moment in Peking*. See Adet Lin's preface to Yutang Lin, *Jing Hua Yan Yun* [惊华艳云], reprint ed. (Hongkong: Ji liu shu dian, 1954).
romantic courtesan, Du Shiniang, who chooses to die in defiance of Confucian society when her love is shattered. This rewriting demonstrates Lin’s strong interest in exploring the courtesan phenomenon and in reconstructing Chinese tales for Western readers.

In 1952, Lin’s translated and reinterpreted Famous Chinese Short Stories appeared. Among the tales from the Tang, Song, Ming and Qing dynasties, a series of female images are portrayed, including a few translated by Lin in the 1930s. They illustrate different types of romantic love and courtship in traditional China. Interestingly, Lin rewrote many of these stories according to his own ideals of Chinese women. For instance, Cui Yingying in the Tang tale The Story of Yingying is a passionate and poetic young girl from an aristocratic family. She falls in love with a young man without parental permission, but is later abandoned by him. She remains regretful and silent for the rest of her life. In Lin’s version “Passion,” the image of Yingying is similar to the original, however, the ending is rewritten. Yingying becomes a braver and more strong-minded girl, not at all like the silent, lovesick girl in the original. Lin presents Western readers with an image of a woman with more power in love and courtship. In a similar way, Lin also makes the duster girl Zhang from the Tang tale “Curly-Beard” more determined and intelligent than the original, and makes Meilan from “The Jade Goddess” a more devoted and unyielding lover. He even rewrites the adulterous wife Madame D from “The Lady from Di Clan” as a romantic and liberated woman who bravely pursues her love. Additionally, he rewrites a tragic love affair between a widow and her servant into a comedy with a happy ending.

Lin invested more energy in creative writings in the 1940s, ‘50s and ‘60s, creating in his English novels many images of Chinese women. Peng Danni, in A Leaf in the Storm (1942), survives a family tragedy, and is extremely brave and independent in her romances with two men in a time of war and chaos. In the end, she chooses the one she truly loves. In Chinatown Family (1948), his only novel to address Chinese immigrant life in America, he creates the image of a mother (Mother Fong) who emigrates from China to New York’s Chinatown. Her wisdom and tolerance enable her to adapt

---

134 The original version of “The Story of Yingying” was written by Yuan Zhen (779-831).
135 Yuan Zhen’s original story had been rewritten extensively after it was produced in the Tang dynasty. It was first rewritten by Tong Jieyuan (Jin Dynasty 1115-1234) as The Story of West Wing and was rewritten under the same title by Wang Shipu (Yuan Dynasty 1279-1368). Wang’s version became enormously successful and is well known even today.
harmoniously into a different culture and to manage a large family in a foreign land. In The Vermillion Gate (1953), Lin presents a courageous and idealistic girl Du Rou’an, who leaves her rich family to pursue her true love. In 1955, Lin wrote a fantasy novel Looking Beyond, which explores women’s lives in a utopian society, and tries to provide alternative solutions to the dilemmas feminist faced at his time. The Red Peony, written in 1961, is about the beautiful and liberated young widow Mudan in the late Qing dynasty who rebels against societal expectations and was open in her sexual relations with men. Lin’s 1963 novel Juniper Loa is a semi-autobiographical novel, in which Lin recalls his child love, Lai Boying, who follows the Dao of nature and leads a fruitful life in her homeland. In 1965, Lin wrote the historical novel Lady Wu, about the powerful and sophisticated Tang dynasty female emperor Wu Zetian, who possesses talent, patience, and cruelty both in politics and in love. This is the last novel Lin wrote. It forms an interesting contrast to the first female image Lin created in 1928, the queen Nanzi, and reflects his lasting effort to reconstruct demonized women in Chinese history.

During Lin’s long writing career, he presents many types of Chinese women, both real and fictional, ranging from woman warrior, ancient queen, housewife, abandoned lovesick girl, nun, widow, courtesan, ghosts, and emperor. Indeed, it could be said that Lin constructs his own version of “Biographies of Chinese Women, Ancient and Modern.” These images are critical in developing and articulating Lin’s attitudes about Chinese women and represent Lin’s lifelong effort to give Chinese women a voice. They also mirror the different influences and considerations that affect his reconstruction of images of Chinese women.

B. Nancy—the Earliest Spokeswoman for Chinese Feminism

Among the images of Chinese women Lin constructs and reconstructs, the ancient queen Nanzi should be considered a precursor. Confucius Met Nanzi (1928) was written much earlier than his publication of “Feminist Thought in Ancient China” (1935)

136 The female emperor Wu Zetian in Lin’s Lady Wu is also a powerful female image which Lin reconstructs. While the emperor Wu Zetian is better known in China than Queen Nanzi, Lin’s Lady Wu is a historical novel and I do not address this work here. My dissertation focuses on women in Lin’s translations, adaptations, and rewritings. In addition, I use the example of Nanzi to show how she is a precursor for my four case studies. Lady Wu was written as long as 30 years after these characters.
and his chapter “Women’s Life” in *My Country and My People* (1935). However, Lin’s feminist thought and his efforts to change stereotypical images of Chinese women are well demonstrated in this play.

Confucius Met Nanzi portrays the meeting between Nanzi, the powerful and notorious queen, and Confucius. This meeting is first recorded in *Analects*: “Confucius saw Nanzi and Zilu" was displeased, whereupon Confucius swore an oath, ‘If I have a dishonorable thought, may Heaven strike me! May Heaven strike me!’" It is also briefly depicted in the “Biography of Confucius” in Sima Qian’s *Records of the Grand Historian* (*Shiji*). Seizing upon this highly dramatic historical moment, Lin reconstructs this meeting and presents the ancient queen and the sage from an unconventional and fresh perspective.

Confucius, having wandered through several states to seek the favor of a ruler who would adopt his political ideas and give him a high-ranking position, arrives in the state of Wei around 497 BC. With the help of old friends and disciples, he attempts to obtain the position of minister in the Wei court. Nanzi requests a personal interview with him. Since Nanzi is said to be young, beautiful and lewd, Confucius is unwilling to meet with her. Yet, Nanzi proclaims: “All scholars who visit our country and wish to remain as guests of the court must see me about it,” as she is “the power behind the throne.” Finally, Confucius agrees, though Zilu is unhappy with this decision. Confucius assures him that all will be well, swearing the famous oath, ‘If I have a dishonourable thought, may Heaven strike me! May Heaven strike me!’

---

137 Zilu (子路), oldest of the regular disciples of Confucius, born 542 B.C. He always protested against Confucius’ conduct; he received rough handling in the hands of the authors of the *Analects*. See Yutang Lin, *The Wisdom of Confucius* (New York: The Modern Library, 1938).viii.


139 Lin claimed in the preface to the English version that “The background and all the characters of the play are historical, and the sayings of Confucius are based on early sources.” Preface to Lin, *Nancy*, 1. The general historical facts were based on the relevant records in Sima Qian’s “Biography of Confucius”, in his *Records of the Grand Historian* (*Shiji*), see English translation in Lin, *The Wisdom of Confucius*. 69-70. For the Chinese original, please see 《史记·孔子世家》.

Mindful of the rumors about Nanzi, Confucius nervously enters the parlor of the palace. Nanzi is beautiful and charming, but refined and gentle; she is unusually open-minded, intelligent, and deft at conversation. The play evolves into a series of dialogues, all initiated by Nanzi, regarding history, morality, poetry, and her suggestions for lectures Confucius could deliver. Several times Confucius is dumbfounded by Nanzi and does not know how to respond. The “rites and ceremonies” he promotes appear to be restrained, artificial, and complicated in comparison to Nanzi’s natural, romantic and enthusiastic views of life. Comic effect increases as the conversation progresses. Confucius is surprised that Nanzi is such a clever dialectician with an endless supply of new and wise ideas. He exclaims, “I have never heard such words of wisdom from the lips of a woman!” (Nancy 33). The play climaxes with Nanzi’s high-spirited performance including dance, song, and poetry. Confucius admits: “I have lived fifty-six years, and today for the first time, I begin to understand the real meaning of art and life […] Yes, this is real ceremony, real music […]” (Nancy 43-44). The play ends with Confucius’s uneasy and sad decision to leave Wei. Though he appreciates the beauty of Nanzi’s ‘Li’ (rites), her “music […], life […], rhythm […], simplicity […], naturalness […], no seclusion of women […], all freedom […],” Confucius must “save himself first,” save the ‘Li’ of Zhou (Nancy 45).

Confucius Met Nanzi was published in Benliu in 1928, the prominent left-wing journal edited by Lun Xun and Yu Dafu. In the late 1920s, China was in a dark period after the May Fourth cultural movement. Although the dominant voice of Neo-Confucianism retreated to the back of the stage, its spirit was still rampant in politics and in literary ideology. The chauvinistic attitudes were typical, and stereotypical images of Chinese women were popular, both inside and outside China. It was apparent that one of the reasons Lin designed his play was to mock these dregs of feudalism. The play was first enacted in 1929 at the birthplace of Confucius. The performance immediately renewed public interest in this unusual encounter. It even caused a real-life tragicomedy

---

141 “From 1916 to 1927 China was politically fragmented as local warlords competed for supremacy and imperialist powers extended their domination. Even after political division was largely overcome by the Nationalists, bitter strife between the Communists and the Nationalists and Japan’s progressive aggression kept the Nationalists in a state of war, deflecting them from their goals of modernization.” See Patricia Buckley Ebrey, The Cambridge Illustrated History of China (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996). 262.
when “descendants of the Confucius Clan” lodged a “protest with the Ministry of Education.” This accusation subsequently made the play even more popular and it was performed throughout China. Confucius Met Nanzi made Lin Yutang a national sensation. The humanized image of Confucius, as a man capable of human frailty not simply an infallible sage, fit well into the broad May Fourth intellectual canon. Lu Xun, the prominent May Fourth modern Chinese writer, traced the real-life case and wrote about the significance of the play. The play was primarily interpreted as a work of anti-Confucianism. By the early 1930s, Lin was considered by mainstream literary critics to be an important iconoclastic writer.

Rewriting stories of infamous women in Chinese history and literature to change stereotypical images of women in China was popular among the May Fourth playwrights; especially among those from the Spring Willow Society and Southern Country Society, such as Ouyang Yuqian, Tian Han, Guo Moro. In his play Pan Jinlian (潘金莲), Ouyang Yuqian rewrote the character of notorious Pan Jinlian found in the novel Jin Ping Mei into a woman who pursued true love and freedom. The play was published in 1928, shortly before Lin published Confucius Met Nanzi. Lin’s interest in revisiting the Queen Nanzi was quite possibly inspired by these playwrights. However, in comparison to the plays created by other May Fourth playwrights, Confucius Met Nanzi presented audiences a more powerful and brighter female image, and created a much stronger sensation on China’s literary scene.

In my opinion, Confucius Met Nanzi should be viewed as Lin’s earliest feminist writing. This play contains some of Lin’s most important thoughts and ideas on Chinese women which he expresses later in his articles. The creative reconstruction of Nanzi helped Lin to develop and systematize his feminist thoughts and ideas. By presenting this ancient queen, Lin was perhaps testing the water as to the images of Chinese woman that Chinese audiences would accept--the success of Nanzi gave him the confidence and

---

142 According to Lin’s explanation, “The charges were that ‘a student played the role of Confucius, a lady teacher played the role of Nancy [Nancy], fascinating in her charms, and that the one who played the part of Tselu [Zilu] had the air of a forest robber.’ The whole play was interpreted as an insult to their great ancestor. Lin’s preface to Lin, Nancy.

143 See Lu Xun’s article “On ‘Confucius Met Nanzi’” (“关于《子见南子》”), which was published in the literary journal Yusi, 5.24 (1929). It was reprinted in Zitong, ed., Lin Yutang Pingshuo Oishi Nian (Critics on Lin Yutang in the Last 70 Years) (Beijing: Oversea Chinese Publisher, 2003). 41-56.
stature to go on with his efforts. The strategies Lin developed in the process of reconstructing Nanzi established a solid foundation for his future endeavors in constructing and reconstructing the images of Chinese women. Nanzi is the precursor of Lin’s later work of presenting lovely, intelligent women who are, for at least a brief moment, on equal footing with an individual man.

1. How did Lin Change the Stereotypical Image of Nanzi and Idealize her?

Queen Nanzi personifies one stereotypical image of Chinese women “who by her beauty and intelligence and malice is responsible for disorder in the world, ‘the toppling of nations and the downfall of dynasties.’” (Sohigian 432). This type of image was particularly interesting to missionary translators, such as James Legge and A.C. Safford, since it demonstrates the ancient Chinese male’s fear of female intelligence and power. Though this image was purposefully highlighted by missionaries, the stereotype was indeed rooted in ancient China. The historical records of Wei during Nanzi’s time do not show a downfall of the state. Instead, we see prosperity and political openness. Wei poetry, collected in the Book of Poetry, was lovely and lively, ranking among the best poetry of the time. While Confucius visits them, the king and queen of Wei treat him well, unlike the leaders of other states he visits. Nonetheless, Nanzi was wrapped in negative descriptions and became tarnished by Chinese history, probably because “she did not hide or stifle her feelings or her intellect and employed them in ruling her kingdom” (Sohigian 433).

The stereotypical image of Nanzi reminds us of similar stereotypes in the West which demonize women with power or beauty or who talk too much. For instance, in the Judeo-Christian tradition, it is Eve who engages in a dialogue with Satan (the Snake), and who yields to Satan’s temptation and eats the forbidden fruit in violation of God’s sacred commandment. The various images of Pandora also illustrate the same idea. As Karin Littau argues, the history of Pandora “is a history of her images, which to be precise is a history of his images, that is, male image of her.” She points out that these images largely embody “phallocentric anxieties about woman, both as regards language--the mother

144 See the discussion in my Chapter One.
145 See the Book of Poetry. The Chinese original in 《诗经·颂·小雅》.
tongue—and as regards her gender—female sexuality” (qtd. in Flotow 46). These are two crucial areas, ‘women’s words,’ and ‘sexuality,’ that Lin highlights in this story.

a. Strategies in Selecting Historical Sources and Adopting Drama Form

It is a historical fact that Chinese women, especially during the later imperial dynasties, were not encouraged to speak and perform in public. As Lin points out in his “Feminist Thought in Ancient China,” “not a single woman’s voice was to be heard” among the voices of the later imperial Chinese feminist scholars, “which is but a reflection of the tyrannical power of the Confucian system of ideas” (“Feminist” 116-17). In Lin’s view, women’s emancipation begins with letting women’s own voices be heard. His essay “Women’s Analects” (“女论语”) (“Nü Lunyu”) parodies one of the four Classic Books for women’s education in Ancient China, Song Ruohua’s Analects for Women. Lin asserts that these didactic books attempt to silence women. He cites Otto Jespersen’s words, “We [men] think when we talk, and some ladies talk in order to find out what they think,” claiming that forbidding women to speak is basically forbidding women to think. He also believes that women’s words are highly interesting as well as important (“Nü Lunyu” 83). By choosing a historic encounter and reconstructing it, Lin allows a woman to speak for herself and forces the historical record to be viewed in a more progressive light. As Flotow points out, feminist writing “is often placed on the moments where women’s own voices become audible” (67). By allowing Nanzi to become the dominant speaker in the dialogues with Confucius, Lin emancipates Nanzi from patriarchal language. In the play, the stereotypical views on Nanzi are altered by her own words and performance with laughter, humour and irony. By the end of the drama, all of the men, originally afraid of Nanzi and full of derision for her, are moved and convinced by her wisdom.

b. The Design of Conversation Topics for Allowing Nanzi’s Voice be Heard

Lin’s design of the play centers on two crucial and sensitive topics: women’s words and sexuality. Nanzi was said to be talkative—what could be her favorite topics in discussion? Nanzi was said to be lewd, and fond of being with men, how distracting and harmful could that be? Nanzi was said to have many ideas—were they innovative and interesting? Lin’s primary purpose was to root out stereotypes, to make Nanzi’s voice
audible, and to allow the readers to hear her from her perspective. On each topic, Lin allows Nanzi to speak directly with Confucius, questioning him and expressing her opinions, and speaking from her viewpoint--women’s understanding, women’s experience, women’s psychology.

After some small talk, Nanzi moves to the central purpose of her meeting with Confucius. She suggests forming a literary club for the study of the six classical arts: ceremony, music, archery, charioteering, calligraphy, arithmetics. She wants Confucius to give a series of lectures on ‘Li’ (rites) to the court members. Confucius is delighted by this suggestion, and happily agrees, as educating through the six arts is originally his idea. Yet Nanzi adds a condition, which is: all of the court ladies, including herself, will take part in the club. Men and women will learn the six classical arts together. This request immediately complicates the situation, as according to Confucius’ theory, women must be separated. Nanzi eloquently explains why co-ed instruction is preferable, as she believes it is important to have the female point of view:

There are many passages in the Classics which deal with women, like folk-lore and social customs which only we women understand thoroughly. You often find them in songs and poetry and drama. I am quite sure that we women can repeat them better and interpret them more correctly than yourself, if you will excuse me for saying so. And in history too. You men always interpret them from your egoistic male point of view, and never really understand woman psychology. Take, for instance, the famous Queen of King Yu. She was a very virtuous queen. She was not frivolous. Her only fault was in being beautiful. Because she was virtuous and was not fond of giggling, the wicked King insisted on making her laugh. In order to make her laugh, King Yu acted like a school boy of thirteen--sent a rocket to raise false alarm for his vassals. His vassals came with their troops and saw they had been made fools of. Oh, of course, she laughed then. But, mind you, she was not laughing at the false alarm, but at the fool of you men. Well, who was to blame for this childish foolishness? And yet when men begin to write history, they universally make the Queen responsible for the loss of the kingdom, as if she, and not the King himself played with official war signals. Well, if you allow our women-folk to participate in the discussion we may be able occasionally to throw in interesting suggestions, you see. (Nancy 30-31)

Nanzi’s unique proposal to read literature, poetry, and history from women’s perspectives, and to emphasize the importance of men understanding women’s
psychology astonishes Confucius, almost "like thunder roaring into his ears." Nanzi believes that Confucius will agree with her "co-education" plan, but Confucius worries about the possible improprieties arising from mixing men and women. Nancy then calls Confucius a "delightful moralist," and makes another astounding statement:

What improprieties or misdemeanors do you mean? Sexual? [...] Sometimes I think that without the element of sex, life would be a horrible, fatuous vacuum. Sex gave rise to all the beauties of life and nature, and our life could be made fuller and richer by a more thorough enjoyment of the things that you just refer to as "wine, food, and women." Sex gives rise to literature, our songs and our poetry. Why without sexual misdemeanors, no love lyrics and no literature in the world at all! Have you ever heard the folk songs of our country? (Nancy 34)

Confucius admits that Wei poetry is the most marvelous poetry he ever knows, and Nanzi explains the reasons:

Do you know why Wei poetry is marvelous? Simply because we have the greatest variety and number of sexual improprieties in our country. Why, the best love songs are composed by young lovers who know nothing about your fine ceremonies and seclusion of women, but can sing beautifully about their rendezvous around the city corners, and their secret meetings in the mulberry fields [...] (Nancy 34-35)

The above conversations demonstrate that Nanzi is intelligent and philosophical. She has her own independent judgment and dares doubt time-honoured traditions. Her penetrating questions and arguments leave the sage scandalized, amazed, and convinced. How can Nanzi be so wise and sharp? Historical records reveal only a few sentences said to be uttered by Nanzi. In the preface to the English version of this play, Lin stated that "the background and all the characters of the play are historical, and the sayings of Confucius are based on early sources" (Preface Nancy vi). Clearly, Lin created Nanzi's words.

---

147 Chinese idiom, 如雷贯耳, "reverberates like thunder."

148 The words were recorded in The Biography of Confucius in Sima Qian's Shiji: "The gentlemen of foreign countries who do us the honour of visiting our country and wish to be friends of our King always see me. May I have the pleasure of your company?" ("四方之君子，不辱，欲与寡君为兄弟者，必见寡小君。寡小君愿见。")
c. How could Nancy be so Intelligent and Sharp? --Multiple Voices of Male Feminists

Rewriting a historical story can be likened to ‘refilling an aged bottle with new wine.’ Lin not only fills this ‘aged bottle’ with his own feminist thoughts, but also ‘borrows another person’s cup, to assuage his own worries:’ the ideas and thoughts of other male writers with strong feminist leanings, especially Yuan Mei’s, and Lin’s own, are deftly expressed through Nanzi’s voice and her performance of song and dance. In this way, Lin makes the meeting between Confucius and Nanzi a ‘test tube’ for fusing various feminist ideas. This play acts as ‘the galvanizer’ of these ideas. Nanzi thus becomes a spokeswoman for Chinese Feminism.

In this play, Nanzi challenges Confucius several times by asking him the origin of the ‘Li’ (rites). She doubts whether the rule separating men and women was made by the Duke of Zhou, and mocks the stiff and inflexible aspects of the ancient tenets and verities. Her independent spirit in questioning the time-honored tradition is very similar to Yuan Mei, the rebel thinker of the eighteenth century. As Lin describes,

[Yuan Mei] challenged the infallibility of the Six Confucian Classics, who openly denied that the word “Orthodoxy” should have any meaning, and who even dared to doubt the authorship of the Spring and Autumn Annals by Confucius, to doubt the reliability of the Analects itself as correct reports of Confucius’ sayings and even to suggest that Confucius had his nodding moments. ("Feminist" 124-25)

From Lin’s description of Yuan Mei, we can see that Nanzi is almost a female Yuan Mei. The words she utters, and the singing and dancing she performs reflect Yuan Mei’s spirit and ideas. No wonder Nanzi’s voice is so vigorous and astonishing, and that the play stirred up turmoil at a time when the society was crammed with Neo-Confucian masculine bias.

Nanzi’s proposal to read literature, poetry, and history from the woman’s perspective and her criticism of male bias are apparently of Lin’s idea. As Lin points out in “Feminist Thought in Ancient China:” “It is a truism that Chinese ethics is essentially a masculine ethics.” He uses Chinese historical writing as an illustration of masculine

---

149 Chinese idiom, ‘旧瓶装新酒。’

150 Chinese idiom, ‘借他人之酒杯, 浇自己之块垒。’

151 I borrow the word from Lin’s comments on Gu Hongming’s translation: “It was an act of creative interpretation, a sudden transfusion of light of the old texts through a deep philosophic understanding. He acted, in fact, as the galvanizer of ideas Eastern and Western.” Lin, From Pagan, 50.
bias, and ironically points out that "whenever the men rulers made a mess of the business of government and lost a dynasty, the men scholars were always able to point out a woman as the cause of their downfall" ("Feminist" 112). He allows his own insights express through Nanzi.

Since “female sexuality” is as an important factor underlying stereotypes, “feminist writers have […] responded by breaking open these stereotypes and moving beyond these clichés” (Flotow 17). In reconstructing the image of Nanzi, Lin does not ‘purify’ her sexuality. Lin uses her as an example in My Country and My People to illustrate the liberal sexual relations of men and women in the times of Confucius, to show that “the cult of feminine chastity had not yet become an obsession with men” (My Country 139). Lin’s presentation of this “lewd” queen has another important purpose, “Chinese feminism could fight its way out to the open […] , only by pointing a mocking finger at the really obscene Puritanism of the then prevailing type of Confucianism” ("Feminist" 124). Nanzi’s liberal sexual ethics, thus represent a way of defying Confucian Puritanism.

The most important strategy in moving beyond these clichés, was allowing Nanzi to speak directly on the topic of sexuality. In Nanzi’s view, “sexual improprieties” are a driving-force in literary and artistic creation, and the success of Wei poetry is her best evidence. In this way, Lin uses Nanzi’s words to fight “for a more healthy view of sex and of women” ("Feminist" 133).

In the play, Nanzi asserts “[...] Sometimes I think life is so short and empty […], so why not make it […] short and merry?” (Nancy 38-39). Immersing herself in the emotion of music and poetry, and her liberal and free dance poses, illustrate her way of life—pursuing simplicity and emancipation, and a “whole-hearted and clean enjoyment of life” ("Feminist" 128). In fact, Nanzi reflects Daoism beliefs of Lin Yutang. That Nancy outwits Confucius in this play illustrates Lin’s own philosophical ideal.

The dancing Nanzi also reminds us of the famous dancer Isadora Duncan (1877-1927). In an essay, Lin praises Duncan’s naturalistic dancing which reflects her free

---

152 Isadora Duncan was the first American dancer to define movement based on natural and spiritual laws rather than on formal considerations of geometric space. She rigorously compared dance to the other arts, defending it as a primary art form worthy of "high art" status. See Lynner Conner and Susan Gillis-
and creative spirit, and her philosophy of simplicity. Lin also recommended several times Duncan's autobiography to Chinese readers. The image of Nanzi, as the above studies demonstrate, is "a hybrid construction," representing Lin's fused ideas and spirit of both Chinese and Western feminism.

Like the novelist Li Ruzhen, who "made the novel a channel for propagating his ideas," Lin makes his drama a channel for propagating his feminist thoughts. By using a modern dramatic form, he is able to convey scholarly ideas in a humorous and appealing way and to reach a broader audience than he could in an essay.

2. Translating Chinese Nanzi into English Nancy—Strategies in Localizing the Chinese play in English Context

In 1931, Lin translated Confucius Met Nanzi into English as Confucius Saw Nancy, "in response to the request of the Chinese students at Columbia University who enacted it at the International House in December, 1931" (Preface to Nancy v). This was the first time the image of Nancy appeared for an English audience. In 1937, the play was collected in Lin's book of early English writings, Confucius Saw Nancy and Essays about Nothing. The title of the book perhaps indicates his personal favor for this play. Confucius Saw Nancy has so far not attracted much research attention. However, in my view, Lin had his own purpose in making Nancy known in the West. In the 1930s, Western feminism was rising and Lin wanted to join this feminist discourse by translating his play. In addition, Lin was aware of how the lives of Chinese women were misinterpreted in the West. Lin intended to make Nancy a spokeswoman for Chinese feminism in English. For this purpose, Lin makes Nancy's words more powerful, and her actions more liberal than in the original, in order to fit better with the feminist discourse. For instance, when Nancy is first mentioned by the male scholars, Lin adds: "You know women always rule the world, don't they?" (Nancy 4). This accentuates Lin's view that in early China, women had great power. Lin also had Confucius express his impression directly: "Nancia [Nancy] is a brilliant and beautiful talker. Confound her beauty! She

---


98
has too many ideas” (Nancy 36). This is not in the original Chinese. Lin also adds some explanatory notes before and between conversations. The function of these notes are similar to footnotes, meanwhile they provide space direct the readers’ understanding. For example, when Nancy asks Confucius to adopt the “co-education” plan for the club of studying Six Classic Arts, Lin adds an explanatory note to describe the way Nancy spoke “[In an impressive display of feminine eloquence]” (Nancy 29). When Nancy joins the dancing girls to dance, there is only one sentence in Chinese “南子掷琴解衣起舞 (Nanzi put the musical instrument aside, undid her gown, and started to dance)” ("Zi Jian Nanzi" 227). But in English, Lin expands it to a paragraph and exaggerates the action, “Nancia throws the guitar aside and taking off her gown, revealing beautiful vests and undergown, joins in the dance, flirting all the while with Confucius” (Nancy 41). These added explanations strengthen the feminist color of the play, and make Nancy even more emancipated. Lin also adopts certain vocabularies which were popular in the Western feminist movement, such as ‘co-education’ to translate Nancy’s idea of “gentlemen and ladies studying together (男女同学)” (Nancy 29). These bring a certain modern and feminist color to the ancient Chinese queen’s language.

The appearance of Confucius Met Nanzi and its translation Confucius Saw Nancy signals Lin’s promising start in defining and presenting Chinese women to the West. The strategies Lin develops in changing stereotypical images by selecting source materials, using literary images to embody his feminist thoughts and ideas, philosophical and aesthetic ideals were enlightening. His tendency to idealize and romanticize Chinese women in the process of reconstructing their images, as well as his tendency to sharpen the image for Western audiences, are well demonstrated. This play thus identifies Lin as a male Chinese feminist with strong cross-cultural consciousness in the May Fourth era. It establishes a solid foundation for his future endeavors in constructing and reconstructing the images of Chinese women. Just a few years after Nancy became the spokeswoman for the Chinese feminism, Lin published his English book My Country and My People in New York, and was recognized internationally as a prominent spokesman for China and Chinese culture.
C. The Selected Images for my Case Studies

The case studies in the following chapters focus on the images of Chinese women Lin Yutang translated, adapted and rewrote. As I point out in the Introduction to this dissertation, that while the images Lin creates in his English novels are very important in Lin’s overall discourse on Chinese women, the images in Lin’s translations, adaptations and rewritings play a more significant role in establishing the foundation for Lin’s feminist thoughts and ideals. They support Lin’s arguments, since these images are from historical and literary sources; they are also the inspiration for the female images in Lin’s creative writing. More importantly, these images have also been largely ignored by academic studies. In my view, the genealogy of Lin Yutang’s image of Chinese women could not be established without them.

Among the images Lin constructed and reconstructed in his translations, adaptations and rewritings, I have selected four female images, in addition to Nanzi (Nancy), for my detailed case studies: Yun, Yiyun, Widow Quan and Du Shiniang. I focus on these four images: first, because they are the four common types of Chinese women most stereotyped in the missionary discourse. They are all intelligent and independent, and to a certain degree, stronger than the men they meet. They have integrity and female power, and are able to stand on an equal footing with men. These four images embody not only Lin’s feminist thoughts and beliefs, but also his philosophical, religious, literary and aesthetic ideals. Second, portraying these four images represents three important types of Lin Yutang’s translational practice: translation, adaptation and rewriting. The strategies Lin develops in these practices play a fundamental role in his construction and reconstruction of images of Chinese women.
CHAPTER THREE: YUN, ONE OF THE LOVELIEST WOMEN IN CHINESE LITERATURE--WHY AND HOW LIN YUTANG TRANSLATED SIX CHAPTERS OF A FLOATING LIFE

Introduction

“Yun, I think, is one of the loveliest women in Chinese literature. She is not the most beautiful, for the author, her husband, does not make that claim, and yet who can deny that she is the loveliest?” (Preface to Six Chapters 20). So begins Lin Yutang’s affectionate preface to his English translation of Fu sheng liu ji (浮生六记), Six Chapters of a Floating Life, in which he candidly expresses his admiration and fondness for Yun. In the early 1930s, shortly before Lin wrote My Country and My People, he invested tremendous energy in translating this book, revising it more than ten times. He claimed that this was one of his most challenging translations, yet also the most satisfying (Postscript to Six Chapters 330).

In this chapter I analyze the personal and cultural reasons behind Lin’s strong admiration for Yun and his motives for translating this book into English. I outline the intertextual relationships between Six Chapters of a Floating Life and Lin’s other books introducing Chinese culture to the West, such as My Country and My People and The Importance of Living. I show the critical role this memoir plays in forming Lin’s cross-cultural discourse on Chinese women and Chinese culture. In the second part of the chapter, I focus on how Lin translates this memoir. Two other English versions of Shen

---

154 The Chinese version I use is Fu Shen, Fu Sheng Liu Ji (浮生六记) (Changsha [长沙]: Hunan Literature and Art Press [湖南文艺出版社], 1995).
Fu’s memoir were published after Lin’s. The first was translated by Shirley Black\textsuperscript{155} in 1960, and the second by Leonard Pratt and Su-hui Chiang\textsuperscript{156} in 1983. Lin’s translation strategies and craft will be compared to those of Shirley Black and Pratt and Chiang. There are significant differences in the translations due to the images of Chinese womanhood which the translators attempt to portray. This study will demonstrate why, in my view, Lin is the ideal translator of this memoir.

I. Cultural and Cross-cultural Motives behind Lin Yutang’s Translation of Shen Fu’s Memoir

\textit{Six Chapters of a Floating Life} is a memoir written by Shen Fu\textsuperscript{157}, a minor scholar and amateur painter who lived in Suzhou, China during the heyday of Qianlong reign during the Qing dynasty.\textsuperscript{158} The memoir details the ups and downs of his life, and in particular, memorializes Yun\textsuperscript{159}, his beloved wife who died in sickness and poverty at the age of forty. The memoir is divided into six chapters, titled respectively: “Wedded Bliss,”\textsuperscript{160} “The Little Pleasures of Life,”\textsuperscript{161} “Sorrow,”\textsuperscript{162} “The Joys of Travel,”\textsuperscript{163} “Experience,”\textsuperscript{164} and “The Way of Life.”\textsuperscript{165} In “Wedded Bliss,” Shen Fu passionately and meticulously recalls some significant events, places, and dialogues in his married life, depicting how he and Yun sought “momentary happiness and freedom in an era and environment conducive to tragedy” (Yue 38). In “The Little Pleasures of Life,” Shen illustrates his mystic appreciation of nature and extensive observations on gardens and

\textsuperscript{155} Shirley Black was a translator of Chinese literature. She published an English translation of Li Bai and Du Fu’s poems in 1956. See \textit{Rainbow Skirts and Feather Jackets: Twenty Chinese Poems}, trans. Shirley Black (Hollywood: W.M. Hawley, 1956).

\textsuperscript{156} Two scholars in Chinese studies.

\textsuperscript{157} Shen Fu (沈复, 1763- 1808 after), styled Sanbo (三白). According to his narration, his memoir was written in 1808.

\textsuperscript{158} The Qianlong (乾隆) Emperor (1711-1799) was the fourth emperor of the Qing dynasty China. His reign (1735-1796) was one of the longest in Chinese history, and very prosperous.

\textsuperscript{159} Chen Yun (陈芸), styled Shuzhen (淑珍). According to Shen Fu’s memoir, Yun was born in 1763, and died in 1803.

\textsuperscript{160} 闺房记乐 \textit{gufang ji le}.

\textsuperscript{161} 闲情记趣 \textit{xianqing ji qu}.

\textsuperscript{162} 坎坷记愁 \textit{kanke ji chou}.

\textsuperscript{163} 浪游记快 \textit{langyou ji kuai}.

\textsuperscript{164} 中山记历 \textit{zhongshan ji li}.

\textsuperscript{165} 养生记道 \textit{yangsheng ji dao}.
flower arranging, etc., and explains how Yun’s insights and aptitude in these small things added delight and pleasure to their living. In “Sorrow,” Shen Fu reveals the conflicts between the couple and their larger families and surroundings, their troubles and poverty, and their unbearable final parting. In “The Joy of Travel,” Shen recalls his travels and comments on the scenic spots and gardens which most impressed him, and reveals his intimate relationship with nature. The last two chapters are missing.

The manuscript was discovered at a secondhand bookstore in Suzhou in 1877 by Yang Yinchuan. Yang found it so compelling that he decided to publish it. It caused an immediate sensation in certain literary circles. The memoir was read by a famous Chinese essayist, Yu Pingbo, during the early days of May Fourth era. Yu felt it had an “undeniable dazzling charm,” and thought that it illustrated one of the major May Fourth issues—the conflict between the individual and the large feudal family. Yu edited and reprinted it in 1924. The book immediately became influential among the young intellectuals. During this period Lin Yutang encountered the book and found it unusually interesting. Ten years later, Lin translated it into English, including an affectionate preface, in which he recommends it highly to both Chinese and English

---

166 There is not much information about Yang Yinchuan (杨引传). He was the author (and editor) of 《独悟庵丛钞》 (Collections of Duwuanc), in which Fu sheng liu ji (《浮生六记》) was first collected. The book was published by Shen Pao Press (申报馆, Shanghai Newspaper Press) in 1877, with the help of Yang’s brother-in-law, Wang Tao (王韬, 1828-1897), a famous Qing dynasty translator, fiction writer, and newspaper publisher.

167 According to Yang, the book had been popular in Suzhou in the second or third decade of the nineteenth century, as his brother-in-law Wang Tao had seen it in his childhood. “From Kuan Yi-ngo’s poems and from the known headings of the last chapters, we know that the Fifth Chapter records his experience in Formosa, while the Sixth Chapter contained the author’s reflections on the Way of Life.” See Lin’s preface to Fu Shen, Six Chapters of a Floating Life, trans. Lin Yutang (Beijing: Foreign Language Teaching and Research Press, 1999). 23. In 1935, an edition containing six chapters was published in Shanghai by Shijie shuju, yet the last two parts were apparently fake; they were selected excerpts from the works of several well-known authors.

168 The book was soon reprinted in the journal 《雁来红丛刊》 (Yanlaihong) by Dongwu university (东吴大学), and started to be popular thereafter.

169 Yu Pingbo (1900-1990), original name Yu, Mingheng (俞铭衡), famous modern Chinese poet, essayist and scholar in classical Chinese literature.

readers. Lin’s translation and publication in popular journals made this book well-known among English readers living in China, and increased its popularity among Chinese readers. By the early 1940s, the Chinese version of Fu sheng liu ji had been reprinted as many as fifty times. Yun, thus became a household name in China.

Yun also became known to general Western readers through the publication of Lin’s other works on Chinese culture. In My Country and My People, Lin cites more than three pages of Six Chapters of a Floating Life to support his augments on Chinese characteristics and the Chinese life. In a chapter “The Enjoyment of Nature” in Importance of Living, Lin uses four pages to demonstrate Yun’s ways of enjoying nature. In 1942, all four existing chapters of this translation are included in The Wisdom of China and India. Sections from this book appear as late as 1960 in Lin’s translation, The Importance of Understanding, in the section of “Love and Death.” Lin’s favour for Yun and the importance of Yun in Lin’s discourse on Chinese culture is revealed in these selections.

As an active May Fourth intellectual, Lin’s appreciation of Shen Fu’s memoir was likely similar to that of Yu Pingbo. He must have agreed with Yu Pingbo’s belief in the existence of native Chinese individualism and Romanticism, which was commonly considered to be imported from the West, and must have believed this spirit could enhance the ongoing New Cultural Enlightenment. However, in my view, as a bi-cultural

---

171 The translation was published in the influential English literary journals in Shanghai, Tien Hsia Monthly (《天下》) and the bilingual Hsi Feng Monthly (《西风》), and later the same year, as a separate bilingual edition by the Shanghai Bookstore, with the English and the Chinese on facing pages. These facts are recorded in the postscript “后记” in Lin’s translation Shen, Six Chapters. 330.

172 It had been included in various book collections, such as “Beautifying Life Series,” “Recreational Essay Series,” etc., indicating a variety of interpretations of this book and its popularity. See Li, "Fu Sheng Liu Ji and May Fourth."


175 In this version, which was made available to general Western audiences, Lin cuts about one-third of chapter four, “The Joy of Travel.” The removed materials do not significantly change the expression of Chinese cultural essence that Lin tries to convey by translating this memoir, which are discussed later in this chapter. See Yutang Lin, ed., The Wisdom of China and India (New York: The Modern Library, 1955). 964-1050.

intellectual and a male feminist, Lin had his own perspective in interpreting this native spirit of individualism and Romanticism. His insistence on translating this memoir into English, and his fondness for Yun were deeply related to his personal background and to the cross-cultural context in which he lived. Lin was motivated by his desire to change stereotypical images of Chinese women, to find cross-cultural affinities between Chinese and Western womanhood, and to introduce the best spirit of Chinese culture to the West.

A. A Text for Studying and Introducing Chinese Cultural Essence

Lin encountered Shen Fu’s memoir on his spiritual journey of rediscovering his national culture and people; his joy in finding this book was no less than that of finding “a pearl in an ash can.” Stimulated by Gu Hongming’s systematic method of scholarship, which recommended the student of Chinese “begin his study with the individual, to proceed from the individual to the family, and from the family to the Government” (Gu Spirit 133), Lin found that Six Chapters of a Floating Life was a good case for studying Chinese individuals, especially women and their life, and thereby to achieve a better understanding of Chinese social life and culture (My Country 135).

In Lin’s view, Shen Fu and Yun’s lives represent the essence of Chinese life, integrating Confucianism, Daoism and Buddhism:

I am translating her story, [...] because in this simple story of two guileless creatures in their search for beauty, living a life of poverty and privations, decidedly outwitted by life and their cleverer fellowmen, yet determined to snatch every moment of happiness and always fearful of the jealousy of the gods, I seem to see the essence of a Chinese way of life as really lived by two persons who happened to be husband and wife [...]. (Preface to Six Chapters 20-21)

Six Chapters of a Floating Life gives an account of how Chinese people, like people everywhere, use religion and spiritual support to make their lives meaningful. Living in the heyday of Emperor Qianlong’s reign, Yun and Fu’s lives are inevitably surrounded and controlled by Confucianism; however, they search for spiritual freedom and comfort both through Daoism and Buddhism. As Lin points out, “Taoism [Daoism] and Confucianism are but two alternating moods in the nation’s soul. Every Chinese is a

177 To describe his joy in discovering favourite books, Lin writes in his preface to The Importance of Living: “there is a greater pleasure in picking up a small pearl in an ash-can than in looking at a large one in a jeweler’s window.” Lin, Living. vi.
good Confucianist when he is a success, but a Taoist [Daoist] when he is in trouble or frustrated and beset by difficulties and failures. [...] So far as the popular conception of the word ‘religion’ goes, the Chinese people may be said on the whole to be Buddhist” (From Pagan 111).

Two ordinary artistic persons who did not accomplish anything particularly noteworthy in the world, but merely loved the beautiful things in life, lived their quiet life with some good friends after their own heart—ostensibly failures, and happy in their failure. [...] The cause of the tragedy lay simply in the fact that she knew how to read and write and that she loved beauty too much to know that loving beauty was wrong. [...] There we see an elementary, though entirely innocent, conflict between her artistic temperament and the world of reality. (Preface to Six Chapters 21)

Here Lin outlines the basic conflicts the couple face: the conflict between the Confucian-dominated society and their own pursuit of freedom influenced by Daoism. It seems that Shen Fu and Yun’s sorrows are mainly Confucian sorrows and their pleasures predominantly Daoist pleasures. Their fatalism and means of finding spiritual comfort are deeply influenced by Buddhism. These three spiritual traditions are inseparable from their way of thinking and living, organically integrated into their daily life, and deeply affect their personal identities and fates. Lin recognized and appreciated this “all-embracing” aspect of Chinese cultural values as illustrated in Six Chapters of a Floating Life.

B. A New Model of the Chinese Female Ideal

Yun is very different from those stereotypical uneducated, and prisoner-like housewives presented in the missionary writings and translations I discussed in Chapter One. She lived during 1763-1803, a time shortly before the Protestant missionaries entered China. Shen Fu’s memoir, as one of the few surviving personal records of common people’s life, is not only a fairly accurate portrayal of the social life of the later Qing society, but also provides one of the most vivid and authentic images of Chinese women during later imperial China. Lin asserts that “there are a number of such women in every generation, except that in Yun, I seem to feel the qualities of a cultivated and gentle wife combined to a greater degree of perfection than falls within our common experience” (Preface to Six Chapters 20). Yun thus becomes a supportive example in changing the missionary view of Chinese women, and forms an intertextual illumination
with Lin’s *My Country and My People*.

1. Representing Lin’s Ideal Womanhood, Connecting to Victorian Womanhood

   As I outline in Chapter One, Gu Hongming describes the Chinese feminine ideal as a “helpful wife and exemplary mother,” and believes that this is similar to the feminine ideal in Indo-European and Semitic nations (*Gu Spirit* 74). However, the distinct characteristics of the ideal he presents, such as “absolute selflessness,” “perfect submissiveness,” and “divine meekness,” are problematic in convincing Western readers of the similarity. In general, Lin agrees that the ideal woman in traditional China is a “helpful wife and wise mother” (*My Country* 155), but he reinterprets this concept, and injects new blood into it by portraying women who are more multi-dimensional. By translating *Six Chapters of a Floating Life* into English, Lin presents Yun as a new model of ideal Chinese womanhood.

   Yun possesses many of the feminine virtues Gu proposes, “all those virtues desirable from the male point of view,” such as “quietness, obedience, good manners, personal neatness, industry, ability in cooking and spinning, respect for the husband’s parents, kindness to the husband’s brothers, and courtesy to the husband’s friends” (*My Country* 155). Like most women of her time, Yun’s marriage is her career, and she uses her talents in a limited domestic space. However, unlike the typical Chinese saying, “to be without talent is women’s virtue,” which was very popular in later Ming and Qing dynasty, Yun is presented as an intelligent and multi-talented woman. Since her family was poor, she does not have the education which girls from rich families receive. Nevertheless, Yun, led by her natural curiosity, teaches herself to read and write poetry (*Six Chapters* 6). One of her early poems contains the lines: “Touched by autumn, one’s figure grows slender / Soaked in frost, the chrysanthemum blooms full” (*Six Chapters* 6).

---


179 Yun was taught to recite The Pipa Player (a famous poem by Tang poet Bai Juyi) when she was quite young. Later she retrieves a copy of this poem from a wastebasket, and aided by her childhood memory, reads it word by word.
Her radiating intelligence and poetic talent attract Shen Fu when they first meet in their teens, and eventually seeds their marriage (Six Chapters 6).

Yun continues her learning after marriage by taking her husband as her teacher (Six Chapters 13, 21). Composing poetry and discussing literature become frequent activities in their wedded life. She loves books and paintings more than pearls and jewels, and studies whenever she has time between needlework and household chores (Six Chapters 45). She also educates both her daughter and her son. In addition to reading and writing, Yun is gifted at other things, such as embroidery, which is a source of financial support for the family (Six Chapters 6, 137). She is also talented in managing the household; when financial worries burden the family, it is often Yun who devises the solution.

Yun is not particularly beautiful, yet “in her eyes there was a look of quick intelligence and soft refinement” (Six Chapters 7). She is a woman with her own mind, gentle yet firm. Shen Fu often asks for her opinions and is convinced of her intelligence. He believes that although Yun was born as a woman, she has the “heart and talent of a man” (Six Chapters 175).

By presenting such an intelligent and multi-talented Chinese woman to his English readers, Lin revitalizes the concept of ideal Chinese womanhood, and makes an interesting comparison to Western women of the later nineteenth and early twentieth
century. Victorian life embraced the concepts of virtuous womanhood, educated motherhood and wife-companions (Chin 31). Yun’s depiction fulfills these values.

Missionaries commonly believed that ideal Victorian womanhood was achieved through Christian education. In his article “The Urgent Importance of Female Education,” Allen Young, the chief editor of the influential missionary journal *Chinese Globe Magazine*, praises American women as “intelligent, wise, respectful, pure, virtuous, brave, loyal and patriotic [...].” He asserts that “Christianity improved women’s abilities, elevated women’s place and also emancipated Western women” (“Urgent Importance”). As I discussed in Chapter One, Allen Young also took women’s status as symbol of civilization.

By presenting *Six Chapters of a Floating Life*, Lin reveals that Yun, a Chinese woman very much like the Christian ideal, is created by Daoism, Buddhism, and Confucianism, thus reminding readers that the similarities between Western and Chinese ideals of womanhood are based on the commonalities of human nature, not on religion.

2. Illustrating Love and Marriage in Traditional China

Arranged marriage, in the eyes of many curious outsiders, is a rather inhuman and exotic practice, denying individual desire and love. Gu Hongming tries to defend the wedded love and equality of Chinese marriages but is ineffective, as he emphasizes the role of the wedding ceremony in securing this love and equality (Gu Spirit 85, 89). By presenting Yun and Shen Fu’s story in English, Lin brings to the Western reader a much healthier and humanized version of Chinese love and marriage.

Although the marriage of Yun and Shen Fu is arranged, it stems from and results in genuine love. As Lin points out in “Women’s Life,” “In youth and romance and love, the world is pretty much the same, only the psychological reactions differ as a result of different social traditions” (*My Country* 155). Yun falls in love with Shen Fu, her cousin, when she is a shy and innocent teenage girl. She is happy to share all of her poems with Shen Fu when he visits his mother’s maiden home, and she secretly expresses her
feelings for him whenever there is an occasion. Yun and Shen Fu’s romantic love enters a new stage after the wedding ceremony. As newlyweds, they spend much of their time “either reading together or discussing the ancient things, or else enjoying the moon and passing judgments on the flowers” (Six Chapters 21-23). “Every day we rubbed shoulders together and clung to each other like an object and its shadow, and the love between us was something that surpassed the language of words” (Six Chapters 15). This intimacy between them is not merely a honeymoon phenomenon, but continues in the twenty-three years of their married life, according to Shen Fu (Six Chapters 27).

Yun and Shen Fu express their love in other creative ways:

On the seventh night of the seventh moon of that year [Chinese Valentine’s day], Yun prepared incense, candles and some melons and other fruits, so that we might together worship the Grandson of Heaven in the Hall called “After My Heart.” I had carved two seals with the inscription “That we might remain husband and wife from incarnation to incarnation.” I kept the seal with positive [protruding] characters, while she kept the one with negative [recessed] characters, to be used in our correspondence. (Six Chapters 27)

They even ask a friend to make a painting of “the Old Man under the Moon,” who, according to Chinese legend, was in charge of matrimony. On the first and fifteenth of every month, they “burnt incense and prayed together before him,” so that they could be husband and wife again in their next incarnation (Six Chapters 49).

Shen Fu and Yun’s love, which grows along with their marriage, is undoubtedly established by their mutual sexual attraction, similar artistic temperament, common interests and ideals of life. Their story supports Lin’s defense of the existence of love in Chinese marriage. Shen Fu and Yun’s relationship also illustrates the equality between husband and wife. Lin believes that “nature has ordained that man and woman should meet in their intimacies as equals” (My Country 155), much “like the two fish in the Taoist symbol of yin and yang, necessarily complementing each other” (My Country 139). In his preface to the translated version, Lin praises this memoir as “one of the

---

187 On one occasion, when Shen Fu returns late from a cousin’s wedding ceremony, and hungrily searches for some food, he discovers that Yun had secretly “hidden away a bowl of warm congee and some dishes” for him. Shen, Six Chapters. 9. On their wedding night, Shen Fu learns that Yun had practiced vegetarianism for years (a symbol of her concern for him), starting when he had small-pox. Shen, Six Chapters. 11.

188 Original note from Lin Yutang: “The seventh day of the seventh moon is the only day in the year when the pair of heavenly lovers, the Cowherd (“Grandson of Heaven”) and the Spinster, are allowed to meet each other across the Milky Way.” Shen, Six Chapters. 27.
tenderest accounts of wedded love we have ever come across in literature” (Preface to Six Chapters 22).

In My Country and My People, he argues that “in every nation, the happiness of women does not depend on how many social advantages they enjoy, but on the quality of the men they live with […]” (My Country 147). This point is illustrated in Shen Fu’s love and support for Yun. As a housewife of her time, Yun is expected to stay primarily indoors. However, she loves freedom and travel. With the help of her husband, Yun finds ways to escape her confinement and to enjoy life with him beyond her four walls. When there is an exhibition of “Illuminated Flowers” in their neighbourhood temple. Yun longs to see it, but is not permitted. Such public activities are for men only. Yet, she enjoys an evening with Shen Fu in the festival temple by following his suggestion of putting on make-up and dressing as a man (Six Chapters 58-62). On another occasion, she sneaks out of her home under the excuse of visiting her mother, and joins Shen Fu on a trip to the great Taihu Lake. When the view opens up, and Yun sees “the water was a white stretch, joining the sky at the horizon,” she exclaims, “So this is Taihu! I know now how big the universe is, and I have not lived in vain! I think a good many ladies never see such a view in their whole lifetime” (Six Chapters 62). Lin may well have realized that Western readers would be shocked by Yun’s limited mobility, yet he might have recognized that they would approve of her breaking out of her restrictions.

C. Speaking to Lin’s own Aesthetic Ideals “Xingling” and “Xianshi”; Promoting the Art of Living in the West

As discussed in Chapter Two, Lin had a strong interest in “xingling” and “xianshi” literature and promoted it enthusiastically in the 1930s. It was during this period that Lin translated Six Chapters of a Floating Life. Undoubtedly, in Lin’s eyes, this memoir illustrates what “xingling” and “xianshi” literature should be like.

Under Shen Fu’s close observation, Yun’s artistic temperament, her taste in knowledge, her intense love for this life, and her wisdom in creating and enjoying leisure are intimately and vividly described; her contentment with her simple and even poor life, and her sense of detachment toward the “drama” of this world, are also efficiently

189Glass lanterns are hung with flower-vases and illuminated with candlelight. See Shen, Six Chapters, 57.
demonstrated. *Six Chapters of a Floating Life* thus becomes an ideal companion book to Lin’s *The Importance of Living* (as well as *My Country and My People*), helping Lin to illustrate his own aesthetic ideals and the art of Chinese living to the world.

1. Spirit of “Xingling” Illustrated in Yun’s Personality and in her Artistic Practice

Yun, like most women of her time, tries to fulfill her roles by following traditional Confucian teachings for women. However, no matter how much effort she puts into performing her duties, how many rites and rules she follows, her strong personality is never diminished. She laughs freely, stays close to her husband in their living quarters, and is not afraid of telling him her true likes and dislikes. She is one who would “take off her hairpin and sell it for wine without a second’s thought, for she would not let a beautiful day pass without company” (*Six Chapters* 109). She impresses Shen Fu particularly with her natural way of thinking, her disposition, and her intense love for life.

Yun loves poetry, and she believes that writing short lyrics is especially suited to her mind. Once Shen Fu asks for her opinion on the two master poets of Tang dynasty, Li Bai (representing Romanticism) and Du Fu (representing Realism); her answer is forceful and well articulated:

> Tu [Du]’s poems [...] are known for their workmanship and artistic refinement, while Li’s poems are known for their freedom and naturalness of expression. I prefer the vivacity of Li Po [Li Bai] to the severity of Tu Fu [Du Fu] [...] as for perfection of form and maturity of thought, Tu is the undisputed master, but Li Po’s poems have the wayward charm of a nymph. His lines come naturally like dropping petals and flowing waters, and are so much lovelier for their spontaneity. I am not saying that Tu is second to Li; only personally I feel, not that I love Tu less, but that I love Li more. (*Six Chapters* 21)

Yun’s comments and preference for Li Bai’s naturalness and freedom mirrors her own personality, and her passion for nature and beauty. This illustrates Lin’s view of “xingling”: turn loose your feelings and follow your own personality (*ren qing shuai xing* 任情率性).

In the chapter “Artistic Life,” of *My Country and My People*, Lin writes about the significance of the artists’ “playing mood,” in Chinese calligraphy and painting. He points out that “in China, painting is essentially the pastime of a scholar and not of a

---

190 Shen Fu describes Yun as a new bride as pleasant, quiet and diligent. See Shen, *Six Chapters*, 15.
professional artist” (My Country 369). He believes that the highest quality of Chinese painting, calligraphy, and poetry, identified by “figurativeness” (a light-hearted and carefree style with the spirit of romanticism and recluse), comes from this playful spirit (My Country 303-04). In the section “Art as Play and Personality” in The Importance of Living, Lin develops his thoughts further, and claiming that “art as recreation or as a sheer play of the human spirit is more important” than art merely as creation, and thought that “the spirit of true art can become more general and permeate society only when a lot of people are enjoying art as a pastime, without any hope of achieving immortality. [...] I am for amateurism in all fields. [...]” (My Country 368).

In this sense, Lin recognizes Yun as a true master of the art of living. While Chinese male artists in traditional China had the potential to become professionals in their fields, Chinese women with artistic talents remained purely amateur. The spontaneous nature of Yun’s creativity in her daily life represents the best spirit of this amateurism.

Yun has a true artist’s temperament and sensibility; she could discover beauty among seemingly common things, create beauty in her daily life, and know how to enjoy life as well. When she and Shen Fu visit their ancestral tombs, Yun sees that the pebbles there have beautiful, multi-colored grains. She collects some and makes them into a grotto for miniature plants. Shen Fu is thrilled, claiming that it is even more artistic than the famous one made of Xuanzhou stone (Six Chapters 39). Since Shen Fu loves flower arrangement, Yun also develops a deep interest in it. She invents a method for arranging flowers called ‘insects on grass blades,’ arranging insects on plants in a way that many artists hadn’t yet done (Six Chapters 105). Yun is able to make the smell of burning incense gentler, so as to create a more cultivated and leisurely atmosphere in a quiet room (Six Chapters 103). Yun also can make tea have a more delicate flavour:

When the lotus flowers bloom in summer, they close at night and open in the morning. Yun used to put some tea leaves in a little silk bag and place it in the centre of the flower at night. We would take it out the next morning, and make tea with spring water, which would then have a very delicate flavor. (Six Chapters 122)

Yun and Shen Fu love to design miniature landscapes.

[Once we] took a rectangular Yi-hsing [Yixing] earthen basin, on which we piled
up a mountain peak on the left coming down in undulations to the right. On its
back, we made rugged square lines in the style of rock paintings of Ni Yunlin, so that the whole looked like a rocky precipice overhanging a river. At one corner
we made a hollow place, which we filled with mud and planted with multi-leaf
white duckweed, while the rocks were planted with dodder. This took us quite a
few days to finish. In late autumn, the dodder grew all over the hill, like wisterias
hanging down from a rock. The red dodder flowers made a striking contrast to the
white duckweed, which had grown luxuriantly, too, from the pond underneath.
Looking at it, one could imagine oneself transported to some fairy region. We put
this under the eaves, and discussed between ourselves where we should build a
covered terrace by the water, where we should put a garden arbour, and where we
should put a stone inscription: “Where petals drop and waters flow.” And Yun
further discussed with me where we could build our home, where we could fish,
and where we could go up for a better view of the distance, all so absorbed in it as
if we were moving to live in that little imaginary universe. (Six Chapters 101)

Yun and Shen Fu make their domestic space a work of art, and are playful in their artistic
creations. The design of this miniature mountain reflects their artistic sensibilities, and
their deep understanding of the essence of Chinese landscape painting. In this way, Yun
and Shen Fu transport themselves into the realm of fairylands in the midst of their
poverty and misery.

2. Enjoying Leisure: Daoist Temperament and Good Taste

Lin emphasizes the importance of leisure in his overall lyric philosophy. In the
section “Chinese Theory of Leisure,” in The Importance of Living, he claims that culture,
“is essentially a product of leisure. [...] From the Chinese point of view, the man who is
wisely idle is the most cultured man” (Living 149). He further explains that the Chinese
love leisure so intensely because of the “Taoistic [Daoist] blood in the Chinese
temperament” (Living 150-51). This is illustrated by Yun’s temperament.

In order to avoid summer heat in the city, Yun and Shen Fu rent a peasant cottage,
and spend a pleasant summer there. The little cottage is surrounded on all sides by
vegetable fields and a wilderness of flowers and trees (Living 51). Yun is so enchanted
with this place that she tells Shen Fu:

Some day we must build a cottage here. We’ll buy ten mow of ground around the
cottage, and see to our servants planting in the fields vegetables and melons to be

---
191 Ni Yunlin, (Ni Zan, 1301-1374) a great Yuan painter. He was famous for his unrestrained, leisurely (逸)
style of painting.
sold for the expenses of our daily meals. You will paint and I will do embroidery, from which we could make enough money to buy wine for entertaining our friends who will gather here together to compose poems. Thus, clad in simple gowns and eating simple meals, we could live a very happy life together without going anywhere. (Six Chapters 57)

This detached attitude gives her a tolerant and optimistic view, and allows her to nurture a romantic, light-hearted and carefree spirit, similar to that of a Daoist recluse.¹⁹²

Lin sees the significant role that ‘taste’ plays in the enjoyment of leisure. He is enormously interested in the notion of “taste” (趣味 qu) proposed by Yuan Zhonglang, as one of the three critical concepts for “xingling” literature. Lin interprets this notion in “Good Taste is Knowledge” in The Importance of Living. “The cultured man or the ideal educated man is not necessarily one who is well-read or learned, but one who likes and dislikes the right things. To know what to love and what to hate is to have taste in knowledge” (Living 364).

Lin emphasizes that “to have taste [...] requires a capacity for thinking things through to the bottom, an independence of judgment”, and thus “is closely associated with courage” (Living 365). He also agrees with Yuan Zhonglang that “taste is more of a natural given than an acquired learning.” Yun’s personal taste, as described in Six Chapters of a Floating Life, provides a comprehensive interpretation of this notion to Western readers, and illustrates how ‘taste’ relates to the enjoyment of leisure. Yun is mainly self-educated, yet she is discerning in art and in literature. She can differentiate between floral fragrances and give them different ranks,

The citron is the gentleman among the different fragrant plants because its fragrance is so slight that you can hardly detect it; on the other hand, the jasmine is a common fellow because it borrows its fragrance partly from others. Therefore, the fragrance of the jasmine is like that of a smiling sycophant. (Six Chapters 31)

In a similar way, Yun is able to describe the different poetic styles of Li Bai and Du Fu, and to assert her preference for Li Bai without any hesitation.

In The Importance of Living, Lin humorously points out, the American is known as a great hustler, as the Chinese is known as a great loafer. And as all opposites admire each other, I suspect that the American hustler

¹⁹² Lin discussed this spirit in the section of “Chinese Artistic Life” in Lin, My Country. 303.
admires the Chinese loafer as much as the Chinese loafer admires the American hustler. Such things are called the charms of national traits. (Living 147)

Lin hopes that “the ancient Chinese philosophy of life and the modern technological civilization,” could be integrated “into a sort of working way of life” (Living 148). Yun’s character helps Lin illuminate the spirit of Chinese art to the West.

D. A Choice Reflecting Lin’s Romanticism

As Shen Fu’s beloved wife, Yun is idealized and romanticized in his memoir. She is further idealized and romanticized in Lin’s interpretation. In his view,

She is just one of those charming women one sometimes sees in the homes of one’s friends, so happy with their husbands that one cannot fall in love with them. One is glad merely to know that such a woman exists in the world and to know her as a friend’s wife, to be accepted in her household, to be able to come uninvited to her home for lunch, or to have her put a blanket around one’s legs when one falls asleep while she is discussing painting and literature and cucumbers in her womanish manner with her husband. (Preface to Six Chapters 20)

This admiration blinds Lin to Shen Fu’s manipulations in creating the image of Yun, and prevents Lin from achieving a deeper psychological understanding of Yun. For instance, Lin believes that Yun’s effort to get a singsong girl as a concubine for Shen Fu is purely motivated by her passion for beauty,

Was it wrong for a woman […] to take a passionate interest in a beautiful singsong girl? If so, she could not have been conscious of it. She merely yearned to see and know the beautiful things in life, beautiful things which lay not within the reach of moral women in ancient China to see. (Preface to Six Chapters 21)

Lin believes that “She loved beauty too much to know that loving beauty was wrong,” and therefore Yun falls seriously ill when the girl is snatched away by a more powerful man (Preface to Six Chapters 21). In my view, Yun’s decision to find a concubine for her husband, is not simply due to her love of beautiful things and of people in general, nor due to a tendency towards lesbianism. When Yun begins searching for a concubine, they have two children and are in their mid 30’s. Shen Fu’s narrative suggests that he has an affair with a boat girl, as well as a sexual relationship lasting for several months with a singsong girl when he was in Guandong for business. His friends visit singsong girls often; Shen Fu’s cousin Xu Xiufeng returns with a concubine from Guangdong. It was a
mark of social status at that time for *literati* or businessmen to have singsong girls as concubines. Additionally, Shen may have sexual desires which Yun is unable or unwilling to satisfy. Under such circumstances, perhaps the best Yun can do is to find a concubine that she can tolerate and manage. However, Lin ignores Yun's practical considerations and her potential personal suffering in this circumstance. Eventually, this issue causes Yun deep misery, and may have led to her death at a relatively young age.

Stephen Owen reminds us that "Writing is the translation of memory into art," it gives memory distance, makes it beautiful ("Door" 114). "Shen Fu tells the story of his and Yun's life as it should have been, but he tells it as if that were how their life really was. It is memoir, a work of art that tries its traces as a work of art" ("Repetition" 103). Shen Fu intends readers to have an idealized version of Yun. The events and dialogues presenting Yun as a romantic lover and an artist's spirit are written passionately and carefully. Difficult events in Yun's life, such as her illnesses and poverty, are covered in a few sentences. Yun's life as a mother of two children is quickly glossed over. Thus, Yun appears to be more a romantic lover and an intelligent artist than a diligent and suffering mother. Lin does not recognize this and prefers to indulge his romantic passion in the idiosyncratic truth Shen Fu presents. Lin's choice to translate *Six Chapters of a Floating Life* reflects his romanticized view of Chinese women's life.

II. How Lin Yutang Translated *Fu sheng liu ji* with Reference to Shirley Black’s and Pratt and Chiang’s Translated Versions

The above interpretation reveals the personal and cultural reasons behind Lin's choice of *Fu sheng liu ji* for translation and how this work fits into Lin's overall discourse on Chinese women and Chinese culture. Lin revised the translation more than ten times before it was published in 1935, claiming that this book made him realize how challenging a translation could be. This section will address why the text is so challenging and the strategies used in the three versions to handle these challenges.
It is natural that after a literary work reaches its fame, more than one translation would appear, and each translated version of the same work represents a distinct reading, interpretation and critique of the original, as each translator has his or her own perspective and strategies. Two more English versions of this memoir appeared after Lin's, translated respectively by Shirley Black as *Chapters from a Floating Life* in 1960 and Pratt and Chiang as *Six Records of a Floating Life* in 1983. In this part, I will first study the three prefaces or introductions in each version, investigating their different perspectives in approaching the original. I will then present my interpretation of the characteristics of the book, its challenging elements, and make a judgment as to the success or failure of these three translators' work. I further present a comparative analysis of the craft and strategies of the three translators and examine the role their personal literary and artistic talents plays in the process of reconstructing the original in English. The juxtaposition of these three translated versions of Shen Fu's memoir and the comparative analysis will reveal the differences in the aesthetic and cultural essence they brought to readers, and lead us to a more comprehensive understanding of what constitutes a successful translation.

A. Perspectives on Translation Reflected in the Prefaces or Introductions

An author's preface or introduction usually highlights the key points of the book and summarizes its basic spirit. Similarly, a translator's preface or introduction mirrors the translator's general attitude towards the original text and the translator's basic principles for translation. It is therefore indispensable to read the prefaces of these three translators carefully, in order to learn their motives and purposes in translation, their distinct perspectives in approaching the text, and the reasons behind their strategic choices.

Shirley Black does not mention in her preface whether she was aware of the existence of Lin Yutang's translation at the time she started hers in 1959. A comparison

---

of Lin’s and Black’s versions, however, leads me to believe that Black was not exposed to Lin’s version. There are no traces of his influence, and some noticeable mistakes in her version could have been avoided had she read Lin’s. Pratt and Chiang’s version appeared in 1983. In their introduction they acknowledge Lin’s 1935 version and express their “greatest respect” for their predecessor, but do not mention Black’s version (Introduction to Six Records 14). It is thus interesting to examine how these three translators from different eras approach the same text.

1. Lin’s Preface—An Aesthetic Approach with High Attention to Yun

Lin’s preface is written in the style of a personal essay, which is consistent with “xingling.” He expresses his strong personal fondness for Yun, and explains why he admires her so highly. Lin believes that Yun has “the qualities of a cultivated and gentle wife combined to a greater degree of perfection than falls within our common experience” (Preface to Six Chapters 20). Lin also points out the “conflict between her artistic temperament and the world of reality,” and sees Yun and Shen Fu’s lives as the embodiment of a Chinese way of life (Preface to Six Chapters 20-21). In Lin’s view, Fu sheng liu ji is “one of the tenderest accounts of wedded love we have ever come across in literature,” and believes that Shen Fu and Yun share the same spirit, “the spirit of truth and beauty, and the genius for resignation and contentment so characteristic of Chinese culture” (Preface to Six Chapters 22).

He describes the philosophical and aesthetic transcendence he experienced while “reading and rereading and going over this little booklet,”

[...] My thoughts are led to the question of happiness. For those who do not know it, happiness is a mystery. The reading of Shen Fu’s story gives one this sense of the mystery of happiness, which transcends all bodily sorrows and actual hardships—similar, I think, to the happiness of an innocent man condemned to a life-long sentence with the consciousness of having done no wrong, the same happiness that is so subtly depicted for us in Tolstoy’s “Resurrection,” in which the spirit conquers the body. For this reason, I think the life of this couple is one of the saddest and yet at the same time ‘gayest’ lives, the type of gaiety that bears sorrow so well. (Preface to Six Chapters 22)

This preface appears in Tien Hsia Monthly in 1935, in the original bilingual version of the book published by Shanghai Bookstore in 1935, as well as in Lin’s The Wisdom of China and India published by John Day Company in 1942.
As to Shen Fu’s writing style, Lin writes, “In form, it is unique, an autobiographical story mixed with observations and comments on the art of living, the little pleasures of life, some vivid sketches of scenery and literary and art criticism” (Preface to Six Chapters 23). He regrets that the last two chapters are missing and expresses the hope that they might turn up. Lin does not address any problems or difficulties in translating this memoir in the preface, but in his single paragraph postscript, he claims, “This book let me realize how challenging a translation could be!”

In translating the title of Shen Fu’s memoir, Lin Yutang uses “chapter” to translate the word “ji” (ji), which in a literal translation, means “record.” “Chapter” sounds less like a factual accounting than a poetic recollection of a life. For Lin, “chapters,” means the chapters of a book, as well as the chapters in music: life is a book, life is a melody.

2. Black’s Preface--A Decision to Abridge the Original

Shirley Black also recognizes Shen Fu’s autobiography as “one of the tenderest and happiest of all love stories” (Introduction to Chapters xi), and “a literary masterpiece; poetic, romantic, nostalgic and filled with emotion, it recreates a life essentially tragic, which yet held innumerable moments of an almost magical happiness and beauty” (Introduction to Chapters xi). She briefly discusses the conflict between Yun and Shen Fu’s pursuit for individual freedom and the conservative forces of their social environment, and pays special attention to Shen Fu’s experience of being constantly uprooted. She calls Shen Fu an artist and Yun a poet, and titles her version Chapters from a Floating Life--The Autobiography of A Chinese Artist. Though she appreciates the poetic beauty of this book, she feels it was extremely difficult to reconstruct in English:

[...] I have tried first of all to recreate the subtle emotional atmosphere, at once tragic, passionate and gay, which is, in my opinion, the outstanding characteristic of Shen Fu’s original. I have also tried to be as meticulous as I could in expressing the exact meaning of the Chinese words, at the same time trying to approximate the feeling of the author’s own way of expressing himself. This is a rather difficult job with languages as different from one another as Chinese and English and I do not know that I have even partially succeeded. (Introduction to Chapters xiii)
Unlike Lin’s decision to make a full-text translation of Fu sheng liu ji, Black chooses to abridge the original, and to rearrange the chapters and their contents. The original four chapters become three large parts and twelve small chapters, with all titles of the original chapters erased:

I have omitted many episodes from the fourth part [the chapter on Shen Fu’s Travel], concerned with visits to temples and scenic places, which are rather alike and would not mean much to the reader unacquainted with the actual places described. Some sections of literary criticism, gardening and botany I have also left out, as I felt they were of too specialized a nature to be of general interest. Other episodes I have rearranged into a less confusing chronological order. (Introduction to Chapters xiii)

Black acknowledges Fu sheng liu ji as a masterpiece of Chinese literature, yet she believes the chronological order of the original is somehow confusing. She worries that modern Western readers will have difficulty with its strange order. She also finds the sections on literary criticism, gardening, and botany “of too specialized a nature to be of general interest,” perhaps because these are not “stories” in the conventional sense, and would not normally appear in an autobiography in the West. She omits many episodes of Chapter Four--“The Joy of Travel,” because in her eyes, there are no significant differences between the temples and scenic places Shen Fu visits, nor are these remote and unfamiliar places of interest to Western readers. She highlights that this is an autobiography of a Chinese artist, and adds some illustrations (not in Shen Fu’s original) to the text, which are “reproductions of painting by some of the best of the individualist painters of the Qing dynasty--paintings which Shen Fu, Yun and their friends might have chosen, and in styles in which they might well have painted” (Introduction to Chapters xiv).

It seems that Shirley Black has enormous consideration for general Western readers, and tries to provide a version which appropriately represents the original and also meets the interests and tastes of these readers. The book was published by Oxford University Press in London in 1960, and can be found today in most large university libraries, categorized under Chinese Art.
3. Pratt and Chiang’s Introduction--A Socio-Historical Perspective on the Text

Leonard Pratt and Su-hui Chiang give a full-text translation as Lin Yutang does, but they share Shirley Black’s concern about the technical qualities of the narrative. They believe that Shen Fu’s education is limited, and he is an unskilled writer: “[...] There are references in the book that are not clear, some that make little sense. Sometimes his facts are not consistent.” In addition,

There are also great differences between our modern ideas and Shen Fu’s of just what a book ought to be. The Six Records is not the chronologically constructed tale that we are now used to reading. Instead, Shen Fu takes particular topics and follows a theme each through his life, one at a time [...]. Where we expect transitions, Shen Fu gives us few, and where we expect logical explanations he often gives us none. Sentences frequently stand almost by themselves [...]. (Introduction to Six Records 14)

These comments indicate their low estimation of the aesthetic value of the original work. A careful reading of their preface in comparison to Lin’s leads me to conclude that they approach the text from a more socio-historical perspective, which is very different from Lin’s aesthetic perspective. They value the social and historical significance of the book. In addition, they have their own understanding of what constitutes a faithful translation.

Much longer than the prefaces provided by either Lin or Black, Pratt and Chiang’s introduction is almost a research paper on the social and historical value of Fu sheng liu ji. Unlike Lin, who begins his preface with an emotional exclamation on Yun’s loveliness, Pratt and Chiang start their introduction with Shen Fu’s background. While Lin draws our attention to Yun’s vagabond soul in searching for freedom and beauty, Pratt and Chiang focus mainly on the social and historical basis for Shen Fu’s failures. They make a detailed and intriguing investigation of the general role and unfortunate fate of a yamen clerk (private secretary), the only official job Shen Fu ever performs (Introduction to Six Records 11-13). They highlight the difference between a modern “love story” and a “love story set in a traditional Chinese society,” which occurs within an arranged marriage and “coexists and intermingles with Shen Fu’s affairs with courtesans, and with his wife’s attempts to find him a concubine.” They point out, “The role of the courtesan as described in the Six Records is an example of what makes the book a valuable social document” (Introduction to Six Records 9).
In comparison to Lin’s emotional and passionate expression of his personal feelings about the book, Pratt and Chiang are more rational and objective. In their view, one of the more important aspects of this book is the “remarkable frankness” of Shen Fu, who “has described his life with his wife in what is probably the most frank and moving story to come to us from the literature of his time” (Introduction to Six Records 10). They appreciate Shen Fu’s simple style in explaining “how people living in China then actually spent their time,” and are impressed by the faithful picture of Yun which Shen Fu portrays, and consider it “one of the most realistic accounts of the life of a woman ever given in traditional Chinese literature,” which echoes Lin’s sentiments (Introduction to Six Records 10).

Though Pratt and Chiang acknowledge Lin’s pioneering effort, they believed “there was room to make a full translation,” by using “extensive but [...] not intrusive notes and maps.” In their opinion,

[Shen Fu] wrote for an audience of his own time and place, and neither of those will ever live again. We hope that our contribution to this work may help it to live in the minds of today’s Western readers, as its author intended it should live in the minds of his contemporaries. We have tried to provide a complete translation that is, in the words of Anthony C. Yu,195 ‘the most intelligible fidelity to the original.’ (Introduction to Six Records 14-15)

For this purpose, they translate three pages of the “Chronology of Shen Fu and Yun,” which had been worked out by Yu Pingbo at the time Yu published Fu sheng liu ji (this chronology is not included in Lin’s version). In addition, they provide a table of “Weights and Measures,” four maps of where Shen Fu and Yun live and travel, and present more than one hundred extensive footnotes. (Lin makes only twenty-four notes, and Black makes none, as she integrates her notes into the text.) They hoped that these would enable them to revive an ancient book and make it “live in the minds of today’s Western readers.” The title given by Pratt and Chiang is “Six Records of a Floating Life,” to emphasize the meaning of “factual record” of the word “ji” (ji), in a sense more close to the “ji” in Shiji (Records of the Grand Historian). It has become the most popular translation of Fu sheng liu ji since it was published in 1983. It is widely used as a

195 Anthony C. Yu is a renowned scholar and translator of classical Chinese literature. He is currently a professor at the University of Chicago.
supplementary textbook for introductory courses in Chinese history and culture at American and Canadian universities.

Is Pratt and Chiang's version really more faithful and complete than Lin Yutang’s, and is the social-historical value more significant to this text than its aesthetic value? Is the chronological order of the original really so awkward or so unique? Is Shen Fu’s writing skill inexplicit or wonderfully suggestive? Would Black’s choice of abridging and editing the original be more beneficial for the Western readers? A brief examination of the original text will provide us with insights into the nature of Shen Fu’s memoir, its complex elements for translation, and the degrees of understanding achieved by the three translations. It will also help us to establish some criteria for judging the comments the translators make on the original and their translation choices, as well as to evaluate the overall effectiveness of their strategies and craft.

B. A Brief Analysis of Characteristics of Fu sheng liu ji

At the beginning of the Fu sheng liu ji, Shen Fu writes, “[...] My only regret is that I was not properly educated in childhood; all I know is a simple language and I shall try only to record the real facts and real sentiments” (Six Chapters 3).196 These words are taken by Pratt, Chiang and Black as Shen Fu’s honest admission of his limited education and writing skills. In my view, Shen Fu is merely being humble, a common gesture among Chinese scholars and a strategic expression often appearing at the beginning of their books. In fact, Shen Fu’s writing is unconventional and original, and he has exceptional literary and artistic talent.

Shen Fu is not one of the literati, as Yu Pingbo reminds us in his preface to the reprint version of Fu sheng liu ji, “he wrote not for fame or wealth, but purely for expressing himself at the moment he was interested to do so.” We should also keep in mind that Shen is not a professional, but an amateur, painter--the true Chinese artist Lin Yutang defines.197

196 I use Lin Yutang’s translation in my general discussion.
197 Lin emphasizes, “in China painting is essentially the pastime of a scholar and not of a professional artist,” so the artists’ amateurism--the “playing mood” plays an important role in the quality of Chinese calligraphy and painting. Lin, Living. 369.
The Chinese artist is a man who is at peace with nature, who is free from the shackles of society and from the temptations of gold, and whose spirit is deeply immersed in mountains and rivers and other manifestations of nature (My Country 228).

It was just such an artist who writes this memoir. In my view, Fu sheng liu ji is unique in many ways. Its uniqueness lies not only on its aesthetic spirit, but also in its innovative narrative style and its elegant language.

The first way in which Fu sheng liu ji is unique is in its narrative plan, because it does not follow the chronological order that most autobiographies conventionally follow. It follows the flow of human passion and memory. In this way, Shen Fu breaks the conventional concept of time. The book is born out of Shen Fu’s passionate love of Yun, a woman that he could not forget. He begins his life story by following his passionate love, and lets it support the book. Each chapter develops different emotions, and a variety of fine sensibilities. As Yue Daiyun points out,

Shen Sanbo [Shen Fu] subjectively divides his life into four stages: ‘bliss, pleasure, sorrow, joy.’ Each chapter is presented in narrative fashion following a chronological sequence of events. The author’s genuine emotions are the sole criterion for judging how much emphasis or detail will be granted his material. (52)

These four stages follow a structural formula of a narrative: starting, continuing, turning, and concluding (起, 承, 转, 合), which reminds readers of poetic and musical patterns.

The second way Shen Fu’s memoir is unique is that it resembles Chinese art. Each word and detail is filtered through a well-trained painter’s senses; every bend and joint is composed like a Chinese painting.

Shen’s writing style is linked to his talents as a painter and calligrapher. Shen took great interest in Ni Yunlin, the master painter of the Yuan dynasty. Ni Yunlin’s concise, and leisurely painting style is apparent in Shen Fu’s writing. Shen uses the most selective and economic ‘strokes’ to paint his and Yun’s story in brief chapters, and to make every stroke swift, powerful and rhythmic. When Fu sheng liu ji was reprinted in 1924, Yu Pingbo was impressed with its conciseness, spontaneity, and vitality. He comments that “there is no single word in the whole book which is uncomfortable,  

198 起 qi, 承 cheng, 转 zhuàn, 合 he, is the traditional vision of any structural sequence in China. It can be applied to the structure of Western stories too.
unnecessary, and hypocrisy," and believes that Shen’s words flow in a way similar to that of the “floating clouds and running waters, birds chirping in Spring and insects singing in Autumn”. The proper and artistic use of blank space in Ni Yunlin’s painting and the control of the rhythm of his brush leave clear traces in Shen Fu’s composition. Once “he has expressed the essential conception in his mind,” “the words end, but the flavor remains.” This vitality, coupled with an economy of design, is called “kongling” (空灵) - ‘empty-and-alive’ (My Country 305). It was in this “kongling,” Shen Fu let readers experience a poetic, dreamlike atmosphere, and to feel “qiyun” (气韵) - rhythmic vitality.

Qiyun has been the central principle and highest ideal of Chinese painting, poetry and other art forms since Xie He, the 5th century art historian and critic, first enunciated this theory of painting. Artists and art critics in later centuries have elaborated and developed this theory and applied it to all art forms. In Lin’s view, the evocation of the mood is essential for any great painting:

No amount of technical skill or cleverness of intellectual conception can give us great art, if it fails to achieve an atmosphere and evoke in us a sympathetic state of emotion. We see this in all great paintings, whether Chinese or European. The mood is therefore everything. (My Country 308)

The distinctive poetic mood of Shen Fu’s memoir, described by Shirley Black as a “subtle emotional atmosphere, at once tragic, passionate and gay,” is the outstanding characteristic of Shen Fu’s original, and the vital attraction of this memoir.

Third, this memoir contains a painter’s aesthetic notes on life and nature. In order to convey “the spirit of the scenery and evoke a sympathetic mood in response,” Chinese artists pay regular visits to mountains and rivers to refresh their spirits by communing with nature. “Calm and harmony distinguish Chinese art, and calm and harmony come from the soul of the Chinese artist” (My Country 28). Fu sheng liu ji includes many detailed records of Shen Fu’s experiences and thoughts as a traveler because he intends to “convey to us the benefit of that communion of nature, and communicate to us some of the spirit of the things as it is instilled into his soul” (My Country 310). Similar thoughts

---


200 Xie He is most famous for his “Six points to consider when judging a painting” (绘画六法). His representative work is The Record of the Classification of Old Painters (古画品录).
are also reflected in his observations and comments on the art of living and his critique of literature and art. It is in these comments and critiques that we gain insight into a Chinese artist’s philosophy and aesthetics and recognize how powerful nature can be in purifying hearts and elevating the spirits.

The final way the memoir is unique is in the subtle atmosphere Shen Fu develops with his language. Shen’s artistic temperament and talents penetrate every level of this memoir. He writes naturally in four-character phrases. Four-character phrases possess distinct sound rhythms, structural and semantic antitheses, and have the power of both terseness and inclusiveness in expression; it represents one of most important linguistic achievements of Chinese writing. For the most of this book, whether in description, narration, or dialogue, Shen Fu writes in four-character phrases. For instance:

Original Chinese:

若大园亭楼阁，套室回廊，叠石成山，栽花取势，又在大中见小，小中见大，虚中有实，实中有虚，或藏或露，或浅或深。不仅在“周回曲折”四字，又不在地广石多徒烦工费。 (Fu Sheng 30)

Lin Yutang’s Translation:

As to the planning of garden pavilions, towers, winding corridors and cut-houses, the designing of rockery and the training of flower-trees, one should try to show the small in the big, and the big in the small, and provide for the real in the unreal and for the unreal in the real. One reveals and conceals alternately, making it sometimes apparent and sometimes hidden. This is not just rhythmic irregularity, nor does it depend on having a wide space and great expenditure of labour and material. (Six Chapters 97)

With the exception of a few prepositions (在) and conjunctive words (若夫，又) to assist the narration, the whole paragraph is written in four-character phrases. A careful reading reveals that in most of these phrases or between these phrases there is an antithetical or parallel structure, like the couplets in Chinese regulated verses. For instance, 园亭 (garden pavilions) is paired with 楼阁 (towers), 套室 (winding corridors) is paired with 回廊 (cut-houses). In addition, 叠石成山 (the designing of rockery) is in contrast to 栽花取势 (the training of flower-trees), 大中见小 (show the small in the big) is in contrast to 小中见大 (the big in the small), so is 虚中有实 (the real in the unreal) to 实中有虚 (the unreal in the real), and 或藏或露 (reveals and conceals alternately) to
or shallow (sometimes apparent and sometimes hidden); the pair of 大中见小 (show the small in the big) is in contrast to 小中见大 (the big in the small), and is used to form another antithesis with 虚中有实 (the real in the unreal) to 实中有虚 (the unreal in the real).

This paragraph creates a distinct rhythm in the level, rising, falling and entering tones within the four-character phrase, and moves in rhythmic waves between phrases. It forms a beautiful, antithetical structure. In content, it expresses one of the most important Chinese aesthetics, antithesis, which also illustrates the structural rules of building four-character-phrases. "There is a natural tendency in Chinese towards antithesis," as James Liu, in his book, The Art of Chinese Poetry, points out, to "reveal a dualistic and relativistic way of thinking. [...] Moreover, monosyllabic words and disyllabic compounds, which constitute the bulk of the language, lend themselves easily to antithesis" (146). By using these phrases in such a masterful and natural way, Shen Fu's writing skill is beyond question. Revealing these characteristics of Shen Fu's language becomes critical for translators.

The above explanation of the characteristics of Fu sheng liu ji demonstrates that this memoir bears not only the essence of Chinese aesthetics, but also qualifies it as an important memoir. It challenges the reader's concepts of autobiography, concepts of time and space, attitudes towards texts from other cultures, and the reader's understanding of art, memory, life, history, passion, and more. It also challenges the translator's bilingual abilities in dealing with the language. Failure of the translators to identify these qualities and to develop appropriate strategies can cause problems in their translation practice.

C. A Judgment on the Translators' Critiques and their Decisions

1. Examining Shirley Black's Strategic Decisions of Abridgement and Reorganization

It is relevant for us to investigate the contents which Shirley Black omits and reorganizes. Cyril Birch comments in his review of Black's translation that most of Black's cutting and reorganization are justifiable (526-27). However, a detailed investigation suggests that Black's abridgement and reorganization causes new problems which she did not foresee.
a. The Parts Shirley Black Omitted and the Consequences

Black titles her translation “Chapters of a Floating Life--an Autobiography of a Chinese Artist.” However, her translated version only partly fulfils this claim. The deletions weaken the reader’s opportunity to understand Shen Fu’s artistic temperament and insights.

The largest deletion Black makes to the original is in the fourth chapter “The Joy of Travel.” She claims these episodes are “rather alike and would not mean much to the reader unacquainted with the actual places described.” She deletes most of the chapter except Shen Fu’s travel to Canton and his romance with the prostitute Xi’er. Based on my discussion of Shen Fu’s aesthetic values, we realize that the deleted parts are integral to Shen Fu’s life as a Chinese artist. While Black’s concern for reader’s unfamiliarity with the places Shen Fu visits is reasonable, in her dramatic abridgment of Shen Fu’s travels, Black actually removes most of Shen Fu’s insights into the relation between humanity and nature, his spiritual and aesthetic notes on the natural environment, and the powerful function it has in purifying the human spirit.

Black also cuts several sections of “Wedded Bliss” and “The Little Pleasures of Life” regarding “literary criticism, gardening and botany,” as she believes “they are of too specialized a nature to be of general interest” (Preface to Chapters xiii). In this way, she omits some of the most important theories of Chinese aesthetics.

In lieu of Shen’s literary criticisms and aesthetic theories, and to create an artistic atmosphere, Black adds poems of Li Bai and Du Fu which she translates, and inserts copies of paintings made by “some of the best of the individualist painters of the Qing dynasty,” which might have resembled Shen Fu’s style. However, these additions tend to paint a portrait of an era instead of an individual.

b. Black’s Reorganization and Related Problems

In addition to the deletions and additions, Shirley Black makes an effort to rearrange Shen Fu’s memoir “into a less confusing chronological order” (Chapters xii). The original titles of the four chapters are eliminated. The contents of these four chapters are then divided into three large sections. Section one describes Shen Fu’s childhood, teenage years and love, his honeymoon, and the early years of marriage. The contents of this section are mostly from the original chapter one, with selective parts from chapters
two and four. Section two consists of some parts from the original chapter two, "The Little Pleasures of Life," concentrating on Shen Fu’s hobbies and daily pleasures in married life. Section three follows the original chapter three: "Sorrow." Black succeeds in establishing a true chronology in her first section, but is unable to do so by her third section, and finally could only claim to have created “a less confusing chronological order.”

More significantly, this reorganization interrupts the natural flow of qiyun (the rhythmic vitality in the original). As my interpretation of the characteristics of Fu sheng liu ji explains, each chapter of this memoir has its distinct themes; the themes develop and turn in rhythmic patterns and form harmoniously a unified melody. Any change may cause disharmony. For instance, in the original chapter one, there is a “melody” which could be called “romance under the moonlight in Canglang Pavillion,” including three scenes from Shen Fu and Yun’s first wedded year. The first scene is in the seventh night of the seventh moon when they worship together the Grandson of Heaven in the hall called “After My Heart.” The second is in the fifteenth night of the seventh moon, on All Souls’ Day, when they drink together with the moon as company. The third is in the fifteenth night of the eighth moon, the Mid-Autumn Festival, when they walk under the moonlight inside the garden of Canglang pavilion (Six Chapters 27-35). These three pieces form an organic and unified whole in relating the romance in different tones and moods. Shirley Black separates these three events by inserting the visit to the Dongting Temple after the first scene (Six Chapters 18-24). The flow of the melody is thus interrupted.

This interruption of qiyun is also reflected in the thematic contradiction the new arrangement causes. The recreated time order costs the translator great effort in twisting the contents into a “conventional time order;” it also causes sudden thematic changes. For instance, in order to place Shen’s childhood at the beginning of the memoir, Black moves the first part of the second chapter about Shen Fu’s childhood to right after the beginning of the chapter one “The Wedded Bliss” (Chapters 1). This results in Shen Fu’s claim that “the first of the three hundred poems in the Classic of Poetry is a wedding song and I too shall begin with memories of my married life, letting other events follow as they may,” being immediately followed by “I remember that when I was a small boy I could stare
into the sun with wide-open eyes” (Chapters 1). This is followed by two pages describing Shen Fu’s childhood. Only after this does the narration return to the topic of marriage, telling how Yun becomes engaged to Shen Fu in their adolescence (Chapters 1-4). This rearrangement mixes the theme of childhood pleasures with the theme of wedded bliss, and makes the first two pages of Shen Fu’s story contradictory.

Adaptation and rewriting are important cross-cultural strategies in translating a literary text from a foreign culture. However, a successful adaptation or rewriting must be based on the translator’s thorough understanding of both cultures. Qiyun is the central principle and highest ideal of Chinese aesthetics; preserving or reconstructing qiyun should be the highest principle for translators. Black does not understand the importance of qiyun to Chinese literature and thus an authentic experience of Chinese literature is partially lost to her readers.

c. Reasons Behind Shirley Black’s Problems

Shirley Black has several blind spots as a translator. First, she holds a conventional view of what a memoir should be, and thus overly weights the importance of chronological order. Second, Black can not avoid certain prejudices while translating a text from the Far East and from another century. She uses Western standards to evaluate the aesthetic value of a Chinese text. Subjects which hold Shen Fu’s aesthetic insights are, in her eyes, either not specific, “much the same,” or “not to readers’ interest.” Her attention is paid mainly to narrative events. It is notable that she does not delete stories about courtesans, as these seem quite exotic to her Western eyes. Translators are the “door-keepers” for the introduction of foreign cultures. Black’s failure to recognize and absorb the newness in Shen Fu’s text prevents her from bringing the Chinese aesthetic essence into English. Third, Black’s lack of confidence in the original author is connected to her lack of confidence in her readers. She worries too much about the readers’ ability to grasp the true meaning of the original, and therefore oversimplifies the text, which makes her translation not authentic to the intention of the author. Readers are somewhat misled, and to a certain degree, get the sense of what is “chewed” by the translator, but not the real taste of the original.

These blind spots hinder Shirley Black from achieving an effective translation, and keep her version on a pedestrian level even before her translation is discussed at the
language level. These blind spots also affect her ability to capture accurately the nuance and tone of the author and the meaning of the original words, which is discussed later.

2. Judging Pratt and Chiang’s Social and Historical Approach in Translating a Text which has a Strong Aesthetic Nature

By choosing to make a full-text translation, Pratt and Chiang avoid some of the problems Shirley Black creates, and present English readers a seemingly complete original. In comparison with Lin Yutang’s 1935 translation, theirs appears to be academically a better-wrapped and updated package. However, these potential advantages do not guarantee that this version is better than Lin’s version. As translators, they have their own series of blind spots. They share Black’s conventional view of the necessity for chronological order in an autobiography, and also rank Shen Fu’s literary talent as extremely low. They assert that some of the references in the book are confusing, and that Shen Fu’s facts are not always consistent (Introduction to Six Records 14). Therefore they misunderstand much of the aesthetic expression of the book, and do not seem to care about the effect of Qiyun in the memoir. “Where we expect transitions, Shen Fu gives us few, and where we expect logical explanations he often gives us none. Sentences frequently stand almost by themselves. The book is meant to be mused over and, by our standards, read very slowly. There is much that is left unsaid” (Introduction to Six Records 14). This ignorance and under-valuation of Fu sheng liu ji’s aesthetic value turns out to be the most serious failure of their translation.

Pratt and Chiang’s extensive study of the social-historical documentary value of Fu sheng liu ji certainly enhances the reader’s knowledge and understanding of the fundamental conflict between society and the individual in traditional China. However, their introduction concentrate so intensively on the social and historical reasons for Shen Fu’s career failure that his spiritual and aesthetic ideas are not addressed. Further, they don’t address Yun’s spiritual values at all.

3. Judging Lin’s Perspectives in Approaching the Original

The above illustration of Black’s as well as Pratt and Chiang’s problems in approaching the original shows how well Lin understood the spirit and beauty of Shen
Fu’s memoir. In the preface to *The Importance of Understanding*, Lin explains why he prefers to translate authors he truly likes and works that stick in his mind:

Translation is a very subtle thing; unless you are emotionally in contact with the original author, you can not do a good job of it. In translating an author, you practically engage to speak for him in a new language, and you cannot do so unless you are speaking for an old friend, so to speak. And your friend, knowing how strange his own expressions must often sound in a foreign language, gives you some freedom in expression, provided that he can trust that you truly understand what he was trying to say, and that it would be the way he would say in English if he were thinking and writing in English. (*Understanding* 19)

Lin’s preface demonstrates exactly his *zhīyīn* (bosom friend) feeling towards Shen Fu and Yun. It is this feeling that ignites Lin’s great passion to do the translation, and sets a solid foundation for a much more comprehensive version of the original. Meanwhile, Lin’s strong *zhīyīn* feeling towards Shen Fu and Yun, also cloud his objective judgment of Shen Fu’s presentation of Yun. In Lin’s view, Yun’s life was as ideal as Shen Fu presented it. In some cases, Lin’s English expression is more lyrical and sentimental than the original.

As mentioned in Chapter Two, Lin wrote “On Translation” in 1933, shortly before he started this translation. Lin begins the article by stating that, “translation is an art,” highlighting the role of the translator’s personal artistic talent. He believes that a good translation depends on, first of all, the translator’s thorough understanding of the original text; second, his fluent and concise writing ability in the target language; lastly, his training in translation and correct knowledge of the standards and strategies of translation.

In regard to the fidelity in translation—the translator’s responsibility to the original, Lin points out that “word to word” translation is not necessarily faithful to the original, as each word is alive in a sentence and needs to be understood in its context. Lin emphasizes that the translated version should be faithful not only to the meaning but also to the spirit of the original, and should be able to catch the “feeling tone” of the original author. In Lin’s view, there is no absolute fidelity, as it is impossible for a translator to capture all the beauties of the sound, meaning, spirit, form, and style of the original text at once. It is a success if a translator achieves seventy to eighty percent fidelity. The remainder could be addressed using other strategies.
Lin emphasizes that the translator has a responsibility to follow the grammar and idioms of the target language, in order to produce a fluent, reader-friendly text. Lin agrees with Benedetto Croce: “The true art can not be translated [...]. translation is not a reproduction, but a production” (qtd. in "On Translation" 28), and considers translating poetry most difficult, as the beauty of the work is inseparable from the native language spirit, and the translation relies heavily on the beauty of the language. Thus, he suggests that a translator pay attention to both the content and style, in order to imitate the style of the original. Lin claims that it can be difficult to find an equivalent style and rhythm to the original, which are so closely related to the author’s personality and spirit. Successful translation thus depends on the translator’s cultural knowledge, artistic talents, language skills, and his comprehensive understanding of the original. Translation also depends on the inspiration of the translator. That is why there are often several translations of one original text; and why the same translator could produce different versions of the same text at different times. However, Lin points out, this allows room for a translator to exercise his personal artistic talents.

When Lin includes Six Chapters of a Floating Life in The Wisdom of China and India, he shows his consideration for general Western readers. He abridges the fourth chapter on Shen Fu’s travels, but by only about one-third. Lin selectively cuts some portions relating to Shen Fu’s travels to places which would be unfamiliar to Western readers, but would have been familiar to his audience of English readers living in China. Lin also cuts some travels which are similar to incidents which Lin retains. For example, Lin deletes Shen’s visit to Hangzhou but keeps his visit to Yangzhou, because Shen’s comments on Yangzhou’s mountain, water, and landscape design reveal best his insights as an art critic. Lin deletes some of Shen Fu’s visits to temples and towers, but includes the visits to the “Flying Stork Pavilion,” “The Tower of Yellow Stork,” and “The Sea Screen Temple,” as these portions reveal effectively Shen Fu’s aesthetic values and his enjoyment of travel, and illustrate how nature purifies his spirit and carries away his worldly worries. Lin does not change the order of the original, nor does he remove any of Shen Fu’s travels with Yun. Unlike Black, who rearranges the text to make Shen Fu’s

201 See the abridged Chapter IV: The Joys of Travel in Lin, ed., The Wisdom of China and India, 1023-1050.
visit to a prostitute more prominent, Lin keeps this visit in its original place in the text. Despite shortening this chapter, Lin maintains Shen Fu’s expressions relating to his aesthetic values and his spiritual connection with nature. Lin’s abridgment of chapter four provides an interesting contrast to Black’s rearrangement and editing. Lin shows more respect to the original author and maintains the natural flow of qiyun in the original.

D. A Comparative Analysis of the Craft and Strategies of the Three Translators

Characterized by exceptional aesthetic sensitivity, Fu sheng liu ji poses a series of intriguing and detailed challenges for the translators, such as capturing the precise meaning of the original, preserving the style and the nuance of Shen Fu’s expression, and recreating the poetic atmosphere of the original. To handle these challenges the translators use their own craft and strategies, and eventually shape different versions of the original, bringing readers diverse understandings and aesthetic experiences. “A translation can never equal the original, it can approach it, and its quality can only be judged as to accuracy by how close it gets” (Rabassa 1). It can be hard to judge the accuracy of the versions the translators created. However, a comparative study of the three translated versions of the original will lend us insights into the degrees of fidelity that each achieves.

1. In Capturing the Precise Meaning of Each Word in the Context

“Translation is essentially the closest reading one can possibly give a text. The translator cannot ignore ‘lesser’ words, but must consider every jot and tittle” (6), claims Gregory Rabassa when he describes the intensity with which a translator must approach a text. Since “words have the potential of expanding the boundaries of their lexical meanings and the dynamics of semantic possibilities through their specific contextual placement” (Biguenet and Schulte xi), the translator’s ability in determining the specific meaning of a word in its contextual environment is thus critical for the success of a translation.

Defining the boundaries of meanings becomes particularly challenging when it comes to Chinese poetic language. Due to the nature of the Chinese language, a Chinese character can function as either verb, noun, adjective or adverb, depending on the specific
context. Sometimes a word covers several different meanings, “some of which may be mutually exclusive” (J. Liu 8). This is advantageous for Chinese poetry when metaphorical language is desirable, however, it may become a source of obscurity in translation. Pratt and Chiang complain that “there are references in the book that are not clear, some that make little sense,” because they had difficulties in parsing the precise meaning of the original Chinese. Shirley Black admits that “this is a rather difficult job with languages as different from one another as Chinese and English” (Chapters xiii).

Raised with Chinese sensibilities and a daily understanding of the nuances of the language, and as a bilingual writer and linguist, Lin possesses excellent sensibility and talent. He is far better than the other three translators in assessing the boundaries of the words within a specific context, in discovering the similarities and differences in the meanings of words, and in capturing the precise ‘semantic, etymological and cultural weights’ of each word (Biguenet and Schulte xiv).

Example One:

Original Chinese:

是夜送亲城外，返已漏三下，腹饥蜜饯，婢妪以枣脯进，余嫌其甜。(Fu Sheng 2-3) [the underlining is my own]

Lin Yutang’s Version:

That night, when I came back from outside the city, whither I had accompanied my girl cousin the bride, it was already midnight, and I felt very hungry and asked for something to eat. A maid-servant gave me some dried dates, which were too sweet for me. (Six Chapters 9)

Shirley Black’s Version:

That evening I formally escorted the bridal party to a celebration outside the city walls and before I reached home again the watchman at the water-clock had called the third watch of the night. I was feeling very hungry. Entering the house, I called a servant and asked her to bring me some meat dumplings, but the old woman came back with some dates and dried meats from the wedding feast, sweets which I do not like and will not eat. (Chapters 6)

Pratt and Chiang’s Version:

202 He earned his Ph.D. degree in linguistics at the University of Leipzig. The topic of his thesis is “Altchinesische Laulehre” (“Archaic Chinese Phonetics”), Ph.D. dissertation, University of Leipzig, 1923.
That night after the wedding I escorted my relatives out of the city, and it was midnight by the time I returned. I was terribly hungry and asked for something to eat. A servant brought me some dried plums, but they were too sweet for me. (Six Records 26)

Shirley Black makes three misinterpretations of this paragraph. First, she translates "送亲城外" as "I formally escorted the bridal party to a celebration outside the city walls." She is not sure what the bridal party was going to do "outside the city walls," so guesses "to a celebration." In fact, Shen accompanies his cousin, the bride, after a ceremonial "send-off dinner" at the bride’s home, to go to the bridegroom’s home, which in this case is located "outside the city." Second, she translates "腹饥索饵" as "I called a servant and asked her to bring me some meat dumplings." The literal meaning of "饵," is "food used as bait for fishing," but here it simply refers to something for eating, not specifically "meat dumplings." Third, she translates "枣脯" as "dates and dried meats," which is a misinterpretation of "脯" in this context. In a dictionary, "脯" is explained as "the breast meat (of chicken, duck, etc.)," but in this context, it simply means "the dried ‘meat’" of the dates. 果脯,"--"dried fruits," is a famous local product of Beijing. Lacking this background knowledge, Shirley Black gleans only the surface meaning from a dictionary. Pratt and Chiang capture the meaning of "脯," but it seems that they are not careful with the precise meaning of the words in general, so confuse the meaning of "枣" (dates) with "李" (plums), and thus mix "dried dates" with "dried plums." Lin’s translation of this paragraph is accurate and concise.

Example Two:

Original Chinese:

芸曰: “格律谨严, 词旨老当, 诚杜所独擅。但李诗宛如姑射仙子, 有一种落花流水之趣, 令人可爱。” (Fu Sheng 8)

Lin Yutang’s Version:

“Of course, said she,” as for perfection of form and maturity of thought, Tu is the undisputed master, but Li Po [Li Bai]’s poems have the wayward charm of a nymph. His lines come naturally like dropping petals and flowing waters, and are so much lovelier for their spontaneity.” (Six Chapters 21)
Shirley Black’s Version:

‘For perfection of form, beauty of phrase, and nobility of thought Tu’s poems are certainly unequalled,’ Yuen admitted; ‘but Li’s poems have the lyric charm of fairy maidens. He seems to write as naturally as petals fall and waters flow. That is why I love him.’ (Chapters 13-14)

Pratt & Chiang’s Version:

‘Tu Fu is alone,’ Yun replied, ‘in the detail of his verse and the vividness of his expression. But Li Pai’s poetry flows like a flower tossed into a stream. It’s enchanting.’ (Six Records 31)

The term “落花流水” is a Chinese literary symbolic expression, describing the “ways of following the nature.” It consists of two parts: the dropping petals and the flowing waters. Pratt and Chiang appear unfamiliar with the Chinese usage and idioms, and they translate the expression word by word, thus misinterpret it as “flows like a flower tossed into a stream.” Lack of a strong knowledge of the original language creates problems in ascertaining the precise meaning of words in certain contexts, especially extended connotations in certain idioms and customized sayings.

The ability to know the differences between those seemingly similar words also plays a significant role in the overall quality of the translation. The above analysis shows that Pratt and Chiang have a tendency to ignore slight differences of words, and thus generalize, or simplify their English choices, such as confusing the meaning of 枣 (dates) with 李 (plums), which affect the expression of the original, although not to a great degree. However, it becomes more serious when these words are used in describing an emotional state. That will not only cause misunderstanding of content, but may change the tone and atmosphere.

Example Three:

Original Chinese:

余曰: “前言戏之耳。”芸曰: “世间反目多由戏起，后勿冤妾，令人郁死!” 余乃挽之入怀，抚慰之，始解颜为笑。（Fu Sheng 9）

Lin Yutang’s Version:

"Oh! I was only joking," I said. "The trouble is," said Yun, "most marital troubles begin with joking. Don't you accuse me of disrespect later, for then I shall die of
grief without being able to defend myself." Then I held her close to my breast and caressed her until she smiled. (Six Chapters 25)

Shirley Black’s Version:

‘Forget my words,’ I begged her. ‘I only spoke in fun.’ ‘Most quarrels between husbands and wives start in fun,’ she answered seriously. ‘Please do not be angry with me again, or I shall die of grief.’ Taking her in my arms then, I held her closely, caressing her until she looked into my eyes and smiled again. (Chapters 15)

Pratt and Chiang’s Version:

‘But I was only joking,’ I protested. ‘Most arguments people have begun with a joke,’ Yun said. ‘Don’t ever argue with me for the fun of it again—it makes me so angry I could die!’ I pulled her close to me, patted her back, and comforted her. Her anger passed and she began to smile. (Six Records 32-33)

Here, Pratt and Chiang have the tendency to simplify and generalize the emotional state. “令人郁死” is translated by Lin as “die of grief without being able to defend myself,” (which is most appropriate) and by Black as “die of grief,” (which has missed a connotation of “郁”—a melancholic, unspeakable sad feeling), but is translated by Pratt and Chiang as “it makes me so angry I could die!” “Angry,” is not an appropriate word to describe the emotional state at this moment. Similarly, Pratt and Chiang translate the last sentence “解颜为笑” as “Her anger passed and she began to smile.” Pratt and Chiang use the word “angry” to replace several different and subtle emotions that are close to “anger.” In another passage, they translate “心存快悦” (Fu Sheng 7) as “I really was a little angry with her” (Six Records 30). In fact, the word “快悦” describes an unhappy emotion, it could be disgruntled or depressed, not necessarily anger.

The above analysis of the three translators’ abilities to capture the precise meaning of the word demonstrates the importance of translator’s attention to the context and his capability to assess the “boundaries of every individual cultural situation to define both the sameness and the differences” of the words (Biguenet and Schulte xiv). The analysis reveals that Pratt and Chiang’s knowledge of idioms and their literary backgrounds are limited. They have also somehow muddled “faithful translation” with “literal translation.” In many cases, they make a “literal translation,” which “focuses on the word as word without considering the larger realm of the context of the work and its
placement within a cultural and historical frame.” “Literal translation deals with the surface appearance of words without a reflection of the directions of meaning that the original author tried to materialize behind the surface” (Biguenet and Schulte xi). That is why Pratt and Chiang not only notice the “inconsistency” of the original, but also tend to give generalized and simplified English for the original Chinese. Black tends to provide more than one choice in English for the original word, as she is not sure about the boundaries of the meaning and so gives additional explanations; in this way she inevitably makes an expanded English version of the concise original. In contrast, Lin pays attention to the context of each word, and his literary and cultural background enables him to capture the accurate meaning of the word.

2. In Reconstructing Shen Fu’s Tone and Balancing the Nuance of Shen Fu’s Expression

“Jorge Luis Borges had a fine sense of how words are used and of their Swiftian limitations when he told his translator not to write what he said but what he wanted to say” (Rabassa 2). This sounds like it gives a great flexibility to translators to integrate their own interpretations in the translation; however, in fact, it is an enormous challenge, as the translators must understand what the author intended to say exactly.

The subtle, poetic atmosphere Shen Fu creates in his memoir poses an enormous challenge for translators. In order to attain such a subtle vision, as pointed out by Francois Cheng, “Chinese poets avoid using a style which is too direct or explicit. [...] Tang dynasty poets have sought to formulate a specific language which allows them to suggest, from the inside, the secret and necessary links which unite things” (18).

Black seems to struggle the most in appropriating Shen Fu’s tone, yet often renders its exact opposite. She not only makes the memoir overly explicit and contemporary by explaining some of Shen Fu’s words too extensively in English, but also forces him to say many things in an inelegant and convoluted way. Black goes so far as to integrate her own imagination and cultural notes into the narratives and dialogues. Pratt and Chiang also demonstrate a series of problems in approximating the original tone. They often miss the meaning and ignore the signals Shen Fu uses to suggest the meaning. In this way, they dilute the profoundness of Shen Fu’s expression and make him sound quite shallow and ignorant.
Lin emphasizes the need to capture the “feeling tone” of the original in his 1933 article “On Translation.” He understands Shen Fu’s intention, and sympathizes with what Shen Fu was trying to convey. He is able to follow the rhythm of Shen Fu’s expression, and to render it in concise and elegant English. For Lin, translating Fu sheng liu ji was a process of speaking for his bosom friend, as well as a unique way of expressing himself (Understanding 19).

Example One:

Original Chinese:
其形削肩长项，瘦不露骨，眉弯目秀，顾盼神飞，唯两齿微露，似非佳相。一种缠绵之态，令人之意也消。（Fu Sheng 2）

Lin Yutang’s version:
Of a slender figure, she had drooping shoulders and a rather long neck, slim but not to the point of being skinny. Her eyebrows were arched and in her eyes there was a look of quick intelligence and soft refinement. The only defect was that her two front teeth were slightly inclined forward, which was not a mark of good omen. There was an air of tenderness about her which completely fascinated me. (Six Chapters 7)

Shirley Black’s Version:
 [...] her fragile beauty and the slenderness of her graceful figure, with its sloping shoulders and long, delicate neck. Her eyes looked very dark beneath the curving wings of her brows. Her glance sparkled with intelligence and humour, and I could find no flaw in her loveliness except that her two front teeth sloped forward ever so slightly under short upper lip; an unimportant defect, but one that was regarded as a sign of bad luck. Above all else, a clinging softness in her manner, an indefinable air of tenderness and vulnerability about her, touched my heart deeply, making me wish to stay forever by her side. (Chapters 5)

Pratt and Chiang’s Version:
Yun had delicate shoulders and a stately neck, and her figure was slim. Her brows arched over beautiful, lively eyes. Her only blemish was two slightly protruding front teeth, the sign of a lack of good fortune. But her manner was altogether charming, and she captivated all who saw her. (Six Records 26)

This is the image of Yun that lives in Shen Fu’s memory, and whenever he recalls it, all his tender love arises. The image is different in each of the three translated versions, and is especially different from the original in Black’s translation. By adding words such
as "very dark," exaggerating Yun’s gently arched brow into "curving wings," and by highlighting the "intelligence and humour" in the sparkles of her glance, Black makes the original Yun stronger, sharper, and more outward. Yun’s tenderness and refinement inherent in her appearance are reduced. While describing Yun’s front teeth, Shen Fu uses the term “似非佳相,” translated by Lin as “which was not a mark of good omen,” to express his slight pity. This expression is very subtle, as at the time Shen Fu writes this memoir the pain of losing Yun is so strong that he perhaps retraces some omens set by fate. This is definitely not an expression of distaste for Yun’s teeth. Black exaggerates this weakness by adding a “short upper lip” to Yun’s appearance, and overstates Shen Fu’s regret by translating “似非佳相” as “a sign of bad luck.” It is as if she felt the readers wouldn’t understand ‘omen.’ Though ‘a sign of bad luck’ and ‘not a mark of good omen,’ have almost the same connotation, the way of expression is far different. The nuance of this expression is related to Shen Fu’s love, which prevents him from saying directly the negative word ‘bad.’ Pratt and Chiang simply delete these descriptive words, thus generalizing Yun’s fine appearance, and make a robotic and factual translation.

**Example Two:**

**Original Chinese:**

余虽恋其卧而德其正，因亦随之早起。（Fu Sheng 3）

**Lin Yutang’s Version:**

Although I wanted her to lie in bed longer, I could not help admiring her virtue, and so got up myself, too, at the same time with her. (Six Chapters 15)

**Shirley Black’s Version:**

I wanted to make love to her again; to hold her in my arms a little longer; yet I had such respect for her strength of character that I made myself get out of bed as soon as she did, […] (Chapters 9-10)

**Pratt and Chiang’s Version:**

While I would have liked it if she could have slept more, I had to agree that she was right. So every morning I got up early with her, […]. (Six Records 29)
Shen Fu, in the original Chinese, only says “恋其卧,” as Lin translates, “I wanted her to lie in bed longer,” or as Pratt and Chiang translate, “I would have liked it if she could have slept more,” thus leaving room for the reader’s imagination; but Shirley Black makes this scene more dramatic. To say “I wanted to make love to her again; to hold her in my arms a little longer,” is simply not Shen Fu’s poetic and implicit style. In this way, Shirley Black turns a classic love story into modern soap opera.

There are certain feelings that can not be easily described by every human language. “You can feel it, but cannot describe it.” This is a vital characteristic of Chinese poetry and where the most mysterious poetic beauty lies. Shen Fu prefers to create opportunities for the reader’s own understanding and interpretation. There is an unspoken reciprocal relationship between the writer and the reader in these instances. Black recognizes this aesthetic characteristic, yet is unable to transform it in English. Instead of creating a space for the reader’s imagination as Lin did, she tries to fill these gaps by finding an exact expression in English, and thereby loses the nuance of the author’s expression and perhaps says some things that Shen Fu does not mean. Black drifts away from the original style and losses quite a bit of the mysterious yunwei (韵味, charm and taste) of the original.

3. Ways of Integrating Cultural Notes and Translator’s own Interpretation into Translation

In translating a text from a very different cultural background, it is understandable that a translator integrates his own interpretation and background into the main text of the translation. However, methods of integrating and balancing these interpretations affect the translator’s reconstruction of the author’s tone, and can make a substantial difference to the appearance of the translation. The following example demonstrates how the three translators make cultural notes to Shen Fu’s birthday in the first sentence of Fu sheng liu ji.

Example One:

Original in Chinese:

Lin Yutang’s Version:

I was born in 1763, under the reign of Ch’ienlung, on the twenty-second day of the eleventh moon. (Six Chapters 3)

Shirley Black’s Version:

I was born in 1763, [...] in the reign of the Emperor Chien Lung, on the twenty-second day of the eleventh month, in the winter of the year of the sheep. (Chapters 1)

Pratt and Chiang’s Version:

I was born in the winter of the 27th year of the reign of the Emperor Chien Lung, on the second and twentieth day of the eleventh month. (Six Records 25)

Shen Fu’s birthday is calculated by Shen in a moon calendar plus the Emperor's year. Lin translates the year into a solar calendar, 1763, meanwhile indicating that it is under the reign of Ch'enlung [Qianlong], and uses the word “moon” to tell the month. In this way, he indicates the nature of the moon calendar and avoids any additional explanation and keeps the sentence clear and concise. Black comes to a different solution: she translates the year into the solar calendar, in addition, adding “the year of sheep” to indicate the original moon calendar. Certainly this is a good effort to preserve some exotic cultural connotation; yet in this way she makes her addition somehow too obvious and slightly changes the tone and atmosphere of the original narration, as a zodiac counting of the years in Chinese associates it with some different cultural nuance. Pratt and Chiang attempt to be literally faithful to the original, thus they avoid telling the year in the solar calendar directly, and move the explanation into a footnote. So readers must rely on their footnotes in order to figure out the content of the first sentence of the book and to be able to place Shen in historical context.

The above comparison reveals how naturally Lin integrates cultural background. By changing ‘month’ into ‘moon,’ he is able to point out the nature of the moon calendar, meanwhile, keeping the sentence concise. He makes footnotes only when he feels that it

204 Pratt and Chiang’s original note 1763.
205 In Chinese culture, a person’s character in a zodiac interpretation is related to the character of the distinct animal of the year.
is necessary or a detail is too complicated to integrate into the main narrative. He makes only twenty four footnotes throughout this translation. Lin trusts that Shen Fu can speak in a way that readers understand; he also places sufficient trust in the readers, and thus avoids any unnecessary notes. Pratt and Chiang choose to provide extensive footnotes to explain the cultural background and to avoid integrating these details into the main text. This makes the notes indispensable for understanding the text, which continually interrupts the flow of the text. Pratt and Chiang continually remind readers that they are reading a book from another culture. Black does not provide any footnotes for the text but integrates everything into the main text. Black’s method of integrating notes and personal interpretations into the main narrative not only interrupt the flow of the original narration, but also greatly affect the succinctness of the translation.

Example Two:

Original Chinese:

鴻案相庄廿有三年，年愈久而情愈密。（Fu Sheng 9）

Lin Yutang’s Version:

so we remained courteous to each other for twenty-three years of our married life like Liang Hung and Meng Kuang (of the East Han Dynasty), and the longer we stayed together, the more passionately attached we became to each other. (Six Chapters 25)

Shirley Black’s Version:

We lived the years of our short married life with a courtesy and harmony worthy of Liang Hung and Meng Kuang, whose story is told in the Records of the Han Dynasty. Here is the tale as I remember it. … Meng Kuang was a lady of strong mind, renowned virtue and regrettable lack of beauty, whose family home had been located by Fortune close to that of the wise scholar Liang Hung. […] Or so the story goes! (Chapters 15-16) [I delete the long story here]

Pratt and Chiang’s Version:

We lived together with the greatest mutual respect for three and twenty years, and as the years passed we grew ever closer. (Six Records 33)

Liang Hong and Meng Guang are a couple from the Han dynasty, famous for their mutual respect. Lin keeps their names but did not go into depth to explain, since readers
could figure out in the context what kind of people they are. Pratt and Chiang simply delete the names but keep the meaning in the sentence. Black, however, goes so far as to insert the whole story (about two pages) into the main body of the narrative, and makes Shen Fu tell the story. In a similar way, Black uses Shen Fu to tell a variety of stories such as the story of the Herd-boy and the Weaver-girl, to explicate the text (Chapters 17). She also has Shen Fu and Yun recite poems such as Li Bai and Du Fu’s to convey their poetic discussions (Chapters 12-13). This disturbs Shen Fu’s narrative, affects the qiyun and alters the nuance and tone of the original.

4. In Translating the Poems

Although only a few poems are integrated into the memoir, translating these poems presents another critical challenge for the translators. Both Shen Fu and Yun are poets. It is poetry that first allows them to discover each other’s intelligence, temperaments and talents. Composing and discussing poems is one of the most joyful activities in their wedded life. It is in translating these poems that we see most clearly the different talents, knowledge of Chinese, and even artistic temperaments of the three translators.

Poetry is the art of language. The richest aspects of language are inherent in poetry. The beauty of Chinese poetry is grounded not only on the meaning of its words, but also in its auditory effects and structural distinctness. A good Chinese poem has its own aesthetic realm; each character and its sound play vital roles in forming its rhythmic vitality. Like a sonnet or ballad in English, Chinese poetry has different verse forms. There is four-syllabic verse, ancient verse, and regulated verse, each having its distinct metrical rules, which are based on the variations in sounds and tones that are distinctly Chinese. There is disagreement as to whether poems can be accurately translated due to rhythmical and rhyming qualities, especially between languages as different as Chinese and English. James Liu said, “Reading a poem in translation is like looking at a beautiful woman through a veil, or a landscape through a mist, of varying degrees of thickness” (20). Lin agrees that poetry is the most difficult literary form to translate. He suggests that a translator should pay very close attention, not only to the content, but also to the form, and mostly importantly, to the spirit of the original. In comparison to the other
translations, we find that Lin's translation provides us with some of the most creative ways of achieving an ideal reconstruction of a classic Chinese poem in English.

Example One:

Original Chinese:

刺绣之暇，渐通吟咏，有“秋侵人影瘦，霜染菊花肥”之句。(Fu Sheng 1)

Lin Yutang's Version:

Between her needlework, she gradually learnt to write poetry. One of her poems contained the two lines,

“Touched by autumn, one's figure grows slender,
Soaked in frost, the chrysanthemum blooms full.” (Six Chapters 5)

Shirley Black's Version:

Stealing moments now and then from her embroidery, she not only learned to read poetry but soon began writing verses herself. I have always particularly liked these two lines from one other early poems:

‘Invaded by autumn, men are lean as shadows;
Fattening on frost, chrysanthemums grow lush.’ (Chapters 4)

Pratt and Chiang's Version:

In her spare moments she gradually learned how to write poetry, one line of which was, ‘We grow thin in the shadows of autumn, but chrysanthemums grow fat with the dew.’ (Six Records 26)

“秋侵人影瘦，霜染菊花肥” are two lines from a five syllabic regulated verse. Since these are only two lines quoted by Shen Fu, we are unable to see the use of rhyme in the whole poem; but at least we see that this is a well formed antithetical couplet, that contrasts with each other not only in sense, but also in sound, and grammar. These two lines have well contrasted rhythmic tone patterns--four tones in Chinese pronunciation:

first-level (1), second-rising (2), third-turning (3), fourth-entering (4):

qiu (1) qin (3) ren (2) ying (3) shou (4),
Autumn touch human shadow slender
shuang (1) ran (3) ju(2) hua (1) fei (2)
Frost soak chrysanthemum flower fat

And the grammatical structure of the both lines is: (noun + verb) [adverbial clause] + noun + noun + adjective.
In addition, the words which contrast with each other in these two lines refer to the same category of things: ‘frost’ is closely related to ‘autumn’; ‘touch’ and ‘soak’ are both action verbs demonstrating similar feeling of gradual penetration into something; ‘the shadow of human,’ especially the shadow of a beautiful girl is comparable to ‘the flower of chrysanthemum’; and ‘slender’ and ‘fat’ are both descriptive words for these shapes. An image of a lovely girl appears vividly and tenderly between these two lines.

Such a well-versed antithetic couplet indeed reveals young Yun’s poetic mind and skill, and explains why Shen Fu admired Yun’s talent so highly. In translating these two lines, Lin Yutang pays diligent attention to the characteristics of an antithetical couplet and tries his best to convey its beauty into English:

“Touched by autumn, one’s figure grows slender,
Soaked in frost, the chrysanthemum blooms full.”

Grammatically, Lin makes some slight adjustments, but the spirit of the original beauty is almost fully preserved. Both lines share the same grammatical structure in English:

(Past tense verb + preposition + noun) [adverbial clause], noun + verb + adjective

The auditory effect in these two lines is recreated in English sound patterns, the two past tense verbs ‘touched’ and ‘soaked’ not only bring the gentle power of the two actions to light, but also create a similar sound effect with the ‘ed.’ Lin adds a comma in between, and changes the original “noun [functions as adjective] + noun + adjective” to “noun + verb + adjective [in Chinese, adjectives can function as predicates],” to follow the English grammar and make the expression more vivid. “侵,” has the literal meaning of “invade” or “gradual influence,” but in this poetic realm, Lin translates it as ‘touch,’ a much gentler action to describe this smoke-light yet powerful influence of autumn on the human feeling. “染,” ‘to dye,’ or ‘to color’ is strategically translated by Lin here as “soak,” to form an antithetical effect with ‘touch.’

Shirley Black translates these two lines as follows:

Invaded by autumn, men are lean as shadows;
Fattening on frost, chrysanthemums grow lush.

This version is rougher than Lin’s. The grammatical structures of these two lines vary slightly:

Past tense verb + prep. + noun, noun (pl.) + verb (to be) + adjective + conj.
A certain sense of antithesis is conveyed in this translation, but the original beauty has been only partly transferred into English, because Black does not fully capture the metrical rules of Chinese antithetical couplets. In choosing the meaning of the words, Black selects the English words with the stronger color and sense to translate the original ones. She uses “invade” to translate “侵,” which makes the autumn influence more aggressive, and chooses “fatten” to translate the word “染” (dye/color), which enhances the meaning of “肥,” (which she translated as “lush,”) but loses its original subtlety of action. More significantly, Black translates the word “人” (human) as “men,” which changes the whole meaning. In this way, the overall quality of the poem is affected. Yun’s poetic talent and skill are reduced in Black’s translated version.

In comparison to Lin and Black, Pratt and Chiang indeed show less knowledge and talent in translating poems. The above poem is translated by them as:

‘We grow thin in the shadows of autumn,
but chrysanthemums grow fat with the dew.’

The “shadow of human” in the original is changed to “shadows of autumn;” the gentle actions of “touch” and “soak” are deleted. The translators add “but” to show the antithetical relation between the two lines which make the contrasted structure linear. They translate the general meaning of the original without much consideration of the tone and taste of the original. In this way, the delicacy of feeling, subtlety of expression, and the musical sounds existing in the original are diminished. The lines approximate an English poem, but readers can not recognize Yun’s poetic talents in this translation. Shen Fu’s assertion of Yun’s poetic talent sounds powerless and exaggerated. It is in Lin’s translation that readers are able to sense a poetic atmosphere, to feel the rhythmic vitality of the original, and therefore arrive at a greater appreciation of Fu sheng liu ji.

5. In Translating Four-character Phrases

Four-character phrases are one of the most important linguistic features of this memoir. They are also one of the most complex elements for translators to deal with, as Shen Fu uses this construction often. The ability to preserve the terseness and vitality of
these phrases, to translate their musical rhythms, and to rebuild their structural and semantic antitheses into English determines the overall lyrical quality of the book.

Example One:

Original version:

于是相挽登舟，返棹至万年桥下，阳乌犹未落山。舟窗尽落，清风徐来，纨扇罗衫，剖瓜解暑。少焉霞映橋红，烟笼柳暗，银蟾欲上，渔火满江矣。 (Fu Sheng 20)

Lin Yutang’s Version:

We then came back hand-in-hand to the boat, and when we stopped at the Bridge of Ten Thousand Years, the sun had not yet gone down. And we let down all the windows to allow the river breeze to come in, and there, dressed in light silk and holding a silk fan, we sliced a melon to cool ourselves. Soon the evening glow was casting a red hue over the bridge, and the distant haze enveloped the willow trees in twilight. The moon was then coming up, and all along the river we saw a stretch of lights coming from the fishing boats. (Six Chapters 65)

Shirley Black’s Version:

When we reached the Bridge of Ten Thousand Years again, the sun was low in the sky. Dropping the cabin windows all the way to take advantage of the cool breeze, we sat there in our thin clothes, fanning ourselves and eating slices of melon to distract our minds from the heat. At one moment the bridge was a shining crimson in the reflected glow of the setting sun; the next, a mist had begun to hide the willows on the bank. Then, before the Silver Toad in the Moon had started to show his face, the flames of the fishermen’s fires began to light up the whole river. (Chapters 35)

Pratt and Chiang’s Version:

We walked to the boat hand in hand, and sailed back to Ten Thousand-Years Bridge. The sun had not yet set by the time we reached the bridge, so we let down the windows of the boat to admit a breeze, then changed into silk clothes and, fanning ourselves, ate some melon to cool off. Before long the setting sun turned the bridge red, and the twilight mist enveloped the willows in darkness. The silver moon was just rising and the river quickly filled up with the lights of night fishermen. (Six Records 46)

This passage brings readers into a realm which is similar to that in a good Tang poem or a famous Chinese landscape painting. In constructing this “painting,” Shen Fu’s artistic talent excells. With a painter’s mind and eyes, he posits the elements of natural beauty rhythmically and dynamically, and shades the different colors of natural lights
harmonically and sensitively. The passage consists mostly of four-character phrases; the overall atmosphere relies on the powerful expression of these phrases and the creative combination between these phrases. In reconstructing this painting, translators must be flexible and sensitive to the rhythmically arranged positions and harmonically contrasted colors, and must be able to maintain the dynamic relationships between the various phrases.

Shirley Black changes the original parallels and contrasts into linear positions by using strong connective words such as “the next” and “then.” The audience’s eyes are thus controlled by her way of narrative, seeing the scenes one after another. However, one of the most important characteristics of Chinese painting is its structural flexibility; it allows viewers to experience the scenes with a spacious and wavy feeling, moving their sight up and down, near and distant, not fixed in a linear way. The scenes in a painting might have happened in a particular order, or might have been simultaneous. This structural characteristic is accurately reflected in Lin’s translation of the above paragraph. The grammar of classical Chinese and Shen Fu’s skilful narration allow for structural flexibility. Shirley Black’s version alters the relationships between various phrases, and disables this flexibility. Furthermore, she tends to strengthen the colors of the original. So here the word “crimson” is certainly too strong for the evening glow of setting sun; Lin’s ‘red hue’ sounds more sensitive. The “Silver Toad in the Moon had started to show his face,” sounds too exaggerated in this context, and the word “flames” tends to be also to be too specific and strong for this poetic nightlight. Pratt and Chiang ignore the nuance in the original poetic expressions and simply translated “霞映桥红” as “the setting sun turned the bridge red,” and the sensitive word “暗,” they translated as “darkness,” which is not accurate in this context. The word “quickly” also disturbs the poetic atmosphere.

The comparative analysis of the three translated versions demonstrates that Lin Yutang’s translation is lyrical and atmospheric, and feels as thought it were “stream of consciousness” which gives it authority and authenticity as a memoir. Black’s has some of the poetic quality but it loses its flow when she abridges and reorganizes the content. Pratt and Chiang’s is more like factual reporting, the poetic lyricism of the original is very much lost. However, with their detailed footnotes providing historical and societal context they succeed in conveying the story of an ordinary couple of a particular time.
Walter Benjamin, in his “The Task of the Translator,” points out a dual meaning of the question of whether a work is translatable: “Either: will an adequate translator ever be found among the totality of its readers? Or, more pertinently: Does its nature lend itself to translation and, therefore, in view of the significance of the mode, call for it?” (69). It is exactly at the intersection of these two questions that we see how Lin Yutang is an ideal translator for this book, and how genuinely he responds to the call of Fu sheng liu ji for translation.

Conclusion: the Influence of Fu sheng liu ji on Lin’s Work and Career

The above analysis demonstrates the complex personal and cultural reasons that motivated Lin Yutang to translate Shen Fu’s memoir and how sensitively he translated the memoir into English. Meanwhile, it also reveals the critical role this memoir plays in forming Lin’s cross-cultural discourse on Chinese women and Chinese culture. By translating this text, Lin places Fu sheng liu ji into a modern cultural context, and reveals its significance for modern Chinese and English readers. In the process of translating this book Lin finds important cross-cultural affinities in aesthetics, female ideals, and the art of living, which prepare him to be a spokesman for Chinese people and culture.

Translating Fu sheng liu ji influences Lin’s strategies for introducing Chinese women to the world and for defending them on the world stage. The image of Yun enriches his understanding of Chinese women, their lives, temperaments, thoughts and talents. It brings him to a new balance between tradition and modernity. This mature view is reflected in the chapter on “Women’s Life,” in My Country and My People, written right after this translation. Yun’s image appears between the lines of Lin’s discourses on Chinese women’s education, love and marriage, and women’s position at home. Yun, as Lin’s ideal, also reflects Lin’s romantic view on Chinese women.

Yun became an inspiration for the images of Chinese women in Lin’s creative writing. In 1939, Lin published Moment in Peking. Mulan, the female protagonist in this novel, is unusually intelligent, artistically talented, passionate, and with a peaceful mind. Lin calls her a daughter of Daoism, and claims that if he were a woman, he would like to
be Mulan. Additionally, *Fu sheng liu ji* forms an extremely important intertextual relationship with Lin’s non-fiction books in introducing Chinese life and art such as *Importance of Living*. Lin selected numerous examples from *Fu sheng liu ji* to illustrate his ideas of the art of living. Lin’s discourse on the best spirit of Chinese culture, his evaluation of the contribution of Chinese art to the world, and his strong recommendation of the Chinese art of living to Western culture are fundamentally established in his own aesthetic stance and developed from his deep appreciation of books such as *Fu sheng liu ji*. His modern appropriation of the Chinese aesthetic essence and art of living amazed the Western cultural world and influenced the Western view of Chinese culture.

The succinctly and beautifully rendered *Six Chapters of a Floating Life*, a translation that preserves the original aesthetic nature so ideally, indicates that Lin has reached the mature style of his literary translation. Lin does not leave many theoretical writings about this translation; yet by interpreting the strategies and craft he adopts in the process of reconstructing *Fu sheng liu ji* in English, we learn much of his Dao of cross-cultural literary translation. In Lin’s *From Pagan to Christian* he gives a brief comment on Gu Hongming’s translation: “[Gu Hongming]’s translations will forever stand, for they have that happy matching of sense and expression that can come only through the mastery of both languages and understanding of their deeper meanings. Ku’s [Gu’s] translations are veritable revelations” (*From Pagan* 52). This is an apt description of Lin Yutang’s translations.

---

206 Adet Lin, Preface to the Chinese version of *Moment in Peking*. Lin, *Jing Hua*.

207 Lin’s creative writing of *Moment in Peking*, however, was also inspired by the classical novel *Dream of the Red Chamber*. Lin’s daughter Adet mentioned this in her preface to the Chinese version of *Moment in Peking*, *Jing hua van yun*. Lin originally planned to translate this novel into English, yet in the process of translation, he changed his mind and decided to write a novel by himself. See Adet Lin’s preface to *Lin, Jing Hua*.

CHAPTER FOUR: A WIDOW, A NUN, AND A COURTESAN — HOW THE IMAGES OF THREE MARGINALIZED CHINESE WOMEN ARE REPRESENTED AND RECONSTRUCTED IN LIN YUTANG’S ADAPTATION, TRANSLATION AND REWRITING

In 1951 the John Day Company published Widow, Nun, Courtesan, three novellas about Chinese women which Lin Yutang translated, adapted and rewrote. In the introduction, Lin provides us a general picture of this collection, and brief reasons for translating, adapting or rewriting these stories:

Here are three stories concerning some Chinese women, both the damned and the saved. Two are among the best Chinese novelettes that I know, translated and in part adapted, and one is an ancient tale of love entirely written by me, but based on a popular legend. I have chosen to translate or rewrite these principally as good stories because reading each of them was a memorable experience for me. I have been thinking, however, that presented in English dress, the backgrounds of these stories must be more striking to Western readers than to Chinese readers, for they reveal Chinese institutions and manners and morals. (Introduction to Widow, Nun, Courtesan v)

In comparison to Lin’s other popular books in English, such as My Country and My People, or The Importance of Living, the reception to this one was relatively cold. Except for one article on the problem of adaptation in Lin’s ‘Widow,’ which was published in the 1980s, the book has not attracted much critical attention, and has remained quite unnoticed by Western readers.

---


In this collection, Lin presents three images of marginalized Chinese women. Titled respectively as "Widow Chuan," "A Nun of Taishan," and "Miss Tu [Du]," Lin worked on these stories during different time periods, one in 1936, and the other two in the late 1940s. The original stories were from different genres and from different historical periods. "Widow Chuan" was adapted from the modern novella The Quan Clan Village, written by Lin's contemporary writer Lao Xiang. "A Nun of Taishan" was originally the second part of a famous Qing story The Travels of Laocan, written by Liu E. "Miss Tu" was based on the vernacular short story "Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewellery Box in Anger," selected from Comprehensive Words to Warn the World, a popular collection compiled by the famous Ming Dynasty writer Feng Menglong. Lin's book becomes rich and complicated once it is examined from the perspective of Lin's lifelong translingual practice of constructing and reconstructing images of Chinese women. The text deserves further exploration and re-evaluation. The following three parts are my effort to examine this relatively unknown book about Chinese women.

I. Widow Quan—"Queen Bee" of a Chinese Village

A. Cultural Background for Lin Yutang's Selection of "Widow Chuan"

Among the stereotypical images of Chinese women during the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the image of the widow ranks the lowest. The term ‘widow’ itself was inevitably linked in later imperial China with a series of other terms and sayings, such as “heroic suicide,” “chastity monument,” and the oft-quoted aphorism of Zhu Xi: "It is a small matter to starve to death, but a large matter to lose one’s virtue." The dominant image of Chinese widows recorded in the authentic dynastic histories and local gazetteers, was as women who disfigured themselves or committed suicide to reject

211 'Du' is the pronunciation in pinyin for the Chinese character 'U'. Lin Yutang used a modified version of the Wade Giles Romanization system, therefore it was spelled as "Tu" in his translation.
212 "Nun of Taishan" was published first in 1936, in E Liu and other writers, A Nun of Taishan and Other Translations, trans. Yutang Lin (Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1936). "Miss Tu" was published first in 1950, in Yutang Lin, Miss Tu (New York: John Day Company, 1950).
213 Zhu Xi (1130-1200), a leading scholar of Neo-Confucianism during the Song dynasty. The aphorism was first said by another leading scholar of Neo-Confucianism Cheng Yichuan (1033-1107), but promoted by Zhu Xi. Here the word ‘virtue’ refers to the ‘chastity’ in widowhood, i.e., free of sex and refusal to remarry after becoming a widow.
remarriage and to remain loyal to their deceased husbands. Commemorative arches were erected by the imperial government to honor these deeds. The Protestant missionary writers who arrived in China during the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries paid particular attention to the phenomenon of widow suicide and made sensational reports concerning it in the West. Translations of historical records such as Liènû Zhuan enhanced the apparent authenticity of these reports and gave the impression of Chinese women's passivity and collaboration in their own misery and sacrifice.

The life stories of Chinese widows were used by missionaries as testaments to the suffering endured by Chinese women, and the inhumanity and brutality inherent in Chinese national characteristics.

“A widow is not a wife, nor is she an unmarried woman. Her position in the traditional Chinese social order was complex.” Anne Waltner, in her study of “Widows and Remarriage in Ming and Early Qing China,” points out the widow’s extremely marginalized position and her vulnerability in the traditional clan system,

The ties which bound her to her husband’s family, though in theory unchanged, were fundamentally weakened by his death, especially if she had not reinforced the ties by bearing a son. Her own family, often living in a distant village and preoccupied with their own concerns, were not obligated to support the daughter who became a stranger when she married into a stranger’s house.

Moreover, “a widow’s position within the family of her deceased husband was only partially protected by law.”

If a widow had no sons, she was obligated to adopt an heir for her deceased husband, but only be “in consultation with clan elders” (Waltner 132). In

---


216 See my discussion in the first chapter on the views of missionaries such as Helen Barrett Montgomery and R.H. Grave on widow suicide.

217 See Waltner’s explanation: “A widow with no sons, or whose sons were minors, succeeded to her husband’s share of the patrimony. This was not true inheritance, but rather the result of the concept that a married couple formed one legal unit; the wife’s legal personality was subsumed in her husband’s. After his death she represented the joint legal personality of the couple, but she could not sell property without the consent of other members of the family, nor could she take it with her if she remarried.” Anne Waltner, "Widows and Remarriage in Ming and Early Qing China," Women in China, Current Directions in Historical Scholarship, eds. Richard W. Guisso and Stanley Johannesen (Youngstown, N.Y.: Philo Press, 1981).132.
addition, the widow’s sexual activity became a public concern. “If a widow remained chaste, the prestige accrued not only to her, but to the entire family. Conversely, if she became involved in scandal, the entire family would be stained” (Waltner 134). Widows in traditional China thus became a group of marginalized women who were vulnerable for social abuse.

During the May Fourth Chinese Cultural Movement, Confucianism, which supported the doctrine of chaste widowhood, was ferociously condemned by the modern Chinese intellectuals and denounced as a “man-eating religion.” Lu Xun, the most prominent May Fourth writer, wrote a short story titled “New Year’s Sacrifice” in 1924, in which he described how an innocent village widow—“Wife of Xianglin,” who lost two husbands and died due to the influence of the strict Confucian tenets. ‘Wife of Xianglin,’ never held her fate in her own hand; she was discriminated against and ostracized by the society, and went insane before her suicide. This story was widely circulated during the May Fourth era and became extremely influential in the modern Chinese literary tradition as it fit the iconoclastic purpose of the ongoing Chinese revolution. The ignorance and passivity of the wife of Xianglin were considered the common state of Chinese women under the oppressive feudal and patriarchal system.

Yet Lin Yutang did not believe Chinese women could be so easily suppressed. In his view, “The Chinese woman is, on the whole, a constitutionally sounder animal than her male companion” (My Country 137). In discussing the theory of chaste widowhood, Lin warned that the “practice must have lagged behind theory, and even as late as the Manchu times, chaste widowhood was expected of the wife of a scholar with official titles but not of the common women” (My Country 140).

No wonder that when he read Lao Xiang’s novella The Quan Clan Village (Quan Jia Cun, 全家村,) in 1940, Lin could not wait to make it known in English.218 Widow Quan219 was so different from the stereotypes of Chinese widows popularized in the West and in China; she was dramatically different from the wife of Xianglin. This rebellious, free-minded, “human, wicked, capable and hearty” (Lin's Prefatory note to "Widow" 3)

---

218 The original Novella Village Chuan was written by Lao Xiang (老向1901-1968, real name Wang Xiangchen 王向辰), who was distinguished by his conciseness and humour.

219 ‘Quan’ is the pronunciation in pinyin for the Chinese character ‘全’ (family name). It was spelled as “Chuan” in Lin’s translation.
village widow illustrated Lin’s firm belief in the existence of the matriarchal spirit in Chinese widowhood.

The original story, *Quan Clan Village*, is set in a small village in Northern China during the late 1930’s after the beginning of the Sino-Japanese war. It covers one day following the return of war hero Quan Dachu to his home village. Along with the hero’s travel and activities, the village inhabitants and their lives are vividly and humorously depicted. Characters such as Village Elder Quan, the busybody Hullo Quan, salt smuggler Quan Fei, Widow Quan and her youngest daughter Diandian Nier are highlighted with many flashbacks of their pasts. *Quan Clan Village*, as Lin asserts, is “a realistic and humorous, not really satirical, group picture of life in a village” (Introduction to *Widow, Nun, Courtesan* vi). In Lin’s opinion, this is one of the best creative works of modern Chinese literature, better than Lu Xun’s “The True Story of Ah Q”—which is one of the most influential and canonized texts in modern Chinese literature. In translating this story into English, Lin adapts it by sharpening the image of the widow, and renames the story as “Widow Chuan [Quan].”

In the “Introduction” to the book, Lin writes,

> Chastity in widowhood--the refusal to remarry--was praised in literature; respected in society, and often honored by the government, because it helped preserve the family line. It often meant poverty, hardship, and courage, and such a widow was regarded as a heroine. So far so good in the Confucian system. Our “Widow Chuan,” however, had nothing to do with chastity; she was a personality, and if she was an institution in the village, it was against all that Confucius ever taught and believed. At least to the widow, Confucius was fiction, she was life. (Introduction to *Widow, Nun, Courtesan* v-vi)

**B. Widow Quan’s Personality and her Survival Strategies**

Widow Quan has all the social vulnerabilities of a widow who had borne no sons. From a city family, she marries a cousin of the village Elder Quan, gives birth to five daughters, and eventually becomes a widow. However, Widow Quan, nicknamed ‘Topping All Westgate,’ and “more humorously and respectfully referred to by the villagers as ‘Ancestor Widow’” (“Widow” 23), turns out to be the most forceful personality of the community. She becomes the spiritual leader of the village. Her home becomes the cultural center of the village, and the village elder is “completely crushed
and flattened under her feet, like a maple leaf after frost” ("Widow" 27). By examining her unusual personality and survival strategies, we learn why Lin admired her so highly and wanted to make her character known in the West.

1. A Courageous, Intelligent, and Rebellious Widow

Widow Quan is bold, loud, witty, and rebellious, and turns many of the common assumptions about Chinese widowhood upside down. She never went to school and neither reads nor writes. She brags, “If I had been born thirty years later, and had got hold of a girl student’s skirt, I would not be afraid to be the Queen of the United States” ("Widow" 26).

Since Widow Quan does not have a son, the village Elder Quan tries to force her to adopt a child of the clan, but she refuses. Elder Quan decides to sue her over clan property and debts ("Widow" 26). He believes that “with his knowledge of law courts, he would have no difficulty in winning against a woman. “At the worst, he could accuse her of being an ‘unchaste and immoral widow’ and could bury her alive first and talk about it afterward” ("Widow" 27-28). When Elder Quan fixes up a wagon for the journey to the city to sue the Widow, the Widow, “with a full smiling face demanded to ride with him.” “After arrival in the city, the Widow insisted that he should stay in the same hotel with her,” and “began immediately to order wine and the menu for the dinner” ("Widow" 28). This is how Widow Quan strategically arranges the opportunity to talk with the Elder:

[...] You are my husband’s cousin, and I am your widowed cousin-in-law, and there is no point in either of us winning a suit against the other. [...] You have three daughters who are not yet engaged. If we ever appear against each other in court, you know this mouth of mine is not dependable and I don’t make a prepared speech. Just in case it makes a slip and says something unpleasant about the virtue of your daughters, I shall feel badly toward their mother. Your daughters are attending college and want to be properly married, don’t they? I certainly would not want them ever to blame me for being a silly old fool who lets her tongue run away with her. [...] ("Widow" 29-30)

“When he heard this forthright speech by the Widow, its open threats untempered by mercy, he was at his wits’ end” ("Widow" 30). “The net result was, that they fixed up the cover for the wagon again and rode home together to the village” ("Widow" 31).
The lack of formal Confucian education for Widow Quan turns out to be to her advantage, as her mind is free from the knowledge of books such as *The Biography of Virtuous Women*, or *Analects for Women*. The moral burden that Neo-Confucianism lays on the shoulders of those educated Chinese women thus had little to do with this widow and her daughters.

Her own five daughters were never ill at ease in public. With the single exception that they had never led a nudist parade, there was no kind of 'freedom' which they did not fully enjoy. Four of them were married. One died when she tried to practice birth control by abortion, but the other three were all separated from their husbands and living gay and very enjoyable lives of their own. ("Widow" 27)

So both the mother and daughters are "followers of Mocius' Doctrine of Universal Love,"

Unlike other widows and their orphaned children, there was smoke in the chimney of the home of Topping Westgate every day. Hullo Chuan, Chuan Fei, Little Root, and Little Tiger were all their followers, and it would not be incorrect to say that there were not many men in the village who were not contributing supporters of the Widow’s club. ("Widow" 27)

In the countryside of traditional China, women did not have the opportunity to be educated by Neo-Confucian texts thus lived more freely than those burdened by its didactic education.

Widow Quan develops her intelligence and wisdom chiefly from her real life experience.

According to the story, except on her wedding day, Topping Westgate never spent a night quietly in her own earthen bed. She was sixty, and the gambling dens and teahouses were her favorite resorts. In the matter of cards and dice, she was a past master and invincible foe for anybody, and no one would ever think of putting anything over on her. Chuan Fei, for instance, that salt smuggler and cardshark who cheated many gambling friends, would stop cheating if the Widow merely flickered an eyelid. Sometimes after a raid on gambling houses, the games would be played in a thick grove on the hill or in a field completely covered by tall corn, but she inevitably found her way there. When others were arrested by an officer, she would be let off with a laugh and walk away undisturbed. She was thoroughly familiar with the thieves’ argot, and when she was not gambling, she could be seen sitting in an open teashop at the square discussing the affairs of the world, not forgetting to keep an eye on all the passers-by. Consequently, there was not nothing in city or country life that she did not know, no gang and no profession with which she was not familiar, and no one with whom she could not engage in conversation. ("Widow" 25-26)
Through her wild and legendary experience, Widow Quan develops her own morality and philosophy, formed by necessary tactics for survival. She builds up a strong psychology which overcomes the humiliations and threats, she develops a temperament which recognizes hypocrisy, and dares to speak ‘unprepared speech.’ She is never afraid of pointing out hypocrisies and revealing the true nature of others. For instance, though the widow made her home a house of worship, she herself “did not believe in the gods and publicly said so,” claiming,

“When a stinking dung beetle puts on an official cap, the foolish people call him an official and address him as Your Honor. A piece of wood, if made into a threshold, is stepped upon by everybody, but when the same piece of wood is carved into a Buddha, it is said that whoever touches it, his finger will immediately rot. And you ask me to believe that?” ("Widow" 35)

When she asked by the gambler and smuggler Quan Fei why keep an idol at home, she answers: “Don’t tell me that you don’t know. What do you run a gambling den for? For your commissions. So do I. I keep a Buddha in my house for the same reason a teahouse owner provides teapots, and for the same reason you keep your dice and cards” ("Widow" 36).

2. A Capable and Hearty Leader who Successfully Directs the Village Cultural Centre

Along with a strong nervous system and an optimistic attitude, Widow Quan is decisive and far-sighted. In addition, she is warm-hearted and ready to help others in distress. She is the village’s spiritual leader.

In the opinion of the villagers, except for the fact that they did not quite like the long pillows in the beds at her home, they rather thought her a more useful member of the community than the Elder who was good only for sitting at the top at a public dinner. I will not dwell on the point that in times of need, she was always ready and willing to help one in distress, but will only mention the fact that she possessed a special skill which made her useful to all expectant mothers, and she was the special savior of those expecting women and girls who should not have a baby. [...] In case of a drought, they went to her home to pray for rain; in case of sickness, for a prescription of medicine; in case of a bad dream, to ward off evil luck. The cultural center of the village was decidedly not in the school housed in an old dilapidated temple, but in the Widow’s home. ("Widow" 32-33)

Widow Quan’s talent in organizing and directing large cultural activities is remarkable. For instance, she is the general director of prayer services to various gods,
and “the way she gave orders for sacrifices at midnight or for burning written prayers to
the gods at noon compelled the confidence of the followers and the priests” ("Widow"
34).

There is a saying in Chinese which describes a woman’s abilities: “women’s hair
is long, but their sight is short.” But Widow Quan has ‘a general’s far-sightness and a
minister’s tolerance.’ She is very goal-oriented and able to ignore unimportant details.
For instance, when the war hero Captain Quan Dachu is nine years old, his mother dies.
His maternal uncle prevents the burial and “compelled the poor orphan of nine to sit by
his mother’s corpse for five days without permission to put her in the coffin” ("Widow"
74). Widow Quan leads the efforts to help this nine-year-old boy. Hullo Quan, a
warmhearted villager wants to start the funeral without notifying the uncle, but Widow
Quan disagrees:

“We must help to smooth the matter over, rather than to spoil it,” she said. “If the
other family should take the matter to court and sue for illegal burial, mentioning
your name incidentally as the prime mover, you are going to wear yourself out
running to town for the lawsuit. They are bargaining for a price. If we are smart
we should haggle with them and settle for what we can get and be done with it. I
tell you what we will do. You go and speak to the uncle and tell him that we shall
hold the funeral day after tomorrow and invite them to come. Say that I shall see
to it that they are satisfied. If he turns the offer down, then we will think of
something else.” ("Widow" 77-78)

In this way, she is able to solve the funeral problem peacefully.

Widow Quan’s generous heart and capable leadership wins support from the
villagers. Several times the Elder intends to “bury the Widow alive,” yet he cannot do so
without the support of the villagers.

The Elder considered the question carefully. Hullo Chuan was a good person,
easily coaxed to do anything, but he was a bachelor and all his winter and
summer clothing was made by the daughters of the Widow. To ask him to turn
against the Widow would appear to be more difficult than digging a railway
tunnel. The Captain, the homecoming hero, commanded prestige and influence,
but we know that the Elder would be thankful if the Captain did not “bury” him
“alive.” As for the general run of honest farmers, they knew well that a murderer
had to pay with his life ever since the laws of the Han Dynasty had been
established, and certainly no one would think of taking his orders to “bury” the
Widow “alive.” ("Widow" 32)

The Elder comes to the conclusion that “all he could do was to stay home and pretend to
be deaf and dumb” ("Widow" 32). Widow Quan is able to become the spiritual leader of the village because she understands the villagers’ true desires.

Widow Quan is intelligent, able, rebellious, wicked yet warm-hearted, “procreative and teeming with life like the earth” ("Widow" 24). Indeed, she possesses true matriarchal power, like a Queen Bee. How could Lin Yutang not appreciate her when he encountered her?

C. Lin Yutang’s High Opinion of Quan Clan Village and his Purpose in Adaptation

As I discussed in Chapter Two of this dissertation, Lin was the first Chinese to introduce and transliterate the word ‘humour’ to Chinese as early as 1924. He emphasized the importance of humour, and searched for humour in Chinese literature. Quan Jia Cun, which was published in Yuzhou Feng in 1940, in Lin’s view, represented the true spirit of Yuzhou Feng.

Lin believed that humour could be used as an aesthetic strategy in dealing with real life problems, even changing “the quality and character of our entire cultural life, […]” as “its function is chemical, rather than physical, it alters the basic texture of our thought and experience […]” (Living 76). Therefore, when Lao Xiang used humour to deal with the serious topic of the Chinese widow and thereby criticized Neo-Confucianism, Lin could appreciate it. “To Lin Yutang, the humorless and deadly serious moralism of the Neo-Confucianists was the root of the stagnation of the Chinese culture” (Qian 108).

There are similarities between the images of Queen Nancy and Widow Quan. Although one is an ancient queen, who confronts the famous sage Confucius, and the other a modern widow, who confronts the village Elder, the two women resemble each other in many ways, not only in their conversational and diplomatic skills, but also in the power they achieve. This is how we come to understand why Lin Yutang was fond of the image of Widow Quan, and how much he wanted to present her story in English. Since the focus of the original story Quan Jia Cun is the whole village, Lin adapts partly the text, in order to focus and sharpen the image of the Widow.
D. Lin Yutang’s Adaptation of *Quan Clan Village* with the Purpose of Sharpening the Image of the Widow

Lin’s translation and adaptation of *Quan Clan Village* caught the attention of Frederik Brandauer, a scholar who was very interested in Lao Xiang’s works. In his article “Lin Yutang’s ‘Widow’ and the Problem of Adaptation,” Brandauer makes a careful comparison between Lao Xiang’s original story and Lin’s English version, and raises a series of questions regarding the problems in the narrative coherence caused by the adaptation. However, Lin’s purpose is clearly different from Lao Xiang’s.

1. To What Extent had Lin Adapted the Original?

The original focus of Lao Xiang’s *Quan Jia Cun*, as I mention before, is the life and activities of a whole village. The main narrative thread follows the return of the war hero Quan Dachu. Lin Yutang is very much aware of this. For the purpose of refocusing and sharpening the image of Widow Quan, Lin makes a series of changes to the original.

In order to create this shift in narrative emphasis, Lin condenses about one-third of the original material not directly related to Widow Quan.\(^{220}\) Lin also changes the narrative order of certain interrelated parts and adds some new interpretive sentences, paragraphs and episodes, such as:

Because the Elder was a man and the Widow a woman, it does not follow that in a contest of strength, or of wits, or of words, the woman had to run before the man. No, not in this village while the Widow was living. Quite the contrary! Being a woman and a widow, she was willing to let the Elder maintain his outward semblance of authority as long as he did not step on her toes, and the Elder knew her too well to do that. The difference between the two heads of the village was that one was temporal and the other was spiritual. The spiritual head always knew where she stood, but the temporal head did not and was never sure of his ground when he was confronted with her. Moreover, our homecoming Hero might sit in the ancestral temple as the brass idol, causing other people to do things by doing nothing himself, as all idols do, but our Widow alone could make the village happy because she was active and understood men’s desires. The War Hero was silent like heaven; the Widow procreative and teeming with life like the earth. (*Widow* 23-24)

\(^{220}\) Brandauer makes a similar estimation of the materials deleted by Lin. See note 8 in Brandauer, "Lin Yutang's 'Widow'."
Obviously, Lin creates this overview of the Widow Quan to draw the readers' attention to her strong personality and activities, and to contrast her to the village Elder and the War Hero. It becomes a powerful beginning for her story.

Another addition Lin makes to the text is the love affair between Diandian Nier, the Widow’s youngest daughter, and the young laborer from Elder Quan’s family.\(^{221}\) Brandauer finds this addition too far-fetched, and believes that Lin uses it to “attract the interest of the English reader through inclusion of material common in Western fiction” (8). I partly agree with Brandauer’s view, but still think that there were deeper motives behind Lin’s decision. Lao Xiang’s story did not consider the youth of the Widow, yet mentioned several times that the widow’s youngest daughter resembled her mother the most: “Tientien Ni'rh was a worthy product of the great petticoat tradition of her mother. There was nothing she dared not do or say, no place where she dared not go, and no man whom she dared not see” ("Widow" 28).

Diandian Nier is a mirror of Widow Quan’s youth. By presenting a lively image of the energetic, noisy and promiscuous Diandain Nier, Lao Xiang shows the reader the image of the Widow when she was young. Similarly, by adding this love affair, Lin enriches the rebellious and liberal character of this youngest daughter, and thereby enriches the image of the Widow.

2. How Should Lin’s Adaptation be Evaluated?

Since Lin declares that “Widow Chuan” is a “translated and adapted” work, we must switch our perspective from a ‘full translation’ to partly a translation and partly an adaptation. New criteria need to be defined in assessing the value of this unusual work. Similar to an adaptation made from a novel to a movie script, the adaptor’s personal intention and creativity are deeply involved. Instead of the standard of “how faithful is Lin’s English version to the original,” another set of standards, such as ‘how important is

\(^{221}\) In the original story, there is a scene revealing how Diandian Nier made a fool of the young laborer accusing him of touching her breasts when people were gathering in front of the Hero Quan’s ancestral temple. By following this potential narrative logic, Lin creates a new scene. Lin describes how passionate the young laborer was about Diandian Nier and how he decides to go to the girl’s home. Diandian Nier is outside of her door, so they talk, flirt, and in the end, the laborer even embraces her. Yutang Lin, Widow, Nun and Courtesan: Three Novellettes from the Chinese Translated and Adapted by Lin Yutang (New York: The John Day Company, 1951). 93-95.
his purpose of adaptation,' 'how well did he meet the challenges in his cross-cultural
translation and adaptation,' and 'to what degree did he achieve the purposes he set for
this adaptation,' etc., should be used as the important criteria to evaluate the value of
Lin’s adaptation.

Although “Widow Chuan” was an adapted work, it is clearly not a dramatically
adapted one, and does not become, as Brandauer judges, an entirely new work. This is
mainly because the spirit of the original is not lost, and in some aspects, it is even
enhanced.

Brandauer concludes that Lin’s adaptation “as an exercise its value is limited:”
“Lao Xiang is not a famous writer although he has been praised for his literary
accomplishments. Lin Yutang is well-known, but his Widow, Nun and Courtesan has
never attracted wide-spread attention” (9).

In my opinion, “Widow Chuan” is an important experiment in cross-cultural
literary translation and adaptation. Once “Widow Chuan” is fixed in Lin’s project of
constructing and reconstructing the images of Chinese women, its value stretches beyond
the differences between the adapted version and the original.

Widow Quan is the first image of a happy and independent widow in modern
Chinese literature, yet she is unknown even to many modern and contemporary Chinese
scholars and literary critics.222 Due to the insignificance of Lao Xiang in modern Chinese
literary history, and the disappearance of Lin’s voice in Chinese literary circles during the
last half century, Widow Quan remains quite unknown to general readers.

3. Impact of “Widow Chuan” on Lin Yutang’s Creative Rewriting and Writing about
Widows in English

Translating and adapting this story certainly confirmed Lin’s view of the problem
of the widow in Chinese culture. Yet, the story also reflects Lin’s tendency to romanticize
and idealize the image of Chinese women. Though real widows like Widow Quan indeed
existed in Chinese life, the numerous monuments erected for the chaste widows in

222 Recently Yan Geling published the novel The Ninth Widow. The critic He Shaojun claims that the Ninth
Widow Pudao is the first image of a happy widow in modern Chinese literature. He seems to be unaware
of the existence of Widow Quan. See Geling Yan, The Ninth Widow [第九个寡妇] (Beijing: Zuojia
Chubanshe, 2006)., and He’s comments in Shaojun He, "Minjian Shengcun Zhexue De Kuaile Jingling
Chinese history demonstrate a more cruel reality. Lin’s choice of translating and adapting this widow story, like his choice of translating *Six Chapters of a Floating Life*, was, to a certain extent, romanticized.

A year after Lin published this book, he published another collection of Chinese short stories, all translated and retold by him. One of the stories among that collection is called “Chastity” (*Famous 85*). The original story is the tragic tale of a widow of Qing dynasty who commits suicide the night before she could obtain the chastity monument from the emperor due to her affair with a male servant. In rewriting this story Lin changes the original ending--creating a happy marriage for the widow and her lover. In 1961, Lin published a novel *The Red Peony*, in which he presents a liberated young widow of later Qing China, who pursues her love against all restrictions and taboos. General critics of this image of widow consider that such a widow in traditional China was too romanticized, and Westernized, and unrealistic. Yet I see the Chinese root of this image, and the similarity between Lin’s *Red Peony* and Lao Xiang’s *Widow Quan*. By creating strong traditional or modern female characters, Lin was able to empower Chinese women.

II. Nun Yiyun--A Wild Orchid in a Secluded Valley

Buddhist or Daoist Nuns had always been marginalized in traditional Chinese society. They appeared to be quite mysterious. Living in temples on the fringes of cities or deep in the mountains, these women ‘veiled’ themselves in a unique way: with shaved heads, grey attire and distinct lifestyle. Missionaries arriving in China in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries had the chance to get to know family women in the countryside and in big cities, yet did not contact nuns whose religious aspirations were already ‘heathenized.’ Occasionally, they would catch a glimpse of these nuns, as they came to the villages to beg for alms, to engage in religious services, or to take excursions in their boats. Westerners might have heard of the high rate of literacy among these nuns, and observed the mysterious power the nuns held over the village people.

---

223 For instance, He Shaojun holds such a view in his article “Minjian shencun zhexue de kuaile jingling [民间生存哲学的快乐精灵].”

224 See my discussion in Chapter One of this dissertation.
However, in general, nuns were the strangest group of Chinese women these missionaries had ever encountered.\(^{225}\)

In 1936, a year after Lin translated *Six Chapters of a Floating Life*, he translated *A Nun of Taishan*, a story about Yiyun, a young and beautiful nun at a convent on Mount Tai\(^{226}\) in the late nineteenth century. In the story Yiyun strives for earthly love but fails, and yet is able to transcend her suffering through Daoism and Buddhism. Eventually she grows into a happy, carefree, and independent young woman, as well as a religious teacher. In 1951, Lin reprinted the translation of this story in *Widow, Nun and Courtesan*, with slight modification, and made it one of three unique tales about Chinese women.

The original Chinese story was written by Liu E,\(^{227}\) a brilliant writer and thinker of the late Qing dynasty. *A Nun of Taishan* is essentially the first six chapters of the second part of Liu E’s *The Travels of Laocan*,\(^{228}\) a semi-autobiographical novel in the form of a traveling doctor’s records, depicting the events and encounters from his travels. In these chapters, Laocan befriends a tourist guide, the charming young nun Yiyun. The narrative follows Yiyun’s own explanation of her life experience and her enlightenment.

---


\(^{226}\) One of the five famous sacred mountains.

\(^{227}\) 刘鹗 (1857-1909), styled 铁云 (Tieyun), a poet, musician, medical practitioner and entrepreneur, as well as a significant novelist in the late Qing dynasty. He worked on flood control, famine relief, and railroads, and was the pioneering scholar in discovering and studying the inscriptions on bones and tortoise shells. He was also an advocate of modern reforms in later Qing dynasty, and thus incurred much enmity. He died in exile in Xinjiang in 1909.

\(^{228}\) One of the four most famous social novels of Qing Dynasty. The first part (twenty chapters) of *Laocan Youjj* (《骆驼祥子》) was published first in installments in 1903 in the Literary Magazine *Xiuxiang Xiaoshuo* (《绣像小说》半月刊), and then in *Tientsin Daily News* (《天津日日新闻》) during 1903-1906. The second part (nine chapters) of *Laocan Youjj* was published in *Tientsin Daily News* in 1907; however, it disappeared from reader’s view for about twenty seven years. In 1934, Lin Yutang obtained a copy of the first six chapters of the second part from one of Liu E’s family members and urged them to publish it. These six chapters were printed that year in *Renjianshi*, one of the literary magazines created by Lin Yutang. A separate edition was published in 1935 by Liangyou (良友), a publisher in Shanghai, prefaced by Lin Yutang. The last three chapters of the second part of *Laocan Youjj* appeared in 1959, when Liu E’s grandson Liu Huisun 刘惠孙 decided to give the preserved copies to Shanghai Zhonghua Shuju (上海中华书局). The first twenty chapters (first part) of the book have been translated into eight languages. The most popular English version was translated by Harold Shadick, under the title *The Travels of Laots’an*, and was published by Cornell University press in 1952. The first six chapters of the second part were translated by Lin Yutang under the title “A Nun of Taishan” in 1936, and published by the Commercial Press of Shanghai. An improved version of “A Nun of Taishan” was included in *Widow, Nun and Courtesan* (New York: The John Day Company, 1951).
In the introduction to *Widow, Nun, Courtesan*, Lin Yutang emphasizes that Liu E was “a real scholar who understood Buddhism” (Introduction to *Widow, Nun, Courtesan* v-vi). In Lin’s opinion, Yiyun’s story “represents a mature and extremely human and simple view of religion” (Introduction to *Widow, Nun, Courtesan* vi).

A. What Kind of Nun was Yiyun?

Yiyun is not the type of nun who lives a consecrated life and chants Buddhist sutras day and night, but a beautiful nun-cum-entertainer who lives in a convent where the nuns are specifically trained to entertain male tourists. “Nuns,” in general, were marginalized in traditional Chinese society, and these “nun entertainers” were doubly marginalized, and indeed, considered “the other.”

The custom of “nun-cum-entertainers” started after Buddhism became popular in China, around the later Six Dynasties (222-589) and early Tang dynasty (618-907). “Buddhist goals were never forbidden the female sex,” and it was possible that “women, too, attained enlightenment and nirvana” (Tsai 2), therefore Buddhist convents had always been a haven for female refugees. Those who were abandoned or orphaned due to “violent political and social disturbances,” or with “personal difficulties such as illness or grief at the loss of a parent,” or by “vows taken on one’s own or by one’s parents,” could all find a home with the nuns (Tsai 9). Convents also opened their doors for loose women seeking refuge as well. As Jan Walls points out, “R.H. Van Gulik finds that Buddhist and Taoist nunneries during the later T’ang all had doubtful reputations” (42), as they were a haven of refuge not only for pious girls but also for widows and divorced women who had no family to return to, and at the same time for loose women who wished to lead a free life, without registering officially as prostitutes. (Gulik 175)

---

229 As Tsai points out, “The Great Vehicle (Mahayana) rather than the Disciples’ Vehicle flourished in China, however, and certain developments in Mahayana doctrine seem at first glance to impede the path of women seeking the Way.”

230 According to historical records, there were many Buddhist as well as Daoist convents during the High Tang period. Some princesses, for personal religious pursuits, also spent time at these convents. Wu Zetian, the first female Emperor of China during the Tang dynasty (625-705 AD), lived in a Buddhist convent before she rose to her power.
Famous Tang nun-poetess Li Ye (?-784) and Yu Xuanji (ca.844-868?) spent much of their lives in Daoist convents, meeting male *literati* and official guests, exercising their poetic talents, and gaining notoriety for sexual activities far and wide.

Though critics of nun-convents and nun-cum-entertainers started as early as the Tang and continued in later dynasties, the custom was undying in imperial China. This was clearly related to the dilemma existing between the strict constraints set by Confucianism for women in general and the romantic pursuits of Chinese male *literati*, officials and rich businessmen. In the chapter “Women’s Life” of *My Country and My People*, Lin points out the important role that courtesans played in China’s literary, musical and political traditions, and reveals the cultural reasons behind this phenomenon.

Because men thought it improper for decent family girls to handle musical instruments, which were dangerous to their virtue, or to have too much literary learning, which was equally subversive of their morality, but rarely encouraged painting and poetry for them, they did not, on that account, cease to desire female company of the artistic and literary type. The sing-song girls cultivated these things because they did not need ignorance as a bulwark of their virtue. (*My Country* 160)

Compared to other women, these well-educated courtesans (differing from the lower-ranking prostitutes), were indeed “more cultivated, more independent, and more at home in men’s society” (*My Country* 162). They “supplied the need for courtship and romance which many men missed in their youth before marriage” (*My Country* 161). Nun-cum-entertainers, as an unofficial alternative to these courtesans, appeared to be even more mysterious and romantic due to their special religious training and high literacy, and for living in remote mountain locations.

Doumugong in Mountain Tai where Yiyun lived in the late nineteenth century was exactly such a remote convent. As Yiyun explains,

[...] The pilgrims who come up the mountain are usually officials or the gentry. To entertain them, we have been given some education, besides learning to chant prayers and say masses. Thus when officials come, we can carry on a

231 Li Ye 李冶, styled Jilan (季兰) and Yu Xuanji 鱼玄机, original name Youwei (幼薇) and styled Huilan (慧兰) who were considered to be two of the most famous talented poetesses, were also Daoist priestesses. Yu Xuanji had been a courtesan and concubine.

232 For instance, in the early thirteenth century the famous bibliophile Chen Chensun (陈振孙) remarked: “[...] just as I always say, women who become Buddhists and Taoists, unrestrained by civil law, are the forces that wreck our traditions and destroy the popular customs.” See Jan W. Walls, “The Poetry of Yu Hsüan-Chi,” Indiana University, 1972. 51, 76.
conversation with them without being bores. And because the nun’s dress usually repels people and the guests are either on their way to assume office or else celebrating some happy occasion, we are dressed like this before our thirtieth year. After thirty, we cut off our hair. Before then our duty is to entertain guests. Sometimes a few young men like to flirt a little with us, which we don’t mind. As for staying overnight with us, it is against the rules of the monastery. ("Nun" 123-24)

This was the environment in which Yiyun grew up. She had lived and trained in it since she had been seven or eight years old. Though partly attached to ‘otherworldly’ issues, she is bound to this ‘dusty life’ physically and spiritually. At the age of sixteen, she falls in love with Ren Sanye, a married young man of the local gentry. Her love, as Lin Yutang points out, “is of course no different from any girl’s experience of love, except under what Western readers may regard as exotic surroundings” (Prefatory note to "Nun" 113), yet her identity as a nun-cum-entertainer disables this love in all possible ways. The pain of this aborted love throws her into enormous psychological turbulence and struggle.

As the Chan Buddhist verse says, “the purest of blossoms emerge from the mire,” and Yiyun, a girl “who looks almost like a prostitute,” ("Nun" 160) transcends into a living Buddha. The true meaning of Buddhism is portrayed in Yiyun’s story.

B. How did Yiyun Achieve Enlightenment and Liberation?

1. The Uniqueness of Yiyun’s Enlightenment in Comparison with those in the Authentic Records

Stories about enlightened nuns, although few, appear in various authentic records. The earliest one is Biqiuni zhuan (Biographies of Bhiksunis), compiled in 516 by a monk named Baochang, at the court of the Liang during the Southern Dynasty’s period (420-589) (Idema and Grant 153). Jiadai pudenglu (The Jiadai Universal Record of the Lamps), compiled in 1204, is another authentic record from the Song dynasty, containing

---

233 The reasons for Yiyun’s entering the convent at such a young age are unclear, but were likely due to family poverty or vows taken by her parents.

234 The reference here is to the lotus flower. This stanza was written by Daoren Mingshi, a nun during the Song dynasty. See Wilt Idema and Beata Grant, The Red Brush: Writing Women of Imperial China, Harvard East Asian Monographs, 231 (Cambridge (MA) and London: Harvard University Press, 2004). 328.

235 The travelling doctor Laocan in the story claims this in the story.
fifteen biographical accounts of female Chan masters, "out of a total of more than one thousand" (Idema and Grant 323). However, for specific religious characteristics and tenets, these biographical sketches often exclude detailed reasons of the most critical stage of these nuns' enlightenment. Also, enlightenment is presented in a characteristically Chan Buddhist way: enigmatic, sudden, and metaphysical, remaining incomprehensible to common readers.

In comparison with these authentic records, Yiyun's story is unique. It illustrates the Buddhist idea of awakening from worldly attachment. However, in contrast to those mysterious and metaphysical records in the authentic biographies, Yiyun's awakening turns out to be deeply psychological and reliable, and illustrates the strong bond between religious salvation and women's liberation.

2. Yiyun's Awakening from Dreams

Awakening from the dream and being able to see through the illusion of the world is the first stage of one's enlightenment in Buddhism. The word 'Buddha' means the 'Awakened One'. Yiyun is awakened not by diligently studying the Buddhist Classics, but in the middle of her painful suffering over love and erotic passion, and in the realization that all her 'red dust' dreams are the "moon in the well, flower in the mirror."236

After she and Ren Sanye fall "in love with each other at first sight" ("Nun" 133), Yiyun begins her fantastic dream with her lover ("Nun" 135-36). However, when Sanye discusses Yiyun with his mother, she reminds him that the match is unsuitable due to Yiyun’s identity as a nun-cum-entertainer, and refuses to provide sufficient money for him to spend the "first night" with Yiyun ("Nun" 139-40). Yiyun is heartbroken. She is sleepless for several nights, struggling to find a way to be with Sanye. She considers requesting nothing from Sanye for the "first night," or spending her "first night" with another guest and then with Sanye. She considers running away with him, or becoming his concubine. Yet, wherever her mind turns, she runs into a deadlock. She realizes how

---

236 "Red" suggests the Buddhist idea that the whole world is “red dust” (红尘).
237 平中月，镜中花，means "illusions".
238 "Spending first night" means to sell her virginity for a large sum of money. Thereafter, she is able to accept various customers. Lin, Widow, Nun, Courtesan, 145.
deeply rooted she is in the convent and how difficult it will be for her to free herself.

Once she understands it is hopeless to pursue a relationship with Ren Sanye, she is able to sleep.

The moment I closed my eyes, I had a dream and I saw in my dream an old man with white hair and a white beard, who spoke to me, ‘Yiyun! Yiyun! You have in you a touch of God’s grace, but have lost it on account of your mortal desires and passions. Now the light is beginning to shine in your soul and a spark of wisdom flashes in your mind. Tend and nourish it! Take up your Sword of Wisdom and cut off your mortal ties!’ ‘Yes, yes,’ I replied immediately, but I added, ‘My name is Huayun (Beautiful Clouds) and not Yiyun (Ethereal Clouds).’ ‘But,’ replied the old man, ‘that was your name when you had not seen the light but after your awakening now, you shall be called Yiyun.’ [...] I woke up in a fright with cold perspiration all over my body. And I lay there on the bed and felt as if a cool breeze had blown off all the desires and passions and perplexities from my soul. From that time on, I took Yiyun as my name. (“Nun” 147-48)

This is probably one of the most detailed and realistic descriptions of awakening in Chinese literature. Joy and despair, “the ardent hopes and the terrible fear of failure”, keeps her in a state similar to suffering from malaria, “a spell of burning heat followed a spell of freezing cold” (“Nun” 137). After all her ideas end in deadlock and all her dreams are broken, Yiyun finally arrives at her first step of enlightenment.

3. Yiyun’s Transcendence through the Combination of Buddhism, Daoism and Confucianism

Lin Yutang comments on Yiyun’s spiritual progress in the prefatory note to his translation,

The love story is one of her struggle to free herself and leads to the story of her spiritual development in the last two sections where she emerges as a kindly and dignified young teacher of the truth. Strange as her love story may be to some readers, it is in the last sections of the novelette that her character is rounded off and the story reaches true depth. ("Nun" 113)

a. The Wisdom of “Change” in the Progress of Yiyun’s Buddhist Enlightenment

One of the fundamental teachings of Buddhism is that “the ultimate truth was to be found beyond all dualities, including that of gender” (Idema and Grant 321). As Vajra-Sutra says, “no consciousness of self and no consciousness of others.” “All the troubles of this world come from this distinction between self and others” ("Nun" 148). This may
be difficult for a non-Buddhist to comprehend. Yiyun cites the story of ‘the heavenly maid dropping flowers down on Subhuti’ ("Nun" 148-49) to illustrate that “all our sorrows and our sufferings come from the idea that we are women. If we only see that there is no difference between men and women, we shall have already enjoyed the bliss of paradise” ("Nun" 149). When Yiyun is asked, “Do you mean to say that no man can now waken in you any feeling of love, no matter how attractive he is?” ("Nun" 149). She replies,

Of course I cannot escape love; only this love has no reference to sexual differences, but has only distinctions of degree. For instance, when I see a brilliant young man or a beautiful woman, or a hero or a scholar, there is awakened in my heart a love which grows out of respect; when I see people close to me, there is awakened in my heart a love which comes from familiarity; and when I see fools and idiots, there is awakened in me a love which comes from pity. In other words, there is no one in the world whom we cannot love, but this has nothing to do with one's being a man or a woman. ("Nun" 149)

When Yiyun is asked how she could arrive at such a high level of understanding of Buddhism, she explains her mental progress of achieving this truth. “It is all contained in the one word ‘change.’ The Book of Changes says, ‘When one is in extremities, one changes; and when one changes, one reaches understanding.’” ("Nun" 150)

When I was a girl of twelve or thirteen, I didn’t understand anything and also had no idea of sex. When I was fourteen or fifteen, I began to know something and to feel a liking for men. But I liked only handsome men. [...] When I was sixteen or seventeen, however, [...] I felt that a man I liked must have something in him, either culture and charm, or some talent in him; [...] This was the time when I fell in love with Jen Sanyeh [Ren Sanye]. When I was seventeen or eighteen, I began to think only of heroes. A newspaper editor who could write long essays and discourse on any topic on earth was a hero to me. [...] [but] then I began to see their clay feet. [...] For my ideal of a hero or a great man, I wanted a man like Tseng Kuofan (a scholar-general who suppressed the Taiping Rebellion), who was as good at commanding people as at commanding armies, and as masterly at judging coming events as at writing literary essays--all at the same time. [...] Finally my ideal grew until I would not be satisfied with any one less than Confucius or Laotse or Buddha, who were for me the true heroes and great men of the world. When I came to this point, then of course there was no one in this world that I really cared for, and curiously enough, to feel that you have no one in the world that you really care for is at the time to feel that you care for every common man or humanity itself. The above is the story of my mental development. ("Nun" 151)
This illustration of the evolution of her male ideal allows us to understand how important the wisdom of “change” is in Yiyun’s arrival at this high level of religious understanding, where the consciousness of gender distinctions could no longer bother her, and how she finally becomes a person who was able to transcend mortal attractions.

b. The Active Role of Daoist Wisdom in Yiyun’s Spiritual Enlightenment

Roger Ames, in explaining Daoism, emphasizes the positive and active spirit of Daoism,

Taoism is a philosophy that pursues some positive ideals of the consummate human being, an ideal which although consistent with nature does represent a peculiarly human realization. Further, the attainment of this ideal demands sustained effort and the authentication of understanding in action. Finally, I insist that Taoism is a philosophy which affirms both the reality and the worth of the phenomenal world, and seeks not to escape from it, but rather to effect a radical integration with it. (23)

It seems that this active spirit of Daoist wisdom is harmoniously integrated into both Yiyun’s spiritual and physical beings:

Recently I have decided to divide my personality into two beings. The first one is called ‘Yiyun of the world.’ As Yiyun of the world, and as a nun in this Toumukung I will do whatever I ought to do and talk with whoever wants to talk with me. [...] The other self is called ‘Yiyun the recluse,’ who likes to spend her leisure hours associating with the great founders of Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism, and feels contented and happy watching the changing drama enacted by the sun and the moon and the forces of the universe. ("Nun" 151-52)

This active spirit not only helps Yiyun achieve mental freedom, but also helps her achieve sound health by engaging in vigorous exercise, which is clearly demonstrated in the instructions Yiyun gives to Huancui, when the latter decides to become Yiyun’s disciple:

‘If you have really made up your mind to follow Buddha, it should not be difficult [...]. First, when you go to the little convent at the back of the hill, you must wander everyday on foot on the mountain. When you have learned to run up and down the steep mountain paths like on level ground, then you will have laid a sound foundation for understanding Buddhism. Then I will teach you how to chant sutras and explain to you the Buddhist teachings, [...]’ ("Nun" 173)

These are teachings for her new disciple, and for her own practice. Yiyun’s intelligence, happiness and independence are not merely reflected in the insights of her
words, but also in the way she lives. She walks bravely on the mountain road everyday. She is nourished by the spirit of nature, and is the true daughter of the Mountain Tai. Lin Yutang regards Yiyun more as a Daoist than a Buddhist. In his prefatory note to “A Nun of Taishan,” Lin writes,

She was happy, she was carefree, she was independent, she could wander about where she liked, and she could be at home anywhere. Her happiness was decidedly attractive, and how did she do it? By what Taoist magic formula? First, by a vigorous training of her body; and second, by attaining a view of life which set her at ease wherever she went and in whatever company she found herself. Those are the two essential elements in a Taoist training, for I regard her more as a Taoist than a Buddhist. In her opinion, Huants’ui could not be spiritually saved until she had unbound her feet and learned to run about the mountains as if on level ground. Without such a body, no soul could be happy, and after all, the only test of a soul’s salvation is its inward happiness. But see how Yiyun runs up and down Taishan, and how she can go without an evening meal and sleep without a blanket at night! She has attained that stage of physical fitness and independence very much desired by modern Boy Scouts and Girl Guides. (“Nun” 113-14)

C. Yiyun as the Embodiment of Lin’s Religious and Female Ideals

Yiyun is one of the most intelligent, independent, pure-minded, and amiable nun ever depicted in Chinese literature, she is a positive image of a religious Chinese woman. Lin admired Yiyun deeply when he first read her story, but could not help wondering: did such a nun ever truly exist on the Mount Tai?

If there is indeed such a nun in Doumugong, I would certainly go there to meet her. Yet this is like a dream, but also not a dream, how could I know if it is true? My only hope is that it is not a dream, so it could really make the Mountain Tai unusually attractive. 239

Lin believed that “She then stands as the author’s ideal of an emancipated person” (Prefatory note to "Nun" 113). He points out:

The author, I am convinced, presents a true and factual account of what he saw in the convent and its practices, though he must have created Yiyun out of his imagination. Convents which are “irregular” are known in some provinces of China, though they would be periodically “cleaned up” by a new official. The incidental side light thrown on the practice of Buddhism in the last two chapters as the author presents it through the mouth of the nun of Taishan should be

---


176
regarded as a correct and authoritative picture of the Chinese religious life.
(Prefatory note to "Nun" 115)

Lin’s overly-sentimental reflection on the romantic aspect of Yiyun’s life, and his assertive tone in introducing the last two chapters as “a correct and authoritative picture of the Chinese religious life,” however, reveal his own romanticized and idealized view of Yiyun. Yiyun is obviously idealized by the author Liu E in his semi-autographical story. She is further romanticized and idealized through Lin’s introduction, and his translation and adaptation. Lin did not see the hardship placed on Yiyun by the society and her unfortunate fate as a despised woman. By having Yiyun speak for herself, however, the reader is convinced of the authority of her perspective.

The reprinting of the second part of Laocan Youji, the story of Yiyun, was due to Lin Yutang’s effort. Lin wrote the Chinese preface to the second part of The Travels of Laocan (《老残游记二集》). He asserted how highly he valued the author Liu E and The Travels of Laocan, and how much he personally liked this book, especially the female images created (Preface to Laocan 1). It was from these idealized images of Chinese women that Lin recognized Liu E’s male feminist spirit. The Travels of Laocan caught scholars’ attention for its scathing political satire and excellent narrative skill. However, from Lin’s preface we learn that Lin was one of the first modern Chinese intellectuals to pay attention to Liu E’s attitudes towards Chinese women. When Lin found that Yiyun’s story was so well ‘armed’ with the integrated spirit of Daoism, Buddhism and Confucianism, which spoke to his own spiritual belief, he wanted to translate it into English. Yiyun’s story provides Western readers with not only an ‘extremely human and simple view’ of Chinese religion, but also the unusually healthy, happy and independent image of a religious Chinese young woman. In this case, Lin Yutang just borrowed Liu E’s ‘flowers,’ to dedicate his own ‘Buddha.’

Independent “new women” became popular in the writings of modern Chinese literature after the May Fourth cultural movement. Critics have often considered that the appearance of Chinese “New Women” in modern China was mainly due to the influence of Western culture. However, the image of Yiyun appeared in Liu E’s work before these “New Women” came into view, and was purely native Chinese.

240 “borrowed other people’s flowers, to dedicate to his own Buddha,” an idiom in Chinese, “借花献佛。”
D. The Adaptations Lin Yutang Made in his English Translation

In this novella, the image of Yiyun is well focused, and the atmosphere is delicately elaborated. In translating the story into English, Lin did not need to make dramatic changes. However, Lin did make some minor changes and adaptations for the purpose of sharpening the image of Yiyun, and for developing a better cross-cultural understanding. The following is a brief summary of the adaptations Lin made to the original.

1. Minor Changes in the Whole Narrative Structure

To make the narrative structure of *A Nun of Taishan* closer to a ‘novella’ of the Western genre, Lin made some minor changes in the translated version. He removed the features of traditional Chinese fiction, such as the formula of beginning with ‘It is told’ and having each chapter end in suspense. He did not use the two-line poetic summaries of the content as chapter titles. He also deleted nearly half of the content of chapter one (about fifteen percent of the whole content).241 By making this major deletion, the story in English became more focused on the image of Yiyun, and entered her story more quickly than the original. Moderate changes and deletions were made to chapters three and four, which seem to be due to Lin’s consideration of cross-cultural understanding. For instance, chapter three described the process of Yiyun’s awakening from her dreams. The first dream about how many things Yiyun was going to ask Sanye to buy for her was shortened. The things Yiyun demanded in her dream would be understandable in Chinese customs, yet could be too strange for an English reader and might cause misunderstanding of Yiyun’s character. Several paragraphs describing Yiyun’s worries were also reduced. For instance, her thoughts about the problems of sleeping with Mr. Ox and Mr. Horse were simplified; her doubt about Sanye’s plan to trap her was also simplified. Lin may have decided that these would increase the reader’s impression of Yiyun’s sophistication. A story Yiyun recalled about the ill-treatment a nun suffered at the hand of a first wife was also simplified to a sentence, “her home was like a hell [...]” ("Nun" 147), most likely because Lin did not want to scare readers by this individual

241 This estimation is based on the comparison between Lin’s English translation and the original Chinese version.
case. Yiyun’s life was simplified and she was idealized and romanticized in the process of Lin Yutang’s translation and adaptation.

2. Strategies Developed by Lin for a Better Cross-cultural Understanding

An important strategy Lin applied in enhancing cross-cultural understanding of this story is finding an analogue in the target culture. For instance, most of the Chinese historical heroes Yiyun mentions in illustrating the evolution of her male ideal are unfamiliar to Western readers. Lin found corresponding Western heroes for the Chinese ones, allowing readers to get a basic understanding of the heroes that Yiyun talks about:

[...] I felt that people like the Tseng brothers were not first-class heroes. My military heroes were like Kuan Yu and Chao Yun (European counterparts: Sir Philip Sidney and Oliver Cromwell) and later I felt even this was not enough; the real heroes for me were Kuan Chung and Yo Yi (who were like Charlemagne and Julius Caesar in Europe), and my literary heroes were Chuang-tse and Liehtse (who were like Plato and Empedocles in Greece). ("Nun" 151)

He also used the term “Pluto’s temple” as an equivalent to the ‘Yenlomiao’ in Chinese, “That is Kaolishan and the temple on its top is Yenlomiao (or Pluto's temple)” ("Nun" 116).

The image of Yiyun is sharpened after some deletions and condensations; the analogues Lin found in Western culture help the readers to achieve a better understanding. The translation reflects the high quality Liu E’s vernacular Chinese narrative. Overall, Lin’s translation enhances the brilliance of the original; the rhythmic vitality of the original is maintained.

E. The Impact of “A Nun of Taishan” on Lin’s Creative Rewriting and Writing

Translating “A Nun of Taishan” influenced Lin Yutang’s creative rewriting and writing. For instance, Lin’s idealization of the image of courtesan in his rewritten novella “Miss Du” is related to Liu E’s idealization of Yiyun. In some of Lin’s descriptions of characters and atmosphere, we can find traces of Liu E’s art of storytelling, as my analysis of Lin’s rewriting of “Miss Du” will demonstrate. In 1948, Lin published his second novel A Leaf in the Storm. The female protagonist Peng Danni’s understanding of Buddhism, achieved through her suffering in love, is very similar to Yiyun’s. The
instruction made to Danni to walk daily around the Yangzi river, is similar to Yiyun’s instruction for her new disciple’s Buddhist training through walking up and down on the mountain Tai.

III. Chinese ‘Camellia’ Blossoms in America

A. Background for Lin’s Selection and Rewriting the Story of Du Shiniang

Prostitution has long been called the world’s oldest profession. In China, the institution of the professional courtesan dates back, according to known records, to the seventh century BC (Genius 153). Because of the conflict between moral restraints set by Confucianism for family women and the romantic and sexual pursuits of traditional Chinese male literati, officials and businessmen, the tradition of high-class courtesans, who were different from the lower-ranking prostitutes, developed and prospered in traditional Chinese society. These courtesans, as Lin points out, not only “supplied the need for courtship and romance which many men missed in their youth before marriage,” but also “occupied a very prominent position in Chinese social life, similar to that of the Greek hetaera” (Introduction to Widow, Nun, Courtesan). They “made their mark on literary history, some by being poets themselves, some by being closely associated with literary men.” As a group, they were closely connected with the history of song and music. Courtesans were also perceived as being “more cultivated, more independent, and more at home in men’s society than were family women” (My Country 162). A courtesan was “the emancipated lady in ancient China” (My Country 162), as long as she remained in her profession. However, as Lin poignantly reveals, “What was not professional, but human, is the fact that a courtesan might really fall in love with someone, and the social limitations which complicated the affair if the girl wanted to marry into a good family usually worked to the girl’s disadvantage” (Introduction to Widow, Nun, Courtesan v).

242 Lin further explains that it is because “the playing of musical instruments and singing were deprecated among family girls, the songs also tended to concentrate almost entirely on love and passion, which in turn was considered detrimental to the virtue of adolescent girls.” in Yutang Lin, The Gay Genius: The Life and Times of Su Tungpo (New York: John Day Company, 1947). 153-154.
There are many tales in traditional Chinese literature about courtesans’ romance with the scholars they loved. With few exceptions, such tales ended tragically. These stories demonstrate how alienated these courtesans were from the society, and how difficult it was for them to leave their profession to have normal marriages. One of the most popular legends about such a tragic love was “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger.”

The tragedy is said to have happened about the year 1595, during the Emperor Wanli’s reign in the Ming Dynasty (Lin’s Prefatory note to "Tu" 183). A young man named Li Jia, son of a provincial commissar and a student of the Imperial Academy in Beijing falls in love with a courtesan, Du Shiniang. Du Shiniang had been sold as a courtesan at the age of thirteen. With her exceptional beauty and artistic talents, she rises to be a top-ranked courtesan in the capital city’s pleasure quarters. After seven years of indulgence and suffering, she longs for true love and a family life in the company of Li Jia, who appears to be honest, devoted and amiable. After Li Jia spends all the money which his father had provided for his study, he is to be expelled by the procuress. This strengthens Shiniang’s determination to be with him. Partly with her own savings, and partly with money raised by Li’s friend Liu Yuchun, she sets herself free from the quarter, taking only a jewel box with her. The lovers leave Beijing and travel south toward Li Jia’s hometown, first seeking a temporary place for Shiniang to lodge so that Li Jia may go home to reconcile his father to his marriage. However, while the lovers wait to cross the Yangzi River, Li Jia encounters a young salt merchant Sun Fu, whose boat is moored next to theirs. Sun Fu accidentally overhears Shiniang’s singing and catches a glimpse of her beauty; his desire for her causes him to hatch a wicked plot. He invites Li Jia to have a drink and cunningly advises Li to give up the girl to him. He offers to pay one thousand taels of silver for her, which Li could give his father in reconciliation. Li easily falls into this trap and returns to discuss the deal with Shiniang.

243 Courtesans’ love stories in Ming and Qing dynasties, such as Dong Xiaowan with Mao Pijiang, Li Xiangjiun with Hou Fangyu, and Liu Rushi with Qian Qingyi, have a relatively positive end.

Shocked out of her dream of a happy marriage, Shiniang accepts her fate and makes a drastic decision. The next morning she dresses as a bride and appears on the deck of the boat. In front of Li Jia, Sun Fu, and the onlookers on shore, she opens the jewel box. To the astonishment of everyone, she throws several drawers of precious jewels, pearls, gold and jade into the river. Then she scolds Sun Fu for his evil behavior and Li Jia for his betrayal and ingratitude. She tells Li Jia that her jewel box held more than ten thousand taels of silver, which she had originally planned to use for their trip and as a gift for Li’s family so that they might feel more favourably towards her. However, ‘There is jade in my chest but I regret you have no pearls in your eyes.’ Clasping the jewel box in her arms, she leaps into the bosom of the river and vanishes without a trace.

This ending is heartbreaking. It reveals how desperately Du Shiniang wishes to regain the dignity denied her. She chooses to die, out of her wounded dignity, her unspeakable sadness, anger, and her defiance of the social system, which marginalized and commercialized her.

“Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger” is regarded as one of the best-written and most poignant Chinese vernacular short stories by many Chinese literary critics. Liu Wu-chi points out in his book An Introduction to Chinese Literature: “In style and method of presentation, it is clever imitation of the art of the colloquial storyteller. Instead of a complicated plot with many ups and downs, it is a well-told, lively, and tightly knit tale of a courtesan’s love for a young student, his fickleness and ingratitude, and her death by drowning” (220).

The original of “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger” was called “The Faithless Lover,” a tale composed in classical Chinese by a Ming scholar Song Maocheng, which was said to be based on a real incident which happened in 1595. It


246 Song Maocheng (宋懋澄 1569-ca.1620), a Ming Dynasty classical scholar. “The Faithless Lover” (“Fuqing Nong Zhuan,” “负情侬传”), was collected in his anthology Jiu Yu Ji (《九籥集》). See Maocheng Song, Fuqing Nong Zhuan [负情侬传], Jiu Yu Ji [九籥集] (Beijing: Beijing Press, 1997). Lin Yutang was not aware of this version. He indicates in his prefatory note to “Miss Du”: “According to the earliest known written version, the Ching Shih T’ung Yen, by Feng Menglung, the incident happened about year 1595.” Many other scholars and literary historians were not aware of the existence of this earlier version of Du Shiniang’s story. This classical tale was translated by Patrick Hanan. See Patrick Hanan, ”The Making of the Pearl-Sewn Shirt and the Courtesan’s Jewel Box,” Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies 33 (1973). 139-146.
was retold in the vernacular by Feng Menglong,²⁴⁸ and included in his great storybook *Comprehensive Words to Warn the World* (Jingshi Tongyan 《警世通言》) under the current title.²⁴⁹ The vernacular story became so popular thereafter that “there is not a man, woman, or child in China who has not heard of Miss Tu [Du] Number Ten [shiniang] and her jewels.”²⁵⁰ The powerful force of this tragedy has kept this tale popular for generations; it has been rewritten several times since the Ming dynasty. There are also local opera versions and modern drama and movie versions. The most recent movie of “Miss Du Shiniang” was produced in 2003 by the famous Hongkong director Du Guoweii.

In 1950, for the first time, this story was brought to the English world by Lin Yutang in *Widow, Nun and Courtesan*. It was the force of her tragic story which motivated Lin to share this tale with his English readers. However, Lin did not simply translate this tale, as several other translators²⁵¹ did later, or, partly translate and partly adapt, as he did in “Widow Chuan” and “A Nun of Tainshan.” Instead, he kept only the outline of the events and the main characters and rewrote it completely, and gave it a new title “Miss Du.” Lin did not speak directly about why he did this. In the “Introduction” to *Widow, Nun, Courtesan*, he briefly explains his concerns about translating and rewriting literary works cross-culturally,

I have chosen to translate or rewrite these principally as good stories because reading each of them was a memorable experience for me. I have been thinking, however, that presented in English dress, the backgrounds of these stories must be more striking to Western readers than to Chinese readers, for they reveal Chinese institutions and manners and morals. (*Widow, Nun, Courtesan* v)

²⁴⁷ According to Song Maocheng, he had “heard the real incident from a friend.” He classified this story in the category of biographies in his book *Chiu-yueh chi*, attempting to convince his readers that the story he told was a true one.

²⁴⁸ Feng Menglong (1574-1646), one of the most important and productive writers and editors in later Ming China.

²⁴⁹ Feng changed the story significantly when he collected it in 1624 in *Jingshi Tongyan*. The story became extremely popular after it was rewritten by Feng. Feng Menglong therefore has been often misidentified as the original author of this story.


In 1935, Lin wrote of the phenomenon of courtesan and concubinage in China in *My Country and My People*. By choosing to rewrite Du Shiniang’s story, Lin must have intended to continue his exploration of a courtesan’s life and fate, examining how a love which develops in the pleasure place tragically ends when one attempts to enter ‘normal’ life. Du Shiniang’s case allowed him to probe the social roots of this tragedy, and the extent to which a courtesan was able to challenge society. Meanwhile, he was also concerned with rendering a good story successfully into English. The same concern is reflected in the preface to *Famous Chinese Short Stories* (1952), another Chinese storybook he retold in English:

In rendering these stories into English, I have not confined my duties to those of a translator. I have sometimes found translation impossible. The differences in language, in customs and practices that could be taken for granted and those which have to be explained, in the reader’s natural sympathies for this or that character, and above all in the pace and technique of modern story-telling—all these make it necessary that stories be retold in a new version [...]. (*Famous xv*)

These concerns provide important references for investigating the reasons behind Lin’s decision to rewrite the story of Du Shiniang, and his politics and strategies in reconstructing it into English. In comparing Lin’s rewritten novella “Miss Du” with the old Chinese tale “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger,” I was amazed by the dramatic changes and additions that Lin had made to the original.

In the process of my investigation, the image of Marguerite Gautier from *The Lady of the Camellias* [*La Dame Aux Camelias*] came to mind. The joy and sorrow, the passion and tragedy of Maguerite and Du Shiniang are similar. To find an appropriate narrative analogue for the source text is critical for a cross-cultural rewriter to domesticate the source text in the target culture. In the case of rewriting Du Shiniang’s story, Lin, perhaps, intended to present a ‘Chinese Lady of Camellias’ to his English readers by using Marguerite as an analogue.

252 Lin’s concerns are correspondent to the critical points Andre Lefevere (1945-1996) proposes in his cross-cultural translation theory. He examines the major difficulties a translator may encounter in cross-cultural translation and emphasizes that rewriting is sometimes necessary due to the differences on the levels of ideology, poetics, universe of discourse and language. See Andre Lefevere, *Translating Literature: Practice and Theory in a Comparative Literature Context* (New York: The Modern Language Association of America, 1992). 87-88.

Similar to symbiosis in the natural world, cross-cultural symbiosis exists as well. Although these literary texts appeared in different historical periods and in different languages, they are interrelated in certain distinctive ways. The Lady of the Camellias is a novel about the tragic romance of a Parisian courtesan, Marguerite Gautier, who falls in love with a young man named Armand, and dies of tuberculosis one year after she is forced by Armand’s father to be separated from her lover. The novel was written by Alexandre Dumas Jr. (1824-1895), one of the most significant French novelists and dramatists of late nineteenth century. The novel caused an immediate sensation in France, and was soon transformed into theatrical and operatic versions.\textsuperscript{254} It was translated into many languages (including Chinese) and became one of literature’s great tragic love stories.\textsuperscript{255} The story continued its legendary fame into the modern age; the 1936 film version with Greta Garbo brought its popularity to a new height.\textsuperscript{256} For modern readers in the West, The Lady of the Camellias was a tale they were very familiar with.

It is obvious that Lin perceived this cross-cultural symbiosis between the stories of Chinese and French courtesans. The tragic force common to these two tales enhanced his motive to tell this Chinese story for English readers in hopes that readers would link the two courtesans’ fates, and contemplate the societal strictures which caused these tragedies. By taking The Lady of the Camellias as analogue, Lin hoped to increase the acceptability of the Chinese tale in the West.

In the process of investigation, however, the image of Nun Yiyun, as well as that of famous courtesans from Chinese history also came to mind. Obviously, Lin did not intend to present merely an imitation of the ‘French Camillia,’ but a story which represented the life and fate of a courtesan in Chinese culture. Since rewriting is different from creative writing, Lin must set his ‘feet’ of imagination and creativity on the ‘earth’ of the original story. It thus becomes important to examine how Lin modernizes the story to appeal to Western readers by taking Dumas’s novel as an analogue, meanwhile

\textsuperscript{254} A theatrical version by Dumas Jr. in 1851 and an opera version by Verdi in 1853.
\textsuperscript{255} The novel was rendered into classic Chinese in 1897 by Lin Shu (1852-1924) as \textit{Bali Chahuansu yishi}, 巴黎茶花女轶事, and caused an immediate sensation among the reading public. It initiated a profound change in the trend of Chinese romantic fiction. Lin Yutang mentioned that he read this translation together with his second sister when he was in middle school. See Taiyi Lin, \textit{Lin Yutang Zhuan} [Biography of Lin Yutang] (Taiyuan: Beiyue Wenyi, 1994), 7.
\textsuperscript{256} \textit{Camille}, Hollywood Movie in 1938.
presenting an image of a distinctly Chinese courtesan, based on his understanding and knowledge of the professional courtesan’s life and fate in traditional China.

B. Narrative Changes and their Positive Impact on the Image of Miss Du

Inspired by Dumas’s interwoven narrative voices, Lin made striking changes to Feng Menglong’s “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger.” The twenty page short story was transformed into an eighty-three page modern English novella with: vivid descriptive settings, a captivating initial situation, a series of increasingly complicated incidents, a climax, and finally, a significant resolution. The third person omniscient obtrusive narrative voice is changed into the first person limited, double-narrative voices. Letters and diaries are added to provide personal and psychological narrative voices. Feng’s story is told in chronological order, but “Miss Du” starts with the events after Du Shiniang’s death, and then allows the main narrator, Liu Yuchun, to trace the whole tragic romance between his friend Li and Miss Du. This newly structured narrative mode provides a freer space for Lin to reconstruct the image of Miss Du.

First, the title of the story is changed from “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger” to “Miss Du.” The former is a typical “action-oriented” title, commonly used by Chinese storytellers to attract the attention of the audience, while the new title is “character oriented,” similar to that of “Madame Bovary” or “La Dame Aux Camelias.” The change of the title signifies the switch from the narrative mode, the traditional Chinese storytelling style, to the modern English narrative fashion. In addition, “Miss Du” suggests youthful innocence while the other title makes her sound powerful—which she really is not, except for her one brazen act.

Lin designs double-narrative voices in “Miss Du”: one is a respected old writer’s, who speaks as “I”, and the other is Liu Yuchun’s, the personal friend and witness of the protagonists. The “I” narrator establishes a frame for the whole narration. He listens to the main narrator Liu Yuchun tell the story, and offers his own views and feelings to the reader. This design is clearly inspired by the two narrative voices in The Lady of the Camellias: one voice being the “I” narrator, representing Dumas’s authorial voice, the other voice being the male protagonist Armand, who is directly involved in the tragic love affair. The “I” witnesses Miss Du’s suicide and wants to know more about the story.
He is also involved in building a memorial temple after the tragic incident, and functions as an organizer of the basic narrative structure. This "I" figure (a writer), entirely created by Lin, is clearly representative of Lin's own authorial voice. By creating this voice, Lin effectively presents his own perspective on this tragedy and his deep sympathy towards both the female and male protagonists. For instance, at the beginning of the story, this writer expresses his thoughts on the tragic event, his thoughts on love, morality, and the unfortunate fates of courtesans in general. He also describes his impression of Miss Du before she jumped into the river:

[...] the image of Miss Tu, calm and dignified, tossing herself into the river, came back to me. At that moment, she seemed like a spirit. She was standing on the bow, erect and proud like a statue, or like a young maiden about to be sacrificed on the altar of love. [...] The morning sun was shining on her glistening jewels and her small, white, young face, set off by her jet-black beautiful high coiffure done in several coils on the top. She wore a pink bridal gown with an embroidered cape of pale blue slapping in the wind, and below flowed the strong icy current glittering in the December sun. No one else ever went to her death like that. The powerful current carried her swiftly out of reach of the rescuers. ("Tu" 186-87)

The other narrator of this story, Liu Yuchun, the male protagonist's only personal friend in Peking, was originally part of Feng Menglong's version, but his role in Lin's version is much enhanced. His narration becomes the mainstay of the rewritten story. His passionate voice creates an atmosphere of deep sadness and remorse, enhancing the tragic effect and increasing the reader's sympathy. "Here my narrator's voice choked, and I saw that his eyes were wet. Soon he buried his face in his hands and sobbed in convulsions" ("Tu" 249). Liu Yuchun also gives frequent comments on the Miss Du's tragic love to his friend Li Xiaming:

Miss Tu need not have died if she had loved less greatly. To change lovers, to discard one and take up the next is part of the life of a courtesan. If Miss Tu had been older, she might not have loved so whole-heartedly, so passionately, and she would have been more callous. [...] It is because she loved so truly, and built her entire dream world upon love that when the dream vanished, her world collapsed around her and she had no other choice but death. ("Tu" 203)

Both the "I" narrator and the main narrator in this story thus play significant roles in creating lyric power, controlling the readers' reaction to the tragic story and their view of Miss Du.

The discovery of Du Shiniang's poems and letters after her death is another
significant invention by Lin Yutang. This seems to be inspired by Marguerite’s diaries. These letters and poems provide an important personal voice for Du Shiniang, reflecting her thoughts and feelings, while also demonstrating Miss Du’s talent in writing poetry. The reader’s empathy for her is enhanced by her own words. The reliability and authenticity of the story is also increased.

The name of the male protagonist is changed from Li Jia to Li Xiaming. The change indicates Lin Yutang’s new perspective on the young man’s personal character and fate. In Feng’s version, the storyteller’s voice is fairly critical of Li Jia’s ingratitude and betrayal. One of the purposes of this story is to admonish people not to follow him: “Li was no less than a common fool to have failed to appreciate Shih-niang [Shiniang]’s heart. For this he was not even worth one’s contempt” ("Du Shiniang" 160). But in “Miss Du,” Lin demonstrates strong sympathy towards Li. Both the old writer’s and Liu Yuchun’s narrative voices speak of him as a victim of “grand passion” ("Tu" 206), and of patriarchal society. In order to secure the reader’s sympathy for him, Lin tries to exonerate Li, partly by changing his reasons for betraying Miss Du, and by portraying him as someone who deserves Du’s love. For this purpose, Lin adds another powerful patriarchal figure, Li’s uncle, and has him directly threaten Li Xiaming. The merchant’s name Sun Fu is changed by Lin to “Merchant Mao Number Three.” His role and involvement are also increased. He is not only an important old customer of Miss Ou, but also the evil designer for the intrigue which fatally traps Miss Du. Mao Number Three represents the growing power of the new bourgeois class which is influential in Miss Du’s suicide.

A new ending is notably added to the rewritten novella. Feng Menglong’s version ends in “heavenly retribution,” in which Liu Yuchun is repaid by ghost Du Shiniang for his assistance, Sun Fu is fatally punished for his evil intention, and Li Jia goes insane with regret. In his new version, Lin deletes the ghostly retribution of Du Shiniang; instead, he has a memorial temple for Miss Du built by Li’s father, near the river where she dies, in order to propitiate Miss Du’s spirit. Twenty years later, an insane monk

In the novel, Marguerite asks her friend Julie Duprat to give the diaries to Armand after her death. Marguerite’s personal voice constitutes almost the last three chapters of La Dame Aux Camelias, in which she recounts how Armand’s father persuaded her to give up the love, and how she suffers and longs for Armand during her illness. Dumas, The Lady of the Camellias, 292.
(supposedly Li Xiaming) appears in the temple to worship the portrait of Miss Du, and later burns himself to death in destroying the temple. These changes reduce the heroic nature of Miss Du, making her weaker and gentler. It also romanticizes and makes the whole story more tragic.

C. Recreating Courtesan Culture in Ming China and Enhancing its Accessibility

Andere Lefevere, in his theory of cross-cultural translation and rewriting, emphasizes the importance of creating understanding for prospective readers:

Certain features of the author’s universe of discourse may have become unintelligible to the target audience, either because they no longer exist or because they have acquired different meanings. Translators must either substitute analogous features from the target culture’s universe of discourse or try to re-create the author’s universe of discourse as best they can in a preface, in footnotes, or—what is most frequently done—in both. (Translating Literature 87)

Although “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger” is a story about a courtesan’s life and fate, it touches only briefly upon the customs and practice of courtesan culture, as it is a short story and was written for readers in Ming dynasty China. To most contemporary readers, courtesan life is quite mysterious and unintelligible. Since this is a novella, not an introduction to Chinese culture, Lin chooses to integrate cultural information into the narrative as naturally as possible, and he adds new scenes to the story in order to do so.

Lin introduces the nature of a courtesan’s life through Liu Yuchun. Liu is a relatively sophisticated young man who has had some experience with courtesans. However, when he and Li Xiaming first met Miss Du in the countryside, he was not sure who Miss Du was.

Who is she? I asked myself. She was too outspoken to be a family girl, too cultivated to be a cheap prostitute, but too simply dressed to be a high-class courtesan [. . .]. Her turning back so soon after us, from whatever motive, did make her look a little cheap in my mind, and I began to wonder if she was not a “half-open door,” that is, a private independent prostitute. The presence of the woman and the absence of any man accompanying her increased this impression. ("Tu" 199-200)

By following Liu Yuchun’s observations and introduction, readers are introduced to different types of courtesans in Ming dynasty China. Liu asks the doorkeeper of the
temple whether the woman with Miss Du is her real mother. The doorkeeper answers, “No. She is Madam Tu [Du]. You know it is the custom for the girl to call her ‘mother.’” ("Tu" 202).

The relationship between courtesan and procuress in Chinese custom, on the surface, was like a mother and daughter, but it was actually a financial relationship between an owner and her precious commodity. In describing the relation between Madame Du and Miss Du, Lin cites the ancient proverb in English, which says, “The girl loves the lover’s dash, but the madam loves the cash” ("Tu" 215). He also uses a vivid Chinese term “shake-coin tree,” to illustrate the business: “There were three or four other girls in the establishment, but none could earn as much as Miss Tu Number Ten, who was her ‘shake-coin tree.’ All she needed was to shake the tree, and silver coins would drop like leaves into her lap” ("Tu" 220).

Liu Yuchun later reveals:

Miss Tu belonged to the top seven or eight in the Chiaofangyuan, or Court of Musicians of Peking. She was generally known as “Miss Tu Number Ten,” as girls are addressed according to their seniority in the house, but her name is Wei. Tu is her mother’s name. After we knew her well, we used to call her “Wei-niang.” We learned that after her parents’ death she was sold, at the age of fifteen, by a vicious sister-in-law. Resigned to her fate, and trained in her profession, she soon grew very popular with her songs, her lute, and her personal charms. ("Tu" 204)

There is a custom called “tea rounds” in the pleasure quarters. Lin adds this custom to his version to explain why “an affair with such a well-known courtesan would be preposterous, unthinkable” ("Tu" 204),

258 In Chinese: 搖錢樹.
259 Here Lin Yutang makes a mistake in pronunciation. Du Shiniang’s name, as given by Feng Menglong, is “Mei,薇” not “Wei,薇.” These two characters have similar appearance. This mistake is similar to one he makes in Widow Chuang, he pronounces the Hero Quan Dachu (全大杵) as Quan Dawu (全大杵), because 杵 and 杵 also look similar. These two characters are seldom used, and are not pronounced by following the pictophonetic rules. This shows the complicated aspects of Chinese character combination and pronunciation. There are always exceptions. It seems that, even with as knowledgeable a scholar and translator as Lin, one should be always be cautious, and double check before publishing the translation.
us make the “tea rounds.” You go in with someone who knows the place, say which one you wish to see, are ushered to her room. There you meet the girl, have a cup of tea, talk gossip for a while, ask her to sing for you if you like, and go on to see another one. Before you make a round of four or five tea calls, the evening is up. Some of the students become steady friends of the girls when they can spend money on them. But we are limited by our allowances and cannot write home for money without some very plausible reason. ("Tu" 205)

By integrating detailed explanations in the story, readers gain a better understanding of the courtesan’s life in Ming dynasty China.

D. Strategies in Idealizing and Romanticizing the Image of Miss Du

1. A Celebrated and Multi-talented Courtesan

Higher-class courtesans, as Lin points out, were tradition peculiar to China. “Many of them were gifted, and those who understood reading and writing and were accomplished in music and song were very much sought after by the scholars” (Genius 153). Du Shiniang’s fame, beauty and her artistic talents are only briefly described in two short poems in Feng’s version ("Du Shiniang" 147). Lin creates magnificent scenes and rich details, displaying her life of grand extravagance, and how much she was sought after by rich men and famous poets, and how well cultivated and talented she was in poetry and music. From these rich descriptions Lin reconstructs a new image of Du Shiniang.

a. A Courtesan of Celebrated Fame

In introducing Du Shiniang, Lin imagines some details of how she becomes famous.

A rich official of one of the ministries had offered to redeem her and take her as his concubine, but she had turned him down. Then you know that by accident the poet Shih Meiyu was struck by her beauty and wrote some lines in her praise. She was only seventeen then. Immediately she became famous. People begged to be introduced to her and called on her just to see her. Her evenings were never unoccupied and she was invited to attend dinners of high officials. A long line of carriages always stood before her gate, the lights of her house glared in the streets, and Madam Tu made a lot of money. ("Tu" 204)

This refusal adds an interesting dimension to Miss Du’s character, making her proud and stubborn, and shows her strong desire to control her own life. Being a
concubine in a rich family was a dream for many courtesans who wanted to get out of their profession, but this is not to be Miss Du’s dream. The rise of Miss Du’s fame due to the poet’s description of her beauty and talent adds legendary color to her, and justifies why she is the one that other courtesans “all looked up to” (“Du Shiniang” 152). “The practice of writing poems in honor of certain courtesans was quite common even among highly respected gentlemen.” (Y. Lin Genius 153). But, nonetheless, these details serve to convince the reader that Miss Du is no ordinary courtesan.

Lin adds details such as “people began to say that she was proud and hard to approach” (“Tu” 204) and “she was getting a reputation for being both expensive and fickle” (“Tu” 223). These details illustrates why she is estimated to be “the most prized courtesan in her profession,” and why her price of redemption “couldn’t be less than ten pecks of pearls and a thousand taels in cash” (“Du Shiniang” 150), thus portraying her as arrogant and as having some power of choice.

b. A Talented Poetess

In Feng’s version, we are not told whether Du Shiniang could write poems. Yet considering Du’s high rank in the pleasure quarters of the capital city during Ming dynasty, it is logical that such a celebrated courtesan could also be a poetess. Lin explains that these poems “are taken from courtesans’ songs of the period” (Introduction to Widow, Nun, Courtesan vi). It is convincing for Du Shiniang to write poems, as it is historically true that late Ming dynasty courtesans played an exceptionally active role in writing poetry. As Idema and Grant point out, “We have to wait until the final decades of the Ming before we see these courtesans once again playing a major role in the development of women’s literature” (333). There are a few famous courtesan poetesses of the Ming dynasty, such as Liang Xiaoyu, Jin Pianpian, Ma Xiaolan, Liu Shi. Most of their surviving poems are collected in the Collected Poems of the Successive Dynasties, compiled by Qian Qianyi and Liu Shi (Idema and Grant 359-82). The poems that Lin designs for Miss Du, in form, style, and content, are very similar to the ones written by these courtesans. “Scholarly critics would say that she was crude and uncultivated, that she lisped rather than sang, but how genuine and deeply felt were her lisplings!” (“Tu” 211-12).
Lin makes Miss Du a poetess to suggest a sensitive intelligence. Her poems are heartfelt, reveal the depth of her love and her determination. They also give added dimension to her character.

Let me now pay with torrent of tears,
in recompense for his great love.
And even if his heart should now be faithless,
for all the world I would not miss the nights we had. ("Tu" 213)

Reading her poems, Liu Yuchun says to Li Xiaming: “This is genuine stuff, better than all those fake love poems the thin-blooded scholars try to write, better than all of them” ("Tu" 211). These poems also move Li Xiaming’s father. After Miss Du’s suicide, he discovers them and is so touched that he builds a temple to her. Thus, the reader’s sympathy and admiration for Miss Du are increased.

c. A Musician and an Artistic Performer

In order to display how the talented courtesans “carried on the musical tradition of the country” (My Country 162), Lin invents several scenes to demonstrate Miss Du’s musical talent, from singing to a lute performance ("Tu" 197, 226-27, 48). The most impressive scene is her lute performance. It not only demonstrates her artistic talent, her celebrated fame in the world of demimonde, but also shows her sadness and loneliness.

Miss Du invites Li Xiaming and Liu Yuchun to see her perform on the day of the Dragon Boat Festival, the day when “singsong artists, actors, and musicians were invited to sing or perform at the Terrace” ("Tu" 223). When Li Xiaming and Liu Yuchun arrive, they are overwhelmed by the celebratory atmosphere of the grande festival. Here Lin’s splendid description of the gathering of the upper class with famous courtesans is similar to Dumas’ portrayal of the atmosphere of the Parisian demimonde in the theatres where Marguerite has her own stage box.

This was a highly critical audience, camp followers, I may say, of the demimonde, who can recount to you all the past history and intimate affairs of the individual courtesans, and know whose mouth is the smallest, whose teeth are the whitest, and whose feet the smallest. ("Tu" 224-25)

When Miss Du appears, “[...] all eyes were turned in her direction.”

She advanced to the middle of the stage, bowed slightly to the audience, and announced in her clear girlish voice: “[...] I shall sing ‘The Plaint of Chaochun’.” [...] Lightly she plucked the strings of the lute, in a gentle and quiet opening. The
audience hushed in dead silence. Then the pace quickened and the quick rattling of her fingers dazzled by their speed, as a fast, impatient strain issued from the instrument, like a rain of teardrops, suggesting some deep, unfathomable turmoil of the heart. [...] Then the voice came distinctly and more distinctly, in a strange, plaintive melody, descended a little and picked up again, in a series of persuasive crescendos, as if it were searching, trying and timid, until it was sure of itself. [...] the music of the instrument resounded, sure, steady, getting ever louder and quicker, and her voice climbed with it. Up and down, in graceful, appealing rises, it carried the audience with it. It remained suspended at the top, and then began to descend in a sort of swinging rhythm, like a bird gliding down from a mountaintop following the loops and circles of a winding ravine toward the valley. ("Tu" 226-27)

This paragraph reminds us of a famous description of Little Jade Wang's musical performance in Chapter two of Liu E's The Travels of Laoan. Lin takes Liu E's description as an analogue for his own presentation of the song, tune, and atmosphere. Lin illustrates the sound of melody, the singing voice--its rise, fall, turning and peak, all in figurative speech and brilliant images; the audience's responses are vividly depicted in order to set off the performance. However, this is not just an imitation of Liu E's work; the description created by Lin radiates its own intensity. As Miss Du announces, her performance is "The Plaint of Zhaojun." Wang Zhaojun, an unfortunate imperial concubine in Han dynasty, was a famous "neglected beauty" in Chinese history. She was mistakenly banished by the Han emperor to remote Mongolia to marry a Tartar chieftain as one of his conditions for peace. Her story has moved generations of Chinese readers; no one could "refrain from sighing and weeping after reading Wang Zhaojun's story if he believed his inner worth was as great as hers, and felt as frustrated and lonely as she did" (Yang 123). "The Plaint of Zhaojun," is a song describing Zhaojun’s sad departure from the palace. Lin, however, uses this musical performance to describe Miss Du’s inner world and character. Her vulnerability to failure and shame are reflected "in a series of

260 See the following paragraph: "[...] Little Jade Wang then opened her vermilion lips, [...] At first the sound was not very loud, but you felt an inexpressible magic enter your ears, [...] After the first few phrases her song rose higher and louder till suddenly she drew her voice up to a sharp high-pitched note like a thread of steel wire thrown into the vault of the sky, you could not help secretly applauding. [...] after several turns her voice again began to rise, making three or four successive folds in the melody, each one higher than the last. It was like climbing T'ashan from the western face of the Aolai Peak. [...] suddenly her voice dropped, and then at a powerful spirited gallop, in a short time, with a thousand twists and turns she described innumerable circles like a flying serpent writhing and turning among the thirty-six peaks of The Yellow Mountains [...]" E Liu, The Travels of Lao Ts'an, trans. Harold Shadick (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1952). 27-28.
persuasive crescendos, as if it were searching, trying and timid, until it was sure of itself.” Her increased confidence is expressed when “the music of the instrument resounded, sure, steady, getting ever louder and quicker, and her voice climbed with it.” Her wish for freedom to become a bird, above it all--is shown in her “swinging rhythm, like a bird gliding down from a mountaintop following the loops and circles of a winding ravine toward the valley.”

Playing music is often interpreted in Chinese as an act of self-expression, and of looking for a zhiyin, a true listener who understands the tune. Miss Du’s musical performance mingles her personal identity with Zhaochun’s and expresses her hope that the man she loves would understand her. Lin borrows Zhaojun’s story to cause the reader “correlative thinking” on Du Shiniang’s fate: she might not be able to meet the right man, and the man she meets might cause her misfortune. The image of Miss Du as a splendid yet desolate courtesan is thus rooted in the reader’s mind. As Liu Yuchun comments, “You see, the most popular courtesan is still the loneliest and most friendless woman in the world” ("Tu" 209).

2. A Romantic and Sentimental Lover

The romantic relationship between Du Shiniang and Li Jia is briefly described in Feng’s version ("Du Shiniang" 147-48), but is not supported with details. Lin develops many aspects of the romance: how they meet and instantly fall in love, how they become inseparable, and how they finally vow to be husband and wife. In Lin’s version, Miss Du, and Li Xiaming become romantic and sentimental lovers that readers might recognize from their own experience of hopes.

a. A Nature-lover with Simple and Innocent Heart

In Lin’s version, the lovers meet for the first time in a natural landscape instead of in the pleasure quarters as in Feng’s version. This setting not only adds romantic color to the meeting, by allowing them to indulge in the beauty of the landscape, but also highlights the dignified elements of pure love, in contrast to the sheer financial transaction of purchased sex. It places the lovers on more equal footing. Miss Du appears as a nature lover. On that quiet and sunny winter day, she is on the river, “reclining in her boat in that hidden recess, biting a reed stalk in her mouth” ("Tu" 197), and singing
songs. Li Xiaming and Liu Yuchun are captivated by a girl in such a scene and think that "[...] She was perhaps seeking the innocent joys of a lost childhood, the sight of the open sky, the smell of the soil and of plants, the sounds of birds, the lights of the water, and the colors of the distant hills. [...]" ("Tu" 200).

Connecting love with nature is an important characteristic of Western Romanticism. Here we recognize how Lin romanticizes the image of a Chinese courtesan by portraying her as a nature lover, and this seems to be inspired by Marguerite’s love of the countryside life. A romantic nature lover suggests a pure heart. Thus Miss Du is presented as a tender innocent girl who is forced into the wrong lifestyle, yet has not lost her good qualities. As Liu Yuchun recalls, "Although Miss Tu [Du] was very much in love, she never permitted exhibitions of it in my presence. Once Shia-ming kissed her, and she pouted her lips and blushed all over, which was quite surprising to me in a woman of her profession" ("Tu" 231). Though Miss Du lives in the splendid “gold-melting den” ("Tu" 207), and works as a “money tree,” she is still shy and naïve. This adds an unusual charm and nobility to her nature.

b. A Sentimental Lover Living in the Shadow of Fate

Lin adds other new scenes designed to enrich and deepen the emotional life of Miss Du’s character. The most moving new scene related to her inner world is her visit to the Fragrant Tomb. Her despair and sense of foreboding, are all expressed at this time.

The Fragrant Tomb was the tomb of a singing girl named Jingyun who had committed suicide when her romance with a poor scholar was thwarted ("Tu" 233).261 When Miss Du cries, Liu Yuchun muses that “Perhaps a shock that touched the innermost depths of her heart because the grave was also that of a professional singer. This similarity must have reminded her of her own heart problems and predicament” ("Tu" 234). The poem inscribed on the tomb by the courtesan’s lover is inscribed on Shiniang’s mind as well:

The world is a sea of sorrow, Human life a succession of woes.

---

261 The origin of the “Fragrant Tomb” could be the tomb of the famous courtesan Su Xiaoxiao in Hangzhou, which many young people visit every year. Su Xiaoxiao was an exceptionally beautiful and celebrated courtesan who lived in Southern Qi dynasty (南齐 479－502) and died at nineteen when her romance with a poor scholar was thwarted. Lin must have felt the same sympathy toward the two courtesans and invented this important scene to portray the inner depth of Miss Du’s sentimental heart.
The short song is ended. The round moon is chipped. 
In this beautiful city with green foliage, there is a pool of jade blood. 
The jade cannot be preserved forever, and the blood in time runs out. 
Only a coil of her fragment spirit remains afloat 
Is this reality or illusion—
A butterfly dream, true only when it lasts? ("Tu" 248)

Miss Du suspects that the singsong girls’ story foreshadows her own fate. This 
poem becomes the song Shiniang performs in the moonlight on the river when they are 
on their way to Li Xiaming’s hometown. This visit to the tomb and the singing of the 
poem enhance the tragic tone of the story, and link Miss Du’s fate to the singsong girl. 
Lin highlights her sensitivity and talent when she translates the poem into a song. Miss 
Du may well have been begging her love to make her fate different from the singsong 
girl’s. In Feng Menglong’s version, Shiniang also sings a song at the request of Li Jia. 
“Her song was about a scholar offering wine to a girl. It was taken from the play Moon 
Pavilion by Shih Chun-mei of the Yuan dynasty and was set to the tune of ‘The Little 
Red Peach Blossom’” ("Du Shiniang" 154). However, as Hanan points out, “in that song 
she expresses only her ‘happy mood,’ not the deep strain of nostalgia and melancholy of 
‘The Faithless Lover.’” ("The Making” 152). It is therefore significant that Lin changes 
the content of the song even though he is not aware of Song Maocheng’s version. In this 
way he reinstates the nostalgia and melancholy Du Shiniang would have felt at that 
moment.

Miss Du’s feelings are similar to Marguerite’s sentimental reaction to the book 
Manon Lescaut. Manon Lescaut, a novel about a courtesan’s love and death, was written 
in 1731 by French novelist Abbe Prevost. It plays an important role in Dumas’ The Lady 
of the Camellias, working as an analogue for Dumas’ novel. To a certain degree 
Marguerite’s life is analogical to Manon’s.

---

262 The poem inscribed on the Fragrant Tomb tablet (Lin created it), in style and meaning, is also similar to 
the poem written by Tang poet Li He (790-816) “On the Tomb of Su Xiaoxiao”: “Dew on the secluded 
orchid, like crying eyes. Nothing to bind the heart to, misted flowers I can not bear to cut. Grass like a 
cushion, the pine like a parasol. The wind is a skirt, the waters tinkling pendants. A coach with 
lacquered sides, waits for someone in the evening. Cold candle in blue flames, strain to shine bright. 
Beneath West Mound, The wind blows the rain.” In original Chinese, 李贺 (Li He)《苏小小墓》: “幽兰 
露，如啼眼。无物结同心，烟花不堪剪。草如茵，松如盖。风为裳，水为佩。油壁车，夕相侍。 
冷翠烛，劳光彩。西陵下，风吹雨。” Shih [Poetry], Yillionaire Enterprises LLC, Available: 
Both Marguerite and Miss Du are soberly aware of their alienated positions and live in enormous solitude. Marguerite frequently says "a woman like me" to indicate her unfortunate character. Miss Du calls herself a "wayside rose" which can be "plucked by any stranger" ("Tu" 238). Both foresee their misfortunes. As Miss Du says, "It's all Karma. And we girls are the sacrifice" ("Tu" 219). These added details reveal Lin's sympathy for these women. He recognizes the sacrifices these women made.

c. An Eloquent Speaker and Philosophic Thinker

Similar to the Du Shiniang in Feng's version, Miss Du is very independent, more mature and decisive than her lover, and quite dominant in their relationship. However, in contrast to Feng Menglong's, Lin's Miss Du appears to be more open, warm-hearted, more expressive (even talkative), and philosophical.

Du Shiniang in Feng's version seems "impassive" and enigmatic (Hanan "The Making" 152). This is probably because she seldom speaks, except in her heroic tirade near the end of the story. Lin designs several occasions to let Miss Du speak. When Li Xiaming and Liu Yuchun accidentally meet Du Shiniang on the river, they are amazed by her free laugh, her brazen and witty responses, and her manner of speaking "with an extraordinary freedom" ("Tu" 198). When both young men are invited to Miss Du's quarter, they are further impressed by her intelligence and frankness ("Tu" 208). Miss Du maintains an active communication with Li Xiaming and Liu Yuchun. Liu Yuchun is designed in Lin's version to be an admirer and ally of Miss Du, and a good listener for Miss Du's confidences.

Lin believes that women's emancipation should begin with letting women's own voices be heard. He claims that forbidding women to speak is basically forbidding women to think ("Nü Lunyu" 83). Therefore he sharpens Miss Du's tongue and lets her express herself on many occasions.

Miss Du's words reflect profound thoughts of her own alienation and of women's fate in general.

But I would be happy if I could get out of this life altogether. [...] this is a short and unhappy life I am leading, burning the candle at both ends. [...] This mill will grind any poor girl's life out in ten years. [...] To drink, to laugh, to sing, to be gay, every night of the three hundred sixty-five nights in the year! And you try to be witty and flatter your guests and stand for their jokes and innuendos and let
those filthy drink-smelling, oily-faced, rich sons of asses and grandsons of monkeys whom you would gladly kick under the table think they are having the grandest time of their lives! ("Tu" 218)

Allowing Miss Du to speak for herself increases the reader’s compassion for her and make it clear why she struggles hard for a better life.

Miss Du’s expressiveness reminds us of Marguerite. According to Armand, Marguerite is open-minded, talkative, and sometimes even mocks her customers. Perhaps Miss Du’s and Marguerite’s desire for self-expression is related to their marginalized positions in society.

In Miss Du’s speeches, we also hear the voice of the nun Yiyun.

Honestly, I am surprised why the world never runs out of rich and ugly oily-mouthed sons of asses. It's all Karma. And we girls are the sacrifice. I have often wondered. Sometimes I think Grandfather Heaven distributes his favors all fair and square. Those whom Heaven makes rich are ugly and stupid. And those whom Heaven makes talented and handsome are poor. ("Tu" 219)

This is similar to Yiyun’s thoughts during those sleepless nights when she is considering whether she should spend her first night with Mr. Horse or Mr. Ox:

I thought of the other frequenters of the temple besides these two, and all I can say is, those who have money don’t look like human beings and those who look like human beings haven’t any money. And so I began to understand life a little. It seemed to me Old Father Heaven values money and the human shape equally. That’s why, if He gives a person money, then He doesn’t give him a human shape; and if He makes him look like a human being, than He doesn’t give him any money. This seemed so clear to me. ("Nun" 144-45)

Translating Liu E’s “A Nun of Taishan” had an obvious impact on Lin’s rewriting of Du Shiniang’s story. Lin seems inspired by Yiyun in his reconstruction of Miss Du. Yiyun’s experience and thoughts form an underlying contrast to Miss Du’s. Both are dreamers, imagining a true love who would marry and rescue them and rescue them. But while Yiyun thinks of the possibilities to fulfill her “red dust” dreams in her sleepless thoughts, Miss Du struggles in reality to make her dreams come true. Many of Yiyun’s dreams are put into practice in Miss Du’s life. For instance, Yiyun thinks of the idea of spending her first night with Mr. Ox or Mr. Horse, and letting one of them pay handsomely, so that thereafter she could enjoy her nights with Ren Sanye, yet she does not follow through on
this plan. However, Miss Du does implement such a plan, and that is how she meets the rich salt merchant Mr. Mao Number Three, who brings on the fatal disaster.

The last dream Yiyun has before her awakening is about marriage. "I dreamed how I would be a good wife, and how I would have two sons, [...]" ("Tu" 147). This must have been Miss Du's dream too. However, while Yiyun awakens from this last dream, Miss Du meets her death when her dream fails. In contrast to Yiyun, Miss Du has no choice but to chase her dream until her fate becomes unavoidable.

After all these skilful reconstructions and manipulations, the image of Du Shiniang appears significantly new in Lin's version. She is as determined and proud as the character in Feng’s version, but also more lovable, romantic, and human, as she incorporates Lin's ideal of what a famous Ming dynasty courtesan should be. She is unusually talented in poetry and music; she is romantic, sentimental and philosophical; she is splendid yet desolate.

E. Problems Created by Lin’s Reconstruction and the Impact on the Image of Miss Du

Rewriting the story of Du Shiniang by analogizing The Lady of the Camellias helps Lin Yutang establish a new narrative mode in English, and to express many of his own ideals and thoughts. Miss Du and Li Xiaming are significantly idealized and romanticized. The story is changed and becomes more intelligible to Western readers. However, this rewriting also creates some new problems which affects the image of Miss Du. In my view, the most serious problem created by Lin in rewriting "Miss Du" is to be found in Du Shiniang’s concealment of her jewel box and Lin’s invented creation of a temple for Miss Du.

1. The Concealed Jewel Box and its Impact on Miss Du

The concealed jewel box is a key plot in the story of Du Shiniang. It was designed by the original author Song Maocheng in "The Faithless Lover." Hanan calls this plot design "a textbook example of reversal and discovery." He believes that this jewel box

263 “Not only are the main character’s thoughts hidden from the reader—that is common enough in the Classical tale—but key facts are hidden as well. Of course, the reader is warned of the terms on which
is designed by the author as a token of Du Shiniang’s love, and hiding her wealth from her lover is reasonable behavior ("The Making" 148).

This plot line is preserved by Feng Menglong in “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger.” However, along with the changes Feng Menglong made to explain the characters of Du Shiniang and Li Jia, Shiniang’s concealment of the jewel box is no longer merely to test her lover’s commitment. It involves the worth of the jewels in the box. In his study of Feng Menglong’s rewriting of “The Faithless Lover,” Hanan reveals that the added details in the vernacular story make Li a more comprehensible figure than in the Classical tale ("The Making" 151-52). The added information about Li’s fear of his father, his emotional involvement in love, and his desperate economic situation, allows readers to understand why he is so hesitant and passive, and why he falls so easily into Sun Fu’s trap. Du Shiniang, by contrast, is “less comprehensible” ("The Making" 152). She is presented as more “calculating” than in the Classical tale. “She had formed the plan to leave the quarter long before, she not only hid her wealth from Li, she even lied to him.” In addition, she appears more impassive: “all the indications of her emotions given in “The Faithless Lover” have been removed or moderated in “The Courtesan’s Jewel Box.” “Where she has been described before as weeping or jubilant or moved or melancholy, she is now presented as impassive. [...]” These changes alter the original intention of Shiniang’s concealment of the jewel box as designed in the Classical tale, adding more economic nuance to this box, and make Shiniang appear more selfish and cunning. But in her tirade, she “accuses Li directly of betraying his vows and lacking faith in her, a charge which rings a little odd after her demonstrated lack of faith in him” ("The Making" 152). Feng Menlong intends to add a more heroic color to her; but his presentation of Shiniang as a woman hero is not convincing. Hanan considers this “the source of the apparent weakness of the story” ("The Making" 152).

The plot of Du Shiniang’s concealment of the jewel box is included in Lin’s version as well. However, with the expansion from a short story to a novella and the dramatic changes made to the characters of Miss Du and Li Xiaming, the concealment of the jewel box becomes more problematic. This is created mainly by Lin’s intention of

the tale is being told; the statement that Shi-niang “appeared not to know” the contents of the chest is a signal of the narrator’s selectivity.” Hanan, "The Making." 147.
idealizing and romanticizing the story by taking *The Lady of the Camellias* as an analogue, and his respect to Feng’s version by following its basic outline, in which the weakness created by Feng was hidden.

**a. Overly Strong Sympathy for Li Xiaming**

In order to idealize the image of Miss Du, Lin also idealizes the image of Li Xiaming. In Lin’s version, Li Xiaming is significantly different from Li Jia in Feng Menglong’s. Li Jia is a frequent visitor of the pleasure quarters and has a wife at home. Li Xiaming, however, “had never looked at a woman” ("Tu" 195). Miss Du is his first love. He is presented by Lin as a romantic and ardent lover, inexperienced and dreamy. Although his character is weak, he impresses readers with his “affectionate and trusting nature” ("Tu" 195). When Li is faced with abandoning his family for Du, Liu Yuchun observes:

> It seemed he had not wanted it that way; he had wanted to carry on with Miss Tu while he was studying, and suddenly he found he had to make a decision to marry her or be cut off from her. [...] A break with his family was unthinkable for Shia-ming [Xiaming]. All he knew was that he wanted Miss Tu [Du], and when Miss Tu said that she was willing to come down with him, he had only one instinct to guide him, the instinct of love. He was almost in tears, and Miss Tu sat there watching him out the corner of her eye, and I detected the faintest sign of disappointment on her face. “What do you say?” asked Miss Tu, affectionately. Shia-ming looked up. “I will do whatever you say.” ("Tu" 245-46)

Here Lin portrays Miss Du as more powerful in the relationship than in Feng’s version. Li Xiaming’s attitude in facing this highly difficult task is more considerate of Miss Du than Li Jia in Feng’s version; his love for Miss Du is also more sincere. Even when he is threatened and cajoled by his uncle until he “went almost completely to pieces,” he still says to his uncle, “I will not give her up!” ("Tu" 253). He collapses only after he has learned that the six hundred dollars Liu Yuchun borrowed for him to redeem Miss Du’s freedom is from Mao Number Three ("Tu" 253-54). He becomes half insane after his uncle threatens him ("Tu" 254). There seems no way out for Li Xiaming, “as if you have lost your bearings in a wood, or as if you find yourself caught in an underground cave, and everywhere you turn, you are confronted with a stone wall” ("Tu" 246). It is under

---

264 In Feng’s version, Li Jia doesn’t dare to go back to Du Shiniang’s place after he fails to raise the money. Du Shiniang sends a servant to bring him back to her.
such desperate conditions that Xiaming tells Miss Du that it is hopeless for them to continue their relationship. Lin explains: “He just could not think when a crisis came” ("Tu" 245).

In comparison to Li Jia, Li Xiaming is not a spendthrift by nature. He is a very good student, “Bright, young, and hopeful, I am sure he would have amounted to something, if he had not been caught in this tragic affair, which had so many unexpected twists” ("Tu" 195-96). Miss Du says to Liu, “[...] I am so glad that I have found Shia­ming. He is so pure, so good. No matter where we go, rich or poor, we shall be happy together” ("Tu" 219).

The episodes Lin designs for Li Xiaming serve to diminish the blame attributed to Li, and to convince readers that Li is a devoted lover and an innocent victim of a grand passion. This makes the reader wonder whether it was necessary for Miss Du to test Li’s commitment by concealing the contents of the jewel box.

b. Controversial Aspects of Miss Du’s Character

Miss Du is presented in Lin’s version as much more romantic, talkative, and even more philosophical than in Feng’s version. Her love for Li, as expressed in the poems she writes, is as romantic, and deep as the sea: “Let me now pay with a torrent of tears, in recompense for his great love!” ("Tu" 213). They make their secret marital pledge a year before she is to be free from the pleasure house. Her intense love seems to contradict to the way she tests the lover who is so deeply devoted to her. Her sentimental nature is inconsistent with her way of dealing with the jewel box. When she tests Li Xiaming’s commitment again and again instead of helping him out of his financial crises, she impresses readers with her cunning and unreasonableness.

Lin tries to justify Miss Du’s behavior by explaining why Miss Du keeps the jewel box a secret, and how she plans to use it. Lin presents Miss Du as very ambitious. She needs to make plans for her future very carefully and secretly,

She was looking for a good dependable young man. That was no more than what many courtesans do. She had seen her sisters of the profession marry into officials’ houses. But being of a different turn of mind and a little stubborn about it, she didn’t want to be a concubine, but to be a wife and have a husband all to herself. Difficult for her, but attainable, if she planned hard enough. Anyway, being a more intelligent person than the rest, she wanted to escape from the “short and unhappy life” she was leading, as she called it. ("Tu" 208-09)
Miss Du's dream is common. She wishes to have a husband and a home. However, for a woman like her, it is indeed ambitious. Yet Miss Du seems quite naïve when she speaks with Liu Yuchun about Li Xiaming's situation,

"[...] He seems so mortally afraid of his father. Is he so severe? Isn't there some way of telling him?" Seeing that I hesitated very much for an answer, she added, "He tells me his father has taken a mistress, too. Will he not consent for his son's sake, if he insists and tells him, as he tells me, that he will die without me?" ("Tu" 217)

In Feng's version Du Shiniang is also naïve, as she believes in the power of money. She assumes Li Jia's family will accept her if she lets Li take the jewel box home. Miss Du, in Lin's version, is even more naïve, as she believes that their great love would make his family accept her. It is, therefore, extremely important for her to make sure that her lover stands up for her. Liu Yuchun explains her plan later,

When Miss Tu decided she was going to marry my friend, she knew she would have difficulties with his family to contend with, and she carefully worked out a plan. She knew she would have to depend entirely upon herself and perhaps even provide for her husband for some time. To that end, she had made herself seem ruthless to her lovers. [...] The jewels she had obtained were variously estimated at from five to ten thousand dollars. ("Tu" 258)

In Feng's version, Du intends to equip Li splendidly with the valuable jewels, so that "when you returned to your parents they might appreciate my love for you and admit me into the family" ("Du Shiniang" 159). But in Lin's version, she will share her wealth with Li only after he tries his best to reconcile the family to his marriage.

Now, when she learned that her foolish young lover was not willing to go through with it, the bitterness and the cruelty of the disillusion must have been devastating. Her love for my friend had vanished like a dream in a second, snapped like a flower bitten by a night's frost. She did not hate him; she only pitied him. ("Tu" 258)

After they decide to go to Li's home, Li is greatly worried about his family, and is obviously unable to solve the problem by himself. Miss Du seems to ignore Li's difficulties, and is more interested in testing Li's commitment than in helping him out. She asks Li, "And you have no other way?" ("Tu" 256). But she does not offer her jewels, and still keeps her secret plan. She has two conflicting qualities: idealism and cunning. She has not put her trust in him even after they have loved each other for two
years. This seems quite illogical for her romantic nature and contradicts their 'great' love as depicted in the first part of the story. Although she is betting everything on Li and is trying to save herself, the concealment of the jewel box makes her appear overly rational, calculating and stubborn.

Lin struggles to find a better solution to solve the illogical aspects of Miss Du’s character, and attempts to shift Du’s anger to the intrigue made by Mao Number Three and the uncle.

But when she heard that he had sold her to the very man who could not otherwise obtain her but who was now trying to possess her by such foul tactics, the humiliation and the irony of it were too great for her. Her anger and her hatred of all the “rich sons of asses” at whose hands she had allowed herself to be insulted, despoiled, teased, wheedled, and joked at for money were now concentrated on Mao Number Three. Mao thought he had got her by his cunning design, but she was going to see who won--she or “the pig.” ("Tu" 258)

Here Miss Du is courageous and powerful. By committing suicide, she is in control of her destiny at last. Her final tirade is targeted at Mao Number Three, but also at the society which has made her a courtesan:

Holding in her hand the broken jade flute, she rose with a laugh. Pointing to Mao, she said haughtily, “You millionaire son of a donkey! You thought you could buy me with your filthy riches, didn't you? You know that I love Mr. Li and want to marry him. Yet you can think only of yourself, your wines and your wives and your pleasures. I will let you know what I think of your money and your wretched wealth with which you think you can buy me. You set a trap for us, to break up a pair of lovers. And you think you have won. We shall see!” ("Tu" 263)

Similar to Feng’s version, Miss Du accuses Li of betrayal,

"I have yet one more word to say and I am finished. To you, Li Shia-ming, I have given my heart, my soul, my all, and I have gone through much and come a long way to live with you, hoping that because of my dutiful behavior your parents would take pity on me and accept me as their daughter-in-law. To this end, I provided well for both of us, so that no matter what happened, we should never be in want. I did not tell you because I wanted to know what stuff you are made of. Now I have shown you that it would not have been so difficult to provide a thousand dollars if you had remained faithful to the end. I put my trust in you and now I know I was mistaken. What more can I say? God is in high heaven and will be my witness as to who has been unfaithful." ("Tu" 263-64)

This accusation sounds odder and more questionable than the one in Feng’s version, since she has learned of the deceits of Mao and the uncle. Lin tries to show that
although Miss Du understands that Li is a victim of Mao’s intrigue, she is so angry and sad that she makes her final decision impulsively. However, her accusation would make her tirade illogical and weaken the ending and the ideal image of Miss Du which Lin wants to portray.

c. A Dilemma between the Original and its Analogue

Lin intends to rewrite Feng’s version into a great tragedy by infusing his own thoughts and ideals. Thus the mutual love between Miss Du and Li Xiaming is much more romantic than that one in Feng Menglong’s version. Through the old writer’s voice and Liu Yuchun’s narration, Lin describes how great Miss Du’s love is; the image of Miss Du remains in his mind as “a spirit,” “like a young maiden about to be sacrificed on the altar of love” (”Tu” 188). However, these narrative voices sound a little suspect in comparison to how Miss Du tests her lover. This becomes the source of the weakness of Lin’s version.

This weakness, as we can see, is mainly caused by Lin’s intention of idealizing and romanticizing the story by taking The Lady of Camellia as an analogue, and his respect to the source text by following its basic outline. However, the more Li is romanticized, the less need there is for a test for his commitment. Similarly, more Miss Du is romanticized, the less likely it is that she would make such harsh tests of her lover. This results in the controversial aspects of Miss Du’s character, and weakens the function of the secret jewel box in its original design, and affects the image of Miss Du Lin intends to present.

2. Building the Temple for Miss Du and Lin’s Over Idealization of the Image of Miss Du

In Lin’s rewritten version, a small memorial temple is built in honour of Miss Du. This invention is strategic from a narrative perspective, however, it is unrealistic and impossible in actual Chinese life. This addition further exemplifies Lin’s tendency to overly romanticize and idealize Miss Du, who, according the old writer, is like “a spirit,” or a goddess, “who was sacrificed for love.” Lin portrays Li Xiaming’s father as an understanding person who is greatly touched by the tragedy, and decides to build a temple to propitiate Miss Du’s spirit. By erecting this temple near the river, Lin wishes to make the audience see her true worth, to see how a woman sacrifices herself for her own
ideals. The temple is a symbol for Miss Du's love and courage; it is similar to the idea of a monument for a faithful widow who dies for chastity. However, in China, there are temples for Buddhas and heroes, or even for benevolent men who help local people, but not for courtesans. This is perhaps the reason Lin has the temple burned down by its only worshiper, Li Xiaming.

In addition, Li Xiaming's father is presented here as a sensitive person who pays for the temple for Miss Du. This is also an impossible idea, because as an old Confucian scholar and official he would be the most unlikely person to do so.

F. Contribution to Cross-cultural Literary Rewriting

Although Lin creates a few problems in his rewriting of Du Shiniang's story, it is still a daring and valuable experiment in cross-cultural literary rewriting. It demonstrates Lin's deep sympathy for a courtesan's life, his appreciation of the courtesan's contribution to Chinese art and music, and his desire to portray strong yet sympathetic women. The cultural and narrative strategies Lin uses in the process of re-constructing a Chinese vernacular short story into an English novella are noteworthy. He absorbs creatively Liu E's ideas and narrative strategies through his translation of "A Nun of Taishan." His adoption of Dumas' The Lady of the Camellias as a cross-cultural analogue is indeed a brilliant strategy. The thematic and structural similarities between the Chinese and French stories enlighten us as to the usefulness of an analogue in cross-cultural rewriting.

While adapting a cross-cultural analogue, Lin continues "pouring his own wine" into "the aged bottle," "embroidering his own picture" on the "known fabric." In the process of reconstructing this story, Lin consciously borrows 'bottle(s)" and 'cup(s)’ from Feng Menglong (unconsciously Song Maocheng), Dumas, and Liu E, as well as others, to express his own ideals and thoughts. The rewritten novella "Miss Du," can be considered a "hybrid construction" in light of Bakhtin's dialogism: "My voice can mean, but only with others: at times in chorus, but at the best of times in a dialogue"(Holquist 165). Lin joins the authorship of the story of Du Shiniang with his own distinctive marks. As the rewriter of Miss Du, Lin also plays the role of an interlocutor and mediator.
between Feng Menglong and Dumas, on the universal theme of love and tragedy. Lin helps the French Camille find a Chinese sister.

IV. Conclusion

A. The Commonalities among these Three Images of Chinese Women

The above examination of “Widow Chuan,” “A Nun of Taishan,” and “Miss Du” reveals that there are remarkable commonalities between these three images of Chinese women. They have strong personalities despite difficult circumstances. Each is independent, decisive, and has a strong sense of self-respect. They make their own livings and make choices for survival. They remain dignified no matter how desperate their environments are.

Widow Quan is the most forceful personality and leader in her village, all the men, including the village elder, show respect (or fear) for her leadership. Nun Yiyun is enlightened and becomes an influential religious teacher, even male scholars like Laocan and Te Huisheng admire her. Miss Du has her pride and determination; she is much more independent and decisive than her weak-minded lover Li Xiaming. Although she commits suicide, she shows society that she can decide her own final fate.

These three women impress us not only with their intelligence and talents, but also with their own strong voices and powerful words. They are philosophical in their beliefs about love, marriage, and human life. Their marginalized positions provide unique perspectives on the customs and traditions of society.

These marginalized women form a collective voice against Confucian society. They choose different roads in opposing Confucian rules in their search for liberation. As Lin reveals in the introduction to Widow, Nun, and Courtesan, “All of these women, widow, nun, and courtesan, had to make the best of their lives, with or without Confucius. The nun was beyond Confucius, the widow totally ignored him, and the courtesan tried at least to defy him” (Widow, Nun, Courtesan vi).

They also form a relationship with each other, inter-echoing and inter-illuminating. Had Yiyun not been able to awaken from her last dream, she would have had to face the fate which Miss Du meets. In contrast, we understand how alienated Miss
Du is from society, as she does not have a choice but to pursue her dream in callous reality. Miss Du’s determination to make plans for her future is comparable to Widow Quan’s ability to administrate the village. Unfortunately, Miss Du is too naïve to see through the cannibalistic nature of her social system, so she awakens too late.

B. Lin Yutang’s Feminist Spirit in Connection with that of other Male Writers

The collection of these images in one book bespeaks Lin’s strong sympathy toward marginalized women in Chinese society, and represents Lin’s admiration for their intelligence, talents and personalities. By presenting these three images Lin further reveals his spiritual connection with other male writers with feminist leanings in Chinese literature. Widow, Nun, and Courtesan introduces us to several male Chinese writers who had strong feminist consciousnesses for their time. The seventeenth century writer Feng Menglong’s sympathy towards these “much maligned and injured sing-song girls in the houses of ill-fame” (Wu-chi Liu 218), is demonstrated in his “Du Shiniang Sinks the Jewel Box in Anger”. The talented Qing dynasty writer Liu E’s high admiration for women’s intelligence and beauty is reflected in his idealization of Yiyun. When Lao Xiang, Lin’s contemporary and personal friend created the powerful image of widow in a humorous way, Lin is delighted and inspired. Indeed, it was Lin’s own feministic spirit, his broad knowledge of Chinese literature, and his personal talent that allow him to introduce a series of Chinese male writers into English literature.

C. Adaptation and Rewriting for the Purpose of Sharpening the Images of Women

The images in the selected stories are all unconventional and highly idealized; in the process of relocating these stories in English, Lin sharpens or reconstructs them according to his own ideals, and cross-cultural consideration. For instance, Du Shiniang in Feng’s version rarely speaks except in her tirade at the end. After Lin’s rewriting, Miss Du appears to be expressive, even talkative. Lin also lets her express feelings and thoughts in her poetry. In this way, she becomes a more fully developed character.

Widow, Nun and Courtesan, illustrates three types of translingual literary practices: minor adaptation in “A Nun of Taishan,” dramatic adaptation in “Widow Chuan,” and complete rewriting in “Miss Du.” The cultural and narrative strategies Lin
develops in translating, adapting, and rewriting these stories are remarkable; They are all valuable contributions to cross-cultural literary translation and rewriting.

D. Impact of this Book on Lin’s Future Projects on Chinese Women

Translating, adapting, and rewriting these images establishes a strong basis for Lin’s future work. The strategies he develops in presenting and reconstructing these three women are applied and further developed in his 1952 book, Famous Chinese Short Stories, in which he represents and reconstructs a series of images of Chinese women from love stories. These women tend to be highly idealized and romanticized, speaking to Lin’s own ideals and thoughts about Chinese women’s love and passion.

The image types and strategies he develops in translation, adaptation and rewriting also influence his presentation of images in his creative writing—his English novels. In the 1950s and 1960s, Lin devoted much of his time to creative writing. His romantic novels such as A Leaf in the Storm, Vermillion Gate, Red Peony, his historical novel Lady Wu, and his semi-autobiographical novel Lai Boying, all feature idealized and romanticized Chinese women. These women characterize ideals which are distinctively Lin Yutang’s.
CONCLUSION

The above case studies demonstrate the power that Lin Yutang's translation, adaptation and rewriting had in changing the stereotypical images of Chinese women. The examples show how his ideology and his translational strategies shaped these positive female images, and how subtle factors such as Lin's sense of readership affected his voice on Chinese women and the appearance of his reconstructed female images.

In this Conclusion, I first review my discovery of lesser known bilingual translators and writers who set the stage for Lin Yutang's work. I then summarize the critical strategies Lin developed in selecting source materials, reconstructing female images, and in literary translation, and stress the limitations of his translingual practice. I conclude by affirming the significance of Lin Yutang in the cross-cultural world.

I. Re-evaluation of the Historical and Bicultural Context and of the Genealogy of Lin's Female Images

Studying Lin Yutang from the perspective of cross-culturally translating Chinese women in a post-colonial context, has revealed some fresh, diverse and complicated phenomena in the intersection of post-colonialism, feminism, and cross-cultural translation, and brought to light some significant findings.

A. The Relationship of Lin's Work to the Historical and Bicultural Context

Contextualized in the history of Western images of Chinese women during the period from the late nineteenth century to the mid-twentieth century, this study has revealed a major cross-cultural translation phenomenon which has gone unnoticed when studied in isolation. A series of translated or rewritten works previously ignored, have
been placed in their proper context.

A. C. Safford, a pioneering missionary woman from America, has long been forgotten in the cross-cultural history of China and America. Her *Typical Women of China* has been largely ignored in academic studies. However, its contents radiate new significance after being studied in the context of representing images of Chinese women in the age of colonization. Interpreting Safford’s case enriches the ongoing post-colonial translation studies.

The study of the rise of Lin Yutang and the formation of his distinctive voice concerning Chinese women in the post-colonial cross-cultural world allows us to understand how Lin, a May Fourth Chinese intellectual, connects to a Western and Christian education, to Gu Hongming, to male writers with strong feminist leanings in traditional China, to Daoism and to the Western feminism. It asserts the powerful role that his personal identity and experience play in his beliefs and in his discourse on Chinese women.

B. A More Comprehensive Genealogy of Lin’s Female Characters

As a great writer, thinker, and translator, Lin Yutang is remembered by millions of readers, both in the East and the West. His books such as *My Country and My People*, *The Importance of Living*, *With Love and Irony*, and his English novels, such as *Moment in Peking*, *Chinatown Family*, *The Vermillion Gate*, and *The Red Peony*, continue to be of interest to both readers and scholars alike. However, Lin’s translated, adapted, and rewritten works which highlight the images of Chinese women have been long ignored by serious scholarship. By examining and evaluating these translations and rewritings, I discover that these works function as a strong basis for Lin’s more famous works. Therefore, a more comprehensive genealogy of Lin’s translilingual literary practice is created, and the organic relationship between his translations, rewritings and creative writings are revealed.

The interpretation of Nancy’s feminist spirit in Chapter Two of this dissertation reveals that the most important ideas in Lin’s article “Feminist Thought in Ancient China” (1935) were developed in the process of writing and translating *Confucius Met Nanzi* (1928). These ideas set the tone for his chapter “Women’s Life,” in *My Country
and My People (1935). It is also noteworthy that Lin’s translation of Shen Fu’s Six Chapters of a Floating Life (1935), Liu E’s A Nun of Taishan (1935) and several classical Chinese tales such as The Disembodied Oiannü, were done shortly before My Country and My People. His comprehensive understanding of women’s life, and his distinctive voice for Chinese women developed and matured in the process of translating these works.

The study also contributes to the theory that translations and adaptations are literary creations, and verifies that “all creative writings are rewritings.” It reveals that many of Lin’s images in his English novels are inspired through the process of translation, adapting, and rewriting. The fundamental strategies of translation and rewriting which Lin developed have influenced his construction of the female images in his creative writing and rewriting. For instance, the female protagonist Mulan in Lin’s first English novel, Moment in Beijing, is similar to Yun—the “loveliest woman in Chinese literature.” Lin’s novel The Red Peony was influenced by his translation and adaptation of “Widow Chuan.” It is noticeable that Liu E’s narrative skills and his image of Yiyun leave imprints in “Miss Du” through Lin’s translation of “A Nun of Taishan.” The strategies Lin used to recreate the image of Miss Du are similar to the strategies he used to reconstruct the image of Nancy. Lin’s use of a cross-cultural analogue for Miss Du is mirrored in his reconstruction of the image of Madame Di. Lin took Tolstoy’s Anna Karenina as an analogue for this liberated wife. In writing the novel A Leaf in the Storm, Lin took Scarlet O’Hara from Margaret Mitchell’s Gone with the Wind as Peng Danni’s cross-cultural analogue. There are many threads connecting the female characters he created and the ones he translated and rewrote. The powerful influence of these translated and rewritten images on Lin’s creative writing can not be ignored. Because of this study, the genealogy of Lin’s images of women becomes more comprehensible. In my view, a new chapter on the images of Chinese women in Lin Yutang’s literary translation, rewriting and creative writing needs to be added to the histories of modern Chinese literature.
II. Critical Strategies Lin Developed and his Limitation

The types of women who appear in Lin’s translation and rewriting are similar to those which appear in missionary writings and translations, such as a widow, a nun, a courtesan, the wife of an arranged marriage, an abandoned girl, and a powerful queen. While these women appeared as victims, slaves, virtual prisoners, idol worshipers, and kingdom wreckers in the missionary stories, they turn out to be strategic leaders, brilliant conversationalists, talented artists, religious teachers, survivors, and ardent lovers in Lin’s fictional presentations. Lin’s successful rewriting of the missionary discourse on Chinese women derives fundamentally from his politics in selecting new source materials, strategies in reconstructing these images, and his art and craft in literary translation. At the same time, his limitations and problems are also reflected.

A. Principles in Selecting Source Materials

In contrast to Safford’s narrowing down of the rich and broad tradition of writing about Chinese women and in de-historizing the source texts from their Chinese context, Lin broadens the horizon by selecting from various unofficial materials, such as travelers’ records, biographies and autobiographies, tales, legends, and controversial historical cases. He also uses contemporary materials such as stories from the 1930s and 40s. In these materials, Chinese women are much more open and free, full of healthy thoughts and imaginations and speak frankly and honestly. These images were unprecedented in the West. By selecting stories from these rich sources, Lin was able to open up a new world, and present his English readers with a gallery of images of various Chinese women, both ancient and modern. While Safford announces that she finally raises “the veil of Chinese women” through Typical Women of China, Lin proves that she only raises a corner of that veil, and creates his own version of “Biographies of Chinese Women, Ancient and Modern.” By presenting a variety of Chinese stories in English, Lin also enriches the genres and modes of Chinese literature in English translation.

It is noteworthy that Lin became personally involved in publishing some of these source stories in Chinese. He met the girl soldier Xie Bingying in 1927, and helped her to publish her “war diaries and letters” in Chinese, which he quickly translated into English. The story of “A Nun of Taishan,” was first obtained by Lin Yutang from Liu E’s family,
and was published in Shanghai with Lin’s support. Lin soon translated and published in English. The story of “Widow Chuan,” was originally printed in the Chinese magazine Yuzhou Feng. Lin translated and adapted the story in English shortly after it was published. And Confucius Saw Nancy was originally written in Chinese by Lin himself. Lin’s literary, aesthetic, and cultural as well as cross-cultural sensibilities, and his sharp eyes in discovering these sources, were unusual among his generation of modern Chinese writers.

In the preface to his Famous Chinese Short Stories, Lin wrote about his principles for selecting stories for translating and retelling: “I have selected those which I believe have a most nearly universal appeal. [...] the reader shall come away with the satisfactory feeling that a particular insight into human character has been gained, or that his knowledge of life has been deepened, or that pity, love, or sympathy for a human being has been awakened” (Famous xii). These choices reflect Lin’s awareness of universal themes that cross cultural boundaries and his intention to establish cross-cultural bridges.

B. Strategies in Reconstructing Images of Chinese Women and Influence of Readership on his Strategies

1. Strategies in Reconstructing Images

Safford, in her Typical Women of China, develops sophisticated methods for reconstructing stereotypical images. In contrast to Safford’s efforts to depersonalize, silence and exoticize Chinese women, Lin Yutang enhances and enriches them, gives them voices which haven’t been heard before. He also finds analogues in Western literature to make his images more intelligible to readers. In addition, all his female characters are romanticized and idealized. They are inter-echoing and inter-illuminating, forming a collective picture of positive and active Chinese women. These female images embody various aspects of the Chinese cultural essence as well as Lin’s own aesthetic and philosophical ideals; they thus become vehicles for transmitting Chinese culture to the West.

The women in Lin’s translation, adaptation and rewriting have strong personalities. They are not afraid of expressing their own thoughts and feelings, which was unusual in literature about Chinese women. In the case of Nancy and Miss Du, Lin
rewrites them to sharpen their tongues. Nancy becomes a spokeswoman for Chinese feminism after Lin strengthens her voice by filling it with his own and Yuan Mei’s ideas. Miss Du’s words become philosophical after Lin adds some of Marguerite’s thoughts (which reflect Dumas’ voice), and some of nun Yiyun’s thoughts (which in fact reflect Liu E’s voice). Miss Du becomes a poetess after Lin includes her letters and poems, which he created for her. “Borrowing someone else’s cups to assuage one’s own worries,” is an effective strategy Lin uses to reinforce the voices of these women.

In order to make images of Chinese women more acceptable to readers, Lin develops one of the most effective strategies for cross-cultural literary rewriting—that of finding an appropriate analogue, already existing in the target culture. For instance, by taking the French Marguerite Gautier as an analogue for rewriting the Chinese Du Shiniang, Lin strikes a chord of recognition, and creates a better understanding of a Chinese courtesan. By finding cross-cultural analogues, Lin makes his images of Chinese women more comprehensible for Western readers. If Pearl Buck let the Westerners first feel that “all men are brothers,” it was Lin who first made them feel that “all women are sisters.”

For the purpose of dispelling existing stereotypes, the images in Lin’s translated or rewritten stories are romanticized and idealized from their originals, such as Yun and Yiyun. In Miss Du’s case, Lin’s dramatic rewriting and his use of analogues from the Western Romantic tradition create a new paradigm of a Chinese woman, which is a hybrid construction of both Chinese and Western origin.

The study in Chapter Four demonstrates how Widow Quan, Yiyun, and Miss Du form a collective voice against the Confucian society in which they are marginalized. They form a relationship with each other, inter-echoing and inter-illuminating. In fact, their characters echo and illuminate other female images that Lin presents in English. For instance, the matriarchal power achieved by Widow Quan is comparable to that of Queen Nancy. Yiyun’s achievement of personal freedom through Daoism and Buddhism forms an interesting contrast to Yun’s attaining her spiritual freedom. Thus, Lin establishes a more comprehensive picture of the influence of religion on women in traditional China.

These female images embody various aspects of the Chinese cultural essence as well as Lin’s own aesthetic and philosophical ideals. The conversations between
Confucius and Nancy represent Lin’s effort to present Western readers with the basic conflict between the two Chinese native philosophies: Confucianism and Daoism. Nancy outwits Confucius, and in so doing illustrates Lin’s own philosophical ideal. The intertextual comparison between *Six Chapters of a Floating Life* and Lin’s *The Importance of Living* allows us to see that Yun, in fact, personifies the spirit of the Chinese art of living. By introducing Yiyun’s enlightenment, Lin presents a more humanistic version of Chinese religion to the West. Widow Quan’s survival strategies and the happy lives she and her daughters led, show that the Chinese can be an extremely realistic people, with a sense of humour, and that the wisdom within these lives is far stronger than the wisdom emanating from theory.

2. Influence of the intended Readership

Unlike Lin’s non-fiction English books such as *My Country and My People* and his English novels, which were written for general Western readers, most of the works examined in this dissertation were originally undertaken for English readership in China. Lin’s consideration of his intended audience thus affected his translational strategies. When Nanzi becomes Nancy, Lin makes her words more powerful and her actions more liberal. Lin also gives stage direction to enhance Nancy’s feminist spirit. *My Country and My People* works to ameliorate the view of Chinese women, while *Ancient Feminist Thought*, written for an English audience in China, is more critical of the aspects of Chinese culture. When *Six Chapters of a Floating Life* was included in *The Wisdom of India and China*, Lin abridges the fourth chapter to simplify the presentation of Shen Fu’s travels. Nun Yiyun’s story was also first translated for English audience in China, but when Lin includes it in *Widow, Nun, and Courtesan*, he makes minor adaptations.

In the case of the widow and the courtesan, translated and rewritten for a general Western audience, Lin adds many details to the Chinese original he was working from in order to modernize and give voice to these marginalized women. For instance, Lin adds a love story for the widow’s daughter to humanize her. In rewriting Miss Du, Lin uses the analogue of Marguerite to enhance Westerners’ understanding and sympathy. He invents poems, thoughts, and conversations for Miss Du, to enhance her voice. Lin addresses
different levels of readership at different times. This indeed influences subtly his translation strategies and styles.

C. Art and Craft in Literary Translation

Lin does not leave many theoretical writings about his translations. In his cornerstone article, “On Translation” (1933), Lin emphasizes that translation is an art. Some of Lin’s translation principles are examined in the prefaces and introductions to his translated works, which I have carefully analyzed. More importantly, Lin’s richest and liveliest translation theory existed in his practice. His strategies of cross-cultural literary translation and rewriting, his quest for dynamic and poetic equivalence between Chinese and English, are splendidly and vigorously reflected in his work.

The comparative study of the three translated versions of Shen Fu’s memoir, Fu sheng liu ji, reveals Lin’s exceptional craft in translating a challenging Chinese text with exceptionally high aesthetic quality. My interpretation of the original text of Fu sheng liu ji by using the Chinese painting theory of qiyun, provides a new perspective in evaluating the qualities of the translated texts. Lin’s translation of Six Chapters of a Floating Life, in comparison to Shirley Black’s Chapters of a Floating Life and Pratt and Chiang’s Six Records of a Floating Life, achieves a greater degree of faithfulness, elegance and comprehensiveness. It indicates the maturity Lin reaches in his literary translation.

This study presents new perspectives on the qualifications of a translator. It allows us to see how different ideological motivations, translational conceptions and strategies, and how the different personal temperaments and talents of the translator affect the quality of the translation. Lin’s personal experience and bilingual cultural background, his philosophy and aesthetic views, his literary talent and knowledge of Chinese art and music, play important roles in his exceptional craft. His background and skill allow him to integrate literatures of East and West.

D. Lin Yutang’s Limitations and Problems

As an established figure in the East-West cross-cultural world, Lin appears as a successful Oriental cultural icon in the eyes of millions of his readers. However, we must recognize that he sometimes struggles between two cultures, and is limited by his own
background and gender. It is noteworthy that all his characters examined here are highly romanticized and idealized. Some of these images appear, in fact, to be overly romanticized and idealized. For instance, Yun’s effort in getting a singsong girl as a concubine for Shen Fu is interpreted by Lin Yutang as being purely motivated by her passion for beauty. Even Lin’s choice of Shen Fu’s memoir is romantic, as Shen Fu glosses over the difficulties in Yun’s life. Similarly, Lin focuses more on the romantic aspect of Yiyun’s life, but tends not to see the hardship placed on Yiyun by the society and her unfortunate fate as an ostracized woman.

The images of Chinese women in Lin’s gallery are mostly in the tradition of Chinese Romanticism. Significant female images from the Chinese tradition of Realism, however, do not appear in Lin’s work, such as the aggrieved widow Dou E (窦娥), in the drama “The Injustice to Dou E” (“窦娥冤”) by the great playwright Guan Hanqing (关汉卿 1241-132). Actual nuns and the courtesans, such as the Tang dynasty nun-poetess Yu Xuanji’s (鱼玄机), do not appear in Lin’s work. Although Lin may have intended to rewrite the missionary view of Chinese women, the picture of Chinese women Lin brought to the West does not completely represent the lives of all Chinese women. His selections affect the authenticity and historicity of these images. Thus the questions: “What were typical Chinese women like?” “What were their lives?” are only partially answered. In this case, it would be interesting and valuable to compare Lin’s work to that of Zhang Ailing (1920-1995), a bilingual Chinese woman writer who immigrated to the U.S. in 1955. She wrote English novels for a Western audience, such as Rice Sprout Song (1955), and Love in the Naked Earth (1956). She also translated her own short story “The Golden Cangue” (1943) into English as The Rouge of the North (1967), which gives a very different picture of the position of Chinese women from those in Lin Yutang’s works, a woman who becomes a wife/prisoner who eventually goes mad due to her thwarted dreams.
III. Significance of Lin Yutang’s Bicultural and Translingual Practice

A. The Voice of a Male Chinese Feminist and its Correspondence to Contemporary Historical Studies of Gender

Lin was a pioneer in allowing the voices of Chinese women to be heard effectively in the West, and in establishing a more positive identity for Chinese women. It is interesting to note that the ideas of Chinese male writers reflected in Lin’s translation, rewriting and creative writing corresponds to recent discoveries by female scholars, including Susan Mann and Dorothy Ko, in the field of gender studies in Chinese social history. Their study of Chinese women’s everyday lives and intellectual history in Ming and Qing dynasties, through careful investigation of literature written by women themselves, has brought new perspectives to the real status of women in ancient China. Their findings have shaken the common assumption of ‘the submissive woman’ found in mainstream social and historical studies. Their recently published, Teachers of the Inner Chamber (1994), Precious Records (1997), and Under Confucius’ Eyes (2001), have shown the complicated and rich intellectual lives experienced by Chinese women in late imperial China. Women’s intelligence and talent are also reflected in newly discovered poems, anthologies, and records of literary societies, which are either written by women or recorded by males who were close to these women at that time. These new discoveries have generated much attention in today’s academic world. However, it is interesting to note that the gallery of the Chinese women that Lin brought to the West, in the 1930s, 40s and 50s, share many similarities with these rediscovered Chinese women. These women all demonstrate great intelligence, independence and undying matriarchal power. A different road, but the same destiny—Lin Yutang’s pioneering defence of Chinese women, at a time when only a few Chinese women were able to speak for themselves, was unique and important. The idea of womanhood which Lin promoted, physically, intellectually, and psychologically strong and healthy, and capable of harmonious interactions with men, could be a reference point for the feminist movement, both in China and in the West.

267 Susan Mann, Under Confucian Eyes (Berkeley: University of California, 2001).
B. Lin Yutang and the Increasingly Globalized World

My dissertation demonstrates that Lin Yutang’s contribution to cross-cultural studies and literature is much greater than generally believed in academia, and remains significant in today’s increasingly globalized world. The narrative and cultural strategies he develops in his translilingual practice clarify and solidify his contribution. The Chinese female images he constructs, not only play a significant role in changing stereotypical images, and in introducing Chinese culture to the West, but also provide critical wisdom for understanding cross-cultural links in today’s world.

Long Yingtai,\textsuperscript{268} a renowned Chinese cultural critic, once expressed her unique view on “internationalization”:

What is ‘internationalization’? It means knowing yourself and knowing the other. Knowing yourself, therefore you can decide what are the true and permanent values for being yourself; knowing the other, so you will be able to use the languages, writings, logics that can be understood by the other to present your own language, your own views, your own cultural values. It does not mean that you have to assimilate yourself completely into the other, but to tell the others that you are different in ways they can understand.\textsuperscript{269}

The fundamental spirit of Lin’s cross-cultural translation and rewriting echoes the true meaning of “internationalization” as interpreted by Long Yingtai. Indeed, Lin applies “knowing yourself and knowing the other,” and works out a set of strategies to help others to better understand Chinese culture.

It is significant that Lin Yutang was around at the time when China “opened” to the West and when Westerners’ interest in China increased. Lin may well have perceived himself as having a “mission” to fairly portray China in this new, open environment. He dedicated his life to make Westerners understand his country and his people, personifying the original meaning and purpose of “missionary.”

\textsuperscript{268} Long Yingtai (龙应台), a contemporary cultural critic and writer from Taiwan, now living in Germany.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


222


---. "On Ibsenism [Yibusheng Zhuyi, 易卜生主义]." *Xin Qingnian* [New Youth, 新青年] 4.6 (1918).

---. "Zhencao Wenti [真草问题]." *Xin Qingnian* [New Youth, 新青年] 5.1 (1918).


Jetter, J.B. *Memoir of Mrs. Shuck, the First American Female Missionary to China*. Boston: Gould, Kendall and Lincoln, 1846.


--- With Love and Irony. Illustrated by Kurt Wiese. 1940.


**The She King or Ancient Poetry.** Trans. James Legge. London: Trubner, 1876.


