THE AUDIENCE RELATION:
AN ANALYSIS OF EDUCATIONAL RADIO BROADCASTING IN BOLIVIA

by

Thomas F. Balke
B.A. Hons., McGill University, 1980

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS OF
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS
in the Department
of
Communication

© Thomas Balke 1985
SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
November 1985

All rights reserved. This work may not be reproduced in whole or in part, by photocopy or other means, without permission of the author.
APPROVAL

Name: Thomas F.F. Balke
Degree: Master of Arts (Communication)
Examine Committee:

Chairperson: Martin Laba, Assistant Professor

______________________________
Robert S. Anderson
Associate Professor
Senior Supervisor

______________________________
Liora Salter
Associate Professor

______________________________
Alberto Ciria
Professor
Department of Political Science

______________________________
Jorge J. Gilbert
Department of Sociology
Date Approved: 5 November 1985
PARTIAL COPYRIGHT LICENSE

I hereby grant to Simon Fraser University the right to lend my thesis, project or extended essay (the title of which is shown below) to users of the Simon Fraser University Library, and to make partial or single copies only for such users or in response to a request from the library of any other university, or other educational institution, on its own behalf or for one of its users. I further agree that permission for multiple copying of this work for scholarly purposes may be granted by me or the Dean of Graduate Studies. It is understood that copying or publication of this work for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Title of Thesis/Project/Extended Essay

The Audience Relation: An Analysis of Educational Radio Broadcasting in Bolivia

Author: __________________________

(signature)

Thomas F.F. Balke

(name)

November 5, 1985

(date)
Abstract

This thesis develops criteria for comparing and assessing audience-station relations among radio schools in Bolivia on the basis of progressive stages of access, participation, and self-management on the part of the audience. Three audience-relation model types are defined: the formal instructional, mutual development, and radical change models. These audience-relation model types are in turn used to evaluate local involvement in three Bolivian radio schools, and are shown to be relevant to other countries. The term "audience relation", in this thesis, pertains to the influence of financing, evaluation, and production on relationships between an educational radio station and its audience.

Drawing upon contemporary Spanish-language communications research, the methodology and survey questions were designed, and reviewed by Latin American communications researchers before the field studies were completed. The author then spent a three month period in Bolivia, Ecuador and Colombia collecting case study data and published reports in 1983. The case studies were carried out with the cooperation of Radio San Gabriel, Radio San Rafael, and Radio Pío XII.

This analysis led to the conclusion that audience-station relations were severely constrained by political, economic, cultural, geographical and linguistic barriers, and that in cases where station decision-making is removed from the community, certain technical, organizational, financial, and
ideological dependencies have become amplified. Funding agencies and evaluation teams have perpetuated the vague use of terms such as "participation" and "access" in Bolivia in order to increase chances of obtaining foreign financing, even though the audience's involvement in community-based radio has not been reliably or systematically assessed on an on-going basis.

Despite the evident dependencies, community organizations (including radio stations), need to become self-sufficient to ensure continuation during times of political and economic turmoil when foreign-financed projects may not be continued. The Catholic Church serves as a protecting factor during political repression but must evaluate the extent to which it should control stations and involve the community in their operations.

Audience-relation analysis is a concrete method of assessing the actual involvement of the local community in the development of educational radio, thus assisting station self-evaluation and facilitating the increased involvement of local groups.
Acknowledgements

Without the assistance, support, and cooperation of many individuals the completion of this thesis would not have been possible. I would like to begin by thanking José Bernardo Toro and Robert Anderson, without whom the conceptual framework for this thesis would be incomplete. I also appreciated the assistance given to me by Robert White, Eduardo Contreras, Antonio Cabezas, Carlos Crespo, Marita Paiva, and Jeremiah O'Sullivan Ryan in collecting bibliographical material. I am also greatly indebted to the staff and volunteers working at Radio San Gabriel, Radio San Rafael, and Radio Pío XII for their assistance while I was in Bolivia. Without them, I would not have been able to collect the material for my case study analysis. Their hard work and commitment to the people of Bolivia inspired me to complete this study.

It is impossible for me to adequately thank the numerous other people who assisted me in the editing, word-processing and proof reading of this text. Included in this group of friends are Cecil Klassen, Jorge Aliaga, Lauren Aslin, Don Pape, John Krueger, and Robert Foster. Last but not least, I would like to thank my wife Kim for her patience and support in the completion of this thesis.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Approval Page</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 The Audience Relation 1
1.2 The Significance of Audience Relations 1
1.3 Why Audience-Relation Analysis? 3
1.4 Chapter Breakdown 5

Chapter Two: Research Experiences and the Conceptualization of Audience-Relation Analysis

2.0 Research Experiences 7
2.1 Radio in Bolivia 9
2.2 The Catholic Church in Bolivia 10
2.3 Research Method 10
2.3.1 Research Difficulties 11
2.3.2 Varying Definition of Terms 13
2.3.3 Indigenous Station Personnel 13
2.3.4 Available Literature 14
2.4 Latin American Communication Research 15
2.4.1 Freire and the Audience Relation 17
2.4.2 Alternative Communication 18
2.4.3 Vertical Communication 19
2.4.4 The Democratization of Communication 20
2.4.5 The Concept of Access 21
2.4.6 The Concept of Participation 22
2.4.7 The Concept of Self-Management 28
2.5 Audience-Relation Analysis 29
2.5.1 Primary Factors in Assessing the Audience Relation 32
2.5.1.1 The Dimension of Station Operations 34
2.5.1.2 Community Contact 35
2.5.1.3 Educational Method 36
2.5.1.4 Institutional Structure 37
2.6 Classification of Audience Relation Model Types 38

Chapter Three: The Formal-Instructional Model

3.0 Theoretical Background 42
3.1 Case Analysis: Radio San Rafael 44
3.2 Station Decision-Making Radio School San Rafael 47
3.3 Audience-Relation Analysis of Radio School San Rafael 52
## Chapter Four: The Mutual Development Model

4.0 Theoretical Background 62  
4.1 Case Analysis: Radio San Gabriel 66  
4.2 Station Decision-Making at Radio San Gabriel 69  
4.3 Audience-Relation Analysis of Radio San Gabriel 73

## Chapter Five: The Indigenous-Change Model

5.0 Theoretical Background 80  
5.1 Case Analysis: Radio Pío XII 84  
5.2 Station Decision-Making at Radio Pío XII 88  
5.3 Audience-Relation Continuum Analysis of Radio Pío XII 94

## Chapter Six: Educational Radio Broadcasting in Latin America

6.1 Introduction 103  
6.2 The Latin American Association of Educational Radio 104  
6.2.1 ALER and the Catholic Church 107  
6.2.2 Advantages of the Catholic Church's Involvement 109  
6.2.3 Limitations to the Catholic Church's Involvement 110  
6.3 Station Direction: Ordained and Lay Directors 111  
6.4 Radio School Dependency 113  
6.5 Funding Strategies 115  
6.5.1 Government Financing 116  
6.5.2 International Development Agencies 118  
6.5.3 Advertising Revenue 121  
6.5.4 Local Private Support 122  
6.5.5 Self-Financing 124  
6.6 Obstacles to Community Participation 127  
6.6.1 Political and Ideological Constraints 127  
6.6.2 Structural Constraints 129  
6.6.3 Institutional Constraints 129  
6.6.4 Socio-Cultural Constraints 134  
6.6.5 Economic Constraints 138

## Chapter Seven: Conclusions

7.1 Introduction 142  
7.2 Prognosis 142  
7.3 Audience-Relation Analysis 144  
7.4 Radio Schools 145  
7.5 The Nature of the Medium 149  
7.6 Technological Dependency 153  
7.7 Self-Financing 155  
7.8 Ownership and Control of Educational Radio 160  
7.9 Grass-Roots Organizations 164  
7.10 Integral Liberation 165

List of References 169  
Bibliography 186
List of Tables

Table 2-1: Audience-Relation Continuum
Table 2-2: Factors Affecting the Audience Relation
Table 2-3: Audience-Relation Model Types
Table 3-1: Organizational Diagram of Radio School San Rafael
Table 3-2: Decision-Making at Radio San Rafael
Table 3-3: Profile of Radio School San Rafael
Table 4-1: Decision-Making at Radio San Gabriel
Table 4-2: Organizational Diagram of Radio San Gabriel
Table 4-3: Profile of Radio San Gabriel
Table 5-1: Decision-Making at Radio Pío XII
Table 5-2: Organizational Diagram of Radio Pío XII
Table 5-3: Profile of Radio Pío XII
Table 6-1: ALER Affiliates
Chapter One:

Introduction

1.1 The Audience Relation

The objective of this study is to analyze the relationship between educational radio stations and their audiences. I will use the term "audience relation" to describe the existing relationships between the audience and the station, the public school system, political authorities, and funding organizations. My analysis of audience relations encompasses questions of access, participation, and self-management in the development of indigenous educational radio. My use of the term audience relation is intended to facilitate the study of ideologically diverse organizations. Audience-relation analysis is a technique for criticism of existing station models based on current Latin American communications research. My study of audience relations includes relations of media production, financing and evaluation. In my analysis of audience-relation models adopted by educational radio stations, I will demonstrate the importance of such relations, and suggest improvements in promoting indigenous development. I intend this analysis to serve as a background model for future indigenous research concerning avenues for structural and operational change in educational radio broadcasting, and to increase North American understanding of the topic at hand.

1.2 The Significance of Audience Relations

For the purpose of this study, audience-relation
analysis serves as a nexus between contemporary Latin American communication theory and the work of Latin American radio schools. The study of audience relations could pertain to the entire complex spectrum of social, political, cultural, and economic relations. However, my study of audience relations will be carefully limited and applied to the radio schools of Latin America in terms of the qualitative and quantitative significance of the relative level of local autonomy in decision-making and the overall impact of community participation.

Conflicting definitions of participation provided by media researchers and practitioners affect the quantitative analysis of grass-roots involvement. Similarly, varying research methods yield different results depending upon who defines the problem, who conducts the research, and who carries out project evaluations. The audience-relation analysis framework I have developed is influenced by definitions of access, participation, and self-management used by Latin American researchers. This is because my field research took place in Latin America where the terminology takes on its own connotations. I found it necessary to develop my own criteria for evaluating indigenous involvement in educational broadcasting because, although theoretical discussions of participation do occur among Latin American researchers, few verifiable standards for evaluating rural involvement seem to exist. A problem evident in Latin American communication research is that Latin American researchers tend to be
urban-centered and university-educated, which results in social
and cultural isolation from the rural reality. These
non-indigenous researchers are often unaware of the consequences
of their policies. This affects their definition of terms and
their choice of priorities for indigenous broadcasting. It was
thus necessary for me to consult Latin American radio school
personnel and rural dwellers who do not read theoretical
discussions on research methodology, and who are more involved
in the actual rural context, in order to develop the criteria
used in this thesis.

I discovered in my conversations with Latin American
radio school staff and researchers that the Latin American
concept of "feedback," per se, is different from the classical
feedback paradigm. The radio school staff stress the active
participation of student-listeners and maximum local expression,
features not possible within closed-loop feedback systems. The
concept of feedback\(^6\) usually suggests a privilege of sources
(radio stations) which limits the receivers (the audience) to
merely responding to the initiatives of those controlling the
mass media. When local program production becomes
deprofessionalized, however, communication becomes a mutual
process conducted between equal communicators, and feedback is
used to ensure that the message is adjusted to take into
consideration the needs, aptitudes and preferences of
participating communicators. This is the definition of
communication employed in this thesis.

1.3 Why Audience-Relation Analysis?
Audience-relation analysis provides a means of mapping how control is structured in any given radio school. It provides an alternative to the "servo-centric feedback" paradigm, which is unacceptable because it allows for inequality between those who control the system and those who are part of it, a bias against indigenous input, the interpretation of feedback to support externally determined objectives, and limited opportunities for local participation.

Audience-relation analysis differs from feedback analysis precisely in its assumptions about the role of the local people. Audience-relation analysis emphasises local community input in the development of appropriate alternative media. The focus of control is shifted from traditional institutional, commercial, and governmental sources to that of local autonomous groups. Audience-relation analysis encourages the transformation of existing hierarchical relations by promoting endogenous and democratic structural change. Not only are the language, culture and opinions of the local people given priority over those of the dominant sectors of society, but the local people are actually brought into station planning, programming, and decision-making. In the process, they learn to operate their own media and create their own forms of alternative programming. Thus, audience-relation analysis provides not only a means of mapping the way in which control is structured in a station, but also suggests how to transform hierarchical (vertical) structures into more participatory (horizontal) structures.
1.4 Chapter Breakdown

In my second chapter I describe my research experiences in Latin America and my conceptualization of audience-relation analysis. This section includes the presentation of my methodological framework, research difficulties, and definition of key terms to be used throughout this thesis. In chapter two I also describe the audience-relation continuum as a means of assessing relations between a community and its local radio station. I then classify three audience-relation model types, the formal-instructional model, the mutual-development model, and the radical-change model in terms of the relative levels of access, participation, self-management, and also the four categories of primary factors pertaining to audience-station relations.

In chapters three, four and five respectively, I describe the basis of the formal-instructional, mutual-development, and radical-change models of audience-station relations, as well as the characteristics of those educational radio stations adopting these models. The second half of each of these chapters contains a case study analysis of a Bolivian radio school whose audience-relations approach that of the model described in the appropriate chapter. The radio schools studied include Radio San Rafael, Cochabamba (chapter three), Radio San Gabriel, La Paz (chapter four), and Radio Pío XII, Llallagua (chapter five). Each case study includes a historical review of station operations, a profile of station activities, a discussion of station decision-making, an analysis of
audience-station relations, and possible suggestions as to how the station could be improved.

Chapter six contains a discussion of audience-relation analysis within the broader context of educational radio broadcasting in Latin America. Discussion includes the organizational and economic relationships which tend to predominate, and constraints or obstacles which hinder local participation in educational radio broadcasting.

In my concluding chapter I clarify the theoretical basis of audience-relation analysis and its relevance to the radio schools of Bolivia. I also discuss the broader implications of technological, ideological, social, organizational, and financial dependencies which constrain rural communities in the appropriation of and participation in alternative radio. I then suggest possible courses of action to be pursued by radio school staff and management, grass-roots organizations, and local communities in progressing toward the democratization of communication.
Chapter Two:

Research Experiences and the Conceptualization
of Audience Relation Analysis

2.0 Research Experiences

Because the theoretical basis for this study evolved largely out of the field research I undertook in Latin America, a description of the research I did is essential to an understanding of the audience-relation analysis framework I have developed. I initially planned to do a comparative analysis of audience-station relationships based upon published reports and field investigation of educational radio stations in Colombia, Ecuador and Bolivia. My first step was to consult available literature, and to interview visiting Latin American researchers in order to outline basic research questions I would pursue. I sent letters of inquiry to numerous Latin American educational radio stations, research institutions and experts in the field and then travelled to South America to tour those stations and research institutions from which I had received a positive response. While in Latin America I made additional contacts which helped me in my study.

In the course of the three month field research portion of my thesis, I conducted interviews at ten radio stations in Colombia, Ecuador, and Bolivia. These stations included Radio Sutatenza (ACPO), Radio Caracol, Escuelas Radiofónicas Populares del Ecuador, Radio Latacunga, Radio Colta, Radio HCJB, Radio
Ghana, Radio San Gabriel, Radio San Rafael, and Radio Pío XII. I also interviewed staff from Radio Shuar, Radio Acción Cultural Loyola, and Radio Enriquillo as well as from numerous other related institutions such as the Latin American Association of Educational Radio (ALER), the International Center for Higher Studies in Journalism for Latin America (CIESPAL), the Bolivian Association of Radiophonic Education (ERBOL), the Catholic Association for Radio and Television in Latin America (UNDA/AL), Universidad Abierta de Colombia, and Universidad Javeriana. This experience has proven invaluable to me in selecting stations for analysis, in developing research questions, and in developing a theory of audience-relation analysis.

The selection of specific radio schools as case study examples depended on a favorable response to initial inquiry and on support of the proposed research project by station directors. I selected stations on the basis of similar size, minimal political obstacles, and relatively close proximity. I consulted senior researchers including Eduardo Contreras and Antonio Cabezas of CIESPAL, and Carlos Crespo and Marita Paiva of ALER as to which three stations would constitute a fair representation of the diversity among radio schools.

I selected Radio San Gabriel of La Paz, Radio San Rafael of Cochabamba, and Radio Pío XII of Llallagua, all located in Bolivia. Each of these three stations is unique in its organizational structure, type of station operations, political and educational affiliation, and other factors pertaining to audience-station relations. Three Bolivian radio schools were
selected in order to compare the operations of stations operating under the same tumultuous political and economic conditions and to maintain a level of consonance in social, cultural, and educational factors which vary from nation to nation. This uniformity simplifies the presentation and analysis of data related to the national reality.

2.1 Radio In Bolivia

The majority of Bolivia's 127 medium wave radio stations are located in Bolivia's seven major population centers: La Paz, Cochabamba, Sucre, Oruro, Santa Cruz, Potosí, and Tarija. Only twelve stations have output of 10 kilowatts or greater, and 103 stations have output of less than 3 kilowatts. The majority of stations have few staff, low budgets and small audiences. All stations except for the few which are sponsored by the church, development agencies, unions, and political parties, rely heavily upon commercial advertising revenue. A typical station would broadcast popular music, news, and editorial commentaries. A minority of stations represent special interest groups such as the Catholic church, the mining unions of Siglo XX, and various Protestant churches.

Very few commercial stations broadcast in Aymara or Quechua, largely because advertising revenue comes primarily from the Spanish sector. It is difficult to mix native and Spanish-language broadcasts without offending Spanish-speaking audiences. Of all the stations registered with the Bolivian Association of Radio Broadcasters (ASORBA), only 14 are members of Bolivian Association of Educational Radio (ERBOL). These
stations broadcast a variety of educational, cultural, religious, entertainment, and news programming.  

2.2 The Catholic Church in Bolivia

Approximately 90 percent of Bolivia's population is affiliated with the Roman Catholic Church. The Bolivian church is conservative, governed by a hierarchy of predominantly non-Bolivian missionary priests. Although some clergy sympathize with liberation theology, the church has made few discernable attempts to align itself politically with the poor. In November of 1984 the Catholic bishops made a highly publicized effort to bring together representatives of political parties, workers' organizations, and business interests. After many days of debate, little changed.

Although the Bolivian Catholic Church has not aligned itself politically with the poor, it has been a central force in the peasant culture for centuries. Much Bolivian Catholicism is of the "folk" variety. This involves the combination of the traditions of the Aymara and Quechua peoples with the doctrine of the church. Unlike the Brazilian church which has developed more "lay-involvement" models such as basic ecclesiastical communities (comunidades de base), the Bolivian church hierarchy retains an authoritarian structure. The Catholic radio schools, however, have attempted to serve the rural poor.

2.3 Research Method

I developed a set of descriptive and open-ended questions to use with the three stations in order to explore the relationship between the stations and their audiences. I then
conducted interviews with station directors, technicians, reporters, teachers, secretaries, and extension workers. In addition, I talked with visiting union representatives, catequists, local officials, and campesinos (rural peasants) about their contact with the station and their assessment of its operations. I attempted to corroborate interview responses and to identify politically and culturally sensitive issues by observing station operations for a number of days. My own observations yielded qualitative impressions of audience contact and involvement with various radio stations.

I was able to develop a close rapport with most radio school staff after taking part in station activities and travelling with promoters to local communities. Once an initial level of confidence developed, staff opened up and expressed the positive and negative aspects of their station. Staff often questioned me about my own motivation for completing such a study before they answered my questions.

2.3.1 Research Difficulties

The difficulties I experienced obtaining data (let alone reliable data) greatly sharpened my awareness of the obstacles faced by Latin American researchers. The unavailability of recent audience surveys for the rural areas in question reflects the difficulties (i.e. high costs, and inconsistencies) involved. Even previous simplistic participant research conducted by indigenous-language campesinos has yielded conflicting findings.

The difficulties I encountered in collecting information
included poor land transportation which impeded access to many rural areas. Hence, during my time there, I found it impossible to visit the majority of rural communities serviced by a given station. Similarly, although prior arrangements had been made, not all station personnel and community representatives were available for consultation at the time of my visit. Interaction with indigenous-language *campeños* required the assistance of local intermediaries to establish an atmosphere of trust with the people interviewed. I made prior contact with station officials and I established relationships with respected intermediaries such as a local Catholic priest or a trusted radio school reporter or agricultural extension agent who would assist me in making contact with the people.

In the course of my field investigation I found that access to the countryside was difficult except in coordination with community visits by station personnel. I relied upon the radio staff to arrange transportation and to encourage a sense of rapport with the local people. Similarly, when conducting interviews with indigenous people I relied upon Quechua and Aymara staff who understood the nuances and oral syntax of their native language. Staff facilitated contact with community opinion leaders including mayors, village elders, labor union executives, educational authorities, and farming cooperatives.10

Another problem I encountered was the pre-conceived notions that residents and radio school staff had concerning the desired response to interview questions. The indigenous *campeños* were often hesitant when questioned. In conducting
Interviews with Quechua and Aymara peoples I encountered fear and superstition of strangers derived from age old experience and practices. One Quechua tradition, the Chupa Sangre tradition, perpetuates the fear of strangers. Traditionally, outsiders are seen as bringing bad luck and taking both physical and magical advantage of the local people. Merely speaking Spanish to many rural Quechua can cause intimidation. Radio school staff were also apprehensive about criticising station activities in the presence of foreigners who may represent funding agencies. Many fear that what little they have will be taken away if they reveal deficiencies in local station operations. Likewise, local residents are hesitant to express political views because personnel at radio stations including Radio San Rafael and Radio Pío XII have been kidnapped and listed as missing.

2.3.2 Varying Definition of Terms

While conducting interviews with educated radio school staff and illiterate campesinos, I became aware of varying definitions of key terms such as participation, involvement, access, and conscientization. The field research component of this study demonstrates the different worlds of understanding held by those individuals and groups involved in educational radio broadcasting. Researchers and policy analysts adopt one definition of these key terms, the radio school staff and the educational agents another definition, and the local indigenous population yet another.

2.3.3 Indigenous Station Personnel
In interviewing indigenous station personnel, I heard conflicting opinions concerning station policy; in certain cases it was next to impossible to obtain a definitive response. Station personnel seemed to feel compelled to create a favorable impression as if future sources of financing were at stake. In certain cases I was asked outright to assist in financing local projects.

Throughout Bolivia, radio staff were introduced to me as coming from campesino, Quechua, or Aymara backgrounds. A close observation of social interaction, clothing, verbal expression, etc., revealed that station personnel of indigenous extraction tend to change their native cultural, linguistic, and social practices to adapt to the urban environment. It was difficult for me to discern who reflected actual campesino concerns and who reflected an urbanized departure from indigenous cultural and linguistic realities. Urbanized radio school staff often add Spanish words to Quechua phrases to show that as former campesinos they have risen to a superior social level. Thus interviews with urbanized campesinos do not necessarily represent a portrayal of campesino views. The views of relatively new employees at the station, and those of employees who have left the station shed a different light on the relation between the station and native peoples.

2.3.4 Available Literature

In collecting data concerning each of my case studies, I encountered a lack of recent published material. Therefore, I relied upon unpublished station reports and evaluations.
Available case studies and reports were consulted whenever possible, yet even the large scale 1980 *Análisis de Sistemas de Educación Radiódonica* study is outdated in terms of actual station operations. Information related to station history and technical data was obtained from reports, yet many details pertaining to day to day station operations were not available.

2.4 Latin American Communication Research

Although I found little data for my case studies in published research studies, the Latin American communications research I encountered has proved to be as essential to this study as the data I gathered on specific radio stations. What follows is a survey of Latin American Communications theory which influenced my conceptualization of audience relation analysis.

In Latin America, national communication models have gained prestige over foreign models and new genres of research are advancing rapidly. Juan Díaz Bordenave states: "We must overcome our mental compulsion to perceive our reality through foreign concepts and ideologies and learn to look at communication and adoption from a new perspective." Latin American research is coming of age.

Latin American communications researchers and research groups including the International Centre for Higher Studies in Journalism for Latin America (CIESPAL), the Latin American Association of Educational Radio (ALER), the Latin
American Catholic Association for Radio and Television, (UNDA/AL), the Centre for the Study and Promotion of Development (DECOS), etc., are involved in research in areas such as the democratization of communication, grass-roots participation, alternative communication, and a host of other topics. Unfortunately, most of this research is unavailable in North America.

Latin American criticism of the "classical transmission-persuasion, pro status quo paradigm" centers around the undemocratic nature of social relationships within nations and between them. Criticism is condensed in the expression **comunicación vertical** describing communication which is top-down, domineering and undemocratic in nature. Communication, per se, is viewed as a political matter, largely determined by the economic, cultural, and political structure of society. The suggested alternative to vertical communication is horizontal and democratic communication.

There is a growing awareness among Latin American researchers of what they call **incomunicación social** (social incommunication) among the rural poor. This form of isolation is experienced by those marginalized groups and individuals who have limited access to centers of information and power including mass communication channels. Commercial media are seen to reflect the same patterns of political and economic domination which are part of the reality of marginalization and rural poverty. Political oppression, censorship of the press, the domination of urban-oriented commercial channels, and the
lack of indigenous-language programming reflect cultural and linguistic homogenization, social alienation, and migration to the cities. Latin American research groups are calling for more equitable dissemination and production of information as well as the appropriation of indigenous communication processes and channels by rural audiences. One suggested response to the concentration of national media ownership is the development of alternative communication media.

2.4.1 Freire and the Audience Relation

The work of Paulo Freire\textsuperscript{17} has been influential in the development of educational radio broadcasting in Latin America and is central to audience-relation analysis. Freire's methods of consciousness-raising are an attempt to illuminate the existing infrastructure of relations affecting the lives of the oppressed. His work is based on his notion of conscientization -- the development of critical awareness by engaging in a process of conscious action and critical reflection.

Community understanding of audience relations would be one application of this process of conscientization. Campesino understanding of how mass media is structured to exclude their participation and how it could be structured to involve them is part of the process. Freire stresses not only awareness of how a situation is structured against the oppressed, but also active involvement of the oppressed in transforming their situation.

The way audience-relation analysis emphasizes audience participation in the decision-making and operation of radio stations reflects such an awareness and involvement-based
2.4.2 Alternative Communication

Alternative communication (comunicación alternativa) is a term which was first used in the 1960's to denote a variety of non-commercial, education and development-oriented mass communication experiments. Throughout Latin America there are a number of similar projects which exist under different names: "popular communication" (comunicación popular), participatory communication and horizontal communication. These projects have the common goal of opposing institutionalized, vertical, and official communication channels and promoting just and democratic social and economic relations. Latin American authors view alternative communication as one response by the "popular" sector to forms of social, political, economic, and cultural domination. Indigenous-based alternative communication projects are often highly political in their emphasis on social, communicational, and political rights. The expansion of the activities of radical groups such as the M 19, the Sendero Luminoso (the shining path), and the Rumiñahui represent movements intent upon affecting social, political and economic change. Many progressive groups include on their agenda the goal of establishing communication channels which represent the voice of those subjected to the dominant flow of information.

In addition to political parties and groups with more explicit political purposes, a variety of social and cultural minorities are involved in the development of alternative media. Local community groups make up this category. They seek to
decentralize media communications in order to give an active and meaningful role to marginalized sectors of the population including youth, women, campesinos, neighborhood groups, and base communities.  

The third category is composed of trade unions (such as the Bolivian miners' unions), campesino groups, farming cooperatives, and other formally organized indigenous groups each of which has its own communication network. These groups tend to emphasize socially and technically useful information instead of entertainment content. The projects supported by these groups have a narrow focus which cater to a specific occupational group. Groups such as Bolivian mining unions emphasize political dimensions of local problems, and experience the same forms of opposition and censorship as minority political parties.

2.4.3 Vertical Communication

Vertical communication, (comunicación vertical) as defined by Encalada, is the elites' one-way and top-down use of communication media as a means of securing advantage over the poorer classes. This pattern of communication results in a subject-object relationship which is structured so that the recipient has no say or part in what is received. The recipient is deprived of input to the decision-making process and denied the opportunity to supplement media content.

One-way and vertical communication characterizes all stages of the communication process. At the group level, a select few carry out decision-making biased by their particular
interests. Similarly, at the community level dominant social groups usurp political and communication channels, and thus mediate the flow of information and the control of local institutions. At the institutional level, inflexible hierarchical structures result in a permanent bias against horizontally-based community channels. At the mass level, media ownership, administration, and content selection is limited to a few dominant groups, effectively excluding public input. At the international level, this is evident when more powerful nations control the flow of information to and from poorer nations. This unidirectional communication flow leaves the poorer nations at a disadvantage, as they become dependent on the source of information control.

2.4.4 The Democratization of Communication

The democratization of communication is defined as the process whereby the individual becomes an active partner in the production, selection, transmission, and evaluation of information. In this process station and audience increasingly exchange messages between each other thereby improving the extent and quality of participation in communication.

The MacBride Commission refers to four different levels of initiatives in the democratization of communication. The first stage provides access to the overall communication system through providing the audience with a means to reply and criticize various forms of feedback, and through regular contact between program producers and the audience. The second level includes non-professionals in producing and transmitting
programs, and utilizes local sources of information and untapped human resources. The third stage develops alternative communication channels at the local level. The final stage involves the community and media users in the management and decision-making processes.

Complex, competing national and regional political forces limit the development of such forms of management. Practical forms of self-management are often possible only at the local level; hence, the decentralization of the mass media is key to the democratization of communication. It includes establishing local radio stations and regional production centres to foster the expression of rural needs and interests. One threat to the democratization of communication is the tendency for "decentralized" media to model themselves after powerful centralized stations, resulting in situations of local corporatism or mirroring of the local social hierarchy. This tendency is increased when those in positions of authority have experience in more traditional educational media. Similarly, patterns of station ownership and decision-making perpetuate a "bigger-is-better" mentality. This perspective brings about a false sensation of stability and prestige.

2.4.5 The Concept of Access

Access refers to the ability of individuals and groups to come closer to communication media. Access can be described in terms of choice and feedback. Choice in access implies the right to communication materials, program selection, location of program reception, and the transmission of materials
requested by the public. Feedback in access includes a relationship of interaction between producers and receivers of messages; direct participation by the audience during the transmission of programs; the right to critique messages; and a means of maintaining contact with producers and station administrators.\textsuperscript{33}

In most rural areas of Latin America, access to the media depends on social, educational, and economic structures. In any urban center the upper class minority has greater access to the media than the rest of the population. In rural areas, an even smaller minority have the privilege of access to electronic mass media.\textsuperscript{34} Authors including Encalada state that a lack of access to communication media produces \textit{incomunicación social} (social incommunication) among \textit{campesinos}.\textsuperscript{35} \textit{Incomunicación social} refers to alienation and marginalization experienced by the oppressed in society. One result is that a large sector of the population has no significant involvement in emitting radio messages. The social need to employ communication resources as a means of maintaining autonomous group existence is denied to the majority of rural dwellers.\textsuperscript{36}

2.4.6 The Concept of Participation

Historically, the participation of the marginalized has been controlled in that group action has been limited to externally pre-established goals.\textsuperscript{37} The media, government and landowners have equally treated \textit{campesinos} as production factors. The \textit{campesinos} have not been permitted to have their own say.
A contemporary Latin American approach to development and education emphasizes higher levels of public involvement in social transformation. Genuine community participation involves conscientization, politicization, organization, and action. Participation in media is defined as "the effective exercise of the right to emit messages." Participation processes should function as popular pedagogies—educational processes analyzing reality, exposing the ideology of the dominant class, and mobilizing popular classes to action directed toward social change.

Participation, as defined by Latin American researchers, involves local community members at three levels: production, decision-making, and planning. At the level of production, participation implies unlimited opportunities for the public to produce media programs and to have access to technical facilities, production resources, and professional assistance in achieving higher levels of participation. At the level of decision-making, participation implies local involvement in the management, administration and financing of communication projects, as well as the content and scheduling of programs. At the planning level, participation includes the public right to contribute to plans and policy formulation for future communication projects, the definition of management objectives and principles, and the formulation of national, regional and local communication plans.

Chantar cites the following six levels of participation: 1) the definition of objectives, 2) the preparation of...
policies, 3) the preparation for action plans, 4) decision-making, 5) the execution of programs, and 6) project control and evaluation. Latin American practitioners involved in alternative radio stations take this conceptualization of participation one step further. José Ignacio of Radio Enriquillo states that popular participation is not limited to station operations; it includes the station taking a conscious ideological stance. Popular participation becomes extremely political. According to Ignacio's definition of participation, a truly participatory radio station would assume the ideological stance of a certain sector of the population to identify with their struggle.

The above-mentioned theoretical ideals held by Latin American communications researchers are often removed from the actual practice of Latin American radio schools where participation on a reasonably extensive scale has hardly been contemplated let alone put into practice. The majority of educational radio institutions continue to be conservative in their definition of participation. Like their North American counterparts, most stations perceive audience participation in three basic forms: regular listening to broadcasts, involvement in discussion groups and extension courses, and audience response in the form of letters and visits to the station.

"Participation" itself is the most abused catchword of the 1960's and 1970's. Projects operating under the guise of indigenous, participatory development often perpetuate authoritarian social relations, dependency, social stratifi-
cation, and external systemic control. Early attempts at "participatory research" have had very little to do with significant local involvement in the evaluation of the local situation, the definition of problems, possible solutions to the problems, and the evaluation of the entire process.

In the majority of cases, existing communication processes are non-participatory in nature. Members of the audience are considered as objects and not subjects of the communication process. This results in major implications for the organization and evaluation of mass communication. Researchers have merely exchanged the defunct feedback paradigm for the participation paradigm in their rhetoric, thus perpetuating semantic myths rather than changing existing practices.

In addition, few small-scale radio projects utilize theoretical resource materials. Despite the strong advocacy of popular participation in Latin American writings on development and education, theoretical assertions are seldom backed up with empirical evidence. Dr. René Hauzer and Alfredo Paiva, concur with these observations.

In the 1980 Análisis de Sistemas de Educación Radiofónica, the most important study to date conducted by the Latin American Association of Educational Radio (ALER), only evaluated participation in terms of the satisfaction station staff expressed about their level of input into programming and station management. Part of the reticence to conducting practical evaluations of community participation in educational media projects is due to the lack of standard criteria, the
variation in existing station practices, controversy regarding the definition and priority given to participation, and the lack of significant audience involvement in station operations.

Because most actual practice at radio schools does not reflect the theory and rhetoric of local participation, an important issue is how genuine participation can be fostered. J.D. Hogg states that individuals will generally act out of self-interest; they will seldom wish to participate in collective decision-making because its costs and demands ordinarily exceed its benefits. Yet the suggested participatory structure for educational broadcasting depends upon public initiative, decision-making input, and responsibility for station operations.

Active social, political, and economic participation in alternative educational media is often seen in the literature reviewed to be dependent upon a change in attitude which enables a person to take part in improving his or her local situation. Latin American literature on rural participation often focuses on the ideological implications of participation in social change. In certain Catholic circles discussion of popular participation often reflects notions of Christian solidarity and cooperation more than the materialist notions of Marxism or interest-group theory. Projects dedicated to popular promotion and community development are based on the premise that participation can be achieved through training and good will, which in time results in greater well being for the whole of humankind. These two premises run through all the analysis
reviewed here.

A report published by Radio Acción Cultural Loyola states that the levels of participation attained depend upon the measures taken by individual media ventures to define and promote participation. Levels of participation could also be seen to depend upon the availability of communication channels for local input into station programming. However, even though station personnel frequently use the term participation, it is often not equated with more far reaching social and political powers. Participation is stressed in terms of self-development; lesser importance is given to the social power of the campesinos as a means of liberation.

It is difficult to determine whether the development of participatory communication in Latin America is a process of autonomous self-discovery or if it requires a highly structured and mediated process only achievable with the assistance of external initiatives. Public participation advocates view cooperative grass-roots organizations as essential for initiating authentic participation, social change, increased productivity, and improved living conditions. These organizations formulate their message independently of established communication networks and begin to build their own horizontal communication networks. The lack of effective peasant organizations, however, ensures continued marginalization, dependency and external domination. If the self-generation of messages, the accurate perception of basic local needs, spontaneity of self-expression, and local responsi-
bility in project direction are critical aspects of participatory communication, then few educational or development-based media projects in Latin America are participatory in nature.

2.4.7 The Concept of Self-Management

The most advanced form of participation and access is self-management which refers to direct public involvement in the formulation of communication plans and policies, media decision-making processes, and day-to-day station operations. Whereas participation may mean no more than consulting the public in decision-making processes, self-management is based upon the local community's direct involvement in and responsibility for local media ventures. In cases of self-management the local people themselves function as station directors and staff. Hence, self-management provides clear criteria for the evaluation of local involvement in mass media.

Two of the major obstacles to communication systems self-management are external initiation of local media projects and external ownership. External organizations have financed and initiated the majority of Latin American educational radio stations. Few stations are aware of the impact of economic dependency upon indigenous self-management of the media. Self-management of local media by the so-called "popular" or impoverished sectors of society depends on community autonomy and a wide range of freedoms not present if there is external ownership or management. Where there is little autonomy and self-determination of media systems, it is difficult to initiate indigenous appropriation and self-management of the media.
2.5 Audience-Relation Analysis

In the remainder of this chapter I will develop the criteria I used to assess relations between a community and its local educational radio station. In order to systematically analyze audience-station relations I developed a continuum of audience relations based on the Latin American communications research discussed above.

Beltrán proposes that in terms of the degree of difficulty of attainment and practical viability, there is a sequential progression from access to participation. It is easier to encourage audience reception of radio signals than to encourage conditions where community participation and self-management are progressively made possible. My audience-relation continuum represents this progression in audience-media interaction through three stages: from access to participation to self-management. Table 2-1 defines the three stages of my audience-relation continuum in terms of "station operations," one of the five categories of primary factors affecting audience relations to be discussed in the next section. I have broken down each stage of access, participation and self-management into three stages of application. A station may be evaluated from zero to three in each area, and from zero to nine on the continuum. In completing this type of analysis, it is essential to provide an overview of station decision-making which documents which individuals are consulted and which individuals make the actual decisions. Through assessing the horizontal or vertical channels of local involvement in station activities, it
is possible to analyze the interaction between the station and local organizations carrying out similar activities. It is important to recognize that educational radio strategies are continually evolving in response to suggestions on the part of a radio station's staff, administration, and the local community. Any examination of a station's audience relations at a given point in time is like one still photograph in a series of pictures. The concepts of access, participation, and self-management are interdependent in the development of horizontal communication within the system. A quantitative increase in access results in greater possibilities for local participation, and more qualitative dialogue results in greater usefulness of access and the higher impact of participation. In this way the three levels on the audience relation continuum can be seen to correspond to the degree of conscientization among the local population group. The enrichment of these three components results in the satisfaction of communication needs and the utilization of human resources.
Table 2-1: The Audience-Relation Continuum

**LEVEL 1 ACCESS:**
clear signal reception; occasional listening.

**LEVEL 2 ACCESS:**
access to learning materials and contact with station personnel; local discussion groups.

**LEVEL 3 ACCESS:**
access to regional courses or training days; indigenous language broadcasting; community promoters; multiple course levels; multiple instructional media used.

**LEVEL 1 PARTICIPATION:**
input of primary leaders in course planning; de-mystification of radio; indigenous staff.

**LEVEL 2 PARTICIPATION:**
consultation in decision-making by leaders and select community members; indigenous initiation of courses; and expression of local political views.

**LEVEL 3 PARTICIPATION:**
participation in program selection and station evaluation; decision-making apprenticeship; popular reporters program; coordination with external community groups; and community decision-making input.

**LEVEL 1 SELF-MANAGEMENT:**
indigenous pedagogy and programming; local selection of staff and staff training.

**LEVEL 2 SELF-MANAGEMENT:**
indigenous decision-making; political, editorial, and research autonomy.

**LEVEL 3 SELF-MANAGEMENT:**
indigenous ownership, financing, and technical upkeep; autonomous infrastructure.
2.5.1 Primary Factors in Assessing the Audience Relation

In my attempt to establish basic guidelines for the comparison of audience relation models employed by different stations, I developed a list of important factors to evaluate. In this section I will describe these primary factors essential to the assessment of the audience relations of educational radio stations. Primary factors are those which have significant effects upon the audience relations of the majority of educational radio stations in Latin America. These variables (see Table 2-2 on the following page) have been selected with the assistance of Antonio Cabezas (CIESPAL), Bernardo Toro (editor, Educación Hoy), as well as radio school staff and academic researchers.

My analysis of factors pertaining to audience-station relations is not quantitative in method due to difficulties in collecting useful quantitative data. The qualitative form of investigation which I adopted enabled me to explore factors often obscured from the view of external researchers. These factors pertain to the role of administrative authorities in the control of decision-making processes. A lack of understanding of station policy-making on the part of staff and community members reflects a reliance upon unseen decision-making strategies. Community members see the result of established decision-making patterns without being aware of underlying political processes.

Depending upon the local situation, a single factor may serve to inhibit and/or encourage access, participation, and
Table 2-2
Factors Affecting the Audience Relation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DESCRIPTION OF FACTORS</th>
<th>EFFECT UPON THE AUDIENCE RELATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INHIBITS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DIMENSION OF STATION:**
- High kw Transmission Power: x x
- Wide Radial Distance: x x x
- Mobile Transmission Unit: x
- Large Number of Staff: x x
- Large Number of Students: x

**COMMUNITY CONTACT:**
- Rural Location: x
- Frequent Visits to Station: x
- Infrastructure of Promoters: x x
- Numerous Local Meetings: x x
- Frequent Rural Visits: x x
- Numerous Letters Received: x x
- Letters Replied: x x
- Association With Local Groups: x

**EDUCATIONAL METHOD:**
- Native-Language Instruction: x
- Multiple Course Levels: x
- Agricultural Courses: x
- Flexibility in Programming: x
- Use of Multiple Media: x
- Community Based Production: x
- Local Research Input: x
- Local Evaluation Input: x
- Formal Instruction Method: x x
- Conscientization Method: x

**INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURE:**
- Indigenous Appropriation: x
- Community Decision-Making: x
- Assoc. with Educ. Authority: x x
- Assoc. with Government: x x
- Vertical Decision-Making: x x
- High Input into Programming: x

**GENERAL FACTORS**
- Political Oppression: x
- Poor Land Transport: x
- Multiple Languages/Cultures: x
- High Cost of Batteries: x
- Hierarchical Social Relations: x x
- Station Environment: x x x
- Local Selection of Promoters: x
- Urban Migration: x
- Drought: x
- Source of Financing: x x x
- Area Radio Competition: x
- Ideological/Religious Base: x x x
self-management. The varying effect of factors may be attributed to changes in station policy-making and conflicting viewpoints about the assessment of access, participation, and self-management. It is impossible to discern all of the implications surrounding any one factor. However, it is possible to assess the general effect of any single factor on the relation between the audience and the radio station.

I have classified primary variables pertaining to the audience relation in the following five categories: dimension of station operations (staff size, kilowatt output etc.), institutional structure, educational method, community contact, and general external factors. I have structured each case study around these five categories. What follows is a discussion of each category.

2.5.1.1 The Dimension of Station Operations

This category includes such characteristics as transmission power, area of signal coverage, staff and audience size. The implications of station dimensions are difficult to interpret. For example, a station transmitting with over ten kilowatts in power and reaching a radial distance of over one hundred fifty kilometers in itself promotes only primary and secondary access levels on the audience-relation continuum (see Table 2-1). Participation and self-management would become possible only when other conditions are also met. To overcome two-way communication problems created by great distances, stations often create a network of intermediaries. Personal contact becomes an important catalyst for motivating campesinos
to collaborate on joint projects.

A large number of staff and promoters helps a station make contact with isolated communities. Yet in many cases, local citizens never have opportunity to appropriate secondary and tertiary levels of participation and primary levels of self-management. Stations with a large number of students active in extension courses do not have the manpower or resources to train such a group, let alone begin to meet their individual needs. On the basis of my experience in Bolivia I conclude that unlimited station expansion is contrary to the ideals of access, participation, and self-management.

2.5.1.2 Community Contact

Similar to the difficulty of interpreting the implications of the station dimension on audience relations, assessing contact established between the local community and its radio station is a difficult task. It is one thing for a station to look good on paper, and another for it to make contact with its audience and respond to their needs. Having a rural location, frequent campesino visits, and numerous local meetings may reflect positive links with the local community, yet may also involve isolation, transportation difficulties, lack of interest in meetings, and minimal community involvement in station activities. The possibility for community contact must be complemented by channels for local involvement, direct response to local needs, response to campesino letters, and healthy relationships between station staff and the community.

One ambiguous aspect of community contact is the effect
of a network of volunteer extension workers or promoters who visit rural groups and encourage participation in radio school courses and training programs. In general, a well organized group of local promoters would seem to be a very positive way to promote audience involvement. However, the success of any such rural auxiliary worker network depends largely on their selection, training, remuneration and autonomy. A highly organized promoters network may result in excessive station control over processes of promoter selection and organization. The potential exists to create an elitist form of representation which merely mirrors the existing dominant power structures.  

2.5.1.3 Educational Method

The implied educational method of Latin American radio schools suggests that to gain a marginalized audience, encourage local autonomous involvement, and develop needs-centred programming, it is essential to use the local indigenous language in programming, to use multiple educational media, and to ensure that local research and evaluation are undertaken. An educational methodology which emphasizes Freire's conscientization approach encourages higher levels of access, participation, and self-management on the audience-relation continuum. Similarly, indigenous program production and decision-making are central to the development of advanced relations between the community and the local radio station.  

2.5.1.4 Institutional Structure

The two major areas of concern in the discussion of the institutional structure of educational broadcasting are the
indigenous appropriation of station operation and the development of horizontal decision-making infrastructures. At this point we must distinguish between station ownership and station appropriation. This distinction is simplified if one examines the station decision-making infrastructures to determine whether a station employs primarily vertical or horizontal decision-making. It is possible to discern cases where community involvement includes more than occasional or casual consultation to regular channels of local input in major aspects of station decision-making. Stations, including Radio Pío XII, are evolving from one method of decision-making to another.

It is necessary to determine the structure of the relationship between the station and other entities such as the local government, the ministry of education, and local grass-roots organizations. In the majority of Latin American radio schools, political conflict has made it necessary for the Catholic Church, as opposed to the local people themselves, to own the local educational radio station. It is important to differentiate between cases where Church ownership protects station operations and those cases where it inhibits the appropriation of station operations by the local community. José Ignacio of Radio Enriquillo states that if it were to transfer its ownership from the Church to the community, it would risk immediate closure and destruction of facilities.59

2.6 Classification of Audience-Relation Model Types

In the following three chapters I will present three case studies to illustrate three different audience-relation
model types adopted by Latin American educational radio stations: the formal-instructional model, the mutual-development model, and the indigenous-change model. These operational models will be developed in terms of the relative levels of access, participation and self-management, and also the four previously mentioned categories of factors pertaining to the audience relation. The brief description of these model types included in this section is not intended to be complete. Please refer to chapters three, four, and five for a further description.

The evolution from one audience-relation model type to another is evident in studying the history of Latin American radio schools. There has been a shift from an instructional-based model to a development-based model and then to an indigenous change model. This represents an evolution in the technical development of the medium, the stance of the Catholic Church, the educational use of the medium, the national literacy and education levels, and the development of political awareness and conscientization among the people. The marked shift in models represents rapid social change.

As stations progress from an instructional model to a development model there is often a change in the pedagogical orientation taken by the staff. The students themselves, rather than the educator, begin to serve as the centre of the mutually-defined educational process. One-way communication gradually shifts towards dialogue and the free expression of ideas. The change from one model to another is the result of
new communication and education paradigms, and a change in the
desires of increasingly political local communities. None of
the three models corresponds directly with my Bolivian case
studies (see Table 2-3). Audience-relation model types are
approximations of three approaches to audience-station
relations. Hence, a station resembles a model type but does not
conform to all of its characteristics.

In the majority of cases, I see the indigenous-change
model of audience relations as a theoretical ideal rather than
an operating model. Political, economic and organization
restrictions prevent numerous stations from developing truly
camperino-oriented broadcasting. Many of those stations which
have promoted more radical positions have been cut short in the
erly stages of operation. Hence the long term viability and
potential effect of such models is in question. The underlying
debate concerning the practicality of radical-change models
revolves around whether stations which risk closure have a
greater positive effect upon the community than more
conservative stations which remain neutral in times of political
repression. Stations with an instructional orientation maintain
that the preservation of station activities with half of the
immediate effect of radical-change models is preferable to the
cessation of station activities due to political conflict.

At the root of this conflict between approaches is a
difference in basic operating assumptions and goals. Stations
incorporating change-oriented operations stress the importance
of a network of local grass roots organizations which will
Table 2-3

Audience Relation Model Types

The following chart differentiates between various audience-relation models on the basis of four categories of factors. These generalizations are intended to serve as the basis for comparative models and hence are not representative of any one station. Similarly, there is a degree of variation between stations classified by the same model type.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DESCRIPTION OF FACTORS</th>
<th>AUDIENCE RELATION MODEL TYPE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Formal Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DIMENSION OF STATION:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Focus (10kw+)</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Focus (5-10kw)</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Focus (.5-5kw)</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wide Radial Distance</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large Number of Staff</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large Number of Students</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>COMMUNITY CONTACT:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Location</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequent Visits to Station</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure of Promoters</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Numerous Local Meetings</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequent Rural Visits</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letters Received</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letters Replied</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affiliated With Local Groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EDUCATIONAL METHOD:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous Language Instruction</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple Course Levels</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Agriculture Courses</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexibility in Programming</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Multiple Media</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Aids Offered</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Research Input</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Evaluation Input</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Instruction Method</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientization Method</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURE:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous Ownership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assoc. with Educ. Authority</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assoc. with Political Authority</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vertical Decision-Making</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Input into Programming</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
continue their work during times of persecution. Instructional stations advocate a continued educational process providing support for campesinos desiring to raise their level of education and to improve local living conditions. A station such as Radio Enriquillo maintains that political affiliation with the local people is essential to their own liberation and organization. Such views are dependent upon the extent of government opposition to political activism and the dangers which may result from it. The question remains: who decides the extent of political involvement and who controls the development of alternative educational radio?
Chapter Three:
The Formal-Instructional Model: Theory and Application

3.0 Theoretical Background

The roots of the formal-instructional audience relation model lie in the use of radio for literacy and catechism classes by Radio Sutatenza during the 1950's and 1960's. This model reinforces station-centric operations and hierarchical decision-making structures; there is little significant community input into decision-making processes, station organization, and program production. If evaluated in terms of the three-tiered audience-relation continuum, the formal-instructional model is characterized by the following: primary and secondary levels of access, primary levels of participation, and non-existent opportunities for self-management.

Stations employing the formal-instructional model delineate audience attitudes, behavior and action which will lead to supposed educational success. The emphasis is placed upon changing the individual rather than altering the economic or political system. With respect to programming, there is a high degree of audience persuasion and often a unidirectional communication of objectives. Instructional models are also characterized by closer association with the formal state system of education. These stations often receive financing from state sources and consult the national ministry of education concerning standardized course content.

The two factors which are most indicative of the formal
instructional model are the lack of freedom to express diverse political views, and the limited association with local organizations with political affiliations. These factors perpetuate an equilibrium model of development, which both supports existing economic structures and avoids conflict with political authorities. Stations adopting instructional models are more economically and politically stable, precluding radical political change. These stations often increase their kilowatt output and open audience size with the aid of foreign financing. Stability in station operations encourages long term planning, foreign capital investment in the physical plant, international political support, and generation of commercial revenue.

Stations with more formal audience relations are characterized by hierarchical station decision-making structures. Control of the organization lies in the hands of those select individuals in positions of authority. Centralized organizational infrastructures limit input at the grass-roots level and depersonalize contact with the local audience. Similarly, pedagogical methods adopted by these stations focus on the authority and expertise of the central educator as opposed to the experience and insight of the local people. This model reflects the rigid, authoritarian pedagogy of state controlled public schools.

My hypothesis is that the basis of audience relations maintained by radio stations with a strong Catholic affiliation is influenced by the campesino's lifelong allegiance to the Catholic Church. The pattern of campesino interaction with the
local radio school run by a Catholic priest is similar to the pattern of local involvement within the local Catholic Church. Structures of authority and channels of participation are conditioned by past relations between the local community and the government in power, the military, the public educational system, the Catholic Church, and also development agencies.

The following section contains a case study analysis of Radio San Gabriel in order to illustrate a station that approaches the characteristics of the formal instructional audience-relation model.

3.1 Case Analysis: Radio School San Rafael

The San Rafael Radio School was founded in 1960 by the Maryknoll Fathers, and served as part of their operations at Radio San Rafael. In the early days of Radio San Rafael, formal educational methods were practiced by the missionary priests to evangelize and to promote catechism among the Quechua.1

In 1965 station personnel, in an attempt to meet the needs of the poor, initiated the station’s educational department which produced Quechua-language programs in the areas of health, agriculture, and radio theatre. This focus was developed alongside San Rafael’s educational radio clubs which were established in campesino communities.2 In 1968 the radio school began literacy campaigns in cooperation with Radio ACLO. These campaigns stressed formal adult education programs and the leadership of local promoters. In 1972 station supervision changed hands from clergy to lay directorship and the literacy program was changed to incorporate Freirean psycho-social
learning methods. Systematized literacy programs incorporated group learning, community interviews, radio theatre, response to correspondence, and community training. Simultaneously, a three-tiered basic education program was initiated. The next year's programming included an increased emphasis upon agricultural, health, and women's programming. This phase of station growth culminated in 1973 when station ownership was transferred to the local Archdiocese of Cochabamba.

In 1978 the radio school discovered that its methods of literacy training did not meet the needs of its audience. The school's initial response included an increase in the number of training courses for community promoters and the systematization of radial programming and study guides. San Rafael also established a new sense of identity among local communities during the elections of 1978, 1979, and 1980. The radio school's concerted efforts toward developing campesino awareness of political parties and campesino perspectives on issues was one major influence in the inclusion of the marginalized in the political process. This period was one of political unrest in which government intervention and censorship disrupted San Rafael's broadcasts. As a result of the involvement of the radio school in political issues, two station personnel were arrested and one is still listed as missing.3

The 1980 ALER analysis of radio school objectives ushered in a new era in station operations. As a result of the study, rural radio broadcasts became more dynamic and contemporary, and literacy programming was reduced from one and a half
hours daily to fifteen minutes. In 1982 under the direction of the Archbishop, the role of the radio school was changed from serving as a department of Radio San Rafael to functioning as a separate organization renting station facilities. Both entities remain under the direction of the same Advisory Council and the Archbishop.

In 1982 the radio school initiated a new campaign which stressed campesino participation. Numerous innovative ideas were generated regarding correspondence, visits, training courses, etc. However, there was no coherent way of organizing this material. Many valuable experiences were lost for purposes of analysis by not recording what transpired. In 1983 San Rafael began a major evaluation of urban and rural operations, which was sponsored by the Inter-American Foundation and ERBOL.

This eighteen month study will clarify station and school objectives, and possibly resolve the conflict between these two groups. The findings of the joint study on station and school activities, and the decisions to be made by the Archbishop, the directors, and the Advisory Council may result in major changes in the role of the radio school, its organizational structure, and its educational focus, but further information is unavailable.

Although efforts have been made to ease tensions at Radio San Rafael, divergence still occurs between the objectives of the station and the school. The urban and rural departments of Radio San Rafael are in conflict over the following: programming objectives, studio space, professional standards,
the interpretation of local needs, the concept of participation, and the desired audience relation. The radio school also caters to a different target audience with a distinct culture, language and needs. The Archbishop and the radio station are politically and theologically more conservative than the school, and hence, are not as supportive of participatory education.\(^5\)

3.2 Station Decision-Making: Radio School San Rafael

Decision-making within the Radio School at San Rafael is complex in nature. In the organizational diagram on the following page (Table 3-1) we see that the Archbishopric and the Advisory Council exercise supervisory control over both the station and the school. The strong friendship between the station's director and the Archbishop influence upper-level decision-making concerning radio school policies and programs. Poor communication links between the radio school and the station, the Archbishop, and the Advisory Council hinder the development of its programs.

Sharing facilities with the station is beneficial to the radio school in that fewer technical staff are required for the upkeep of equipment. However, the existing relationship promotes dependency upon the station for services including technical operations and maintenance. This dependency complicates radio school operations and impedes the move toward horizontal communication. A lack of autonomy in station management inhibits participation among radio school staff and the local population in areas of program production and
Table 3-1:
Organizational Diagram: Radio School San Rafael
financing. Technical apprenticeship programs are also not available for radio school staff and community members. Furthermore, the urban/rural conflicts, frequent throughout Bolivia, are evident in the differences between the Spanish-language, urban-centred operations of the station and the Quechua-language educational programming of the radio school.

The station's understanding of participation is very different from that of the school. Salim Sauma, the station director, sees his urban audience as participating "internally" by listening and reflecting. In contrast, the radio school encourages participation in terms of involvement in station programming and training courses. There is also an emphasis upon critical reflection and problem solving within rural Quechua communities. With such divergent objectives a symbiotic relationship between these two bodies appears doubtful.

In examining Table 3-2 Station Decision-Making at Radio San Rafael (on the following page), we see that certain channels for local involvement are in place, yet policy-making rests primarily in the hands of the school director, the pedagogical head, and the production team. The director is consulted in seven key policy areas and is directly involved in decision-making in another fourteen areas. The pedagogical head is consulted in seven areas and is involved in decision-making in nine other areas, and the production team is consulted in nine areas and members of the decision-making team in six other areas. These staff roles are in contrast
Table 3-2: Decision-Making at Radio School San Rafael

This is a survey of those individuals or groups either directly involved in station decision-making processes (D), or consulted (C) concerning decision-making.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Decision-Making</th>
<th>Executive Council</th>
<th>School Director</th>
<th>Pedagogical Head</th>
<th>Production Team</th>
<th>Promoters Leaders</th>
<th>Local Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>STATION MANAGEMENT:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Policy-making</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational Planning</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departmental Planning</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Human Resources</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Material Resources</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Financial Resources</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM PRODUCTION &amp; EVALUATION:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content Selection</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours of Transmission</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Assignments</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervision</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language of Instruction</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design of Printed Materials</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes to Programming</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source of New Programming</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STAFFING:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of Educational Agents and Promoters</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approval of Educational Agents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renumeration of Promoters</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of Training</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of Staff</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Remuneration</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTALS FOR 22 AREAS:</strong></td>
<td>1-C</td>
<td>4-C</td>
<td>7-C</td>
<td>9-C</td>
<td>11-C</td>
<td>0-C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-D</td>
<td>14-D</td>
<td>9-D</td>
<td>6-D</td>
<td>0-D</td>
<td>2-D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Interview with Constantino Rojas, Radio San Rafael, Cochabamba Bolivia, May 25, 1983.
with those of the local promoters and leaders who are consulted in eleven areas and the community which has decision-making privileges in only two of the twenty-one areas outlined. Thus, actual involvement in the decision-making process is extremely limited outside of the station itself.

In areas of overall policy-making, management of human and financial resources, hours of transmission, work assignments, evaluation, staff selection and remuneration, and remuneration of promoters, the station director and the pedagogical head serve as the key decision makers. The production team exercises control of other areas including departmental planning, content selection, supervision, design of printed materials, and types of training.

The local promoters and leaders are beginning to be consulted in many areas of operational planning, content selection, design of materials, programming, and approval of local promoters. Promoters are consulted in these areas, and yet mechanisms for their input are informal and contact with them is sporadic. Representation of local promoters on station planning committees would help to encourage their effective input. These forms of involvement and apprenticeship encourage more direct community involvement in radio school activities. On paper, the relationship between the promoters and the radio school is impressive, however, in practice this consultative relationship between the school and the surrounding communities is very informal, poorly defined, and irregular in nature. The promoters are not always wholeheartedly committed to school
activities, their training is in many cases lacking, they are not directly consulted concerning key policy areas, and few formal channels for such input exist.)

One positive aspect of radio school operations is that the local communities themselves are actively involved in selecting and approving local educational promoters. Yet on the other hand, their input in other major areas is significantly lacking. Increasing involvement, input, and apprenticeship at the level of community promoters would place a higher value on community experience and the use of existing channels.

The radio school is currently in a period of transition. Following the 1980 study by ALER, school staff have embarked upon a participatory model of station operations. The staff are interested in moving toward the ideal of participation yet lack practical experience in promoting this approach to audience relations. Staff require an understanding of the basis of horizontal relationships; theoretical definitions and catchwords are plentiful, yet practical applications are lacking. In this instance, existing organizational structures impede the development of the relationship between the radio school and its audience.

3.3 Audience-Relation Analysis of Radio School San Rafael

Over the past two years staff perspectives towards audience relations have changed significantly at Radio School San Rafael. Hence, this analysis represents one phase in the evolution of the radio school's audience-relation models. The continuity of this process is contingent upon the station
evaluation currently taking place.

Using the audience-relation continuum (Table 2-1) and the data presented in the school profile at the end of this chapter as the basis of my comparison of audience-relation models, I conclude that Radio School San Rafael is characterized by primary, secondary and tertiary levels of access, and limited participation at the primary level. In terms of access to educational materials, San Rafael publishes a large quantity of educational materials yet direct contact between campesinos and radio school staff is limited. The use of such materials is not as effective as it might be if complemented by diverse educational media aids, staff visits, and regular support of the local promoters. Similarly, access to regional courses and training days is limited to community promoters and leaders, excluding the majority of the population. The input of local leaders is limited to primary levels of participation. This is due in part to infrequent staff visits and the absence of formal mechanisms for consultation concerning specific policy matters.

On the continuum of audience relations, the radio school of San Rafael is at the more progressive end of the formal instructional category of audience-relation models. In determining the audience-relation model type at San Rafael, one must compare its operations with the description of the formal-instructional model described in this chapter and the mutual-development model presented in chapter four. A basic comparison yields that certain infrastructural and operational changes are necessary before Radio San Rafael will make the transition to
development-type audience relations. At this crucial stage in the definition of audience-relation model types, radio school San Rafael could be ushered in either direction. Ultimately the somewhat conservative Archbishop of Cochabamba and the Advisory Council will determine the nature of radio school operations and the form of audience relations maintained with the Quechua community. These decision-making processes are far from the ideal of indigenous communication networks supported by the radio school.

The radio school at San Rafael is undergoing a transition in the audience-relation model it will adopt. In classifying the audience-relation model San Rafael adopts, this analysis is focused on the actual system of audience relations as opposed to the theoretical ideal of their horizontal promoter network. On the basis of published reports, staff interviews, and personal observations, I conclude that Radio School San Rafael is most closely characterized by the formal or instructional model of audience relations. San Rafael demonstrates certain trends that are symptomatic of the mutual-development model type. Nevertheless, it is lacking in the area of community consultation and apprenticeship at policy-making levels, effective and regular channels for promoter input, and community awareness of station activities. Furthermore, conflict with the radio station and uncertainty concerning the role of local promoters impedes the development of the school's network of promoters. Uncertainty about the role of the radio school and its intended audience relation model limit the
integration of local communities into the activities of the radio school.
Table 3-3
Profile: Radio School San Rafael, Cochabamba, Bolivia

The information in this Table was obtained from interviews with the following staff at Radio San Rafael and Radio School San Rafael: Monique Bigras, Freddy Caballero, Jesús Pardo Camacho, Jorge Lozano, Constantino Rojas, Salim Sauma, and Juan Orellana Soria.

Radio San Rafael
An urban, Spanish-language station committed to evangelisation, information, entertainment and education in the city of Cochabamba. Assumes a pastoral, cultural, and commercial focus.

Station Ownership
The Archbishopric of Cochabamba.

The Radio School of San Rafael
A separate entity with differing goals and methods which rents time at Radio San Rafael.

Objectives of the Radio School
The revalorization of the Quechua culture.
To conscientize, motivate, and encourage campesinos to reflect critically and to become authors of their own liberation and development.
To create and strengthen grassroots organizations with an aim to improve the regional economic, agricultural, health, education, and family life conditions as well as to encourage participation in changing economic, political and social systems.
To create an educational system based upon the needs and problems of the province of Cochabamba, encouraging active, horizontal participation of those involved.
To help increase rural productivity, via the technification of small farms. To promote the knowledge and practice of the teachings of the Catholic Church.

Relation with the Radio Station
Up until August 1982 the radio school was the department of rural education of the radio station. Now it is a separate organization broadcasting programs in the station’s schedule. The radio school’s offices are separate from those of the station. However, the radio school uses the station’s studio space.

Conflicts Between the Station and the School
Limited available recording hours, poor coordination of efforts with the radio station. No involvement of the radio school in station decision-making.
Conflicting objectives regarding ideological line, language of broadcast, number of hours in Quechua, and organizational planning. Station director is in close contact with the Archbishop, whereas the school director has limited contact with those overseeing the station. Station envisions people participating internally in listening and contemplation whereas school desires holistic liberation.

Target Audience of the Radio School
The Quechua population in the Cochabamba area including urban Quechua who have migrated from the country.

Political Viewpoint of the Radio School
Following the canons of the Roman Catholic Church, Radio San Rafael retains a non-political focus. Political policy changes slightly with each Archbishop. Monsignor Prata is conservative and less interested in conscientization and indigenous political expression. Station broadcasts are neutral, with minimal political expression. The station and staff do not want to be attacked or risk station operations.

Relation to the Church
The radio school functions alongside the social service commission of the diocese. The Archbishop has no direct say in daily operations yet has input in the areas of financing and organization.

Financing of the Radio Station
Paid advertisements represent an average of 14 minutes per hour of broadcast.

Financing of the Radio School
International financing received through ERBOL from German agencies including Misereor and Adveniat. No direct funding from the Diocese of Cochabamba. Government sponsors seven teachers, and the Instituto de Educación Radiofónica supports one promoter. The Radio School pays 150,000 pesos monthly for the use of the Diocesan Station. Operating costs are lowered by sharing expenses.

Station Advisory Council
Controls the finances and critical station affairs including legal problems with unions. Meets sporadically. Membership includes: Donald Stehte, Antonio Cabrero (director of Colegio San Augustín), Rafael Gumuzio (University of San Simón), Leonel Camacho (general manager of Radio San Rafael).

Radio School Staff
The radio school has nineteen paid staff and numerous volunteer and part-time promoters and auxiliaries.
The radio station provides technical assistance in recording and transmitting programs.

Planning and Research
Yearly radio school evaluations and departmental evaluations completed by staff. Minimal campesino input in planning processes. Insufficient financing and manpower to complete audience survey in the past twenty years. Major 1983-1984 participatory regional audience survey of three zones completed. Involvement of zonal teams of local leaders. Local people are unaware that San Rafael is doing the study. Design of methodology in association with promoters and ERBOL. Project involves collection of data pertaining to regional needs, projects, resources, organization, etc. Results of the study include the prioritization of needs, analysis of resources, planning of services and cooperative action, decisions made with communities concerning possible action, followup, supervision, and evaluation.

Transmitting Power
3kw as of August 1983. Not sufficient for rural transmission. Has 10kw potential, however it is not used.

Radial Distance of Transmission
100km. No mobile transmitting unit as of July 1983.

Hours of Broadcast
5-7:30am and 7-9pm in Quechua. 31.5 hours weekly.

Estimated Size of Audience
Open audience in Bolivia 1,880,000.
Semi-controlled audience maintaining some form of contact with the station 9,000
Controlled audience involved in learning centres 20,200.

Transportation
One jeep used for the majority of field visits.

Competition
Twelve other stations with audible signals. Radio San Rafael is the only one working with the Quechua. Other stations have 1kw power versus 3kw of San Rafael. San Rafael is listened to by 41.3% of the population (1980). 97.5% of regional farmers listen to the radio. The commercial stations are owned by the private presses and their material is seen as propaganda.

Radio School Contact With Grass-Roots Organizations
Formal contact with the Parroquia Tiraque literacy group. Non-formal contact with the Federation of Campesinos, the Central Obrera Boliviana, the Agrarian Sindicats, the Agrarian Reform Movement, Ineder, Cipca, Senarb, Unidad Sanitaria, Juntas Vecinales, Agricultural Cooperatives,
hospitals, the Association of Potatoe Producers, mothers clubs, and youth groups. Former radio school promoters are now community leaders, mayors, and union representatives.

**Campeosino Input into Station Operations**

Vertical organizational structures. No *campeosino* representation in station decision-making.

**Forms of Campeosino Participation in the School**

Systematic emphasis upon participation initiated in February of 1983. Prior to this date there was no organization of correspondence. *Campeosinos* asked for more extensive programming. Limited access to the station, people visit to record programs. Yearly festival with native cultural events. A desire to develop local recording studios. 8-10 letters received daily. Radio notices regarding community visits by teachers. Future centre for popular communication (with ERBOL).

**Visits to Communities by the Radio School**

Minimal contact with isolated communities. Station visits to the country 2-3 days weekly. Station visits are made to communities that show potential. Insufficient station resources to meet all of the requests for assistance. 20 individual staff visits monthly mostly by the production team. Staff record and produce programs. Little specialization among team members. 88.9% of *campeosinos* have not been visited by an extension agent (21.7% have received technical assistance).

**Visits to The Radio School**

Six visits daily by rural visitors which bring community news and information items with them. The majority of visits are from leaders and promoters. 100-120 diagnostic agricultural reports completed monthly by promoters outlining animal health, illness, pests. This information is used in course preparation.

**Illiteracy**

28.5% among men, and 51.85 among women.

**Relation with other Radiophonic Institutions**

Member of ALER and ERBOL. Associated with the Institute of Radiophonic Education (IER).

**Relation Between the Radio School and the State**

Political Persecution
The radio school has been subject to government intervention on many occasions. There are reports of staff disappearing and being kidnapped and tortured. Degree of repression depends upon the government in power.

Relation with State School System
Formal relations with the Ministry of Education which sponsors seven teachers on staff. Recognized by the Ministry of Education’s Department of Adult Education. No government control over educational policies. No coordination with the formal system of State education.

The Radio School’s Educational Method
Freirean psycho-social techniques involving conscientization-based mutual education. 102 centres in 42 communities. Five month courses. In 1983, 1396 students were enrolled and 918 completed courses. Non formal educational program oriented toward the solution of community problems as well as bilingual literacy program. Three levels of basic education in reading, writing, and math.

Types of Radio School Programming
Bilingual literacy, Quechua Literacy, health, agriculture, campesino news, bilingual news, religion, home education, national music, community sounding board, radio theatre, pastoral thoughts, children’s hour.

Texts Published by the School
Texts are published in the following areas: Mathematics, reading and writing, animal care, leadership, legal aid, legal rights, family orientation, children’s education, nutrition, health, literacy, the worker’s dignity, work and property, wages, unions, farming cooperatives, and soccer rules. 82,000 cartillas and 47,000 folletos printed yearly. Individual folletos correspond to specific radio programs.

Material Design
Use of ACLO, ERBOL and San Rafael folletos. San Rafael’s publications are prepared by the staff members and the radio auxiliary responsible for specific courses. All radial programming is accompanied by a workbook. Needs are determined in staff visits. Staff edit the materials.

Content Decisions
There is no participation of the community in content decisions and editing processes. All decisions are made by the radio school staff. However, this verticality is changing. The current radio school study may result in changes dictated by the radio station. Certain urban directors feel that the radio school must
renovate their programming and attempt to integrate it into the urban radio programming.

**Community Training Courses**

1983 training of seven zonal teams for research project. Five-day course offered twice yearly for training of promoters in the areas of agriculture, health, home care, and literacy. Eighty promoters are trained each year by the school.

**Community Promoters**

Promoters are chosen democratically by the communities. 1983 total of 575 station promoters, and 710 in association with other institutions in the area. Their role is to contact people in the community, to teach, to train, to act as the nexus between the school and the village, to make contact with state agencies, to inform community leaders. Promoters often do not have a solvent way of living. No set remuneration by the community. Out of 100 promoters 60 teach for personal benefit, and the rest do nothing as there is community resistance. 60% work for 3-4 years and 30% continue after that.

**Student Dropout**

80% student dropout after the first month. Initial enthusiasm is often squelched. People lack support and contact. There is no continuity, no materials to read, family farms require the young to work, many parents discourage children from learning, and 65% of the students return to a state of illiteracy after the completion of courses.

**Means of Motivation**

Mention of community meetings and projects in progress. Jingles, interviews, visits, radio novels, social dramas. Direct contact made in over 40 community meetings monthly.
4.0 Theoretical Background

The mutual-development model of audience relations is the result of experience with more formal educational models, as well as changing communication, education, and development paradigms during the 1960's and 1970's. Compared to the formal-instructional model, the mutual development model is more oriented toward group action and community involvement in diverse health, educational, and agricultural projects which are sensitive to local needs and encourage a sense of local unity and commitment.

If evaluated in terms of the audience-relation continuum, the mutual-development model is defined in terms of secondary and tertiary levels of access, secondary levels of participation, and either the primary or the zero stage of self-management. In such cases station planning is conducted in consultation with the local leaders, yet their direct participation in decision-making and programming is limited. Campesinos become more open to making suggestions concerning program content, and yet traditional decision-making structures favor the input of station directors and staff. Vastly differing social, economic, and educational backgrounds of trained educators, media specialists, station administrators, and illiterate farmers create tension and distance in the relationship established between the station and the local people. These relationships are also threatened by the physical
distance between the station and isolated audience groups requiring assistance. Staff at Radio San Rafael in Cochabamba, Bolivia must travel over four hours by jeep and then walk a distance to reach communities requesting information and training.

In the case of radio stations implementing development-type relations there are few if any rural production centres and limited funds available for the development of alternative learning materials. These regional centres are essential in involving people in station activities and in developing technical training programs. Basic training and apprenticeship programs result in vastly improved programming. Professionalism itself must not become the primary goal of such forms of alternative communication. Apprenticeship programs fostering local involvement at all stages of participation, access, and self-management contribute to the development of qualitative audience relations at the community level.

Stations adopting the development-based audience relation model are often characterized by moderate political involvement. In many cases, groups with more radical political views are not given air time to express themselves. The station director, the board of governors, funding organizations and staff are involved in formulating policies which determine the forms of indigenous political expression which are acceptable to be broadcast. In this manner, stations avoid political confrontation with the government and thus attempt to secure station stability. Likewise, stations characterized by
development based audience-relation models maintain an informal association with the state educational system. The state may provide funding for a limited number of educational advisors on staff, however it has no say in determining program content. Certificates of academic equivalence are not issued by the Ministry of Education because the courses offered focus more on the campesinos' needs rather than academic expertise and knowledge.

Theoretically, in stations characterized by the development model, rural audiences will begin to state what their own levels of social and physical satisfaction must be. This is not always the case. My investigation has revealed that, in actuality, a small percent of the population express what they desire to gain from station programming. Local opinion leaders including community officials, promoters, catequists etc., supposedly represent the interests of the majority, when in fact their selection is not made on the basis of democratic representation. The experience of local communities suggests that in many cases the views of the educational promoter are not representative of the whole of the community but rather those of a privileged elite.

The development-based audience relation model promotes the consultation of local promoters and community members concerning key decisions. Nevertheless, change is initiated from above. It is possible for the local Catholic Diocese, the station's board of directors and executive council to make the final policy decisions and exercise veto power over station
activities. The crossover between station practices and theorized models is difficult to achieve without some form of initiation or encouragement from the administrative hierarchy.

In a nation such as Bolivia, the choice between an equilibrium model of station operations and a change-oriented model is complex. Stations with development-based audience relations are cautious when considering the risks associated with more politically sensitive forms of involvement. Development type stations are neither mechanisms of state controlled formal education, nor are they non-formal, indigenous organizations promoting radical change. Station directors often support an equilibrium theory position while opting for maximum allowable social change.

This position may in fact work to discourage campesino involvement, local autonomy and self-sufficiency. As campesinos begin to express themselves, freedom of self-determination and political expression takes on increasing significance in the creation of indigenous mass media. Freedom of expression also increases the level of responsibility required of the local community in creating editorial policies and in monitoring the content of messages. Many local leaders see the protection of their family and community as their prime responsibility, as opposed to risking health and welfare for more radical political causes.

The next section contains a case study analysis of Radio San Gabriel in order to illustrate a station that approaches the characteristics of the mutual development audience relation.
4.1 Case Analysis: Radio San Gabriel

Radio San Gabriel was founded in 1955 by the Maryknoll Fathers as part of the educational efforts of their missionaries. The station's original 250 watt signal was broadcast four hours each day from Peñas, a small town outside of La Paz. Prior to the opening of San Gabriel there was a revolution in 1952, the democratic vote was given to Aymara citizens, and the government began to use radio for educational and political purposes. San Gabriel's initial objectives included literacy, evangelisation, and social action among the Aymara of the altiplano region. Broadcasts also included campesino news items and greetings to isolated friends and families.

San Gabriel's formal educational methods emphasised literacy and mathematics. A lack of material and human resources necessitated the use of Peruvian educational materials to develop programming and to initiate training courses for local promoters. The clergy-operated station did not allow any form of political expression. In 1957 the radio school work began in earnest, adopting the model established by Radio Sutatenza. Radio San Gabriel supplied teachers for distance education in remote areas of the country. This saved the government money and extended education throughout the altiplano.

A network of local Catholic parishes served as the foundation of the radio school field operations, providing central meeting locations and credibility in smaller villages.
In 1958 the station's daily broadcast was increased to nine hours and its transmitting power to one kilowatt. Up until the early 1960's programming maintained a heavy scholastic emphasis and transmissions were irregular. In 1965 the right wing Barrientos government supported the work of Radio San Gabriel in an attempt to influence *campe
ing*o views. At this time external financing was provided by American sources. In 1967 the Association of Bolivian Radio Schools (ERBOL), was founded with the intention of establishing a nation-wide chain of Catholic educational radio stations. Prior to 1970, San Gabriel experienced tremendous growth with fifty paid staff and one hundred promoters. This resulted in unrealistic station costs, and unmet financial obligations. At the end of 1970 the station staff was drastically reduced to five teachers and ten staff for a period of ten years.5

Shortly after this the *campe
ingos* lost interest in formal literacy campaigns as their basic needs were not being met. After receiving primary level instruction the *campe
ingo* assumed that he or she had enough education to survive in the marketplace.6 High levels of student dropout occurred following introductory courses. Drastic changes in programming were necessary if the station was to survive. In 1970 an administrative expert, Father Steed, successfully implemented a commercial model of station finances which used promotional jingles to finance station operations and to improve contact with rural audiences.7 By the end of 1970 over 30,000 Aymaras had been taught to read and write.8
In 1971 the Ministry of Education signed an agreement with ERBOL providing San Gabriel with teachers to assist in their rural programs. In 1972 the station moved its operations to La Paz, and increased its transmission power to seven kilowatts. San Gabriel’s 314 radiophonic centres involved 488 field promoters and 6,167 students. In 1975 the station began their basic accelerated learning project (EIBA) which gave the campesino the same learning opportunities as any other Bolivian. This bilingual needs-centred program used volunteer promoters and was equivalent to the first five years of public school.

In 1976 the Maryknoll Fathers transferred the station to the Archbishopric of La Paz and the direction of the Brothers of La Salle. Many staff were tired of the more traditional forms of programming and when new staff joined the station in 1977 the educational and news departments became consolidated and programming began to cater to local needs. This resulted in diversified programming, an increase in local campesino input, and a renewed interest among the Aymara population.

It was also in 1977 that reform within ALER resulted in a greater emphasis upon community participation, and in changing the name of the association. The emphasis was no longer placed on formal radio schools (escuelas radiofónicas) but rather on radio education (educación radiofónica). This brought about new applications of educational broadcasting which were linked to a diagnosis of the national reality. Educational problems and radio-centered solutions were each considered in relation to economic, cultural, and linguistic factors.
During the García Meza regime of 1980-1982, the government desired to close Radio San Gabriel in order to control the campesinos' political actions. The station remained open yet refrained from overt political expression. At this time the US AID program offered San Gabriel $500,000 in aid but requested input into station decision-making, and less emphasis on relations maintained with the local communities. Radio San Gabriel refused US AID's offer and opted to establish their own priorities. Following the 1982 return to democracy San Gabriel's director, Father Canut, changed the station's political platform by allowing various communities to express their political views. Freedom of expression and community-centered programming became key to San Gabriel's new direction.

In current times of national turmoil, political instability, and economic crisis, it is difficult to assess whether the evolution in San Gabriel's operations and increased emphasis upon audience relations will continue, or whether the Church will adopt a more conservative approach to political and educational involvement.

4.2 Station Decision-Making at Radio San Gabriel

In examining Tables 4-1 and 4-2 on the following pages we see that decision-making at Radio San Gabriel is centered about the advisory council, the station director, and the individual station departments. Over the past ten years the consultation of local leaders, catequists, and community members has increased dramatically. Nevertheless, we see that
Table 4-1: Decision-Making at Radio San Gabriel

This is a survey of those individuals or groups either directly involved in station decision-making processes (D), or consulted (C) concerning various important issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Decision-Making</th>
<th>Indvidual or Group Consulted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advisory Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STATION MANAGEMENT:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Policy-Making</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational Planning</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departmental Planning</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Human Resources</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Material Resources</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Financial Resources</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM PRODUCTION &amp; EVALUATION:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content Selection</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours of Transmission</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Assignments</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervision</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language of Instruction</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design of Printed Materials</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes to Programming</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection and Evaluation of Campaigns</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STAFFING:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of Educational Agents and Promoters</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approval of Educational Agents</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renumeration of Promoters</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of Training</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of Staff</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Remuneration</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTALS FOR 21 AREAS:</strong></td>
<td>14-C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1-D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Interviews with Jaime Archondo and Lucia Sauma Radio San Gabriel, La Paz Bolivia, May 16-17, 1983.
Table 4-2:
Organizational Diagram: Radio San Gabriel
many key policy-making areas remain isolated from the catequists, the local leaders, and the people themselves. The radio school operates on such a large scale that station administration has become complex, requiring centralized coordination of operations.

San Gabriel's objectives include community involvement in station activities, yet few actual channels exist for local participation in decision-making at the departmental level. The department of planning and research and the departmental advisory council each lack significant external campesino involvement. A balance needs to be struck between the authority of the station director and the Archbishopric, and the involvement of the local community. Ways must be established to integrate local community leaders into higher levels of station decision-making. One possibility is the election of a community council, initially to observe and later to assume certain aspects of station policy-making. The station needs to clarify the degree of local autonomy and responsibility before any significant changes in policy-making take place. Similarly, one must determine the degree of flexibility of the Archbishopric of La Paz with respect to the effective control of the station, and the role of campesinos in determining its political stance.

Those individuals functioning at the upper levels of the organization have less direct contact with promoters, catequists, and community members. Station departments, catechists and local leaders serve as the gatekeepers of the
views of local communities. Subtle forms of vertical organizational structures are seen in the differentiation between the decision-making authority of station administrators and local educators. In the case of San Gabriel, the institutionalization of grass-roots communication works against the theorized objectives of horizontal communication. On this basis Radio San Gabriel risks the over extension of staff, a reduction in the quality and quantity of contact with the audience, and the limitation of individual involvement in station operations. Rapid station growth and increased transmission power have impeded the development of qualitative audience relations, and hence, the progression from a mutual-development model type to a radical-change oriented audience-relation model.

4.3 Audience-Relation Analysis of Radio San Gabriel

This section will assess Radio San Gabriel in terms of the audience-relation analysis presented in chapter two. Using the audience-relation continuum, (Table 2-1) and the data presented in the station profile (Table 4-3 at the end of this chapter) as the basis of our comparison, it is possible to classify Radio San Gabriel in terms of one of the audience-relation model types. Radio San Gabriel is characterized by primary, secondary, and tertiary levels of access, as well as primary and secondary levels of participation. Radio San Gabriel is moving toward the incorporation of tertiary levels of participation and primary levels of self-management, yet the data presented in table 4-1 suggests that although the station expresses a desire to further integrate the local population
into planning processes, it falls short of its theorized goals.¹⁸ A number of detrimental factors including existing authority structures, staff attitudes, lack of community motivation, and political conflict restrict the development of more significant audience relations at Radio San Gabriel. On the basis of this information as well as material contained in Tables 4-1, 4-2 and 4-3, we see that Radio San Gabriel is most closely characterized by mutual-development type audience relations. This model type is not absolute in that there is significant variation within the development-based model. This allows for a station such as San Gabriel which is among the more progressive stations in this grouping.

Positive elements of station-audience relations at San Gabriel include community consultation in policy-making in areas such as content selection, hours of transmission, language of instruction, evaluation of campaigns, approval of educational agents, and methods of community training. Other positive aspects of Radio San Gabriel include the use of multiple educational media, a large staff, frequent visits to the country, frequent campesino visits to the station, and multiple course levels. However, San Gabriel is deficient in areas of democratic participation in decision-making, local autonomy, local determination of political content, and national ownership.

These deficiencies are the result of a large organizational infrastructure and powerful transmission capacity. This means that a relatively small proportion of the audience is actually involved in station operations.¹⁹ It is unfortunate
that due to high costs, vested interests, and difficulty in administering questionnaires, accurate audience surveys are unavailable. Hence, it is difficult to compare the proportion of audience to station involvement between similar stations.
Table 4-3
Profile: Radio San Gabriel, La Paz Bolivia

The information in this Table was obtained from interviews with the following station personnel at Radio San Gabriel: Jaime Archondo, Emiliana Ayavir Rojas, Father José Canut, Morocollo Apuwillquille, Eva Gutiérrez, Félix Hidalgo, Víctor Guispicolque, Donato Ayma Rojas, Lucía Sauma, and Bonifacio Yapuchura.

Station Objectives
To serve the Aymara population of the altiplano and to promote their language and culture. Integrated development stressing the balance between all aspects of human life in order to attain advancement for the underprivileged. Religious, parochial objectives (pastoral Department).

Ownership
The Archbishopric of La Paz. Station control by native campesinos is not possible at this time due to an insufficient base for local financing, lack of political understanding, and poor financial management, even though the local people are motivated and have the ability to work with radio.

Political Viewpoint
Radio San Gabriel adheres to the position of ERBOL and the Catholic Church. The station's Advisory Council establishes editorial policies.

Financing
Catholic agencies such as Misereor and Adveniat supply the bulk of finances. The Inter-American Foundation also supports station activities. Foreign agencies have no significant input into policy-making. No advertisements broadcast, no local support base.

Executive Council
Composed of one representative from each department and also the station director (ten in total). Meets twice monthly to decide station policy.

Staff
Fifty-one full time staff, forty-five of which are either Aymara or mestizo (of Aymara extraction).

Department Breakdown
Research and Planning, Radio Program Production, Agriculture, Education (Basic, Intermediate, Rural Education), Administration, Production of Printed
Materials, Professional Development, Pastoral Care, Promotion of Women’s Groups, Health Education.

Planning and Research
There are two levels of investigation: departmental evaluations (in July and December), and audience research concerning program preference, occupation, music tastes, audience feedback etc.

Transmitting Power
20kw at peak hours as of August 1983.
10 kw at other times. 7kw actual in June 1983.

Hours of Daily Broadcast
4:30am to 2:00pm and 4:00pm to 10:00pm daily.
15.5 hours daily, 107.5 hours weekly.

Radial Distance of Transmission
Over 200km. No mobile transmitting unit as of July 1983.

Estimated Size of Audience
Open audience in Bolivia, Chile and Peru between 1,500,000 and 2,000,000.
Semi-controlled audience maintaining some form of contact with the station 700,000.
Controlled audience involved in organized centres 3,500.

Transportation
Four vehicles for 60% of field visits, local bus for 40%.

Competition
Up until 1977-1978 they had a monopoly on broadcasting in the altiplano (as per a 1978 survey by Musto and Luhr). They are the only Aymara station, and the only station many people trust.
Minimal competition in the Aymara language; Radio Splendid 1/2 hour daily, Radio Nacional has no campesino impact. Radio Nueva Armenia has little campesino contact. Radio FIDES is seen as being too commercial. Main competition from Spanish language music stations. No regional audience surveys have recently been completed.

Contact With Grass-Roots Organizations
Nonformal permanent association with the Federation of Campesinos, the Central Obrera Boliviana, the Institution for the Promotion of the Aymara Culture (AYNI), women’s groups, community groups, and local Catholic Churches.

Campesino Input into Station Operations
Minimal participation and input in areas of planning, programming, and evaluation. Campesinos are consulted concerning content of booklets.
Forms of Campesino Participation
Regional conferences, painting, essay and poetry contests, station interviews, group letters, station visits, 500 program tapes received yearly, membership in learning groups, attendance at local festivals.

Illiteracy
45% to 70% among rural adults.

Relation with other Radiophonic Institutions
Member of ALER and ERBOL and the ECORA Program (Community Education and Radio).

Relation with State
Official recognition as a "cultural" rather than "commercial" station with licence renewal. Agreements with the Ministries of Planning, Public Health and Social Security, and Education.

Relation with State School System
Formal relations with the Ministry of Education which sponsors teachers on staff. No imposition of formal programming style. No national education offered in Aymara even though the majority of the population is of Aymara extraction. Attempts to assist formal primary school system by producing programs in Spanish for rural teachers.

Teacher Qualification
Formal educational training, a rapport with the people, and familiarity with the Aymara culture, and experience teaching in rural areas.

Educational Method
Conscientization-based mutual education. Not a formal educational program with certification.

Types of Programming
Bible lessons, local music, national music, health and agricultural programs, Basic Integral Education, Quechua hour, international program, news and notices, sports, news from the country, stories, program KHANA, etc.

Centre of Media Education for Adults (CEMA)
24 centres of adult education in math, language, social studies, natural sciences.

Texts Published by the Station
Texts are published in the following areas: language (3), math (3), history, health, family, crafts, cooperatives, song books, national heroes, unions, legends, legislation, women's issues, carpentry, cooking, rural economy, animal care, child education, child health.
Design of Written Materials
Research is conducted in the campo with the help of campesinos, material written in Spanish by staff team, revised at station, select group leaders visit station for consultation, staff team edits rough draft, then Aymara translation completed and set to the press. Occasional use of test groups.

Content Decisions
Ultimate decisions made by ten member staff team. Station Director and Advisory Council decide direct needs. Community leaders are invited to a three day consultation.

Integrated Basic Accelerated Education Program (EIBA)
Four teachers assisting 1,900 students. Courses in nutrition, health, agriculture, artesania, history, family relations, and cooperatives. Forty-four community learning centres, initiated by community official before station assists.

Community Training Courses
Two three-day courses for community leaders.

Choice of Promoters
Is made primarily by the station itself.

Student Dropout
For every 800 enrolled at least 150 drop out. One in every 100 elementary students completes high school.
Chapter Five:
The Indigenous-Change Model

5.0 Theoretical Background

Different forms of the indigenous-change model of audience relations have been in practice since the early 1960’s throughout Latin America. Stations such as MEB, Enriquillo, ACPH, and Pío XII are prime examples of the change-based model. The indigenous-change model is an interactive communication model based upon joint-problem analysis, discussion, and decision-making between station staff and the local community. Joint decision-making fosters cooperation and self-sufficiency rather than dependency, and problem resolution takes on the form of a problem-solving dialogue as opposed to a lecture format.

A more thorough understanding of the word indigenous is essential in grasping the concept behind the indigenous-change model. In addition to indigenous referring to natural, local and grass-roots involvement, there is a significant connection between the Spanish word for native peoples pueblas indígenas and the word indigenous. This is intentional, as throughout Latin America native peoples are among the most oppressed. Indigenous or autochthonous change implies local incentive, expression, involvement and control. In a country where oppression, hierarchical decision-making, and the under-representation of the native voice are a way of life, indigenous expression and control assume even greater importance.¹
If analyzed in terms of the audience-relation continuum, the indigenous change model type is defined in terms of tertiary levels of local access, tertiary levels of participation, and primary or secondary stages of self-management. In this model there is ideally no separation between the audience and the station. Members of the community are able to enter into relations of media production, evaluation and financing.

Change-based stations operate with a more horizontal organizational structure, placing less emphasis upon administrative officials and more emphasis on the local people. Decision-making involves a complex infrastructure of regional opinion leaders, catequists and educational promoters. The radio station and the local community develop strategies based upon mutual cooperation, equality in participation, and a common definition of local problems. Change-based stations focus their efforts on the needs of the local audience as expressed by the audience itself. Courses, programs, and booklets include relevant topics such as labor unions, cooperatives, conscientization, and the rights of the poor. Stations adopt a range of solutions to modify the existing living conditions. These actions often involve working alongside existing grass-roots organizations with similar goals.

One important characteristic of stations developing an indigenous-change model of audience relations is that they represent political solutions to local problems, involving a great deal more risk than other positions. Stations active in the local political sphere often conflict with the government in
power, the military, and opposition parties. In cases such as Radio Pío XII the forced closure of facilities due to political pressure is an ever-present reality.²

The majority of stations assimilating more of a radical change model in Bolivia are located in rural areas removed from the political center of the nation. This allows a certain degree of freedom in the daily programming which broadcasters in the capital cities do not have. Rural radio stations cater to the health, agricultural, educational, spiritual, and political needs of the isolated indigenous poor. There is a higher degree of interaction with the campesino due to the close physical proximity of the station, personal contact with local promoters and staff, affiliation with other grass roots organizations, and the promotion of local training programs and station-sponsored neighborhood groups. Hence, this audience-relation model incorporates a qualitatively different form of rapport with the local inhabitants than the other models.

Clergy involvement is essential to preserve the continuation of station activities during times of political censorship and repression. Stations which encourage indigenous political expression and the discussion of controversial social issues assist in the development of critical social consciousness among the poor. This results in concerted community action and an increased interest in labor unions and farming cooperatives. Few campesino stations are popular with the rural affluent. They are labeled "insurgent" and "radical" because they work alongside marginalized sectors. The result of
this affiliation with the poor is that community-oriented stations develop a wide base of local volunteers. Thus, change-oriented stations are clearly differentiated from other stations as they embody the voice of the marginalized section of the population.

Throughout the whole of Latin America, smaller, change-based rural stations operate on reduced budgets. This is due to an unstable rural support base, risky long-term involvement for external groups, and restricted funding due to political repression. Stations with limited financial resources have fewer vehicles available for long-distance travel to outlying communities. This makes it difficult to visit all of the communities which request assistance. Staff are often poorly paid and stations rely upon volunteer involvement as one means of ensuring continued operations. These stations lack the financial resources to develop alternative learning materials, and hence are not able to meet all requests for printed materials.

Other additional difficulties of low budget stations include antiquated equipment with limited kilowatt output, lower technical quality program material, and staff with fewer professional qualifications. In the case of stations with the most antiquated equipment we see a larger number of people involved in training programs, local research projects, station evaluation, and daily station operations.

One unique characteristic of stations with change-oriented audience relations is their relationship with the
government. Due to the more radical political stance taken by a station such as Radio Pío XII, strained relations exist with government bodies such as the ministry of education. State organizations see groups which advocate more radical change as challenging national policies of integration and modernization, and threatening national stability. Hence, action is taken against groups which work independently of government guidelines.

The next section contains a case study analysis of Radio Pío XII in order to illustrate a station that approaches the characteristics of the radical-change model of audience-station relations.

5.1 Case Analysis: Radio Pío XII

In 1954 the Oblate fathers founded Radio Pío XII (which means Pope Pius the twelfth), a 250 watt Catholic station which was financed and directed by Father Grenier, a Canadian priest. The Church still officially owns the station. Radio Pío XII is located in Llallagua, 330 kilometers south east of La Paz in the Department of Potosí, the largest silver mining zone in Bolivia. There are two mining camps in Siglo XX and Catavi, and 70,000 inhabitants of Llallagua and neighbouring Uncita who rely upon the mining industry for their survival.

The objectives of the first era of station operations at Pío XII included educational programming, evangelisation and catechism classes via radio, and a campaign against the communist ideas propagated by the labour movement and the miners' radio station. Right wing governments supported early
station activities in order to soften unrest initiated by mining unions. Radio Pío XII in its first year of operations could therefore afford to hire the best announcers and journalists in the nation and was the first station to use radio theatre and promotional jingles in its attempt to denounce socialism. In the late 1950's radio was seen by the Church as a prime means of influencing rural opinion and squelching union activities in the government owned mines. Mining formed an important part of the national economy which the dominant elite would not allow the workers to jeopardize.

The station cooperated with government literacy campaigns in an effort to combat the socio-economic and political problems of the illiterate, marginalized sectors of the population. The formal educational methods adopted by the Oblate Fathers enforced hierarchical social relations and did not favor freedom in participation on the part of the campesinos. In 1963 the station's transmitting power was increased to one kilowatt which resulted in further penetration of the surrounding rural audience.

In 1964 station officials began to look at the widespread illiteracy, poverty, hunger, and inhuman living conditions in the area. The radio school was significant in changing the attitudes of the Priests concerning the immediate needs of the people. Pío XII began working with rural campesinos in the area of agricultural training, marking a radical departure from the previous scholastic emphasis. In 1965 the station awoke to the pressing social and economic needs
of the miners after the government cut salaries by fifty percent and 300 people were killed in the resulting conflict. In 1967 the military took over the union offices and detonated the miners' radio station. At this time there was a change in the mentality of the clergy; all of the Priests endorsed a statement concerning miners' rights. Radio Pío XII began to support the ideology of class struggle. As urban staff left the station there was less of a reliance upon professionalism and more of an emphasis upon popular involvement. With the creation of ERBOL in 1967, Pío XII was officially licenced and therefore required to renew its contract with each government. This meant that its license could be revoked by any repressive government which wanted to curtail its activities.

The Medellín Episcopal Conference of 1969 represented an important stage in the theological progression of the Catholic Church, and in the station operations at Pío XII. Liberating evangelisation, social promotion, and popular education became central to the work of the progressive arm of the Church. A change in the missionary directors of Radio Pío XII accompanied a change in the station's pedagogical method and the acceptance of the ideology of liberation and social promotion. Together these factors resulted in a strong identification with the local people.

Increased social commitment resulted in government intervention in station operations between 1969 and 1982 including assault, imprisonment, death threats, destruction of equipment, and station closure. During the military coup
d'éats of 1969, 1970, 1971, 1978, and 1979, the station experienced short-term closures, and in July of 1980 the García Meza regime closed the station until June of 1982. This lengthy cessation of station operations resulted in a loss of equipment, a fifty percent staff turnover, alienation of the audience, a need to re-motivate the people, a waste of training, instability of station operations, and a neutralization of the effect of previous programs involving popular education and popular communication. This ongoing conflict has also encouraged strong solidarity between the station and the people in the Llallagua region.

Since 1975, Radio Pío XII has attempted to systematize audience participation in its programming operations. Efforts have included participatory research projects, cassette forums, round table discussions, direct community broadcasts via mobile transmitters, training of popular news reporters, as well as increased contact with women's groups, neighborhood organizations, farming cooperatives, and labour unions. Before recent modifications, the station infrastructure was described as being "haughty", whereas current operations are based upon applied research and are more functional in nature.

At present, Radio Pío XII is de-mystifying the radio as a force removed from the people; staff are now representative of local social and cultural groups, are less formal in their approach, and are more approachable and available to the person on the street. Current programming places a lesser emphasis upon spiritual promotion and more of a focus on collaborative
work with previously excluded neighbourhood groups. Many difficulties must still be overcome including a need for training of personnel and promoters, a fear of political oppression among the people, political polarization among unions and grass-roots organizations, technical problems, the need for new participatory models of station operations, and means of encouraging local leadership and expression.

5.2 Station Decision-Making at Radio Pío XII

In examining Tables 5-1 and 5-2 on the following pages, it is apparent that station decision-making at Radio Pío XII is distinct from other Bolivian radio schools. Pío XII maintains more frequent contacts with local grass-roots organizations (including those with political interests) and is further removed from any association with the State. These factors shape decision-making processes within the station. Pío XII demonstrates more horizontal forms of decision-making as local organizations and communities are often consulted in areas of policy-making. Local organizations are involved in overall policy-making, operational and departmental planning, content selection, hours of transmission, supervision, evaluation, design of printed materials, changes to programming, forms of community training, and the selection and evaluation of campaigns. Radio Pío XII often risks
Table 5-1: Decision-Making: Radio Pío XII

This is a survey of those individuals or groups either directly involved in station decision-making processes (D), or consulted (C) concerning various important issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Decision-Making</th>
<th>Oblate Council</th>
<th>Executive Station Director</th>
<th>Station Director</th>
<th>Department Heads</th>
<th>Involved Organizations</th>
<th>Local Community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>STATION MANAGEMENT:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Policy-Making</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational Planning</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departmental Planning</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Human Resources</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Material Resources</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of Financial Resources</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM PRODUCTION &amp; EVALUATION:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content Selection</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours of Transmission</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Assignments</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department Supervision</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language of Instruction</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design of Printed Materials</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes to Programming</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source of New Programming</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection and Evaluation of Campaigns</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STAFFING:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of Educational Agents and Promoters</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approval of Educational Agents</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renumeration of Promoters</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types of Training</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selection of Staff</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Remuneration</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTALS FOR 22 AREAS:</strong></td>
<td>1-C</td>
<td>12-C</td>
<td>10-C</td>
<td>10-C</td>
<td>12-C</td>
<td>14-C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0-D</td>
<td>10-D</td>
<td>12-D</td>
<td>5-D</td>
<td>0-D</td>
<td>0-D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Interview with Ernesto Ramiro June 3, 1983 and Teodora Camacho June 1, 1983 Radio Pío XII, Llallagua.
government repression in the way in which they interact with their audience.

Station decision-making at Pío XII is more de-centralized than in other stations, nevertheless, the executive director, the station director, and the department heads make the majority of decisions.\textsuperscript{17} Although the community is often consulted concerning important issues, the community or the grass-roots organizations are rarely directly involved in decision-making. Local \textit{campesino} organizations are consulted in twelve key policy-making areas investigated and the community is consulted in fourteen areas.\textsuperscript{18} This is in contrast with the executive director who is consulted in twelve areas and makes decisions in ten other areas, the station director who is consulted in ten areas and is involved in decision-making in twelve areas, and the department heads who are consulted in sixteen areas and actually make decisions in another five areas. Hence, although the consultation process is open to grass-roots organizations and community leaders, actual decision-making is contained within the station itself.

In examining station decision-making it is evident that the community is not involved in four central areas of station management. These areas include the development of political policies, the management of human resources, material resources, and financial resources. In these areas the forms of control are still maintained by the station's directors and indirectly by the Oblate Fathers. Significant changes need to be initiated if local people are to assume greater responsibility for these
areas. If not, a form of audience-station dependency will continue to develop.

These policies of station control may or may not be justified in terms of protecting the station from infiltration by political groups and the response of the military. Protective policies serve to both decrease the possibility of station closure and also to limit the extent of community involvement in station operations. The issue is very complex in nature, and it is difficult to discern infrastructural biases which are central to understanding the issues at hand. Whereas in the past the station’s hierarchical organizational structure was accepted by those in the periphery, today’s campesino organizations are more aware of their needs and rights and also how mass media can be used to change local political, economic, and educational systems.

The presence of the Oblate Council and the missionary priests at Pío XII is key to maintaining the stability of the station. Father Durete, the executive director, is directly involved in the decision-making process, yet his power is not exclusive as is the case with other clergy-directed radio schools. At Pío XII there is less dependency upon the missionary clergy in key areas of station operation. The stance assumed by the two missionary priests is one of assistance, guidance, and sanctuary, as opposed to control or domination.

One of the central goals of Pío XII is to facilitate and strengthen community involvement in indigenous organizations
oriented toward social, political, and economic change. Staff stress the importance of autonomous local groups as station activities may not be able to continue during times of political repression and economic instability. Personnel at Píó XII are often faced with the immediacy and volatility of the national political climate as they risk future employment, lower salaries, and even their lives by working at the station.  

In considering the possibility of government intervention in station activities, I question whether the existing processes of community consultation are sufficiently organized to facilitate the regular input of all groups. Impressions of community opinion which affect policy-making are filtered through the executive director (non-Aymara/Quechua speaking), the station director, and the department heads. It is possible for these views to represent only those sectors of the population with which these individuals are in contact.

Patterns of community consultation are constrained by the campesinos fear of expressing their opinions; hierarchical social relations and poor land access to the station also limit community consultation concerning station activities.  

Although Píó XII has initiated local training programs and established contact with community organizations, the staff and promoters still struggle to involve local community members in the consultation process. Even in those cases where villagers are somewhat cooperative, it is extremely difficult to encourage the initiation of indigenous community organizations. Hence, it is not always possible to develop consultative relationships.
with local groups.

The channels of community consultation and the degree of autonomy of local organizations involved in station operations at Pío XII must be defined. The difficulty in generating group consensus, motivating local citizens, and promoting community awareness of group activity must be addressed. A more orderly approach to the inclusion of organization and community opinion in station decision-making is one of the sole means of continuing Pío XII's radical educational methods.

5.3 Audience-Relation Continuum Analysis of Radio Pío XII

Using the audience-relation continuum and the data presented in the station profile at the end of the chapter (Table 5-3) as the basis of our analysis, we find that Radio Pío XII has primary, secondary and tertiary levels of access and participation, as well as primary levels of self-management. Pío XII is different from Radio San Gabriel and other stations with mutual-development type audience relations in that it adopts a more horizontal decision-making structure, a less formal emphasis upon educational programming, more frequent consultation of local communities and campesino organizations in policy-making, an overt political affiliation with unions and mining syndicates, and a wide aperture for community involvement in station operations. This is evident in Pío XII's relation to the community and in the staff attitudes toward community initiatives. Pío XII's two-year closure in 1980 and its constant political vulnerability create a different atmosphere among the staff and community members. A close relationship
with the audience is seen as being essential to the continuation of station operations. Pío XII staff also appear to be committed to the cause and ideals of the local people.

Using data from the station profile, it is possible to assess Pío XII in terms of my four categories of factors affecting the audience relation. In terms of the dimension of station operations, Pío XII maintains a local focus which distinguishes it from other stations. Similarly, the use of the station's mobile transmitting unit encourages local people to become involved in program production. Frequent staff visits to local barrios also increase contact with the community and encourage promoters. For this reason Pío XII has more significant relationships with local grass-roots organizations than any other radio school surveyed.

In comparison with other radio schools, Pío XII's educational method is more oriented toward the conscientization of campesinos. Pío XII's approach to local problems is practical in nature. It encourages students to express their own opinions and attempt to solve local problems as opposed to relying upon formal educational methods. Program types, printed materials, and forms of instruction are well suited to the needs of the community as expressed by the local people. Pío XII's decision-making structure operates on a smaller dimension than other stations and incorporates horizontal input into planning processes. Projects including the popular reporters project indicate a high level of local input into programming.

Although Radio Pío XII has not attained secondary and
tertiary levels of self-management, if compared with the audience relations of other radio schools, we see that those of Pío XII are more characteristic of the radical-change model type. Pío XII approaches the ideals of this model while operating in a politically turbulent situation. Radio Pío XII is characterized by poor contact with State agencies and conflict with the military. In relation to other Bolivian stations, Pío XII is seen as being more extreme in its rejection of government political policies, and aligning itself with the voice of the oppressed.

Radio Pío XII is one of the few ALER affiliates incorporating audience relations which approach that of the radical-change model type. Pío XII is viewed by many as a radical extreme. The majority of stations fear the repercussions resulting from statements broadcast by Pío XII and the relationship established with politically active indigenous groups. As an educational radio station, Pío XII emphasizes the local community and their interaction with the medium, as opposed to merely the mass transmission of messages.

Although Radio Pío XII incorporates various forms of local input into station decision-making, it falls short of some of the characteristics of the radical-change model outlined at the beginning of this chapter. An improved relationship with its audience would consist of additional opportunities for station self-management on the part of local residents. Likewise, the democratization of station management and operation is dependent upon overall social, economic, political,
and educational change in Bolivia. The long term effectiveness of Pío XII's activities and the feasibility of local community organizations during times of political oppression remain to be seen. Experience will demonstrate if the radical change approach to audience relations will prove advantageous over the other audience-relation models in the context of Bolivia's tumultuous political climate. In the case of other Latin American radio schools adopting radical change audience relations, there has been limited long term success. In cases such as Radio ACPH and the MEB, the continuation of operations was contingent upon the government tolerating station activities. If faced with a conservative military dictatorship, the future of Radio Pío XII is not hopeful. On the other hand, there may be a chance for this popular educational movement to continue if the current democratic government can survive the ongoing national economic crisis and guarantee freedom of expression of the oppressed classes.
Table 5-3

Profile: Radio Pío XII, Llallagua Bolivia

The information in this appendix was obtained from interviews with the following staff at Radio Pío XII: Félix Calix, Teodora Camacho, Germán Condaro, Marcelino Gonzales, Narciso Gutierrez, Ernesto Maman, and Ernesto Ramirez.

Station Objective
To help existing groups to coordinate efforts, plan activities, and reflect on the activities of other zones.
To assist people in seeing, defining, and solving problems.
To mobilize community members to participate in mass media.
To include all of the community in the feedback process.
To develop a critical perception in order to promote better conditions of family and social life. To teach and promote popular participation in social, economic, political, educational, and agricultural movements.
To help the community to consolidate its efforts to seek communal solutions to the most urgent problems.

Ownership
The Oblate Fathers.

Target Audience
The suburban population of Llallagua, Pío XII, Siglo XX, and the rural population of the surrounding ten zones. This area is a very politically active mining area, where many Quechua and Aymara seek jobs.
30% of rural dwellers are Aymara, and 70% Quechua.
The mines discriminate against the campesinos.
The station broadcasts 50% Spanish and 50% Aymara/Quechua.
Diversity of audiences requires varied programming.
Neighbouring zones react differently to same materials, programming must meet specific needs.

Political Viewpoint
The station does not favor any one political party. Pío XII expresses the concerns of the local people and the voice of the organized groups among the marginalized.

Relation with the Catholic Church
There is a wide base of cooperation with the local Catholic Church which is more radical than that of the national centre. There is direct contact with the local Church and there are no problems with ideology.
The people have been persecuted and oppressed and the Church sides with the poor.
The Church also speaks on behalf of the miners.
There is only one priest for every ten communities, hence, the radio is seen as having a key role in the growth and
development of the Church itself.

Financing
Sponsored by ERBOL and in turn by Misereor and other German development agencies.
No Commercial programming.

Staff
The 20 staff all speak Quechua except Narciso who speaks Aymara, and the two missionary priests who speak Spanish. All staff have Aymara heritage except for the Priests (directors). 50% staff turnover since last station closure in 1980.

Planning and Research
1982 audience survey and investigation of various media.
No published data for lack of time and finances.
Research conducted by José Ignacio of Radio Enriquillo.

Transmitting Power
1kw as of August 1983.
Equipment of poor technical quality.

Radial Distance of Transmission
120km. Mobile transmitting unit used once weekly.
Functions only over short distances, telephone required.

Estimated Size of Audience
Open audience in Bolivia approximately 300,000
40,000 living in Llallagua and Siglo XX.
No formally controlled audience.

Competition
No recent audience survey data available.
La Voz Minero, Siglo XX (1kw) news and music,
minimal educational programming, Spanish Language.
21 de Diciembre (1kw), poor technical operations,
Spanish language broadcast, minimal cultural emphasis.
Radio Uncilla (300w), modern music with youth orientation.
Radio Llallagua, not operational due to government closure.

Contact With Grass-Roots Organizations
Before 1980 coup 45 communities and 50 leaders contacted.
Following government persecution trust was destroyed.
Pío XII currently in contact with 10 communities and 48 leaders in 4 zones.
Ongoing contact is established with 12 women's groups in the community (often catalysts for union activities), mining unions, Juntas Vecinales, Vecinos Mundiales, UNITAS, Corporaciones Regionales de Desarollo etc.
There is a general need to unify and consolidate groups.
Pío XII lacks an ordered way of making contacts and generating a forum among its wide base of contacts.
It is essential to create an atmosphere where the people
see their input as being relevant and effective. There is lack of integration of meetings, a low level of community awareness, and there is a need for improved planning as staff have little experience.

**Campesino Input into Station Operations**

Local participation is essential in station evaluation as well as program, folleto, and cartilla design. 59 popular reporters (25 are active) from different zones report on neighborhood events and conduct interviews. 15-20 leaders produce programs weekly.

**Forms of Campesino Participation**

10 letters received each week, mostly asking for courses. 70% of rural letters are for agricultural information, 20% concerning programming and 10% publications. 30% of urban letters are concerning needs, 40% concerning unions and political organizations, and 30% regarding content. 10 weekly visits to the station. Few locals are actually involved, some neighborhood reporters are sending news. Communities suggest themes for programs and publications, and popular evangelisation involves community members. Audiences ask for specific campaigns, the station provides the content, and the community evaluates the effort. The open audience is without commitment and therefore does not need the radio to survive. Select organized community groups ask for training and are motivated to use the radio; others are apathetic. Daily contact with neighborhood leaders, women's groups, and miners by popular reporters.

**Station Visits to the Local Communities**

Thirty to forty visits weekly to conduct interviews, assist local promoters, and also to conduct courses and seminars. The agricultural department visits forty communities eight times each year to assist farmers in solving problems. 15 local community leaders visit station weekly to broadcast their own programs.

**Media Used**

Cassette forums, radio, worksheets, songbooks, station newsletter, street theatre, puppets, slide-tape shows.

**Relation with other Radiophonic Institutions**

Member of ALER and ERBOL. Formal contact is established with ACLO Potosí, Khana, and UNITAS.

**Relation with State**

Official recognition as a cultural station. After the last coup and government seizure there was a great deal of red tape before resuming transmission. No formal contact with government agricultural agencies. In the past there has been a great deal of conflict with the military and the government. Pío XII is a
centre for political and union activity in Bolivia.

Relation with State School System
No formal relations with the Ministry of Education. Cooperation with ERBOL and the government for 1984 literacy campaign, yet Pío XII is apprehensive concerning the possibility of political propaganda, government red tape, the use of traditional literacy methods, and the potential manipulation of rural audiences.

Teacher Qualification
Teachers are graduates of the teachers' academy, and have a rural educational degree. A select number of staff have BA's and agriculturists have a technical agricultural degree. Some staff have less formal education yet greater practical experience.

Educational Method
Conscientization-based mutual education. No formal educational programming, no extension courses. Pío XII programming takes on a very practical focus. Formal literacy methods are not in vogue. It is difficult in this region to teach via the radio, both formal and non formal educational methods have failed. The radio's prime emphasis is to motivate the people. Education is seen as more of a horizontal process which is the result of reflection and motivation.

Folletos Published by the Station
Folletos correspond to each instructional theme. These materials are used to complement promoter training, community visits, and radial broadcasts. A great deal of the station's printed material is imported from other organizations because they do not have the means to produce these materials.

Material Design
There are folletos in each area of promotion. Material design is completed by station staff from individual departments with the consultation of promoters and community cooperation. Needs are suggested by the local community and the staff then determines the nature of the educational materials to be implemented. After completing the galley copy, the staff take the folleto to the local communities for their suggestions, then to ERBOL's education department. All ten promoters then visit a community to complete a field test. The station coordinates the whole process and has ultimate editorial powers.

Content Decisions
The community suggests course and program content and the station selects content, prepares programming, and teaches local leaders. There is no democratic decision-making.
There is community consultation and input, however staff coordinate these processes. A 1982 survey documented the ideas of 130 people regarding programming. Sunday audience surveys on past week’s programs. Audience also evaluates each course.

Community Training Courses
25 Promoter training courses offered each year.
70 community representatives attend each course.
Democratic community representation.
Courses offered in the administration of co-ops, weaving, horticulture and food, internal parasites, campesino unions, health and hygiene, managing finances, salary, currency devaluation, group leadership, effects of radio and television, evangelisation, the use of cassettes and slides etc. UNITAS courses are used in promoter training by Pío XII staff. Ten agricultural courses offered for a total of 350 leaders.
59 popular reporters representing neighborhoods, rural communities, women’s groups, and miners.
The objective is to motivate local involvement in news programming and assist existing organizations.
Reporters are trained in radio production, announcing, news processing, sources of information, editing, etc.

Choice of Promoters
Democraticaly chosen by the community.
Two station staff assist 10 zonal organizations, giving credibility to the projects, motivating groups, and guaranteeing fair group representation.

Student Dropout
Course attendance depends upon group leaders and content.
Dropout is often due to weather, course hours, and travel.
No statistics available.

Evaluation
Two yearly questionnaires among base groups concerning station operations.
Yearly evaluation submitted to ERBOL by each department.
Evaluation of planning is trimestral by department.
Evaluation of supervision is trimestral by department.
Rigorous evaluation using Harvard method for analysis of individual objectives and results.
Monthly staff reports concerning group participation.
Reports from neighborhood groups to urban sector each trimester concerning local visits, progress, and needs.
Advanced research methods are foreign to staff with basic levels of education. Yearly reports to ERBOL are seen as being a formality to ensure financing of station operations. Harvard model for departmental planning and evaluation initiated by Walter Gómez of UNITAS.
6.1 Introduction

This chapter will discuss audience-relation analysis within the broader context of educational radio broadcasting in Latin America. Discussion will include the organizational and economic relationships which tend to predominate, and constraints or obstacles which hinder local participation in broadcasting.

Educational radio broadcasting is severely limited throughout Latin America. Of the 4,033 radio stations reported by Bisbal, 202 of these stations are property of the Catholic Church, and of this number only 75 to 100 are educational or cultural in nature. This represents two and a half percent of all existing stations, and half of the educational stations are located in Brazil alone. This small number of stations reaches few of the roughly 300 million inhabitants of Latin America.

The impact of educational radio stations is limited due to restricted human and financial resources, political repression, and the domination of commercial models. Moreover, a limited understanding of the educational potential of radio on the part of station directors and owners impedes innovation in programming. Written material exploring the application of radio to social problems is often unavailable, and technical expertise is lacking in rural areas.

Typically, cultural and educational stations emit AM
band signals which are under five kilowatts in power and are poor in technical quality, thus reaching an extremely limited area. The majority of smaller stations possess antiquated and unserviced equipment. Small stations have minimal financial resources and poorly trained staff who are motivated by religious conviction and the desire to help their community.

Throughout Latin America, government licencing procedures impede the operation of educational radio broadcasting. In countries such as Bolivia, stations are subject to complicated government licencing procedures. These procedures are ultimately tied to the sociopolitical context of each nation. In countries where people lack freedom of expression and public access to communication channels, few educational stations operate without severe restrictions. In the case of other nations, government certification is more simplified.

6.2 The Latin American Association of Educational Radio

The Latin American radio school movement is the largest and most well known group of stations dedicated to the use of radio for educational purposes. The Latin American Association of Educational Radio, more commonly referred to as ALER, is an association of forty-one institutions promoting radiophonic education in seventeen different Latin American nations (see Table 6-1 on the following page). These small radio stations, each averaging less than ten kilowatts in power, serve as viable media alternatives to the large urban-based commercial stations.
Table 6-1:
ALER Affiliates

ARGENTINA:
Instituto de Cultura Popular (INCUPO).

BOLIVIA:
Acción Cultural Loyola (ACLO);
Instituto de Investigación Cultural para Educación Popular;
Asociación de Educación Radiofónica de Bolivia (ERBOL);
Emisoras y Escuelas Radiofónicas San Rafael;
Escuelas Radiofónicas Fides;
Instituto Radiofónico Fe y Alegría (IRFA-B);
Centro de Educación a través de los medios de Comunicación Social (CEAMCOS); Programa GHANA-ERBOL;
Radio Esperanza; Radio Juan XXIII;
Radio Santa Clara; Radio San Gabriel;
Emisoras Pío XII; Radio Yungas.

BRASIL:
Fundación Educacional Padre Landell de Mource (FEPLAM).

COLOMBIA:
Acción Cultural Popular (ACPO).

COSTA RICA:
Instituto Costarricense de Enseñanza Radiofónica.

CHILE:
Fundación Radio Escuela para el Desarrollo.

ECUADOR:
Escuelas Radiofónicas Populares del Ecuador (ERPE);
Instituto Radiofónico Fe y Alegría (IRFEYAL);
Sistema de Educación Radiofónica Bicultural Shuar; Radio Mensaje.

GUATEMALA:
Federación Guatemalteca de Escuelas Radiofónicas (F.G.E.R.);
Radio Tezultlán; La Voz de Colmaba;
La Voz de Nahuala; Radio Mami; Radio Chortís.

HAITI:
Radio Solei.

HONDURAS:
Acción Cultural Popular Hondureña (ACPH).

MÉXICO:
Fomento Cultural y Educativo.

NICARAGUA:
Escuelas Radiofónicas de Nicaragua.

PANAMA:
Centro de Estudios, Promoción y Asistencia Social (CEPAS).

PERU:
La Voz de la Selva.

REPÚBLICA DOMINICANA:
Radio Enriquillo; Radio Marién; Radio Santa María.

VENEZUELA:
Radio Occidente; Instituto Radiofónico Fe y Alegría.
ALER affiliates are commonly referred to as "radio schools" (escuelas radiofónicas), a term derived from Radio Sutatenza's program of Basic Integral Education developed in 1947. A local radio school is defined as a relatively stable, small group of campesinos of varying ages which holds sustained, periodic meetings to listen systematically, with the aid of a trained community promoter, to radio programs produced especially for rural areas. Broadcasts are supplemented by leaflets, books, newspapers, and audio-visual materials oriented toward the campesino audience. The term radio school is used to describe stations transmitting a variety of formal and non-formal educational programs. Radio school students may be involved in a series of over-the-air extension courses, or they may listen to daily programs including basic education, literacy, health, agricultural, cultural, political, and religious programming.

The majority of ALER affiliates are located in agricultural regions. Priority is given to assisting the popular classes (the marginalized poor) in the use of radio communication, and the formation of grass-roots organizations as a means toward their development and liberation. Ideally, these local bases are to be administered by the people who make up the target audience, giving a voice to those who do not have a voice in society.

ALER was founded in Bogotá in 1972 as a private non-profit organization with the following objectives: to achieve effective solidarity between member institutions and other
national and international organizations promoting grass-roots media development; to assist in the interchange of ideas, strategies, and experiences; to consult other member organizations concerning planning, programming, and evaluation; to promote better training and higher qualification of staff; to promote the work of the radio schools and their motivational effect; to represent ALER and its affiliates in negotiations with other organizations.10

6.2.1 ALER and the Catholic Church

ALER has an explicit forty-three page doctrinal statement which makes reference to the Medellín11 and Puebla12 documents and to the Bible as sources of ALER's practical and theoretical orientation. Although certain ALER affiliates affirm that they are interdenominational,13 ALER itself is predominantly Roman Catholic in nature. The Church often assists in the development of station objectives, the selection and training of personnel, the management of station finances, and in determining program content.14 More autonomous radio schools have their own judicial board of lay directors who assume greater responsibility.15

In general, the Roman Catholic Church influences most of the activities of the radio schools whether or not a school has institutional autonomy.16 Ideologically speaking, the member stations represent a range of political and theological views. These views usually reflect the standpoint of the local Catholic bishop or religious order which sponsors the station. Among the more radical, liberation-oriented group of stations which
advocate joining with the oppressed in their political struggle are Radio Pío XII and Radio Enriquillo. Many of these stations have suffered government pressure tactics ranging from censorship to the kidnapping of leaders, and the destruction of facilities.¹⁷

Since the inception of Radio Sutatenza in 1947, radio broadcasting has been an integral part of the Church's concentration on evangelization, justice, social promotion, health and agricultural campaigns, and solidarity with the poor.¹⁸ During the 1950's religious orders sent out missionary clergy to work with communication media. The focus of the Church shifted to regions unserviced by State education and agriculture programs. In the 1960's and 1970's radio was used increasingly for the expression of dissident popular movements.¹⁹

In rural areas where campesinos feel the brunt of social, economic, and political marginalization, the Church has worked toward making the Catholic faith more relevant to the needs of the people.²⁰ In an age of secularism, the cultural Catholicism of the middle and upper classes is dwindling in popularity. Well-educated clergy who once played a significant part in the communication networks of the national or provincial elites, no longer maintain the same role. Church views towards peasants have also changed. The rural poor are no longer seen as merely illiterate, uncivilized savages, as they are expressing their own voice and are rapidly becoming the Church's most active constituency. The radio school movement is an
example of the Church's intensified use of communication media to meet the needs of the poor, to build a strong rural church, and to prevent the insurgence of harmful elements. 21

The Catholic Church benefits directly from radio school operations. 22 Individual stations conserve its prestige and extend its presence in rural areas. 23 The presence of radio schools in isolated areas restricts the influence of extreme political ideologies and religious cults. Radio school broadcasts frequently publicize Church activities, and local promoters distribute materials on catechism classes. Radio schools and base communities are prominent international examples of the positive thrust of the Church across the continent.

6.2.2 Advantages of the Catholic Church's Involvement

The collaboration of the Church is essential to the radio school movement. The local priest is frequently involved in establishing stations, motivating the people, and in selecting local leaders. Local churches also serve as ideal meeting places for radio discussion groups. 24 Radio stations benefit from the Church's help in obtaining international financing, and in mediating relations with the government.

The most significant reason for the Church's involvement in educational radio is the credibility and authority it gives to radiophonic institutions. 25 The Church's influence has been demonstrable in protecting the operation of radio schools in situations where the lives of the staff and the future of the station would be otherwise be endangered. Dependence on the
Catholic Church is seen by station administrators as a condition for greater security and independence during times of political hostility. However, association with the Church, although significant, has not prevented aggressive military action from being taken against ALER affiliates in Chile, Honduras, Guatemala, and Bolivia.

6.2.3 Limitations of the Catholic Church’s Involvement

There are major limitations concerning the Church’s involvement in the radio school movement. Though previous research makes no mention of conflict between ALER affiliates, there is conflict over the degree of support of ALER’s doctrinal statement. Certain stations are loosely committed to ALER’s doctrinal statement. Discontinued association with ALER may jeopardize external financing, hence certain stations maintain their association with ALER while not fully supporting their views. Internal Church conflicts translate into discrepancies between the stance of the Catholic hierarchy and the radio school staff. A contrast between position papers such as the Puebla and Medellín documents and actual ecclesiastical practice result in conflict over the development of educational media projects. Although Church support for the radio schools has increased in recent years, theological differences between members of the Church hierarchy and radio school directors result in conflicting policy directives, non-unilateral project support, and poor coordination with other agencies.

Official documents state that without the preservation of the integrity of the Christian (Catholic) message, social
action is considered as neither integral evangelization nor appropriate liberating action. In the case of nine of twenty-seven Latin American stations surveyed in ALER's 1980 major study, the difference between the two concepts of evangelization is either uncertain or indistinguishable.

Conflicting viewpoints concerning evangelization demonstrate the divergent positions maintained by radio school staff, participants, and international supporters. In many instances spiritual concerns are secondary to social, agricultural, health, and educational objectives, even though publications and evaluations state the opposite. Confusion resulting from church disunity works against the overall goals of the radio schools. Illiterate campesinos do not know what to accept and what to reject.

6.3 Station Direction: Ordained and Lay Directors

Historically, radio schools have been founded and directed by missionary priests. Ordained clergy are in a position to make contact with other Church groups and encourage the sharing of resources. The charisma of many priests serves as a source of inspiration, trust, and solidarity among the local people who see the priest as being dedicated to the cause and, above all, virtuous. It is also assumed that the priest is able to resolve conflicts within the station and with government officials. Further, many feel that without the direction or participation of one or more priests, radio schools may lose their Catholic orientation. However, the most distinct advantage of clerical involvement is that Catholic priests have
procured international financing for otherwise destitute projects. 31

There are also disadvantages associated with ordained directors. For example, missionary priests assigned to such tasks often lack technical and administrative training. Concerning the role of the priest, there is often confusion as to whether he is a fund raiser, a counsellor, a teacher, an evangelist, a social activist, an international ambassador, an administrator, or a disc jockey. A criticism voiced about the priest's role as a mediator of conflict is that the priest cannot in all cases understand the significance and nature of difficulties among lay staff members. Over sixty percent of religious directors are foreigners, whereas lay directors are national citizens. 32 It is evident in the documents cited above that certain clergy are better suited to such involvement, whereas others are more paternalistic in their approach to the development of indigenous media.

In response to the local situation, radio school leadership patterns are currently changing. Fifty percent of the stations surveyed are now directed by lay individuals. 33 It is generally accepted that lay directors allow for more autonomy and freedom in the design of station policies. Lay directors are closer to personnel problems, and they have links with non-Catholic organizations. These qualities are beneficial to internal operations and valuable in strengthening associations with local grass-roots groups. These links encourage community participation in station activities. It is also reported that
lay-directed stations are more oriented toward social action and political consciousness than are stations with ordained directors.\textsuperscript{34}

Disadvantages of lay-direction include less contact with the local Church, generation of less international financing, higher salary costs, and a general lack of the charisma or mystique of an ordained priest.\textsuperscript{35} Such charisma and solidarity with the poor often inspires the help of voluntary auxiliaries and professionals otherwise inaccessible to lay staff members.\textsuperscript{36}

Due to the relative advantages of both lay and religious direction, the majority of stations integrate both forms of leadership in station operations. The paternalistic aura attached to involvement of priests as station directors and governors can sometimes encourage openness among campesinos, but it can also prevent more meaningful participation in processes of social change. Unhealthy dependence upon external motivation and assistance can thwart local change-oriented initiatives. In such cases it is up to the local priest to involve local individuals in station planning and operations, and to break down the harmful barriers of paternalism as a way of life. Unfortunately, many rural priests are tied to traditional pastoral roles which inhibit such processes.

6.4 Radio School Dependency

Dependency among radio schools upon foreign technical and financial help from international church, development, and government agencies is a highly controversial topic. Published reports do not refer to support relationships as generating any
form of dependency. Stations rely upon external financial support for equipment, technical assistance, and staff. Support relationships cannot always be differentiated from harmful political, religious, and ideological dependencies. 

Forms of financial, technical and political dependency are not easily disassociated from one another. Each form of dependency can result in the development of inappropriate media systems. Reliance upon foreign financing and foreign decision-making guidelines constrains the indigenization of educational radio stations and the development of healthy audience relations. Audience autonomy and responsibility concerning station financing is eroded by external financing. Funding agencies, station directors, and staff do not trust the local people to make decisions concerning station financing, and rarely involve them in administration apprenticeship or training programs which will improve their abilities.

Certain stations willingly accept a limited dependency on external financing as no other alternative exists. Spain makes reference to ALER affiliates which receive up to eighty percent of their operating budget from external sources. Even with such support, stations are unable to pay their staff adequate salaries. Staff with specialized technical and teaching experience are forced to search for more lucrative employment. To secure trained staff, stations must provide basic levels of remuneration. Many stations do not have sufficient human and financial resources to meet their stated objectives. Under these conditions, self-sufficient financing
is not possible.

6.5 Funding Strategies

Five funding strategies have been adopted by educational media projects in Latin America. Each strategy involves decisions concerning the sources, methods, and effects of station financing. Spain\textsuperscript{41} has defined five specific funding sources: 1) the local, regional or national government, 2) international donor agencies, 3) advertising sales, 4) private support from friends or local benefactors, and 5) project self-support.

Few researchers deal with the reluctance of media managers to discuss sources of station financing and funding strategies. Researchers such as Quarry\textsuperscript{42} support the observation that station staff and officials are apprehensive in responding to questioning pertaining to foreign financing of radio projects, making it difficult to obtain detailed information. Spain\textsuperscript{43} maintains that stations do not want agencies to know what other agencies are giving, as it might appear that desperately needed funds are not required because there are multiple donors.

Without systematic evaluation based upon measurable objectives, the station manager is unable to justify station funding and is susceptible to criticism by local, national, and international officials. Thus, stations may be reticent to publish details about external financing. Information pertaining to international donors has led to allegations concerning dependency upon foreign ideologies and foreign institutions. Evaluation itself can lead to the involvement of
local groups, and to improved programming. Few station managers are open to the scrutiny of their projects by an outside evaluation team for fear of the evaluation being used by political opponents as a tool to change station policy.44

This next section will discuss the advantages and disadvantages of each alternative financing option, and its effect upon audience relations.

6.5.1 Government Financing

Government involvement in station financing has many profound effects upon the audience relation. Government-controlled educational systems have not catered to the needs of indigenous poor, but rather to the needs of the dominant rural elite. On the whole, government supported education radio stations have more formal educational programming, less community participation, and extreme censorship of political expression.

Government support of educational radio is dependent upon the national economy and the political party in power. ALER's position of siding with the oppressed classes often opposes government policies and precludes receiving financing from regional and national authorities. Except for brief periods, most Latin American governments represent the dominant classes, and, thus oppose the progressive social orientation of ALER's affiliates.45 Fragile national economies, unstable governments, and competing political factions create a cautious response to government support of alternative educational broadcasting. Government support may indicate an attempt to
interfere in station operation, in which case the station must reserve the right to refuse forms of support which are incompatible with station objectives.

Freedom of political expression is the exception rather than the rule in Latin America, and therefore radio schools are cautious in voicing political opinions. ALER affiliates such as Radio Fides in La Paz remain apolitical. Other stations, such as Radio Pío XII in Llallagua, express the political views of local grass-roots organizations. Certain Latin American governments, such as that of Bolivia, support national radio schools by providing salaries for teachers. However, by no means does this support cover station costs. Large-scale financial support is out of the question for debt-ridden nations, hence, government financing is only a remote solution to the funding.

In Latin America, family politics have added to paternalism within national affairs; marginalized sectors continue to be without a voice. Urban-centered governments fear the use of influential indigenous-language radio stations for political gain. In the past the government of Bolivia has attempted to control rural mass communication to prevent organized opposition in the form of public announcements about road blocks, protests, and strikes. The right to communicate has been denied to ensure control over subversive political thought. Consequently, governments frown upon autonomous audience relations among marginalized campesinos.

For the above reasons the public questions whether any
station financed by a repressive government represents the voice of the people. Doubt or skepticism on the part of the campesino population concerning freedom of expression can lead to widespread mistrust in dealing with the local station. Proponents of grass-roots media have come to expect a certain degree of conflict with the powers that be if change is to occur.

Alternative media are established in response to the undemocratic nature of current governments, and any association with such governments may jeopardize the freedom and neutrality of such operations. In Bolivia, government action against popular radio stations during the García Meza regime resulted in widespread mistrust of any form of government involvement. It is in this milieu of apprehension that we encounter poor relations between the audience and government-financed educational radio stations.

6.5.2 International Development Agencies

Insufficient financing from national government sources causes most ALER affiliates to seek foreign financing. Financing from international church, government, or aid-related agencies carries with it stipulations which must be adhered to. Foreign financing is dependent upon factors including international political and economic stability, competition between projects, quality of project submissions, changes in funding policy, and personal contacts. ERBOL and its affiliates have procured long-term international funding from primarily Catholic organizations which support its religious orientation. Finan-
cing from Church sources guarantees a sense of permanence and financial solubility. Other organizations are more cautious about funding projects with an implicit ideological focus. It is evident in the current Latin American milieu that without the political and financial support of the international Church, the radio schools could not exist.

O'Sullivan\textsuperscript{46} refers to various cooperating agencies which have assisted in partial financing of projects such as seminars, workshops, educational research, and publications. Major funding organizations include the German church agencies Misereor and Adveniat, the International Development Research Centre, Radio Netherlands, Broederlijk Delen, Vastenaktie, and the Konrad Adenauer Foundation. There is minimal material available about the relationship between these funding agencies and ALER. The recent evaluation completed by Misereor concerning their association with ERBOL is weak and provides little new information.\textsuperscript{47}

Aid has become a political lever manipulated by foreign authorities and by national officials motivated by concerns other than the local situation. Media planners are forced to reconcile two different sets of goals: political goals intended to gain project support among decision-makers and donors and project goals essential to the station's impact in the community. Long-term objectives are used to justify large media investments regardless of potential effects upon the community. The impact of foreign media technology cannot be evaluated with any degree of long range accuracy.\textsuperscript{48}
The absence of extremely powerful international agencies such as the World Bank, US Aid, the Swedish International Development Agency etc. in the financing of radio schools is an interesting phenomenon. One may only speculate that it is due to unpublicized conflict between international agencies and specific radio schools. Church authorities such as Bishop Proano of Riobamba, Ecuador, who are committed to the advance of liberation theology, stress that local projects should not rely upon foreign financing. Incompatibility with Bishop Proano's radical liberation line has lead to the cessation of technical assistance from Radio Netherlands, and financial assistance from European Catholic agencies to Escuelas Radiofónicas Populares del Ecuador (ERPE). This conflict has resulted in technical deterioration and a decrease in signal strength from ten kilowatts to less than five kilowatts. An unwillingness among ALER affiliates to discuss such issues prevents in-depth analysis of political conflict between funding authorities and radio schools.

In the case of radio stations soliciting financial assistance from international organizations, local inhabitants rarely have any input into which organizations the station associates with. Decisions are made on behalf of the local population and contact with external groups is mediated by station authorities. These funding practices distance local groups from the nexus of financial decision-making. Ultimate responsibility lies in the hands of the station's director and board of governors. Likewise, community groups have no part in
complicated evaluation procedures.

International financing practices adopted by radio schools work against the relationship established between the station and its audience. In the case of local visits by international officials, the actual contact made with local groups is minimal. Station officials often assist in selecting groups to be visited and translate for the visiting dignitaries. This mediated relationship provides little local autonomy or representation in areas of financial decision-making.

6.5.3 Advertising Revenue

Advertising revenue as a method of station financing is a highly controversial topic. Financial benefits must be balanced by a thorough evaluation of detrimental effects upon the rural audience and also the audience's perception of educational programming. Each station must assess to what extent commercial advertising is compatible with ALER's doctrinal statement. Stations must also determine whether they are to confront the injustices of the commercial power structure in Latin America. Standards vary from station to station concerning moral and political content restrictions. The central question is whether an adequate selection of advertising will or will not annul the thrust of educational programming.

Predominantly Catholic stations ban commercials promoting political parties, alcohol, and cigarettes.

ALER affiliates determine what percentage of broadcasting time and what specific type of advertising is to be accepted. Select stations broadcast advertisement-free
educational programming during key listening hours and restrict commercial advertisements to other times. However, prime time advertising quotients must be maintained to secure advertising contracts. One study suggests that if a station dedicates less than thirty percent of air time to commercial programming, it is virtually impossible to cover station costs without external assistance.

Latin American researchers conclude that advertising conditions integral human development, and indirectly influences the development of national and regional cultures. Schenkel states that trends promoted by advertising serve to distort the national reality, and impede full participation in radical structural change. Similarly, advertising perpetuates myths concerning the existing social, political, and economic order.

Poorly educated campesinos are tempted and misled by urban-produced commercial advertising which uses advanced persuasion techniques to prompt the consumption of luxury goods. These products are inappropriate for use by rural campesinos and beyond their financial means. Advertising myths concerning success and a better life create unrealistic desires among rural audiences. A large sector of the rural audience has become accustomed to the advertising of new products, and listens to the radio for product information. The popularization of advertising has resulted in local one-upmanship and the purchase of unnecessary luxury goods including beauty products, televisions, refrigerators, and appliances.

6.5.4 Local Private Support
In most rural contexts, generating private support from friends or local benefactors is a limited approach to station financing. Rural areas plagued by economic difficulties have an extremely limited financial support base. Few donors are interested in financing educational radio. Wealthy merchants and landowners are reluctant to support alternative media which defend the rights of local laborers. The small farmers which are in favor of such projects are devoid of funds to support them. In accepting local financial support, stations must discern attempts to influence station policy. Even the appearance of political favouritism threatens the credibility of a station. Stations are sensitive to the current government in power and also rival political parties which may overthrow the existing government. The relation between the audience and the station should be strengthened by local private support, financing from political groups may result in the audience becoming suspicious of the station’s motives.

Throughout Bolivia, electoral candidates are turning to media to gain the peasant vote. Radio schools have experienced donors attempting to gain political access. In isolated rural areas, ALER affiliates attract audiences otherwise unreached by commercial channels. Political statements broadcast by radio schools are respected as the voice of the people, hence station directors oversee tremendous political power.

As in the case of advertising revenue, station management often makes decisions concerning acceptable political content. The politicization of community affairs complicates
local funding and may lead to intense local conflict. The Catholic Church is considered the sole group capable of mediating such conflicts. Yet it must be understood that the Church has its own ideological bias which may prevent the association between Church-sponsored radio stations and politically diverse groups.

A station's political stance is dependent upon the director (often a priest), the board of governors, and funding agencies. If total democratic communication existed, all groups would be given representative access to broadcast time. In the case of San Gabriel, official community representatives may express group opinion, but political parties are not permitted access to the radio. At Radio Pío XII the radio school risks government closure as politically active campesino groups are encouraged to broadcast their views. In each of these cases either the station's director or board of governors has established station policy.

6.5.5 Self-Financing

The final financing option for educational broadcasting is self-support. Self-financing implies that a radio station cover some of its operational costs from student course fees, books, station-related industries, and financial campaigns. In assessing the compatibility of commercial and educational activity, each station determines if commercial activity is acceptable to the public, if its focus conflicts with that of educational programming offered, and if station industries take away needed manpower from other activities. Conflicting goals
between commercial and educational activities may result in public controversy. Hence, staff and audience understanding of self-financing is critical to continued station operation. Inherent difficulties in establishing self-financing have resulted in few stations investing in such laborious efforts. In an age of budget cuts and competing projects, educational radio projects will need to generate more self-support or face extinction.

The first method of station self-financing is user financing. Radio Santa María in the Dominican Republic is the most successful case of a user-financed radio school. It generates seventy percent of its annual budget from student revenue.⁶⁰ The Radio Santa María financing system is based on each student contributing $7.00 per course, equivalent to four days minimum wage for a twenty-eight week course. The fact that the students are willing to pay course fees indicates that courses are deemed valuable by the participants.⁶¹

Externally funded projects may provide inappropriate services otherwise not offered if dependent upon user-determined funding. Similarly, local communities are more willing to invest time and effort in "self-wanted" development alternatives as opposed to externally determined projects.⁶² A sense of dignity and responsibility is developed when local people contribute to projects.⁶³ Local input is thus essential in planning course materials, and in assessing whether the courses are relevant to the daily lives of the audience.

Critics of student-financed radio maintain that those
who need the programs most cannot afford to pay for them. This problem is solved by using a sliding scale of income-determined course fees. Other prerequisites for this method of financing include an efficient system of fee collection, a non-discriminatory selection of students, and a nonpaternalistic approach to course subsidies.

The second means of station self-financing is that of station-based industries. These industries are often an extension of daily station operations and include printing and record presses. Radio Sutatenza generates seventy-three percent of its total budget from station-related industries. These operations include publishing a local newspaper and radio worksheets with advertising content. Community radio may also offer a community bulletin board service or emergency information channel. ERBOL is currently developing an alternative news agency to collect and disseminate news throughout Bolivia. This information is otherwise unavailable to campesinos via conventional media channels. Increased political freedom may lead to marketing this unique service to national newspapers and radio stations.

Another possible financing option is that of fundraising campaigns. Stations including Radio San Rafael have initiated annual campaigns asking campesinos for one day's salary to assist in supporting the work of the radio school. These campaigns are run in conjunction with folkloric festivals featuring the station's educational efforts. Formal financial campaigns are also directed toward unions, farming cooperatives,
Healthy and mutually cooperative relationships between the radio station and various like-minded community organizations are a pre-requisite for this method of financing. Without widespread public support it is possible for such campaigns to cost more than they generate. Similarly, stations stand the risk of offending people in the public solicitation of funds.

6.6 Obstacles to Community Participation

The remainder of this chapter contains an overview of obstacles to community participation and the development of significant relations between the audience and educational media. It is impossible to discuss the full spectrum of local, regional, national, and international impediments to the direct involvement of communities and individuals in educational media projects. This discussion is limited to a brief analysis of five main categories of constraints: political and ideological, structural, sociocultural, institutional, and economic.

6.6.1 Political and Ideological Constraints

Political and ideological constraints represent the strongest undercurrent opposing significant audience relations. Meaningful participation can only be generated if and when certain human rights are recognized. Freedom of expression is severely restricted throughout Latin America. Certain aspects of law, politics, national education, and bureaucratic procedures also impede audience relations.

Included within the category of political constraints are government policies which prohibit the expression of views
opposed to the government, and strategies which favor national integration and modernization above the expression of regional identity, cultural sovereignty, and appropriate media development. Consequently, peasants are not considered to be a significant "public" as they are marginal to the dominant national political and economic market. National, educational, and developmental goals are affected by the dominant national ideology and are thus biased against democratization. Any local group that takes on political characteristics risks the loss of official recognition, the confiscation of resources, censorship, or physical coercion.

At the community level, peer pressure is often exerted to achieve political objectives. At both local and national levels, factionalism and the defense of different economic interests results in community disunity. Likewise, there is a tendency for powerful individuals to take advantage of opportunities for personal gain, extending the effects of marginalization among the less powerful in society.

Forms of religious constraint upon audience relations are included in the category of political and ideological obstacles. The bulk of educational stations assume an explicitly Catholic, Protestant, or Bahai orientation. This factor may limit the participation of non-religious individuals or individuals from other denominations. Furthermore, traditional ways of participating in the Church may in turn severely limit the manner in which campesinos participate in church-operated media.
6.6.2 Structural Constraints

The next general category of obstacles to audience-station relations is that of structural constraints. The basic structural constraint is that of geography. Rugged terrain, vast distances, insufficient roads, and high transportation costs affect campesino mobility, interpersonal contact with station staff, as well as access to electricity, health services, and schools. Under these conditions, the lack of regional production and broadcasting facilities and the shortage of trained personnel affect the relation between the audience and the station. There is often a poor capacity for sustained local-level action because of the dearth of regional extension agents and local organizations involved in educational broadcasting. Many rural programs are estimated to reach only 15 to 20 percent of their target audience, as mass media channels are not integrated with the existing community communication networks.

6.6.3 Institutional Constraints

The third category of obstacles to significant audience-station relations is that of institutional constraints. Institutional constraints pertain to the organizational structure and overall operations of educational radio stations. The greatest structural impediments to participatory audience relations occur at the national, international, and mass communicational levels. Media ownership imposes conditions of production (message content and style), dissemination, and distribution of messages as well as the use and value assigned
to indigenous communication. Institutionalization of communication processes, restricted information flow, the defense of vested interests, and the perpetuation of dominant media models limit opportunities for significant audience relations.

Throughout Latin America community involvement in media ownership is minimal. Thus, community members have low ideals pertaining to the self-appropriation of community media. Entrenched public attitudes toward popular participation are not easily transformed. Paradoxically, commercial media are one of the most powerful conditioners of public attitudes toward popular participation in educational media processes.

Institutional constraints are also shaped by elitist professional attitudes which promote the professionalisation of production techniques and which limit the active role of community members in local media. These views are conditioned by training courses and high urban professional standards rather than the need among rural communities for basic technical apprenticeship. The lack of opportunity for training within institutions results in the need to import trained staff to assist in the development of non-indigenous media.

In the majority of professional radio stations, the production function as reflected in station budgets for staff and equipment is assigned high priority. The bulk of resources are spent in the production of messages with minimal concern for their utilization in remote villages. The materialistic vision of development accounts for large equipment expenditures when basic non-hardware needs are neglected. Likewise, an
unhealthy emphasis on technical development mitigates against autonomy, cultural identity, and regional expression. Technology without indigenous communication strategies and trained local specialists dedicated to rural work does not contribute to authentic development. 78

In many educational radio stations, conflict between staff members results in poorly defined and conflicting institutional objectives. Institutional media projects are often controlled by the centre of operations which determines their form, scope, and duration. Projects involving participatory communication are viewed as being experimental in nature and hence are short-term in duration. Therefore, in certain cases, there is a lack of capacity for sustained local action. 79 One central problem is that there is minimal integration of community members in centralized decision-making processes. Village elites, and even more so the rural poor, are both excluded from decision-making processes. The result is that neither the community nor the station staff have a real understanding of active participation in the media. Local problems are unaddressed and educational media projects remain removed from the center of local needs. Confusion among local community members is encouraged by a lack of cooperation between competing educational projects, the multiplicity of project efforts, ineffective local operations, deficiencies in project follow-up, and conflicting agency positions.

In a similar manner, throughout Latin America centrally-controlled, state-operated public school systems do
not include community members in decision-making processes. The consequences of centrally-controlled "banking education" include submissiveness, passivity, the inability to reason critically, a lack of creativity, and the assertion of inferiority. Students therefore develop a naive consciousness about nature and social existence, and society "remains as if narcotized to serve the ends of the minorities controlling education and communication." One other institutional constraint is the dimension of station operations. The more powerful the station's transmission, the larger its radial distance and the more people reached by the signal. However, this very distance makes it difficult to maintain quality support relationships with the audience without incremental expenditure on staff, transportation, and learning materials. Station staff cannot increase their contact beyond those communities already served. Limited air time restricts group participation in programming, and regular interpersonal contact with isolated audiences becomes virtually impossible. These factors must be taken into consideration when increasing station power; it is debatable whether radial programming without interpersonal support actually improves the situation of isolated marginalized groups. As is often the case, small stations jump at the chance to increase the station's transmitting power when foreign financing is available. In many cases rapid expansion will further remove the station from the needs of individual communities and limit local participation in station activities.
Some station authorities assume that increased access to signals is essential to guarantee stability. Stations desire to procure international financing with a view to acquiring technical equipment. Individuals are caught up in a "bigger is beautiful" mentality which is often incompatible with the original goals of the institution.

The creation of more powerful stations may result in increased access to signals yet by itself will not result in a qualitative improvement in audience relations with the station. More powerful signals complicate efforts towards increased community participation and make it more difficult to realize the indigenous change model of audience relations. Staff become over-extended and programs become less specific to local needs. Stations are slowly becoming aware of the relative advantages and disadvantages of increasing transmission beyond the local region. Unfortunately, international development organizations have encouraged expansion as well as the sponsorship of larger instructional models such as Radio Sutatenza to facilitate widespread literacy training. Unlimited station expansion diminishes available staff resources and jeopardizes relations between the radio station and the community it serves. Increased reliance upon sophisticated media technology also discourages the involvement of local residents in station maintenance.

An institutional over-dependence upon mass media and the lack of a truly multi-media approach to regional problems also constrain the development of significant audience relations.
There is a need to integrate traditional interpersonal channels with more modern media channels. The use of increasingly sophisticated media technologies without user-assistance programs inevitably results in the alienation of the audience as a whole, and the creation of media elite.

6.6.4 Socio-Cultural Constraints

A broad spectrum of social, cultural, and linguistic factors limits the participation of rural dwellers in the operation of educational media. In the scope of this discussion it is impossible to describe in detail the social and cultural nuances particular to any specific country or region. Cultural diversity itself is a significant barrier to the involvement of different organizations in local communication projects. In this section I will outline general areas of social and cultural constraint which affect rural audiences.

Paulo Freire uses the term "the culture of silence" to refer to the ignorance and lethargy of the population as a product of economic, political, and social domination. These factors force individuals to conform to the status quo as promoted by the dominant class. The culture of silence among the poor demonstrates the toll of oppression. Freire sees in the contradiction of human beings as oppressor and oppressed the enslavement of human labor, and therefore, the human person. Humans thus become deprived of incentive. They become totally dependent, insecure, and permanently threatened if they are denied the right to create and transform the world with their labor, and if their work does not belong to them.
The marginalized sectors of Latin American society have been subject to preset structures of oppression dating from the time of the conquistadors. Traditional authoritarian social relations perpetuated by powerful landowners, the Roman Catholic Church, the formal educational system, and oppressive governments have conditioned the response of these sectors. The lack of motivation on the part of the poor to become involved in social and political change is a response to generation after generation of subjection to ruling authorities, to a series of unmet political promises, and to very little tangible change. Changing development paradigms, dominant institutions, and financial benefactors have resulted in a turnover of development and media projects. The rural poor who have endured numerous project failures are reluctant to invest their hope in seemingly empty promises.

The gap between the rich and the poor is more than an economic gap: it is a social gap, a power gap, a knowledge gap, a literacy gap, and a communications gap. Class bias and prejudice prevent campesinos from gaining access to the majority of societal privileges. Researchers working with educational field agents conclude that low levels of education are the primary factor cited as an obstacle to participation in the learning process. Illiteracy is not so much based upon intelligence as upon social, political, and economic factors. Illiteracy excludes the marginalized from the benefits of print media and involvement in educational media processes.

Freire states that to alienate human beings from their
own decision-making processes (media production, financing and evaluation) is to change them into dehumanized objects. If the oppressed organize themselves they can enter the historical process, and if they do not they will continue to be manipulated by the elite. Freire continues saying that, to unite, the oppressed must first cut the umbilical cord of myth and magic which binds them to the world of the oppressor. In order to engage in authentic participation, the oppressed must be unified at the level of "beings" engaged in the struggle for liberation, and not at the level of "things" being manipulated.

Conscientization, the development of critical awareness via a process of conscious action, critical reflection and intervention, is seen by Freire as the key to authentic participation and humanizing action. Likewise, the awareness of relations of media production, financing and evaluation are essential to the conscientization of rural communities.

In conducting interviews with radio staff and campesinos, I discovered two basic responses to urban influences. Rural dwellers are either wary of external influence or eager to adopt a more urban-centred, success-oriented lifestyle. The older community members are more likely to maintain traditional cultural, linguistic, and political values. The younger generation does not place as great an emphasis upon cultural preservation, yet is intent upon social and political change. Among both of these groups, radios and televisions are often purchased as status symbols and not for the purpose of learning; the bigger the radio and the
antennae you own, the more prosperous you appear to be. In few cases is radio seen as a part of the process of indigenous communication or critical reflection among rural audiences.

The majority of mass media messages are foreign to the social, cultural, and linguistic context of rural audiences and therefore unintelligible to vast sectors of the population. This, no doubt, affects the audience relations rural dwellers can or will enter into. In Bolivia, where indigenous people represent over sixty percent of the population, few stations broadcast in local dialects: Aymara-language radio programming, broadcast by Radio San Gabriel in La Paz, causes fear among urban Spanish-speaking residents who are weary of strikes and roadblocks in defense of campesino rights.

Rural peasants are further alienated from their own reality by socially and culturally biased media programming. Indigenous groups are made marginal to the central processes of national communication and alienated from their own system of beliefs, culture, means of production, system of leadership etc. The daily schedule of the rural farmer is not compatible with urban media scheduling. By five or six a.m. farmers are out of the house and in the fields. At this hour there is minimal commercial radio programming dedicated to their needs, interests and language preference. It is not profitable for urban stations to offer indigenous-language programming during the day when men and women are in the fields, at the market, at work or at home.

There are major adjustments to be made by indigenous
peoples in the appropriation of an audio-centred medium such as radio. The transition from rural to urban values lends itself to cultural and linguistic homogenization, breakdown of the nuclear family, urban migration, and high unemployment levels for unskilled laborers. Likewise, it is difficult to offset the effects created by dominant commercial media.

**Campeinos** in Bolivia often limit their interaction with the outside world to the buyers and suppliers of food, sources of credit, the local priest, transporters, and civil authorities. The information that the average campeino can receive or transmit is limited by the forms of contact he or she makes with urban society. In Bolivia, visits to the city by the campesino are often limited to between two and four a year. Messages between regional centers of commerce and the rural countryside are often re-interpreted by local opinion leaders who may manipulate incoming and outgoing messages, and few stations encourage their audience to use the station for the exchange of messages. Thus, the interaction between rural areas and regional centers is an extremely complicated process.

**6.6.5 Economic Constraints**

As discussed in chapter two, the funding options open to radio schools constrain their operations. Economic constraints affect both educational radio stations and their audiences. Economic constraints restrict radio stations in the range of programs, services, and learning aids which they are able to provide. Radio stations lacking financial resources are unable to offer adequate training opportunities for interested
community members. Finances are often unavailable to pay for the transportation and lodging costs involved in the training of local citizens. Stations, including Radio San Gabriel, have planned to construct a hostel to lodge out-of-town participants to make it easier for a greater number of campesinos to participate in station activities. This project has not been completed due to a lack of funds.

Financially burdened stations are also unable to provide supplementary learning materials for interested students and are unable to create new materials for students at more advanced levels. The lack of adequate materials takes learning incentive away from students. Similarly, limited transportation results in poor contact with local authorities, fewer community interviews, and conflict over the use of station vehicles. These factors make it increasingly difficult for educational stations to maintain meaningful relations with their audience.

Limited financial resources also restrict the number of paid extension agents hired to assist rural communities. When stations are unable to meet staff salary requirements there is low staff morale, and trained station personnel are forced to seek employment with more financially lucrative commercial stations. The financial burden of certain staff members and jealousy between paid and non-paid staff complicate the voluntary involvement of community members.

With respect to the station's physical plant, sufficient office and studio space is required to produce high quality programming. Many stations are unable to afford basic repairs
to antiquated equipment. This results in poor signal quality. When commercial signals are more easily heard, listeners are discouraged from listening regularly to educational station broadcasts. Many stations desire to acquire mobile transmitting units to facilitate optimum local participation in community-based broadcasts. Similarly, stations with limited financing are unable to increase their transmitting power and radial distance over which their signal can be received.

Economic constraints on the audiences itself can also seriously affect audience-station relationships. Economic constraints prevent campesinos from entering into more meaningful relations with educational radio stations. Financial resources are not available to purchase food and clothing, let alone to purchase batteries or to repair broken radios. A station manager at Radio San Rafael estimated that at the time of a recent drought the station's audience was reduced to forty percent of its normal size due to the high costs of batteries to operate radios in areas without electricity. A lack of financial resources on the part of the rural peasant makes it impossible to invest the time and money necessary to complete radio extension courses. Even subsidized course materials are not within the budget of subsistence farmers.

Farmers and laborers are often required to work twelve to fourteen-hour days to support their families. After spending the day working in the field or in the mine, there is often little incentive to participate in an extension course which will not help to meet physical and economic needs. Many parents
question the value of educating their children if there are not immediate concrete benefits. After receiving an elementary level education campesino youths have few opportunities for additional education. Many question the value of participating in formal or informal classes if the results are not easily identifiable.

In conclusion, political, structural, institutional, socio-cultural, and financial constraints result in a lack of incentive for continued participation in station activities. Without a basic level of personal contact with rural communities there is little incentive for the campesino to participate in the courses and discussion groups offered by the local radio school. Without strong motivation, the marginalized poor are reticent to invest time and money in a ostensibly useless education which does not result in immediate benefits.
Chapter Seven:

Conclusions

7.1 Introduction

This investigation of educational radio broadcasting in Latin America began with the development of a method which would allow for the comparative analysis of Bolivian radio schools. I have referred to this method as "audience-relation analysis." In this conclusion, I will first clarify the theoretical relevance of audience relation analysis and then I will summarize how educational radio operates in Latin American radio schools. The use of audience-relation analysis, as applied to the radio school movement of Latin America, points very strongly to various forms of dependency which exist in the planning, production, and administration of media. Within these three facets of broadcasting we encounter technological, ideological, social, organizational, and financial dependencies. Any prognosis of this context must address such relationships. Consequently, I will identify forms of dependency which constrain rural communities in the appropriation of and participation in alternative radio. I will also suggest possible courses of action to be pursued by radio school staff and management, grass-roots organizations, and local communities in progressing toward the democratization of communication.

7.2 Prognosis

The history of the radio school movement demonstrates that educational stations are vulnerable to external inter-
vention and attempted control. If current trends of inter-
vention in station operations continue, it is possible that in
the 1980s governments and political groups will exert even
greater efforts to control mass media. Issues surrounding
educational broadcasting will become politicized, and grass-
roots organizations will become more radical in their response
to inequality and oppression. Politically conservative stations
adopting "formal" instructional audience relations will maintain
existing relations. Some of these stations will in time become
more closely aligned with government policies. In both cases,
community audiences will have little chance to participate in
station activities. Radical stations will either be eliminated
or will continue having their broadcasts censored or suspended
for varying periods of time. Stations dedicated to a
radical-change model will be forced to adopt a "shout and
whisper" strategy. During periods of relative freedom they will
shout their message and during times of repression they will
whisper it. Political oppression of radical stations will
result in high staff turnover, little continuity in broadcasts,
detention of staff, destruction of facilities, and apprehension
among campesino communities.

Within the context of increasing class polarization,
poverty, and urban migration, the meeting of physical needs will
likely become even more of a struggle for the marginalized.
Expendible time for the poor will decrease as more time will be
spent trying to survive. Hence, there will be less time to
participate in non-formal radio school activities.
In addition, the polarization of North and South continues to lead to increasing politicization of international funding policies. Conflict within the Catholic church between conservative and liberation factions will also affect traditional sources of financing. Radio schools will not survive if they are unable to attain basic levels of self-financing. The community itself will have to fight for its right to alternative media. Projects which lack community support and input will pass away. For these reasons, it is critical that the radio school movement maintain the characteristics of a popular movement rooted in the local community.

7.3 Audience-Relation Analysis

Audience-station relations, as presented in this study include relations of educational media production, financing and evaluation. Audience-relation analysis defines three audience relation models (the formal-instructional model, the mutual-development model, and the radical-change model) in terms of incremental levels of access, participation and self-management. This method objectifies theoretical ideals and provides verifiable means of assessing audience-station relations. The qualitative and quantitative evaluation of audience relations is a means of developing more horizontal and democratic communications systems. As such, audience-relation analysis can be used as a tool by stations and community organizations which desire to assess and improve existing relations. It can be used as a means of clearly defining standards pertaining to access, participation and
self-management in order to counteract hidden patterns of dependency and domination.

An understanding of audience relations assists a station in sensing community needs, understanding the local culture, and utilizing local resources. This enables the station to define who the audience is, what their needs are, and what forms of training are required among community members and staff. Audience-relation analysis can also be used as a means of charting the historical progression from one stage of audience relations to another.

The application of audience-relation analysis will generate more accurate means of assessing audience-station interaction. It is an audience-oriented model of analysis which could assist marginalized groups in appropriating their own alternative media and in utilizing available resources. This means of analysis must be made available and comprehensible not only to station directors, staff and researchers, but also to community promoters, local leaders, and community members as part of the process of conscientization. It must be applied and evaluated by staff and community members alike on the basis of their experience with educational radio. Thus, my analysis makes possible the transition from an understanding of horizontal and democratic communication at a level of theoretical abstraction among researchers to the level of practical application among campesino communities.

7.4 Radio Schools

One thing which is evident in my analysis of radio
schools is that there is no definitive station model. Each context is unique, and each community requires its own form of appropriate media. Audience-relation model types are approximations of three different approaches to community involvement in educational radio. There has been an historical progression in Latin America in the kinds of audience relations that have existed in educational radio stations. As stated in chapter two, audience-relation models evolve from the formal-instructional model to the mutual-development model and then to the radical-change model. It is also possible to regress from one model to another.

These audience relations are produced by dominant media institutions, international development paradigms, and the political and economic context. Evolutionary development stances, for example, have increasingly resulted in multiple media strategies to maintain community interest in educational broadcasting. Likewise, radio schools have had to respond to a context of changing attitudes and expectations in their audiences. If stations are to improve existing relations, programming must remain flexible and open to the needs and desires of the community.

The Catholic Church has been one of the dominant forces in shaping audience-relation models in the radio schools. It is undeniable that ALER and ERBOL have played a major role in establishing educational radio in Latin America. However, as discussed in chapter six, educational radio in Latin America still reaches only a small sector of the population.
One major obstacle to community-centered radio is financing. The production of programming and learning materials is extremely costly and few stations are self-sufficient. The educational radio projects I observed have on the whole been initiated and financed by foreign entities with an accompanying tendency toward media and technology-centrism. Concerning commercial advertising, there is a need for programs to assist rural peoples in discerning harmful foreign values and in determining which products are useful. These programs may be developed in cooperation with health and agricultural experts, consumer groups, and indigenous rights groups.

In the majority of community educational radio projects, the medium of radio is imposed upon the people rather than chosen by the community. Rural audiences have had little to say in determining whether or not the medium of radio was appropriate in a given context. Hence, the medium may not be appropriated by the community after it is initially installed, and acceptance of foreign station models has resulted in limited opportunities for indigenous use of the media. The technological gap between societies has often been ignored; the use of electronic media has preceded the advance of complementary social, economic and technological processes. Exceptions to this pattern include Radio Colta which is owned and operated by an association of some 250 Quechua churches in Ecuador.

In the past the communities have not been active in determining their own communication needs, planning and financing media systems, and training staff. Local people were
not prepared for the introduction of mass media, and have not been given adequate opportunities for technical and financial apprenticeship. Non-appropriate media strategies, ineffective operations, the lack of autonomous audience relations, the exclusion of key local groups, and excessive ideological and financial domination by national and international groups form deeply rooted patterns of paternalism. If the community does not assume partial responsibility for the system it will face entrenched dependencies upon foreign resources and methodologies. Insufficient local interest and support of a given project may reflect age-old dependencies and a lack of local input into media operations. Historical domination of media channels distorts local perception of the purposes and potential uses of media as well as attitudes toward participation, self-management, and media appropriation. Moreover, the imposition of dominant strategies and goals restricts indigenous applications.

Indigenous autonomy in the use of radio, when permitted, results in innovative applications in the solution of local problems. One example of this is the use of radio as a means of transmitting emergency messages between isolated communities. Such applications are sometimes frowned upon by foreign educational consultants and yet are appropriate to the local social situation.

It is the right of indigenous peoples to reject media infiltration in favor of the preservation of indigenous language and culture. The freedom must exist to accept or reject the use
of electronic media to emit and receive messages normally carried by traditional channels. The selection of a medium should be made on the basis of its suitability to the social and communication needs of a given population, rather than foreign-determined criteria. Therefore, ideal community appropriation of a medium is based upon the real need for a technology rather than the imposition of a foreign medium poorly suited to the local experience.

7.5 The Nature Of The Medium

As with other educational media, there is a struggle in radio broadcasting to focus the audience's attention. Electronic media lack the personal motivation provided by a promoter or change agent. In addition, radio tends to be perceived as a commercial entertainment medium, and it is difficult to change local attitudes toward the medium. Hence, audience involvement in educational radio is extremely limited, erratic, and of short term duration. The informal nature of the medium and casual listening habits of the audience dissipate the effect of educational programming.

For the above reasons, radio as currently implemented is not an ideal medium for mass literacy training. In the cases I studied in Latin America, the trend of thought is moving away from mass radio campaigns. This is largely due to the difficulty in organizing and motivating large groups of students over vast distances, and of providing them with personal change agents. If, as suggested by Bernardo Toro, it takes six years of local education to achieve literacy, then how can infrequent
and casual listening to radio campaigns effectively produce literates? Casual listening among rural communities is the result of long work days, pressing financial and physical needs, lack of batteries, poor signal reception, student apathy, and other fruits of oppression.

By itself, then, radio is an ineffective literacy training method. However, radio can be used effectively as a motivational tool to help organize and gather groups for specific purposes. Complementary media strategies and networking with other organizations strengthen the educational effect of the medium. Over-the-air conscientization processes complement basic education programs offered by other groups.

Media technology by themselves do not solve rural problems (as predicted by media-centrists); in fact electronic media may compound social problems. For example, the technology of the medium has been used to justify centralized organizational structures, educational methods and media-centric solutions. De-mystification of the medium would serve as a first step toward informed local decision-making concerning appropriate technology. This is likely to take place in cases where local radio stations invite listeners to tour station facilities, take part in training workshops, and gradually assume responsibility for station operation.

One major factor which affects how a station can be used for educational purposes is the size of station operations. More powerful station signals promote larger open audiences, while making it more difficult for the audience to participate
in station activities. With regional and national broadcasts, the signal is transmitted from the center to the periphery, with the center exercising control over the message flow. In contrast, smaller community radio stations emphasize rural-rural and rural-urban flow of messages. Similarly, stations which stress de-centralized program production encourage the expression of local views about the nature of the problem and possible solutions.

Large institutional infrastructures dwarf attempts toward indigenization. One reason for this is that dominant media strategies are assumed by the foreign institutions which fund and influence the stations. Stations and funders have forgotten the lessons learned from the use and abuse of the Sutatenza model of the 1960's. Stations such as San Gabriel continue to sacrifice opportunities for community involvement, staff visits and local focus in favour of gaining a large open audience whose members remain isolated from personal contact with the station.

Educational radio stations have encouraged patterns of dependency and paternalism via reliance upon foreign media technology, funding strategies, and staffing methods. Local groups tend to perpetuate the same structures of dependency, paternalism and discrimination from which they are attempting to break free. Dominant institutions, local governments and grass-roots organizations are susceptible to the same ills. In the case of the radio schools, the acceptance of dominant station models (i.e. the Sutatenza model) perpetuates the
acceptance of non-indigenous, inappropriate media models with built-in dependencies. The Catholic Church, for example, has played a major role in creating educational models, in suggesting organizational strategies, and in delineating political policies. Catholic clergy should now ask such questions as, "Is there still an effort being exerted to create a mass media of the Church?" "Is this consistent with infrastructures and directives initiated at the community level?" "To what extent will indigenous peoples autonomy actually be encouraged?" and, "To what extent will external directives control operations?"

In my opinion, for the radio school movement to become more effective, it must correct the trend toward developing large stations at the cost of local contact. Community must be stressed over media technology: for example, resources could be focused upon the development of a network of local volunteers to establish the minimal organizational structure required to coordinate such contacts. My view is that the role of educational radio stations is to foster partnership as well as to function in tandem with existing processes of change. Local stations must support the efforts of grass-roots organizations in the field.

Major structural impediments, as discussed in chapter six, including political, social and economic relations, prevent the realization of conscientization-based change. Although Freirean conscientization methods are valuable in encouraging reflection, awareness, and action at the community level,
psycho-social learning techniques and attitude changes on the part of the marginalized are not enough. In order to have audience participation in media production, financing, and evaluation, all structures, attitudes and value systems must allow and even encourage such involvement. Otherwise, alienation will continue in the form of dehumanization, social marginalization and the denial of basic human needs.

7.6 Technological Dependency

In the past, dominant media institutions introduced local media projects which were beyond the technological sophistication of the community. In my opinion, any medium which cannot be supported by the community is inappropriate as a community-based educational medium. These media create a dependency upon external technical and financial support, and reinforce unhealthy attitudes toward technology-centrism. Likewise, professionalism in station management and program production tend to exclude marginalized sectors from station activities.

To counteract dependency of this kind, radio schools need to develop a new emphasis on local training and apprenticeship programs. A community apprenticeship program may include station tours and "hands on" experience in recording local interviews. Stations must seek ways of encouraging community members to assume greater levels of responsibility or risk becoming more dependent upon those individuals already in positions of power. Radio schools can encourage community involvement in decision-making by inviting local representatives
to attend planning meetings. Following a gradual apprenticeship in station policy-making, a village council could be established as a means of including the community in decision-making processes. ERBOL and ALER could assist in this process of increasing such audience participation.

This would include the popularization and exchange of existing training methods, strategies, and experiences. The benefits derived from regional meetings and training seminars would need to be shared by greater numbers of people at the community level. ALER should develop a broader vision for encouraging the production of quality educational programming among smaller commercial stations and it could work toward becoming less exclusive in the organizations it associates with. The overall effect of educational broadcasting would be increased if ALER would augment the number of commercial stations open to broadcasting educational programming. The use of commercial stations will encourage horizontal learning networks and alternative use of the medium. Travelling ALER consultants could offer assistance to smaller stations which do not have the time or means to produce quality programming. This form of contact will increase the acceptance of educational radio broadcasting and also encourage processes of educational change. By including different organizations and sectors of society in the network of educational stations, it will develop a broader base of involvement and a more effective utilization of resources. For example in Bolivia, ERBOL could involve other organizations in their community news service.
The question, however, is whether ALER and its affiliates have sufficient human and financial resources to initiate additional programs. The need for increased coordination between projects and organizations is obvious. However, to what extent is it the responsibility of the local radio school to animate and coordinate social and political processes? On the other hand, should ALER and ERBOL accept the lack of conciliation and integration between groups or should they address the problem?

In order to encourage the democratization of communication among rural communities, greater emphasis must also be placed upon media which are easier to appropriate. The local use of less sophisticated media such as murals, cassette tapes, popular theatre, and printing presses is key to the appropriation of more complex media. A fixation upon the medium of radio may result in poor use of other media better suited to the task at hand. Community use of appropriate media technologies encourages local project control and initiative. This is a crucial step in the process whereby local groups can learn to exercise control over technically sophisticated and costly media.

7.7 Self-Financing

Increased self-sufficiency is crucial in guaranteeing the long-term economic viability of educational radio in Latin America. International financing has been available over the past two decades, yet budget cuts may require a rethinking of budgetary priorities and alternative creative financing schemes.
There is an immediate need for further research concerning audience revenue, methods of motivation, levels of local funding, and the involvement of local groups in project support.

In my opinion the unprecedented growth of various radio schools in the 1960's may have been premature. External conditions and not the directives of the people determined the growth and direction of radio school projects such as Radio Sutatenza. Insufficient evaluation of how the funds are to be used, how the project fits into the local context, and how the people perceive their needs lead to the growth of inappropriate media. Only recently has information been made available for indepth evaluation of project financing.

In initiating station self-financing, it is important to create effective systems of station organization and management. Unclear overall station objectives, poor financial planning and accountability, poorly trained staff, and ineffective evaluation of station financing complicate the move toward self-financing and self-sufficiency. It has been suggested that educational radio stations must operate at a local or regional level for self-financing to be possible. This policy rejects unlimited expansion in favor of consolidating existing operations and creating a more manageable local system. Stations of a limited dimension operating over a smaller geographical area are more easily operated by local staff. Moreover, there is a greater chance for contact with community members if the station is personal in its approach.

One key element of station self-financing is the
participation of regional public-service organizations in the station planning process. Inadequate self-financing sometimes indicates poor community relations and poor utilization of local resources (including those of other institutions). Self-financing is affected by a lack of community and staff awareness of alternative financing options, inappropriate program content, and project overlap with other organizations. Thus, integration into the life of the community, cooperation with other organizations, and an understanding of the local culture are essential to the operation of any educational media venture.  

There are a number of important considerations to be taken into account with the self-financing approach. The intricacies of the local economy must be understood before initiating station-related cottage industries. In addition, the consumer needs of the local population and available local resources must be assessed. An option such as the sale of artisan goods may utilize local resources, but is useless without a market for the goods. Likewise, as in the case of Radio Sutatenza, it is possible to sell books and cassettes related to health and agriculture, but without the market for such materials the project will fail. Grass-roots stations must be careful not to displace or compete with local businesses when the market for such services is limited. Stations must not abuse their ability to publicize station-run businesses or risk becoming a marketing agent for these industries. Needs-centered industries must be within the means of
rural inhabitants and relevant to their needs as determined by the community, the station and local experts. One option is to sell agricultural products including seeds, insecticides, and tools. Station agriculturalists may be on hand to provide useful product information as well as station-produced literature on relevant topics. Another service directly related to educational radio is a low-cost repair center for broken radios and tape recorders. A central storehouse of salvageable parts may serve to cut repair costs and increase the number of receivers. Batteries and radios could be sold and rechargeable batteries exchanged. Local students could be apprenticed to service other electrical items and eventually learn to service station equipment. These services might be included in a regional training centre and hostel for campesino students, such as the one planned by Radio San Gabriel.

Furthermore, a regional employment bureau could be set up where the employer would pay a consulting fee for the selection of a qualified worker. Consulting services of various staff members could be offered to various governmental and non-governmental agencies conducting social and economic studies in the region. The danger in any of these options is in taking away staff resources required for educational programs.

The current economic and political vulnerability of the radio school movement suggests that efforts should be made to procure alternative means of financing to ensure continued operations. Excessive reliance upon external financial support (which is in turn dependent upon international political
stability) may jeopardize the future of radio schools. The future of many projects is dependent upon the development of a community support base. To ensure less foreign dependency in the development of more appropriate educational media, control of financing, the determination of local needs, and the expression of responsible political opinion must rest with those for whom the service is intended. Each of these goals is contrary to dominant national and international communication models. Information concerning the financing of alternative media should be made available to assist the local community, media managers, and development agencies in re-evaluating strategies. The practical relations among the audience, the station, and the funding authority must also be expanded, thus allowing for more local input at all levels of decision-making.

The evolution of indigenous national media is a very slow process. Radio schools must be given the opportunity to develop a local support base with the potential of overcoming economic and political calamities. The social and educational processes of development-based change are more important than the preservation of institutions which are susceptible to political and economic intervention. Hence, more direct efforts must be made to assist in the autonomous development of alternative media. The question still remains as how to best encourage such indigenous media models which will serve the needs of not only academics, the Catholic Church, local authorities, and development organizations, but also current and future generations of the marginalized poor of Latin America.
7.8 Ownership and Control of Educational Radio

As discovered in chapter six, the control and ownership of educational media is critical in station decision-making processes. Although the Church plays a major role in providing sanctuary for the radio school movement, I question to what extent the Church should continue to exercise control over station policies and operations. As horizontal networks develop, the central issue will become which group will have the power to initiate change in the area of editorial and political decision-making.

Interviews I conducted at Radio Latacunga with station management suggest that the station is being used by the Catholic Church to counteract the influence of Protestant radio stations. Conflicting religious and political goals may detract from the educational potential of such stations if propaganda becomes a priority over educational programming. Alternatively, however, such forms of conflict may cause the establishment of new stations. The end result of competitive propaganda thus could be a wider variety of programming available to the audience.

Institutionalized station control has been justified in providing support and safety for the radio schools. In the process campesinos have become dependent upon external agencies for funds, training methods, programming and station management. Dominant institutions have imposed ideological and organizational models leaving local groups with little say in the matter. In certain cases, these structures will remain
unchanged due to external control and local assimilation of imported models. In other cases such as Radio Pio XII, the need among popular grass-roots organizations to create more horizontal structures will result in the transformation of existing structures into more appropriate means for achieving local objectives. My fear is that vertical infrastructures, if uncritically accepted, will impede grass-roots organizations from rising above former patterns of dependency and control.

If local communities and grass-roots organizations are to become a part of alternative educational broadcasting, it will be important for them to improve their own contact with funding agencies. As it stands, community groups have little or no direct contact with funders. In order to maintain healthier relationships with funding agencies and to encourage indigenous self-management, the community must gain an awareness of the funding process and begin to make decisions. It will also become important for the community to develop meaningful methods of evaluating station activities and of communicating with foreign agencies. Evaluations of radio school activities have either been completed by foreign academics, or by station staff with the interests of funding agencies in mind. These evaluations are rarely shown to or consulted by local communities. Stations must move away from the practice of completing evaluations for the purpose of satisfying funders and begin to involve the audience in change-based reflection which is relevant to their existence.

Dependency upon dominant institutions denies the
decision-making abilities of local groups. It may be the case that cumbersome, institutionalized infrastructures and bureaucratization must change if the people are to begin to assume their own role in this area. In the past, control has been exerted over their actions and opinions making the conscientization process a slow and arduous one.

Local ownership of educational radio is one important step in the appropriation of the medium. As suggested in my section on station financing, further research and discussion is needed concerning indigenous stations such as Radio Colta which generates a significant portion of its own costs. Likewise, it is critical that community members have access to the medium and that they play a role in content selection and evaluation.

There is a very real need to develop mechanisms for group participation which are built into existing non-formal communication channels. Further research is required concerning methods of creating and sustaining local impetus for effective participation.

As it stands there are few opportunities for community participation in educational media. Permanent links must be established between the community and station policy-makers. Concrete standards pertaining to the democratic participation of indigenous groups in the development of educational strategies must be established by each station. Planning must reflect community opinion concerning the application of pedagogical methods to local needs. Hence, the process of local consultation is a significant indicator of improved community
It is debatable as to what forms of alternative educational radio truly represent the people, who should take control of it, and who should encourage apprenticeship among the local community. In the majority of cases, popular organizations have either adapted to the existing structures or chosen not to work with educational media. On the basis of my research, I conclude that on the whole, the marginalized local groups continue to remain subject to technically advanced media and have few opportunities to express political opinions. Those stations such as Acción Popular Hondureña, which have incorporated local political input into educational radio, have functioned for relatively brief periods of time before being forced to close by conservative governments.

In the past, community appropriation and selection of media has not been a priority of dominant media institutions. On the contrary the radio school movement has been guilty of encouraging dependency upon foreign control of the media. Taking into consideration existing institutional, political, socio-cultural and economic constraints (as outlined in chapter six), how realistic is it to aspire to the self-management of rural community media? Attempts at self-management in stations such as Radio Pío XII and Radio Colta suggest that although seemingly insurmountable barriers exist, it is possible to initiate steps toward self-management. However, this self-management is dependent upon rights and values essential to significant audience relations of media production, financing,
7.9 Grass-Roots Organizations

Autonomous local expression is essential in order to create popular media which cater to the needs of the marginalized. The term "grass-roots media" implies local involvement in the selection and appropriation of local media. Partnership with grass-roots organizations is central to the improvement of such audience relations adopted by radio schools. Autonomous local expression is essential in creating popular media which can then deal with the needs of the marginalized. It is within this framework of understanding that the community becomes more important than the station.

At this point we should return to our basic question, "Who defines community needs and who controls the selection, production, financing, and evaluation of local media?" The question which follows is "Can a higher sense of unity of purpose be created among groups with divergent objectives?"

Unified action and concerted efforts are difficult to import. They should come from within the community itself. To achieve indigenization of communication processes, community groups must be able to appropriate the channel and the management of the medium as well. Institutions tend to develop in the place of community-based forms of management. In my study, I have found that the institutionalization of communication processes often impeded the move toward audience-relation models based upon local group experience.

Those international organizations assisting in the
development of indigenous communications hinder the growth of local movements when they are not willing to let go of project responsibility. This causes me to question whether community movements are in fact being initiated or if the balance of initiative and control remains in the hands of non-indigenous organizations. If the radio school movement is to come of age, its parent must let it get up and try to walk or the appropriate muscles will never develop. An essential facet of this principle is that rural participation in educational radio projects must not be confined to traditional institutional definitions of participation. In bantering about the term "participation", we need to avoid semantic rhetoric and begin to address ways in which participatory educational radio can function in the context of economic inequality and political oppression. In most cases such participation has not occurred. Participatory educational radio has functioned only briefly under temporarily hospitable circumstances. Participation has been dealt with in an academic fashion; real human costs have not been taken into consideration. Subsistence-level farmers who enjoy minimal economic and political security are asked to risk precious time and resources on projects controlled by outsiders. Participation in change-oriented projects does not guarantee immediate physical benefits, and is thus seen by many campesinos as being a waste of time.

7.10 Integral Liberation

In conclusion, I feel that we as members of dominant cultures should undertake a realistic assessment of the world.
We must reflect upon the extent of poverty, oppression, economic dependency, political injustice, foreign domination, project failure, alienation of the marginalized, and most of all - our role in these processes. There is a discrepancy between the needs and the means available. I believe that for significant change to be affected, our approach to the problem must change.

Media alone cannot create the conditions for change. Rather, change will occur where there is political will, freedom, local initiative, and where change arises out of situations involving conflict. As in the case of Radio Colta, the unified local initiative of numerous regional churches, ethnic identity, religious motivation, and a groundswell of volunteer interest carries the project.

North Americans and non-indigenous Latin Americans must learn from the experience of native peoples rather than imposing imported solutions. North American ignorance of significant Latin American communications research and projects must change. The writings of Beltrán, Bordenave, Braun, Contreras, Freire, Kaplún, O'Sullivan, Reyes Matta and others are significant contributions to communications research. Likewise, local initiatives such as Pío XII's popular promoters program, San Gabriel's basic education program, San Rafael's network of indigenous promoters, numerous women's groups, and Radio Colta's strong volunteer effort provide significant comparative examples of context-specific innovations. Many of these writings and experiences are inaccessible due to lack of translation services and lack of First World interest in developments emanating from
the South.

My suggestion for further research concerning ways in which change can be introduced would be to accomplish a better understanding of the dimensions of domination and liberation. These dimensions include religious, cultural, personal, and political facets of liberation. Different forms of domination which foster dependencies require different forms of liberation, which is to say that for significant audience relations to develop more than political and economic changes must occur.

Our own narrow understandings of liberation limit our analysis of the Latin American context. By restricting liberation to economic and political change one misses the implications of basic concepts presented by Paulo Freire, and also the Medellín and Puebla documents. Liberation also encompasses spiritual, cultural, and non-economic relationships and dimensions. I depart from the traditionally accepted epistemological framework of development theory by suggesting that the dimension of spirituality should be included in our analysis and definitions of liberation and development.

Marginalization and oppression cannot be changed instantly. Solutions do not consist solely of additional political action, conscientization, cultural sensitivity, educational programming, agricultural training, and decision-making apprenticeship. Rather, an integrated process of wholistic liberation must occur over time. When we recognize the range of dimensions to be found within the concept of liberation, we will be one step closer to bringing it about.
HOW RADIO IS TO HELP THE COMMUNITY: A SCENARIO

One man said, "Give them a microphone!"
A researcher concluded, "Do a study."
Paulo suggested, "Promote critical consciousness."
The advisor from ACPO said, "Build them an institution."
A nurse suggested, "Develop a preventative health program."
A priest said, "I will pray for the people."
A rebel chanted, "Overthrow the government!"
A child playing on the street cried, "Wait for me!"

In the end, a foreign agency bought the village a station.
The Ministry of Education suggested the "ideal change" for the illiterate.
A teacher proposed a school over the air.
A specialist wanted to train farmers.
An elderly campesino wanted to be left alone.
A publicity expert discussed giving them access.
The union brought them music at noon.
The local bank brought them commercials and loans.
The woman nursing her baby asked, "What will I feed my children tomorrow?"

On the doorstep of the station, the elderly campesino questioned "Who knows the voice of my people and whose voice will decide?"
"Rather than politics and promises, give me a voice, I will sing my own song in my own tongue, my own way."
List of References: Chapter One

1 The term audience relation was suggested by Liora Salter in discussing my thesis proposal.

2 For audience relations of media production and financing to exist, certain rights, values and opportunities for participation must exist. Otherwise alienation, dehumanization, social incommunication, and the denial of basic human rights will occur.

3 For a more thorough analysis of factors affecting the audience relation, please refer to Table 2-1.

4 The qualitative participation of the oppressed is essential in improving basic living conditions, physical welfare and the provision of basic communicational rights.


8 In this thesis I do not seek to discount the valiant efforts of those involved in various educational media projects, but rather to indicate the forms of opposition which face those attempting to further the causes of the oppressed.
List of References: Chapter Two

1. Tables 3-1, 3-2 and 3-3 contain the basic questions administered to each station. These questions were formulated with assistance from Bernardo Toro, Antonio Cabezas and other Latin American researchers.


5. Goslin, p. 118.

6. Often more than one staff member was asked the same question to determine whether there was consensus concerning station objectives, strategies, etc.

7. These informal findings were in addition to the more formal interviews, and they often complemented and reinforced information gathered via more formal methods.

8. Researchers such as Cabezas and O'Connoly confirm that the selection of a true cross section of the population, the generation of statistically verifiable data, and the design of culturally and linguistically bias-free questionnaires is difficult when working with isolated, indigenous-language speaking population groups in Latin America. The difficulties in designing and administering audience surveys are multiplied when dealing with apathy, learning difficulties, and the culture of silence of the oppressed. The findings presented in this chapter are representative of the difficulties encountered in designing such a study, and also the conflicts experienced by those involved in educational radio projects.


10. I was warned in Bolivia that most rural teachers are of urban extraction, Spanish speaking, appointed by the government in power, and change their posts after each election or coup. Many people see public school teachers as instruments of state policies promoting cultural and linguistic homogenization, and other forms of government-defined modernization. It was impossible to determine how culturally sensitive radio staff members were, and how their presence affected the campesino's response. In many cases there was no other alternative in making contact with rural groups.
Researchers are sometimes viewed as wealthy financial benefactors, Central Intelligence Agency spies, exploitative entrepreneurs, or political emissaries from the north. Any perception of foreign oppression affects the openness and response. I was discrete in the clothing I wore, in the non-formal interview approach I adopted, and in the company I kept. I often recorded an individual's response after the interview had taken place.

A study conducted among rural inhabitants in Ecuador concluded that forty percent of those questioned did not know the name of the country, thirty-two percent did not know the colors of the flag, and sixty-five percent did not know the name of the President of the Republic. (Marco Ordóñez Andrade, La Incomunicación en los Grupos Marginados de las áreas rurales del Ecuador. Quito: CIESPAL, 1973. pp. 7-11) Considering the results of this study it is unreasonable to assume that poorly schooled Quechua and Aymara speaking people will understand more abstract questions pertaining to local involvement in educational radio or that such questions are relevant to the immediate situation. This is especially the case when the questions are developed and administered by external researchers.

Asociación Latinoamericana de Educación Radiofónica, Análisis de Sistemas de Educación Radiofónica (Quito: ALER, 1982).


Paiva, 1982 p. 4

MacBride, p. 170

Jeremiah O'Sullivan-Ryan, "Radiodifusión Cristiana en América Latina" Consulta Sobre la Práctica de la Comunicación a

24. Beltrán, p. 25

25. Encalada, p. 12

26. Encalada, pp. 5-6


28. MacBride, p. 166


30. MacBride, p. 169

31. MacBride, p. 169


33. O'Sullivan-Ryan, and Kaplún, p. 17

34. Beltrán, p. 17

35. Encalada, p. 7

36. Beltrán, p. 29


42. Interview with José Ignacio, Radio Enriquillo, Cochabamba, Bolivia, May 26, 1983.

43. O'Sullivan, and Kaplún, 1979, p. 2. For a conceptual framework for the analysis of participation in a variety of

44Encalada, p. 8
45Cornell Rural Development Committee, pp. 1-10.
46Interview with René Hauzer, Bogotá, April 11, 1983.
47Paiva, pp. 4-5.
52Cornell Rural Development Committee, pp. 20-25.
53O'Sullivan and Kaplun, p. 18.
54Beltrán, 1979, p. 31.
55Certain stations, such as Radio Pio XII, are progressing in terms of their relationship with the local audience, whereas others are more cautious in adopting new strategies involving audience participation. One station which exemplifies the alternative use of educational radio is Radio Colta in Ecuador. This station has adopted a more democratic form of station operation. On the audience-relation continuum, Radio Colta incorporates tertiary levels of access and participation, and secondary levels of self-management. Other stations with primarily educational objectives are distant from many of the goals actualized by this station.
56Correspondingly, conscientization may be broken down into three stages: information, preparation and training, and liberation.
57The case study analysis will investigate station
administration, the level of effective participation, and input on the part of the staff and the local community. Table 2-1 indicates which factors inhibit or encourage the relationship between the radio station and the local audience.

58 Refer to Table 2-1 for a listing of primary factors and their effect upon the audience relation.

59 Interview with José Ignacio, Cochabamba Bolivia, June 17, 1983.

60 Radio ACPH of Honduras and MEB of Brazil are included in this category.

61 Interview with José Ignacio, Cochabamba Bolivia, June 17, 1983.
List of References: Chapter Three

1 Interview with Costantino Rojas, La Paz Bolivia, May 27, 1983.

2 Radio San Rafael 1983 Informe de San Rafael (Cochabamba: Radio San Rafael, 1983), p. 3.

3 Interview with Constantino Rojas, Cochabamba Bolivia, May 27, 1983.

4 Interview with Jorge Lozano, Cochabamba Bolivia, May 26, 1983.

5 Please refer to Table 4-3 for additional information concerning the conflict between the station and the school, the relation between the local community and the radio school, financing, planning and research, competition, forms of participation, contact with grass-roots organizations, educational methodology, relation with the State, community training, and station evaluation.

6 Interview with Salim Sauma, La Paz, Bolivia, May 17, 1983.

7 Interview with Constantino Rojas, Cochabamba Bolivia, May 27, 1983.

8 One difficulty encountered in assessing decision-making within the radio school is the verification of data provided by the radio school. There are 575 promoters and tele-auxiliaries involved in the school's activities and an additional 710 promoters working with affiliated organizations ERBOL, Radio San Rafael, Un Emisora Regional para el Desarrollo de Cochabamba (ERBOL: La Paz Bolivia, 1982), p. 45. From personal observation I conclude it is doubtful that such a small staff can make contact with almost 1300 community promoters.

9 ALER, Análisis de Sistemas Radiofónicos (Quito: ALER, 1982).
In certain cases the conscientization process among the marginalized has not advanced to the point of local initiation and hence it is impossible for responsibility to be assumed by the local people. In other cases those in control of station decision-making are hesitant to entrust the local people with such responsibilities. Those in control of educational media must develop some objective basis as to when the community is responsible enough to take hold of their mass media.


Interview with Lucia Sauma, La Paz Bolivia, June 1, 1983.

Interview with Jaime Archondo, La Paz Bolivia, June 8, 1983.

Interview with José Canut, La Paz Bolivia, June 8, 1983.

Interview with Jaime Archondo, La Paz Bolivia, June 8, 1983.


Interview with Jaime Archondo, La Paz Bolivia, June 7, 1983.

Interview with Antonio Alamayo, La Paz Bolivia, May 31, 1983.

For additional information pertaining to station operations, the relation established between the station and its audience, station objectives, financing, planning and research, competition, forms of participation, contact with grass-roots organizations, educational methodology, relation with the State, community training programs, and station evaluation please refer to Table 3-3.

In Table 3-1 it is apparent that the station's staff
and director exert control over decision-making. Local leaders, catequists, and local community groups are consulted concerning station decision-making, they are not integrated into actual decision-making processes.

15 In San Gabriel's organizational diagram we see that the station's six central departments and the promoters associated with these departments serve as the intermediaries between local communities and program production. The station is of such a size that without substantial structural control, station operations could not continue. If the station were smaller in size it might be possible to transfer the gatekeeper's task to community members.

16 My analysis takes into consideration the infrastructure of decision-making, the levels of access, participation, and self management, as well as other factors mentioned in Table 2-1.

17 Tertiary levels of participation and even basic levels of self management are denied to staff members let alone catequist leaders and local community members.

18 Statistics reflecting the number of visits to the station must be evaluated in terms of quality of involvement and the size of the target population. 10,000 yearly visits to a station with an estimated open audience of 1,000,000 is not as significant as 10,000 visits to a station with an open audience of 100,000.
It should be clarified that the indigenous-change model does not refer solely to the involvement of native peoples, but rather the involvement of a variety of grass-roots and community organizations. The word "indigenous" takes on a special meaning when referring to the case of native people.

In Table 5-3, Profile: Radio Pío XII, we see that following the 1980 coup d'état station operations were impeded by the military, and station facilities were destroyed.

There is not a single study available which makes any sort of correlation between the technical quality of transmission, staff qualifications and community participation.

Interview with Ernesto Miranda, Llallagua Bolivia, June 7, 1983.


Interview with Ernesto Miranda, Llallagua Bolivia, June 7, 1983.

Interview with Teodora Camacho, Llallagua Bolivia, June 8, 1983.

Interview with Teodora Camacho, Llallagua Bolivia, June 10, 1983.

Interview with José Miranda, Llallagua Bolivia, June 7, 1983.

In Table 5-3, we see that each station department has some form of direct contact with the local people.

Interview with Teodora Camacho, Llallagua Bolivia, June 1, 1983.

Interview with Ernesto Miranda, Llallagua Bolivia, June 8, 1983.

For additional information pertaining to station operations and the relation established between Pío XII and its audience, station objectives, planning and research, competition, forms of participation, contact with grass-roots organizations, educational methodology, relation to the State, community training, and station evaluation, please refer to
In examining Tables 5-1, 5-2, and 5-3 we see that station decision-making at Radio Pío XII is more community oriented than at other radio schools.

In Table 5-3 we see that local organizations are consulted in twelve of twenty areas of station decision-making. Unfortunately, local groups are not integrated into policy-making in any of these areas.

In examining the station decision-making chart we see that the difference between Pío XII and other stations is that at Pío XII decisions are representative of a wider base of the population.

In Table 5-1 we see that the community and other organizations are rarely consulted concerning areas of station management. This indicates that Pío XII is a long way from the completion of self-sufficient indigenous mass communication infrastructures.

If we compare the decision-making analysis of each of the three stations (Tables 3-1, 4-1 and 5-1) we see that at Pío XII the director exerts less direct control over all aspects of station policy-making.

It will be interesting to see if, in the future, station roles will advance to the point where foreign priests will assume even more of a symbolic role as the local people gain responsibility for station operations.

In my opinion, if Pío XII faces prolonged government interference in station operation, community groups will be forced to function on their own. The long-term future of station-sponsored groups will be jeopardized if grass roots organizations do not grow in numbers and autonomy.

Some older and more conservative community members refrain from having anything to do with the station as they are afraid of rumors that the station is connected with communist sympathisers.

In Table 5-3 we see the full range of grass-roots organizations which are in contact with the station. In comparison with other stations, Pío XII incorporates advanced forms of campesino participation.
List of References: Chapter Six


2 O'Sullivan, 1972, p. 21.

3 Educational stations which broadcast on short wave frequencies have a restricted audience due to the cost of receivers.


5 Please refer to Table 6-1 for a complete listing of the stations and institutions.


9 Wendy Quarry, "Small is Beautiful?" Media in Education and Development Vol. 15, Num. 4 (December 1982), 183.

10 ALER, 1981, p.6


13 Interview with José Luis Aliaga, La Paz, Bolivia, May 30, 1983.


15 I wonder whether ALER maintains its inter-denominational "label" in order to ensure continued funding from non-Catholic funding agencies.
The Catholic Church in Latin America realizes that it cannot survive if dependent upon priest-directed operations; many countries have only one priest per 20,000 baptized Catholics. (White, 1981, p. 93.) Without significant lay involvement the future of the Church and of the radio schools is in jeopardy.

Dependency among campesinos includes a lack of control of dominant communicational, political, and economic processes. Marginalized peoples are inextricably attached to various forms of dependency, including dependencies upon educational radio stations. These conditions will not radically change in the near future unless marginalized peoples are encouraged to assess their own needs, define local problems, utilize local resources,
cooperate on joint ventures, and assume responsibility for educational radio stations.

38 The ultimate violation of radio school operations is the exclusion of the voice of campesinos in programming and decision-making. This occurs when the rights, opinions and values of the community are ignored. Radio schools have accepted harmful dependencies in order to sustain their educational efforts.


41 Spain, 1978, p. 179.

42 Interview with Wendy Quarry, Ottawa, January 13, 1983.


44 Interview with John O'Connell, Bogotá, April, 1983.


46 O'Sullivan, 1982, p. 22.


51 ALER, Marco Doctrinario (Quito: ALER, 1982), pp. 36, 39.


If commercial stations are dependent upon advertising revenue for survival, then local educational stations are hard pressed to become self-sufficient without similar forms of support.


Peter Schenkel, as quoted by Cabezas, A. 1982, p. 124.

Commercial advertising is an extension of the existing structures of dependency.

Interview with Lucía Sauma, La Paz, May 19, 1983.

Please refer to Tables 3-1, 4-1, and 5-1 which outline station decision-making at Radio San Gabriel, Radio San Rafael, and Radio Pío XII.

Zotto, 1980, p. 249.


Spain, 1978, p. 182.

Zotto, 1980, p. 249.


O'Sullivan, and Kaplún, p. 15.

Paiva, p. 8.

Korten, p.5.

Korten, p. 4.


Korten, pp. 1,4.

Andrade, 1982, p.5.
Interpersonal communication is less controllable in nature and therefore is not easily structured or manipulated by large media institutions. (Everett Rogers, 1974, pp. 52-53.)


Aristizabal, 1980, p. 87.

Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, p. 73.


Boston, p. 84.


Andrade, 1974, p. 2.


Andrade, 1982, p. 5.

Radio San Rafael, June, 1983.
One station administrator stated that one major reason for initiating station operations in Latacunga was the presence of a Protestant radio station in the area.

The effect of a diversified range of programming is not negative, however, the community will suffer if consciousness-raising and educational programming is replaced by mere propaganda.

Radio Colta (HCUE) is a small radio station outside of Riobamba Ecuador. It is operated by an association of 250 Protestant Quechua churches, and utilizes the volunteer efforts of hundreds of people weekly. Outside technical help is secured from Radio HCJB in Quito, and some financial resources are received from the Gospel Missionary Union.

Radio Colta and Radio Shuar in Ecuador were the only two stations I encountered in my field investigation which were owned and operated by groups within the local community. Local community ownership has a significant effect upon the nature of community involvement and hence, audience-station relations.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


______. *Guía Para la Acción de ALER, Documento de trabajo del Seminario de ASER.* Quito: ALER, 1982.


______. *The Use of Correspondence in Tele-education Programs in Latin America.* Quito: ALER, April 1978.


Kennedy, William B. "Pilgrims of the Obvious Or the Not-So-Obvious?" in Risk. World Council of Churches. vol. II no. 1, 1975


Social Sciences, Stanford University, 1976.


BIBLIOGRAPHY: INTERVIEWS


Aliaga, José Luis. ERBOL, La Paz, Bolivia. Interview, May 30, 1983.


Ayavir, Emiliana Rojas. Radio San Gabriel, La Paz, Bolivia. Interview, June 1, 1983.


Camacho, Teodora. Radio Pío XII, Llallagua, Bolivia. Interview, June 1, 1983.


Canut, José. Radio San Gabriel, La Paz, Bolivia. Interview, June 1, 1983.


Encalada, Marco. CIESPAL, Quito, Ecuador. Interview, May 11, 1983.


Gutierrez, Eva Anna. Radio San Gabriel, La Paz, Bolivia. Interview, May 18, 1983.


Maman, Ernesto. Radio Pío XII, Llallagua, Bolivia. Interview, June 1, 1983.


O'Connoly, John. Universidad Javeriana, Bogotá, Colombia. Interview, 16 April, 1983.

Quispicolque, Victor. Radio San Gabriel, La Paz, Bolivia. Interview, June 1, 1983.

Ramiro, Ernesto. Radio Pío XII, Llallagua, Bolivia. Interview, June 1, 1983.


Subirats, Pepe José. Acción Cultural Loyola, La Paz, Bolivia. Interview, 23 May, 1983.

Toro, José Bernardo. Interview, Toronto, August 12, 1983.
