SCHOOL FOR
INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

“Ending up in Buenos Aires”: Affective Mobilities of Urban Toba Indigenous People

Ana Vivaldi

Simons Papers in Security and Development

No. 63/2018 | February 2018

The **Simons Papers in Security and Development** are edited and published at the School for International Studies, Simon Fraser University. The papers disseminate cutting-edge research in progress on peace and security, international development, human rights and international law, and governance and civil society by the School's faculty and associated and visiting scholars. Inclusion of a paper in the series should not limit subsequent publication in any other venue. All papers can be downloaded free of charge from our website, www.sfu.ca/internationalstudies.

The series is supported by the Simons Foundation.

Series editor: Jeffrey T. Checkel
Managing editor: Martha Snodgrass

Vivaldi, Ana, *"Ending up in Buenos Aires": Affective Mobilities of Urban Toba Indigenous People*, Simons Papers in Security and Development, No. 63/2018, School for International Studies, Simon Fraser University, Vancouver, February 2018.

ISSN 1922-5725

Copyright remains with the author. Reproduction for other purposes than personal research, whether in hard copy or electronically, requires the consent of the author(s). If cited or quoted, reference should be made to the full name of the author(s), the title, the working paper number and year, and the publisher.

Copyright for this issue: Ana Vivaldi, avivaldi(at)sfu.ca.

School for International Studies
Simon Fraser University
Suite 7200 - 515 West Hastings Street
Vancouver, BC Canada V6B 5K3

SCHOOL FOR INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

SFU SIMON FRASER UNIVERSITY
ENGAGING THE WORLD

"Ending up in Buenos Aires": Affective Mobilities of Urban Toba Indigenous People

Simons Papers in Security and Development
No. 63/2018 | February 2018

Abstract:
In this paper, I analyze the forms of mobility and the affective modulations that shaped the trajectories of indigenous people from the Chaco region to the city of Buenos Aires, Argentina, where they now live. Considering the macro-structural forces of political and economic process as insufficient to explain why, how and when indigenous people moved to the city, I focus on habits around movement and affective modulations that made indigenous people previously living in rural Chaco region to "end up" in the capital city of the country. These movements were unusual in their form, as the first arrivants had little connections and no hosting institution in the city. Through an analysis of the life histories and trajectories of indigenous people who are now living in and indigenous *barrio* (poor neighborhood) in Buenos Aires, this research traces the specific affective states that triggered travels to the city. I produce an "odd" typology of these affective mobilities that emerged as common forms of experience within larger context. My aim is to offer an alternative analysis of mobility, one that departs from preconceived understandings of migratory push and pull factors and engages with the lived experience of urban indigenous people who move in spite and across multiple socio-economic constraints.

About the author:
Dr. Ana Vivaldi is a Simons Research Fellow at the School for International Studies in the Simon Fraser University, and an Instructor in Departments of Anthropology and Sociology at UBC. Her main ethnographic research was held among urban indigenous people in Buenos Aires. Her work shows the importance of spatial mobility and the creation of spatial and social networks, that she coined "subaltern assemblages". Her work has benefitted from the support of the International Development Research Centre, the Liu Institute for Global Issues, and UBC Graduate Fellowships. She is currently conducting research on the experience of indigenous men in the Argentinean military. Since 2014, among others, she has taught Ethnographic Methods, Social Theory, Indigenous Politics and Media Anthropology at UBC and SFU.

About the publisher:
The School for International Studies (SIS) fosters innovative interdisciplinary research and teaching programs concerned with a range of global issues, but with a particular emphasis on international development, and on global governance and security. The School aims to link theory, practice and engagement with other societies and cultures, while offering students a challenging and multi-faceted learning experience. SIS is located within the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at Simon Fraser University. Our website is www.sfu.ca/internationalstudies.

"Ending up in Buenos Aires": Affective Mobilities of Urban Toba Indigenous People

"I never thought I would end up living in Buenos Aires." Martin and I were sitting in the kitchen of his small house in Cortadera[1] an indigenous poor neighbourhood (*barrio*) in Buenos Aires' metropolitan area. His remark surprised me because it not only broke my own assumptions about Toba's migration to the city, but it contrasted with previous explanations that described moving to Buenos Aires as part of a well-defined plan.

Arriving in Buenos Aires as Unplanned Mobility

Martin is a Toba man in his sixties who owns a house in the outskirts of Castelli, a small city in the province of Chaco, where he used to live, and still considers moving back to the Chaco region, around 1,300 kilometers to the North of the country and where Toba people are originally from. In Castelli he has siblings and many relatives he misses. Martin explained to me that the only reason he remains in Buenos Aires is that his only son and his family live with him. Martin lived in many places before moving to Buenos Aires. He was born in a small village north of Castelli, where his parents and uncles planted cotton and hunted. As a young man, he moved to the town of Castelli to find employment as a seasonal worker, and he traveled back and forth to plantations collecting cotton during the harvest, returning to Castelli in the off-season when he would study the Bible at an evangelical church. After the breakup of his first marriage, he moved to a Toba settlement in the city of Rosario, he met his second wife and lived with her for almost a decade. They split after trying to have children unsuccessfully and he moved back to Castelli. If it were not for a phone call from his nephew requesting help to build his house in the Cortadera barrio in Buenos Aires, and a subsequent offer of a plot of land for himself, Martin believes he would still be living in Castelli.

[1] This is a pseudonym to the place where I conducted fieldwork between March 2009 and August 2010.

Many people like Martin recounted imagining themselves moving from the Chaco to Buenos Aires, long before they left. However, most people also remember how unlikely such a move seemed to them at the time. Most of them had not seriously sought to visit or move to Buenos Aires, and describe their decision as the culmination of chance events. "Ending up in Buenos Aires" meant that travel there was unplanned, and that living in the Toba barrio had become a stop in a longer series of back and forth movements. Adults in the families now constituting Cortadera were born in rural villages, moved back and forth between several locations, including other peri-urban barrios in towns and cities in the Chaco region when they were younger, and only later had "tried their luck" or literally "ended up" in Buenos Aires. Even among those who had always wanted to live in the city, their arrival in Buenos Aires was a result of specific chance experiences and personal resolve.

"Ending up" was a way of describing the experience of moving to Buenos Aires that challenged my own assumptions about indigenous mobilities from rural areas to the city. The phrase did not easily match the type of analysis made in migration studies I had arrived with. These trajectories had been winding, repetitive and backtracking rather than direct and straightforward and each turn was unpredictable. Arriving in Buenos Aires was, therefore, only one possibility among many. "Ending up" condenses these experimental nature of movements to Buenos Aires, as if to echo Doreen Massey's notion of being "thrown together" in place, a notion she uses to describe conjunctural nature of space coining the notion of spatial multiplicity. Moreover urban Toba trajectories were not final but unfolding, since many older and younger people were considering moving elsewhere in the future.

The concept of mobilities not only focuses on the processes of travel and spatial movements of people, objects and meanings. Mobilities is also a perspective from which to reconsider the social (Urry 2010, Urry and Schiller 2006) and draws our attention to displacement rather than sedentarism as productive of social space (Malkki 1996, Massey 2005, Urry and Schiller, 2006). Mobilities results as much from people's creative practices of detachment and escape (Appadurai 1996, Hardt and Negri 2009), as from entangled and spatialized power relations slowing down, orienting and regulating people's movements (Moore 2005, Tsing 2005, Mezzadra and Nielsen 2013). Following Massey and Urry, I define mobilities

as the dynamic force shaping socialities and space through movement and stasis of people, objects (Massey 2005, Urry 2010, Salazar and Smart 2011).

I trace the role of affect among the Toba people in order to conceptualize what type of intensities in social and political relations triggered movement (Masumi 2002, Mazzarella 2006, Beasley Murray 2010). By suggesting that trajectories were also shaped by affect, I refer to collective variations in people's capacities to act that result from encounters of bodies – whether of individuals, objects or conjunctions of both (Spinoza 1996; Deleuze 1978, 1988).[2] Suggesting that affect modulated mobility is a way of thinking about the politics of intentionality and collective action beyond notions of interpellation and articulation (Hall 1986, Li 2000). An analytic focus on affective mobilities enables us to move away from simplifying Tobas' arrival to the city, and to overcome the distinction between flows and structured movement and consider both dimensions together. By engaging with affect, I explore what type of intensive variations triggered movement; what capacities that movement enabled; and what capacities a person had to have to travel far enough to arrive in Buenos Aires.

The current analysis is based on ethnographic work conducted with urban indigenous people who live in one of the 14 Toba barrios in the metropolitan area of Buenos Aires, during 18 months, between February 2009 and August 2010. My ethnography started in the barrio and then followed Toba older and younger (in their twenties), women and men in their daily movements across the city including the local movements and the commutes to the city centre. Interviews and life histories enabled me to reconstruct the past histories of movements. I also traced mobility by following their travels to the Chaco and the movement of objects and information between Chaco and Buenos Aires.

Buenos Aires periphery is a vast formation of suburban rings comprising a population of 14 million people, and Toba barrios are located in the poorer and harder to access areas of this

[2] While there has been a proliferation of works on affect, there is not a homogenous use of the concept (Gregg and Seigworth 2010). I follow the genealogy of Deleuze who takes the notion of affect from Spinoza. My work therefore takes insights from researchers drawing on and extending this genealogy such as the work of Mazzarella (2009) within Anthropology, and Grossberg 1992, Massumi 2002, and Beasley-Murray 2010 within political theory. I have chosen this line because of the emphasis on affect as a collective and a political force rather than a patterned psychological experience.

periphery. Cortaderas, a Toba barrio where I conducted this ethnography, is demographically and spatially discrete and is composed of over 30 families organized in individual plots, and around 10 precarious houses of younger people who have no formal plots and have occupied common lands. The place was created in the 1990s as a result of a land donation by the Catholic church, to a legally recognized indigenous community. It was created by a group of previously dispersed Toba families living in the populated shantytowns for many years. Cortaderas was one of the first Toba barrios to be created in Buenos Aires and its existence and leaders eased the creation of others. The demographic insignificance in the context of the populous Buenos Aires periphery contrast to their relevance of Toba barrios as the only indigenous-specific places in the city (other urban indigenous live dispersed around several areas). Importantly, these barrios, over a thousand kilometers away from their traditional territories, challenge the idea of Buenos Aires as a white and European city (Gordillo 2014).

What follows, analyzes the historical circumstances over which urban Toba mobilities unfolded. Then, I analyze forms of movement among young Toba women and men that are related to becoming an adult and gaining independence, before they even considered coming to Buenos Aires. Finally, I trace some patterns of movement that emerged in life histories noting unusual patterns of affective intensity by which they ended up in Buenos Aires.

From Forced Indigenous Displacements to Youth Mobilities

Many families living in the Toba barrio moved to Buenos Aires as a means of escaping from the multiple forms of dispossession that resulted from ongoing colonization in the Chaco region. Colonization was not a single moment of occupation but rather violent disposition of indigenous people from their land, means of subsistence and life that is still unfolding in the present (resonating Coulthard's ideas on ongoing primitive accumulation, 2014). In Argentina the vectors of dispossession were the army in the late nineteenth century. After land redistribution in the twentieth century provincial police, local government authorities, missionaries, plantation owners and poor *criollo* farmers (people of mixed Spanish and indigenous heritage) were responsible for expropriating territories and pushing indigenous

groups to small less productive lands.[3] In the central Chaco region, the dispossession of land and indigenous labour was organized in by economic cycles. Both cotton and sugar production relied heavily on the cheap labour of Indigenous People and poor criollo farmers to produce the "extraordinary revenues" celebrated by national and provincial governments (Gonzales 1890). People in the barrio often recall their past experiences working on the cotton and sugar harvests in the Chaco.

In the 1930s, cotton became the main economic activity of the region, when the national government promoted it by subsidizing companies and distributing lands previously occupied by indigenous groups (Mari 2009; Iñigo Carrera 2010). Some indigenous groups were able to organize as small cotton farmers on their own lands. However, they could not maintain the production for long. When in the 1970s commercialization became harder for small producers, they had to seek employment as workers on the plantation (Iñigo Carrera 1982). The *ingenio* (sugar plantation and processing factory) Las Palmas was the first agribusiness organizing space for capitalist production in this region.[4] Owned by British investors and subsidized by the national government, it employed thousands of Indigenous people as seasonal workers during the harvest.

In the 1970s and 1980s, seasonal work in the region shrank abruptly, the *ingenio* Las Palmas went bankrupt, and the demand for labour at the cotton harvest declined because of technological transformations. The tasks the Toba used to perform were no longer necessary, which what generated an almost complete expulsion of Indigenous workers from the plantation (Mari 2009; Iñigo Carrera 2008). During this period, mobility from rural areas to the towns and small cities such as Castelli became more frequent,[5] as people moved in search of sporadic jobs

[3] It is important to note connections between the creation of political power and economic power in the Chaco, and the relationship of both to indigenous mobilities. Given the national government distributed lands to the elite families and military personnel who participated in Chaco's colonization, those people also became responsible for policing where indigenous groups would be placed as workers and during their "free" time.

[4] Las Palmas was established in 1887 as the first and main industrial unit of the province. It was founded with British capital. In 1914, it employed 3,000 temporary workers of which it is estimated that 70% was indigenous (Mariotti et al. 2010). The *ingenio* went bankrupt in the 1970s and was bought by the state. In 1994 it sold its last properties. The National Institute of Indigenous Affairs handed a portion of the lands to the indigenous communities in the area (Tamagno 2001).

[5] Since 1950, poor rural populations have also been forced out of their lands and into urban margins (Ratier 1971).

and to study the Bible. As a result, people created more stable settlements in the Chaco region cities. Toba settlements also emerged outside of the Chaco, especially in the 1970s in the cities of Rosario, Santa Fe and La Plata (Tamagno 2001; Vazquez 2000). In this period, people living in urban settlements in all these urban areas organized successful land claims.[6]

When I started fieldwork, men and women in their thirties and above explained that they had moved to Buenos Aires because in Chaco "there was no work," implying they were escaping the unemployment resulting from economic crisis and technological transformation I have just described. Explanations also pointed to getting "better jobs and salaries", during a time of high labour demand in Buenos Aires booming industries in the 1960s and 1970s. Finally people explicitly mentioned the restricted lands, explaining that they were "too many siblings" and the farms lands were not enough for all. I understood these narratives as reflecting push and pull factors for migration.

These initial answers fitted an analytics of migration (i.e. Kearney 1994, Horevitz 2009)[7] and the historical context I just summarized. I could have used them to reconstruct Toba's trajectories as a result of the articulation of economic processes, group strategies and individual choices, and to analyze the as reconfiguring of identities in a new place (see Horevitz 2009, Clifford 2013). Toba groups, I could argue, avoided exploitation and displacement by escaping to towns and cities. However, these processes do not account for why some families and people moved while others stayed, what capacities this people had, or what situations triggered their movements.

[6] Provincial governments in Formosa and Chaco handed out land titles and turned peri-urban settlements into formal Toba barrios in the 1970s and 1980s. While this was a significant recognition, it also allowed governments to "settle" Indigenous people in urban areas and away from rural lands, thus allowing ongoing expansions of the agricultural frontier in what was previously rural lands occupied by indigenous groups. In the 1990s, outside the Chaco there were other cases of municipal, provincial or national agencies helping create urban Toba barrios. In most of these barrios, people made a living from state assistance, sporadic jobs, and selling handicrafts (see Iñigo Carrera V. 2008). In these barrios and when possible, people continued to gather resources in the peri-urban bush (Vivaldi 2007).

[7] In the typification of migration theories by Kearney (1994) all three moments involve a degree of rationality and choice: people moving as a search for better life (modernization theory), as an escape of negative conditions and neo colonial inequalities (dependency and world system theories), or as processes where culture and community mediate larger economic factors (articulation theory).

Looking for a place to be: Youth mobilities

Entangled with experience of labour exploitation and land expropriation were the dispositions and affective modulations of people's movements. Toba people defined "youth" as a period of life that starts when teens are considered old enough to travel on their own (around twelve years of age) and that ends when they start a domestic partnership independently from their families and have their first children and are therefore considered adults (Tola 2012). In different Toba villages and barrios, I observed that many young people moved intensively and frequently. When I asked about it, adults said that traveling is part of growing up. Parents are often active in helping young people to make short or longer trips, and may encourage the mobility of their daughters or sons so that they get valuable experience or contribute to the family's well-being. Families and acquaintances, however, also watch over young people's movement, especially that of young women, as they are considered in danger of being sexually assaulted. As a form of regulation, people in a community spread gossip about women's mobility if they consider their movement to be excessive.

Toba people I met in Buenos Aires and in the Chaco were highly mobile. Some young people traveled to visit relatives in nearby villages, but others moved longer distances to a town or city. Youth often traveled by themselves, moving, for example, to a different village to attend high school, get a job, help a relative, or because they were "fighting too much" with their parents. Youth were also among the most enthusiastic participants in church-organized trips, some of which took them to cities outside of the Chaco for several days (see Citro 2009). Juana, for example told me that she had traveled a lot when young and thus it was not as hard for her to come to Buenos Aires. Julio explained that his experience traveling helped him find his way when he arrived in Buenos Aires with nowhere to live. People living in Cortaderas thus relied on this experience to "end up in Buenos Aires".

Young people's movements in Buenos Aires and Chaco were often described as actions through which they are "*buscando un lugar para estar*" ("looking for a place to be"). People explained they wanted to live somewhere different from their own villages and engaged in visiting other places and meeting new people. For example, a young woman I knew from a village in Chaco attending a teachers' meeting in Buenos Aires decided at the last minute not to

take the bus back home, traveling instead to the Toba barrio in the city of Resistencia with new friends who were also indigenous teachers. Unpredictability was considered a normal part of "being young." When I asked parents if they were concerned about their children last minute decisions to travel they said that it was "normal". Even the extreme form of unplanned mobility known as "*la joda*", party life, is accepted if later on the young person goes back to a "right path".

La joda, party life, is a term I heard in every Toba community I visited. The phrase refers to people, generally young, who "party", spend the day hanging out with friends, drinking alcohol and smoking; they go to parties and dance clubs in the nearby towns and "hook up" with different people including criollos/as. This way of life is also connected with dropping out from school, as youth who leave the school most generally join *la joda*. People in *la joda* travel often to party in villages near-by. While parents worry when their children engage in *la joda* they do not punish or restrain them. Noelia, the mother of a young man in *la joda*, explained to me, "You can't stop them, you can't lock them up." Parents encourage them to "get out of that life" and go back to school or attend the church. People who join evangelical churches and become evangelicals stop partying.

To be in the *evangelio* (become evangelical) redirects people onto a "good path," which is literally seen as a good and well-behaved form of mobility: staying at home, working, going to church, and traveling only for employment or religious encounters. The transition from being in *la joda* to becoming a Christian is a recurrent topic at religious services in particular in the segment when the preacher invites assistants to give their *testimonios* (testimonies). People who quit *la joda* are also regarded as experienced individuals who "saw a lot of the world", but then had the moral strength to get back onto a respectable path.

Related to the sexuality implied in *la joda* and coming of age, a few men admitted that another reason to move was to find a girlfriend. In the Cortaderas, and in communities in the Chaco, I met many young people who had romantic relations elsewhere. For them it was common to be constantly moving back and forth between their home villages and that of their lovers. Young people described falling in love as an intense, irrational need to be with or "meet"

another person, and constantly moving to be closer to them was a part of this intense affection.[8] Adults expressed that, when a young person likes a boy or girl, "you can't stop them from wanting to meet them", and love is described as an uncontrollable urge to be with a person, showing that they regard constant mobility as part of the very experience of falling in love.

When young people find a place to settle with their partners, they usually say *ya me quedé* (I settled), and then find a job or form a family. When young adults "find their place," or especially after having children, their mobility typically slows down. Men may still travel sporadically (and political leaders and preachers are generally engaged in intense travel as part of their work), but it is harder for women to leave their children and domestic responsibilities behind. In this regards, the possibilities to move that are more equally available and acceptable during youth, become restricted for women when they are raising children.

Youth mobilities are thus permeated with affective states related to communing of age. Young Toba men and women feel the need to explore their surroundings beyond the home villages. In particular they move because they fall in love and become sexually active. Being in *la joda* is an extreme form of these affects, one that does not allow space for anything else other than socializing, exploring and being in love. These affective mobilities are seen as natural part of growing and as shaping capacities among adults. While people who are in la joda are regarded as unpredictable and unreliable, having been in la joda and then coming back make people to be regarded as strong, capable and experienced. In this sense affect is directly related to embodied capacities what Deleuze (1970), following Spinoza (1996) calls affection, of the embodied trace of an affect that reshapes that body.

Gendered mobilities

Youth affective mobilities however offer some different possibilities to men and women. While women gave me similar descriptions of their past movement to that of men, as I got deeper into the details about their travels I found their travels were more organized and less erratic than that of young men. Women they did not travel alone for employment as seasonal

[8] See Gómez (2011) and Tola (2007).

workers on farms, and when they traveled by themselves they had a specific destination.[9] Women who were considered experienced and strong because of their travels described a way of organizing travels that was gender-specific.

Women like Andrea who had traveled to attend high school since very young, usually traveled to places where they had relatives, or with an institution organizing their trip. Women also tended to explain their travels with regard to a particular goal: to participate in church meeting, take care of a relative, attend a teacher training session. Women's travels are thus more organized, and tend to have a particular destination and sense of purpose. If women do not follow an organized travel trajectory, they are considered to "travel too much," to be irresponsible, and are the subjects of criticism by both men and women, potentially creating problems with their relatives and husbands.

Cecilia is an indigenous teachers' assistant in her late twenties,[10] with two young children and living in a Toba barrio in Formosa Province. She traveled very frequently to attend aboriginal teachers' meetings. Cecilia was among the most mobile women I met as part of her involvement in a provincial aboriginal teachers' organization. In spite of how carefully she planned all of her travels, neighbors and in-laws gossiped that when she traveled she was meeting other men. When we met once in Buenos Aires, her husband had just left her because of the rumours of infidelity. A few months later, I visited her in the Chaco, and she told me there was also gossip about her being "a bad mother" and leaving her responsibilities behind. She was angry and frustrated, and told me she was not willing to stop attending teacher's meetings to get her husband back.

Gossip is a form of social regulation that may attempt to slow down or stop movement. People link women's movement with the development of what is considered an "excessive

[9] The women were not employed in the cotton field or the sugar plantation by themselves as the men were. They did not travel by themselves to participate in the harvest as young men do.

[10] *Auxiliar Docente Aborigen* (in Chaco province) or *Maestro de Modalidad Aborigen* (in Formosa) refers to aboriginal teacher´s assistants. This position was created as part of national multicultural education policies. Aboriginal Assistants are trained and employed in provinces with a high percentage of indigenous residents, such as Chaco and Formosa, but not in Buenos Aires. While they are not allowed to teach, they are expected to translate and tutor indigenous students.

sexuality", which goes against being a "respectable woman" (see Gómez 2011).[11] This is a category influenced by the Evangelical church, and condemns women who have sex with many men while being unmarried, or who "cheat" on their husbands. A woman who is not "respectable" is not only criticized in terms of her sexuality, but also as a mother. A "respectable" woman is assumed to stay at home and have all household duties under control. Thus, while women have relative freedom to move and can engage in intense travels when they are young, their mobility has to be well planned, and must slow down when they become mothers.[12]

While the intense affective mobilities of youth are accepted, once a woman is taking care of her children the expected affection to prevail is that of taking care of them and thus movement is expected to slow down (see Grosz 1994, 2011). Affect channelled into motherhood resonates as a slowing down of youth mobilities, and slowing down is also regulated when adult women's affective mobilities become an object of concern and gossip.

Feminist authors have pointed out these complexities as an expression of the ways gender relations are embedded in broader fields of tensions that make it impossible to describe an action such as women's mobility under one universalizing logic. To do so is to disregard the complex relations that enable and affect them (Abu-Lughod 1993, Massey 1994). Women's mobilities in sum are both an object of regulation, as well as recognized and a form of power, given women who travel may be under scrutiny, but are also valued as experienced. For women, mobility represents an ambiguous experience. It may allow them to study, have a job, and gain leadership roles in their communities, but also be an object of criticism, conflict and rupture. Prior

[11] My points about women's movement coincide with the analysis of Mariana Gómez, who has worked in rural villages in the west of Formosa Province. My work does not specifically focus on sexuality but shares similar insights about mobility.

[12] This observation certainly echoes feminist discussions around women's mobility. Initial feminist approaches considered the control over women's movement outside the household and into the "public" space as a universal form of regulation across societies (Rich 1980; Rosaldo 1974). In this scheme, feminists regarded mobility as a form of emancipating transgression. In the examples analyzed above, mobility may open up spaces and new possibilities for women, but it also may be directed by others, as when parents insist their daughters move to help a relative in need. Toba women's mobilities therefore problematize any dichotomous understanding of mobility as emancipating women.

dispositions to move, were manifested in women's trajectories to Buenos Aires, given only previously highly mobile women arrived in Buenos Aires by themselves (see the next sections).

In sum, the disposition in young people to move is regarded as part of the process of becoming adults and is modulated by intense affects, of uneasiness, romantic experiences, or attempts to earn independence. The trajectories of people that "ended up" in Cortaderas were among the first Toba people to settle in Buenos Aires this barrio expanded these previous experiences of intense affective mobilities. The people who ended up in the barrio were not the ones most in need. Rather and in their majority they embodied the effects of these intense movements as young, and had the capacities to manage themselves in these longer than average and exploratory travels (in comparison to moving to the provincial capital, or even the city of Rosario with well-established Toba barrios). In many cases, the people who came to Buenos Aires first were men who later brought their families to the city. Many of the women came as partners, following their husbands' initiative. But among the adults in the barrio there were also a number of particularly strong women who had been responsible for the move of their families. In the next section, I examine the complete trajectories of four people who now live in the barrio, and who generated their families' move to Buenos Aires.

Affective Modulations of Unusual Trajectories

With the concept of affective modulation I highlight the way that political and economic dynamics, and group dispositions for movement come to vary in intensity and, in doing so, generated Toba travels, oriented them and modulated their speed and spatial reach. With the concept of "affective modulation", I explore the following questions: When did a situation in the Chaco become so unbearable that people moved? How were people able to move? How did people come to move elsewhere even if they did not want to?

Toba trajectories "ending up" in Buenos Aires bring together the three levels of interaction I am analyzing – economic conditioning, dispositions to move, and the affective modulation of movement – which entangled with each other and triggered travels, shaped turns, and expanded mobilities. When Martin and others described "ending up in Buenos Aires" they accounted for the fact that their current location unfolded from their specific capacities for

moving as well as specific triggers that pushed them to travel farther than usual and to take the risk to move to a place where no established Toba community was present.

If mobilities were not only defined by political economic process, and not just an articulation of these structures with Toba youth mobilities, the affective modulation of mobilities considers a last level of circumstances that triggered and motorized movement that the notion of "ending up" highlights. Mobilities thus, unfold over political contexts, articulate with habits and dispositions of travel of the Toba, include unexpected encounters, but specifically emerge out of these moments of affective intensity. While it seemed anecdotal at first, as I deepened my ethnographic engagement I found that the moments of affective intensity triggering travels were not individual and unique experiences, but emerged from common experiences. These included moments of betrayal and break up, being orphaned, having done the military service or being a strong woman.

Analyzing the role of affect as a form of political resistance in Latin America (and while recognizing the possibility of affect as a form of totalitarian power) Beasley Murray's states: "Politics is no longer a matter of consent and negotiation, implied by the hegemonic contract; it is a (non)relation or incompatibility between processes of capture and affective escape." (2010, 139) With this he is establishing a field of study of dynamics, which are not immediately codified as structures, and within a politics of representation and while unfolding over social relations are forms of collective embodied movement and transformation.

While there are other types of trajectories and different dimensions could be stressed, I identified some regularities among the people that I worked longer with. Out of these patterns I create an "odd" typology, not with the aim of locking all mobilities to these but as a way to identify commonalities in these "unusual" mobilities. The typology is odd in that it conveys the life histories I conducted, but may need modification if more experiences were brought into the analysis. The typology is odd too in that is not following a classification of emotions or even of affective relations were all possibilities and their implications are considered. Rather it is a typology that emerges from the social and political contexts these families were situated, and rather than linked with only joy or sadness, as Spinoza (1996) has done (see also Massumi) it shows the ambiguity of the lived experience.

The first type of trajectory I analyze is that of the women who were recognized as *mujeres fuertes* (strong women), who were encouraged to move to help their families living elsewhere. This is in contrast with experiences of men who had been key figures in the land negotiation of the barrio and narrated their life histories around having been *huerfanitos* ("little orphans"). A third type highlighted by both men and women, involved breaking up with a partner, described as a moment when people needed to go elsewhere. Finally, many adult men moved out of the Chaco because they were drafted to do mandatory military service (abolished in 1994), which they identified as a moment that made them stronger and capable of moving to Buenos Aires by themselves. These four types of experiences are affective variations, given they involve moments that changed people's capacities to act, transforming their associations in one place and making them move elsewhere.

Mujeres fuertes

*Mujeres fuertes (*strong women) is a category that is used to refer to women who have a leadership role, are experienced, and are perceived to be, brave. In the rural areas they are called *guapas* (meaning in this context skilful and self-sufficient), women who know how to find their way in the bush; and know how to use a machete, climb trees, gather fruits, and can carry big loads of firewood on their backs for many kilometres. They are also brave women who confront the dangers of the bush. Younger women living in the city, by contrast, become strong by accessing education, getting jobs as health assistants or aboriginal teachers, and working with NGOs. Women who have leadership roles and organize community activities, such as running a soup kitchen, are also regarded as "strong women".[13] Some strong women have all of these capacities at the same time. In the barrio, a few of them were primarily responsible for making their whole family move to Buenos Aires.

Andrea was born in the mid-1970s, in a village in an extensive indigenous territory between the Bermejo and Bermejito Rivers. As a child, she used to travel with her father, who was an important political leader, to visit relatives and other leaders in the area. She also went to

[13] For a longer characterization of the "*mujeres guapas*", see Gómez (2011). The opposite of being strong is to be *flojo/a*, a category used for both men and women and closely related to a physical state of having neither strength nor *ánimo*, energy, initiative or will.

work in the cotton harvest with her father several times. In her travels she got to know different villages, learned about political organizing and became physically strong as she participated in the harvest (children did not get paid but were key to enabling parents achieve the daily quotas).

Andrea attended the high school created by Belgian missionaries, located a few kilometers from her family farm: a boarding school for rural indigenous children. She lived in the school for several weeks, and then went home to help with farm duties. When she finished high school, Andrea was fluent in Spanish, had strong reading and writing skills, and knew how to interact with institutions. Attending high school, therefore, prepared her for life in an urban setting. When she graduated, Andrea had her first child, and, because she did not stay with the baby's father, she lived with her parents, who helped her raise the baby. Soon, she met her current husband and had two more children.

In the 1990s, indigenous leaders, including Andrea's father, obtained legal title to 140,000 hectares of land in the area between the Bermejito and the Bermejo rivers in the Chaco. With the assistance of Belgium missionaries, they created the indigenous Land Association, which administered the land (Carrasco and Briones 1996). Andrea's father helped her get a plot of land in the area, and she settled there with her husband and three of her eventually nine children. Andrea lived there for a few years, raising cattle and taking care of her farm. When her older children were still small, her father asked her to move to Buenos Aires to help her sister who was living in a *villa miseria* (shantytown). He stressed that she would have more possibilities to move forward in her education there. Her father considered her more able to move than any of her other siblings, and her experience implied that she had a responsibility to go to Buenos Aires and help her sister. Although she did not want to go, her father put a lot of pressure in her going.

In her early twenties, Andrea moved to Buenos Aires and lived in the shantytown with her sister for a year. But her husband, who was not fluent in Spanish, did not find a job. She had no chance to study, and they both disliked the shantytown and the city, so they moved back to the village in the Chaco. Andrea remembers that after returning to their community they were very happy living on her farm and tending cattle. However, her sister became involved in the group doing the land negotiations for creating Cortaderas in Buenos Aires, and she offered to put

Andrea on the list of families requesting a house. This time Andrea and her husband were even more certain they did not want to move, but her father insisted on the importance of having a house in Buenos Aires, and her sister told her that the barrio would be very different from the shantytown. Andrea's father and sister convinced her to move. Andrea agreed with the aim of *juntar certificados*, getting as many education certificates for herself and her children by taking courses and attending training programs.[14] Since she moved, Andrea has been actively involved in the barrio's *comisión*, producing and selling handicrafts, and working with NGOs and the middle-class people who approach the barrio "to help."

Andrea was responsible for her family's move to Buenos Aires. She did not passively accompany her husband, but was rather herself the person with travel experience, who decided to move and made the effort to settle in the city. Andrea, however, was also under a lot of pressure to move. Being a "strong woman" with unusual travel experience, holding a high-school diploma and possessing the knowledge of how to interact with state institutions and NGOs, Andrea was made responsible for her extended family. She was expected to contribute in a different way than her siblings, some of whom had no formal education and stayed on the farm.

Andrea's settlement in Buenos Aires further transformed her extended family's capacities for mobility as a whole, because the family now would have two houses where they could stay while in Buenos Aires. After Andrea moved, she and her sister hosted relatives, and connected people from Buenos Aires to the Chaco. However, Andrea, who was in her late thirties at the time of our conversations, did not give up her desire to live back on a farm in the Chaco, and she periodically reminded her father that she wanted to go back.

Andrea's story is similar to a few other strong women in the barrio who likewise had moved to Buenos Aires in response to the collective need of their families. In affective terms, this can be understood as an expansion of the families' capacity to act, given it is useful to have a family member who can run errands in the city and host other family members from the Chaco. Andrea and her sister were thus actively in touch with their family in the Chaco, texting back and

[14] For Andrea's generation, social mobility for the Toba meant getting a high school certificate as a health care or teaching assistant, and getting a job as such. Andrea hoped that more learning opportunities could lead her toward a stable job.

forth and talking on the phone several times a week, in order to coordinate these forms of connectivity.

Kinship relations are actualized in complex ways, yet there is a tendency among groups now characterized as Tobas for the maternal side to be stronger when people are adults.[15] Women can be expected to keep a more active connection with their parents once they have their own families. Having "strong women" in the family, therefore, can make a huge contribution to the overall well-being of the family. More than fifteen years after they had moved to Buenos Aires, Andrea and her sister had created a strong extension of their family there, sending resources, receiving and commercializing handicrafts, and connecting people by creating translocal assemblages.

Orphans

In contrast to the spatial expansion of kin relations created by "strong women," many of the men who first arrived in the city explained that they went because they were orphans, and so their affective relations with their families had been severed. As orphans, they had no significant kinship relations in the Chaco, had nothing to lose if they moved far away, and thus took the chance to explore their options by leaving the Chaco. During my fieldwork, I was surprised by the number of men now in their late forties or older who emphasized this experience of being orphaned, which initially seemed to me to be unrelated to travelling. I will illustrate this by focusing on Lorenzo's trajectory.

Sitting under a tree outside his house in the Toba barrio in Buenos Aires, Lorenzo narrated his life to me in a series of interviews that were non-linear in chronology, going back and forth from one topic to another. When Lorenzo recalled events he seemed to be reliving them, making gestures as if the landscape he was referring to were there in front of him. His sense of having been lost most of his life, with no family support, no guidance and no love until he met his last wife, was a recurrent theme. Lorenzo narrated his life starting from the moment

[15] For an in-depth and recent study of Toba kinship and its role in the making of personhood, see Tola (2007).

his father died and then went back to contrast how well he was cared for when his father was still alive.

Lorenzo was born in the 1920s near the *ingenio* Las Palmas. He started traveling when he was eight years old, after his father died. His father was a strong leader who exerted influence over several Toba groups in the central Chaco and was hired at the sugar *ingenio* Las Palmas, to supervise workers at the plantation. When Lorenzo's father died, the family abandoned their house and spread out into different villages. Lorenzo's mother sent him to a nearby village to live with his uncle, who worked for the sugar plantation as well. In Lorenzo's memory, at that moment he became an orphan: he had no home of his own, no guidance in life, and no family support. This status shaped the rest of his life. He quit school before completing his primary education, hung out in the train station with criollo children, and they rode the train without tickets.

When Lorenzo was eleven he started working with his uncle on the Las Palmas sugar plantation, where they ploughed the land with oxen. Lorenzo recounted that he made almost no money, just enough to buy clothes. During one harvest, Lorenzo met Roberto, a Toba man working at the plantation for a few months who told him about Buenos Aires. Roberto was living and working in the city, and told Lorenzo how much work one could get there. He left Lorenzo his address and insisted that he go and work there himself. Lorenzo kept on working on the plantation, but after some time he started to feel a pain in his chest. He asked the sugar company to treat him, but the company doctor told him he was healthy. He took time off and rested, and when harvest time came, he asked for a job again. The *mayordomo* (foreman) of the area said there was no work that season. He knew they were hiring many people for the harvest, and they were explicitly denying him work. This was probably because the administration did not want to recognize any work-related injury he might have, and so they did not want to have him as an employee again. Lorenzo felt betrayed and angry after so many years of hard work.

It was this experience, rather than the labour exploitation itself, that Lorenzo found most upsetting. He also felt particularly abused because his father used to be the *mayordomo* of the area. This was the situation that triggered Lorenzo's first trip to Buenos Aires, when he decided to use the address that Roberto had written down on a small piece of paper. With sugar cane

workers union' s support, Lorenzo prepared a folder with his medical record, got a train ticket, and left for Buenos Aires. Lorenzo's trajectory was in this way marked by intensely affective transformations: the death of his father, the breakup of his family, and losing his job at the plantation. In his memories, he linked all of these events and his subsequent trip to Buenos Aires to the experience of being an orphan with no parental guidance.

Going to Buenos Aires with nothing more than the address of an acquaintance written down on a piece of paper was a bold move. Nobody else in Lorenzo's circle of relatives or acquaintances had moved that far away. His trip to Buenos Aires was modulated by these intense affects and the lack of any relation holding him in the Chaco. He felt betrayed by the plantation administration, not because of the unpaid work he did as a child or the low wages, but rather because he was left unemployed. Lorenzo's anger added to his sense of being alone in the Chaco, with no one supporting him and nothing to lose if he moved far away.

Other men, like Carlos and Julio, also remembered their mobility as shaped by their experiences of being orphans. They explained that they had more freedom to move far away because they had no strong personal attachments in the Chaco, and they also moved to get away from sad memories of the time their families were together. The experience however made them strong in the long term, having confronted many difficulties, and finding their way out of them. When they moved to Buenos Aires, there was no Toba Unida church to help them settle, or any organized groups of Toba families. Thus, it was a sense of homelessness among some orphan men that opened up the option of moving farther than usual, of making a leap and move somewhere completely strange. These male orphans and the "strong women" were, therefore, the pioneers in the expansion of Toba networks into Buenos Aires. Later, they helped others to settle in the city.

Breakups

Another trajectory from the Chaco to Buenos Aires involves people who move to the city to escape from a breakup, and so to move away from intense personal confrontations with their former partners and families. These moves were acts of affective and spatial disconnection.

Sofía was born in the late 1980s, in a rural village in the Chaco in the area of Espinillo. When she was a child, her father was very active producing and selling handicrafts. He sold his crafts in the city of Resistencia, and periodically went to fairs in cities outside of the province. As a child Sofia went with him whenever she could, and on those trips she learned how to travel to cities, manage the business, and interact with criollos and white people. When her parents split up, Sofia was a teenager. Instead of staying on her maternal family's farm, she moved with her father to the Toba barrio in Resistencia and attended high school there. Her father was involved in the barrio's neighborhood commission, and, although he was not a formal leader, he was always participating in political events. In Resistencia, Sofía started to work with an NGO coordinating youth groups, and in this role she traveled several times to meetings in cities such as Rosario and Santa Fe.

When I met her, Sofia had just arrived in Buenos Aires from Resistencia. She explained she came to Buenos Aires to take a job offer as a live-in maid in a middle-class home because her father insisted and supported her in doing so. However, Sophia explained that the impetus for her move to Buenos Aires was a recent breakup with her partner, with whom she had a child. A non-Toba friend Sofia had met in a youth encounter and who was already working as a maid, had contacted her to offer her the job. Sofía did not want to take the job, because it meant she would have to separate from her child, but she finally decided to move to be far from her former partner and start over. She sent her child to live with her mother in the village where she grew up, and let her father help organize the trip. He contacted Leandro, a distant relative of his living in the Toba barrio, and made the arrangements for her to stay at his place for her first days in the city. Because of her previous experience of travel, Sofia did not find it hard to move around in Buenos Aires, and never got lost, for instance, as many other people did.

Sofia's travel was thus related to several factors that I have been discussing so far: job opportunities, being a strong woman, and support and pressure from her father. The breakup, and her need to be far from her former partner were ultimately responsible for the move. Others, such as Martin, a man who also had to move away from a partner, explained that former partners can get resentful, become aggressive and try to cause harm through sorcery. Accordingly, Sofia took an option she would not have considered otherwise, and decided to move far from Resistencia.

Thus, some people ended up in Buenos Aires because they needed to dissipate a conflict, interrupt intense relations in the Chaco, and start over. In this case, travel was a way of actively disconnecting from intense relations in the Chaco.

Colimbas

Among men, an important factor that made them move to Buenos Aires was the military draft, a major state institution that made enlisted men move across the country. After their military service, some men decided not to go back home. When I recorded men's life histories, the draft came up time and again. "*Colimba*" is the popularized informal name given to any man who was enrolled in Argentina's system of military service system that existed until 1994. It is a term that compresses the words *corre, limpia, barre* ("Run, clean, sweep"), which alludes to the actions associated with the draft.[16] Military Service was mandatory until 1994, when the last draft took place, and after that it became voluntary (Garaño 2012). Each year, all men who were seventeen years old and Argentinean citizens, had their National ID numbers placed into a raffle, which selected the men required to do a year (or more) of service. During service men first received military training, and then were distributed across Argentina's three armed forces (Army, Navy and Air Force), and throughout the country to perform the lowest-ranked tasks in each military unit.[17]

I had expected that military service would be a particularly traumatic experience for Toba men, because most Toba people have memories of the violent military conquest of the Chaco by the army in the early twentieth century transmitted to them by parents and grandparents. And, yet, most of the men I talked to remembered it as a positive personal experience, which they separated from the state violence that once engulfed the Chaco. The *colimba* was a recurrent theme in the trajectories of several men ending up in Buenos Aires, and was remembered as an

[16] *Colimba* is the name given to the military draft and as a nickname for the men who were doing it.

[17] Being a *colimba* was recognized as a very hard, even traumatic experience for many men, especially during the dictatorship years (1976- 1983) when *colimbas* had to participate in or try to avoid participating in the "dirty war" including confrontations with armed leftist movements, and the illegal kidnaping, torturing and killing of civilians. Further in 1982, thousands of *colimbas* were forced to fight in the Falklands War with the United Kingdom. Undertrained and underequipped, thousands of Argentina's casualties were *colimbas*. Nowadays, *colimba* is generational marker: the last men to be drafted were in the class of 1976; the last *colimbas* are now reaching their forties.

experience that gave them valuable skills, and generated in them the desire to travel and visit new places.

Julio's experience in the *colimba* in the early 1980s is a striking example. Julio was first stationed in the city of Corrientes and then sent to a naval base in northern Patagonia, where he learned to work on ships and was trained in parachuting. It was in the *colimba* that he started to desire to move to Buenos Aires. One of his friends had worked in the city, and told Julio that he should go. Buenos Aires was full of jobs, he told him. He indeed went to Buenos Aires, even though he had lost touch with his friend and had no connections there. During the service, as they bonded with men from throughout the country, men of all backgrounds and places of origin got to learn about places they had never heard about. Julio remembered that, during the *colimba*, they had spent a lot of time making future plans to visit each other's hometowns. Thus, the military was an experience that gave men the opportunity to expand their mobilities to previously unimagined places.

Julio further explained that, in the service, Toba men had a good reputation. The physical training and the tasks assigned to them, he said, were relatively easy to perform for Toba men. After all, they were used to hunting in the bush with rifles, and many of them had worked as exploited labourers on plantations, so they were strong and could bear physically exhausting work. Toba men were used to very few hours of sleep, working with no interruption, and having one very basic meal a day. They were also very good at finding their way in the bush, sleeping on the ground and shooting with a rifle. Therefore, they were praised by instructors and recognized as skilled soldiers. Their skills and strength unexpectedly became a form of embodied capital in the specific context of the military. By embodied capital I mean to combine the terms set by Marcel Mauss (1973) in his notion of "techniques of the body", forms of training the body imparting specific capacities. Mauss is stressing something more basic than Bourdieu (1977): rather than recreating a socially-structured disposition for acting and with all its social implications, it was the trained body and his capacities of tracing, running, and shooting, among others. It is this trained body and not a specific habit, that in a new context became a source of status, or capital, in Bourdieu terms (1977). Under the stressful conditions of military training,

Toba's bodies, made strong in labour exploitation of the cotton harvest and their habits as hunters in the Chaco forest, had capacities others did not.

This praise contrasts with the scorn and discrimination indigenous men faced in other state institutions, such as schools and hospitals, where they were treated as incapable, stupid and childlike. It also contrasts with their experience as workers on sugar plantations, where Indigenous people from the Chaco were regarded as the least skilled workers in the market and where the ones paid the lowest salaries (Gordillo 2004).

Military service also allowed indigenous men to learn new skills. Only in the *colimba* did Julio learn to read and write. There was a school for adults where, in his words, they "patiently explained everything," and unlike his experience at school in the Chaco where the teacher only explained the lessons to criollo kids. He also learned to do advanced construction work, plumbing, and electricity. Because of this learning experience, Julio explained, "It came the time when I finished my time, they wanted to send me home, but I asked if I could stay. I wanted to learn more, and I had opportunities." For Julio, military service gave him skills that were useful later in life, and would help him stay in Buenos Aires.

Julio also learned more personal skills to, in his words, "*hacerse respetar por los demas*" (make others respect you), especially after he was initially bullied by other conscripts. He explained:

> I had to learn to gain respect. At the beginning, other men treated me as if I was stupid. One time, other men stole my socks. I got a detention from the officers. But then I started copying what the other men did to me. I stole somebody's socks to replace the ones I had lost. I learned to be suspicious and more aggressive. Then, they respected me.

When Julio was no longer the target of bullying, he made friends with several non-indigenous men, with whom he bonded on relatively equal terms. Julio and other Toba men gained greater social capacities, learning new forms of dominant masculine behaviour and so, paradoxically, receiving a sense of respect and freedom they did not experience in any other state institution. Adopting the habits that define dominant forms of masculinity enabled Julio to know what to expect in his relations with non-Toba men. "*Hacerse respetar*" was an important skill later in his

life in Buenos Aires, and to deal with coworkers in a construction site, for example. Julio emphasized that, after the *colimba*, he was never treated as a fool again in any setting.

In sum, the military was a state institution that efficiently amplified Toba men's capacities to travel. After completing military service Julio wanted to go to Buenos Aires, knowing he could move there and find work in construction. After the *colimba*, Toba men were able to move farther than other men, and this explains why many of the first men to arrive in the city, and who later created the barrio, had served in the military.

"Ending up": Open-ended Trajectories to Buenos Aires

The four types of trajectories examined in this article show that people "ended up" in Buenos Aires because of particular historical conditionings, specific dispositions for movement during their youth, and forms of affective variations strongly shaped by gender. To understand how people ended up in Buenos Aires, it is thus necessary to go beyond the specific trip to the city and trace their complete trajectories, their personal "histories of change", and their potentialities and conditions. In interviews and informal conversations, people made a point of explaining the intricacies and complexities of their trajectories to the city.

Massey suggests that multiplicity of relations emergent in spatial encounters are never the result of spatial planning or even people's agencies, but contain a conjunctural nature of associations. This conjuncture and multiplicity implies the impossibility of politics to regulate every aspect social relations in space (2005: 151). Affect relates to this open ended nature of space as the relational variations that takes place when gendered and racialized bodies of Tobas met others.

In all four types of trajectory, people explained their move as the result of a moment of intensity in their relations in the Chaco, which transformed a request, a conflict, a sense of disorientation and anger, among other factors, into mobility. Movements to Buenos Aires, therefore, were oriented by affective experiences, transformations in the capacities of individual and collective bodies (i.e. families) that created the "need to move." This "need" is inseparable from broader social, geographic, and historical conditions, but indicates further an affective

intensity, the sense of being compelled to move away from where they were and travel to Buenos Aires.

Despite the diversity of trajectories described in this chapter, what they each have in common is the presence of an affective intensity that motivated them to move, as well as an emphasis on the importance of knowing how to move and travel. In tracing these trajectories, I found that most people coming to Buenos Aires had had previous experiences of intense travel, and such experiences were described as necessary to survive in the city. At present, moving to Buenos Aires is easier because newcomers may count on finding many established Toba barrios, and, therefore, on a pre-established network of connections and points of reference. Yet, decades ago, Buenos Aires was an uncommon destination for Indigenous people living in rural areas in the Chaco. In their memories, people stressed the unusualness of their decisions, moving to shantytowns that struck them as alien places where they had no connections. This made many of the people now in the barrio "pioneers" in arriving and staying in the city where they had to "*arreglarse*" (figure things out by themselves), get to know people, connect with unknown institutions such as local schools, and find a place to live. The relative success of their efforts to settle down in the city is explained as the outcome of physical and moral grit, embodied in the "strong women" and in the *colimbas*.

Affects related to sense of betrayal, to family and couple dissolution, with a sense of responsibility for others, and with feeling of being stronger or more capable than ordinary, profoundly modulated the form of movements and shaped these experiences of mobility. While youth mobilities had triggered back-and-forth movements, the longer trips to Buenos Aires were related to some unusual circumstances and the strength of the people ending up in Buenos Aires. Emphasis on the experience of being an orphan illustrates the salience of this affective dimension. And these affectively intense personal circumstances were articulated as the source of valuable experience, measured in the capacity to travel by oneself; to make new friends and build positive associations that allow individuals, for example, to rent a place in the *villas*; or to be respected by others. Each movement opened new capacities and new potential connections, and the chain of those chance encounters made people "end up" in Buenos Aires. In sum, affect helps us understand why and how people moved within the Chaco, how mobility changed

people's capacities, and what types of situations triggered and oriented people towards Buenos Aires.

In this article, I have offered an alternative approach to understanding mobility as neither the result of political economic relations alone, the product of cultural practices specific to the Toba as an indigenous group, nor the consequence of purely individual choices. Instead, I have traced mobilities in their bodily and affective materiality, as embodied actions executed within and against entangled relations of power and domination, operating at different scales. The concept of entanglement brings together the simultaneity of relations that shape forms of movement, while the idea of a "trajectory" allows for an understanding of the spatiality and the temporality of the variations that take place within these entangled relations.

Tracing the trajectories that made people "end up" in Buenos Aires has forced me to consider regularities in their forms of mobility, and to follow the specific modulations shaping those movements. "Ending up in Buenos Aires" resulted from the intersection of different power relations operating at different scales, conjunctural encounters that were affectively intense and transformed people's capacities for action, and the efforts to act within those conditions. People went from village to village because they could not stay on their family farm, as there was not enough land or work, and because they had met a lover elsewhere, or because they had had an emotionally intense breakup. Entanglement means that not one form of relationship alone can explain people's trajectories to Buenos Aires, since several relations are always operating together. Entanglement also refers to the longitudinal dimension of travel; people had previous histories of moving back and forth, and the relations that made them travel to Buenos Aires were superimposed on those previous movements.

Focusing on these mobilities helps to unpack the trajectories of people in the barrio. Mobilities that resulted from economic processes (such as rural poverty, unemployment, or labour exploitation) certainly explain the existence of a generic spatial orientation of movements, starting in rural villages and directing people toward towns and cities. Economic crisis and land expropriations have historically been two very strong and concrete forces that pushed people away from rural areas. People also moved away from everyday forms of violence from criollo farmers, for example, by moving to towns and cities in the Chaco. But these trajectories were not

unilinear, and often had unexpected rhythms resulting from chance encounters or affectively intense experiences. In life histories, these affectively intense experiences emerged as a necessary part of the bold move to Buenos Aires, and, ultimately, the creation of the barrio. Thus, people generally moved from rural to urban places, and they often explored several locations and came back home in between, in some cases going back to their home villages in the Chaco.

More importantly, most of these trajectories were defined by uncertainty. Very few people had planned to move to Buenos Aires or organized their mobility with that goal in mind. Most of the encounters and displacements were unplanned, and this is manifested in the phrase "ending up" in Buenos Aires. The strong women, orphans, people who had undergone breakups or *colimbas* refer to these unusual capacities, and to the specific circumstances triggering movement. Tracing trajectories ethnographically showed these commonalities, and also the specificity of each experience. These trajectories unfolded over specific places, encountered other trajectories, and implied embodied transformations. People like Andrea and Martin, who still desired to "go back" to the Chaco also, made the notion of being "settled" as a relative condition. Yet, the fact that many of these trajectories ended up in Buenos Aires, and not elsewhere, also indicates the affective pull of this city as the national capital, and, therefore, as the most powerful point of reference in national imaginings of progress and prosperity.

References

Abu-Lughod, Lila. 1993. *Writing Women's Worlds: Bedouin Stories*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Adamovsky, Ezequiel. 2012. "El Color de La Nación Argentina: Conflictos y Negociaciones Por La Definición de Un Ethnos Nacional, de La Crisis Al Bicentenario." *Jahrbuch Für Geschichte Lateinamerikas (Colonia)* 49: 343–364.

Beasley-Murray, Jon. 2010. *Posthegemony : Political Theory and Latin America*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1977. *Outline of a theory of practice*. Cambridge, U.K.; New York: Cambridge University Press.

Carrasco, Morita, and Claudia Briones. 1996. "La Tierra Que Nos Quitaron." International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs (IWGIA). 1996.

Clifford, James. 2013. *Returns: Becoming Indigenous in the Twenty-First Century*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Coulthard, Glen Sean. *Red skin, white masks: Rejecting the colonial politics of recognition*. University of Minnesota Press, 2014.

Deleuze, Gilles. 1988. *Spinoza, Practical Philosophy*. San Francisco: City Lights Books.

Deleuze, Gilles. 1992. "Postscript on the Societies of Control." *October* 59 (January): 3–7.

Garaño, Santiago. 2012. "Entre El Cuartel y El Monte. Soldados, Militantes y Militares Durante El Operativo Independencia (Tucumán, 1975-1977)"." PhD Thesis, Buenos Aires: Universidad de Buenos Aires.

Gómez, Mariana Daniela. 2016. *Guerreras y tímidas doncellas del Pilcomayo las mujeres tobas (qom) del oeste de Formosa*. Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires: Editorial Biblos.

Gonzalez, Meliton. 1890. *El gran Chaco argentino*. Buenos Aires: Comp. Sud-Americ. de Billetes de Banco.

Gordillo, Gastn R. 2014. *Rubble.* Place of publication not identified: Duke University Press.

Gordillo, Gastón. 2004. *Landscapes of Devils: Tensions of Place and Memory in the Argentinean Chaco*. Durham [N.C.]: Duke University Press.

Grosz, Elizabeth A. 2001. *Architecture from the Outside: Essays on Virtual and Real Space*. MIT Press.

Grosz, Elizabeth A. 2011. *Becoming Undone: Darwinian Reflections on Life, Politics, and Art*. Durham, NC; London: Duke University Press.

Hall, Stuart. 1996. "Race, Articulation, and Societies Structured in Dominance." *Black British Cultural Studies: A Reader*, 16–60.

Horevitz, Elizabeth. "Understanding the anthropology of immigration and migration." *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment* 19, no. 6 (2009): 745-758.

Iñigo Carrera, Nicolás. 1982. *Violence as an Economic Force: The Process of Proletarianisation among the Indigenous People of the Argentinian Chaco, 1884-1930*. Copenhagen: IWGIA.

Iñigo Carrera, Valeria. 2010. "Sujetos productivos, sujetos políticos, sujetos indígenas: las formas de su objetivación mercantil entre los tobas del este de Formosa." *cas Cuadernos de antropología social*, no. 32: 229–31.

Kearney, Michael. "The local and the global: The anthropology of globalization and transnationalism." *Annual review of anthropology* 24, no. 1 (1995): 547-565.

Li, Tania Murray. 2000. "Articulating Indigenous Identity in Indonesia: Resource Politics and the Tribal Slot." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 42 (1): 149–79.

Mari, Óscar Ernesto. 2009. "La Transición Entre Dos Ciclos y Sus Efectos Sociales En Un Territorio Argentino: Conflictos de Convivencia En El Chaco Ante Una Nueva Etapa Colonizadora (1920-1940)." *Revista de Geografía Norte Grande*, no. 42 (May): 21–40.

Massey, Doreen B. 2005. *For Space*. London; Thousand Oaks, Calif.: SAGE.

Massumi, Brian. 2002. *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Mauss, Marcel. 1973. "Techniques of the Body." *Economy and Society* 2 (1): 70–88.

Mazarrella, William. 2009. "Affect: What Is It Good For?'." In *Enchantments of Modernity: Empire, Nation, Globalization.*, by In S. Dube, ed., 291–306. New York: Routledge.

Mezzadra, Sandro, Brett Neilson, and Duke University Press. 2013. *Border as Method, or, The Multiplication of Labor*. Durham [N.C.]; London: Duke University Press.

Salazar, Noel B., and Alan Smart. 2011. "Anthropological Takes on (Im)Mobility." *Identities* 18 (6): i–ix.

Sheller, Mimi, and John Urry. "The new mobilities paradigm." *Environment and planning A* 38, no. 2 (2006): 207-226.

Spinoza, Benedict de. 1996. *Ethics*. Translated by Edwin Curley. Penguin Classics.

Tamagno, Liliana E. 2001. *Nam Qom Huetáa Na Doqshi Lma´= Los Tobas En La Casa Del Hombre Blanco: Identidad, Memoria y Utopía*. La Plata: Ediciones Al Margen.

Tola, Florencia C. 2007. "Constitución de La Persona Sexuada Entre Los Toba Qom, Del Chaco Argentino." *Pueblos y Fronteras* 04 (01): 1–24.

Tsing, Anna Lowenhaupt. 2005. *Friction: An Ethnography of Global Connection*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Urry, John. 2007. *Mobilities*. Cambridge, UK; Malden, MA: Polity.

Vázquez, Héctor. 2000. *Procesos Identitarios y Exclusión Sociocultural: La Cuestión Indígena en la Argentina*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Biblos.

Vivaldi, Ana. 2011. "Stuck on a Muddy Road: Frictions of Mobility amongst Urban Toba in Northern Argentina." *Identities* 18 (6): 599–619.